Preface

The mission of the European Association for Consumer Research Conference was to present an international forum for researchers from Europe and from all other continents who are interested in consumer behavior. The European ACR conference took place for the fifth time. We are very glad that Germany had the honor to host this year’s EACR conference and that scholars from all over the world were able to meet and exchange their ideas and different views on consumer research. Authors, chairs, discussants and reviewers came from twenty-five different nations located on five different continents. These colleagues formed the core of the conference and only their excellent professional efforts made this successful meeting possible. Therefore, we want to express our special thanks to all of them: for submitting proposals, for reviewing, for presenting their ideas, and for chairing and leading discussions.

Organizing such a conference always implies the support of many other people. First of all we are very grateful for the help of Jim Muncy, ACR’s Executive Secretary. We deeply appreciated his patient advice.

In addition, we would like to thank all our colleagues from the German Consumer Behavior Research Group (in German: Forschungsgruppe Konsum & Verhalten or “K&V-Group”) who not only provided ”psychological support”, but also helped us to find our sponsors. Thanks to our sponsors we were able to provide one or the other delicacy to fulfill our ”needs” for sensual pleasure with our receptions and especially with the Special Dinner Event on top of the Reichtstag building, which was one of the highlights of the conference.

Last but not least we owe Dorothea Baun a debt of gratitude. She is an academic assistant at the European University Viadrina. Her help covered correspondence with authors and participants, providing and maintaining the database as well as the conference webpages – among a thousand other things. She was the ”good soul” throughout the time of preparation.

It was a rewarding experience to organize the European ACR conference, and we deeply appreciate that we had this unique opportunity to welcome everybody to Berlin. All the acknowledging comments that we received after the conference were the best reward we could think of. We hope that the participants were inspired with many new ideas for their research projects and future co-operation with other colleagues. Furthermore, we hope the participants could afford some time off for sightseeing in Berlin – probably one of the most fascinating cities in Europe – and experienced on the one hand the beauty and vividness of Germany’s capital and on the other hand, maybe noticed some of the problems the reunification brought about. The reunification is still a miracle in history and we are very grateful that the Fifth European ACR conference could take place in the historic center of Berlin which – eleven years ago – was part of the former GDR.

Andrea Gröppel-Klein, European University Viadrina, Frankfurt (Oder), Germany
Franz-Rudolf Esch, Justus Liebig-University, Gießen, Germany
Conference Co-Chairs

Andrea Groeppel-Klein
European University Viadrina, Germany

Franz-Rudolf Esch
Justus Liebig-University Giessen, Germany

Conference Committee

Gerold Behrens, University of Wuppertal, Germany
Sigrid Bekmeier-Feuerhahn, University of Lüneburg, Germany
Lutz Hildebrandt, Humboldt-Universität Berlin, Germany
Klaus Peter Kaas, Johann Wolfgang Goethe-University Frankfurt (Main), Germany
Bruno Neibecker, University of Karlsruhe, Germany
Thorsten Posselt, University of Leipzig, Germany
Christian Schade, Humboldt-Universität Berlin, Germany
Volker Trommsdorff, Technische Universität Berlin, Germany
Peter Weinberg, Saarland University, Germany

Special Thanks to

Dorothea Baun, European University Viadrina, Germany
Anja Domke, European University Viadrina, Germany
Thade Dudzik, European University Viadrina, Germany
Claas Christian Germelmann, European University Viadrina, Germany
Patrick Geus, Justus Liebig-University Gießen, Germany
Jörg Jeromin, European University Viadrina, Germany
Maria Kromp, European University Viadrina, Germany
Tobias Langner, Justus Liebig-University Gießen, Germany
Anna Slupinska, European University Viadrina, Germany
Kerstin Wunderlich, European University Viadrina, Germany
Reviewers

Alba, Joe, University of Florida, USA
Askegaard, Søren, Odense University, Denmark
Baker, Stacey, Bowling Green State University, USA
Balderjahn, Ingo, University of Potsdam, Germany
Ballesteros, Carlos, Universidad Pontifica Comillas, Spain
Balloffet, Pierre, Ecole des Hautes Etudes Commerciales (Montréal), Canada
Bamossy, Gary, University of Utah, USA
Barnes, James, University of Mississippi, USA
Bean, Cindy, University of South Florida, USA
Beckmann, Susanne, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Behrens, Gerold, University of Wuppertal, Germany
Bekmeier-Feuerhahn, Sigrid, University of Lüneburg, Germany
Belch, George E., San Diego State University, USA
Belch, Michael A., San Diego State University, USA
Belk, Russel W., University of Utah, USA
Biswas, Dip, University of California (Irvine), USA
Bolle, Friedel, European University Viadrina, Germany
Bonsu, Sammy, University of North Carolina, USA
Bristol, Terry, Arizona State University West, USA
Clark, Claudia, University of Alaska, USA
Cornwell, Bettina, University of Queensland, Australia
Csaba, Fabian Faurholt, Bilkent University, Turkey
Dalakas, Vassilis, Berry College, USA
Felix, Reto, University of Monterrey, Mexico
Fischer, Eileen, York University, Canada
Friend, Lorraine, University of Waikato, New Zealand
Friese, Susanne, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Gabel, Terry, Truman State University, USA
Gentry, Jim, University of Nebraska, USA
Ger, Güliz, Bilkent University, Turkey
Guennens, Maggie, University of Brussels (VUB), Belgium
Gilly, Mary, University of California (Irvine), USA
Gould, Stephen, City University of New York, USA
Grassl, Wolfgang, Hillsdale College, USA
Grunert, Klaus G., Aarhus School of Business, Denmark
Hansen, Flemming, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Hermesberger, Andrea, Universität Innsbruck, Austria
Herrmann, Andreas, Johannes Gutenberg-University Mainz, Germany
Hetzler, Patrick, Université Panthéon-Assas, France
Hildebrandt, Lutz, Humboldt-Universität Berlin, Germany
Hirschman, Elizabeth C., Princeton University, USA
Hogg, Margaret, UMIST, UK
Holmberg, Carina, KF Föreningsutveckling, Sweden
Hsu, Chung-kue, Monclair State University, USA
Hunt, Keith, Brigham Young University, USA
Jensen, Hans-Rask, University of Southern Denmark, Denmark
Jones, Marilyn, Bond University, Australia
Kaas, Klaus Peter, Johann Wolfgang Goethe-University Frankfurt (Main), Germany
Kapferer, Jean-Noel, Groupe HEC, France
Kassarijan, Hal, USA
Kates, Steven, Monash University, Australia
Knoops, Stan, Wageningen University, Netherlands
Kozinets, Robert, KGSM-Northwestern University, USA
Luna-Arocas, Roberto, Universidad de Valencia, Spain
Maher, Jill, Saint Joseph’s University, USA
Malaviya, Prashant, INSEAD, France
Martin, Ingrid, University of Colorado, USA
Mitchell, Andrew, University of Toronto, Canada
Mühlbacher, Hans, University of Innsbruck, Austria
Mulvey, Michael, Rutgers University, USA
Muncy, Jim, Valdosta State University, USA
Nakamoto, Kent, Virginia Tech, USA
Neibecker, Bruno, University of Karlsruhe, Germany
Neumaier, Maria, University of Wuppertal, Germany
Olsen, Douglas, University of Alberta, Canada
Oppenheim, Peter P., University of Ballarat, Australia
Padgett, Dan, Tulane University, USA
Park, Kyungae, Yeungnam University, South Korea
Peloso, Antony, Arizona State University, USA
Percy, Larry, Marketing-Communication-Advertising, USA
Pinson, Christian, INSEAD, France
Posselt, Thorsten, University of Leipzig, Germany
Putrevu, Sanjay, Brock University, Canada
Raghunathan, Raj, University of Texas (Austin), USA
Robben, Henry S.J., Universiteit Nijenrode, Netherlands
Rosa, Jose Antonio, Case Western Reserve University, USA
Rossiter, John R., University of Wollongong, Australia
Ruiz, Salvador, University of Murcia, Spain
Russo, Jay Edward, Cornell University, USA
Schade, Christian, Humboldt-Universität Berlin, Germany
Schmidt, Marcus, University of Southern Denmark, Denmark
Schmitt, Bernhard, Columbia University, USA
Schroeder, Johnathan, KTH, Sweden
Shaw, Michael, Monash University, Australia
Shimp, Terence A., University of South Carolina, USA
Smith, Craig, London Business School, UK
Solomon, Michael R., Auburn University, USA
Sowboda, Bernhard, Saarland University, Germany
Thelen, Eva, Universität Innsbruck, Austria
Trommsdorff, Volker, Technische Universität Berlin, Germany
Turley, Darach, Dublin City University, Ireland
van der Lans, Ivo, Wageningen University, Netherlands
Vanhuele, Marc, Groupe HEC, France
Ward, Tony, Central Queensland University, Australia
Warlop, Luk, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Belgium
Weidemanis Magi, Anne, Sweden
Weinberg, Peter, Saarland University, Germany
Wilkes, Robert, Texas Tech University, USA
Witkowski, Terrence, California State University, USA
Wong, Nancy, University of Hawaii (Manoa), USA
Wood, Charles, University of Tulsa, USA
Woratschek, Herbert, University of Bayreuth, Germany
Zaichkowsky, Judy, Simon Fraser University, Canada
ASSOCIATION FOR CONSUMER RESEARCH
EUROPEAN CONFERENCE 2001
June 20th – June 23rd, 2001
Hotel HILTON
Berlin, Germany

WEDNESDAY, JUNE 20, 2001

Welcome Reception
6:00 pm

THURSDAY, JUNE 21, 2001

SESSION 1.1
9:15 am – 10:45 am

Special Topic Session 111:  Understanding, Measuring and Engineering the Consumption Experience in the Online Environment

Chair:  Ashesh Mukherjee, McGill University, Canada
Discussant:  Gilles Laurent, Groupe HEC, France

SPECIAL SESSION SUMMARY
Understanding, Measuring and Engineering the Consumption Experience in the Online Environment
Laurette Dubé, McGill University, Canada
Ashesh Mukherjee, McGill University, Canada

Experience Cyberspace: Consumer Responses to New Technology
Annama Joy, Concordia University, Canada
John F. Sherry, Northwestern University, U.S.A.
Emotional Experience of E-Services: Structure, Antecedents, Moderators and Dynamic Modeling over Time

Laurette Dubé, McGill University, Canada
Demetrios Vakratsas, McGill University, Canada
Jianying Zhao, McGill University, Canada

Varieties of Consumer Experience: An Empirical Test in the Online Environment

J.J. Brakus, Columbia University, U.S.A.
Bernd Schmitt, Columbia University, U.S.A.

Competitive Paper Session 112: Consumers’ Health Concerns and Consumption

Chair: Klaus G. Grunert, Aarhus School of Business, Denmark
Discussant: Gerold Behrens, University of Wuppertal, Germany

Health as Consumption Object: Construct and Heuristic Study
Nicholas Gould, University of Glamorgan, U.K.
Elizabeth A. Gould, Gwent Health Authority, U.K.

The Changing Importance of Quality Aspects in Food Consumption
Joachim Scholderer, The Aarhus School of Business, Denmark
Karen Brunsø, The Aarhus School of Business, Denmark
Klaus G. Grunert, The Aarhus School of Business, Denmark
Carsten Stig Poulsen, The Aarhus School of Business, Denmark
John Thøgersen, Aarhus School of Business, Denmark

The Influence of Tasting Experience and Health Benefits on Nordic Consumers’ Rejection of Genetically Modified Foods
Tino Bech-Larsen, The Aarhus School of Business, Denmark
Klaus G. Grunert, The Aarhus School of Business, Denmark

Competitive Paper Session 113 Innovative Product Policy

Chair: Lutz Hildebrandt, Humboldt-Universität Berlin, Germany
Discussant: Volker Trommsdorff, Technische Universität Berlin, Germany

What’s New? A Multi-Dimensional Approach to Product Newness
Anne Michaut, Wageningen University, Netherlands
Jan-Benedict Steenkamp, Wageningen University, Netherlands
Hans van Trijp, Wageningen University, Netherlands

From Really New to More of the Same: The Effect of Familiarization on the Classification of Hybrid Products
Kaj P.N. Morel, Delft University of Technology, Netherlands
Jan P.L. Schoormans, Delft University of Technology, Netherlands
Peter W.J. Verlegh, Erasmus University, Netherlands

Situational Influences on Cross Category Comparisons in the Context of Consumer-Oriented Product Developments
Stan Knoops, Wageningen University/OP&P Product Research, Netherlands
Ivo A. van der Lans, Wageningen University, Netherlands
Jonathan Gutman, University of New Hampshire, U.S.A.
Special Topic Session 114  The Re-Emergence of the Body in Consumer Behavior Research

Chair:  Luk Warlop, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Belgium
Discussant:  Russell W. Belk, University of Utah, U.S.A.

SPECIAL SESSION SUMMARY
The Re-Emergence of the Body in Consumer Behavior Research ................................................................. 18
Luk Warlop, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Belgium
Suzanne C. Beckmann, Copenhagen Business School and Saatchi & Saatchi, Denmark

The Impact of Girls’ Views and Concerns about Physical Appearance on Perceptual Distortions, Self-ideal
Discrepancies, and Body Alteration Behaviors
Luk Warlop, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Belgium
Davy Lerouge, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Belgium
Robin Heymans, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Belgium

Denial of Identity in Eating Disorders: A Case Study from “Advertising for a Good Cause” in Denmark 2000
Suzanne C. Beckmann, Copenhagen Business School and Saatchi & Saatchi, Denmark
Pernille Helweg, Saatchi & Saatchi, Denmark

“I HATE MY BODY!” Body Image, the Negative Self, Fashion and Clothing
Emma N. Banister, UMIST, U.K.
Margaret K. Hogg, UMIST, U.K.

The Politics of Consumption: The Role of Body Adornment and the Self-Reflexive Body in Lifestyle Cultures and Identity
Anne Velliquette, University of Utah, U.S.A.
Gary Bamossy, University of Utah, U.S.A.

THURSDAY, JUNE 21, 2001

SESSION 1.2
11:00 am – 12:30 pm

Competitive Paper Session 121  Brand Extension and Brand Commitment

Chair:  Sigrid Bekmeier-Feuerhahn, University of Lüneburg, Germany
Discussant:  Franz-Rudolf Esch, Justus Liebig-University Gießen, Germany

Contextual Influences on Consumers’ Evaluation of Brand Extensions: A Quasi-Experimental Field Study ............ 23
Rune Lines, Norwegian School of Economics and Business Administration, Norway
Leif E. Hem, Foundation for Research in Economics and Business Administration, Norway
Kjell Gronhaug, Norwegian School of Economics and Business Administration, Norway

The Determination Roles of Category and Attribute Factors on the Reciprocal Effects of Brand Extensions ............. 24
Joseph W. Chang, UMIST, U.K.

Product-Class Effects on Brand Commitment and Brand Outcomes: The Role of Brand Trust and Brand Affect .......... 30
Arjun Chaudhuri, Fairfield University, U.S.A.
Morris B. Holbrook, Columbia University, U.S.A.
Competitive Paper Session 122  

*The Influence of Time and the Right Timing: Time as a Determining Factor in Consumer Research*

Chair: Christian Schade, Humboldt-Universität Berlin, Germany  
Discussant: Gavan Fitzsimons, University of Pennsylvania, U.S.A.

*The Value of Consumers’ Time: Interdisciplinary Understanding and Experimental Evidence of Situational Influences*  
Sabine M. Schaeffer, Universitaet Bayreuth, Germany

*Timing and Contextual Effects on Satisfaction Measurement*  
Andreas H. Zins, Vienna University of Economics and Business Administration, Austria

*Show and Tell: Advertisers’ Use of Rhetoric Over Time*  
Barbara J. Phillips, University of Saskatchewan, Canada  
Edward F. McQuarrie, Santa Clara University, U.S.A.

Special Topic Session 123  

*Dual-Process Theories in Affective Persuasion*

Chair: Anick Bosmans, Ghent University, Belgium  
Discussant: Anick Bosmans, Ghent University, Belgium

*SPECIAL SESSION SUMMARY*  

*Dual-Process Theories in Affective Persuasion*  
Anick Bosmans, Ghent University, Belgium

*Prior Attitudes and Consumer Judgements: The Effect of Valence, Extremity and Elaboration*  
Carlos Falces, Universidad Autonoma de Madrid, Spain  
Benjamin Sierra, Universidad Autonoma de Madrid, Spain  
Elena Alier, Universidad Autonoma de Madrid, Spain  
Pablo Briñol, Universidad Autonoma de Madrid, Spain

*The Influence of Mood on the Evaluation of Negatively Valenced Mental Categories*  
Anick Bosmans, Ghent University, Belgium  
Patrick Van Kenhove, Ghent University, Belgium  
Peter Vlerick, Ghent University, Belgium  
Hendrik Hendrickx, Ghent University, Belgium

*Extending Dual-Process Models: The CASCADES Model*  
Andreas Strebinger, Vienna University of Economics and Business Administration, Austria
Special Topic Session 124  *The Original Marketing Paradox: “Product Needs” versus “Individualized Financial Solutions”*

Chair: Johan De Heer, Tilburg University, Netherlands
Discussant: Klaus Peter Kaas, Johann Wolfgang Goethe-University Frankfurt (Main), Germany

**SPECIAL SESSION SUMMARY**

**The Original Marketing Paradox: “Product Needs” versus “Individualized Financial Solutions”: Predicting and Understanding Consumer Saving Behavior Using a New Methodology to Assess the Dynamics of Psychological Variables**
- Johan De Heer, Tilburg University, Netherlands
- Ton Kuijlen, Tilburg University, Netherlands
- Leo Paas, Tilburg University, Netherlands

**Towards an Economic Psychology Perspective of Saving Behavior**
- Johan De Heer, Tilburg University, Netherlands

**Explaining Steps Taken in a Hierarchy of Saving Products Related to Different Saving Needs**
- Leo Paas, Tilburg University, Netherlands

**Relationship Between Acquisition Pattern Position and Information Need**
- Ton Kuijlen, Tilburg University, Netherlands

---

**THURSDAY, JUNE 21, 2001**

**SESSION 1.3**
2:00 pm – 3:30 pm

---

**Competitive Paper Session 131  Provocative Consumer Research and New Developments in Marketing**

Chair: Gary Bamossy, University of Utah, U.S.A.
Discussant: Russell Belk, University of Utah, U.S.A.

**Disciplinary Power and Consumer Research: An Introduction**
- David Marsden, Napier University Business School, U.K.

**FCUK Consumer Research: On Disgust, Revulsion and Other Forms of Offensive Advertising**
- Stephen Brown, University of Ulster, U.K.
- Hope Schau, Temple University, U.S.A.

**Consumer Research Implications of Marketing and ICT Developments**
- Theo B.C. Poiesz, Tilburg University, Netherlands
- Johan de Heer, Tilburg University, Netherlands
- W. Fred van Raaij, Tilburg University, Netherlands
Competitive Paper Session 132  Values and Value Measurement in Marketing

Chair: Volker Trommsdorff, Technische Universität Berlin, Germany
Discussant: Klaus G. Grunert, Aarhus School of Business, Denmark

A Value Inventory and Value Dimensions .......................................................... 73
    Joke Oppenhuisen, University of Amsterdam, Netherlands
    Dirk Sikkel, University of Amsterdam, Netherlands

Deriving Wine Marketing Strategies by Combining Means-End Chains with an Occasion Based CHAID
Segmentation Analysis ...................................................................................... 82
    John Hall, Victoria University, Australia
    Peter P. Oppenheim, University of Ballarat, Australia
    Larry Lockshin, University of South Australia, Australia

Motivations Underlying Commercial Web Sites Censorship: The Third-Person Perception .......... 90
    Fang Wan, Vanderbilt University, U.S.A.
    Seounmi Youn, University of North Dakota, U.S.A.
    Ronald J. Faber, University of Minnesota, U.S.A.

Special Topic Session 133  Retailing From A Behavioural Point of View

Chair: Bernhard Swoboda, Saarland University, Germany
Discussant: George E. Belch, San Diego State University, U.S.A.

SPECIAL SESSION SUMMARY
Retailing From a Behavioural Point of View ........................................................ 101
    Bernhard Swoboda, Saarland University, Germany

Convenience Orientation – Consumer Preferences and Measurement with Conjoint Analysis .......... 102
    Bernhard Swoboda, Saarland University, Germany

Retail Branding as a Goal of Strategic Retail Marketing - A Causal Model from the Perspective of Consumer Research .......................................................... 107
    Dirk Morschett, Saarland University, Germany

Using Lifestyle in Environmental Psychology .................................................. 111
    Ralf Terlutter, Saarland University, Germany

Virtual Stores on the Internet: Design of Emotional Online Shopping Offers on the Internet from a Behavioral Point of View ......................................................... 115
    Sandra Diehl, Saarland University, Germany
Special Topic Session 141  Consumer Behavior in the Global Context

Chair: Durairaj Maheswaran, New York University, U.S.A.
Discussant: Richard Bagozzi, University of Michigan, U.S.A.

SPECIAL SESSION SUMMARY
Consumer Behavior in the Global Context ................................................................. 120
  Nidhi Agrawal, New York University, U.S.A.
  Rujirutana Mandhachitara, New York University, U.S.A.
  Durairaj Maheswaran, New York University, U.S.A.

Subjective Norms and the Animosity Model: Social Pressure within a Collectivist Culture
  Jill G. Klein, INSEAD, France
  Philippe DeBroux, Soka University, Japan

A Cross-Cultural Assessment of Materialism’s Conceptualization, Characteristics, and Consequences
  Nancy Wong, University of Hawaii, U.S.A.
  Aric Rindfleisch, University of Arizona, U.S.A.
  James Burroughs, University of Virginia, U.S.A.

The Influence of Cultural Orientation on Country of Origin Stereotypes
  Julie Anne Lee, University of Miami, U.S.A.
  Ellen Garbarino, Weatherland School of Management, U.S.A.
  Dawn Lerman, Fordham University, U.S.A.
  Marty Horn, DDB Needham, U.S.A.
  Kay Satow, U.S.A.

Cross-Cultural Inquiry: Issues and Research Directions
  Nidhi Agrawal, New York University, U.S.A.
  Durairaj Maheswaran, New York University, U.S.A.
  Rujirutana Mandhachitara, New York University, U.S.A.

Competitive Paper Session 142  What Drives the Consumers’ Behavior? Self-Symbolism, Self-Identity, and Motivations

Chair: Sigrid Bekmeier-Feuerhahn, University of Lüneburg, Germany
Discussant: Gerold Behrens, University of Wuppertal, Germany

More Than a Feeling: An Exploration into the Self-Symbolic Consumption of Music .................................................. 124
  Gretchen Larsen, University of Otago, New Zealand
  Rob Lawson, University of Otago, New Zealand
  Sarah Todd, University of Otago, New Zealand
Self-Identity and Purchase Intention: An Extension of the Theory of Planned Behaviour .......................... 130
Stefano Puntoni, London Business School, U.K.

An Exploratory Study of Grocery Shopping Motivations ............................................................................. 135
Maggie Geuens, Ghent University, Belgium
Malaika Brengman, University of Brussels (VUB), Belgium
Rosette S’Jegers, University of Brussels (VUB), Belgium

Special Topic Session 143  Alternative Promotional Strategies

Chair: Peter R. Darke, University of British Columbia, Canada
Discussant: Gilles Laurent, Groupe HEC, France

SPECIAL SESSION SUMMARY
Alternative Promotional Strategies: Salience and Inference ........................................................................ 141
Peter R. Darke, University of British Columbia, Canada

The Attentional Effects of Sales Promotions at the Point of Purchase and at the Point of Consumption
Pierre Chandon, INSEAD, France

Effects of Pricing and Promotion on Perceptions of Product Quality: It Depends on How You Frame It
Peter R. Darke, University of British Columbia, Canada
Cindy M.Y. Chung, Nanyang Technological University, Singapore

Free Gift with Purchase: Promoting or Discounting the Brand?
Priya Raghubir, University of California (Berkeley), U.S.A.

FRIDAY, JUNE 22, 2001
SESSION 2.1
9:00 am – 10:30 am

Competitive Paper Session 211  Tortillas, Vodka, and Veils - Still Significant Cultural Symbols?

Chair: Stephen Brown, University of Ulster, U.K.
Discussant: Søren Askegaard, Odense University, Denmark

Families in the Transforming Russian Society: Observations from Visits to Families in Novgorod the Great ......... 145
Karin M. Ekström, Göteborg University, Sweden
Marianne P. Ekström, Göteborg University, Sweden
Helena Shanahan, Göteborg University, Sweden

Islamic Consumptionscape in Turkey: Practices and Strategies of Faithful Consumption ............................. 155
Özlem Sandikci, Bilkent University, Turkey
Güliz Ger, Bilkent University, Turkey
Competitive Paper Session 212  The Effect of Celebrity Endorsements And Repetition in Advertising

Chair: Gerold Behrens, University of Wuppertal, Germany
Discussant: Larry Percy, U.S.A.

From Fame to Fortune: A Meta-analytic Review of Celebrity Endorsements in Persuasive Communication ………… 156
Angela van der Lee, University of Amsterdam, Netherlands
Bas van den Putte, University of Amsterdam, Netherlands

Symbolic Meaning and the Elaboration Likelihood Model: Preliminary Insights ......................................................... 157
Brett A.S. Martin, University of Auckland, New Zealand
Michael J. Sherrard, University of Auckland, New Zealand
Yasutoshi Imura, Mitsubishi Motors, New Zealand

Advertising Repetition, Memory, and Attitudes …………………………………………………………………………… 158
Jennifer Christie, University of Arkansas, U.S.A.
Thomas D. Jensen, University of Arkansas, U.S.A.

Special Topic Session 213  The Conscious and Unconscious Influences of Affective Responses

Chair: Jordan L. Le Bel, Concordia University, Canada
Discussant: Andrew Mitchell, University of Toronto, Canada

SPECIAL SESSION SUMMARY
The Conscious and Unconscious Influences of Affective Responses on Consumer Experience, Choice, and Behavior …………………………………………………………………………………………………………………………… 163
Jordan L. LeBel, Concordia University, Canada

When Emotion is for Doing: Subliminal Affective Priming Influences Consumption Behavior and Evaluations
Without Producing a Subjective Experience
Piotr Winkielman, University of Denver, U.S.A.
Kent Berridge, University of Michigan, U.S.A.
Julie Wilbarger, University of Denver, U.S.A.

Motivational Influences of Negative Affect on Consumer Decision Making
Raj Raghunathan, University of Texas (Austin), U.S.A.
Michel Tuan Pham, Columbia University, U.S.A.
Kim P. Corfman, New York University, U.S.A.

Experience Counts: Affective Experience Influences Consumer Decision-Making Under High and Low Elaboration Conditions
Peter R. Darke, University of British Columbia, Canada
Amitava Chattopadhyay, INSEAD, France
Laurence Ashworth, University of British Columbia, Canada

Sensory Knowledge and Attentional Focus During Consumption as Modulators of Behavioral Responses to Hedonic Stimuli: The Role of Pleasure and Judgement Fluency
Jordan L. Le Bel, Concordia University, Canada
Laurette Dubé, McGill University, Canada
Special Topic Session 214  Portrayals of Environmental Myths and Images in European Adverts and the News Media

Chair:  Susanne Friese, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Discussant:  James A. Fitchett, University of Exeter, U.K.

SPECIAL SESSION SUMMARY
Portrayals of Environmental Myths and Images in European Adverts and the News Media ................................. 164
Lucia Reisch, University of Hohenheim, Germany
Susanne Friese, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark

Environmentally Significant Behaviour in Europe: Media Coverage and the Political, Economic and Cultural Climate
Brigitta Gatersleben, University of Surrey, U.K.
Linda Steg, University of Groningen, Netherlands

Analysing Multimedia Data Using ATLAS.ti: A Computer-aided Qualitative Data Analysis Approach
Susanne Friese, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark

Mass Mediated Environmental Consumer Socialization in Germany: A Qualitative Investigation
Lucia A. Reisch, University of Hohenheim, Germany
Marleen Strategier, Catholic University of Brabant, Netherlands

Articulating Nature: The Construction of Nature and the Environment in Television Advertising in the UK, Germany, and Denmark
Anders Hansen, University of Leicester, U.K.
Alison Anderson, University of Plymouth, U.K.

FRIDAY, JUNE 22, 2001
SESSION 2.2
11:00 am – 12:30 pm

Competitive Paper Session 221  The Specific Needs of Men and Women and the Relevance to Marketing Communication

Chair:  Özlem Sandikci, Bilkent University, Turkey
Discussant:  Özlem Sandikci, Bilkent University, Turkey

Shifting Masculinities: Advertising, Male Bodies and the Male Gaze ................................................................. 167
Maurice Patterson, Nottingham Trent University, U.K.

Marketing´ s Interpretive Communities: A Case Study of Gay Men’s Responses to Advertising ............................ 168
Steven M. Kates, Monash University, Australia

The Joys of Text: Women’s Experiential Consumption of Magazines ............................................................... 169
Lorna Stevens, University of Ulster, Northern Ireland
Stephen Brown, University of Ulster, Northern Ireland
Pauline Maclaran, De Montfort University, U.K.
Competitive Paper Session 222  

Methodological Approaches to Consumer Behavior

Chair: Herbert Woratschek, University of Bayreuth, Germany
Discussant: Luk Warlop, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Belgium

A Range Model of Overall Evaluation: Extending the Ideal Point Model ................................................................. 174
Elizabeth Cowley, University of New South Wales, Australia
John R. Rossiter, University of Wollongong, Australia

Using Unobtrusive Methods in Consumer Research: An Assessment ................................................................. 180
Marcus Schmidt, University of Southern Denmark, Denmark
Niels Krause, The Danish Commissioner of Police, Denmark

Investigating the Brand Choice Decision Using Hierarchical Models on Aggregated Panel Data .................. 187
Lutz Hildebrandt, Humboldt-University of Berlin, Germany
Kerstin Kamlage, Humboldt-University of Berlin, Germany

Special Topic Session 223  

Marketers-Efficient Pebble Counters, Heavy Eaters, or Highly Intelligent: Twenty Years Later What Are We Doing To Develop Better Measures To Support The Advancement of Consumer Theory

Chairs: Cristel A. Russell, San Diego State University, U.S.A.
Heather Honea, San Diego State University, U.S.A.
Discussant: George Zinkhan, University of Georgia, U.S.A.
Iris Junglas, University of Georgia, U.S.A.

SPECIAL SESSION SUMMARY

Developing Better Marketing Measure: In Search of Nomological Validity ................................................................. 193
Heather Honea, San Diego State University, U.S.A.
Cristel A. Russell, San Diego State University, U.S.A.

Using Nested Models to Examine Perceptions of Easy-Difficult
Mark Leach, Loyola Marymount University, U.S.A.
Michael Hennessy, The University of Pennsylvania, U.S.A.
Martin Fishbein, The University of Pennsylvania, U.S.A.

The Consumption of Regular Television Programming: Development and Validation of the Connectedness Scale
Cristel A. Russell, San Diego State University, U.S.A.
Andrew Norman, Iowa State University, U.S.A.

“I Got a Deal!?” Defining the Affective Dimension of Promotional Purchases
Darren W. Dahl, University of Manitoba, U.S.A.
Heather Honea, San Diego State University, U.S.A.
Special Topic Session Session 224  What are the Chances? Biases in the Assessment of Probability and Risk

Chairs: Tina Kiesler, University of California, Northridge, U.S.A.
      Vicki G. Morwitz, New York University, U.S.A.
Discussant: Christian Schade, Humboldt-Universität Berlin, Germany

SPECIAL SESSION SUMMARY
What are the Chances? Biases in the Assessment of Probability and Risk ................................................................. 195
Tina Kiesler, California State University, Northridge, U.S.A.
Vicki G. Morwitz, New York University, U.S.A.

We’re at as Much Risk as We’re Led to Believe
Geeta Menon, New York University, U.S.A.
Lauren Block, CUNY, Baruch College, U.S.A.
Suresh Ramanathan, New York University, U.S.A.

Behavioral Consequences of HIV Testing
Sankar Sen, CUNY, Baruch College, U.S.A.
C.B. Bhattacharya, Boston University, U.S.A.
Rose L. Johnson, Strategic Business Research, U.S.A.

Reserves, Regret, and Rejoicing in Open English Auctions: An Experimental Study
Eric A. Greenleaf, New York University, U.S.A.

The Ball Bounces Differently for Experts and Novices
Tina Kiesler, University of California (Los Angeles), U.S.A.
Vicki G. Morwitz, New York University, U.S.A.
Eric Yorkston, USC, U.S.A.

FRIDAY, JUNE 22, 2001

SESSION 2.3
2:00 pm – 3:30 pm

Competitive Paper Session 231  I Love It, I Go For It! - Consumers’ Desires and Experiences

Chair: Volker Trommsdorff, Technische Universität Berlin, Germany
Discussant: Peter Weinberg, Saarland University, Germany

Experiential Positioning: Strategic Differentiation of Customer-Brand Relationships .................................................. 196
Michael S. Mulvey, Rutgers University, U.S.A.
Dan Padgett, Tulane University, U.S.A.

Specialty Magazines and Flights of Fancy: Feeding the Desire to Desire ................................................................. 197
Russell W. Belk, University of Utah, U.S.A.

Dance Clubs, Rave and the Consumer Experience: An Exploratory Study of a Subcultural Phenomenon ................. 203
Christina Goulding, University of Wolverhampton, U.K.
Avi Shankar, University of Exeter, U.K.
Richard Elliott, University of Exeter, U.K.
Special Topic Session 232  The Psychology of Presenters

Chair: Lynn Kahle, University of Oregon, U.S.A.
Discussant: Terence A. Shimp, University of South Carolina, U.S.A.

The Psychology of Source and Presenter Effects: Social Adaptation Theory Contributions
David Toumajian, University of Oregon, U.S.A.
Lynn Kahle, University of Oregon, U.S.A.

Source Effects in Persuasion: An Elaboration Likelihood Model Perspective
Curtis P. Haugtvedt, Ohio State University, U.S.A.

Presenter Effects in Advertising: The VisCAP Model
John R. Rossiter, University of Wollongong, Australia
Ale Smidts, Rotterdam School of Management, Netherlands

Competitive Paper Session 233  Information Processing

Chair: Klaus Peter Kaas, Johann Wolfgang Goethe-University Frankfurt (Main), Germany
Discussant: Thorsten Posselt, University of Leipzig, Germany

The Impact of Contrast Interval Length and Type on Information Retention: Are Silence and Music Equivalent?
Douglas Olsen, University of Alberta, Canada

A Test of the Renewable Resources Model of Multiple Gains and Multiple Losses
Sandra C. Jones, The University of Western Australia and Curtin University of Technology, Australia

Product Instructions as a Means of Fulfilling Consumers' Usage Goals
Ingrid M. Martin, California State University-Long Beach, U.S.A.
Valerie S. Folkes, University of Southern California, U.S.A.

