



ASSOCIATION FOR CONSUMER RESEARCH

Labovitz School of Business & Economics, University of Minnesota Duluth, 11 E. Superior Street, Suite 210, Duluth, MN 55802

Market-Mediated Multiculturalism: the Institutional Shaping of the Ethnic Consumer Subject

Ela Veresiu, York University, Canada

Markus Giesler, York University, Canada

We bring to bear sociological theories of governmentality and multiculturalism on an analysis of Canada's marketplace to reveal market-mediated multiculturalism: a four-fold process of consumer socialization through which institutional actors build on the ideology of neoliberal multiculturalism to shape an ethnic consumer subject, in order to manage diversity through consumption.

[to cite]:

Ela Veresiu and Markus Giesler (2016) ,"Market-Mediated Multiculturalism: the Institutional Shaping of the Ethnic Consumer Subject", in NA - Advances in Consumer Research Volume 44, eds. Page Moreau and Stefano Puntoni, Duluth, MN : Association for Consumer Research, Pages: 257-263.

[url]:

<http://www.acrwebsite.org/volumes/1021647/volumes/v44/NA-44>

[copyright notice]:

This work is copyrighted by The Association for Consumer Research. For permission to copy or use this work in whole or in part, please contact the Copyright Clearance Center at <http://www.copyright.com/>.

The Politicization of Markets: Exploring the Interplay Between Politics and Markets

Chairs: Katja H. Brunk, European University Viadrina, Frankfurt (Oder), Germany

Benjamin J. Hartmann, University of Gothenburg, Sweden

Ela Veresiu, Schulich School of Business, York University, Canada

Paper #1: Market-Mediated Multiculturalism: The Institutional Shaping of the Ethnic Consumer Subject

Ela Veresiu, York University, Canada

Markus Giesler, York University, Canada

Paper #2: Brand Retrofication: How East German Consumers Animate a Retro Brand Market to Create a Revisionist Eastern Consumption Culture

Benjamin J. Hartmann, Gothenburg University, Sweden

Katja H. Brunk, European University Viadrina, Frankfurt (Oder), Germany

Markus Giesler, York University, Canada

Paper #3: Myth Market Formation and the Irony of Neoliberalism: Insights from the Export of Danish Eldercare to China

Stine Bjerregaard, University of Southern Denmark, Denmark

Dannie Kjeldgaard, University of Southern Denmark, Denmark

Soren Askegaard, University of Southern Denmark, Denmark

Paper #4: Political Consumerism as Neoliberal Therapy: How An Actually Existing Neoliberalism Produces Entrepreneurial Passion

Craig Thompson, University of Wisconsin-Madison, USA

Ankita Kumar, University of Wisconsin-Madison, USA

SESSION OVERVIEW

The interplay among politics, markets, and consumption is of increasing interest to consumer researchers. One stream of past research has looked at how commercialism tends to have depoliticizing effects, transforming political movements and ideas into commodities. Consider, for example, the study on countercultural co-optation in the context of the organic food movement (Thompson and Coskuner-Balli 2007), the work on resistance through cathartic festivals like Burning Man that ultimately supports the market system (Kozinets 2002) or the critical perspective on green marketing (Giesler and Veresiu 2014). Another stream has focused on how consumer groups politicize brands in order to galvanize political resistance (e.g., Holt 2002; Kozinets and Handelman 2004; Izberk-Bilgin 2012; Sandlin and Callahan 2009; Varman and Belk 2009).

However, what remains understudied in this canon is the way in which the markets that situate brands and consumer practices are themselves shaped by political discourses and conflicts, especially neoliberal ones. The purpose of this special session is to elucidate these relationships, which we refer to as the politicization of markets. The session brings together four studies that blend historical analyses of different market systems (and their distinctive institutional characteristics) with insights into how market actors (consumers, producers, institutions, administrators, politicians, popular culture) interpret and shape each system and their actions within it. Thus, the works in this special session seek to collectively unpack the politicization of markets at the nexus of macro-level processes, marketplace resources and micro-level actions and interpretations.

In detail, Veresiu and Giesler begin by presenting an institutional analysis of political mythmaking in Canada to illustrate market-based multiculturalism strategies through which market and political institutions collaborate in the creation of an ethnic consumer subject. Next, Hartmann, Brunk, and Giesler mobilize the context of the po-

litical re-unification between West and East Germany to elucidate how the market for East-German retro brands is shaped by the underlying political conflict between capitalism and socialism. Third, Bjerregaard and Kjeldgaard unfold the discursive formation of a global market for welfare services in the context of Danish eldercare export to China and discuss how this discursive formation and its mythical resources are embedded in wider ideological tensions over the legitimacy of pervasive welfare states. By using the context of the Slow Food movement, Thompson and Kumar will lastly illuminate the continuities and discontinuities that arise as food political discourses are transposed onto different institutional fields and intersect with other discursive systems.

This session is timely because it expands previous perspectives and conceptualizations on various politicized aspects within markets. Thus, the session is particularly relevant for consumer researchers interested in understanding the deeply-rooted politicized and politicizing nature of markets and how this in turn shapes and contours individual consumer actions and interpretations. The session informs theoretical debates on commercial and consumer mythmaking, as well as the formation and shaping of new markets and consumer subjectivities.

Market-Mediated Multiculturalism: The Institutional Shaping of the Ethnic Consumer Subject

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

In the current global climate characterized by increased population mobility, ethnic consumers have become a central concern for consumer researchers. Prior research has investigated the consumer behaviour of African-Americans, Latinos, and Native Americans in the U.S. (e.g., Crocket and Wallendorf 2004; Deshpande, Hoyer, Donthu 1986; Sexton 1972; Shim and Gehrt 1996; Stayman and Deshpande 1989; Wallendorf and Reilly 1983), followed by consumer acculturation agents and outcomes of various (im)migrants in different parts of the world (e.g., Askegaard, Arnould and Kjeldgaard 2005; Chytкова 2011; Dion, Sitz, and Remy 2011; Hu, Whittler and Tian 2013; Jafari and Goulding 2008; Oswald 1999; Penalzoza 1994; Üstüner and Holt 2007; Vihalemm and Keller 2011), and most recently, even indigene consumers' responses to immigrant consumer behaviour (Luedicke 2015). However, according to Askegaard and Özçaglar-Toulouse (2011, 220), "while many studies have highlighted the socio-historic structure of ethnicity, little research really focuses on the interactions between individuals, groups (ethnic and non-ethnic groups), and institutions." Hence, by focusing on the lived experiences of different ethnic groups, this body of literature has yet to understand how and why an ethnic consumer subject is created in the first place.

Rather than prioritizing the experiences of individual consumers (Askegaard and Linnet 2011), this paper focuses on understanding the institutional shaping of an ethnic consumer subject. This is a great concern given that "[in] many countries, migration and ethnic diversity represent major challenges at the dawn of the twenty-first century, dividing opinions and assessment between the extremes of multicultural enrichment and the threat to local identities" (Askegaard and Özçaglar-Toulouse 2011, 217). Furthermore, although Zhao and Belk (2008, 241) aptly note that "[t]hroughout history,

consumption has seldom existed outside politics, [...] and the state has been actively involved in the definition and representation of consumers,” few studies have unpacked the relationship between the state, institutions, ethnicity, and consumption in greater empirical detail.

In pursuing this increasingly important research imperative, we turn to the sociology of governmentality. According to Michel Foucault (2001, 241), governmentality represents “[t]he ensemble formed by the institutions, procedures, analyses and reflections, the calculations and tactics that allow the exercise of this very specific albeit complex form of power, which has as its target population, as its principal form of knowledge political economy, and as its essential technical means apparatuses of security.” In other words, governmentality can be understood as a process for managing populations through which the shaping role of institutions operates. One such mode of governmentality is neoliberal multiculturalism (Hale 2005; Kymlicka 2013; Mitchell 2004). According to Kymlicka (2013, 109), “neoliberal multiculturalism is the belief that ethnic identities and attachments can be assets to market actors and hence that they can legitimately be supported by the neoliberal state.” Hence, when neoliberal multiculturalism is understood as a market-mediated mode of governmentality, intuitions may create ethnic consumer subject positions to manage increasingly diverse populations through the market and consumption.

In this paper, we build on the notion of neoliberal multiculturalism, as well as our institutional analysis of Canada’s multicultural marketplace to introduce the concept of market-mediated multiculturalization. We define market-mediated multiculturalization as a fourfold process of consumer socialization through which an ethnic consumer subject is created in order to manage increased population diversity by means of consumption and ensure a nation’s economic success. Based on our multiyear analysis of the Canadian marketplace, which includes both institutional and consumer data, we find that market-mediated multiculturalization takes the shape of four interrelated processes: inception, identification, proliferation, and adoption.

During the first phase of inception, institutional and political actors envision an ideal citizen-type in the form of an ethnic consuming subject. This phase is triggered by different minority groups’ public crises of legitimacy. During the second phase of identification, industry leaders, analysts, and other business professionals create measures, analyze data, and publish reports on who the ethnic consumer actually is. In this third phase, both public and private institutions proliferate ethnic consumers in the arts, entertainment, media, and other cultural creative spheres. Finally, in the last phase, which we term adoption, indigene and immigrant individuals alike adopt their prescribed ethnic consumer position by engaging with different ethnic products, services, and experiences. During the adoption phase, individuals internalize the idea that ethnic tensions and crises of group legitimacy can best be solved through market forces by naturalizing that their ethnic identity is best expressed through their consumption choices.