Friday, June 22, 2001
Session 2.4
4:00 pm – 5:30 pm

Competitive Paper Session 241  Don’t Worry, Be Happy! Consumers’ Emotions

Chair: Peter Weinberg, Saarland University, Germany
Discussant: Peter Weinberg, Saarland University, Germany

A Differentiated View of Pleasure: Review of the Literature and Research Propositions
Laurette Dubé, McGill University, Canada
Jordan L. Le Bel, Concordia University, Canada
Consumer and Happiness. An Approach to Integrate the Concept of Happiness into Marketing Theory .................. 227
Pakize Schuchert-Güler, Freie Universität Berlin, Germany
Martin Eisend, Freie Universität Berlin, Germany
Holger Lütters, Freie Universität Berlin, Germany

Investigating the Effect of Components of Consumption Emotions on Service Evaluation .............................. 233
Kalyani Menon, Wilfried Laurier University, Canada
Laurette Dubé, McGill University, Canada

Competitive Paper Session 242  Alternative Theoretical Approaches to Consumer Research
Chair: Bruno Neibecker, University of Karlsruhe, Germany
Discussant: Gerold Behrens, University of Wuppertal, Germany

Interpretivist And Positivist Insights into Museum Consumption: An Empirical Enquiry into Paradigm Compatibility ........................................................................................................... 234
Andrea Davies, University of Exeter, U.K.
James A. Fitchett, University of Exeter, U.K.

Cyber-Research: Metamorphosis on the Internet ............................................................................................... 240
Charles A. McMellon, Hofstra University, U.S.A.

Special Topic Session 243  Cross-Border Shopping
Chair: Søren Askegaard, Odense University, Denmark
Discussant: Bernhard Swoboda, Saarland University, Germany

Special Session Summary
Cross-Border Shopping ....................................................................................................................................... 245
Søren Askegaard, Odense University, Denmark

Cross-border Shopping in the Open European Market: 1 Litre of Hard Liquor, 20 Litres of Wine, 24 Litre of Beer, 400 Cigarettes, Max. 30 kilo! ................................................................. 246
Anders Bengtsson, Lund University, Sweden
Jacob Östberg, Lund University, Sweden
Søren Askegaard, Odense University, Denmark

A Tale of Two Malls: An Exploration of Shopping Practices and Commercial Designs across Cultures
Fabian F. Csaba, Bilkent University, Turkey
Asli Tokman, Bilkent University, Turkey

The Paradox of Crossing Borders in a Border-less World .................................................................................. 253
Diana Storm, Odense University, Denmark
Competitive Paper Session 311  
Who Am I? Consumer Behavior and The Self

Chair: Christian Schade, Humboldt-Universität Berlin, Germany
Discussant: Christian Schade, Humboldt-Universität Berlin, Germany

Entering the Empty Nest Stage: A Multi-Method Exploration of Women’s Life Experiences and Coping Strategies in Periods of Life Stage Transition ................................................................. 260
Carolyn Folkman Curasi, Berry College, U.S.A.
Margaret K. Hogg, UMIST, U.K.
Pauline Maclaran, De Montfort University, U.K.

Exploring the Impact of Gender Identity within Consumers’ Self-schemas on their Consumption of Advertising .......... 268
Margaret K. Hogg, UMIST, U.K.
Jade Garrow, UMIST, U.K.

Using Self-Reference Theory to Explain the Effectiveness of Including Ethnic Minority Models in Advertising .......... 269
Christina Kwai-Choi Lee, University of Auckland, New Zealand
Nalini Fernandez, Royal Sun Alliance, New Zealand

Competitive Paper Session 312  
The Relationship Between the Online Retailer and Online Consumers: Design, Satisfaction, and Values

Chair: Bruno Neibecker, University of Karlsruhe, Germany
Discussant: John R. Rossiter, University of Wollongong, Australia

Webscape: A Theoretical Framework of Web Site Design Impact on Consumers’ Responses ........................................... 270
Jean-Philippe Galan, University of Social Sciences at Toulouse, France
Christine Gonzalez, University of Paris-Dauphine, France

Satisfaction, Trust and Commitment in Consumers’ Relationships with Online Retailers ........................................... 276
Janet Wagner, University of Maryland, U.S.A.
Gabrielle Rydstrom, Barton-Cotton, Inc., U.S.A.

A Cross-Cultural Study on Consumer Values of Web Navigation and the Internet Shopping Behaviors ..................... 281
Cheol Park, Korea University, South Korea
Special Topic Session 313  The Role of “Fit” in Cause Related Marketing

Chair: John W. Pracejus, University of Alberta, Canada
Discussant: Gary Bamossy, University of Utah, U.S.A.

SPECIAL SESSION SUMMARY
The Role of “Fit” in Cause Related Marketing ................................................................. 286
John W. Pracejus, University of Alberta, Canada

Fortifying or Diluting Equity via Association: The Case of Sponsorship
Karen Becker-Olsen, New York University, U.S.A.
Carolyn J. Simmons, University of Virginia, U.S.A.

Nonprofit-Business Alliance: Outcomes of Joint Communications
Sridhar Samu, Memorial University of Newfoundland, Canada
Walter Wymer, Christopher Newport University, U.S.A.

Fit Between Brand and Non-profit Organizations: the Impact on Choice for the Sponsoring Brand
John W. Pracejus, University of Alberta, Canada
Douglas Olsen, University of Alberta, Canada

SPECIAL TOPIC SESSION 321  Advertising and Other Communication Effects in Low-Involvement Situations, with Special Emphasis on Emotional Effects and Effects upon Attitudes towards the Message

Chair: Flemming Hansen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Discussant: Flemming Hansen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark

SPECIAL SESSION SUMMARY
Advertising and Communication Effects in Low-Involvement Situations, with Special Emphasis on Emotional Effects and Effects upon Attitudes Towards the Message ................................................................. 290
Flemming Hansen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark

The Role of Emotion in Processing Low Involvement Advertising ............................................. 293
Larry Percy, U.S.A.

Emotions in Mass Communication
A Study Investigating Relations Between Cognitive Categories/Cultural Narrative and Psycho-Physiological Phenomenon in the Perception of Visual Stimuli ................................................................. 297
Anders A. Rasmussen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
A Procedure for Testing the Emotional and Attitudinal Effects of Design ................................................................. 300
  Tore Kristensen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
  Gorm Gabrielsen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
  Flemming Hansen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
  Jens Halling, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark

Estimation of Emotional and Evaluating Effects of Sport Sponsorships ................................................................. 310
  Flemming Hansen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
  Jens Halling, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
  Gitte Bach Lauritsen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark

Evaluation of Public Spokespersons ......................................................................................................................... 318
  Flemming Hansen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
  Christian Kock, University of Copenhagen, Denmark

Competitive Paper Session 322  Message Processing, Knowledge and Ethnic Identification

Chair: Thorsten Posselt, University of Leipzig, Germany
Discussant: Güliz Ger, Bilkent University, Turkey

Ease of Message Processing and Judgement
  Prashant Malaviya, INSEAD, France
  George A. Bakamitsos, Dartmouth College, U.S.A.
  Brian Sternthal, Northwestern University, U.S.A.
  Alice M. Tybout, Northwestern University, U.S.A.

The Country-of-Origin Effect and Brand Origin Knowledge: How Little Consumers Know and How Important Knowledge Is ................................................................. 325
  Terence A. Shimp, University of South Carolina, U.S.A.
  Saeed Samiee, University of Tulsa, U.S.A.
  Subhash Sharma, University of South Carolina, U.S.A.

The Impact of the Intensity of Ethnic Identification Upon Consumer Behavior ......................................................... 327
  Nexhimi Rexha, Curtin University of Technology, Australia
  Russel P.J. Kingshott, Curtin University of Technology, Australia

Competitive Paper Session 323  Persuasive Communication: How to Make Oneself Heard by The Consumer

Chair: George E. Belch, San Diego State University, U.S.A.
Discussant: Michael A. Belch, San Diego State University, U.S.A.

EURO2000: A Study on the Influence of Program-Involvement on Commercial Selection and Memory in a Real Life Setting ................................................................. 334
  Marjolein Moorman, University of Amsterdam, Netherlands
  Peter Neijens, University of Amsterdam, Netherlands
  Edith G. Smit, University of Amsterdam, Netherlands

The Use of Humor in Threat-Related Advertising: An Experiential Processing Perspective ........................................ 335
  Ashesh Mukherjee, McGill University, Canada
  Laurette Dubé, McGill University, Canada
Are Negative Frames More Persuasive than Positive Frames for Senior Citizens? An Exploratory Investigation of Age Differences in Framing Effects

Rama Jayanti, Cleveland State University, U.S.A.

Author Index
European Advances in Consumer Research

Volume 5

Andrea Gröppel-Klein
Franz-Rudolf Esch
European Advances in Consumer Research, Volume 5
(Valdosta, GA: Association for Consumer Research, 2001)
Preface

The mission of the European Association for Consumer Research Conference was to present an international forum for researchers from Europe and from all other continents who are interested in consumer behavior. The European ACR conference took place for the fifth time. We are very glad that Germany had the honor to host this year’s EACR conference and that scholars from all over the world were able to meet and exchange their ideas and different views on consumer research. Authors, chairs, discussants and reviewers came from twenty-five different nations located on five different continents. These colleagues formed the core of the conference and only their excellent professional efforts made this successful meeting possible. Therefore, we want to express our special thanks to all of them: for submitting proposals, for reviewing, for presenting their ideas, and for chairing and leading discussions.

Organizing such a conference always implies the support of many other people. First of all we are very grateful for the help of Jim Muncy, ACR’s Executive Secretary. We deeply appreciated his patient advice.

In addition, we would like to thank all our colleagues from the German Consumer Behavior Research Group (in German: Forschungsgruppe Konsum & Verhalten or "K&V-Group") who not only provided ”psychological support”, but also helped us to find our sponsors. Thanks to our sponsors we were able to provide one or the other delicacy to fulfill our ”needs” for sensual pleasure with our receptions and especially with the Special Dinner Event on top of the Reichtstag building, which was one of the highlights of the conference.

Last but not least we owe Dorothea Baun a debt of gratitude. She is an academic assistant at the European University Viadrina. Her help covered correspondence with authors and participants, providing and maintaining the database as well as the conference webpages – among a thousand other things. She was the ”good soul” throughout the time of preparation.

It was a rewarding experience to organize the European ACR conference, and we deeply appreciate that we had this unique opportunity to welcome everybody to Berlin. All the acknowledging comments that we received after the conference were the best reward we could think of. We hope that the participants were inspired with many new ideas for their research projects and future co-operation with other colleagues. Furthermore, we hope the participants could afford some time off for sightseeing in Berlin – probably one of the most fascinating cities in Europe – and experienced on the one hand the beauty and vividness of Germany’s capital and on the other hand, maybe noticed some of the problems the reunification brought about. The reunification is still a miracle in history and we are very grateful that the Fifth European ACR conference could take place in the historic center of Berlin which – eleven years ago – was part of the former GDR.

Andrea Gröppel-Klein, European University Viadrina, Frankfurt (Oder), Germany
Franz-Rudolf Esch, Justus Liebig-University, Gießen, Germany
Conference Co-Chairs

Andrea Groeppel-Klein
European University Viadrina, Germany

Franz-Rudolf Esch
Justus Liebig-University Giessen, Germany

Conference Committee

Gerold Behrens, University of Wuppertal, Germany
Sigrid Bekmeier-Feuerhahn, University of Lüneburg, Germany
Lutz Hildebrandt, Humboldt-Universität Berlin, Germany
Klaus Peter Kaas, Johann Wolfgang Goethe-University Frankfurt (Main), Germany
Bruno Neibecker, University of Karlsruhe, Germany
Thorsten Posselt, University of Leipzig, Germany
Christian Schade, Humboldt-Universität Berlin, Germany
Volker Trommsdorff, Technische Universität Berlin, Germany
Peter Weinberg, Saarland University, Germany

Special Thanks to

Dorothea Baun, European University Viadrina, Germany
Anja Domke, European University Viadrina, Germany
Thade Dudzik, European University Viadrina, Germany
Claas Christian Germelmann, European University Viadrina, Germany
Patrick Geus, Justus Liebig-University Gießen, Germany
Jörg Jeromin, European University Viadrina, Germany
Maria Kromp, European University Viadrina, Germany
Tobias Langner, Justus Liebig-University Gießen, Germany
Anna Slupinska, European University Viadrina, Germany
Kerstin Wunderlich, European University Viadrina, Germany
Reviewers

Alba, Joe, University of Florida, USA
Askegaard, Søren, Odense University, Denmark
Baker, Stacey, Bowling Green State University, USA
Balderjahn, Ingo, University of Potsdam, Germany
Ballesteros, Carlos, Universidad Pontifica Comillas, Spain
Balloffet, Pierre, Ecole des Hautes Etudes Commerciales (Montréal), Canada
Bamossy, Gary, University of Utah, USA
Barnes, James, University of Mississippi, USA
Bean, Cindy, University of South Florida, USA
Beckmann, Susanne, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Bekmeier-Feuerhahn, Sigrid, University of Lüneburg, Germany
Belch, George E., San Diego State University, USA
Belch, Michael A., San Diego State University, USA
Biswas, Dip, University of California (Irvine), USA
Bolle, Friedel, European University Viadrina, Germany
Bonsu, Sammy, University of North Carolina, USA
Bristol, Terry, Arizona State University West, USA
Clark, Claudia, University of Alaska, USA
Cornwell, Bettina, University of Queensland, Australia
Csaba, Fabian Faurholt, Bilkent University, Turkey
Dalakas, Vassilis, Berry College, USA
Felix, Reto, University of Monterrey, Mexico
Fischer, Eileen, York University, Canada
Friend, Lorraine, University of Waikato, New Zealand
Friese, Susanne, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Gabel, Terry, Truman State University, USA
Gentry, Jim, University of Nebraska, USA
Ger, Güliz, Bilkent University, Turkey
Guensburg, Maggie, University of Brussels (VUB), Belgium
Gilly, Mary, University of California (Irvine), USA
Gould, Stephen, City University of New York, USA
Grassl, Wolfgang, Hillsdale College, USA
Grunt, Klaus G., Aarhus School of Business, Denmark
Hansen, Flemming, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Hermens, Andrea, Universität Innsbruck, Austria
Herrmann, Andreas, Johannes Gutenberg-University Mainz, Germany
Hetzl, Patrick, Université Panthéon-Assas, France
Hildebrandt, Lutz, Humboldt-Universität Berlin, Germany
Hirschman, Elizabeth C., Princeton University, USA
Hogg, Margaret, UMIST, UK
Holmberg, Carina, KF Föreningsutveckling, Sweden
Hsu, Chung-kue, Monclair State University, USA
Hunt, Keith, Brigham Young University, USA
Jensen, Hans-Rask, University of Southern Denmark, Denmark
Jones, Marilyn, Bond University, Australia
Kaas, Klaus Peter, Johann Wolfgang Goethe-University Frankfurt (Main), Germany
Kapferer, Jean-Noel, Groupe HEC, France
Kassariani, Hal, USA
Kates, Steven, Monash University, Australia
Knoops, Stan, Wageningen University, Netherlands
Kozinet, Robert, KGS-Northwestern University, USA
Luna-Arocas, Roberto, Universidad de Valencia, Spain
Maher, Jill, Saint Joseph’s University, USA
Malavija, Prashant, INSEAD, France
Martin, Ingrid, University of Colorado, USA
Mitchell, Andrew, University of Toronto, Canada
Mühlbacher, Hans, University of Innsbruck, Austria
Mulvey, Michael, Rutgers University, USA
Muncy, Jim, Valdosta State University, USA
Nakamoto, Kent, Virginia Tech, USA
Neibecker, Bruno, University of Karlsruhe, Germany
Neumaier, Maria, University of Wuppertal, Germany
Olsen, Douglas, University of Alberta, Canada
Oppenheim, Peter P., University of Ballarat, Australia
Padgett, Dan, Tulane University, USA
Park, Kyungae, Yeungnam University, South Korea
Peloso, Antony, Arizona State University, USA
Percy, Larry, Marketing-Communication-Advertising, USA
Pinker, Christian, INSEAD, France
Posselt, Thorsten, University of Leipzig, Germany
Putrevu, Sanjay, Brock University, Canada
Raghunathan, Raj, University of Texas (Austin), USA
Robben, Henry S.J., Universiteit Nijenrode, Netherlands
Rosa, Jose Antonio, Case Western Reserve University, USA
Rossiter, John R., University of Wollongong, Australia
Ruiz, Salvador, University of Murcia, Spain
Russo, Jay Edward, Cornell University, USA
Schade, Christian, Humboldt-Universität Berlin, Germany
Schmidt, Marcus, University of Southern Denmark, Denmark
Schmitt, Bernhard, Columbia University, USA
Schoedel, Johnathan, KTH, Sweden
Shaw, Michael, Monash University, Australia
Shimp, Terence A., University of South Carolina, USA
Smith, Craig, London Business School, UK
Solomon, Michael R., Auburn University, USA
Swoboda, Bernhard, Saarland University, Germany
Thelen, Eva, Universität Innsbruck, Austria
Trommsdorff, Volker, Technische Universität Berlin, Germany
Turley, Darach, Dublin City University, Ireland
van der Lans, Ivo, Wageningen University, Netherlands
Vanhuele, Marc, Groupe HEC, France
Ward, Tony, Central Queensland University, Australia
Warlop, Luk, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Belgium
Weidemani, Magi, Anne, Sweden
Weinberg, Peter, Saarland University, Germany
Wilkes, Robert, Texas Tech University, USA
Witkowski, Terrence, California State University, USA
Wong, Nancy, University of Hawaii (Manoa), USA
Wood, Charles, University of Tulsa, USA
Woratschek, Herbert, University of Bayreuth, Germany
Zaichkowsky, Judy, Simon Fraser University, Canada
ASSOCIATION FOR CONSUMER RESEARCH
EUROPEAN CONFERENCE 2001
June 20th – June 23rd, 2001
Hotel HILTON
Berlin, Germany

WEDNESDAY, JUNE 20, 2001

Welcome Reception
6:00 pm

THURSDAY, JUNE 21, 2001

SESSION 1.1
9:15 am – 10:45 am

Special Topic Session 111:  Understanding, Measuring and Engineering the Consumption Experience in the Online Environment

Chair: Ashesh Mukherjee, McGill University, Canada
Discussant: Gilles Laurent, Groupe HEC, France

SPECIAL SESSION SUMMARY
Understanding, Measuring and Engineering the Consumption Experience in the Online Environment ................. 1
Laurette Dubé, McGill University, Canada
Ashesh Mukherjee, McGill University, Canada

Experience Cyberspace: Consumer Responses to New Technology
Annama Joy, Concordia University, Canada
John F. Sherry, Northwestern University, U.S.A.
Emotional Experience of E-Services: Structure, Antecedents, Moderators and Dynamic Modeling over Time
Laurette Dubé, McGill University, Canada
Demetrios Vakratsas, McGill University, Canada
Jianying Zhao, McGill University, Canada

Varieties of Consumer Experience: An Empirical Test in the Online Environment
J.J. Brakus, Columbia University, U.S.A.
Bernd Schmitt, Columbia University, U.S.A.

Competitive Paper Session 112: Consumers’ Health Concerns and Consumption

Chair: Klaus G. Grunert, Aarhus School of Business, Denmark
Discussant: Gerold Behrens, University of Wuppertal, Germany

Health as Consumption Object: Construct and Heuristic Study
Nicholas Gould, University of Glamorgan, U.K.
Elizabeth A. Gould, Gwent Health Authority, U.K.

The Changing Importance of Quality Aspects in Food Consumption
Joachim Scholderer, The Aarhus School of Business, Denmark
Karen Brunso, The Aarhus School of Business, Denmark
Klaus G. Grunert, The Aarhus School of Business, Denmark
Carsten Stig Poulsen, The Aarhus School of Business, Denmark
John Thøgersen, Aarhus School of Business, Denmark

The Influence of Tasting Experience and Health Benefits on Nordic Consumers’ Rejection of Genetically Modified Foods
Tino Bech-Larsen, The Aarhus School of Business, Denmark
Klaus G. Grunert, The Aarhus School of Business, Denmark

Competitive Paper Session 113 Innovative Product Policy

Chair: Lutz Hildebrandt, Humboldt-Universität Berlin, Germany
Discussant: Volker Trommsdorff, Technische Universität Berlin, Germany

What’s New? A Multi-Dimensional Approach to Product Newness
Anne Michaut, Wageningen University, Netherlands
Jan-Benedict Steenkamp, Wageningen University, Netherlands
Hans van Trijp, Wageningen University, Netherlands

From Really New to More of the Same: The Effect of Familiarization on the Classification of Hybrid Products
Kaj P.N. Morel, Delft University of Technology, Netherlands
Jan P.L. Schoormans, Delft University of Technology, Netherlands
Peter W.J. Verlegh, Erasmus University, Netherlands

Situational Influences on Cross Category Comparisons in the Context of Consumer-Oriented Product Developments
Stan Knoops, Wageningen University/OP&P Product Research, Netherlands
Ivo A. van der Lans, Wageningen University, Netherlands
Jonathan Gutman, University of New Hampshire, U.S.A.
Special Topic Session 114  The Re-Emergence of the Body in Consumer Behavior Research

Chair: Luk Warlop, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Belgium
Discussant: Russell W. Belk, University of Utah, U.S.A.

SPECIAL SESSION SUMMARY
The Re-Emergence of the Body in Consumer Behavior Research ................................................................. 18
   Luk Warlop, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Belgium
   Suzanne C. Beckmann, Copenhagen Business School and Saatchi & Saatchi, Denmark

The Impact of Girls’ Views and Concerns about Physical Appearance on Perceptual Distortions, Self-ideal Discrepancies, and Body Alternation Behaviors
   Luk Warlop, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Belgium
   Davy Lerouge, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Belgium
   Robin Heymans, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Belgium

Denial of Identity in Eating Disorders: A Case Study from “Advertising for a Good Cause” in Denmark 2000
   Suzanne C. Beckmann, Copenhagen Business School and Saatchi & Saatchi, Denmark
   Pernille Helweg, Saatchi & Saatchi, Denmark

“I HATE MY BODY!” Body Image, the Negative Self, Fashion and Clothing
   Emma N. Banister, UMIST, U.K.
   Margaret K. Hogg, UMIST, U.K.

The Politics of Consumption: The Role of Body Adornment and the Self-Reflexive Body in Lifestyle Cultures and Identity
   Anne Velliquette, University of Utah, U.S.A.
   Gary Bamossy, University of Utah, U.S.A.

THURSDAY, JUNE 21, 2001

SESSION 1.2
11:00 am – 12:30 pm

Competitive Paper Session 121  Brand Extension and Brand Commitment

Chair: Sigrid Bekmeier-Feuerhahn, University of Lüneburg, Germany
Discussant: Franz-Rudolf Esch, Justus Liebig-University Gießen, Germany

Contextual Influences on Consumers’ Evaluation of Brand Extensions: A Quasi-Experimental Field Study ............... 23
   Rune Lines, Norwegian School of Economics and Business Administration, Norway
   Leif E. Hem, Foundation for Research in Economics and Business Administration, Norway
   Kjell Gronhaug, Norwegian School of Economics and Business Administration, Norway

The Determination Roles of Category and Attribute Factors on the Reciprocal Effects of Brand Extensions ............... 24
   Joseph W. Chang, UMIST, U.K.

Product-Class Effects on Brand Commitment and Brand Outcomes: The Role of Brand Trust and Brand Affect ........ 30
   Arjun Chaudhuri, Fairfield University, U.S.A.
   Morris B. Holbrook, Columbia University, U.S.A.
Competitive Paper Session 122  The Influence of Time and the Right Timing: Time as a Determining Factor in Consumer Research

Chair: Christian Schade, Humboldt-Universität Berlin, Germany
Discussant: Gavan Fitzsimons, University of Pennsylvania, U.S.A.

The Value of Consumers’ Time: Interdisciplinary Understanding and Experimental Evidence of Situational Influences .................................................................................................................................................................................. 31
Sabine M. Schaeffer, Universitaet Bayreuth, Germany

Timing and Contextual Effects on Satisfaction Measurement .......................................................................................................................... 37
Andreas H. Zins, Vienna University of Economics and Business Administration, Austria

Show and Tell: Advertisers’ Use of Rhetoric Over Time .............................................................................................................................................................................. 46
Barbara J. Phillips, University of Saskatchewan, Canada
Edward F. McQuarrie, Santa Clara University, U.S.A.

Special Topic Session 123  Dual-Process Theories in Affective Persuasion
Chair: Anick Bosmans, Ghent University, Belgium
Discussant: Anick Bosmans, Ghent University, Belgium

SPECIAL SESSION SUMMARY
Dual-Process Theories in Affective Persuasion .................................................................................................................................................................................. 47
Anick Bosmans, Ghent University, Belgium

Prior Attitudes and Consumer Judgements: The Effect of Valence, Extremity and Elaboration
Carlos Falces, Universidad Autonoma de Madrid, Spain
Benjamin Sierra, Universidad Autonoma de Madrid, Spain
Elena Alier, Universidad Autonoma de Madrid, Spain
Pablo Briñol, Universidad Autonoma de Madrid, Spain

The Influence of Mood on the Evaluation of Negatively Valenced Mental Categories
Anick Bosmans, Ghent University, Belgium
Patrick Van Kenhove, Ghent University, Belgium
Peter Vlerick, Ghent University, Belgium
Hendrik Hendrickx, Ghent University, Belgium

Extending Dual-Process Models: The CASCADES Model
Andreas Strebinger, Vienna University of Economics and Business Administration, Austria
Special Topic Session 124  The Original Marketing Paradox: “Product Needs” versus “Individualized Financial Solutions”

Chair: Johan De Heer, Tilburg University, Netherlands
Discussant: Klaus Peter Kaas, Johann Wolfgang Goethe-University Frankfurt (Main), Germany

Special Session Summary
The Original Marketing Paradox: “Product Needs” versus “Individualized Financial Solutions”:
Predicting and Understanding Consumer Saving Behavior Using a New Methodology to Assess the Dynamics of Psychological Variables
Johan De Heer, Tilburg University, Netherlands
Ton Kuijlen, Tilburg University, Netherlands
Leo Paas, Tilburg University, Netherlands

Towards an Economic Psychology Perspective of Saving Behavior
Johan De Heer, Tilburg University, Netherlands

Explaining Steps Taken in a Hierarchy of Saving Products Related to Different Saving Needs
Leo Paas, Tilburg University, Netherlands

Relationship Between Acquisition Pattern Position and Information Need
Ton Kuijlen, Tilburg University, Netherlands

THURSDAY, JUNE 21, 2001
SESSION 1.3
2:00 pm – 3:30 pm

Competitive Paper Session 131  Provocative Consumer Research and New Developments in Marketing

Chair: Gary Bamossy, University of Utah, U.S.A.
Discussant: Russell Belk, University of Utah, U.S.A.

Disciplinary Power and Consumer Research: An Introduction
David Marsden, Napier University Business School, U.K.

FCUK Consumer Research: On Disgust, Revulsion and Other Forms of Offensive Advertising
Stephen Brown, University of Ulster, U.K.
Hope Schau, Temple University, U.S.A.

Consumer Research Implications of Marketing and ICT Developments
Theo B.C. Poiesz, Tilburg University, Netherlands
Johan de Heer, Tilburg University, Netherlands
W. Fred van Raaij, Tilburg University, Netherlands
Competitive Paper Session 132  Values and Value Measurement in Marketing

Chair: Volker Trommsdorff, Technische Universität Berlin, Germany
Discussant: Klaus G. Grunert, Aarhus School of Business, Denmark

A Value Inventory and Value Dimensions ............................................................... 73
   Joke Oppenhuisen, University of Amsterdam, Netherlands
   Dirk Sikkel, University of Amsterdam, Netherlands

Deriving Wine Marketing Strategies by Combining Means-End Chains with an Occasion Based CHAID Segmentation Analysis ................................................................. 82
   John Hall, Victoria University, Australia
   Peter P. Oppenheim, University of Ballarat, Australia
   Larry Lockshin, University of South Australia, Australia

Motivations Underlying Commercial Web Sites Censorship: The Third-Person Perception ....................................................... 90
   Fang Wan, Vanderbilt University, U.S.A.
   Seounmi Youn, University of North Dakota, U.S.A.
   Ronald J. Faber, University of Minnesota, U.S.A.

Special Topic Session 133  Retailing From A Behavioural Point of View

Chair: Bernhard Swoboda, Saarland University, Germany
Discussant: George E. Belch, San Diego State University, U.S.A.

SPECIAL SESSION SUMMARY
Retailing From a Behavioural Point of View .......................................................... 101
   Bernhard Swoboda, Saarland University, Germany

Convenience Orientation – Consumer Preferences and Measurement with Conjoint Analysis .................................................. 102
   Bernhard Swoboda, Saarland University, Germany

Retail Branding as a Goal of Strategic Retail Marketing - A Causal Model from the Perspective of Consumer Research .......... 107
   Dirk Morschett, Saarland University, Germany

Using Lifestyle in Environmental Psychology ....................................................... 111
   Ralf Terlutter, Saarland University, Germany

Virtual Stores on the Internet: Design of Emotional Online Shopping Offers on the Internet from a Behavioral Point of View ...................... 115
   Sandra Diehl, Saarland University, Germany
Special Topic Session 141  

Consumer Behavior in the Global Context

Chair: Durairaj Maheswaran, New York University, U.S.A.
Discussant: Richard Bagozzi, University of Michigan, U.S.A.

Special Session Summary

Consumer Behavior in the Global Context ................................................................. 120
Nidhi Agrawal, New York University, U.S.A.
Rujirutana Mandhachitara, New York University, U.S.A.
Durairaj Maheswaran, New York University, U.S.A.

Subjective Norms and the Animosity Model: Social Pressure within a Collectivist Culture
Jill G. Klein, INSEAD, France
Philippe DeBroux, Soka University, Japan

A Cross-Cultural Assessment of Materialism’s Conceptualization, Characteristics, and Consequences
Nancy Wong, University of Hawaii, U.S.A.
Aric Rindfleisch, University of Arizona, U.S.A.
James Burroughs, University of Virginia, U.S.A.

The Influence of Cultural Orientation on Country of Origin Stereotypes
Julie Anne Lee, University of Miami, U.S.A.
Ellen Garbarino, Weatherland School of Management, U.S.A.
Dawn Lerman, Fordham University, U.S.A.
Marty Horn, DDB Needham, U.S.A.
Kay Satow, U.S.A.

Cross-Cultural Inquiry: Issues and Research Directions
Nidhi Agrawal, New York University, U.S.A.
Durairaj Maheswaran, New York University, U.S.A.
Rujirutana Mandhachitara, New York University, U.S.A.

Competitive Paper Session 142  

What Drives the Consumers’ Behavior? Self-Symbolism, Self-Identity, and Motivations

Chair: Sigrid Bekmeier-Feuerhahn, University of Lüneburg, Germany
Discussant: Gerold Behrens, University of Wuppertal, Germany

More Than a Feeling: An Exploration into the Self-Symbolic Consumption of Music ................................................. 124
Gretchen Larsen, University of Otago, New Zealand
Rob Lawson, University of Otago, New Zealand
Sarah Todd, University of Otago, New Zealand
Special Topic Session 143  Alternative Promotional Strategies

Chair:  Peter R. Darke, University of British Columbia, Canada
Discussant:  Gilles Laurent, Groupe HEC, France

SPECIAL SESSION SUMMARY
Alternative Promotional Strategies: Salience and Inference .......................................................... 141
  Peter R. Darke, University of British Columbia, Canada

The Attentional Effects of Sales Promotions at the Point of Purchase and at the Point of Consumption
  Pierre Chandon, INSEAD, France

Effects of Pricing and Promotion on Perceptions of Product Quality: It Depends on How You Frame It
  Peter R. Darke, University of British Columbia, Canada
  Cindy M.Y. Chung, Nanyang Technological University, Singapore

Free Gift with Purchase: Promoting or Discounting the Brand?
  Priya Raghubir, University of California (Berkeley), U.S.A.

FRIDAY, JUNE 22, 2001

SESSION 2.1
9:00 am – 10:30 am

Competitive Paper Session 211  Tortillas, Vodka, and Veils - Still Significant Cultural Symbols?

Chair:  Stephen Brown, University of Ulster, U.K.
Discussant:  Søren Askegaard, Odense University, Denmark

Families in the Transforming Russian Society: Observations from Visits to Families in Novgorod the Great ......... 145
  Karin M. Ekström, Göteborg University, Sweden
  Marianne P. Ekström, Göteborg University, Sweden
  Helena Shanahan, Göteborg University, Sweden

Islamic Consumescapes in Turkey: Practices and Strategies of Faithful Consumption ........................................ 155
  Özlem Sandikç, Bilkent University, Turkey
  Güliz Ger, Bilkent University, Turkey
Competitive Paper Session 212     The Effect of Celebrity Endorsements And Repetition in Advertising

Chair: Gerold Behrens, University of Wuppertal, Germany
Discussant: Larry Percy, U.S.A.

From Fame to Fortune: A Meta-analytic Review of Celebrity Endorsements in Persuasive Communication .......... 156
   Angela van der Lee, University of Amsterdam, Netherlands
   Bas van den Putte, University of Amsterdam, Netherlands

Symbolic Meaning and the Elaboration Likelihood Model: Preliminary Insights .......................................................... 157
   Brett A.S. Martin, University of Auckland, New Zealand
   Michael J. Sherrard, University of Auckland, New Zealand
   Yasutoshi Imura, Mitsubishi Motors, New Zealand

Advertising Repetition, Memory, and Attitudes ........................................................................................................ 158
   Jennifer Christie, University of Arkansas, U.S.A.
   Thomas D. Jensen, University of Arkansas, U.S.A.

Special Topic Session 213     The Conscious and Unconscious Influences of Affective Responses

Chair: Jordan L. Le Bel, Concordia University, Canada
Discussant: Andrew Mitchell, University of Toronto, Canada

Special Session Summary
The Conscious and Unconscious Influences of Affective Responses on Consumer Experience, Choice, and Behavior .......................................................... 163
   Jordan L. LeBel, Concordia University, Canada

When Emotion is for Doing: Subliminal Affective Priming Influences Consumption Behavior and Evaluations Without Producing a Subjective Experience
   Piotr Winkielman, University of Denver, U.S.A.
   Kent Berridge, University of Michigan, U.S.A.
   Julie Wilbarger, University of Denver, U.S.A.

Motivational Influences of Negative Affect on Consumer Decision Making
   Raj Raghunatan, University of Texas (Austin), U.S.A.
   Michel Tuan Pham, Columbia University, U.S.A.
   Kim P. Corfman, New York University, U.S.A.

Experience Counts: Affective Experience Influences Consumer Decision-Making Under High and Low Elaboration Conditions
   Peter R. Darke, University of British Columbia, Canada
   Amitava Chattopadhyay, INSEAD, France
   Laurence Ashworth, University of British Columbia, Canada

Sensory Knowledge and Attentional Focus During Consumption as Modulators of Behavioral Responses to Hedonic Stimuli: The Role of Pleasure and Judgement Fluency
   Jordan L. Le Bel, Concordia University, Canada
   Laurette Dubé, McGill University, Canada
Special Topic Session 214  Portrayals of Environmental Myths and Images in European Adverts and the News Media

Chair: Susanne Friese, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Discussant: James A. Fitchett, University of Exeter, U.K.

SPECIAL SESSION SUMMARY
Portrayals of Environmental Myths and Images in European Adverts and the News Media ........................................ 164
Lucia Reisch, University of Hohenheim, Germany
Susanne Friese, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark

Environmentally Significant Behaviour in Europe: Media Coverage and the Political, Economic and Cultural Climate
Brigitta Gatersleben, University of Surrey, U.K.
Linda Steg, University of Groningen, Netherlands

Analysing Multimedia Data Using ATLAS.ti: A Computer-aided Qualitative Data Analysis Approach
Susanne Friese, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark

Mass Mediated Environmental Consumer Socialization in Germany: A Qualitative Investigation
Lucia A. Reisch, University of Hohenheim, Germany
Marleen Strategier, Catholic University of Brabant, Netherlands

Articulating Nature: The Construction of Nature and the Environment in Television Advertising in the UK, Germany, and Denmark
Anders Hansen, University of Leicester, U.K.
Alison Anderson, University of Plymouth, U.K.

FRIDAY, JUNE 22, 2001
SESSION 2.2
11:00 am – 12:30 pm

Competitive Paper Session 221  The Specific Needs of Men and Women and the Relevance to Marketing Communication

Chair: Özlem Sandikci, Bilkent University, Turkey
Discussant: Özlem Sandikci, Bilkent University, Turkey

Shifting Masculinities: Advertising, Male Bodies and the Male Gaze ............................................................... 167
Maurice Patterson, Nottingham Trent University, U.K.

Marketing´s Interpretive Communities: A Case Study of Gay Men´s Responses to Advertising ......................... 168
Steven M. Kates, Monash University, Australia

The Joys of Text: Women´s Experiential Consumption of Magazines .............................................................. 169
Lorna Stevens, University of Ulster, Northern Ireland
Stephen Brown, University of Ulster, Northern Ireland
Pauline Maclaran, De Montfort University, U.K.
Competitive Paper Session 222  

Methodological Approaches to Consumer Behavior

Chair: Herbert Woratschek, University of Bayreuth, Germany
Discussant: Luk Warlop, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Belgium

A Range Model of Overall Evaluation: Extending the Ideal Point Model ........................................................................ 174
Elizabeth Cowley, University of New South Wales, Australia
John R. Rossiter, University of Wollongong, Australia

Using Unobtrusive Methods in Consumer Research: An Assessment .............................................................................. 180
Marcus Schmidt, University of Southern Denmark, Denmark
Niels Krause, The Danish Commissioner of Police, Denmark

Investigating the Brand Choice Decision Using Hierarchical Models on Aggregated Panel Data ............................... 187
Lutz Hildebrandt, Humboldt-University of Berlin, Germany
Kerstin Kamlage, Humboldt-University of Berlin, Germany

Special Topic Session 223  

Marketers-Efficient Pebble Counters, Heavy Eaters, or Highly Intelligent: Twenty Years Later What Are We Doing To Develop Better Measures To Support The Advancement of Consumer Theory

Chairs: Cristel A. Russell, San Diego State University, U.S.A.
Heather Honea, San Diego State University, U.S.A.
Discussant: George Zinkhan, University of Georgia, U.S.A.
Iris Junglas, University of Georgia, U.S.A.

SPECIAL SESSION SUMMARY
Developing Better Marketing Measure: In Search of Nomological Validity ................................................................. 193
Heather Honea, San Diego State University, U.S.A.
Cristel A. Russell, San Diego State University, U.S.A.

Using Nested Models to Examine Perceptions of Easy-Difficult
Mark Leach, Loyola Marymount University, U.S.A.
Michael Hennessy, The University of Pennsylvania, U.S.A.
Martin Fishbein, The University of Pennsylvania, U.S.A.

The Consumption of Regular Television Programming: Development and Validation of the Connectedness Scale
Cristel A. Russell, San Diego State University, U.S.A.
Andrew Norman, Iowa State University, U.S.A.

“I Got a Deal!?” Defining the Affective Dimension of Promotional Purchases
Darren W. Dahl, University of Manitoba, U.S.A.
Heather Honea, San Diego State University, U.S.A.
Special Topic Session Session 224  What are the Chances? Biases in the Assessment of Probability and Risk

Chairs:  Tina Kiesler, University of California, Northridge, U.S.A.
        Vicki G. Morwitz, New York University, U.S.A.
Discussant:  Christian Schade, Humboldt-Universität Berlin, Germany

**SPECIAL SESSION SUMMARY**

*What are the Chances? Biases in the Assessment of Probability and Risk*

- Tina Kiesler, California State University, Northridge, U.S.A.
- Vicki G. Morwitz, New York University, U.S.A.

*We’re at as Much Risk as We’re Led to Believe*
- Geeta Menon, New York University, U.S.A.
- Lauren Block, CUNY, Baruch College, U.S.A.
- Suresh Ramanathan, New York University, U.S.A.

*Behavioral Consequences of HIV Testing*
- Sankar Sen, CUNY, Baruch College, U.S.A.
- C.B. Bhattacharya, Boston University, U.S.A.
- Rose L. Johnson, Strategic Business Research, U.S.A.

*Reserves, Regret, and Rejoicing in Open English Auctions: An Experimental Study*
- Eric A. Greenleaf, New York University, U.S.A.

*The Ball Bounces Differently for Experts and Novices*
- Tina Kiesler, University of California (Los Angeles), U.S.A.
- Vicki G. Morwitz, New York University, U.S.A.
- Eric Yorkston, USC, U.S.A.

---

**FRIDAY, JUNE 22, 2001**

**SESSION 2.3**

2:00 pm – 3:30 pm

**Competitive Paper Session 231  I Love It, I Go For It! - Consumers’ Desires and Experiences**

Chair:  Volker Trommsdorff, Technische Universität Berlin, Germany
Discussant:  Peter Weinberg, Saarland University, Germany

*Experiential Positioning: Strategic Differentiation of Customer-Brand Relationships* ................................................................. 196
- Michael S. Mulvey, Rutgers University, U.S.A.
- Dan Padgett, Tulane University, U.S.A.

*Specialty Magazines and Flights of Fancy: Feeding the Desire to Desire* ................................................................. 197
- Russell W. Belk, University of Utah, U.S.A.

*Dance Clubs, Rave and the Consumer Experience: An Exploratory Study of a Subcultural Phenomenon* ..................... 203
- Christina Goulding, University of Wolverhampton, U.K.
- Avi Shankar, University of Exeter, U.K.
- Richard Elliott, University of Exeter, U.K.
Special Topic Session 232  The Psychology of Presenters

Chair:   Lynn Kahle, University of Oregon, U.S.A.
Discussant: Terence A. Shimp, University of South Carolina, U.S.A.

The Psychology of Source and Presenter Effects: Social Adaptation Theory Contributions
David Toumajian, University of Oregon, U.S.A.
Lynn Kahle, University of Oregon, U.S.A.

Source Effects in Persuasion: An Elaboration Likelihood Model Perspective
Curtis P. Haugtvedt, Ohio State University, U.S.A.

Presenter Effects in Advertising: The VisCAP Model
John R. Rossiter, University of Wollongong, Australia
Ale Smidts, Rotterdam School of Management, Netherlands

Competitive Paper Session 233  Information Processing

Chair:   Klaus Peter Kaas, Johann Wolfgang Goethe-University Frankfurt (Main), Germany
Discussant: Thorsten Posselt, University of Leipzig, Germany

The Impact of Contrast Interval Length and Type on Information Retention: Are Silence and Music Equivalent?
Douglas Olsen, University of Alberta, Canada

A Test of the Renewable Resources Model of Multiple Gains and Multiple Losses
Sandra C. Jones, The University of Western Australia and Curtin University of Technology, Australia

Product Instructions as a Means of Fulfilling Consumers’ Usage Goals
Ingrid M. Martin, California State University-Long Beach, U.S.A.
Valerie S. Folkes, University of Southern California, U.S.A.

Friday, June 22, 2001
Session 2.4
4:00 pm – 5:30 pm

Competitive Paper Session 241  Don’t Worry, Be Happy! Consumers’ Emotions

Chair:   Peter Weinberg, Saarland University, Germany
Discussant: Peter Weinberg, Saarland University, Germany

A Differentiated View of Pleasure: Review of the Literature and Research Propositions
Laurette Dubé, McGill University, Canada
Jordan L. Le Bel, Concordia University, Canada
Consumer and Happiness. An Approach to Integrate the Concept of Happiness into Marketing Theory .......................... 227
Pakize Schuchert-Güler, Freie Universität Berlin, Germany
Martin Eisend, Freie Universität Berlin, Germany
Holger Lütters, Freie Universität Berlin, Germany

Investigating the Effect of Components of Consumption Emotions on Service Evaluation ........................................... 233
Kalyani Menon, Wilfried Laurier University, Canada
Laurette Dubé, McGill University, Canada

Competitive Paper Session 242  Alternative Theoretical Approaches to Consumer Research

Chair: Bruno Neibecker, University of Karlsruhe, Germany
Discussant: Gerold Behrens, University of Wuppertal, Germany

Interpretivist And Positivist Insights into Museum Consumption: An Empirical Enquiry into Paradigm Compatibility ........................................................................................................... 234
Andrea Davies, University of Exeter, U.K.
James A. Fitchett, University of Exeter, U.K.

Cyber-Research: Metamorphosis on the Internet ................................................................. 240
Charles A. McMellon, Hofstra University, U.S.A.

Special Topic Session 243  Cross-Border Shopping

Chair: Søren Askegaard, Odense University, Denmark
Discussant: Bernhard Swoboda, Saarland University, Germany

Cross-border Shopping in the Open European Market: 1 Litre of Hard Liquor, 20 Litres of Wine, 24 Litre of Beer, 400 Cigarettes, Max. 30 kilo! ... ................................................................. 246
Anders Bengtsson, Lund University, Sweden
Jacob Östberg, Lund University, Sweden
Søren Askegaard, Odense University, Denmark

A Tale of Two Malls: An Exploration of Shopping Practices and Commercial Designs across Cultures
Fabian F. Csaba, Bilkent University, Turkey
Asli Tokman, Bilkent University, Turkey

The Paradox of Crossing Borders in a Border-less World ................................................................. 253
Diana Storm, Odense University, Denmark
SATURDAY, JUNE 23, 2001

SESSION 3.1
9:00 am – 10:30 am

Competitive Paper Session 311  Who Am I? Consumer Behavior and The Self

Chair: Christian Schade, Humboldt-Universität Berlin, Germany
Discussant: Christian Schade, Humboldt-Universität Berlin, Germany

Entering the Empty Nest Stage: A Multi-Method Exploration of Women’s Life Experiences and Coping Strategies in Periods of Life Stage Transition ................................................................. 260
Carolyn Folkman Curasi, Berry College, U.S.A.
Margaret K. Hogg, UMIST, U.K.
Pauline Maclaran, De Montfort University, U.K.

Exploring the Impact of Gender Identity within Consumers’ Self-schemas on their Consumption of Advertising .......... 268
Margaret K. Hogg, UMIST, U.K.
Jade Garrow, UMIST, U.K.

Using Self-Reference Theory to Explain the Effectiveness of Including Ethnic Minority Models in Advertising .......... 269
Christina Kwai-Choi Lee, University of Auckland, New Zealand
Nalini Fernandez, Royal Sun Alliance, New Zealand

Competitive Paper Session 312  The Relationship Between the Online Retailer and Online Consumers: Design, Satisfaction, and Values

Chair: Bruno Neibecker, University of Karlsruhe, Germany
Discussant: John R. Rossiter, University of Wollongong, Australia

Webscape: A Theoretical Framework of Web Site Design Impact on Consumers’ Responses .............................. 270
Jean-Philippe Galan, University of Social Sciences at Toulouse, France
Christine Gonzalez, University of Paris-Dauphine, France

Satisfaction, Trust and Commitment in Consumers’ Relationships with Online Retailers ................................. 276
Janet Wagner, University of Maryland, U.S.A.
Gabrielle Rydstrom, Barton-Cotton, Inc., U.S.A.

A Cross-Cultural Study on Consumer Values of Web Navigation and the Internet Shopping Behaviors ................. 281
Cheol Park, Korea University, South Korea
Special Topic Session 313  The Role of “Fit” in Cause Related Marketing

Chair: John W. Pracejus, University of Alberta, Canada
Discussant: Gary Bamossy, University of Utah, U.S.A.

SPECIAL SESSION SUMMARY
The Role of “Fit” in Cause Related Marketing ................................................................. 286
John W. Pracejus, University of Alberta, Canada

Fortifying or Diluting Equity via Association: The Case of Sponsorship
Karen Becker-Olsen, New York University, U.S.A.
Carolyn J. Simmons, University of Virginia, U.S.A.

Nonprofit-Business Alliance: Outcomes of Joint Communications
Sridhar Samu, Memorial University of Newfoundland, Canada
Walter Wymer, Christopher Newport University, U.S.A.

Fit Between Brand and Non-profit Organizations: the Impact on Choice for the Sponsoring Brand
John W. Pracejus, University of Alberta, Canada
Douglas Olsen, University of Alberta, Canada

SUNDAY, JUNE 24, 2001

SESSION 3.2
11:00 am – 12:30 pm

Special Topic Session 321  Advertising and Other Communication Effects in Low-Involvement Situations, with Special Emphasis on Emotional Effects and Effects upon Attitudes towards the Message

Chair: Flemming Hansen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Discussant: Flemming Hansen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark

SPECIAL SESSION SUMMARY
Advertising and Communication Effects in Low-Involvement Situations, with Special Emphasis on Emotional Effects and Effects upon Attitudes Towards the Message ................................................................. 290
Flemming Hansen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark

The Role of Emotion in Processing Low Involvement Advertising ......................................................... 293
Larry Percy, U.S.A.

Emotions in Mass Communication
A Study Investigating Relations Between Cognitive Categories/Cultural Narrative and Psycho-Physiological Phenomenon in the Perception of Visual Stimuli ................................................................. 297
Anders A. Rasmussen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
A Procedure for Testing the Emotional and Attitudinal Effects of Design ................................................. 300
Tore Kristensen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Gorm Gabrielsen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Flemming Hansen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Jens Halling, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark

Estimation of Emotional and Evaluating Effects of Sport Sponsorships ......................................................... 310
Flemming Hansen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Jens Halling, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Gitte Bach Lauritsen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark

Evaluation of Public Spokespersons ........................................................................................................ 318
Flemming Hansen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Christian Kock, University of Copenhagen, Denmark

Competitive Paper Session 322  Message Processing, Knowledge and Ethnic Identification

Chair: Thorsten Posselt, University of Leipzig, Germany
Discussant: Güliz Ger, Bilkent University, Turkey

Ease of Message Processing and Judgement
Prashant Malaviya, INSEAD, France
George A. Bakamitsos, Dartmouth College, U.S.A.
Brian Sternthal, Northwestern University, U.S.A.
Alice M. Tybout, Northwestern University, U.S.A.

The Country-of-Origin Effect and Brand Origin Knowledge: How Little Consumers Know and How Important Knowledge Is ................................................................. 325
Terence A. Shimp, University of South Carolina, U.S.A.
Saeed Samiee, University of Tulsa, U.S.A.
Subhash Sharma, University of South Carolina, U.S.A.

The Impact of the Intensity of Ethnic Identification Upon Consumer Behavior ........................................ 327
Nexhimi Rexha, Curtin University of Technology, Australia
Russel P.J. Kingshott, Curtin University of Technology, Australia

Competitive Paper Session 323  Persuasive Communication: How to Make Oneself Heard by The Consumer

Chair: George E. Belch, San Diego State University, U.S.A.
Discussant: Michael A. Belch, San Diego State University, U.S.A.

EURO2000: A Study on the Influence of Program-Involvement on Commercial Selection and Memory in a Real Life Setting ................................................................. 334
Marjolein Moorman, University of Amsterdam, Netherlands
Peter Neijens, University of Amsterdam, Netherlands
Edith G. Smit, University of Amsterdam, Netherlands

The Use of Humor in Threat-Related Advertising: An Experiential Processing Perspective ....................... 335
Ashesh Mukherjee, McGill University, Canada
Laurette Dubé, McGill University, Canada
Understanding, Measuring and Engineering the Consumption Experience in the Online Environment

Laurette Dubé, McGill University, Canada
Ashesh Mukherjee, McGill University, Canada

ABSTRACT
Recently, there has been extensive interest in engineering the consumer experience, i.e., the design and management of objective features of a firm’s offering and communications, in a way that induces a positive subjective state in the consumer, engages the consumer in a personal way, and ultimately shapes positive responses such as purchase behavior, satisfaction and loyalty. The three papers in this session use complementary research approaches to understand different dimensions of the consumption experience in the online environment. The first paper by Annamma Joy and John Sherry builds upon the ethnographic approach to identify the key metaphors and metonymies used by consumers to make sense of the internet. When metaphorical property mapping occurs, the focus is on terms such as “virtual worlds,” “fantasy experiences,” “addiction,” “being lost in space,” “building bridges” “superhighways.” In metonymy, the text reveals phrases and terms such as “betrayal” [being on guard against viruses], “overwhelmed” [due to information overload], “frustration” [because of anonymity of the web], “transformation” [continuously re-invent themselves], and “informality” [at home -while the fingers do the moving]. The authors discuss how their results provide insights to web-designers to create specific types of online experiences, much the same way an architect would design a space to create a certain subjective experience in visitors to a building. The second paper by Laurette Dubé, Demetrios Vaskatras, and Jianying Zhao focuses on the structure and dynamics of emotional experiences when consumers use functional e-services such as web-search services (e.g., Yahoo, Farefinder). The authors present a longitudinal study in which consumers of web-search services were asked to report on their emotions and their perceptions of service attributes, as they perform a sequence of 15 calibrated search tasks on as many different days. Analyses revealed a 4-factor structure for emotions, organized in two dominant high-arousal factors (frustration, enthusiasm) and two less prevalent, low-arousal factors (calm and sadness). Perceptual features of the product (i.e., web-search service) were organized into three factors: processing effectiveness, speed, and graphic quality. Of these, perceived effectiveness was the most powerful and universal attribute antecedent of consumption emotions. Further, while gender, familiarity, objective knowledge and level of usage were all found to be significant moderators of emotional experiences, the effects of some of these moderators were found to vary by the type of consumption emotions. The third paper by J. J. Brakus and Bernd Schmitt investigates five types of consumption experiences and their underlying processing, in the context of static web banners and animated web advertisements. This research builds on a theoretical framework that distinguishes consumer experiences into five types (i.e., sensory, affective, intellectual, bodily and social), and posits that these experiences occur on two separate levels. At a primary level, responses are fairly instinctual and automatic, while at a secondary level, responses are learned and acquired. Predictions derived from the framework are supported in two experimental studies. The discussant, Gilles Laurent, commented on ways in which the portfolio of methodological approaches presented in this session could be profitably integrated to develop innovative research on ways to engineer online emotional experiences to be friendlier to consumers and more effective for marketers.

“Experiencing Cyberspace: Consumer Responses to New Technology”

Annamma Joy, Concordia University
John F Sherry Jr., Northwestern University

Cyberspace is a symbolic system supported by computers and other machines and related technologies. The metaphor of ‘space’ is a useful one in contemplating cyberspace. In opposition to ‘place’, that often requires some form of physical locality and a body rooted in gravity, ‘space’ is more abstract. There is a sense of vastness and openness about cyberspace and it suggests a new frontier that can be annexed. Cyber space can be experienced in many ways; the only condition is that the flesh cannot enter these spaces. The metaphors that we use guide the ways in which we think of cyberspace. If we view such spaces as navigable spaces, then we can consider whether it is sculptural space [palpable] or architectural space [livable]. If we use other metaphors then the design of such systems would also differ.

This study examines the meanings of cyberspace as part of a larger study on experiencing art on the Internet. First, however, we wished to know how the participants viewed and made sense of the Internet. A version of the Zaltman metaphor elicitation technique was used for this study. Thirty volunteers who wished to participate in this study were asked to choose ten pictures [any form of visual presentation] that represented in their minds the meanings they associated with the Internet. These pictures are projective in terms of representing what the Internet and cyberspace meant to each of them. They were then asked to write a two-page report explaining how and why each of these pictures represented their current thoughts and meanings associated with the use of this technology. They were also asked to visually manipulate the ten images [scanned or print media] and create a collage. A final report summarized their overall reactions to the Internet and provided a description of the collage that they created. Our understanding of the many meanings of cyberspace is based on thick descriptions provided by subjects about the images, that make chaoe their inchoate thoughts. These articulated meanings in turn, contribute towards an understanding of the larger culture that is evolving around the use of the internet and related technologies.

Based on participant responses we were able to identify certain themes. For instance, when metaphorical property mapping occurs, the focus in the text is on terms such as “virtual worlds,” “fantasy experiences,” “addiction,” “building bridges” “superhighways.” In the second context of metonymy, the text focuses on phrases and terms such as “instant and frequent communication [often cross-cultural],” “betrayal” [being on guard against viruses], “overwhelmed” [due to information overload and because they are exchanging technical skills for thought processes], “frustration” [because of anonymity of the web], “transformation” [continuously re-invent themselves], and “informality” [at home -while the fingers do the moving]. We discuss how a better knowledge of the metaphorical language used by consumers to describe how they see and experience the virtual space, can help web-
designers to create contexts within which communication and persuasion can quickly occur, and not simply create a series of screen designs. In other words, web-sites can be built, engineered or designed to emulate the three dimensional world that we live in, by using metaphorical connections. This paper helps map the metaphors and associations that help make effective connections, interactions and dialogues between the everyday world of consumers and cyberspace.

“Consumer Emotions in Virtual Environments: Structure, Antecedents, Moderators and Dynamic Modeling over Time”  
Laurette Dubé, Demetrios Vakratsas, and Jianying Zhao, McGill University

Research on consumption emotions in the context of e-services or, more generally, as people travel in cyberspace has thus far primarily focused on “flow,” i.e., intense emotional experience in which one loses a sense of oneself and a sense of time. Yet, as e-services or product and services marketed through internet are transformed into commodities, relatively few consumers are likely to experience flow. In the present research, we explore consumption emotions beyond flow, while using an e-service on repeated episodes (namely Yahoo websearch). Specifically, we empirically explore the various dimensions of consumption emotions in virtual environments, their perceptual antecedents in terms of service features, and individual-level moderators of the effect of features on emotional experience. We also explore the dynamics of emotions in search episodes over time.

In a controlled experiment, 82 consumers (average age 20 years; 41 males, 41 females) of web-search services were asked to report on their emotions while using the Yahoo search engine to perform 15 tasks in sequence on as many different days. Each of the tasks was designed and pre-tested to take between 10-20 minutes to perform, and each participant completed the same 15 tasks in a different random order under one of two judgment instruction manipulations after each search. Participants provided self-report (11-point scales) of emotions (positive: enthusiastic, happy, stimulated, content, elated, calm and relaxed; negative: frustrated, angry, irritated, anxious, tense, impatient, sad, depressed) and their perceptions of various service features (processing speed, graphic quality, ease of use, search process efficiency, search process pleasantness, search outcome quality). For each episode, they also indicated how much they liked the task (single item) as well as the times the task started and ended. Individual moderators considered were gender, self-reported familiarity (11-point scales, familiar, knowledgeable, interested), objective knowledge (6-item scale), and usage level (# searches per week) of web-search services.

Factor analyses (exploratory followed by confirmatory) revealed a 4-factor structure for consumption emotions, organized in terms of valence and arousal. The two high-arousal factors of frustration (frustration, angry, irritated) and enthusiasm (enthusiastic, happy and stimulated) each accounted for about one quarter of the shared variance with two less prevalent, low-arousal factors (calm: calm, relaxed; sad: sad depressed). The perceptual features of the search engine were organized into three factors capturing processing effectiveness (easy of use, efficiency, enjoyment, outcome quality), speed (time to completion, processing speed), and graphic quality (single item). The impact of perceptual antecedents and moderators on consumption emotions was assessed by a random coefficient approach. In this approach, the three perceptual antecedents and liking for the task were taken as random effects, while gender, familiarity, knowledge, and usage level were considered fixed effects in distinct predictive models for each dimension of emotional experience. Perceived effectiveness was found to be the most powerful and universal antecedent of consumption emotions with strong effect on each dimension, being the unique predictor for enthusiasm and sadness. Perceived speed was a significant antecedent of frustration (-) and calm (+). A puzzling positive relationship emerged between graphic quality and frustration. Liking for the task influenced frustration (-) and enthusiasm (+) only.

In terms of moderators, all four moderators had significant effects of some of the emotional dimensions but the impact varied by emotions. Gender moderated the degree of frustration (p<0.10), enthusiasm (p<0.05) and calm (p<0.01) with males, compared to females, reporting more intense frustration and enthusiasm and less calmness. Self-reported familiarity had a moderating effect on three dimensions of emotions, with less frustration (p<0.10), more enthusiasm (p<0.01) and more calm (p<0.01). More knowledgeable consumers reported less enthusiasm (p<0.01), more calm (p<0.01) and more sadness (p<0.05). As for the level of usage, it was found that heavier user of web-search services seem to have more intense emotional responses on the dimensions of frustration (p<0.01), enthusiasm (p<0.10), and sadness (p<0.01).

Finally, we modeled the dynamics of each emotional dimension over the course of a single search episode. We used a multiplicative effects model to break down the cumulative effect of the order of the task and its duration. Results show that, for all four emotions, intensity fades over time as consumers move along the task sequence. Within each task, the experience of frustration and enthusiasm (and marginally so for calm) reflects a non-monotonic dynamic. More specifically, the effect of time on frustration exhibits an inverted U-shape with a late peak, whereas the effect on enthusiasm initially has an inverted U-shape which later turns into a U-shape (in other words, first exhibits a dip, then a peak and later decreases). No dynamic pattern emerged for sadness. Theoretical and managerial implications of the results are discussed.

“Varieties of Consumer Experience: An Empirical Test in the Online Environment”  
J.J. Brakus and Bernd Schmitt, Columbia Business School

This paper builds on a theoretical framework that distinguishes consumer experiences into five types, i.e., sensory, affective, intellectual, bodily and social. These experiences occur on two separate response levels—a primary level at which responses are fairly instinctual and automatic, and a secondary level at which responses are learned and acquired. At the primary level, the process entails evolutionary response to specific environmental cues, called “affordances,” that offer perceptual clues to the organism by mere virtue of the specific organism-environment interaction. The secondary level consists of a conscious step-by-step process of perception, encoding, storage, and retrieval that results in the respective experiences. Predictions derived from this framework are tested in an online environment using animated web advertisements and static web banners.

We propose that consumers engage in different processes (direct perception vs. inference making) as they engage in experiences of different types. The five types of consumer experiences are expected to operate in the following way. At the primary level, visual attributes of fundamental chromatic colors and basic shapes trigger the sensory module; facial displays of universal primary emotions (e.g., a smile) trigger the affective module; syllogisms, thought schemas and violations of expectations trigger the intellectual module; stimuli that result in arousal and/or pain trigger bodily modules; and references to kin (mother, father, sister, brother) trigger the social module. These propositions were tested in two experiments using web-adsvertisements and web-banners as experimental stimuli.
In Study 1, three animated web advertisements for a new product—an MP3 player—were developed and pre-tested to create each of three types of consumer experience (sensory, affective and intellectual). The sensory and affective ads contained specific affordances intended to provide the respective experiences, while the intention of the intellectual ad was to simply present features of the product. The number of presented claims across the ads was the same. Furthermore, for each ad we made two versions—the “normal tempo” version and the “fast tempo” version. We made sure that the subjects who saw the fast version did not have enough time to read all the presented information, unlike the subjects who saw the normal version. Subjects provided product evaluation and measures of the consumption experience. We expected that sensory and affective information would be processed faster and more consistently across subjects than the intellectual information. Hence, even if the time to process all the information contained in an advertisement is cut short, subjects might still evaluate the advertised product highly if it is presented in affective and sensory rather than in an intellectual way. However, if there is not enough time to process the functional information, consumers become insecure about the product performance. This insecurity could drive down their evaluation of the product. These predictions were supported by the results.

In Study 2, we wanted to test further whether primary and secondary level processing could exist within each type of consumer experience. Additional pre-tests were performed to formulate web-banners that manipulated processing levels within sensory (color; red-green/orange-olive), affective (facial expressions; happy-sad/surprise-angry), and intellectual (yin and yang symbol; two variants) types of consumption experiences. Results from recognition and product evaluation data showed that the two levels of processing could be empirically distinguished within each type of experience. Subjects recognized web-banners more easily, consistently and faster at the primary level than on the secondary level. Moreover, subjects’ responses were affected less by exposure time at the primary level compared to the secondary level of processing.
Health as Consumption Object: Construct and Heuristic Study
Nicholas Gould, University of Glamorgan, United Kingdom
Elizabeth A. Gould, Gwent Health Authority, United Kingdom

ABSTRACT
Do people do health like they do shopping or clubbing? The notion of consumption object has appeared in the literature on consumer behaviour. But what, exactly, is a consumption object and how does it differ from a commodity? This paper suggests a definition for consumption object and examines the possibility that health is understood as a consumption object. These theoretical speculations are given practical expression in a heuristic study that factors in gender and social class. We examine marketing and public policy implications, particularly with reference to health inequalities.
The Changing Importance of Quality Aspects in Food Consumption

Joachim Scholderer, The Aarhus School of Business, Denmark
Karen Brunso, The Aarhus School of Business, Denmark
Klaus G. Grunert, The Aarhus School of Business, Denmark
Carsten Stig Poulsen, The Aarhus School of Business, Denmark
John Thøgersen, The Aarhus School of Business, Denmark

ABSTRACT

Major consumer trends like health and organic foods figure prominently on the agenda of food businesses and regulatory decision-makers. However, it is not clear from previous research whether rising market shares reflect changes in consumer attitudes, changes in the supply structure, or changes in the pricing of foods. Five scales from the Food-related Lifestyle Instrument (FRL) were used in replication surveys in Germany in 1993 and 1996 (N1=1000, N2=1042), France in 1994 and 1998 (N1=1000, N2=1000), and the UK in 1994 and 1998 (N1=1000, N2=1000), measuring the importance of health, price/quality relation, novelty, organic products, and freshness to consumers’ food choices. Trends in the importance of these quality aspects were modeled using multi-sample confirmatory factor analysis with structured means. Results indicate that, contrary to widespread expectations, the importance of healthy/unprocessed foods, organic foods, and fresh foods has been declining in all three countries since the early 1990s. The pattern suggests that the actual consumer trend to organic foods already peaked several years ago, and that the current boom is likely to be a mere short-term consequence of changes in pricing and distribution.

INTRODUCTION

It is customary in food business and consumer policy alike to base strategic decisions on certain “consumer trends” that appear just so obvious that nobody asks if they are really there, after all. A recent example is the organic foods boom. It is estimated that from 1998 to 1999, the volume of the organic foods market has grown by approximately 10% in Germany (Stiftung Ökologischer Landbau 2000), 12% in France (USDA Foreign Agricultural Service 1999), and 40% in the UK (The Soil Association 1999).

Judged against this background, it is somewhat surprising that marketing scholars have only paid superficial attention to this trend, usually by means of cross-sectional studies (e.g., Bech-Larsen and Grunert, in press; Kyriakopoulos and Ophuis 1997; Tiilikainen and Huddleston 2000; Thøgersen 1998). However, longitudinal or repeated cross-sectional designs are needed to account for the trend character of the phenomenon.

So far, the authors know of only one study that used an actual panel design. In a study about the influence of personal values on pro-environmental behaviors, Thøgersen (2000) asked 1090 Danish consumers in 1998 and 1999 whether they regularly purchased organic foods. Significant increases in purchase frequency were only found in one out of three product categories (frozen peas), whilst the others did not change significantly.

To make things even more complicated, purely behavioral indicators (like aggregate sales statistics or individual purchase frequencies) are quite unspecific as to the forces that drive a particular trend. Two scenarios may be constructed as to what is actually going on beneath the surface:

- **Scenario 1.** The importance of attribute X to consumers’ food choices is in fact increasing. Decision-makers who timely react to this may expect growth of the more sustainable sort, at least when their pricing and distribution decisions are not completely unreasonable.

- **Scenario 2.** The importance of attribute X to consumers’ food choices has been rising for some time, but already peaked some time ago. Market shares are still rising, but only because restrictions (such as premium prices and limited supply) have recently been eased. Decision-makers who rely on the sustainability of such a trend are likely to be disappointed soon when short-term growth reaches a ceiling.

The scenarios constitute a classic economic problem: when only quantities supplied and market price are known, it is impossible to determine the shape of the demand curve (Working 1927). Consequently, it is also impossible to decide whether demand has increased, decreased or remained constant—an infinite number of demand curves exist that are consistent with the same equilibria (Figure 1).

The aim of the present study is to look behind a number of alleged consumer trends in European food markets, including healthy/natural foods, organic foods, novelty, freshness, and the price/quality relation. Specifically, we will examine whether these quality aspects have in fact become more important to European consumers, or if their importance is already dwindling again but is still held in high regard by food marketers because the point of inflection went by unnoticed.

The importance of these aspects to consumers’ food choices will be assessed using a number of scales from the Food-Related Lifestyle Instrument (FRL; Grunert, Brunso and Bisp 1997). Trends in these aspects will be estimated in a structural equation modeling framework, based on data from replication surveys carried out between 1993 and 1998 in Germany, France, and the United Kingdom.

METHOD

Data Collection

The analysis will combine data from six different surveys. All samples were drawn on a household basis with a quota imposed on region:

- **D-93.** Data were collected from N=1000 German consumers in 1993. The mean age of the respondents was 45.03 years (SD=16.15), 77 per cent of the respondents were female.
- **D-96.** Data were collected from N=1042 German consumers in 1996. The mean age of the respondents was 44.10 years (SD=15.73), 78 per cent of the respondents were female.
- **F-94.** Data were collected from N=1000 French consumers in 1994. The mean age of the respondents was 48.16 years (SD=15.45), 91 per cent of the respondents were female.
- **F-98.** Data were collected from N=1000 French consumers in 1998. The mean age of the respondents was 48.17 years (SD=15.45), 87 per cent of the respondents were female.
- **UK-94.** Data were collected from N=1000 British consumers in 1994. The mean age of the respondents was 44.55...
The Identification Problem Illustrated: When only Quantities supplied \((Q_1, Q_2)\) and market price \((P_1, P_2)\) are known, shape and shift of the demand curve \((D_1, D_2)\) cannot be determined.

\[
\begin{align*}
\text{SCENARIO 1} & \\
\text{SCENARIO 2} \\
\end{align*}
\]

James M. Krantz, Luce, Suppes and Tversky 1971).