Our study contributes to extant scholarship on ethnic consumers, consumer subject formation, and the role of neoliberalism in shaping markets and consumers. First, while past work has looked at how ethnic individuals experience the marketplace (e.g., see Luedicke 2011 for an overview), we highlight how institutions shape this ethnic consumer experience. As such, we also contribute to the literature investigating consumer subject formation (Cayla and Eckhard 2008; Giesler and Veresiu 2014; Karababa and Ger 2011; Moisander and Eriksson 2006). This emergent stream of research has not yet investigated the relationship among consumption, ethnicity, and multicultural ideologies, which our study unpacks. Finally, we

extend the literature on neoliberalism and consumption (Askegaard and Linnet 2011; Bonsu and Polsa 2011; Giesler and Veresiu 2014; Shankar, Cherrier, and Canniford 2006; Zwick, Bonsu, and Darmody 2008) by developing a theorization that explains how the neoliberal political ideology of multiculturalism influences citizens’ consumer behaviour.

Brand Retrofication: How East German Consumers Animate a Retro Brand Market to Create a Revisionist Eastern Consumption Culture

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

How and why do retro brand markets emerge? Consumer and marketing researchers have shown increasing interest in the rise of retro brands defined as ‘relaunched historical brands with updated features’ (Brown, Sherry, and Kozinets 2003a p.19). Previous studies in this area portray the emergence of retro brands primarily as a marketer-driven process. For example, Brown, Sherry and Kozinets (2003b) investigate the pre-requisites for retro brand re-launch and elucidate brand meaning negotiations through which producers and consumers invest retro brands with meanings of authenticity, enchantment, and paradox (Brown, Sherry, Kozinets 2003a).

Although Brown (1999) suspects that, sociologically, the rise of retro brands can be explained with Davis’s (1979) nostalgic ethos prevalent in societies undergoing turbulence and transformation, thus creating desires to consume bygone brands as symbolic restoration of a past condition, relatively little is known about how retro markets emerge within and are shaped by larger socio-political trajectories and related ideological tensions. While Thompson and Tian (2008) highlight the role of diverging ideological aims of commercial mythmakers creating competing reconstructions of the American South, and Brown McDonagh, and Shultz (2013) emphasize the role of mythic underpinnings in retro phenomena, the particularities through which consumers mobilize retro brands to serve their ideological aims remains a theoretical mystery. Thus, in this study we ask: how are retro brand markets animated by consumers as a mechanism serving ideological interests? We bring sociological theories of popular memory/countermemory (Foucault 1977; Lipsitz 1990; Thompson and Tian, 2008) and cultural branding to bear on an in-depth analysis of consumers’ brand narratives to introduce the concept of brand retrofication as a market-based mechanism through which consumers imbue suppressed market objects from the past with identity significance, thereby animating these brands to potent, in-demand retro brands serving consumers’ ideological aims.

To explore these issues, our finished fieldwork leverages the context of the rise of retro brand consumption after Germany’s political re-unification, previously a microcosm of geopolitical order (Boyer 2001). Since the end of WW2, the subsequent division of Germany by the Allied Forces into a Western and an Eastern occupation zones—leading to the founding of the two German national states of FRG and GDR, respectively—heralded a specific mythic topology lending East and West Germany dualistic allegorical quality for the larger world views that governed them. While West Germany adhered to capitalist consumer culture, East Germany was characterized by a socialist consumer culture. Thus, consumption has in this context always been a strongly politicized point of competition between capitalist and socialist market ideologies (Merkel, 2006).

Since then, and from the viewpoint of the West, East Germany has been frequently portrayed as an economically, socially, and culturally desolate landscape, contrasting the free and prosperous West with the isolated and backwards GDR. Following the fall of The Berlin Wall, however, East Germans faced a situation of immediate ac-

cess to the desired Western consumption system, but also the instant wipe-out of East German brands and products, inducing inevitable processes of dealing with a neoliberal market system and a capitalist culture of consumption. Alongside these developments, the mythic contrast between East and West took a colonialist turn and provided a template for commentaries on pre-reunification and post-reunification conditions in the two consumer cultures.

In this climate, thriving East German retro brands emerge such as the GDR school kitchen tomato sauce, hotels re-creating the GDR experience, and various everyday GDR products like washing detergents, soft drinks, and snacks, some of which outrival their once-longed-for Western counterparts. Our empirical material collected in this context consists of East German consumer brand narratives collected through introspections and interviews (Brown 1998; Gould 1995; McCracken 1988), netnographic material (Kozinets 2002) collected in various online forums and communities dedicated to GDR brands, as well as historical and pop-cultural material allowing to historicize the rise of GDR retro brands (Brown et al. 2013).

After genealogically tracing the Mythic (German) East, we explore how Eastern German consumers' investment of redeeming meanings into products from the socialist past combats (Western) caricatures of the post-reunified East while creating commercially thriving retrobrands. Thus, we show how GDR retro brand consumption creates a Revisionist Eastern consumption culture by linking ideologically redeeming meanings to cultural and market objects from the past that can be readily mobilized by Eastern consumers to rebuke some of the disparagements perpetuated by stigmatizing political myth. A resulting market-mediated mechanism is the emergence of a retro brand market infused with and shaped by ideological agendas of East German consumers negotiating the dominant popular (Western) memory by creating (Eastern) countermemories.