When populations \(A\) and \(B\) are different cultures or cohorts, and the observed variable \(x\) is a questionnaire item, it becomes unreasonable to simply assume a common interval scale for responses on \(x\). Explicit treatment of such biases requires the use of an appropriate psychometric model. Confirmatory factor analysis with structured means (Sörbom 1974) is the most flexible framework to handle such measurement problems. It represents the observed responses to \(P\) items \((p=1,2,...,P)\) as a linear function of \(M\) latent factors \((m=1,...,M, M \leq P\)\), \(P\) intercept terms, and \(P\) random errors. In multi-sample models, parameters are allowed to differ across groups:

\[
x_{g}=x_{g}+\Lambda_{g} \xi_{g}+\delta_{g},
\]

where \(x_{g}\) is the \(P \times 1\) vector of observed variables in group \(g = 1, ... G\), \(x_{g}\) is the \(P \times 1\) vector of intercept terms in group \(g\), \(\xi_{g}\) is the \(M \times 1\) vector of latent factors in group \(g\), \(\Lambda_{g}\) is the \(P \times M\) matrix of factor loadings in group \(g\), and \(\delta_{g}\) is the \(P \times 1\) vector of random errors in group \(g\), assumed to be uncorrelated with the latent factors and to have zero expectation. Thus, the expected values of the observed variables are

\[
\mu_{g}=x_{g}+\Lambda_{g} \xi_{g},
\]

where \(\mu_{g}\) is the \(P \times 1\) vector of observed means in group \(g\) and \(\kappa_{g}\) is the \(M \times 1\) vector of latent factor means in group \(g\). Finally, the covariance matrix of the observed variables is

\[
\Sigma_{g} = \Lambda_{g} \Phi_{g} \Lambda_{g}' + \Theta_{g},
\]

where \(\Phi_{g}\) is the \(M \times M\) covariance matrix of latent factors in group \(g\) and \(\Theta_{g}\) is the \(P \times P\) covariance matrix of random errors in group \(g\).

Across groups, the measurement model can be invariant with respect to each of its five parameter matrices \(\tau, \Lambda, \Phi, \Theta, \kappa\). Of particular interest is a measurement model where factor loadings and item intercepts are invariant across groups, defining a conge-
eric measurement model with group-invariant location and scale parameters. If the constraints hold, the observed variables \( x \) are measured on common interval scales and can be meaningfully compared across groups (Meredith 1993).

The present study includes consumer samples from three different cultures and, within the three cultures, samples from two different points in time. Hence, the invariance of parameters will be tested in two steps: (a) In a first step, parameters will be constrained only within cultures, but across time, and (b) in a second step, parameters will be constrained across cultures and across time. After the degree of measurement invariance has been established, change over time will be analyzed using procedures that are appropriate for the particular invariance level.

RESULTS

Normality Check

Since maximum likelihood (ML) estimation of parameters assumes multivariate normality, multivariate skewness and kurtosis statistics were computed for the joint distributions of the fifteen items within each sample. The distributions departed significantly from normality in the D-93 (multivariate skewness=43.964, multivariate kurtosis=337.756), D-96 (skewness=22.737, kurtosis=315.425), F-94 (skewness=30.853, kurtosis=315.974), F-98 (skewness=25.338, kurtosis=305.166), UK-94 (skewness=30.884, kurtosis=311.297), and UK-98 samples (skewness=27.841, kurtosis=310.163; all \( p < .001 \)).

Yet because goodness-of-fit tests against multivariate normality are notorious for excessive power in large samples, univariate skewness and kurtosis statistics were inspected to check whether individual items were responsible. None could be identified so that approximate multivariate normality will be assumed.

Measurement Invariance

Five models were specified. Model 0 assumed an invariant factor pattern across the six samples, including five latent factors, and only one non-zero loading for each item (simple structure). The model will serve as the null model in the model comparison sequence. Model 1 assumed that the factor loadings \( \Lambda \) were invariant over time, but only within cultures. Model 2 assumed them to be invariant over time and across cultures. Model 3 assumed that the item intercepts \( \tau \) were invariant over time, but only within cultures. Model 4 assumed them to be invariant over time and across cultures. All model were estimated by maximum likelihood using LISREL 8.30 (Jöreskog and Sörbom 1996; Jöreskog, Sörbom, du Toit and du Toit 1999) and converged without problems.

Goodness-of-fit statistics are shown in Table 2. The RMSEA remained within conventional acceptance limits (RMSEA<0.080) for Models 0 through 3, and was only slightly above for Model 4. The CAIC reached its minimum value with Model 1, but did not increase substantially for all models except Model 4. Due to the large samples involved here, the overall \( \chi^2 \) and \( \Delta \chi^2 \) values should only be interpreted in relative terms. To improve descriptive accuracy, an incremental TLI (also known as NNFI) was computed for each model comparison, indicating that the only substantial leap occurred between Model 3 and Model 4. Taken together, goodness-of-fit and model comparison statistics suggest acceptable fit for all models up to Model 3, and unacceptable fit for Model 4. As a result, invariance over time and across cultures can be accepted for factor
pattern and factor loadings, but not for item intercepts. They are indeed stable over time, but cross-culturally biased so that all subsequent analyses will be conducted within cultures.

Change over Time
To test for change over time, differences between the latent means of the factors health, price/quality relation, novelty, organic products, and freshness were computed within each culture. Since their estimation at occasions T1 and T2 was based on independent samples, the standard error of any such difference \( \Delta \kappa = \kappa_{T2} - \kappa_{T1} \) is simply \( SE(\Delta \kappa) = [SE^2(\kappa_{T2}) + SE^2(\kappa_{T1})]^{1/2} \) (Goodman 1960), and a \( t \) statistic can be computed in the standard fashion \( t = \Delta \kappa / SE(\Delta \kappa) \).

The importance of health aspects in the sense of natural, unprocessed foods for consumers’ food choices declined significantly in Germany and the UK, but did not change in France. The price/quality relation of products lost importance in Germany, gained importance in France, but did not change significantly in the UK. Likewise, novelty lost in Germany, gained in France, and remained constant in the UK.

Organic products became less important to consumers in Germany and the UK, but did not change in France. The importance of freshness declined significantly in all countries. Standardized changes for all factors (scaled to zero mean and unit variance) are presented in Figure 2.

**DISCUSSION**
In food business as well as in consumer policy, we have become used to taking it for granted that, for example, consumers increasingly favor unprocessed and organic foods over highly processed, conventionally grown foods. However, some things change when you look beneath their surface—and the rather counterintuitive trends identified in the present paper may be but one example of this. Contrary to common expectation, the perceived trend towards unprocessed and organic foods seems to be rather one away from unprocessed and organic foods. This may be a bit confusing as the market shares of organic products are still rising at a high pace in most European countries. Yet this is not necessarily a reliable long-term indicator—the results of the present study suggest that the importance of eco-related aspects to consumers’ food choices already peaked several years ago (at least in Germany and the United Kingdom, which are the largest national markets for organic foods in the EU).

Largely due to premium pricing and insufficient supply chain management, manifest demand has been low during those years. This has been changing lately, so that the rising market shares may be interpreted as a consequence of lower price and higher availability outweighing the negative trend in consumers’ attitudes. Yet if the trend in consumers’ attitudes does not turn upwards again, market growth may be expected to reach a ceiling all too soon.

The declining importance of freshness appears to complement the trend away from healthy/unprocessed and organic foods—after all, a large part of the organic foods business has traditionally dealt in fresh produce. Taken together, both trends may perhaps be interpreted as the by-product of another trend in consumers’ attitudes: convenience foods. Both unprocessed/organic and fresh foods require a certain effort regarding meal preparation, which is obviously at variance with the pre-prepared meals dealt with in the convenience segment.

Whilst the health, organic and freshness trends appear to be hegemonic, the results pertaining to novelty and the price/quality relation of products are somewhat inconclusive. The most obvious feature here is cross-cultural differences. In contrast to France, where the importance of novelty and the price/quality relation has been rising, we observed a strong decline of both aspects in Germany, and no significant changes in the UK. A convenient interpretation would, for example, be one in terms of different degrees of multi-culturalness of the three food cultures. Yet as we have already seen above, common-sensical interpretations like this can be quite misleading. Most importantly, it is not clear whether trends into opposite directions signify divergence or convergence. Although cross-cultural biases in our survey measures prevent us from direct comparisons of their absolute levels, it may also be the case that they approach a common European average, gradually leveling out their different starting points. If that were indeed the case, the apparent divergence could rather be seen as the beginning of a harmonization of European food cultures.

Finally, it should be stressed that our study has its limitations. The design included measurements on two occasions in each...
### TABLE 3
Change in Latent Factor Means

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>T1</th>
<th>T2</th>
<th>Change</th>
<th>SE</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>5.563</td>
<td>.041</td>
<td>5.180</td>
<td>.040</td>
<td>-.383</td>
<td>.058</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Price/quality relation</td>
<td>6.448</td>
<td>.026</td>
<td>6.233</td>
<td>.029</td>
<td>-.216</td>
<td>.039</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Novelty</td>
<td>4.246</td>
<td>.066</td>
<td>3.776</td>
<td>.059</td>
<td>-.470</td>
<td>.088</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organic products</td>
<td>4.257</td>
<td>.059</td>
<td>3.704</td>
<td>.054</td>
<td>-.553</td>
<td>.080</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freshness</td>
<td>5.903</td>
<td>.040</td>
<td>5.305</td>
<td>.048</td>
<td>-.598</td>
<td>.062</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Germany (1993, 1996)**

| Health                    | 5.848    | .042     | 5.743  | .041 | -.105  | .058  | -1.807 | .071 |
| Price/quality relation    | 6.057    | .032     | 6.154  | .029 | .097   | .042  | 2.288  | .022 |
| Novelty                   | 3.678    | .067     | 3.873  | .062 | .195   | .091  | 2.137  | .033 |
| Organic products          | 3.187    | .061     | 3.174  | .061 | -.014  | .086  | -0.160 | .873 |
| Freshness                 | 5.728    | .044     | 5.560  | .042 | -.168  | .061  | -2.772 | .006 |

**France (1994, 1998)**

| Health                    | 5.333    | .045     | 5.165  | .047 | -.168  | .065  | -2.581 | .010 |
| Price/quality relation    | 6.432    | .029     | 6.438  | .028 | .005   | .040  | 0.138  | .891 |
| Novelty                   | 4.305    | .071     | 4.466  | .067 | .162   | .098  | 1.650  | .099 |
| Organic products          | 3.298    | .058     | 3.112  | .056 | -.186  | .080  | -2.312 | .021 |
| Freshness                 | 5.850    | .045     | 5.711  | .044 | -.139  | .063  | -2.220 | .027 |


| Health                    | 5.563    | .041     | 5.180  | .040 | -.383  | .058  | -6.638 | .000 |
| Price/quality relation    | 6.448    | .026     | 6.233  | .029 | -.216  | .039  | -5.506 | .000 |
| Novelty                   | 4.246    | .066     | 3.776  | .059 | -.470  | .088  | -5.321 | .000 |
| Organic products          | 4.257    | .059     | 3.704  | .054 | -.553  | .080  | -6.936 | .000 |
| Freshness                 | 5.903    | .040     | 5.305  | .048 | -.598  | .062  | -9.595 | .000 |

**Note.** All p values are two-tailed.

### FIGURE 2
Standardized Change in Latent Factor Means

- **D (1993-96)**
- **F (1994-98)**
- **UK (1994-98)**

---

country, so that only linear trends could be estimated. It is quite plausible to assume that the true trend has a more complex shape. The 1996 BSE crisis and other food scares, for example, may have triggered temporary increases in consumer attitudes to organic foods that have locally bent the altogether negative trend. A more extensive tracking of consumer attitudes over time is required to account for such phenomena, once again stressing the need for more longitudinal research in marketing.

---

**REFERENCES**


The Influence of Tasting Experience and Health Benefits on Nordic Consumers’ Rejection of Genetically Modified Foods

A Conjoint Study of Danish, Norwegian, Swedish and Finnish Consumers’ Preferences for Hard Cheese

Tino Bech-Larsen, The Aarhus School of Business, Denmark
Klaus G. Grunert, The Aarhus School of Business, Denmark

ABSTRACT

This paper presents the preliminary results of a conjoint study of 750 Danish, Swedish, Norwegian and Finnish consumers’ preferences for genetically modified and conventional cheese with different types of health benefits. The results showed homogeneity in preferences within as well as across countries. In general, the genetically modified cheese was rejected, but this was modified somewhat by health benefits and tasting experience.

INTRODUCTION

Research has consistently shown that European and especially Nordic consumers’ rejection of genetically modified foods is strong, persistent (Bredahl, 1999) and immune to information campaigns and other attempts to change of attitudes (Scholderer, 1999). It has been stressed that the only possible way to break down the rejection is to offer a substantial and trustworthy consumer benefit (Hamstra, 1995).

In contrast to food applications, Europeans more readily accept the use of genetic modification for medical purposes (Frewer & Shepherd, 1995). This fact may constitute a window of opportunity for genetically modified foods with documented health benefits. This is one reason why the food ingredients and additives industry sees functional foods as a potential wallbreaker for genetically modified foods. In general, consumers perceive functional foods as placed somewhere midway on the combined “naturalness-healthiness” continuum from organically processed to genetically modified (Poulsen, 1999; Bech-Larsen, Poulsen & Grunert, 1999).

The problem with this strategy, however, is that the rejection of genetically modified foods is influenced by number of ethical, environmental, and health-based risk perceptions, of which the latter is clearly the most important (Bredahl 1999). Thus, because genetically modified foods are perceived as inherently detrimental to personal health, it is not an easy task to convince consumers that a genetically modified food product can offer a substantial health benefit.

The first step in the introduction of such a product on the market would be to convince consumers to taste it. This could in itself reduce the perception of genetically modified foods as inherently dangerous and alien. If at the same time consumers could be convinced that the genetically modified product offered a substantial health benefit, this could improve re-buy probabilities.

DESIGN AND IMPLEMENTATION

Before rating the preference for each of 16 product profiles the respondents were asked to taste a piece of cheese. In each country, one third of the respondents was told that the type of cheese in question was produced by conventional methods, one third was told that it was produced by the aid of genetically modified starter, and while this was also the case for the last third of the respondents, this group was told that the genetically modified starter implied a health benefit, namely a substantially lower level of calories. In addition to the preference rating task, a number of food related attitude scales consisting of four to six items were implemented, i.e. “interest in natural products”, “attitude to the use of genetic modification in food production”, “attitude to nature”, “attitude to technology”. Also a single item measure of self-perceived knowledge of the use of genetic modification in food production was implemented.

The conjoint task was based on an orthogonal 6-factor design, each with two or three levels. The genetic modification factor was operationalized by the specification of starter cultures which were either conventional and alive in the final product, genetically modified and dead in the final product or genetically modified and alive in the final product. Apart from the price factor, the other factors were in some way related to health consequences. Based on studies of consumer preferences for functional foods (Bech-Larsen, Poulsen & Grunert, 1999; Jonas & Beckmann 1998) and discussion with experts in cheese processing we chose to include factors with different types of health implications and connotations to artificiality. The study was implemented as a full-profile design with 16 product descriptions to be rated on a 7-point scale of buying intention.

RESULTS

In this section we first present the general results of the conjoint study. Then the relations between the conjoint results and the attitude scales are discussed, and finally we discuss the effects of tasting supposedly genetically modified cheese on the estimated conjoint preferences for genetically modified and conventional cheese.

Table 2 shows that the homogeneity in the Nordic countries not only concerns the relative importance of the six factors included in the study, but also the preferences for the levels of the most important factors, i.e. GM and price are similar. As expected, cheaper products are preferred to more expensive ones, and no GM products are preferred to GM products with non-viable starters, which again are preferred to GM products with viable starters.

As regards the factors related to health benefits, the preferred levels of calories, saturated fat, and calcium are also mostly in accordance with expectations. The part-worths are small, however, and this may explain unexpected results such as the Danish respondents’ preference for saturated fatty acids. The fact that the Danish and Swedish respondents have strong aversions towards the cheese with high levels of zinc confirm other studies of functional foods (Poulsen, 1999) that found consumers to perceive such additives as less natural and hence less preferable than more “natural” additives such as calcium.

For each of the four countries and the aggregated set of individual utility functions a hierarchical clustering procedure was performed. In all the cases the great majority of respondents was placed in one segment. These findings confirm the homogeneous preferences of the respondents which is also indicated by the high values of the Pearson’s and Kendall’s tau measures of the estimated models (see table 2). The respondents’ general rejection of genetically modified foods is the primary reason for this homogeneity.

The results in figure 1 indicate that consumers’ general rejection of genetically modified foods is modified by tasting experience, and that this is especially the case if consumers believe the genetically modified cheese to offer a health benefit, i.e less calories. An ANOVA-test (p<0.05) with the utility of the use of a non-GMO
The Influence of Tasting Experience and Health Benefits on Nordic Consumers’ Rejection of Genetically Modified Foods

TABLE 1
Design of the Conjoint Task

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FACTOR</th>
<th>OPERATIONALIZATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LOWFAT</td>
<td>not lower - none –</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>lower fat content  with less calories, but same texture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FATTYPE</td>
<td>not more - none -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>more un-saturated fat which lowers the risk of cardiovascular diseases</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CALCIUM</td>
<td>not extra - none -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>extra which reduces the risk of brittle bone disease</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZINC</td>
<td>not extra - none -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>extra which is good for the immune defence and metabolism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRICE</td>
<td>market price The price is average for this type of cheese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>+25% …25% above average —</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-25% …25% below average —</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STARTER</td>
<td>GMO (living) a genetically modified culture, which is alive and viable in the final product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>GMO (not living) a genetically modified culture, which is present but not viable in the final product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>no GMO a conventional culture (without genetic modification), which is possibly viable in the final product</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

An explanation of the results illustrated in figure 1 could be that respondents who agree to taste a genetically modified cheese (less than 3% refused to taste the GM cheeses) "un-link" their preference for such a product from their strongly negative attitudes to the use of GM in food production. Thus, the mere experience that GM cheese does not taste any different from cheese produced with conventional starters may improve acceptance of genetically modified cheese.

Figure 2 illustrates that the relative importance of price is approximately constant in the three groups. That the same holds true for three of the four health factors (calorie level, content of unsaturated fatty acids and calcium) indicates, however, that the lower degree of rejection of genetic modification does not necessarily imply an increased focus on either health benefits in general or low fat content in particular.

Contrary to this, what seems to have happened in the case of the group that tasted the supposedly low-calorie version of the GM cheese, is that some of the consumer scepticism has been moved from the use of genetically modified starters to the adding of zinc. As such the results are in accordance with other studies (Bech-Larsen, Poulsen & Grunert, 1999; Poulsen, 1999), which also report that the majority of Danish and Finnish consumers have negative attitudes to zinc-enriched products. These results illustrate that taste experience together with substantial health benefits may improve acceptance rates of specific genetically modified foods, but that care should be taken to develop foods with health benefits that are trustworthy and attractive to consumers.

COMMENTS AND IMPLICATIONS

The results of the study reported in this paper imply that health benefits do not as such increase consumer acceptance of genetically modified foods. Nordic consumers’ rejection is so persistent that not even the introduction of genetically modified foods with substantial consumer benefits can change it. In other words, substantial benefits, e.g. health-related ones, are a necessary but not a sufficient condition for increased consumer acceptance.

Although the public is largely unaware of the existence of genetically modified foods, more than 20% of a random sample of foods recently analyzed by the Danish Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Fisheries contained genetically modified ingredients. In the Nordic countries, the dominant strategy of the food industry has been not to make public the increasing use of genetically modified ingredients in their products. Instead of trying to lure consumers into acceptance of genetically modified foods, our study indicates that a combined informational and promotional strategy, e.g. by giving free samples of a genetically modified product and conveying a substantial consumer benefit, may be a better alternative.
### TABLE 2
Aggregated Utility Functions for Each of the Four Countries

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FACTOR</th>
<th>TOTAL PART WORTHS</th>
<th>DENMARK n=181</th>
<th>NORWAY n=199</th>
<th>SWEDEN n=169</th>
<th>FINLAND n=204</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LOWFAT</td>
<td>less calories</td>
<td>0.07</td>
<td>0.15</td>
<td>0.08</td>
<td>0.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FATTYPE</td>
<td>less saturated fat</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>-0.08</td>
<td>0.08</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CALCIUM</td>
<td>more</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>0.07</td>
<td>-0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZINC</td>
<td>more</td>
<td>-0.12</td>
<td>-0.33</td>
<td>0.06</td>
<td>-0.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRICE</td>
<td>average</td>
<td>0.09</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.24</td>
<td>-0.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>average +25%</td>
<td>-0.56</td>
<td>-0.41</td>
<td>-0.66</td>
<td>-0.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STARTER</td>
<td>GMO (viable)</td>
<td>-0.62</td>
<td>-0.31</td>
<td>-0.88</td>
<td>-0.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>GMO (not viable)</td>
<td>-0.33</td>
<td>-0.22</td>
<td>-0.51</td>
<td>-0.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>no GMO</td>
<td>0.94</td>
<td>0.53</td>
<td>1.39</td>
<td>0.78</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Pearson’s* 0.99 0.93 0.99 0.93 0.99
Kendall’s tau* 0.87 0.78 0.88 0.85 0.88

*Significances are in all cases 0.00

### FIGURE 1
Utility for the Three Levels of Starter Culture Under Different Tasting Conditions

[Graph showing utility levels for GMO alive, GMO dead, and No GMO under different tasting conditions.]
FIGURE 2
The Relative Importance in % of the Six Conjoint Factors for the Three Groups with Different Tasting Conditions

REFERENCES
What’s New? A Multi-Dimensional Approach to Product Newness
Anne Michaut, Wageningen University, Netherlands
Jan-Benedict Steenkamp, Wageningen University, Netherlands
Hans van Trijp, Wageningen University, Netherlands

ABSTRACT
How do consumers assess the newness of a new product? We address this question to determine the relevant variables for perceived newness evaluation, get insight into the origin and determinants of newness within a product, and how these differentially influence overall newness. We find empirical evidence for a two-dimensional structure of overall newness. First, a perceptual dimension referring to the newness consumers can immediately perceive through product exposure, second, an epistemic dimension which requires accessibility to higher levels of knowledge structure to be perceived. Results show that attributes are top-of-mind in perceived newness elements, however benefits appear fast and naturally when products offer epistemic newness. Findings also emphasize that consumers
From Really New to More of the Same: The Effect of Familiarization on the Classification of Hybrid Products
Kaj P.N. Morel, Delft University of Technology, The Netherlands
Jan P.L. Schoormans, Delft University of Technology, The Netherlands
Peeter W.J. Verlegh, Erasmus University Rotterdam, The Netherlands

ABSTRACT

Hybrid products (i.e., combinations of two or more existing products) are often introduced as really new products that are placed in a category of their own. This study examines the hypothesis that hybrid products are only perceived to be really new and classified accordingly, when consumers have not yet had actual experience with these products. The results show that unfamiliar hybrid products were classified into separate categories, whereas familiar products were categorized together with the source product they were most congruent with. Furthermore, unfamiliar hybrids were harder to categorize. Theoretical and marketing implications are given.
Situational Influences on Cross Category Comparisons in the Context of Consumer-Oriented Product Development

Stan Knoops, Wageningen University/OP&P Product Research, The Netherlands
Ivo A. van der Lans, Wageningen University, The Netherlands
Jonathan Gutman, University of New Hampshire, U.S.A.1

ABSTRACT
The conventional method to define the competitive market is product-oriented and based on similarity of attributes. This suggests that competition is fixed across different situations and products only compete with products from the same nominal category (van Trijp, Steenkamp 1998). A consumer-oriented, situationally defined market is superior as it provides the opportunity to study the market across the conventional boundaries of competition, using consumers’ perceptions as guidance for marketing decisions. This increases the effectiveness, efficiency and creativity of the marketing strategy. We conducted two empirical studies. Our first study shows that products from different nominal categories can compete fiercely with each other. The set of appropriate and competitive products is not static but changes, depending on consumers’ goals in a specific situation. This should alert marketing managers that conventional methods do not give an accurate picture of the threats and opportunities facing a business. Study 2 shows the influence of the place, the time and the presence of other people on the appropriateness for consumption of 47 snacks and beverages. Chips, peanuts and cheese cubes are perceived as products that are appropriate to consume in the evening with other people. Apple, yoghurt and biscuits are perceived as products that are appropriate to consume in the morning at home. The competitive relationships in specific situations allow for the identification of the actual goals and choice criteria consumers have in mind when purchasing or consuming a product.

1The authors thank Corine Kolb and Pieter Punter from OP&P Product research for valuable comments. This research project is financed by OP&P Product Research, the Netherlands (www.opp.nl).
SESSION ABSTRACT

With a few exceptions, the body has been largely ignored as a focus of research within the field of consumer behaviour (see Thompson and Hirschman 1995). This session examines the body as a vehicle for self-expression and identity construction, the mutuality of which is constrained by societal standards and biological limitations. The centrality of the body in everyday definition and construction of the self, in social affiliation, and in the development of dysfunctional behaviours are examined from various theoretical perspectives and from the perspective of social marketing.

PROPOSAL INTRODUCTION

Consumers want to comply with physical appearance norms that exist within the groups they want to identify themselves with. They are driven by powerful social motives. Individuals are often rejected or feel rejected if their appearance does not correspond to the norms and standards that exist in the social group they affiliate with (DeJong 1980), while they are rewarded for looks that do match these stereotypes (Feingold 1992). The body is also increasingly accepted as a vehicle for the motives of self-expression and identity construction through body adornment and alteration practices, from the virtually riskless and temporary (cosmetic use), to the dangerous (self-starvation) and irreversible (tattooing, plastic surgery). Individual problems in creating an identity may be revealed in dysfunctional body-related behaviours such as eating disorders or self-mutilation, and attract (or should attract) the attention of social marketers (Richins 2000).

(Evolving) societal standards about appearance sometimes drive these alteration behaviours (like in dieting), and sometimes constrain how far an individual can go in creative self-construction (e.g., piercing and tattooing). But also the body itself acts a constraint. For example, the properties of one’s body constrain the unlimited creation of self through clothing. And, while the mutability of the body is increasingly accessible and increasingly acceptable, there are limits to the extent the body allows mutation and change. The success of dieting, for example, is constrained by genetic factors (Brownell and Rodin 1994).

As more artificial and artistic means of altering the body become available, we must ask ourselves the question: “what are the limits of human self-creation?” This session explores the many ways in which consumers use the body to push the limits of self-identity. Four contributions illustrate how the body may act simultaneously as an instrument of and as a constraint on identity construction. WARLOP, LEROUGE and HEYMANS document the centrality of the body in everyday definition and construction of the self, in social affiliation, and in the development of dysfunctional behaviours are examined from various theoretical perspectives and from the perspective of social marketing.

between societal standards and a personal need for self-identification as revealed in body adornment and mutilation practices.

Although varying in content, scope and methodology, the four contributions are united in their attempt to revive interest in the body as a central construct in the study of consumer behaviour. Furthermore, they are linked together by central concepts such as self-identification, identity and ideal/real selves, relating these concepts to the use of the body in contemporary societies with seemingly unlimited opportunities of self-expression.

“The Impact of Girls’ Views and Concerns about Physical Appearance on Perceptual Distortions, Self-ideal Discrepancies, and Body Alteration Behaviours”

Luk Warlop, KULeuven, Belgium

Davy Lerouge, KULeuven, Belgium

Robin Heymans, KULeuven, Belgium

Physical appearance is extremely important in a person’s life. This is not unwarranted. Many studies show that attractive individuals receive more favourable treatments from society than their unattractive counterparts (Feingold 1992).

More generally, body image has been recognised as an important determinant of a number of consumer behaviours. A first stream of research measures how body image deviates from ideals, and relates this to (possibly dysfunctional) consumer behaviours (e.g., Rozin and Fallon 1988). A second stream examines individual differences in traits that reflect the level of concern with and the evaluation of one’s own body. Netemeyer, Burton and Lichtenstein (1995) developed a vanity scale, with subscales for physical vanity measure evaluation and (exaggerated) view of one’s own body. In this study we try to combine both perspectives.

Personal concerns and societal norms of attractiveness have a lot to do with body image, which according to Cash and Pruzinsky (1990) has two main components. The first component is perceptual: individuals differ in the extent to which their perceived physical appearance deviates from reality. In past research, perceptual distortions of body size have been found correlates of eating disorders. Other findings suggest that these distortions also occur in normal populations.

The other component is motivational. Perceptions of one’s own body deviate from personal ideals, and from the norms consumers project in the minds of other individuals in society. Self-ideal discrepancies have also been found significant predictors of a number of consumer behaviours, some of which may be harmful if used excessively (sunbathing, fitness, plastic surgery, and so forth).

Burton et al. (1994) found that concern but not the positive view was related to discrepancies between ideal and perceived breast size in women. They also found a positive correlation between both discrepancy measures and the likelihood of considering plastic (breast) surgery. We extend their research in several ways. We collected measures of self-perceptions and ideal images about breast size, but also waist-to-hip ratio and overall body size from 455 female university freshmen using the silhouette method developed by Rozin and Fallon (1988). The respondents were shown sheets with 48 female silhouettes differing in breast size (4 levels), waist-to-hip ratio (4 levels) and overall body size (3 levels), and were asked to indicate the figures most similar to their actual body image, their ideal body image, and the respective ideals of other women.

Appearance on Perceptual Distortions, Self-ideal Discrepancies, and Body Alteration Behaviours”

Luk Warlop, KULeuven, Belgium

Davy Lerouge, KULeuven, Belgium

Robin Heymans, KULeuven, Belgium

Acknowledging the importance of the body in everyday definition and construction of the self, in social affiliation, and in the development of dysfunctional behaviours, this session examines the body as a central construct in consumer behaviour. Furthermore, it examines the relationship between societal standards and a personal need for self-identification as revealed in body adornment and mutilation practices.
and men. Data were collected during routine freshman medical tests, and were complemented with physician’s evaluations using the same scale. The main dependent measures were the distortion of body image, defined as the distortion between perceived actual size and the physician’s evaluation on all three dimensions, and the discrepancies between actual image and one’s own ideals and other’s male and female ideals on the same dimensions. In addition, we administered a Flemish adaptation of the vanity scale, and we collected frequency measures of sunbathing, exercising, dieting, cosmetic use, and consideration of plastic surgery.

The complete analysis will be reported at the conference. Currently we can only report preliminary results. We partially replicate the findings of Burton et al. (1994). We find large deviations between ideal and actual breast size, but no relationship to either of the two physical vanity subscales. Neither do we find evidence for perceptual distortions in breast size. We do find quite large perceptual distortion effects for both waist-to-hip ratio and overall body size. The respondents systematically perceived themselves larger and with a higher waist to hip ratio then objectively warranted. Self-perception of body size (corrected for actual size) is significantly less accurate for respondents with a low-positive view then for those with a higher positive view of their own appearance. There is no relationship with concern about appearance.

A remarkable, and hitherto unexplainable, finding is that waist-to-hip ratio perceptions are more accurate in deflated view respondents than in inflated view respondents. We do find that the discrepancy between self-perception and ideal body size and waist-to-hip ratio is larger for lower view than for higher view respondents. For each measure ideal self-perceptions are closer to the perceived measures than their estimates of the ideals of others.

Concern about the body is a significant predictor of all investigated body-related consumer behaviors. View is (negatively) related only to dieting behavior. Analyses of mediation and moderation by perceptual distortion and self-ideal discrepancies of the vanity effects on body alteration consumer behaviors are currently under way.

“Denial of Identity in Eating Disorders: A Case Study from “Advertising for a Good Cause” in Denmark 2000”

Suzanne C. Beckmann, Copenhagen Business School and Saatchi & Saatchi, Denmark

Pernille Helweg, Saatchi & Saatchi, Denmark

Eating disorders are a widespread phenomenon in Western societies, mainly affecting young girls, but increasingly also young boys. In Denmark alone, it is estimated that 30% of young people between 14–20 years old are at risk to develop an eating disorder—either anorexia or bulimia. Contrary to popular beliefs eating disorders are neither hysterical diets of teenagers who wish to become supermodels, nor do they have anything to do with food. Eating disorders are a psychological disorder, rooted in a denial of constructing one’s own identity. They are a symptom of a lack of ability to handle challenges and conflicts, thus reflecting an inner vulnerability that is expressed through a distorted way of thinking, feeling and acting about body, food and weight. This inner vulnerability is touched by various different events, such as difficulties within the family, loss of a close friend or fear of growing up. Inner vulnerability is also related to young people’s search for identity in their process of breaking away from parents and childhood and of searching new groups of peers to satisfy their need for belonging. If this search for identity becomes too difficult, the young person may react by denying the identity construction process and thus launch into an eating disorder.

Against this background, this year’s campaign for “Advertising for a good cause” was developed. Introduced in Norway ten years and in Denmark 3 years ago, this event annually gives a 10 mill. DKK advertising campaign for free to a non-profit organisation, which is selected by a jury in a competition. The 2000 organisation chosen in Denmark was “Anoreksiforeningen” (Association for Anorexia). Saatchi & Saatchi Copenhagen was asked to write the brief for the pitch of the advertising agencies, one of which eventually won the honour of executing the campaign which will be aired in the first 6 weeks of 2001. Advertising for a good cause 2000 in Norway has, simultaneously and not knowingly, chosen the same topic, but the results are not yet published.

The focus of this paper is on how the scientific and practical knowledge about eating disorders was turned into a campaign brief. Examples of the submitted campaigns will illustrate the difficulties of translating a complex and very sensitive issue into cause-related communication campaign ideas (see the Danish print-ads in Figure 1 for the competition below). The target group is not young people suffering from eating disorders, but their parents and other adults closely connected to teenagers, thus aiming at increasing both knowledge and understanding of the nature of eating disorders. The reaction of the public will be closely monitored in early 2001 when the campaign is aired, so that the three issues of cause, communication and consequences for the denial of identity through a specific form of body mutilation can be linked. The findings of this monitoring and analysis will be presented at the conference.

“‘I HATE MY BODY!’ Body Image, the Negative Self, Fashion and Clothing”

Emma N. Banister, UMIST, United Kingdom
Margaret K. Hogg, UMIST, United Kingdom

“The old saying—that the human person is composed of three parts—soul, body, and clothes—is more than a joke”

(James 1890)

This study responds to Joy and Venkatesh’s call (1994) for further research into the interrelationship between body, clothing and fashion as they identified how the ‘full force of marketing [links] the body to numerous products and services—perfumes, fashion, clothing…’. This research focuses on two of the three ‘parts’ considered to be essential elements of the human person according to William James (1890). Clothing links the body to the social world (Wilson 1985); and because the body is “the visible carrier of the self” (Featherstone 1991) it is an important site for negotiating identity and consumption.

Turner (1994) argues that “for the self in a consumer society, it is the body image that plays the determining role in the evaluation of self in the public arena. The surface of the body is the target of advertising and self-promotion, just as it is the body surfaces which are the site of stigmatisation”. Body image is the mental picture that one has of his or her body at any moment in time (Kaiser 1997) and it is this ‘mental’ picture which associates what is essentially a physical aspect of the self concept, to more psychological aspects of the self. Body image “is a complex phenomenon with at least three aspects: perceptual, cognitive, and emotional” (Gallagher 1986) which contribute significantly to consumers’ feelings about themselves and their self-concept—both positive and negative (Schouten 1991).