Based on this, we develop a conceptual model of brand retrofication that highlights co-constitutive identity and retro branding relationships of commercial and political mythmaking. The concept of brand retrofication helps elucidating how and why retro brand markets emerge and foregrounds how retro brand markets are shaped by political ideology negotiations by consumers seeking to create symbolic shelters for (national) identity consumption as well as political and commercial mythmakers. This consumer-driven process of brand retrofication resurrects bygone market objects symbolizing the previous condition of a socialist consumer culture through mobilizing capitalist market mechanisms.

These findings have implications for theoretical debates on commercial mythmaking, retro branding, and national identity consumption. As for commercial mythmaking literatures, our study contributes by foregrounding consumers' ideological aims in co-constitution with commercial and political mythmakers vis-à-vis previous accounts of the ideological aims of commercial mythmakers in reconstructions of the past (Thompson and Tian, 2008). Our study informs retro branding literatures by firstly, how consumers animate retro brands to serve their ideological aims, complementing previous accounts of retro-brand animation serving marketer interests; and secondly, by foregrounding how in these animation processes, historical brands are not necessarily technologically updated by marketers as previously depicted, but rather undergo ideological updating by consumers whilst leaving other brand attributes preferably untouched. Our findings further contribute to literatures on national identity consumption by foregrounding its political dimensions.

Myth Market Formation and the Irony of Neoliberalism: Insights from the Export of Danish Eldercare to China

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

"The new bacon." These were the words employed by a politically leading Danish news media to describe the prospects of exporting Danish eldercare services to China (often referred to as *welfare export*) in a news article published in January 2014. The metaphoric reference to the commercial success of Denmark's long tradition for bacon exports highlights a culmination of past decades' marketization of Nordic welfare models. Here the process of marketization is no longer mobilizing a domestic reorganization of welfare systems alone. It is also seen to take on an outward orientation where public welfare services are discursively reframed as commodities and wishfully associated with a significant commercial potential on global markets.

In this paper we explore the dynamics illustrated above as a process of cultural commodification in a domain not historically associated with market logics, namely public welfare services. The empirical context is the idea of exporting 'Danish' eldercare services to an ageing Chinese society – an idea that was introduced to Danish stakeholders in 2011 with the launch of an export promotion program by the Danish Trade Council in China. While the program was abandoned within less than two years, the idea of exporting Danish eldercare to China had already gained a significant foothold in Danish public debate and had set in motion a series of other activities targeted to the emerging Chinese eldercare sector. We offer a study of the media representations related to this series of events with an analytical emphasis on the discursive framing of export activities and the tropes and metaphors (Lakoff and Johnson 1980) employed to give body and meaning to news stories and public debate.

Significant for the news coverage of the events related to the export of Danish eldercare to China is the general application of a somewhat premature market logic that serves as an overarching frame for the reporting of events. With its consistent emphasis on commercial potential and profit, this dominant market logic may be contrasted with representations of welfare export in the early 1990s where the overarching frame was guided by an altruistic logic prioritizing *helping* or *development* as main motives for export endeavors.

While the more recent prioritization of a commercial motive may be argued to reflect the pervasiveness of a neo-liberal ideology even in social democrat welfare states such as Denmark, the use of tropes and metaphors reveal a second layer in the media representations studied, namely the mythologization of the market for welfare services. This relates to the articulation of the Chinese market for eldercare through a global frontier myth echoing Applbaum's (2000) notion of globalization as a key cultural concept acting as "myth and charter" for transnational corporations' geographical expansion. In this sense, we see the Chinese market potential consistently referred to as an "export adventure," we see the demand assessed in (relative to Danish traditions) mythic proportions, and an urgency inferred with the emphasis on "seizing the opportunity."

Second – and more noteworthy, is the articulation of the market offering through the myth of Nordic welfare. This is seen in how the offering to be exported is often described in curiously ambiguous terms such as "welfare knowledge" or "warm welfare hands." And while referred to with barely concealed pride, the notion of welfare remains detached from its historical and political underpinnings (Barthes [1957] 2012). Discursively, the notion of welfare is thus treated as a depoliticized signifier but endowed with commercial potential that drives the welfare export endeavor.

Contemporary political tensions and issues (Holt 2004, Thompson 2004) are revealed, however, in how the Chinese market for Danish eldercare services is described by way of metaphors that derive from the domestic debate on the quality of the largely public Danish eldercare sector and the future viability of the extensive Danish welfare sector in general. In this way, it is seen how the projection of domestic issues onto a largely imagined international market serves to mediate and negotiate tensions at a national level concerning the role of the nation-state in a competitive global economic order. As such, we understand the mythic articulation of welfare services as a marketable offer, as a collective endeavor at national level that ties into popular memory (Thompson and Tian 2008) of the 'heroic' establishment and continuation of the welfare state. The idea of a global market thus serves as a mediator of national political tensions and becomes a catalyst for collective sense-making regarding the legitimacy and future viability of the extensive welfare system.