Much of the literature on the area of body image has focused on the notion of idealised body images and the impact which advertising has on (usually) women’s self esteem and self concept (Richins 1991; Martin and Kennedy 1993; Hogg, Bruce and Hough 1999). Our research focuses on how clothing is used by individuals as an expression of their feelings about their bodies, the usage of clothing to disguise what are perceived to be negative attributes and
to prevent the activation of any negative feelings that they may possess. Unlike Schouten (1991), who explored the use of plastic surgery as a means to avoid negative images of the self, we looked at the more usual (and less irreversible) routes used by consumers in impression management: the ritual of the adornment of the body surface to create positive or avoid negative images of their bodies. The linkages between bodies and clothing imply that consumers use clothing to express their thoughts and feelings about their bodies. For this reason, consumers’ discussion of their fashion and clothing choices provides an effective means by which to elicit consumer attitudes to their bodies.

The specific purpose of this paper is to explore the importance of consumers’ body image to one of their possible selves (Markus and Nurius 1986): the negative self-concept. Two facets of the negative self—the undesired self (so not me!) and the avoidance self (just not me) have been identified (Banister and Hogg 2001) elsewhere. A third facet is proposed for this study: the irrelevant self (meaningless to me). Body image is a crucial feature of the self which relates to all three facets of the negative self.

The study was carried out with 30 participants (both male and female) between the ages of 19 and 30, and used qualitative methods, including informal interviews and a projective technique. The exploration of body image was not the original focus of the study but the importance of body image to many of the participants was a key emergent theme (Miles and Huberman 1994) providing an important link in the study of the negative self-concept and negative symbolic consumption.

The rejection of clothing items and fashion images could be linked to perceptions, thoughts and feelings about the self. Body image emerged as an important constraint on clothing preferences, operating in three primary ways—each of which can be closely identified with a particular dimension of the negative self.

Firstly, there was the body as a practical constraint on clothing selection. This was the main impetus behind the rejection of clothing based on consumers’ irrelevant self. Consumers avoided (or did not even consider) the purchase of certain brands and retail brands because they perceived them as clothing that would not fit or suit their body size or body shape.

Secondly, the body was also interpreted as both a psychological and physical constraint on consumers’ clothing preferences and choices. This constraint appeared to be closely connected with consumers’ avoidance self. Consumers would reject clothing that they believed would be more suitable or flattering on people other than themselves. The interpretation of brands, items and retailers that evoked consumers’ avoidance self would depend on physical (i.e. body shape and size) and non-physical (i.e. character and personality) aspects of consumers, so the same item of clothing or brand might be interpreted positively on one person and negatively on another.

Thirdly, the body also generated an emotional constraint on clothing choice. When clothing evoked notions of the undesired self, this represented rejection ‘out of hand’ of items, styles, brands and retailer brands. Rejection of clothing on the basis of the undesired self was often because these particular clothing styles or brands were felt to communicate what were perceived as negative messages regarding the consumer. The undesired self had connections with consumers’ notions or attitudes to the body generally, most notably with the affective aspects of attitudes and often fairly strong feelings of revulsion.

FIGURE 1
Advertising for a good cause 2000/Denmark: results of the ad agency competition

Source: http://www.reklameforalvor.dk
A second issue which emerged was the gendered nature of the findings. Little information about body image was volunteered by the male participants. Discussions regarding the body were very limited amongst males, this in itself represents an interesting finding which would warrant additional research to establish the place of the body image in men’s views of their possible selves, including their negative self especially in the light of the finding that “the body has become a mark of selfhood for men as well as women” (Jagger 1998). This provides considerable scope for exploring how men use fashion and clothing on their body surfaces in their adornment rituals.

Anne Velliquette, University of Utah, USA
Gary Bamossy, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam, The Netherlands

The general focus of this study is product symbolism and body adornment. In the past decade, many nations in Europe and North America which would be grouped as comprising “Western Culture,” are experiencing a resurgence of tribal body adornment practices. While these practices vary from one country to another, this large and diverse group of tattooees have been collectively referred to as the “new tattoo subculture.” In terms of consumer behavior, the signs and symbols chosen by members of the tattoo subculture can be viewed as part of a discursive mix used to communicate individual and group identity. Thus, the conceptual literature that becomes important in understanding why consumers participate in the tattoo subculture involves various identity theories. Taking a postmodern view of Western society, consumption becomes the primary means for the construction of self (Firat and Venkatesh 1995). Through the consuming body (i.e., through fashion, body adornment/modification, and overall image and style), an individual can produce and reproduce a desired identity at will.

Many theorists (including Deleuze, Giddens, Guattari, Foucault, and Jameson) believe that the self is destabilized (but not dissolved as Baudrillard would argue) through the commodification of culture. While social identities still exist, these identities now have their basis in consumption. The individual is turned into a consumer of signs and images, and identity (which is now formed through television, movies, advertising and other forms of cultural media) becomes chronically unstable, inconsistent and incoherent (Dunn 1998). This means that the term identity may no longer be useful in its original form. A new term, identification, may be more useful under the postmodern conditions outlined herein. Identification is seen as a construction; a continuous process of change and transformation where identities are always conditional and contingent, and thus, never completed- always in process or motion (Hall 1996). Related to this notion is the idea of identity or life politics (e.g., see Hall 1996 and Giddens 1991).

Consumer researchers have long suggested that objects (as well as the use of the body as an object) may be value-expressive, however, they are just beginning to explore the social and political implications. The early interpretivist researchers emphasized an extreme form of agency (i.e., the liberating potential of symbolic consumption) when attempting to understand consumption behaviors, where consumers actively, freely, and playfully create and interact to shape their environment and sense of self (e.g., Belk 1988; Holbrook and Hirschman 1982; Levy 1981; and Rook 1985). At the other extreme we have Grant McCracken’s (1986) theoretical account of structure (i.e., marketing institutions, advertising, and media) and its primary role in the transfer of cultural meaning to consumers, whereby consumers are pawns in the game of consumption. Both of these views ignore the political and oppressive potential of the symbolic. That is, when a consumer chooses a particular style or image, they automatically align themselves with a particular subject position while they simultaneously distinguish themselves from others. The consumer is then judged by those who are different and forced to defend their chosen subject position. In this sense, the consumer is involved in a form of emancipatory or identity politics, in which he/she has to fight for liberation from the groups and social forces that constraining them (Giddens 1991).

Hence, the result for identity formation is that it is a constant process of negotiating/renegotiating and defending one’s various subject positions. In summary, this research sheds light on the dialectical tension that exists between the consumer acting freely and playfully as agent in the creation of self, and the structures and social forces that regulate the creation of self. One phenomenological case will be discussed in detail focusing on the role that consumption acts/choices and tattoo symbolism play in the life-long processes of identification and life politics.

REFERENCES
Banister, Emma and Margaret Hogg 2001 “Mapping the negative self: from ‘so not me’…to ‘just not me’”, Advances in Consumer Research Vol XXVIII, Eds. Mary C. Gilly and Joan Meyers-Levy, Provo, UT: Association for Consumer Research, in press
Feingold, Alan (1992). “Good looking people are not what we think”. Psychological Bulletin, 111 (March), 304-341


Contextual Influences on Consumers’ Evaluation of Brand Extensions: A Quasi-Experimental Field Study

Rune Lines, Norwegian School of Economics and Business Administration, Norway
Leif E. Hem, Foundation for Research in Economics and Business Administration, Norway
Kjell Grønhaug, Norwegian School of Economics and Business Administration, Norway

ABSTRACT

This article examines the role of alternative variance, retrieval set size and attitudes towards extension category in consumers’ judgment of brand extensions. A set of theory driven hypotheses are tested in a quasi-experimental field study including three established brands extended into a total of 9 new product categories. All three variables were found to be related to consumers’ evaluations of the proposed brand extensions in the direction suggested by the hypotheses. Although the effect sizes for alternative variance and retrieval set size are modest, the results underscore the importance of considering other contextual dimensions than brand-category fit for understanding consumers’ evaluations of brand extensions.
The Determination Roles of Category and Attribute Factors on the Reciprocal Effects of Brand Extensions

Joseph W. Chang, UMIST, United Kingdom

ABSTRACT
This research discusses the issues of how category and attribute factors affect the typicality judgments of brand extensions and the reciprocal effects of brand extensions on parent brand evaluations. A two-step typicality judgment model based on categorization theories is proposed to examine the stated issues by laboratory experiments. Research results indicate that attribute factor is more influential than category factor on the typicality judgments of brand extensions and the reciprocal effects on parent brand evaluations. Finally, managerial and theoretical implications and future research are discussed with respect to the research findings.

INTRODUCTION
In order to avoid the possible negative reciprocal effect from an unsuccessful or unfavorable brand extension (Chang, 2001; Loken and John, 1993; John, Loken, and Joiner, 1998), marketers have concerns in the leveraging priority of similar and dissimilar brand extensions. Questions, such as “should the similar or the dissimilar brand extension extended first?” are elaborated. However, research results examining the determination roles of category and attribute factors on the reciprocal effects of parent brand evaluations are discrepant (Ahuwalia and Gurhan-Canli, 2000; Keller and Aaker, 1992; Loken and John, 1993; Romeo, 1991). Moreover, these studies are all based on indirect product experience settings and quite dissimilar to the real world, where consumers’ decision-makings are dominated by direct product experiences. As direct and indirect product experiences invoke high and low order attitudes respectively (Smith and Swinyard, 1982, 1983), research results about the stated issues based on direct and indirect product experience settings could also be different. Therefore, the purpose of this research is to identify the determination roles of the category and attribute factors on the reciprocal effects of brand extensions and the typicality judgments of brand extensions in direct product experience settings.

THEORETICAL BACKGROUND AND HYPOTHESES:

TWO-STEP TYPICALITY JUDGMENT

The reciprocal effects of brand extensions are discussed as a singular information processing process (Ahuwalia and Gurhan-Canli, 2000; John, Loken, and Joiner, 1998; Keller and Aaker, 1992; Loken and John, 1993; Romeo, 1991). However, several consumer evaluation models indicate that consumer’s cognitive procedure is a two-stage process (Fiske and Pavelchak, 1986; Kempf and Smith, 1998; Loken and Ward, 1987; Smith, Shoben, and Rips, 1974; Smith and Swinyard, 1982).

Two-step Evaluation Models

Fiske and Pavelchak (1986) propose a two-step information-processing model discussing the concept of societal categorization. At the first step, consumers attempt to find out the fitness of the new category member with the existing category members. The evaluation process is completed if the new member (e.g., brand extension) is perceived as highly matched with the category (e.g., parent brand). In contrast, if there is a moderate match between the category and the new member, the (attribute-based) piecemeal processing is evoked to assess the similarity between the two. The extent of affect transferring from the category to the new member (e.g., brand extension) is decided by the similarity of the new member to the category. Much the same as Fiske and Pavelchak’s (1986) model, Smith, Shoben, and Rips (1974) propose a two-step model identifying the membership of an instance or a concept to a category. The processing of the first step is rapid and global, where subjects try to match the features of the category and the new objects. If there is a clear match between the two, the process is completed. However, if there is a clear mismatch between the two, the second and slower stage continues, where a more intensive comparison between the features of the category and the new object is elaborated to identify the membership of the new object to the category. Both models of Fiske and Pavelchak (1986) and Smith, Shoben, and Rips (1974) involve a two-stage process, but the former model stresses the affective response to the new instance and the latter model emphasizes the cognitive membership identification.

Smith and Swinyard (1982) develop an integrated information response model to differentiate the product evaluation effects of direct and indirect product experiences. The first stage is the information processing induced by the indirect product experience, such as TV advertising, which invokes lower order beliefs and affects and results in lower belief confidence and insignificant attitude-behavior consistency. The second stage is the process induced by the direct product experience, which invokes higher order beliefs and affects and results in higher belief confidence and significant attitude-behavior consistency. Moreover, Kempf and Smith (1998) propose a refined integrated Ad/Trial model, which is based on the Smith and Swinyard’s (1982) model, to identify how advertising information (indirect product experience) interacts with brand trial experience (direct product experience) and eventually generates overall brand attitudes. An observation emerges from a review of the above models that a two-step information processing is differentiated in categorization and product evaluation research.

The Integrated Two-step Typicality Judgment Model

Based on the above theories, an integrated two-level judgment model is proposed to clarify the determination role of category and attribute factors on brand (extension) evaluations (figure 1), as well as the typicality judgments of brand extensions.

1 The category factor means the product class, such as watch, sunglass, lemonades, orangeades, washing-up liquids, sporting motorcar, etc. Consumers judge the category-based similarity by the closeness where a brand extension located to its parent brand. The category-based similarity of the orangeades category is much higher than that of the washing-up liquids to the lemonades category. The attribute factor means detailed performance information about individual product attributes generated from direct or indirect product experiences, such as the semantic attribute performance information of Consumer Reports or the perceived product attribute performances of real product trial. A consumer normally focuses on the quality or favorability of individual product attributes whilst evaluating the attribute-based similarity of a brand extension. In this research, the attribute-based similarity is based on the direct product experience scenario of real product trial.
The first step: Category-based typicality judgment

Consumers make their similarity judgments heuristically when they are aware that a new brand extension in the same category is extended from a parent brand. The similarity judgment is based on the fit of category between a parent brand and a brand extension, the category-based similarity judgment. Based on the familiarity with the parent brand from past product experiences, consumers form their expectations on the attribute performances of the brand extension. Under the circumstances, only the lower-order psychological procedure with limited product information processing is elaborated and, therefore, the category factor is the determinant for the similarity (or typicality) judgment of the brand extension.

The second step: Attribute-based typicality judgment

At the second stage, the category-based typicality judgment is adjusted with respect to the perceived detailed attribute information of the brand extension, the attribute-based typicality judgment. The overall typicality is the synergy of the category-based and the attribute-based typicality judgments. The expectation disconfirmation equals the difference between the expected and the perceived performances of the brand extension. The information incongruity of attribute performance, which equals the concept of expectation disconfirmation, interacts jointly with the category-based typicality for the overall typicality judgment of the brand extension. Consumers’ expectations on the brand extension are disconfirmed if the expected and the perceived performances of the brand extension are identified as discrepant. Therefore, the expectation disconfirmation, information discrepancy or schematic incongruity, on the brand extension indicates the perception differences between the category-based and the attribute-based typicality judgments, as well as the perception discrepancies between the expected and the perceived performances of the brand extension. More expectation disconfirmation or schematic incongruity on the brand extension results in more changes of typicality judgment and thereafter more schematic incongruity and negative reciprocal effect.

Determination Roles of Attribute and Category Factors

Past research has different conclusions about the determination roles of category and attribute factors on the typicality judgments of new category members or brand extensions. Meyers-Levy and Tybout’s (1989) research proves Mandler’s (1982) hypotheses that category similarity is the base of typicality judgment. Also, although not examining the determination role directly, Keller and Aaker (1992) identify the similarity of a brand extension to its parent brand based on the category closeness, which implies that the category factor is the determinant of the typicality of a brand extension. Moreover, Romeo (1991) discovers that there is no difference on brand extension evaluations across the attribute manipulating and concludes that product category of a brand extension is more influential than the attribute factor on the similarity judgment of a brand extension (p. 404). She concludes that an unfavorable similar brand extension is detrimental to its parent brand. However, in contrast, Loken and John (1993) discover that the attribute factor is more influential than the category factor on brand extension evaluations and conclude that category similarity between the extension and the parent brand categories is not a strong determinant for the dilution effects on the parent brand (p. 82). Gurhan-Canli and Maheshwaran (1998) and Loken and John (1993) attribute the discrepant findings to the different settings of brand extension information, which activate different levels of motivation for information processing. As detailed attribute information triggers stronger motivations than category or brief attribute information for the information processing of brand extension, therefore, the attribute factor is more influential than the category factor on brand extension evaluations. In contrast, Loken and John (1993) provide respondents with more detailed attribute information than Romeo’s. However, both Loken and John’s (1993) and Romeo’s (1991) works are based on indirect product experience settings. As direct experience generates higher beliefs (Smith and Swinyard, 1982) and postulates more extreme attitudes (Smith and

2 The parent brand is defined as an existing well-established brand that gives birth to a brand extension. Moreover, a parent brand is also called a family brand if the parent brand has already been extended and associated with multiple products of brand extensions (Keller, 1998).
METHOD: LABORATORY EXPERIMENT

Experimental Design

The experimental study includes sixty-five students as subjects in a 2x2 factorial design. Each experiment group consists of 15 to 20 subjects. A total of one hundred and forty-nine subjects participate in this research, including fifty-five respondents in pilot and pre-tests and thirty subjects in two control groups. The first factor is the similarities of brand extensions toward the parent brand of Sprite products. Two new brand extensions of Sprite orangeades and Sprite washing-up liquids in the different product categories of orangeades and washing-up liquids represent the similar and dissimilar brand extensions respectively to the parent brand category of lemonades. The second factor is the favorabilities of brand extensions. There are favorable and unfavorable brand extensions for the similar and dissimilar categories of orangeades and washing-up liquids respectively. Therefore, the experiments include four brand extensions in four experimental groups respectively of favorable Sprite orangeades, unfavorable Sprite orangeades, favorable Sprite washing-up liquids and unfavorable Sprite washing-up liquids. Moreover, two control groups are examined in order to clarify the possible biases of experiment treatment effects. The experiment treatments of the control group and II are an unfavorable similar and an unfavorable dissimilar brand extensions of 7-Up products, which is an unrelated parent brand in the same product category of lemonades, respectively.

Stimuli

The selection of the parent brand

In line with the brand evaluation research of Aaker and Keller (1990) and Romeo (1991), the strong parent brand of Sprite products is chosen from the lemonades product category for reasons that Sprite is a popular brand name with a favorable overall quality image and eliciting relatively specific positive associations, such as lemon/lime flavor, sparkling/fizzy/bubbly, refreshing, etc.
process of developing and revising questionnaires for the pre-test and experiments. The pre-test collects data of category similarities and unaided brand awarenesses of lemonades, orangeades and washing-up liquids. The questionnaires have been revised around 30 times before they are believed to have validity and reliability to be implemented for the experiments at the final stage. The whole procedures of the pre-test and each experiment are about 5 and 15 minutes respectively.

**The Experiment Procedures**

In the beginning of the experiments, participants are advised that the research purpose is to learn about consumers’ responses toward new products, which will be launched into the UK market by a famous manufacturer. All respondents are invited volunteers and users of lemonades, orangeades and washing-up liquids. Qualified participants are selected and filtered by screening questionnaires and allocated randomly to one of the experiment or the control groups. Experiments are conducted in small groups with an average size of 3 persons. Each respondent is asked to taste or use a sample product of orangeades or washing-up liquids, which will be launched by a lawful manufacturer and, then, fills out Part I questionnaires evaluating the sample products. They, then, evaluate the Sprite products and taste and evaluate the real products of Sprite lemonades. After that, the participants are advised that the Sprite Company will be developing a new brand extension of Sprite orangeades or Sprite washing-up liquids and asked to indicate their expectations on the performance of the brand extension. Later on, subjects are advised that the sample products of orangeades or washing-up liquids that they tried in the beginning of the experiments are exactly the brand extension that the Sprite company will be launching. Simultaneously, the real Sprite orangeades or Sprite washing-up liquids with package designs are shown to them. They, then, re-evaluate the Sprite orangeades or Sprite washing-up liquids.

After that, subjects re-evaluate the Sprite products and the Sprite lemonades with the identical measures to verify the attitude changes on the Sprite products and the Sprite lemonades. Finally, participants answer selected personal demographics questions, such as age, gender etc., and are dismissed with thanks and rewards. Each participant receives a two-pound worth reward of Coca Cola, Sprite lemonades or Fanta orangeades in successfully completing the experiments.

For the two control groups, respondents experience the same experiment procedures and answer the similar questions with the same measures as those for the four experiment groups, despite the different settings of brand extensions. The experiment treatments of the control group I and II are unfavorable similar and dissimilar brand extensions of an unrelated parent brand of 7-Up respectively, which are expected to rule out the possible biases of the experiment treatments of unfavorable similar and dissimilar brand extensions.

**RESULTS**

**Manipulating Check (independent variables)**

Group homogeneity

The Levene’s tests of equality of error variances indicate that both the error variances of the brand attitudes of parent and original brands are equal across the six groups (F=.42, p>.05; F=2.24, p>.05), which indicates that the four experiment groups and the two control groups are homogeneous. Moreover, the brand attitudes of the parent and the original brands before and after the experiment treatments are not significantly different in the two control groups (t=.36, p>.05; t=.73, p>.05). Also, the brand attitudes of the parent and the original brands are similar (t=1.55, p>.05) and highly correlated (r=.60, p=.00), which suggests that the parent and the original brands are perceived as a same entity before extending a brand extension. Therefore, the original brand will not affect negatively or positively on the parent brand image and the dilution effects on the parent brand image in the four experiment groups are purely induced by the experiment treatments of unfavorable brand extensions, which rules out the possible biases of experiment treatment effect.

**Product favorability and similarity/typicality**

Results of one-way ANOVA analyses indicate that:

1. The product attitudes of the favorable (Fanta) orangeades are significantly much better than the product attitudes of the unfavorable (Asda Farm Stores) orangeades (M=4.84 vs. 3.77; F=8.59, p<.0). The product attitudes of the favorable (Fairy) washing-up liquids are significantly much better than the product attitudes of the unfavorable (Asda Farm Stores) washing-up liquids (M=5.20 vs. 4.09; F=14.36, p<.01).

2. The product attitudes of the favorability Sprite (Fanta) orangeades are much better than the product attitudes of the unfavorable Sprite (Asda Farm Stores) orangeades (M= 4.98 vs. 3.74; F=7.78, p<.01). The product attitudes of the favorable Sprite (Fairy) washing-up liquids are significantly much better than the product attitudes of the unfavorable Sprite (Asda Farm Stores) washing-up liquids (M=4.89 vs. 3.50; F=11.76, p<.01).

3. The orangeades category is perceived as being extremely dissimilar to the washing-up liquids (M=5.97 vs. 2.14, F=146.96, p<.00).

4. The favorable Sprite (Fanta) orangeades are perceived as being significantly much similar (or typical) than the unfavorable Sprite (Asda Farm Stores) orangeades to the Sprite lemonades (M=5.13 vs. 3.20; F=9.92, p<.01). The favorable Sprite (Fairy) washing-up liquids are perceived as being significantly much similar (or typical) to the Sprite products than the unfavorable Sprite (Asda Farm Stores) washing-up liquids are (M=4.86 vs. 2.98; F=12.46, p<.05).

Therefore, the independent variables of product favorability and similarity (or typicality) are properly manipulated both on basic and sub-ordinate categorical levels.

**Hypothesis Testing**

Results of two-way ANOVA analyses indicate that the main effect of the attribute favorability factor is significant on the typicality judgments of brand extensions (F = 22.25, p=.00). Both the main effect of category factor and the interaction effect of category and attribute factors on the typicality judgments of brand extensions are not significant (F=.38, p>.05; F=.004, p>.05). The results indicate that the attribute factor determines the overall typicality judgments of the brand extensions, regardless of the category similarity. Therefore, hypothesis one (H1) is supported.

Moreover, results of two-way ANOVA analyses indicate that the main effect of the attribute factor is significant on the brand

---

3 As being highly internally consistent and correlated (Cronbach’s alpha = .88; r = .78, p<.01), the two measures of similarity and typicality are combined into an overall typicality measure of brand extensions.
extension evaluations \( (F = 19.22, p = .00) \). Both the main effect of category factor and the interaction effect of category and attribute factors are not significant on the brand extension evaluations\(^4\) \( (F = .30, p > .05; F = .07, p > .05) \). Therefore, the attribute factor determines the overall brand extension attitudes, regardless of the category similarity, and hypothesis two (H2) is supported.

Finally, results of two-way ANOVA analyses indicate that the main effect of attribute factor is significant on the parent brand evaluation\(^5\) \( (F_{1,63} = 5.71, p = .02) \). Both the main effect of category factor and the interaction effect of category and attribute factors are not significant on the parent brand evaluation \( (F = .09, p > .05; F = .65, p > .05) \). Therefore, the attribute factor determines the parent brand evaluation, regardless of the category similarity, and hypothesis three (H3) is supported.

**IMPLICATIONS AND LIMITATIONS**

**Theoretical Implications**

The attribute factor is verified as being more influential than the category factor on the typicality judgments of brand extensions, the brand extension evaluations, and the parent brand evaluation. The research findings parallel with those of Ahluwalia and Gurhan-Canli (2000) and Loken and John (1993) and are discrepant or partially fit with those of Keller and Aaker (1992) and Romero (1991). Direct product experiences trigger higher order cognitive and affective responses in response to the product information of individual attributes. Eventually, the attribute factor out-weights the category factor and dominates the typicality judgments of brand extensions, the brand extension evaluations, and the parent brand evaluation. Different experimental settings of direct and indirect product experiences do induce different results in brand (extension) evaluations.

**Managerial Implication**

The research findings suggest marketers that extending unfavorable dissimilar brand extensions will not be able to escape from the negative reciprocal effects of brand extensions on parent brands. Whenever there is an unfavorable brand extension, there will be negative reciprocal effects on the parent brands. No matter how the brand extension is categorically dis-similar to its parent brand. The myth that unfavorable dis-similar brand extensions will never cannibalize their parent brands is unfeasible in the real world. The best way for identifying whether a brand extension will cannibalize its parent brand image is to measure the attribute-based favorability of the brand extension. Marketers who engage in extending brand extensions to down-graded market segmentations need also to consider the threat of the possible damages on their parent brands, despite focusing on the profit-maximizing via leveraging brand extension portfolio to broader markets. Therefore, no unfavorable brand extension should be extended, unless the profits generated from down-graded leveraging of brand extensions can compensate the threats of weakening on parent brand images.

**Limitations and Future Research**

This research manipulates the two independent variables of category and attribute factors and the selected parent brand is a strong brand with strong brand image. As the brand-leveraging activities are not restricted to strong brands, some brands with fair or weak brand images are still engaging in their brand-leveraging, such as the brands of Asda Farm Stores, Cresta, etc. The parent brand image of lower quality brands might be much more difficult to be diluted, because of consumers’ low performance expectations on the brand extensions of the lower quality brands. Moreover, as the lemonades products are low-involvement frequently purchased goods, therefore the findings of this research are applicable for the products with similar features as the tested products in this research. As spending much time and doing much effort in purchase decision-making, consumers are more loyal to the high-involvement products that they selected and were satisfied with. The brand attitudes of the parent brands should be more difficult to be diluted by unfavorable brand extensions. Therefore, the applicability of the research findings for high-involvement products is needed to be verified. Also, the negative reciprocal effects of the unfavorable brand extensions on the parent brand in this research are based on the parent brand (Sprite) that has never been extended. Therefore, the dilution effect on the parent brand can be more specifically explained as the dilution effect of the first unfavorable brand extension on the brand image of a frequently purchased strong parent brand. Accordingly, as the sequential dilution effects of brand extensions on a parent brand image are observed to be diminishing under indirect product experience situations (Keller and Aaker, 1992), the negative reciprocal effects of the second and so forth brand extensions on the parent brand in direct product experience settings can also be diminishing.

**REFERENCES**


---

\(^4\) As being highly internally consistent and correlated with each other (Cronbach’s alpha = .96; \( r = .70 \) to \( .90, p < .01 \)), the six attitude measures are combined into the overall attitude measure of parent brand.

\(^5\) As being highly internally consistent and correlated with each other (Cronbach’s alpha = .96; \( r = .73 \) to \( .87, p < .01 \)), the six attitude measures are combined into the overall attitude measure of parent brand.


Product-Class Effects on Brand Commitment and Brand Outcomes: The Role of Brand Trust and Brand Affect
Arjun Chaudhuri, Fairfield University, U.S.A.
Morris B. Holbrook, Columbia University, U.S.A.

ABSTRACT
The authors extend the study of relational exchanges to consumer markets using brands as the unit of analysis. They propose certain product-class determinants (perceived differences between brands, hedonic and utilitarian values, brand-choice risk) as determinants of brand commitment and brand outcomes (market share, advertising-sales ratio). Brand trust and brand affect are also modelled as intervening variables in the process. Aggregate data based on 137 brands is compiled from four separate surveys of consumers and brand managers. Controls in the study include the brand’s share of voice, level of differentiation, and number of competitors. Hypotheses are tested and largely supported for the relationships of interest.
The Value of Consumers’ Time: Interdisciplinary Understanding and Experimental Evidence of Situational Influences
Sabine M. Schaeffer, Universitaet Bayreuth, Germany

ABSTRACT
The paper examines on a conceptual and empirical basis the value of consumers’ time. Based on an interdisciplinary literature review, five dimensions of time and the subjective and situational character of time value were derived. Laboratory experiments supported the hypothesis that situational effects, like in-process satisfaction, the available alternative activity and the length of duration, influence the value of time. The experiments showed that the common assumption of a generally applicable and constant value of time has to be rejected. Three factors are suggested as the main influential variables on the value of time (content, length, alternatives). Implications for the usage of time allocation models as well as for marketers were pointed out.

INTRODUCTION
Every business transaction between a customer and a company can be described as a dynamic process, which takes up time. In order to purchase and consume products and services, customers are faced not only with a monetary but also a temporal investment. Human time is a scarce resource (Leclerc, Schmitt, and Dubé 1995, Juster and Stafford 1991), limited to the life-span or e.g. to 24 hours a day, which customers allocate to various activities, like working, relaxation, necessities and leisure, including the use of products and services. The expenditure of money and time (Mincer 1963) can be seen as the crucial dimensions of consumption activities. Due to its scarcity, time has a value (Jacoby et al. 1976). The value of time particularly influences buying behavior. Depending on the time value, the temporal criteria of a good are more or less significant to customers’ choice and evaluation of goods. Especially for marketers it is important to recognize that they not only compete for consumers’ financial but also for their limited time-budget.

Research attention regarding time-phenomena (see Jacoby et al. 1976, Gross 1987, Hirschman 1987 for reviews) is widespread. Researchers from many disciplines including economics, sociology, psychology, marketing and consumer behavior, analyze time related customer behavior mostly stating the need for a better understanding of how time costs are actually perceived (Jacoby et al. 1976). But, despite the crucial influence on buying behavior the value of time is rarely analyzed explicitly. Decisions are affected by situational characteristics and Hornik (1982) suggests a strong affect of situational effects on time consumption. Overall research regarding situational influences on customer behavior is scarce.

The crucial relevance to buyer behavior and the lack of research findings, explain the motivation to give an interdisciplinary overview of the various concepts of time and time value as well as to carry out several experiments in order to investigate the effects of different situational variables on the value of customers’ time.

THE INTERDISCIPLINARY LITERATURE
A very wide range of research areas, from classical economic research to marketing, from customer behavior to psychology, deal with time related aspects.

The Economical View
Economic models incorporate time mainly as an exogenous variable expanding from the past, over the present to the future (dynamic models). Neoclassical theories see consumption as „an instantaneous act without temporal consequences“ (Linder 1970, p. 7). Since the beginning of the 1960s a growing number of researchers (Stigler 1961, Mincer 1963, Becker 1965) include the necessary time expenditure of each consumption activity (e.g. information acquisition and use of products and services) into their models and theories. It is assumed that time as a fixed-supply resource possessing a certain value is allocated by individuals to maximize their utility. The value of time is inferred to be constant and measurable by forgone earnings. Most researchers aim to explain allocation of time with reference to labor supply, leisure and home production. Stigler (1961) is generally regarded as one of the first economists who explicitly incorporates the economic value of time into theory, especially regarding information search (Jacoby et al. 1976). Becker (1965), developed the first formal framework to analyze a household’s allocation of time for the competing pursuits of either working or consuming. As time devoted to home production cannot be used for gainful employment, Becker operationalized the value of consumption time by forgone income – the wage-rate per time unit – inferring that households can substitute time with money. Mincer (1963) is recognized as the first to introduce the idea that opportunity costs of time depend on their alternative use. Schary (1971) pointed out that the value of time may be concluded from the opportunity costs of foregone income or participation in other activities. Concentrating solely on the wage-rate is judged insufficient, since the decision for one activity means at the same time a decision against all others. As one of the first, he indicated that consumers’ value of time might, among other things, vary as a function of the situation. The value of time should therefore be operationalized by the utility of the available alternative activity and consequently depends on the actual situation. De Donnea (1972) developed a model to predict traveling behavior. Based on the model of Becker, this approach explicitly incorporates process utility. The time value of a saved time unit (e.g. due to faster traveling method) equals the financial price for the timesaving minus the increased process utility.

Among the home economists (for review see Gross 1987) Gronau (1972, 1977) was one of the first to apply economic time allocation theory to the study of intrafamily time decisions, the hypothesis being that the value of wives’ time increases with education and the existence of (younger) children. In short it is implied that the time allocation decision is not only influenced by the value of time measured by the wage-rate but also by individual preferences, which cannot be drawn from the model.

These examples (for review see Gonzáles 1997) show that for economic modeling the value of time is an indispensable construct, assumed to influence time allocation decisions including consumption activities. From this it is inferred that the value of time can be

1The DAAD (German research association) funded this study by a research grant in 1999. I would like to thank the reviewers for their insightful comments, which led to a substantial revision of the paper.
seen as a constant parameter. In order to be able to use the wage-rate as an indicator for time’s scarcity and value, it is implied that all consumers’ time is traded at a market with the wage-rate as equilibrium.

The Behavioral Science View
The study of time in sociology is associated among other things with the identification of antecedents of perceived time scarcity and the description of patterns of time allocation decisions (for review see Gross 1987). Research focuses on the description of the way time is expended for various activities (Jacoby et al. 1976), concentrating on leisure time expenditures. Home economic research relevant to time has relied almost exclusively on time-budget studies (for review see Jacoby et al. 1976, Gross 1987), focusing on the time allocated to non-discretionary activities, primarily housework. The studies record the daily activities of households and the amount of time devoted to each activity. Number of household members, ages of the children, employment-state of the women and lifestyle trends were identified as influential factors.

Studies in the field of social and consumer psychology analyze behavior influenced by time to a great extent. Recognizing that time perception is subjective in nature (Fraisse 1975, 1984), the antecedents, e.g. personal and situational, consequences (e.g. on decision making) and related temporal experiences (e.g. time pressure) were analyzed. Although Jacoby et al. (1976) stated, “for any given consumer, time exists in limited and finite quantities. Hence, it has value” (Jacoby et al. 1976, p. 332), the value of time is rarely given explicit attention. One of the few exceptions is the study of Marmorstein et al. 1992 in the field of price-comparison shopping. They tested a model of subjective value of time based on Becker’s time allocation model introducing the perceived enjoyment of shopping as a new explanatory variable. Findings showed that the enjoyment of shopping as well as the normal and overtime wage-rate influence the value of time. One main contribution of psychological literature to customer behavior is the finding, that the passage of time can be experienced positively (e.g. holiday) or negatively (e.g. waiting-time).

Anthropologists found general support for the hypothesis, i.e. the value individuals place on time depends to a great extent on their socio-cultural background. In general, industrialized countries view time as a scarce resource and place a higher value on it than developing countries. The most recognized anthropologist in this area is Graham (1981) proposing three different socio-cultural groups regarding time perception: a linear-separable, circular-traditional, and procedural-traditional group.