While the pervasiveness of the neo-liberal ideology has become a "truth" within both scholarship and popular discourse, few scholars have explored neo-liberalism as something more than an implicit background explanatory framework (Mudge 2008). In this paper we address this gap by discussing the relationships between state and market as it plays out in the context of Danish welfare exports. We find that the employment of neo-liberal principles does not necessarily mark out a one-way road to the diminishment of states in lieu of global markets.

Through the glorification of the market as the mediator of exchange between states, the legacy of a state's cultural and ideological history is mythologized and provided with a commercial value - it becomes a *brand*. Conversely, this articulation of the cultural ideology of the extensive welfare state in commercial terms is used for renewed legitimacy of such a state.

Neoliberalism is hence mobilized as a resource for a renewed legitimization of the welfare state in a globalized world. Neo-liberalism provides a discursive resource or framework for social discourses/practices that simultaneously take neo-liberalism to new heights and turn neo-liberalism on its head using neoliberal logics as a means to a non-neoliberal end.

Political Consumerism as Neoliberal Therapy: How An Actually Existing Neoliberalism Produces Entrepreneurial Passion

EXTENDED ABSTRACT

In recent years the politicization of markets has garnered much attention by marketing scholars. One research stream has focused on the depoliticizing effect of commercialism i.e., the transformation of political movements and ideas into commodities—for example in the work on countercultural co-optation (Zwick, Bonsu, and Darmody 2008) or perspectives on green marketing and agro-food movements that criticize them for promoting the idea that privatized and voluntary solutions to societal problems are preferable to collective organization, legal, political, and regulatory remedies (Guthman 2008; Soneryd and Uggla 2015). Another stream focuses on how activist groups politicize brands in order to galvanize political resistance (Izberk-Bilgin 2012). Within this stream of research, an understudied issue is how markets that situate brands and consumer practices are themselves shaped by political discourses and conflicts. Consumer research on the ideological shaping of consumer identities has recently begun to focus on the structuring influences exerted by neoliberal discourses (Askegaard and Linnet 2011; Binkley 2007; Bonsu and Polska 2011; Fitchett, Patsiaouras, and Davies 2014; Giesler and Veresiu 2014; Shankar, Cherrier, and Canniford

2006; Zwick, Bonsu, and Darmody 2008; Zwick and Cayla 2010; Zwick and Ozalp 2010). However, these studies tend to analyze neoliberalism as a hegemonic ideology that instills a moralistic belief in consumers that broader societal problems can be resolved through socially responsabilized consumer choices, and in a more self-interested vein, that they can shield themselves from systemic risks through their dietary choices, self-care regimens, etc. (Giesler and Veresiu 2014; Moor 2010; Rose 2007). According to these critical readings, political consumerism (as an ostensible practice of consumer resistance) serves to more deeply ingrain neoliberal ideas and beliefs into the fabric of everyday life through the process of consumer responsabilization.

This interpretation, however, often fails to distinguish between neoliberal interpellations and discursive structures whose histories long predate the era of neoliberalism's pronounced socio-cultural influence on consumer responsabilization such as the Protestant work ethic and the myth of the self-made man, as well as overlook how these neoliberal discourses are re-embedded in contextualized marketplace cultures. Using the context of the Slow Food movement we trace out continuities and discontinuities that arose as discourses that emerged from Slow Food's historical grounding in radical leftist politics were transposed onto different institutional fields with their inherent socio-economic discrepancies and intersected with neoliberal discourses and a therapeutic market logic (Moisio and Beruchashvili 2010; Thompson 2003) as Slow Food became a global brand. We seek to understand the moralistic governance regimes (Foucault 2008) that shape the actions and interpretations of consumers and producers who are embedded in a Slow Food network.

This research is based on in-depth interviews with 19 participants of a North American Slow Food movement network and participant observation at Slow Food events over the course of twelve months. We draw on Foucault's analytic lens of governmentality. Rather than relying upon disciplinary means, modern modes of governance sought to organize the social field in which actions could be taken or to exert a directive influence upon the ways in which individuals construct themselves as social and ethical actors and concomitantly develop the authority to guide the conduct of others (Foucault 2008; Lemke 2001). Prior studies have tended to suggest that responsabilized consumers have been ideologically induced to act in accordance with neoliberal economic orthodoxies (e.g., Giesler and Veresiu 2014) and to see their personal interest as being aligned with the profit maximizing aims of corporate strategies. However, Foucault's concept of governmentality is a de facto critique of top-down, hegemonic accounts of ideological domination. Instead, it presents a topological, rather than hierarchical, conceptualization of power relations (Collier 2009). We adopt this topological orientation to study "actually existing neoliberalisms" (Brenner and Theodore 2002, 351).