The Marketing and Consumer Behavior View
Marketers generally recognize the increasing importance of time influencing consumer behavior. Even if the temporal dimension of purchasing and consumption has been a topic of interest since the 1950s relatively few empirical contributions appeared (Jacoby et al. 1976 for review). Major areas of interest relate to timesaving possibilities and convenience (e.g. Yale/Venkatesh 1986), time scarcity (Gross 1987), time pressure (Howard/Sheh 1969), e.g. Dhar/Nowlis 1999), waiting-time (e.g. Pruyt/Smidt’s 1998) and consumption time (Hirschman/Holbrook 1982). The time-value-concept is rarely a main focus of these studies. Downs (1961) proposed that consumers try to minimize the basic costs of consumption money, time, and energy. The first formal treatment of time in the marketing literature was published by Schary 1971, who considered consumption as a production process with goods, services and other resources such as money and time as inputs. He suggested that the value consumers place on time is a meaningful basis for market segmentation. Nichols et al. (1971) assume that queuing raises the cost of acquiring a good and that two individuals with different time values face different waiting prices. Voss and Blackwell (1975) claim the value of additional leisure time to be equal to the forgone earnings plus the costs for the timesaving goods. More widely recognized was the idea of Hendrix et al. 1979, who proposed a model of time allocation to explain customer behavior based on anterior conditions like age, health, family life cycle as well as mediating factors like time allocation of others and social role. Time value was not included in the analyses. The time allocation model of Feldman/Hornik (1981) is one of the most comprehensive concepts to date. They assume that in addition to time and money treated as complements, time allocation decisions are influenced by several mediating factors like the value placed on time.

Summary
Overall the value of time is rarely included in customer behavior models or is treated as a mediating variable of low interest. The interdisciplinary analysis of the value of time revealed one major difference between the economic approach and the individual approaches of psychology, marketing and consumer behavior. The economic literature assumes the inter-subjective measurability of the value of time mostly using forgone income as opportunity cost for non-working activities. Consumer behavior oriented research defines the value of time as a subjective concept influenced by personal, socio-cultural and situational variables.

TIME AND TIME VALUE
The meaning and content of time need to be examined to be able to use the concept of time value. The literature review has shown that the understanding of time differs widely. For consumer research the objective and subjective time dimension needs to be considered (Hornik 1984). Objective time is chronological, measurable by clocks and calendars. The time units are homogeneous, independent from the content and range continuously from the past to the future. Examples are the opening-hours of an amusement park from 9 to 9 or a holiday of one week. Two important questions for marketers is derived: When does an activity take place (timing)? How long is an activity carried out (duration)? Time has also a subjective dimension, whereby three aspects need to be distinguished. First, objective timing is perceived subjectively (perceived timing). Second, objective time duration is estimated individually (estimated duration), which means that the estimation may or may not equal objective reality (e.g. waiting length). Third, individuals experience the passage of time subjectively (time experience). The time experience can be a positive (e.g. theater) or negative (e.g. dentist) one depending on the activity carried out.

The value of time is rarely defined and mostly not analyzed explicitly. Based on the definition of time, the following general characteristics need to be considered. This view is set apart from previous findings in four important points. First, the value of time is always related to a certain time duration. Second, the value of time depends on the time moment at which the time duration is available. Third, the objective moment and duration is subjectively perceived and estimated. And fourth, the time duration is experienced subjectively. As a consequence the value of time is a subjective and situational construct in several ways.

For marketing purposes it is interesting to measure the value of time. Time itself has no monetary value, since it is always there and cannot be traded. But time can be used to carry out activities and therefore a value can be placed on a time period, equaling the utility of available activities. The value of time can be measured...
with the concept of opportunity costs, since the decision for one activity means inevitably abstaining from another and sacrificing the utility of it. This alternative activity is the one with the highest utility available at a certain moment and with the available time duration. The value of time is higher the more attractive the alternative is and can equal zero if no alternative activity is available. The usual or overtime wage-rate can only be used if work is the available alternative. This shows, that the value of time depends on the situation, since the alternative activity differs from situation to situation.

**SITUATIONAL INFLUENCES**

The discussion showed that the value of time is a situational concept. Situational influences on consumer behavior are analyzed (for review Nicholls et al. 1996) from time to time (e.g. Park et al. 1989). Psychological literature concerning time stresses situational determinants (Jacoby et al. 1976), but the interdependence between situation and time related aspects is examined rarely (e.g. Hornik 1982). The highly cited situational categories of Belk (1974, 1975) include a temporal perspective, along with physical and social surroundings, as well as task definition and antecedent states, which mainly relates to the dimension of time duration. Regarding the subjective estimation of a time duration and perceived time pressure the influence of situational factors, like stress, inactivity or waiting, are analyzed more often (Gross 1987 for review). The time pressure concept is of particular importance in this context. Customers facing time pressure feel that there is not enough time to perform all desired purchasing and consumption acts (Howard / Sheth 1969), which means that alternative activities with high subjective utility exist. Therefore, it can be stated that time pressure increases the value of time.

To shed some light onto the situational influence factors on time value, an exploratory study has been undertaken. To the best of the author’s knowledge, the following situational influences on the value of time were not studied explicitly so far.

**EMPIRICAL ANALYSIS**

**Design Study**

*Objectives.* The objective of the study is to analyze the effects of situational variables on the value of time and to show that a generally applicable and constant time value cannot be assumed.

The influence of satisfaction with the actual transaction (in-process satisfaction), time pressure and the attractiveness of the alternative activity as well as the length of duration on the value of time were tested.

**Design.** For the laboratory experiments one independent variable was manipulated and two related role-playing scenarios were developed. The scenarios were independently and randomly addressed to the respondents. Response time was app. 10 minutes.

**Dependent variable.** The measurement of time value is not without its difficulties as respondents have problems quantifying directly the value of time (“How much is your time worth?”). E.g. efforts to quantify the value of search time have not been successful (Srinivasan et al. 1990). Therefore an indirect measure is needed. In the context of travel time, timesavings were often measured by the willingness-to-pay for reduced travel time (Walsh et a. 1990). Furthermore Jacoby et al. 1976 pointed out that consumers place a monetary value on their time, e.g. customers pay a higher price to get a timely benefit, like a faster service delivery. Therefore the value of time is operationalized with the willingness-to-pay construct, which means that the participants were asked to indicate how much they would be willing to pay in a certain situation to save time.

**The sample.** With the aim of controlling as many situational and personal characteristics influencing time value as possible, no real-life situations (e.g. contaminated by respondents’ mood, wage-rate etc.) were chosen. This was also the procedure followed by Marmorstein et al. (1992) when testing the influence of selected variables on consumers’ subjective value of time. Aspiring to control as many of the personal characteristics as possible as well as to be able to present realistic and easily imaginable scenarios for all participants, a homogeneous group of respondents (students from one study area) was chosen as respondents. The reason for the selection of MBA students was that they are used to think in time-and money-dimensions and are able to quantify their willingness-to-pay. All experiments were undertaken at the Owen Graduate School of Management, Vanderbilt University, Nashville, USA.

---

3Special thanks go to Roland T. Rust who enabled my research stay at the Owen Graduate School of Management as well as the faculty for allowing me to collect the data at the beginning of their lessons.
in-process satisfaction (dissatisfaction) will lead to a lower (higher)
means that it is not only a pure loss of time. The proposition is, that

costs and increasing time value. To test the situational influence of
time, if they could use their time for a subjectively more important

All chosen students participated voluntarily and no incentives were
given. A three-step data gathering process was carried out to test the
hypotheses. 42, 95 and 70 students participated, e.g. overall 207
answers were given. The average age was 30 years, 24% of the
respondents were women, 60% North Americans, 19% Asians, 9% 
Europeans and others.

Results

Customer Satisfaction. The experience of a transaction (e.g. a
service encounter) influences customer behavior (e.g. reselling and
word-of-mouth) as well as the value of time. In service and
customer behavior literature, the evaluation of a business transac-
tion is measured by the satisfaction construct (Oliver 1997). For
example customers may enjoy shopping (Hornik 1984), which
means that it is not only a pure loss of time. The proposition is, that
in-process satisfaction (dissatisfaction) will lead to a lower (higher)
value of time, e.g. unexplained and long waiting periods lead to
stress and anger in customers’ perception, adding psychological
costs and increasing time value. To test the situational influence of
satisfaction with a service encounter, a role-playing scenario was
developed and presented to the respondents. In Experiment 1 (all
scenarios are described in a shortened version) participants imag-
ined that they had to go to a clinic for several treatments for a whole
day. They were very satisfied (dissatisfied) with the clinic and the
whole process so far. Nevertheless the responsible doctor was late
for the last test and a waiting period of 30 minutes occurred. The
clinic management had recently introduced a new customer loy-
alty program and offered rewards for waiting-times to their pa-
tients. The participants were asked openly how much they would
consider a fair reward for their waiting-time. The hypothesis “the
expected financial reward for 30 minutes waiting-time is signifi-
cantly higher for unsatisfied compared to satisfied customers” was
tested. The scenarios were randomly assigned to 95 students.

One participant indicated a $500 reward for a 30-minute wait,
which was 5 times as much as everybody else. A significant
difference in the expected financial reward occurred. Satisfied
customers expected in average $21,44; dissatisfied customers
$59,41, which is nearly three times as much.

The hypothesis that the variance and means of both groups are
equal can be rejected at a significance level of 0,01% supporting in
turn the research hypothesis that in-process satisfaction during a
transaction has a significant influence on the value of time.

Alternative Activities. As theoretically derived the value of
time depends on the alternative activity determining the opportu-
nity costs of an endeavor. The general proposition is, that the more

Attractive the available alternative activity is at a certain moment,
the higher the value of time will be. The concept of time pressure
can be used to model the perception of different alternative activi-
ties. If a customer is under time pressure, he/she wishes to carry out
other activities with a high utility as well. The hypothesis is that an
increasingly perceived time pressure results in a rising time value.
In Experiment 2 the participants were faced with a situation being
on the way to a very important job interview. They had to buy some
medicine at a drugstore before the interview and had to wait in line
(for 5 minutes). The drugstore offered an express line, where
nobody was waiting, but an additional serving fee would be
charged. In one scenario the participants were late (the job inter-
view representing the alternative activity) and in the other scenario
they were not (the alternative here was going to the interview
without rush). The participants were asked, if they were willing to
pay $5 to get served straight away. The hypothesis “significantly
more people are willing to pay $5 to save a 5 minute wait if they
were under time pressure compared to the situation where they
were not in such a hurry” was tested.

The scenarios were randomly assigned to 42 MBA students. Under
time pressure 85,7% were willing to pay $5 to save 5
minutes equaling a time value of $1 per minute, compared to 23,8%
without. The data scale is nominal and non-parametrical tests were
used. First the binominal dispersion was tested and for both
scenarios a significant difference (p<0.03) between the yes and no
answers were found. Second a Chi-Square test was performed
testing if the perceived counts of one scenario equal the perceived
counts of the other. Both tests clearly proved the differences not
randomly but significant (p<0.00). The research hypothesis that
the attractiveness of the alternative activity has a major influence
on the perceived time value is strongly supported.

These results could be verified in Experiment 3, in which the
participants were asked to imagine to be on the way to a very
important job interview and there was no other possibility than
going by train. Two trains were available, standard and express,
latter reducing traveling time by 30 minutes. All other features
equal, the students were either asked to indicate how much they
would be willing to pay for the express train, if they were in a hurry
(scenario 1) or not (scenario 2). The hypothesis “customers are
willing to pay significantly more to save 30 minutes of traveling
time, if they could use their time for a subjectively more important
activity (the job interview) compared to a less important activity
(waiting)” was tested. Once again the scenarios were randomly
assigned to 95 MBA students. After excluding four extreme outliers
from the analysis, the following results reveal:
The average time value for participants being on time was $0.45 compared to $1.83 representing an increase of 407%. Because of the rational scale of the answers (and the assumption that they were normally distributed), the students’ t-test was used to test the hypothesis that both variances were equal. At a significance level of \( p<0.00 \) this hypothesis can be rejected as well as the hypothesis that both means were equal. This provides very strong support to the research hypothesis, that willingness-to-pay differs between the scenarios, which leads to the conclusion, that the availability of a subjectively important alternative increases the value of time.

Length of Duration. A basic assumption of nearly all time allocation models is, that the value of time stays constant for each time unit (e.g. one minute), which means that the value of time is a linear function of time. This assumption was tested in Experiment 4, where the participants were asked to imagine a situation wanting to purchase a pair of tickets for a show at the performing arts center. Arriving at the ticket counter he/she realized that the student window would not open for 15 (30) minutes. As the window for regular tickets was already open the participant had to decide whether to buy the tickets at the regular price now or to wait. The respondents were asked to fix the amount they were willing to pay. The hypothesis “customers are willing to pay significantly more to save a waiting period of 30 minutes compared to 15 minutes. The average time price for 30 minutes doubles the average time price for 15 minutes” was tested. The scenarios were randomly assigned to 70 MBA students.

In order to analyze the interdependence, it was tested, if both scenarios had equal variances and means. Using students’ t-test this assumption can be rejected at a significance level of \( p<0.00 \) for both. The first part of the research hypothesis can be confirmed. In a second step, comparing the average time values the mean time value for 15 minutes was $2, which equals a price per minute of $0.13. The mean for 30 minutes was $8.24, which equals a price per minute of $0.27. This is nearly twice as much. The results indicate that the assumption of a linear time value is not valid for a waiting situation and the length of the perceived time duration influence the value of time.

Summary. The experiments showed, that in-process satisfaction, the attractiveness of the alternative activity as well as the length of duration influence the value of time.

Limitations of the study. The research approach followed here bears several limitations due to the usage of laboratory experiments and only students as participants.

CONCLUSION

Within the theoretical part of this paper the different views and understandings of time and the value of time in the economic, behavioral, marketing and customer behavior literature are presented. The five different dimensions of time, objective timing and duration as well as subjectively perceived timing, individual estimation of duration and time experience are explained. Within the empirical part of the paper the influence of selected situational variables on the value of time is examined. Due to little knowledge in this area, explanatory laboratory experiments were undertaken. These experiments were able to show that

- in-process satisfaction
- time pressure and the attractiveness of an alternative activity, as well as
- the length of duration

influence the value of time. The experiments demonstrate that the common assumption of a generally applicable and constant value of time has to be rejected. The value of time is a situational construct. Despite the limitations of this kind of research, it is strongly believed that a reliable tendency can be drawn from the results. Therefore the following factors are suggested as the main influential variables on the value of time:

- the content (What are you doing?)
- the length (How long are you doing it?) as well as
- the alternatives (What could you have done?).

One consequence out of these results is, that researchers and marketers should carefully use time allocation models assuming a universal and constant time value. The value of time is not a linear function of time.

Marketers need to consider the value of consumer’s time additionally in three important ways. First, the value of time influences buying behavior, because customers compare the perceived overall price of competing products and services. The overall price consists of the financial price and the value of time. Customers’ willingness-to-pay depends additionally on their subjective value of time. A continuously growing importance of temporal aspects will lead among other things to an increased influence of the value of time on buying behavior. Second, the factors influencing the value of time need to be managed. Process management (e.g. waiting lines) determines the objective length of
activities (e.g. service transactions). And perceptions management (e.g. information given) influences the perceived content as well as the perceived duration. Third, marketers can use different time values of consumers for market segmentation. The management of time value offers the possibility to differentiate from competitors and to establish a competitive advantage.

This piece of research can only shed some light on this yet under-considered area. E.g. further research is needed to determine the influence of situational factors in real-life situations, as well as the influence of personal and socio-cultural characteristics alone and combined.

REFERENCES
Fraisse, Paul (1975), The psychology of time, Greenwood Press, Westport, Conn.
Timing and Contextual Effects on Satisfaction Measurement
Andreas H. Zims, Vienna University of Economics and Business Administration, Austria

ABSTRACT

Does it matter when to ask customers how satisfied they are? When focusing on lasting services it is not evident when it is best to have consumers report upon their degree of satisfaction. There are various reasons for and against interviewing customers during or at the end of the service experience, or some elapse time thereafter. However, the direction of change in satisfaction judgements is contingent on several factors. This study investigates in a longitudinal approach satisfaction appraisals of leisure travellers’ holiday experiences using Oliver’s (1997) multi-domain satisfaction scale. Like in previous studies it could be demonstrated that satisfaction measures decline over time. Controlling for a one and a three months’ elapse time sub-sample no significant difference in their decline could be detected. As could be expected, complaining consumers showed a different pattern of satisfaction change; and so did customers of different travel arrangements. The incident of a new holiday experience or other strong emotional events between first and second appraisal had no impact on the satisfaction level. Implications of the various main and interaction effects are discussed.

1. INTRODUCTION

Together with service quality the marketing construct of satisfaction is one of the most widely researched issue. Companies and non-profit organisations alike recognise customer satisfaction as one of the key objectives of their business activities. Apart from the conceptual variability of customer satisfaction it is questionable when customers should reveal their degree of satisfaction or framed differently: Does it matter when to ask customers how satisfied they are?

In the context of extended, lasting service experiences, such as stays at resorts, travel services, recreational outdoor activities, education, and hospital services, it could be observed that the consecutive collection of discrete encounters contributes to a varying degree to the overall post-purchase evaluation of satisfaction (Dubé and Morgan 1998). The more recent encounters impact more on the final judgement than transactions and experiences in the initial phase of the service delivery process (Chadee und Mattsson 1995, Danahar und Mattsson 1994). Dubé and Morgan (1998) argued that satisfaction may be stable over time; despite the fact that emotional and cognitive aspects could change from one encounter to the next. They found empirically within the domain of health care services a hospital that retrospective reports of global consumption satisfaction could be explained predominantly by the in-process dynamic of satisfaction (adj. $R^2 = 0.446$).

A related issue is addressed by Stewart and Hull (1992) when differentiating between real-time satisfaction (RTS) and post hoc satisfaction (PHS). Assessing satisfaction during the activity (referred to as the “recreation experience continuum”; adapted from Driver and Tocher 1974) is postulated to be a different concept compared to the postactivity assessment of satisfaction. The different timing is important but not the essence of distinction. The post hoc satisfaction concept captures not a recollection of on-site experiences but the appraisal of the current state of the respondent. Hence, the overall post hoc evaluation is influenced by introspection, memory recall and context effects (Stewart and Hull 1992, p. 197).

Consequently, the authors operationalized in their study both constructs differently: 1. RTS was captured by two statements (satisfaction with the experience right now, like to be at some place elsewhere right now). 2. PHS was covered by five items considering comparisons with ideal, cost, enjoyment, benefit and disappointment factors (scale development by Ditton, Graefe, and Fedler 1980; tested further by Schomaker and Knopf 1982). Hikers had to report on their RTS by means of a self-administering questionnaire ten times during the hike; then on their PHS at the end of the hike, three and nine months after the hiking experience. The PHS immediately at the end of the hike could be explained by the RTS measures only with an $R^2$ of 0.31. The model for the three month elapse PHS was even weaker at an $R^2$ of 0.18; altogether delivering support to accept that RTS and PHS are distinct constructs.

No significant relationship between the RTS and the PHS after nine months could be detected which led the authors to the conclusion that “sometime between 3 and 9 months after their hike, the subjects’ satisfaction appraisals of an image of the recreation experience became virtually independent of the actual on-site satisfactions.” (Stewart and Hull 1992, p. 205). The comparisons between the three postactivity measurements showed that the immediate PHS scores were significantly greater than those in the later periods. However, during the three and nine months elapse time the satisfaction scores did not change significantly.

Corroborating findings on the effect of timing are reported by Peterson and Wilson (1992) from their own and other studies. Observing the satisfaction ratings from several thousand new car buyers in a longitudinal approach, the measures declined by 20 percent from 30 days to 90 days subsequent to the purchase. A less dramatic change was reported by McMahon and Forehand (1983) and by Fisk et al. (1990) in the context of health treatment. However, a significant drop in the satisfaction ratings traced longitudinally will be expected ($H_1$). The holiday experience varies in length considerably like other lasting services (e.g. hospital treatments, consulting services) do. If the response for service quality and satisfaction evaluations cannot be collected strictly at the end of the consumption experience for various reasons it is questionable if the time spot during this experience for measuring satisfaction may affect the outcome. Assuming a random occurrence of unforeseen positive and negative events during a holiday stay the time point is not expected to affect the satisfaction measurement ($H_2$). Yet, a minimum of the experiential variety in the course of a holiday stay should be expired. Adopting the Stewart and Hull (1992) findings it can be assumed that the decrease will be stronger in earlier periods than more distant to the initial consumption experience ($H_3$). As more information is processed the further away from the consumption experience the satisfaction appraisal is prone to all sources of additional and comparative information (e.g. Sudman et al. 1996). It was argued that variation is due to the fact that different aspects of satisfaction are being measured at different points in time (Peterson and Wilson 1992). However, this criticism may apply where satisfaction is conceptualised in an unprecise manner.

This study investigates the timing effect of satisfaction measurement longitudinally in the context of leisure travelling. The influence of elapse time as well as of contextual factors of the consumption experience are controlled for. In this study other contextual factors than those of the measurement process are addressed and will be discussed in the next session. In order to keep the conceptual variations as small as possible the identical multi-item satisfaction scale (derived from Oliver 1997) was applied two times consecutively.
2. CONCEPTUAL BACKGROUND

Satisfaction research has adopted the perspective that both emotional and cognitive responses are responsible for this kind of post-purchase evaluation. To find consistent structural relationships across different studies it would be necessary to compare identical or at least very similar concepts. However, this requirement cannot be observed throughout a number of published studies: neither on the side of the satisfaction concept (Bagozzi et al. 1999, Hunt 1977, Westbrook and Oliver 1991) nor on the antecedent side of cognitive and affective appraisals (Mano and Oliver 1993, Nyer 1997, Oliver 1993, Zajone 1980).

The conceptualisation of the satisfaction construct seems to be an issue only for a very limited number of researchers (e.g. Giese and Cote 1999). It is rather exceptional to find a discussion about the content or to find more than a single-item measure to capture overall satisfaction with the exchange process. Bagozzi et al. (1999, p. 201) state that “satisfaction is neither a basic emotion nor a central emotional category in leading theories of emotions”. However, the most frequently used measure is simply represented by a uni- or bipolar scale for satisfaction. Nevertheless, there is great support to view satisfaction as an evaluative post-choice or post-experience judgement which has affinity to attitudes and yet is assumed to represent a hedonic continuum (Westbrook and Oliver 1991).

Using Oliver’s 12-item scale of satisfaction (Oliver 1997) capturing the consumer’s fulfillment response it is assumed to encounter both a variety of emotional reactions which are presumably more important outcomes of purchase (Bagozzi et al. 1999) and the cognitive perspective of the consumption evaluation as well.

From focus group discussions Giese and Cote (1999) concluded that consumers assess their satisfaction at various points of time: about 40% before consumption, 48% during consumption, 12% after consumption. They found support for previous findings (Cote, Foxman, and Cutler 1989) “that satisfaction may not yet be determined when asked and that satisfaction may vary with time.” (Giese and Cote 1999, p. 18). Consistent with Stewart and Hull (1992) it is contended that post-experience satisfaction is determined at the time of the assessment. It is therefore a changing phenomenon which is influenced by previous satisfaction responses (recall) as well as other cognitive processes driven by introspective and contextual sources. Hence, a limited number of influential factors will be incorporated into this study.

There is ample evidence that emotional reactions associated with the consumption experience is fundamental for the determination of satisfaction (Liljander and Strandvik 1997, Oliver 1993, Mano and Oliver 1993, Westbrook 1987, Westbrook and Oliver 1991). The affective perspective complements previous research findings confirming that satisfaction ascends when perceived performance is equal or greater than expected performance. Both perspectives, positive and negative affect, (dis-)confirmation as well as attribute satisfaction, were confirmed to impact satisfaction when applied to automobiles and to a university course (Oliver 1993). In this study, the former two aspects will be considered.

Satisfaction is not conceived to be a pure affective response to the consumption experience; however, satisfaction judgements may be biased by the current state of someone’s emotional condition. Peterson and Wilson (1992) reported significant positive correlations between satisfaction measures and mood from their own and other studies of the subjective well-being literature (cf. Sudman et al. 1996, p. 87ff →H6c). On the other hand, service quality is found to be the key variable impacting on customer satisfaction (Brady and Robertson 2001, Szymanski and Henard 2001). Whether it be by directly measuring the performance or the disconfirmation of expectations (e.g. Oliver and DeSarbo 1988) or any combined measure of congruence (e.g. Spreng and Olshavsky 1993) there are strong conceptual as well as empirical commonalities with the evaluation of satisfaction (→H9c).

Consequently, if tracking satisfaction over time the subjective’s assessment of service quality should be monitored simultaneously. A more product specific argument will be challenged as well. A holiday experience is based on a large bundle of different services and service episodes regularly provided by a number of independent suppliers. All-inclusive products emerged in the field of tourism by offering the complete service chain by applying the pay-once principle to the vacation traveller. In addition to the convenience aspect one strength of this product philosophy could be the homogeneous quality which should be easier to communicate and perceive. Therefore, it is hypothesised that all-inclusive travellers exhibit a higher satisfaction level than travellers with a regular arrangement (→H10c).

Apart from emotional states and cognitive appraisals of the consumption experience other factors may affect the satisfaction judgement. The decision making for vacation travel is in many cases a joint process where members of the travel party play different – and not necessarily balanced – roles. This means that the effort for information gathering, filtering, evaluation, selection and reservation activities is not equally distributed among the travel party. Therefore it is expected that decision and consumption involvement differs among travel party members. It will be assumed that a higher decision involvement leads to a higher satisfaction levels with more or less the same travel services experienced (→H8c).

Due to different expectations and/or personality characteristics service failures will be tolerated or not. The consequence of insufficient service delivery are manifold. One strong sign of disappointed service expectations is complaining (Dröge and Halstead 1991, Nyer 1997). Sometimes complaining activities are difficult to set: time pressure, group restrictions, lack of available people to address or blame are some factors that restrict actual behaviour. However, the intention to complain about a bad service experience could act as a substitute for actual complaining behaviour and is thought to be strongly reflected in lower satisfaction scores (→H7c).

So far, influential factors have been discussed which arise before or during the service experience. If we compare satisfaction judgements during or at the end of the service experience with satisfaction measured some time span after this experience many things could happen in between which change the retrospective and/or current perception (cf. Sudman et al. 1996, p. 111; →H4). It is hypothesised that strong pleasant events will positively bias the satisfaction ratings in retrospect and vice versa. Among others it is important to observe whether customers repeated the same kind of service experience within the relevant time span. Confounding and distinguishing effects can be conceived (→H5). Due to recency effects the new experience leaves stronger traces in memory and masks the former impressions. In contrast, the previous experience could serve as a reference or anchor which helps the consumer to contrast two – more or less – similar encounters. If the evaluation of such follow-up experiences would be known the direction of the satisfaction measurement bias could be investigated.

2.1 Hypotheses

The following hypotheses summarize the introductory section and the previous discussion. They will be tested empirically in this study. Figure 1 gives a graphical representation of the proposed model. While antecedents such as mood, service quality and complaining issues can be found in traditional static satisfaction models
as well this approach tries to incorporate additional factors which are presumably relevant for the dynamic perspective.

2.1.1 Time dependent effects:

**H1**: Satisfaction will decrease over time.

**H2**: The time point of the first satisfaction assessment relative to the duration of the consumption experience has no influence on the satisfaction.

**H3**: The decrease of satisfaction will be stronger the longer the elapse time between consumption experience and retrospection.

2.1.2 Contextual effects:

**H4**: Strong emotional – unplanned – events occurring between the consumption experience and the retrospection will influence the satisfaction judgement.

**H5**: A special case of such an event, though in a planned manner, is a repeated consumption experience. If occurring it will influence the satisfaction judgement.

**H6**: The current mood at the time of the satisfaction measurement will positively influence the satisfaction judgement.

**H7**: Consumers who actually complained or considered to complain exhibit a less favourable satisfaction than those who did not.

**H8**: Consumers with a higher decision involvement will be more satisfied than those with a lower involvement.

**H9**: Quality perceptions are expected to play the major influential role on satisfaction while positive perceptions reinforce satisfaction and less favourable perceptions reduce satisfaction.

**H10**: All-inclusive travellers are expected to be more satisfied with their holiday experience than regular travellers.

3. RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

Data of the 1st questionnaire were collected from 597 leisure travellers by face-to-face interviews during July and beginning of September 1999 in selected holiday regions of Austria. The sample was stratified by quotas for: gender (actually: 55% male), nationality (actually: 68% Germany, 32% Austria), comfort level of the accommodation (only 3- and 4-star or equivalent hotels), length of stay (minimum one week), and elapsed time after arrival (actually: 50% between at least 1/2 and 70% of their stay had expired, 50% later up to the end of their stay; cf. Figure 2). Contacted vacationers were promised to receive a modest present via mail as an incentive for participating in the study and releasing their postal address for a follow-up mail-survey. The oral interview covered socio-demographic characteristics, travel behaviour aspects in general and of the particular trip, a list of (dis-)confirmation elements of the entire vacation, holiday motivations, complaint behaviour or intentions, consumption experience emotions, satisfaction statements, finally repeat visit and recommendation intentions.

The follow-up mail questionnaire was sent out to all of the collected addresses with a pre-stamped return envelope. While the oral, face-to-face interview is a very efficient and effective way to collect complete and reliable data for quota samples the change from an attended to an unattended mode has to be justified in view of the regional dispersal of the target audience. It is questionable whether a data collection mode bias automatically arises. Peterson and Wilson (1992) reported that satisfaction judgements from oral interviews are biased by +10% to +12% compared to those collected by a paper-and-pencil self-administering questionnaire. From Sudman and Bradburn’s (1974) huge meta-analysis about response effects for attitudinal themes just the opposite biases between face-to-face and self-administered interviews had been reported (p. 31; comparing more than 1.000 studies). Interestingly, for both modes positive deviations from mean ratings are documented on average while no negative individual results appear in the tables contrary to the distribution of deviations for behavioural questions. Of course, all these comparisons are based on cross-sectional studies. The only repeated-measure study cited by Peterson and Wilson (1992) compares telephone with mail interviews which is not strictly comparable to the longitudinal applied in this study.

The timing conditions A and B (cf. Figure 2) were combined resulting in four experimental conditions. A response rate of 50% was achieved. Data for 301 respondents for both surveys were...
FIGURE 2
Timing of initial and follow-up study

TABLE 1
Satisfaction scale (adapted from Oliver’s domain specific instrument, 1997, p. 343)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Domain</th>
<th>Reformulated statement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>overall performance, evaluation and quality</td>
<td>This is the best vacation I could have spent this year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>need fulfilment</td>
<td>This vacation trip is exactly what I needed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>failed expectations</td>
<td>This vacation hasn’t worked out as well as I thought it would. (rev.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>satisfaction „anchor“</td>
<td>I am satisfied with my decision to spend this vacation here.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>success attribution</td>
<td>My choice to spend his holiday was a wise one.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>regret</td>
<td>If I could do it over again, I’d spend a different vacation. (rev.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>positive affect</td>
<td>I have truly enjoyed this vacation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>failure attribution</td>
<td>I feel bad (guilty) about my decision to spend this vacation. (rev.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>negative affect</td>
<td>I am not happy that I spend this holiday. (rev.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>success attribution</td>
<td>I am sure it was the right thing to stay here for my holidays.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>purchase evaluation</td>
<td>not applicable without major revision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cognitive dissonance</td>
<td>not applicable without major revision</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

collapsed. The non-response share among the first sample is completely recruited from the B1 sub-sample. All other characteristics are statistically not different from the response sample of the first survey. The questionnaire covered the same satisfaction and service quality statements as the 1st interview together with additional items described below.

3.1 Measurement of Satisfaction

Oliver’s 12-item Likert-type scale (Oliver 1997) was adapted and translated for the use in the particular tourism services context. This satisfaction scale covers the following domains: overall performance, evaluation and quality; need fulfilment; failed expectations; satisfaction „anchor“; success attribution; regret; positive affect; failure attribution; negative affect; success attribution; purchase evaluation; and cognitive dissonance. The latter two have been dropped as the wording and content referred to the acquisition and possession of products which would not apply to service experiences. Each statement was measured on a 7-point scale ranging from 1 ‘entirely reject’ to 7 ‘fully accept’.

3.2 Measurement of Confirmation/Disconfirmation of travel attributes

The cognitive appraisal was operationalised by 23 items describing the vacation travel experience. Four domains can be distinguished a priori: 1. destination atmosphere (items e.g.: climate, safety, landscape, cleanliness, friendliness), 2. infrastructure (e.g. public transportation, cultural offerings, shopping facilities), 3. tourism related infrastructure (e.g. excursions, sport, entertainment, facilities for families), and 4. tourism services (e.g. accommodation, food and beverages, personnel). The scale was constructed following the (dis-)confirmation paradigm: ‘+3’ marked the pole where expectations had not been fulfilled at all; the ‘0’ marker signified met expectations while at the pole ‘+3’ expectations had been more than fulfilled. In order to reduce the complexity of possible influences the quality perceptions were condensed by regressing the satisfaction scale against the 23 items of travel attributes. Quality assessment in time 1 explained 18% of the latent satisfaction construct. The following items were retained, summed and averaged for further analyses (cf. Table 2: items PQUAL1 and PQUAL2): landscape impression, climate and weather, comfort of the accommodation, empathy of service personnel, quality and variety of entertainment. The pre-processing for measurement in time 2 was applied similarly. The quality perceptions of five – partially different – components explained the variation in the satisfaction construct by 23%: climate and weather, landscape impression, service in the accommodation, quality and variety of catering, services for families with children.
TABLE 2
Summary on controlled variance factors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Effect</th>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Q</th>
<th>Characteristics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>relative time of 1st interview</td>
<td>QTIME1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>less than 70% of stay elapsed (0) more than 70% of stay elapsed (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>elapsed time back home</td>
<td>QTIME2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1 month back (0) 3 months back (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>product type</td>
<td>TYPE</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>all-inclusive (1) regular (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>complaining</td>
<td>COMPL</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>no reason to complain (0) complained, intended to complain (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>new holiday experience</td>
<td>NEWEX</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>no (0) yes (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>exceptional event</td>
<td>EVENT</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>negative (-1) no or neutral (0) positive (+1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>decision involvement</td>
<td>INVOLV</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>scale from low to high (1 – 7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mood</td>
<td>MOOD1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>scale from bad to good (1 – 7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mood</td>
<td>MOOD2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>scale from bad to good (1 – 7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>perceived quality</td>
<td>PQUAL1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>summed average scale (1 – 7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>perceived quality</td>
<td>PQUAL2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>summed average scale (1 – 7)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Q1 = questionnaire at t1, Q2 = questionnaire at t2

3.3 Additional control variables

The initial sample had quotas for different types of vacation arrangements. One third of the respondents spent their holidays with an all-inclusive package covering accommodation, catering, leisure activities, child care and additional services. Another third of the sample represented vacationers who bought an inclusive-card granting free or a reduced-fee access to a large number of leisure attractions during their holiday stay. The last third covered the regular traveller without any special arrangement. Pre-processing of the data did not reveal clear differences between the latter two groups and have been collapsed for further analyses.