By tracing the genealogy of Slow Food we find that its ideological origins are far removed from neoliberal doctrines and can be traced to its historical roots in radical Italian political movements and their suspicions of formal institutions and centralized decision making. As the Slow Food movement emerged from this political ferment (subsequently adapted to social changes that lessened popular support for more radical expressions of leftist politics), it began to promote the idea that consumers' could challenge and even disrupt capitalist imperatives, such as efficiency and instrumental assessments of value, by seeking out autonomous pleasures and self-valorizing activities, with food and eating providing a primary context for these acts of everyday resistance. Over time, Slow Food gradually placed a greater reliance on the market as a vehicle for social change such as creating fairer outcomes for workers and sus-

taining threatened culinary traditions, thereby linking consumption with particular neoliberal ideals of responsible citizenship. Rather than consumer responsabilization per se, our findings suggest that Slow Food practices and discourses enact a neoliberal ideal of passionate enterprise which creates an alignment between its members' communal identity, and its historical emphasis on the emancipatory potential of consumption pleasures created outside the auspices of capitalist rationalization, and neoliberalism's edifying vision of entrepreneurial skill building as a path to personal achievement and self-actualization. These invocations of passion need to be affirmed through the experiences of guiding others toward this construction of ethical selfhood. To sustain this alignment, reformulated therapeutic motifs are leveraged to legitimate these passionate engagements and to negate the elitist connotations, and latent sense of class conflict, which have long plagued the Slow Food movement.

This study contributes to the understanding of the heretofore undertheorized relationships among actual existing neoliberalisms, the governmental rationalities that operate through political consumerism and the ideological shaping of consumer identities. It highlights the contextualized processes of socio-economic and cultural restructuring that arise through the intersections among neoliberal discourses (and their normative prescriptions), different institutional fields and the particular histories of marketplace cultures. This topological view of neoliberal governmentalities also explicates how subtle, non-coercive power relations operate as technologies of the self as well as how actors gain or lose ethical authority through market-mediated social interactions and consumption practices.

REFERENCES

- Applbaum, Kalman (2000), "Crossing Borders: Globalization as Myth and Charter in American Transnational Consumer Marketing," *American Ethnologist*, 27 (2), 257-282.
- Askegaard, Søren and Jeppe Trolle Linnet (2011), "Towards an Epistemology of Consumer Culture Theory, Phenomenology and the Context of Context," *Marketing Theory* 11(4), 381-404.
- Askegaard Søren and Özçaglar-Toulouse (2011), "Still Crossing Borders: Migration, Consumption, and Markets," *Consumption, Markets and Culture*, 14 (3), 217-222.
- Askegaard, Søren, Eric J. Arnould and Dannie Kjeldgaard (2005), "Postassimilationist Ethnic Consumer Research: Qualifications and Extensions," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 32 (June), 160-170.
- Barthes, Roland ([1957] 2012), *Mythologies: The Complete Edition, in a new Translation*, New York: Hill and Wang.
- Binkley, Sam (2007), "Governmentality and Lifestyle Studies," *Sociology Compass*, 1(1), 111-126.
- Bonsu, Samuel K. and Pia Polsa (2011), "Governmentality at the Base-of-the-Pyramid," *Journal of Macromarketing*, 31 (3), 236-244.