The issue of complaining was addressed by asking for reasons for complaining. If respondents indicated some reason they could report on actual complaining behaviour or complaining intentions. Both reactions were treated within one category in this study. The occurrence of an additional holiday experience before interviewing the vacationers a second time was recorded in a dichotomous way. In contrast, other exceptional events could be reported as either negative or positive. If both circumstances happened the answer was coded as neutral. Single-item measures were introduced to capture the degree of decision involvement, the mood state at the first and the second interview.

4. RESULTS

Oliver’s satisfaction scale (1997) was subject to a factor and reliability analysis. The ten statements loaded as expected on one dimension and revealed a very good reliability score (Cronbach’s $\alpha = .90$ for SATIS t1, and $\alpha = .88$ for SATIS t2; comparable statistics in Oliver 1997, p. 344). Table 3 delivers further evidence from structural equation estimation (AMOS 4.0, Arbuckle and Wothke 1999) that the multi-domain concept of satisfaction can be consistently captured in one dimension. Model fit is reasonable, though a substantial number of correlated error terms (within and across measurement points) had to be accepted. Each indicator delivers a significant contribution ($p < .05$) to the measurement of satisfaction. However, the loading pattern changes over time. The right column of Table 3 documents the change of the $\chi^2$-value for the model fit if one factor loading is restricted to be equal for both measurements. The least reliable change in the loading structure can be observed for the statements addressing overall performance and the satisfaction “anchor”. Not considering the absolute level of satisfaction the repeated measurement is significantly correlated with the first assessment in the amount of .54.

The following steps of analysis try to trace the impact on the differences in satisfaction scores during/at the end of the holiday experience versus one/three month later. Model complexity is purposely reduced by calculating averaged scores for the uni-dimensional satisfaction construct. The average satisfaction rating diminishes from 6.09 to 5.27 in a statistically significant way; i.e. by 13% from one point in time to the next (H1 accepted; see discussion section). The hypotheses postulated in the remaining hypotheses (H2 to H10) are now going to be investigated simultaneously. Analyses of variance with a repeated measures design, between- and within-subject effects are applied.

The statistical results from estimating time dependent, main and interaction effects are summarized in Tables 4 and 5. The first step of interpretation turns the attention to the non-significant effects. Most important is that time dependent satisfaction differences do not differ whether they are measured with a one ore a three months elapse time (H3 rejected). The same conclusion can be drawn for the different measurement points of time during the service experience (H2 accepted). In other words: the same reduction of satisfaction judgement appears whether vacationers are interviewed in the middle or rather at the end of their stay. No interaction effect between these two experimental conditions (A and B) could be detected.

24% of the respondents travelled for another holiday trip within the time of the first and the second interview. No direct influence on the satisfaction measurement could be observed. Other – positive (12% of the respondents) or negative (7%) – events did not reveal a significant effect either (H4 and H5 rejected).

The current mood state (at t1 as well as at t2) shows no main effect on changes in the satisfaction ratings over time or across subjects. However, mood coincides e.g. with the issue of complaining. Furthermore, this influence changes over time. If respondents had some reason to complain the current mood state while on holiday had a weaker correlation with the satisfaction measure. In contrast, when asked back home the new satisfaction measure was even more correlated with the “holiday” mood. This would imply that reasons for complaining act as a reinforcer on satisfaction in retrospect. This line of thought cannot be substantiated because the mood influence is even larger in the absence of complaining activities or intentions. A less reliable interaction effect between mood while on holiday and the retrospective quality perception ($p = .045$) appears when explaining the variation in the second satisfaction measurement. The negative regression parameter indicates a
lower satisfaction if the quality perception is more mood-driven. This negative relationship can be observed with the current mood state at the time of evaluating the perceived quality and satisfaction a second time. A much stronger, though positive, mood effect is observed with the current mood state at the time of evaluating the perceived quality and satisfaction. This negative relationship can be observed with the current mood state at the time of evaluating the perceived quality and satisfaction. However, the direction of this influence changes over time. While on holiday the relationship is inverse: The less involved the respondent had been in the decision making process the more satisfied he or she is with the travel experience. Back home, this contrast turns into the opposite direction. For the all-inclusive traveller this involvement effect does not seem to operate: neither during or at the end of the holiday nor when return home. However, the significance level for the latter contrast is not sufficient (p = .065; H8 rejected).

Finally, the covariate of the parallel quality evaluation has to be considered. Quality perceptions contribute second best to the explanation of satisfaction change over time (partial $\eta^2 = .03$) and are most responsible for between-subject variations in the satisfaction judgement (partial $\eta^2 = .16$). This effect is significant at both points of measurement time (H9 accepted). However, the quality perceptions while on holiday do not appear to correlate in a very strong and reliable way. The relationship between perceived quality and satisfaction – assessed with a substantial distance to the real experience – is much stronger and highly significant (p < .001). Among all-inclusive vacationers the quality–satisfaction relationship is even stronger.

### 5. DISCUSSION

Measuring satisfaction at two consecutive points of time should reveal insights into the antecedents and sources of change of the satisfaction construct. For this purpose the multi-domain concept of satisfaction (developed by Oliver 1997) was adapted to be applicable in a service context like tourism. The empirical data substantiate that satisfaction can be conceptualized in a multifaceted way, yet, representing a uni-dimensional latent construct. From the structural equation analysis it can be derived that the importance of the ten different indicators changes over time. What appeared to be relatively stable are the two facets called “overall performance” and “satisfaction anchor” (Oliver 1997, p. 343). The largest differences emerged with statements capturing “failed expectations”, “failure attribution” and “negative affect”, altogether negative aspects of the satisfaction formation. This shift in the loading pattern has its counterpart in the absolute differences of scores of the single indicators. Overall, the negative indicators deteriorated much more than the positive ones. While at the single item level the correlations ranged between .15 (failure attribution) and .48 (overall performance) the correlation between the latent satisfaction variables amounted to .54.
From previous research findings it was deduced that satisfaction will decrease over time. The within-subject reduction was determined with 13%. Other studies reported much larger shifts. However, no difference between the one month and three months elapse time measurement could be detected, though Stewart and Hull (1992) reported significant differences within a three-months elapse time. Comparing between-subject contrasts (this study) with within-subject contrasts (Stewart and Hull study) may not be convincing; however sub-samples (experimental condition B) have been carefully constructed and checked for homogeneity. Stewart and Hull (1992) concluded from their results that the decline in satisfaction measures is significant during the first months but did not continue in later periods. Though without precise evidence, it could be expected that if satisfaction decreases over time it will decrease much more immediately after the service experience than in later time periods. Therefore, a substantial difference between the one month and the three months sub-samples could have been expected. Yet, no significant effect turned out to exist, not even if the elapse time (calculated in weeks after the first interview) were introduced as a continuous variable. This robustness against further decrease in later periods may be ascribed to the use of a multi-item satisfaction measurement instrument. Two arguments can be discussed: 1. Introspection of a number of arguments helps to activate more appropriate memory traces than referring to only one emotional stimulus. 2. Even if the perspective of ad-hoc constructed evaluations were more appropriate the stability of satisfaction would mean that the cognitive processes underlying the appraisal does not change in this consumption context (Sudman and Bradburn 1974).

There are strong arguments that customer evaluations and attitudes are constructed at the time when being asked and not recalled (Bettman, Luce and Payne 1998; Stewart and Hull 1992). If appraisals are more governed by constructive processes they are more prone to cognitive changes which occurred more recently.

### Table 4
Main and interaction effects for explaining satisfaction at time point t₁ and t₂

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sources</th>
<th>Within-subject contrasts t₁ – t₂</th>
<th>Between-subjects contrasts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F value</td>
<td>Significance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TIME t₁ – t₂</td>
<td>143.28</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TYPE</td>
<td>5.46</td>
<td>.020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COMPL</td>
<td>n.s.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PQUAL1</td>
<td>n.s.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PQUAL2</td>
<td>9.60</td>
<td>.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INVOLV</td>
<td>9.98</td>
<td>.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QTIME1</td>
<td>n.s.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QTIME2</td>
<td>n.s.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EVENT</td>
<td>n.s.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEWEX</td>
<td>n.s.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOOD1</td>
<td>n.s.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOOD2</td>
<td>n.s.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TYPE * MOOD2</td>
<td>n.s.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TYPE * PQUAL2</td>
<td>n.s.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TYPE * INVOLV</td>
<td>3.43</td>
<td>.065</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COMPL * MOOD1</td>
<td>n.s.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOOD1 * PQUAL2</td>
<td>n.s.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOOD2 * PQUAL2</td>
<td>4.17</td>
<td>.042</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 5
Parameter estimates for separate satisfaction models for t₁ and t₂

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sources</th>
<th>Satisfaction t₁</th>
<th></th>
<th>Satisfaction t₂</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Coeff. B</td>
<td>Significance</td>
<td>Coeff. B</td>
<td>Significance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TYPE</td>
<td>-3.05</td>
<td>.003</td>
<td>-1.28</td>
<td>.253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COMPL</td>
<td>-.84</td>
<td>.393</td>
<td>-1.45</td>
<td>.183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PQUAL1</td>
<td>.13</td>
<td>.072</td>
<td>.16</td>
<td>.046</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PQUAL2</td>
<td>.28</td>
<td>.524</td>
<td>1.73</td>
<td>.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INVOLV</td>
<td>-.07</td>
<td>.994</td>
<td>.09</td>
<td>.411</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TYPE (1) * MOOD2</td>
<td>-.07</td>
<td>.782</td>
<td>.64</td>
<td>.033</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TYPE (2) * MOOD2</td>
<td>-.24</td>
<td>.370</td>
<td>.35</td>
<td>.241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TYPE (1) * PQUAL2</td>
<td>.31</td>
<td>.050</td>
<td>.11</td>
<td>.486</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TYPE * INVOLV</td>
<td>.08</td>
<td>.309</td>
<td>-.10</td>
<td>.238</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COMPL (0) * MOOD1</td>
<td>.49</td>
<td>.106</td>
<td>.90</td>
<td>.008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COMPL (1) * MOOD1</td>
<td>.29</td>
<td>.330</td>
<td>.67</td>
<td>.043</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOOD1 * PQUAL2</td>
<td>-.06</td>
<td>.341</td>
<td>-.15</td>
<td>.029</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOOD2 * PQUAL2</td>
<td>.04</td>
<td>.472</td>
<td>-.09</td>
<td>.123</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Despite some strong emotional events and/or similar consumption experiences respondents in this study did not change their second satisfaction judgement. This finding can be interpreted in favour of more retrospection and less ad-hoc construction of appraisals or in favour of a satisfaction concept which builds on enduring more cognitive and less emotional components.

Various studies have demonstrated that the overall evaluation of a lasting service experience is influenced by every service episode. The more recent encounters were shown to have a larger impact on satisfaction judgements than earlier ones. As satisfaction is conceived overwhelmingly as a post-consumption construct it should be best measured not before the end of the total consumption experience. However, this imperative cannot be obeyed in any cases for various pragmatic reasons of commercial market research. Therefore, this study investigated the effect of asking travellers some days before the end of their holiday stay. Again, no within-subject design was applied. Though from comparing two very similar sub-samples (experimental condition A: relative point of interview during the holiday stay), no significant differences could be detected. It has to be mentioned that the majority of the respondents in the “early” sub-sample had already passed 50% up to 70% of their stay. This means that results would be probably different and/or invalid if travellers would be asked about their overall satisfaction in the early stages of their consumption experience.

However, mood as an immediate feeling state influences interest, perception and memory (Schwarz and Clore 1983). The mood bias on satisfaction measurement could be demonstrated in this study as hypothesized. The effect, however, was mediated by reasons for complaining and other contextual variables. In addition, complaining was supposed to play a direct negative role on satisfaction. While a negative effect could be identified together with the current mood state during the holiday stay differences between complaining and non-complaining vacationers intensified after the return back home. Without having identified exactly the reasons and the precise consequences of complaints (relevant for almost 20% of the respondents) it can be interpreted that complaints are often based on very unpleasant irregularities with an enduring impact. Complaining activities or complaining intentions may act as mood regulating but do affect quality and satisfaction evaluations persistently.

The concept of decision involvement refers to the stage of preparing the destination selection and the trip itself. Though relevant at different points of time it can be argued that it induces consumers to develop different expectations. In this study it was hypothesized that involvement will encourage higher satisfaction levels. Indeed, this positive correlation holds for the second satisfaction measurement after one or three months, while the opposite result was derived for the immediate satisfaction appraisal. In addition, this relationship holds only for non-all-inclusive travelers. This is probably due to the options all-inclusive travelers acquire when booking an all-inclusive package. Expectations are directed towards a flexible and convenient pool of activities during the stay. The degree of involvement of preparing the vacation stay in advance does not matter.

It can be imagined that the higher involvement with the preparation of the consumption experience the more precise are the expectations and the less open the individual will be to accept deviations from these. Failure attribution, responsibility and regret are more likely to be incorporated by consumers with a higher decision involvement. A lower involvement helps the traveller to be more relaxed and more tolerant to experience things – in a way – he or she had no clear imagination about. In the retrospection this influence turns to the inverse situation. Low-involvement travellers are somewhat less satisfied than highly involved ones. Maybe that more involved people are more in favour of their holiday decisions whereas less involved travellers stress more their unfulfilled desires blaming others, not themselves.

Perceived quality evaluation turned out to be correlated with satisfaction measures as expected. The retrospective judgements revealed a strong and consistent relationship. While on holiday the influence emerged to be by far less intense. In any case, it has to be mentioned that the measurement of perceived quality was reduced from 23 to 5 indicators (taking the significant regression variables only). This procedure facilitated the comprehensive analysis and could be criticized due to an over-simplification. Insights from other industries would suggest to investigate the influence of each of the quality indicators for linear and non-linear relationships.

6. CONCLUSION

This study tried to test various influential factors on satisfaction measures under partially experimental conditions. The hypothesized within-subject decrease of satisfaction with a vacation travel experience substantiated. The entire effect appears to be the same asking travellers one or three months after their return back home. This robustness may be due to the complex ten-item satisfaction instrument which is relatively balanced between emotional and cognitive elements. For practitioners, it could be useful to operate with multi-item measures especially when comparing satisfaction ratings for experiences which date back to different time horizons.

However, only part of the tested effects stems from within-subject contrasts. Much more reliability could be achieved if more factors would be traced longitudinally. A very much appreciated extension of the study design would be additional time points, e.g. one, three and six months for each respondent. Initial sample volumes would have to be adapted accordingly. The remaining 300 respondents in the last round, which were rather too few for so many effects, would afford an initial sample size of at least 2,500 respondents considering a constant drop-out ratio of 50%.

Further research should be done especially in the field of complaining. This study reported a reinforcing effect of complaining travellers when asked to evaluate their experience in the hindsight. Though the effect coefficients were not significant it is interesting to investigate this phenomenon in more detail: e.g. with larger sample sizes, with different services, with more insights into the complaining and responding processes.

Against the overall trend that satisfaction ratings decrease over time customers of an all-inclusive travel arrangement did not show the same amount of decay. This may point to the advantage of all-inclusive products in such a way that they support a holistic perception and experience which is more stable and enduring in memory than a number of independent vacation elements which are offered and consumed without conscious interrelationship.

7. REFERENCES


20% of the respondents) it can be interpreted that complaints are


Show and Tell: Advertisers’ Use of Rhetoric Over Time
Barbara J. Phillips, University of Saskatchewan, Canada
Edward F. McQuarrie, Santa Clara University, U.S.A.

ABSTRACT

This paper uses a diachronic perspective to explore the issues of continuity and change as advertisers make ongoing, historically situated attempts to persuade consumers over time. A content assessment of the rhetorical styles of ads in three American magazines was conducted for the time period 1954 to 1999. Results from this assessment show that while the existence of rhetorical figures in ads remains invariant over time, the way in which these figures are used has undergone a dramatic shift. Rhetorical figures are increasingly layered and less verbal copy is used to explain their interpretation. This result suggests that advertisers increasingly rely on consumers’ cultural competence to understand rhetorical figures; advertisers use these figures to increase ad pleasure and combat consumer ennui.
The main objective of this session is to look at some recent studies that use dual-process theories (see Chaiken & Trope, 1999) in the domain of persuasive communication. More specific, the dual-role of affect is taken into account. In the first study, affect-as-information (as a heuristic processing mode) is used to explain the influence of attitudinal valence on the degree of evaluative consistency among attitude related judgements. Consistent with dual-theories, support for an asymmetrical view of affect on persuasion effects is found (Forgas, 2000). In the second study, the effects of mood on the evaluation of negatively valenced mental categories are investigated. Consistent with dual-process theories, the affect-as-information hypothesis could only be supported when respondents’ processing motivation is low. The final study is more theoretical in nature, and discusses the strengths and weaknesses of existing dual-process models. On the basis of these weaknesses, an extended model, the CASCADES model, is presented. Following an introduction into the basic ideas of the model, some of its implications for understanding affective persuasion, especially with regard to the other two papers of the special topic session, will be discussed.

**“Prior Attitudes and Consumer Judgements: The Effect of Valence, Extremity and Elaboration”**

Carlos Falces, Universidad Autonoma de Madrid, Spain  
Benjamin Sierra, Universidad Autonoma de Madrid, Spain  
Elena Alier, Universidad Autonoma de Madrid, Spain  
Pablo Brinol, Ohio State University, U.S.A.

This research analyzes the influence of attitudinal valence on the degree of evaluative consistency among attitude related judgements. Think, for example, about consumers with very positive or negative attitudes toward a service provider, that are required to evaluate the quality they have experienced in a specific service encounter. According to the effect of attitudes on information processing, it could be expected that both groups of consumers show an attitude consistency bias in their quality judgements. In line with this hypothesis, people with an extreme attitude should show more similar scores among attributes than those with relatively moderate or neutral attitudes. However, it is possible that the influence of attitude extremity on attitude related judgements would be different as a function of attitudinal valence. Research on affect and information processing shows asymmetrical effects of affective valence on information processing tasks such as judgements. For example, the affect as information hypothesis proposes that negative affect signals that something is wrong in the environment and motivates a more detailed or analytic processing. On the other hand, positive affect informs the individual of a safe and/or pleasant environment, leading to a more holistic processing of the information at hand.

Applying this view to attitude valence, it could be expected that people with positive attitudes will be less motivated to consider the slightly differences among service dimensions and give more similar scores on those dimensions. On the other hand, a negative orientation toward an attitudinal object could lead to a more detailed consideration of different attributes and then, the probability of perceived differences among those attributes could be higher. As a consequence, the similarity of responses among judged attributes would be higher when people hold positive attitudes than when they hold negative ones.

Two field studies were conducted in order to test the possible effect of attitude valence in consumer judgements.

In the first study, a sample of customers of different restaurant services were classified according the extremity (high vs. moderate) and valence (positive vs. negative) of their previous global attitudes toward the service provider. Participants evaluated the quality of a specific service encounter using a perceived quality scale, which measures five different quality dimensions. A homogeneity index was created using standard deviations of each respondents’ five quality dimension scores. Results showed a main effect of valence qualified by an interaction with the extremity of previous attitudes. Confirming the valence influence hypothesis, negative attitudes led to more dissimilar judgements among quality dimensions than positive ones. The difference between moderate and extreme attitudes was only significant in the case of negative valence and opposite to the extremity influence prediction. The more negative the attitude was, more heterogeneous judgements were made.

The second study examined if the valence effect remained the same when the elaboration likelihood was relatively high or low. The same design of the first study was used, adding the Need for Cognition Scale and a thought listing task as an index of the amount of processing. Results replicated the valence effect found in the first study and showed that compared to high need for cognition respondents, low need for cognition individuals made more similar judgements among quality dimensions when the valence was negative. Results of the thought listing task showed that people with negative attitudes gave more reasons for their evaluations than those holding a positive attitude. However no significant differences were found in the number of thoughts listed between positive and negative high need for cognition individuals. This result suggests that valence effects can not be explained by differences in the amount of processing. As a conclusion, the results of both studies support the view of an asymmetry between negative and positive attitudes in consumer information processing.

**“The Influence of Mood on the Evaluation of Negatively Valenced Mental Categories”**

Anick Bosmans, Ghent University, Belgium  
Patrick Van Kenhove, Ghent University, Belgium  
Peter Vierick, Ghent University, Belgium  
Hendrik Hendrickx, Ghent University, Belgium

According to the affect-as-information hypothesis, people make mood-congruent judgements when their mood is seen as informative for the judgement to be made (Schwarz & Clore, 1983). In addition, the cognitive tuning extension of the affect-as-information hypothesis states that mood also provides procedural information by providing feedback about the nature of a situation (e.g. Clore, Schwarz, & Conway, 1994). Positive mood signals that a situation is benign and that a heuristic / non systematic processing strategy is adequate to meet processing goals. As a consequence, positive mood will result in a greater reliance on general knowledge structures. In contrast, moods that are more negative than usual signal that the situation is problematic, and that a more systematic processing strategy is adequate for dealing with the situation adaptively.

In the current two studies we tested this cognitive tuning effect using negatively valenced mental schema’s (blood donation and condom use). According to the cognitive tuning effect, it can be
expected that positive mood will result in a greater reliance on general knowledge structures, hence in attitudes that are based on this negatively valenced mental schema and, as a result, in evaluations that are more negative. In contrast, following the evaluative component of the affect-as-information hypothesis, mood-congruent judgements can be expected.

In our first study, positive versus negative mood subjects were asked to evaluate a new (fictitious) blood donation initiative at our university (i.e. a service found to be associated with a negatively valenced mental knowledge structure). However, no effects of mood on blood donation evaluations were found. Hence, no support for the affect-as-information hypothesis, nor for its cognitive tuning extension were found.

A possible explanation for this null finding is the fact that subjects may have been too motivated to process the ad: The blood donation message was of high personal relevance for subjects, and subjects often reported negative felt affect. Both conditions have been found to increase processing motivation (for a review see Bagozzi, Gopinath, & Nyer, 1999). It has been suggested that (e.g. Forgas, 1995; Petty, Schumann, Richman, & Strathman, 1993) there are different roles for affect under high- and low-elaboration conditions. Petty et al. (1993) for example showed that, although in both high- and low- elaboration conditions positive mood had a positive influence on subjects’ product evaluations, positive mood had a direct effect on attitudes in low elaboration conditions and influenced attitudes indirectly by modifying the positivity of thoughts in high- elaboration conditions.

This would suggest that under conditions of low elaboration, mood serves as a simple heuristic cue in the formation and change of an attitude. With regard to our research, this suggests that, in line with studies investigating the effects of cognitive tuning under conditions of high versus low elaboration, our affect-as-information and cognitive tuning effects are likely to occur under conditions of low elaboration. Several cognitive tuning studies indeed did not find any cognitive tuning effects when subjects were highly motivated to process (i.e. under conditions of systematic processing) (e.g. Soldat, Sinclair, & Mark, 1997; Ottati, Terkildsen, & Hubbard, 1997). According to these studies, increased motivation can lead to systematic processing even if affective cues suggest that the situation is benign (note that cognitive tuning is considered in the literature as a processing heuristic).

Study 2 was conducted to further test our post hoc explanation (i.e. that subjects were too motivated to use the processing heuristics). In this study, we measured attitudes towards a less negatively valenced (but still sufficiently negative) mental schema (that of condom use) and we manipulated involvement in order to obtain a high- and a low- elaboration condition. Given our above reasoning, we expect cognitive tuning of affect-as-information effects (as initially expected for the previous study) only when elaboration likelihood is low. When elaboration likelihood is high, no effects of mood on evaluation are expected.

In this second study we found that only when involvement was low, product evaluations were more positive under conditions of positive mood than under conditions of negative mood. This finding is consistent with the affect-as-information hypothesis. Moreover, no mood effects were found under conditions of high involvement. As discussed before, the latter null finding is consistent with dual theories (e.g. Petty et al., 1993; Forgas, 1995) concerning the effects of mood on persuasion. According to these theories, when motivation to process is high, mood influences the persuasion process through principles of affective priming, while under low motivation conditions, mood influences the persuasion process through affect-as-information heuristics.

In conclusion, under low elaboration conditions, we found, consistent with the affect-as-information heuristic, mood-congruent judgements. No evidence for cognitive tuning was found. This suggests that participants did not rely on their, with negative affect laden, general knowledge structures when making evaluations. Instead, people seemed to take their moods as informative for the judgement to be made.

It is clear that our study has straightforward implications for marketing and consumer behaviour practitioners. The present study shows that, even though a product or product class is associated with negative beliefs / feelings (e.g. life insurances, drugs, condoms,…), people still take their moods as informative for the judgements to be made. It is important to notice however that this will only be the case under conditions of low involvement (as is the case in a lot of the persuasion attempts).

References


“Extending Dual-Process Models: The CASCADES Model”
Andreas Strehinger, Vienna University of Business Administration and Economics, Austria

Originating from social psychology, dual-process models—in particular the elaboration likelihood model (ELM, Petty and Cacioppo 1986) and the heuristic-systematic model (HSM, Chaiken 1980)—have given rise to a boom-like output of academic studies in consumer research over the past two decades. The outstanding strength of these models, for one, is due to the highly parsimonious model formulation, which permits the characterisation of the impact of a persuasion variable based on no more than five functions. Certain characteristics of source, recipient, message and context (a) may, as peripheral (heuristic) cues, affect persuasion at a low level of elaboration likelihood, (b) act convincingly as central (systematic) cues at a high level of elaboration likelihood, or have a direct effect on elaboration likelihood due to a change in (c) motivation or (d) ability for central (systematic) information processing. The fifth function of a variable is based on the assumption that humans do not always process in a relatively objective manner, but (e) are biased in their persuasion by certain variables. A second strong point of the
models is to be found in the enormous amount of empirical research which gives impressive evidence of their predictive ability and generalizability. In the field of consumer research alone, more than 100 publications substantiate the considerable utility of these models (Strebing 2000, pp. 106ff).

Apart from these central strengths, a subjective inventory by the author highlights six problem areas, in which ELM and HSM still possess a potential for optimization. (1) „Descriptive“ character of cue classification: As Petty and Cacioppo (1986, p. 192) recognize, the question as to which variable adopts which of the five functions of the model under what circumstances is not solved by the ELM. In their critical assessment, Eagly and Chaiken (1993, p. 321) therefore refer to the ELM as „primarily descriptive“, thereby distinguishing it from „explanatory“. Despite their claim to the contrary (Eagly and Chaiken 1993, p. 342) it is hard to follow the authors of the HSM in their assumption that the HSM does solve the question why a heuristic cue should act as a heuristic cue. (2) Confounding of processing mode and content: A problem that is closely related to the „descriptive“ character of the models and that arises in particular in HSM is that the processing of a cue defined as heuristic in the above manner is equated with „heuristic processing“. (3) Lack of an „intraprocedural structure“: Despite outstanding contributions of their authors to the fields of automaticity research (e.g., Cacioppo et al. 1992; Chaiken and Bargh 1993), both models lack an in-depth structure of the procedure of a single, chronologically limited episode of processing (e.g., a single evaluation of a brand or a print ad), which in this context is defined as „intraprocedural structure“. (4) Lack of an „interprocedural perspective“: While some dual-process models such as the CEST come up with a long-term perspective by linking several temporally distinct processing episodes (here referred to as „interprocedural perspective“), ELM and HSM do not, at least explicitly, allow for a change in the function of specific cues over several processing occasions. (5) Lack of a control function: A controlled mode of information processing implies not only literally the existence of a „control authority“. Even if ELM and HSM do not expressly use the term „controlled“, they nevertheless postulate a number of supervisory processing tasks without indicating precisely in what form these are performed. (6) Missing integration into theories of hierarchical expectancy-value formation: Obviously, both ELM and HSM assume the usage of hierarchically lower elements of expectancy-value formation (e.g., specific beliefs about a brand) to be probable when elaboration likelihood is high, whereas low ability or motivation will cause attempts to directly reach the next higher level (e.g., some expectancy-value component or a global attitude toward the brand). Apart from this implicit line of thought, both ELM and HSM remain quite vague, both in theoretical terms (cf. e.g., Eagly and Chaiken 1993, p. 241) and concerning the interpretation of their empirical findings (cf. e.g., Areni and Lutz 1988).

Based on these notions, the CASCADES model proposed by the author roots in ELM and HSM and tries to supplement them in regard to five aspects. (1) The above-mentioned problem of confounding the mode and the content of information processing is addressed by falling back on the distinction between Controlled and automatic information processing, the most important dividing line is regarded to be the level of consciousness (Spiegel 1958/1970, p. 17; Langer, Blank, and Chanowitz 1978, p. 48; Bargh 1989). On the automatic information processing side, a further distinction is made between a formerly conscious processing mode, which is Automated by constant practice, and a Subconscious processing mode which is already based on subconscious learning (cf. Spiegel 1958/1970). (2) Automatic and controlled processes in varying combinations serve the fulfilment of two different func-

**References**


**European Advances in Consumer Research (Volume 5) / 49**


The Original Marketing Paradox: “Product Needs” versus “Individualized Financial Solutions”: Predicting and Understanding Consumer Saving Behavior Using a New Methodology to Assess the Dynamics of Psychological Variables

Johan de Heer, Tilburg University, The Netherlands
Ton Kuijlen, Tilburg University, The Netherlands
Leo Paas, Tilburg University, The Netherlands

This session documents some recent developments in research on consumer saving behavior. Three studies are reported that examine the factors that may predict saving behavior. In particular, we focus on economic and psychological factors and their relationship, which can predict the position the consumer takes in the saving need hierarchy and which factors predict the next position in this hierarchy. The studies in the session focus both on Economic Psychology theory, methodology and marketing and managerial implications. The goal of the session is to understand when and why consumers acquire (more) financial products?

It is paramount to understand how consumers make decisions concerning financial products (e.g., checkings, savings, investment trusts, shares et cetera). The difference between the success and failure of new and existing saving products largely depends on economic and psychological variables. The tremendous marketing activities in advertising financial products point to the crucial importance of the predictability of saving behavior. The empirical research on the topic has been limited and mainly studied from a business economic point of view. The few psychological attempts have shown methodological difficulties. Furthermore, these studies did not take into account the surplus value and the changing roles of the psychological variables in the understanding of moving up positions in the saving need hierarchy, which is to acquire more sophisticated financial products.

Each of the three papers in this special session builds on this developing research stream in various ways. The first theoretical paper, by DeHeer, concerns an economic psychology framework on saving behavior, i.e. the saving need hierarchy model (Wenneryd, 1999). The second paper, by Paas, is of an empirical nature and explains the steps taken in a hierarchy of saving products and relates these to different saving needs. It proposes a new methodological approach in which the pros and cons are discussed. The third and final paper, by Kuijlen, reports an empirical study and focuses on the relationship between the acquisition pattern of financial products and the information that is needed to move through the hierarchy. The implications of this type of research are discussed in terms of economic psychological theory and in terms of applied marketing research.

“Towards an Economic Perspective of Saving Behavior”

Johan de Heer, Tilburg University, The Netherlands

The first paper concentrates on a theory proposed by Lindqvist (1981; cited in Wenneryd, 1999) and later refined by Wahlund (1991; cited in Wenneryd, 1999) and Wahlund and Wenneryd (1987; cited in Wenneryd, 1999) and further elaborated upon by Wenneryd (1999). This theory proposes that saving motives can be ordered hierarchically, as displayed in Figure 1.

It should be noted that very few advanced analyses of data relating to the saving need hierarchy have been carried out. In line with suggestions by Wenneryd (1999, p. 300) a bridge is built to the main purpose of research on saving, that is predicting saving and trying to influence saving.

“Explaining Steps Taken in a Hierarchy of Saving Products Related to Different Saving Needs”

Leo Paas, Tilburg University, The Netherlands

The second paper has two parts. Part A proposes that utilities of different financial products can be relevant for each specific saving need in figure 1. It is, therefore, hypothesized that the different motives in figure 1 lead to the acquisition of different saving products. For example, the need for cash management could lead to the acquisition of a checkings account while the need for a financial buffer could spur interest in the utilities of a savings account. If saving needs are hierarchically ordered then products should be required in the same order by a majority of consumers. Products that possess utilities, which support the satisfaction of basic needs are usually acquired before products with utilities for satisfying higher order needs.

A data set from a financial service provider is available for the present study. This data set consists of a random selection of 543 Dutch households. The sample was interviewed in July 2000. Respondents were asked to indicate whether their household owned the following financial products: (1) Checkings Account(s); (2) Savings Account(s); (3) Investment Trust; (4) Shares. Demographic information is also available, i.e. age of the head of the household, level of education received by the head of the household and family income. Moreover, respondents were asked to answer questions concerning psychological factors, which are considered relevant for their saving behavior.

The result of the first analyses showed that households acquire these four financial products in a highly homogeneous order. It was found that most consumers first acquire a checkings account, then usually a savings account, consecutively the majority of consumers acquire an investment trust and last of all shares. This order is further referred to as the acquisition pattern (see Paas (1998) for details on the procedures) (Figure 2).

The second analyses (the OVERALS procedure in the SPSS) showed that the position a consumer takes in the acquisition pattern relates to the position s/he takes in the saving need hierarchy (discussed in the first paper). This relationship between the acquisition pattern and the saving need hierarchy suggests that households are usually triggered by different motives when acquiring the “next” financial product(s). For example, households who own none of the products displayed in Figure 1 are probably seeking to satisfy a need for cash management. Subjects that make the financial decisions in such households are most likely inclined to acquire a checkings account. While wealth management motives are probably more relevant for acquisitions by households owning the first three products in the acquisition pattern.

Part B builds on Part A and reports the relevance of psychological variables for consumer saving behavior. Based on the relationship between acquisition pattern and the saving need hier-
The Original Marketing Paradox: “Product Needs” versus “Individualized Financial Solutions”

The Original Marketing Paradox: “Product Needs” versus “Individualized Financial Solutions”

The methodology captures and extends the sequential Logit decision model (Amemiya, 1975; Madalla, 1983). In essence, the sequential Logit decision model assumes a deterministic sequential hierarchy for the acquisition patterns of financial products. This deterministic assumption is, given the dynamics of the psychological variables, too strong and therefore the new approach allows probabilistic steps (skipping behavior) as well. The results clearly show that psychological factors are important and relevant for taking different steps in the acquisition patterns.

Literature

“Relationship Between Acquisition Pattern Position and Information Need”
Ton Kuijlen, Tilburg University, The Netherlands

In the second paper it was demonstrated that consumers often acquire financial products in the same orders. It was found that the
acquisition of products was influenced by psychological variables. The focus of the present paper is on the influence of these psychological variables on information gathering and decision-making. For example, the basic need for a financial buffer against unforeseen events may be satisfied through the acquisition of a savings account. Consumers need little information and advice when making decisions regarding financial products that apply to basic needs and take a relatively low level in the acquisition pattern. On the other hand, financial products that satisfy higher-order needs and take relatively high levels in the acquisition pattern rely on more complex decision making processes. Before the latter kind of decisions is made more information is gathered.

Two types of information sources or channels are distinguished. The first concerns direct channels (e.g., e-commerce, call-centers, flyers) and the second concerns personal channels (e.g., intermediaries or other financial experts). Direct channels provide easy and highly accessible, less time-consuming but general information while personal channels provide personalized, tailor-made but time-consuming information (Kuijlen, 1993). The idea here is that direct channels are consulted with the acquisition of basic financial products and personal channels are consulted when acquiring higher-order financial products. This proposition is empirically tested.