- Boyer, Dominic (2001), "Media Markets, Mediating Labors, and the Branding of East German Culture at *Super Illu*," *Social Text*, 68 (3), 9-33.
- Brenner, Neil and Nik Theodore (2002), "Cities and the Geographies of 'Actually Existing Neoliberalism'," *Antipode*, 34 (3), 349-379.
- Brown, Stephen, Kozinets, Robert V., and Sherry, John F. (2003a), "Teaching old brands new tricks: Retro branding and the revival of brand meaning," *Journal of Marketing*, 67(July), 19-33.
- _____ (2003b), "Sell Me the Old, Old Story: Retromarketing Management and the Art of Brand Revival," *Journal of Customer Behaviour*, 2(2), 133-147.
- Brown, Stephen (1999), "Retromarketing: yesterday's tomorrow's today!," *Marketing, Intelligence and Planning*, 17 (7), 363-376.
- _____ (1998), "The wind in the wallows: Literary theory, autobiographical criticism and subjective personal introspection," *Advances in Consumer Research*, 25, 25-30.
- Brown, Stephen, Pierre McDonagh, and Clifford J. Shultz II (2013), "Titanic: Consuming Myths and Meanings of an Ambiguous Brand," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 40(4), 595-614.
- Cayla, Julien, and Eckhardt, Giana M. (2008) 'Asian Brands and the Shaping of a Transnational Imagined Community', *Journal of Consumer Research* 35(2): 216-230
- Chytкова, Zuzana (2011), "Consumer Acculturation, Gender, and Food: Romanian Women in Italy Between Tradition and Modernity," *Consumption, Markets & Culture*, 14(3), 267-291.
- Collier, Stephen J. (2009), "Topologies of Power: Foucault's Analysis of Political Government Beyond 'Governmentality'." *Theory, Culture & Society* 26 (6), 78-108.
- Crockett, David and Melanie Wallendorf (2004), "The Role of Normative Political Ideology in Consumer Behavior," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 31 (3), 511-28.
- Davis, Fred (1979), *Yearning for Yesterday: A Sociology of Nostalgia*, New York, NY: Free Press.
- Deshpande, R., W. D. Hoyer, and N. Donthu (1986), "The Intensity of Ethnic Affiliation: A Study of the Sociology of Hispanic Consumption," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 13 (2), 214-20.
- Dion, Delphine, Lionel Sitz and Eric Remy (2011), "Embodied Ethnicity: The Ethnic Affiliation Grounded in the Body," *Consumption Markets and Culture*, 14 (September), 311-331.
- Fitchett, James A., Georgios Patsiaouras, and Andrea Davies (2014). "Myth and Ideology in Consumer Culture Theory." *Marketing Theory* 14 (4), 495-506.
- Foucault, Michel (1977), *Language, Counter-Memory, Practice: Selected Essays and Interviews*, ed. Donald F. Bouchard, Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.
- _____ (2008), *The Birth of Biopolitics: Lectures at the Collège de France*, ed. Michael Senellart, trans. Graham Burchell, New York: Palgrave.
- Giesler, Markus and Ela Veresiu (2014), "Creating the Responsible Consumer: Moralistic Governance Regimes and Consumer Subjectivity," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 41 (3), 840-857.
- Gould, Steven J. (1995), "Researcher introspection as a method in consumer research: Applications, issues, and implications," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 21(4), 719-722.
- Guthman, Julia (2008), "Neoliberalism and the Making of Food Politics in California." *Geoforum* 39 (3), 1171-1183.
- Hale, Charles. 2005. "Neoliberal Multiculturalism." *POLAR: Political and Legal Anthropology Review* 28 (1): 10-28.
- Holt, Douglas B. (2002) "Why Do Brands Cause Trouble? A Dialectical Theory of Consumer Culture and Branding," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 29(1): 70-90.
- Holt, Douglas B. (2004), *How Brands Become Icons: The Principles of Cultural Branding*, Cambridge, MA: Harvard Business Press.
- Hu, Jing, Tommy E. Whittler and Kelly Tian (2013), "Resisting Immigrant Myths: Everyday Consumer Practices of Asian Immigrants in America," *Consumption, Markets and Culture*, 16 (2), 169-195

- Izberk-Bilgin, Elif (2012), "Infidel Brands: Unveiling Alternative Meanings of Global Brands at the Nexus of Globalization, Consumer Culture, and Islamism," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 39 (December), 663-687.
- Jafari, Aliakbar and Christina Goulding (2008), "'We are not Terrorists!' UK-based Iranians, Consumption Practices and the 'Torn Self,'" *Consumption, Markets & Culture*, 11 (June), 73-91
- Karababa, Eminegül and Güliz Ger (2011), "Early Modern Ottoman Coffeehouse Culture and the Formation of the Consumer Subject," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 37 (February), 737-60.
- Kozinets, Robert V. (2002), "The Field Behind the Screen: Using Netnography for Marketing Research in Online Communities," *Journal of Marketing Research (JMR)*, 39(1), 61-72.
- Kozinets, Robert V. and Jay M. Handelman (2004), "Adversaries of Consumption: Consumer Movements, Activism, and Ideology," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 31 (December), 691-704.
- Kymlicka, Will (2013), "Neoliberal Multiculturalism?" in *Social Resilience in the Neo-Liberal Era*. Eds. Peter A. Hall and Michèle Lamont. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 99-126.
- Lakoff, George and Mark Johnson (1980), *Metaphors We Live By*, Chicago, Ill: University of Chicago Press.
- Lemke, Thomas (2001), "'The Birth of 'Bio-politics': Michel Foucault's Lecture at the Collège de France on Neo-liberal Governmentality," *Economy and Society*, 30 (2), 190-207.
- Lipsitz, George (1990), *Time Passages: Collective Memory and American Popular Culture*, Minneapolis: University of Minneapolis Press.
- Luedicke, Marius K. (2011), "Consumer Acculturation Theory: (Crossing) Conceptual Boundaries," *Consumption, Markets & Culture*, 14 (3), 223-44.
- _____ (2015), "Indigenes' Responses to Immigrants' Consumer Acculturation: A Relational Configuration Analysis," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 42 (1), 109-129.
- Merkel, Ina (2006), "From stigma to cult – Changing meanings in East German consumer cultures," in *Consumer: Knowledge, Power and Identity in the Modern World*, ed. Frank Trentmann, Oxford: Berg. 249-270.
- McCracken, Grant (1988), *The Long Interview, Qualitative Research Methods*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Mitchell, Katharyne. 2004. "Geographies of Identity: Multiculturalism Unplugged." *Progress in Human Geography* 28 (5): 641–51.
- Moisander, Johanna and Päivi Eriksson (2006), "Corporate Narratives of Information Society: Making up the Mobile Consumer Subject," *Consumption, Markets, and Culture*, 9 (4), 257-275.
- Moisio, Risto and Mariam Beruchashvili (2010), "Questing for Well-Being at Weight Watchers: The Role of the Spiritual-Therapeutic Model in a Support Group," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 36 (February), 857-75.
- Moor, Liz (2010), "Neoliberal Experiments: Social Marketing and the Governance of Populations," *Inside Marketing: Practices, Ideologies, Devices*, eds. Detlev Zwick and Julien Cayla, New York: Oxford, 299-319.
- Mudge, Stephanie Lee (2008), "What is Neo-liberalism?," *Socio-Economic Review*, 6 (4), 703-731.
- Oswald, Laura R. (1999), "Culture Swapping: Consumption and the Ethnogenesis of Middle-Class Haitian Immigrants," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 25 (March), 303-318.
- Peñaloza, Lisa (1994), "*Atravesando fronteras*/Border Crossings: A Critical Ethnographic Exploration of the Consumer Acculturation of Mexican Immigrants," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 21 (June), 32–54.
- Rose, Nikolas (2007), *The Politics of Life Itself: Biomedicine, Power, and Subjectivity in the Twenty-First Century*, Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Sandlin, Jennifer A. and Jamie L. Callahan (2009), "Deviance, Dissonance, and Détournement: Culture Jammers' use of Emotion in Consumer Resistance," *Journal of Consumer Culture*, 9 (1), 79-115.
- Sexton, D. E. (1972), "Black Buyer Behavior," *Journal of Marketing*, 6 (4), 36-39.
- Shankar Avi, Hélène Cherrier, and Robin Canniford (2006), "Consumer Empowerment: A Foucauldian Interpretation," *European Journal of Marketing*, 40 (9/10), 1013-1030.
- Shim, S. and K. C. Gehrt (1996), "Hispanic and Native American Adolescents: An Exploratory Study of Their Approach to Shopping," *Journal of Retailing*, 72 (3), 307-24.
- Soneryd, Linda, and Ylva Uggla (2015), "Green Governmentality and Responsibilization: New Forms of Governance and Responses to 'Consumer Responsibility'." *Environmental Politics* 24(6), 913-931.
- Stayman, D. M. and R. Deshpande (1989), "Situational Ethnicity and Consumer Behavior," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 16 (3), 361-71.
- Thompson, Craig J. (2003), "Natural Health's Narratives of Healing and the Ideological Production of Consumer Resistance." *Sociological Quarterly* 44 (Winter), 81-108.
- Thompson, Craig J. (2004), "Marketplace Mythology and Discourses of Power," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 31 (1), 162-180.
- Thompson, Craig J. and Gokcen Coskuner-Balli (2007), "Countervailing Market Responses to Corporate Co-optation and the Ideological Recruitment of Consumption Communities," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 34 (August), 135-52.
- Thompson, Craig J. and Kelly Tian (2008), "Reconstructing the South: How Commercial Myths Compete for Identity Value through the Ideological Shaping of Popular Memories and Counter-memories," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 34 (5), 595-613.
- Üstüner, Tuba and Douglas B. Holt (2007), "Dominated Consumer Acculturation: The Social Construction of Poor Migrant Women's Consumer Identity Projects in a Turkish Squatter," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 34 (June), 41-56.
- Varman, Rohit and Russell W. Belk (2009), "Nationalism and Ideology in an Anticonsumption Movement," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 36 (December), 686-700.
- Vihalemm, Triin and Margit Keller (2011), "Looking Russian or Estonian: Young Consumers Constructing the Ethnic 'Self' and 'Other,'" *Consumption Markets and Culture*, 14 (September), 293-309.
- Wallendorf, M. and M. D. Reilly (1983), "Ethnic Migration, Assimilation, and Consumption," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 10 (3), 292-302.

- Zhao, Xin and Russell W. Belk (2008), "Politicizing Consumer Culture: Advertising's Appropriation of Political Ideology in China's Social Transition," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 35 (August), 231-44.
- Zwick, Detlev, Sammy Bonsu, and Aron Darmody (2008), "Putting Consumers to Work: Co-creation & New Marketing Governmentality," *Journal of Consumer Culture*, 8 (2), 163-196.
- Zwick, Detlev, and Julien Cayla, eds. 2010 *Inside marketing: Practices, ideologies, devices*. New York: Oxford.
- Zwick, Detlev, and Yesim Ozalp (2011), "Flipping the Neighborhood: Biopolitical Marketing as Value Creation for Condos and Lofts," in *Inside Marketing: Practices, Ideologies, Devices*, eds. Detlev Zwick and Julien Cayla, New York: Oxford, 234-253.