If we find empirical support for the proposition, just forwarded, then we try to elucidate the underlying consumer characteristics that may influence the choice between gathering information through a direct or personal channel. In other words, such analysis may provide insight on the type of information (e.g., general or personalized) needed by consumers at different stages on the acquisition pattern.

We used the same data set as in the second paper. For each level in the hierarchy of the acquisition pattern a Logit analyses was conducted. The categories of predictors were [1] economic (demographic) variables, and [2] psychological variables (see also paper 2). These predictor variables were used to explain the type of information channel (personal or direct) through which this specific products were acquired. The results show that both economic and psychological variables contribute to the understanding of which information channel is consulted.

**Literature**


The session concludes with discussing the relevance of the findings from paper 2 and 3 in the context of the proposed model in paper 1. This conclusion is in terms of economic psychology theory and in terms of applied marketing research. In brief, for economic psychology our research provides insight into decision-making processes concerning acquisitions of financial products. Further, it also contributes to our understanding of information gathering that are relevant for making such (simple and complex) decisions. Managerial implications for applied marketing discusses [1] which consumers are prospects for specific financial product in the acquisition pattern, and [2] for which consumers direct channels or personal channels are effective means to distribute financial products.
Disciplinary Power and Consumer Research: An Introduction
David Marsden, Napier University Business School, United Kingdom

ABSTRACT
This paper draws on Michel Foucault’s conception of “disciplinary power” to explore some of the ways in which consumer research is implicated in modern forms of social control. According to Foucault, power in western societies is characterised less by the exercise of physical force and violence than by discipline and training. It operates by subjecting individuals and whole populations to normative regulation through mass surveillance, social categorisation and corrective treatment. The origins of these disciplinary techniques, Foucault argues, lie in the human(agement) sciences such as consumer research. The aim of this paper, therefore, is to explore those disciplinary techniques invested in this discipline (marketing research, segmentation and communications) for governing consumer behaviour.

INTRODUCTION
‘It seems to me that the real political task in society such as ours is to criticize the working of institutions which appear to be both neutral and independent; to criticize them in such a manner that the political violence which has always exercised itself obscurely through them will be unmasked, so that one can fight them’ (Foucault, 1984, p. 6)

Consumer research has traditionally described itself as a neutral and independent institution. It has invested heavily in the idea of itself as a rational, value-free scientific discipline that simply reflects the objective facts of consumer behaviour. Indeed, consumer research is celebrated as a liberating project in which the knowledge it generates about consumer behaviour is used to benefit peoples lives. In contrast, a small number of critical perspectives have recently emerged in the field that have radically called into question this traditional self-image, most notably Marxism and postmodernism. For example, Marxism (and its derivatives) maintains that consumer research reproduces relations of capitalist exploitation and oppression by subjecting people to the ideological domination of the market (e.g., Alvesson and Willmott, 1992; Hetrick and Lozada, 1994). Postmodernism also deconstructs the scientific truth claims of consumer research, although it rejects the manipulation thesis of Marxism in favour of a much more liberatory view of consumption (e.g., Firat and Venkatesh, 1995). A general weakness of this emerging critical body of work, however, is that it tends to adhere to a dualistic “repressive/emancipation” understanding of power.

On the one hand, Marxism’s emphasis on the repressive, manipulative and exploitative forces of consumer research fails to recognise the way in which power can be productive in the sense that individuals actively co-operate and connive in their subjection to it (Thompson and Hirschman, 1995). On the other, postmodernism’s romanticism of the liberating potential of consumption as a means of individual empowerment and expression masks the high levels of policing that governs consumer behaviour, not least by consumer researchers themselves (Gabriel and Lang, 1995). In an attempt to transcend this dualistic mind-set this paper draws on Michel Foucault’s alternative conception of power set out in Discipline and Punish (1977). Here, Foucault argues that modern western societies can be understood in terms of the shift in the mode, or operation, of power over the last two hundred years or so. Among the modes of power that have become salient today, Foucault argues, attempts to control the behaviour of people through the mechanisms of discipline and training are far more typical and routine than an older form of sovereign power based on violent and coercive methods of domination and repression. As Hindess (1996, p. 113) explains:

‘[Disciplinary power] is exercised over one or more individuals in order to provide them with particular skills and attributes, to develop their capacity for self-control, to promote their ability to act in concert, to render them amenable to instruction, or to mould their characters in other ways’

As we shall see, disciplinary power operates by subjecting the psychological strivings and motivations of people to “normative regulation” through mass surveillance, social categorisation and corrective treatment. Foucault maintains that the origins of these control mechanisms can be found in the human(agement) sciences, such as consumer research, that are concerned with mental measurement and social administration, what Rose (1990) refers to as the “psychological complex.” However, Foucault’s ideas have yet to be fully explored by critical consumer researchers which is surprising considering the growing body of literature outside the field that explores the interrelationships between disciplinary power and consumption. Although Foucault’s work is frequently cited by postmodern marketers, his concept of disciplinary power has been largely ignored. The aim of this paper, therefore, is to introduce this theoretical body of work and illustrate some of the ways in which the techniques of consumer research are implicated in it.

DISCIPLINARY POWER & CONSUMER RESEARCH
According to Foucault disciplinary power characterises the way in which the relations of inequality and oppression in modern western societies are (re)produced through the psychological complex. Summarised in Figure 1 below, it can be contrasted with an older form of sovereign power in terms of its aims, site, target and mode of operation.

Aims of Power
Disciplinary power both shaped and was shaped by the problems and opportunities brought into being by the industrial revolution, particularly with regard to the management and planning of the enormous output of goods and services (McNay, 1994; Rabinow, 1984). As the forces of economic production expanded governments and organisations had to manufacture mass markets in order to consume their mass-produced goods (Miller and Rose, 1990). In contrast to sovereign power that was aimed at the domination and submission of the populace, therefore, disciplinary power centred on the expansion and regulation of the productive capacity of labour power both inside the factory and outside in the market place (Barker, 1998). And it was this need to acquire and produce knowledge about market behaviour and how to regulate consumption that saw the rise of the human(agement) sciences (the social and management sciences) in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries (Wickham, 1997). As Engel et al. (1995, p. 30) point out, over the last fifty years: ‘The central concern of businesses, consumer economists, and others was to find more effective strategies to influence and shape [market] behaviour’. And it was from these specific historical conditions - the change from an
agricultural to industrial economy, the professionalisation of the social sciences and cultural industries - that enabled a distinctive type of person to rise to prominence: the “self-as-consumer” (Aldridge, 1994; Falk, 1994; Turner, 1996). This is the person we feel today to be inhabited by motivations and values, possessed by certain traits and personality characteristics seeking to maximise the worth of their existence through personalised acts of consumption (Du Gay and Salaman, 1992). As Knights and Morgan (1993, p. 225) explain, one of the disciplinary effects of marketing knowledge and the discourse of the self-as-consumer has been to naturalise the link between consumption and self-identity:

‘In modern western societies it is through consumption that individuals are continuously transformed into subjects who secure meaning, personal significance and a sense of identity through a socially mediated relation, with the object or symbol consumed’

By stimulating the self-as-consumer individuals and whole populations could be tied to the needs of the market, simultaneously enabling governments and organisations to address them in a very personal way. Specific questions about their consumption behaviours could now be transformed through the methods and techniques of consumer marketing into technical questions resolvable by calculation and administration. If consumer behaviour was to be predictable, therefore, it is in part because it would be made predictable through disciplining and training people in the consumption habits that correspond to what should happen in the market place, making people calculating and therefore calculable (Allen, 1998). As Brownlie et al. (1998, p. 8) observe: ‘The marketing gaze constructs consumers as objects, as rational, sovereign, self-actualising actors whose identity is reduced to the ownership of commodities and all social relations are conceived in market terms’. And as we shall see below, this is arguably one of the distinctive features of modern consumer research - its capacity to produce dispositions and consuming energies in people, to transform them into self-disciplined subjects equipped with the necessary skills and behaviours to fully participate in the market, a central site of disciplinary power.

Site & Nature of Power

Up to the eighteenth century sovereign power was centrally located in the state which, like a pyramid, flowed from the top-down into the bottom of society. It was a power visibly embodied in an individual, group or institution (the monarch, military, judiciary, church and so on) and was something that could be seized, possessed and accumulated much like a substance or commodity. In contrast, Foucault argues that modern forms of disciplinary power are neither centralised in the state apparatus nor work solely through an imposition from above. Rather, he was concerned to examine how power relations are (re)produced through a network of institutions, agencies and authorities dispersed across a spectrum of sites in society. As Foucault (1977, p. 93) maintains: ‘Power is not an institution, and not a structure; neither is it a certain strength we are endowed with; it is the name that one attributes to a complex strategical situation in a particular society’. In other words, disciplinary power is not an attribute or “thing” belonging to an individual, group or state institution. Rather, it characterises the relation amongst them: relations to oneself, relations to others, relations to authority and modes of thought which count as “truth”. Likewise, disciplinary power does not flow from one direction, the top-down, but circulates around the bottom of society ‘weaving itself into our slightest gestures and most intimate utterances…personal relations and routine activities’ (Eagleton, 1991, p. 7). And it is in this sense that Foucault argues disciplinary power is embodied in everyday “discourses” that permeate all levels of social existence - those ways of thinking and speaking (clusters of ideas, images, forms of knowledge, conduct, practices) that define and construct how we see the world and ourselves in it, whether it be the self-as-sinner in sovereign times or the self-as-consumer today. Again, this change in the dominant discourse of the self has its origins in the industrial revolution when authority passed from the social institutions of religion, magic and monarchy into the present-day bearers of “truth” - human(agement) scientists (Lien, 1997; Rose, 1990). Located at a distance from the formal organs of the state, the power invested in economists, psychologists, educationalists and, of course, consumer researchers is essentially hidden and obscured from public view. With the stamp of “science” to legitimate their knowledge claims and practices disciplinary power is essentially productive in that people freely subject themselves to them. And it is the ways in which the ostensibly beneficient and scientific forms of knowledge such as consumer research actually oppress, rather than benefit, peoples lives that we now turn.

Target & Style of Punishment

Whereas the target of sovereign power was the physical “body” and the style of punishment its destruction and repression, Foucault argues that the target of disciplinary power is the “soul” and its productive capacities (Rose, 1990). By the soul, Foucault means what has variously been called the human psyche, consciousness, subjectivity and personality that disciplinary power not only mobilises but also controls through normative regulation - defined as the set of standards, values and performance criteria that individuals must reach and maintain in performing certain tasks (Ransom, 1997). In terms of consumption, normative criteria are set into play by surrounding and enmeshing people within a network of scientific forms of marketing knowledge and consumer

---

### FIGURE 1

Sovereign & Disciplinary Power

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aims</th>
<th>Site &amp; Nature of Power</th>
<th>Target &amp; Style of Punishment</th>
<th>Methods &amp; Techniques of Operation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sovereign Power</td>
<td>Domination &amp; submission</td>
<td>Centralised &amp; possessed (state, class, army): flows top-down</td>
<td>Physical body: destruction &amp; repression</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disciplinary Power</td>
<td>Economic &amp; political regulation</td>
<td>Decentralised &amp; relational (psychologists, educationalists): flows bottom-up</td>
<td>The soul: normative regulation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

European Advances in Consumer Research (Volume 5) / 55
discourses that communicate social expectations about their market behaviour (Willmott, 1998). As Foucault (1997, p. 223) explains, disciplinary power encourages people to compare, evaluate and correct themselves against various “objective” standards or norms: ‘The disciplines characterise, classify, specialise, they distribute along scales around a norm, hierarchise individuals in relation to one another and, if necessary, disqualify and invalidate’. In this sense, disciplinary power is productive rather than repressive in that it is not mobilised or experienced by individuals in directly coercive ways. Indeed, repression is evidence of a lack of power, it is used when the limits of power have been reached. Slavery, for example, is a very unproductive form of labour - such domination only destroys its target along with its capacities to act. In contrast, the most effective and efficient form of power is that which displays itself most and hides itself best as Hoskin and Macve (1986, p. 106) maintain, ‘the most pervasive power is that which makes its subjects co-operate and connive in their subjection to it’. Unlike the physical constraints of sovereign power, therefore, Foucault (1977, p. 93) argues that there is no limit to the ways in which a person’s soul can be isolated in a grid of types and made the object of normalising judgement:

We must cease once and for all to describe the effects of power in negative terms: it ‘excludes’, it ‘represses’, it ‘censors’, it ‘abstracts’, it ‘masks’, it ‘conceals.’ In fact, power produces, it produces reality, it produces domains of objects and rituals of truth. The individual and the knowledge that may be gained of him belong to this production

In short, disciplinary power does not operate by making people do what others want them to do, but to make them want to do it for themselves and to do it as others want them to with the desired tools, efficiency and order (Allen, 1998). It does not work by telling people what to think, but by giving them things to think about - it orders the field of possibilities within which people have to choose and act by providing them with advice, moral support and certain knowledge or skills. And fundamental to the understanding of how normative regulation actually operates are those methods and techniques of discipline and training, the stock in trade of the human(agement) sciences such as consumer research.

Methods & Techniques of Power

Normative regulation operates through three interrelated mechanisms: mass surveillance, social categorisation and corrective treatment. As noted earlier, before the soul can be regulated to meet certain economic/political needs it first has to be made visible as a distinct object or dimension of reality. Likewise, to meet the consumption needs of production under capitalism it is first necessary to define and conceptualise the self-as-consumer; to represent its processes, functions, causes and effects in ways that render it amenable to detailed examination and intervention. One of the main examination techniques of disciplinary power is that of “mass surveillance” which is a form of power internalised by those who are watched, who come to watch and govern their own behaviour according to the prevailing standards of normality. As we shall see in a moment, numerous surveillance mechanisms have been developed by consumer researchers to encourage people to observe their consumption behaviour, to get them to ask questions about themselves and to adjust their behaviour accordingly (Thompson and Hirschman, 1995). As Foucault (1977, pp. 29-30) makes clear, the power of surveillance is that it encourages people to regulate themselves through a constant introspective self-evaluation and examination:

In discipline, it is the subjects who have to be seen. Their visibility assures the hold of power that is exercised over them. It is the fact of constantly being seen, of being able always to be seen, that maintains the disciplined individual in his subjection

The process of surveillance generates an immense amount of information that can be used by consumer researchers to form “categorisation systems” that divide individuals into domains of value and utility, another disciplinary technique (McNay, 1994). Social categorisation, the heart of market segmentation, makes possible the ‘description of groups, the characterisation of collective facts, the calculation of the gaps between individuals, their distribution in a given population’ (Foucault, 1977, p. 190). And it is the creation of social categories that legitimize numerous “treatment programmes” for those who fall within their boundaries, i.e., guidelines, commentaries, recommendations, plans, recipes and exercises designed to continually remind people to assess, observe and correct their attitudes and behaviour in relation to the “norms” of each category. And as we shall also see, this is central to the functioning of marketing communications which encourage people to evaluate and change themselves through the consumption of goods and services.

CONSUMER RESEARCH & DISCIPLINARY POWER

We have seen that from a Foucauldian perspective the aim of consumer research is to harness, optimise and regulate the eco-
onomic consumption of individuals and whole populations in relation to the needs of the market. Summarised in Figure 2 below, to meet these needs consumer researchers have developed numerous disciplinary methods and techniques for observing (market research), classifying (segmentation) and correcting (marketing communications) consumption behaviour.

**Market Research & Surveillance**

It was noted earlier that surveillance is central to the exercise of disciplinary power in that it enables numerous aspects of peoples lives to be observed, documented and recorded (Hillyard and Percy-Smith, 1988). By its very nature, surveillance involves disclosure by rendering the behaviour of individuals more thoroughly knowable or known by others. As such, it circumscribes and constrains personal freedom through the inability of individuals to remain unidentified in society, leading them to act as if they were being watched at all times, forcing them to govern their behaviour continuously (Reynolds and Alferoff, 1999). Today, surveillance is ever more anonymous, automatic and entrenched in what Poster (1984, p. 163) calls the “information mode” of modern western societies:

‘Surveillance is accomplished by setting in place a flow of information from the object under scrutiny to the authorities and to the collection of that information in files and memory banks. The existence of this network of information and the awareness of it by the scrutinised population constitutes a technology of power’

And when we look at consumer research there is undoubtedly an increasingly complex interaction going on between the use of information and communication technologies, electronic consumption tracking devices and mass surveillance techniques. For example, new information technologies have enabled consumer researchers to construct sophisticated electronic systems for monitoring consumer behaviour (Allen, 1998). An immense amount of information can now be yielded from just a few traces of a person’s consumption behaviour - credit cards, loyalty cards, responses to special offers, competitions and prize draws, loan applications, income transactions, library records, entry codes, ID numbers, credit ratings, and so forth. As Laurent and Pras (1998, pp. 251-52) note: ‘There are scanner data for frequently purchased goods...but also on banking behaviour, on insurance, on telephone usage, on medical expenses, on going the opera, on travelling behaviour, etc’. A vast array of interview techniques, questionnaires, motivational analyses, psychological experiments and personality tests have also been developed for extracting and quantifying peoples consumption beliefs, attitudes, habits and behaviours so that they can be grasped in thought and acted upon in reality by commercial organisations (Du Gay, 1997; Miller and Rose, 1988). In this sense market research does not simply reflect the objective facts of consumer behaviour but rather ‘constitutes, conditions, affects, alters, influences, implicates, distorts and re-directs the very thing it purports to represent - and vice versa’ (Brown, 1995, p. 302). In other words, knowledge about consumer behaviour is something that is demanded by the very activities of market research which **themselves** promote the idea that consumer behaviour is ‘out there’ to be had and measured (Osborne and Rose, 1999).

Another way in which consumer researchers observe and build up information on consumers is from the use of video technology and the design of buildings. The video camera, which was used initially in maximum-security prisons and other enclosed security situations, has become a generalised disciplinary technology found in most sites of consumption today (Ransom, 1997). For example, the shopping mall with its security cameras may only incidentally be a place for shopping, but instead serve as a highly productive surveillance machine that enables areas to be over looked and monitored (Ainley, 1998). Similarly, supermarkets use video cameras not just for security purposes alone, but to also follow shoppers’ progress through the stores so they can observe what routes people take. This information enables shops to rearrange their stores so that people buy more, through the control of lighting, smells and colours, the design of shelf space, the strategic positioning of mirrors, the choice of background music, different sized floor tiles, the placement of interrelated goods close to one another and the location of “indulgences” (e.g., alcohol, soft drinks, cakes) on the furthest aisles from the entrance (Crace, 1996; Drummond, 1994). And according to Longhurst (1998) the use of space, time and layout in shopping centres are purposely designed to continually remind women of their roles as objects of feminine beauty and subjects of consumption. The clothes that are sold, the advertising images on shop windows, the body shapes of the display manikins, the age, appearance and scripted attitude of shop assistants all reinforce the notions of beauty as slim, youthful, sexy, and so on. In all the above cases we can see that surveillance is built into the very physical structures of consumption sites, organised to enhance visibility within them.

**Market Segmentation & Social Categorisation**

Since the 1960s consumer researchers have generated literally hundreds of consumer types and categories through the mar- rying of sophisticated computer, information and communication technologies (Hearn and Roseneil, 1999). The development of market segmentation technologies have enabled researchers to aggregate, plot and profile groups of consumers by merging and overlaying demographic and lifestyle data from a number of government and commercial sources as Middleton (1994, p. 215) observes: ‘The growing ability to research, store, retrieve and analyse data on hundreds of thousands of individuals...have revolutionised the ability of producers to obtain a detailed knowledge of consumer segments’. Once again, the disciplinary impulse of normative regulation is at work here because as McKinley and Starkey (1998, p. 8) make clear: ‘The use of electronic trading devises to track streams of purchases by narrowly defined consumer segments deepens the intimacy of corporate knowledge of consumption’. Thus, the methods and techniques of market segmentation have facilitated the process by which organisations endow goods and individuals with an interrelated set of properties and discourses that motivate or trigger a consumption relation between them (Dale, 1997). For example, people defined as “belongers” are said to prefer fads, “emulators” popular fashion, and “subdued” people porridge and margarine (Engel et al. 1995; Heylen et al. 1995 respectively). Moreover, these labels are not socially neutral but carry a powerful evaluative component (Lury and Warde, 1997). In terms of Heylen et al.’s (1995) typology of consumer behaviour, for instance, most people, given the choice, would clearly prefer to be labelled “energetic” and “assertive” rather than “introverted” and “subdued”. Other pejorative labels consumer researchers have attached to people to regulate their market conduct include laggards versus innovators, emotional versus rational decision makers, old versus young consumers and emulators versus achievers (taken from Engel et al. 1995). Again, all of the latter mentioned labels are highly honorific in our culture. The disciplinary power of market segmentation technologies, then, is that they provide consumer researchers with detailed information to label people and develop special “micro-marketing” practices to
police their boundaries, what Foucault would term corrective treatment programmes.

**Marketing Communications & Corrective Treatment**

Marketing communications are key sites for the exercise of disciplinary power in modern western societies, where the self-as-consumer is formed around regimes of normative consumption (Eagleton, 1991). Advertisements, for example, embrace and amplify the notion of the self-as-consumer by offering people sets of (self)concepts, expressions, terms and statements to frame their view of reality and place in it - how to eat, dress, conduct oneself in the marketplace, and so on. Advertisements surround people in a network of ideas, activities and behavioural expectations, continually reminding people who they are, who they could be or can become through the marketplace (Wickham, 1997). As Rose (1996, p. 146) explains: ‘New modes, techniques and images of self-formation and self-problematisation are disseminated, spatialised in new ways according to market segments and lifestyle choices’. Furthermore, advertisements thrive on normalising judgement, continuously comparing the good and the bad (Turner, 1996). Although they are sometimes entertaining, at a more subtle level advertisements promote and reinforce various racial, ethnic, and gender stereotypes as Alvesson and Willmott (1992, p. 12) maintain: ‘Instead of reflecting peoples diverse needs and wants, marketing produces (people as) consumers as it divides them into market segments, thus producing social stereotypical categories (such as gender and youth)’. The portrayal of such normalised images in marketing communications media act as a standard against which individuals measure, judge, discipline and correct their consumption behaviour through the techniques of self-examination and self-surveillance. In terms of the representation of gender, for instance, Bordo (1993, p. 197) argues that marketing communications celebrate standardised discourses of youth, health, choice and self-empowerment: ‘Such normalisation is continuously mystified and effaced in our culture by the rhetoric of choice and self-determination which plays such a key role in commercial representations of diet, exercise, hair and eye colouring and so forth’.

Furthermore, dietary constraints are frequently placed on young women to eat non-fattening foods in order to appear slim as representations of diet, exercise, hair and eye colouring and so on. Advertisements surround people in a network of ideas, activities and behavioural expectations, continually reminding people who they are, who they could be or can become through the marketplace. This is because disciplinary power is not deterministic in that it represents a totally enclosed system of control; on the contrary, because people are the very agents of its exercise it always presupposes some degree of freedom on their part to adopt, reject or reverse its effects. And it is this freedom that means just as power is an inescapable feature of all human behaviour, including consumer behaviour, so too are resistance and evasion. As we have seen, however, for Foucault there is no centralised target of power that is fixed and stable. There is nothing to take hold of or to use as an instrument against it and neither does power just come from having access to the formal organs of the state. So, Foucault does not advocate universal strategies of opposition or totalising schemes of resistance (McNay, 1994). Instead, his concern is with concrete, everyday struggles of resistance at the micro-level of society where power has definite socio-historical conditions of existence and where its effects are most intensely experienced – in the modes of thought and forms of ‘discourse’ which frame the relations we have with ourselves, others and authority.

Given that there are always a number of discourses surrounding an event, such as self-as-consumer, each offering an alternative view of it, it follows that the dominant or prevailing discourses are continually subject to contestation and resistance. They are always under implicit threat from counter discourses which can dislodge them from their position of truth. Indeed, there would be no need to continually reaffirm and assert the truthfulness of the prevailing discourses if it were not for resistance (Barker, 1998; Hindess, 1996). Whilst discourse transmits and produces power, therefore, it also exposes and undermines it. This is what Foucault calls oppositional or ‘reverse’ discourses which can block the circulation and transform the intended effects of disciplinary power (Ransom, 1997; Rose, 1990). For example, scientific categorisation provides groups of individuals with a coherent identity from which resistant ‘counter-identities’ may be formulated. Thus, the discourse of the self-as-consumer originally deployed by organisations to regulate market behaviour is increasingly being re-deployed by individuals to counter the very practices of organisations themselves. It has begun to speak on behalf of itself, to demand that its legitimacy and “sovereignty” be acknowledged in the marketplace. This has produced alternative conceptions of the self-as-consumer including the rebel, activist, green and ethical consumer among others (see Gabriel and Lang, 1995). By breaking down the idea that the self-as-consumer is somehow a fixed and ahistorical category, therefore, Foucault’s work opens up a space for developing other ways of thinking about ourselves as consumers, and consumer researchers, making available alternative discourses from which we may fashion new identities and social relations.

Reverse strategies of resistance also facilitate bringing to the fore previously marginalised voices whose accounts of life cannot be heard within the scientific categories of mainstream consumer research. That is, those groups disempowered on the grounds of class, race, ethnicity, gender, and so on, Analyses of these marginalised voices are important sources of resistance for us all, Foucault says, because they not only challenge the legitimacy of the scientific categories that exclude these voices but also those categories through which the rest of us understand ourselves. For example, women’s rejection of their object status within the dominant discourses of advertising have also encouraged other oppressed groups, particularly ethnic and gay minorities, to construct oppositional strategies and progressive visions for change (van Zoonen, 1994). Indeed, the coming together of different single issue groups around the environment, corporate power and third world debt is a characteristic feature of the growth of the anti-capitalist movement post-Seattle. However, whilst Foucault recognises the creative potential or agency of people to resist the

**DISCUSSION**

Whilst consumer research has undoubtedly advanced social control in everyday sites of consumption, it has simultaneously opened up a space for numerous tactics and strategies of resistance.
effects of disciplinary power this is never abstracted from an understanding of ‘the constraints of culture, ties of history, and the material reality of the body’ (Thompson and Hirschman 1995, p. 151). The aim of future studies, therefore, is to build detailed accounts of the modes of governance and resistance around specific sites of consumption. In practice, this means that analyses must proceed within a concrete rather than abstract methodological framework. At the macro-level of analysis, detailed socio-historio-graphic case studies are required that identify the objective social structures and historical processes that have shaped particular sites of consumption and their disciplinary regimes of control. And at the micro-level, in-depth interpretive studies that account for individual subjective experiences and resistance practices across different consumption sites are also required. It is argued that such detailed case studies based on localised sites of consumption could open up a space among critical consumer researchers for discussing the complex ways in which consumer research is both a positive and negative social force. However, it has only been possible in this paper to abstract a limited set of Foucault’s ideas which are not without their own problems. Nowhere is Foucault as bleak in his vision of modernity as in Discipline and Punish. Furthermore, his analysis of disciplinary power is based on older institutions such as prisons, army camps and hospitals. An understanding of the way disciplinary power operates in modern institutions, such as museums, world’s fairs and department stores, would be a more appropriate framework within which to develop a critical understanding of consumer research.

REFERENCES


Barker, Philip (1998), Michel Foucault: An Introduction, Edinburgh, University Press.


Foucault, Michel (1977), Discipline and Punish, Allen Lane.


FCUK Consumer Research:
On Disgust, Revulsion and Other Forms of Offensive Advertising
Stephen Brown, University of Ulster, United Kingdom
Hope Schau, Temple University, U.S.A.

ABHORRENT ABSTRACT
Warhol was wrong. Far from being famous for fifteen minutes, advertisers are currently enjoying their fifteen minutes of infamy. Inspired by the provocative escapades of Benetton, Calvin Klein and French Connection amongst many others, contemporary advertising campaigns seem determined to affront and offend the consuming public. This paper offers a typology of offensive advertising; attempts to account for the rise of provocative promotions; and contends that the growth of gross-out should be celebrated rather than condemned.

OFFENSIVE OPENING
‘Fuck, fuck, fuck, fuck, fuck, fuck, fuckety-fuck’. As every movie-buff knows, the foregoing orgy of expletives is the first line of the smash-hit, feel-good, happy-clappy family film, Four Weddings and a Funeral. The line, admittedly, is not in the same league as ‘Here’s looking at you, kid’, ‘Tomorrow is another day’, ‘Hasta la vista, baby’ or, indeed, ‘To infinity and beyond’. But few would deny that it is remarkably resonant, well nigh unforgettable. More remarkable still is the fact that forty years after Lady Chatterley’s Lover was banned for its use of the F-word, it now takes eight fucks to do the work of one and, even then, the word itself has almost ceased to offend. As Sheidlower (1995, p. ix) archly observes in his cultural history of swearing, ‘the F-word is increasingly heard in the best-regulated living rooms’.

If fuck and its cognates are now considered innocuous, bordering on refined, the same cannot be said of FCUK. An acronym for French Connection United Kingdom, a fashion-forward clothing retailer, it was coined in 1997 by ace advertising copywriter, Trevor Beattie (Hellen and Prescott 2000). The ensuing campaign, consisting largely of billboards emblazoned with ‘fuck me’, ‘fuck fashion’ and analogous semi-offensive bylines, not only stopped traffic and stimulated a flood of complaints, but it was formally censured by the Advertising Standards Authority, the industry’s official UK watchdog (Sherwin 1999). More to the point perhaps, it helped double the company’s pre-tax profits; it propelled French Connection’s fashion-forward clothing to depict a satisfied customer vomiting into a trashcan. In glorious technicolour.

The purpose of the present paper, then, is to examine the recent rise of revolting advertising and to account for its prevalence. It commences with an attempted typology of offensive adverts; continues with a consideration of possible causal factors, both micro- and macro-; and concludes with a brief discussion of the major research issues arising. This paper, it must be stressed, does not claim to the last word on offensiveness, nor even the first word. But it does come with a ‘Parental Advisory, Explicit Lyrics’ sticker. Be warned.

CLASSIFYING CRAPULENCE
Although the FCUK campaign offended a nation in 1997, it has long since been eclipsed by the shock troops of advertising. In the holy city of Jerusalem, for example, an advertising campaign for Chacko, a chain of fast food restaurants, boasts the all but blasphemous byline, ‘Who the fuck is Chacko?’. Diesel apparel, meanwhile, features four young, rosary-reciting nuns wearing blue jeans made of ‘pure virginal 100 per cent cotton’. Diesel apparel, meanwhile, features four young, rosary-reciting nuns wearing blue jeans made of ‘pure virginal 100 per cent cotton’. Diesel apparel, meanwhile, features four young, rosary-reciting nuns wearing blue jeans made of ‘pure virginal 100 per cent cotton’. Diesel apparel, meanwhile, features four young, rosary-reciting nuns wearing blue jeans made of ‘pure virginal 100 per cent cotton’.

The British Safety Commission, for example, promotes safe sex with a sticker.  Be warned.

As fast moving consumables go, however, Carlsberg is a veritable angel of virtue. Budweiser gathers clan couch potato, complete with lolling tongues, rolling eyes and traditional pre-game salutation, Wassup. An Australian manufacturer of laxative chocolate claims to be ‘The Thunder from Down Under’. Arizona’s anti-smoking campaign shows a teenage girl supping from her boyfriend’s soda container in a darkened movie theatre, only to discover that it is full of cigarette spittle and bronchial mucus. A TV ad for AM-PM convenience stores stresses the sheer revoltingness of its 59-cent hot dogs, as does the ‘messy burger’ campaign for Carl’s Jr., a Californian fast food chain, which rejoices in the slogan, ‘if it doesn’t get all over the place, it doesn’t belong in your face’. Sony cellular, similarly, parades a cavalcade of three smartly dressed female executives, with disgustingly misapplied make up, nauseatingly untrimmed nasal hair and revoltingly ketchup-stained chin respectively. Not to be outdone, the Six Flags theme park feels that the best way to advertise its monster roller coaster is to depict a satisfied customer vomiting into a trashcan. In glorious technicolour.

Above and beyond bad language, blasphemy and bodily functions, advertising’s offensive (as creatives are presumably known nowadays) are not averse to sexism, lewdness and libidinal overkill (Chittenden and Saner 2000; Holgate 2000; Tompkins 2000). A Europe-wide campaign for Gossard lingerie announces, ‘Who said a woman can’t get pleasure from something soft?’, Tour operator Club 18-30 promises ‘Beaver España’, alongside photographs of bulging male crotches and the less than subtle strap-line, ‘Ladies, can we interest you in a package holiday?’. Levi’s re-launches its ‘twisted seam’ jeans with an appropriately warped campaign featuring disembodied denims frolicking, fondling and fornicating in public places. Bol.com, an online bookstore, follows suit with naked bibliophiles wrapped up in a hardcover, whilst...
wrapped around each other. Organics Shampoo shows a stunning redhead peering down the front of her bikini bottoms, in order to prove that it ‘keeps hair colour so long, you’ll forget your natural one’. Luxury confectioner Suchard advertises its mouth-watering chocolates with the aid of a naked woman, provocatively posed, and the worrisome words, ‘You say no; we hear yes’. The Nordica mobile phone company pictures an inflatable sex doll alongside the assertion that ‘your girlfriend will be open-mouthed’. And, who can forget Calvin Klein’s infamous ‘kiddie pornography’ campaign of 1995, which courted free publicity through questionable allusions to underage sex, only to incur the incandescent wrath of concerned parents worldwide? Benetton, of all companies, purported to be outraged by the tastelessness of CK’s ‘cheesy eight-millimetre porn film’.

Happy though advertisers are to wallow in the marketing mire, it is evident that several different offensive dimensions are being exploited (Barnes and Dotson 1990; Yezina and Olivia 1997). A typology of tastelessness is necessary and, purely for the purposes of explication, a 4Cs classification can be tentatively identified.

Carnal pertains to sexually explicit or exploitative campaigns, such as Renault’s claim that ‘size matters’; Pretty Polly’s ‘apparent paean to female masturbation, ‘Go on, treat yourself’; and shirt-maker Van Heuson’s contention that a man is not a man without fifteen and a half inches to play with.

Corporeal refers to bodily fluids, fecal matter and analogous unmentionable natural functions. These range from Marks & Spencer’s distasteful depictions of half-eaten left-overs, through Supernoodles’ suggestion that plates should be licked clean rather than washed, to the Red Bull drinker’s shit-for-shit response to an avian incontinence incident.

Creedal comprises offences against religious beliefs, broadly defined, or widely accepted societal norms. Benetton’s notorious nun-kissing-priest poster epitomises the former and their ‘condemned to die’ montage of death row incumbents is an interesting example of the latter (inasmuch as many Americans believe in capital punishment and are affronted by the company’s ill-considered support for convicted killers).

Cultural, finally, offends against the canons of aesthetic taste, as in a recent ‘Reassuringly Expensive’ campaign by Stella Artois. This portrays beer bottles being opened on top-of-the-range consumer durables – BMW Roadster, Sony Digital Betacam, Saladino glass table, Gibson semi-acoustic guitar – though the resultant scratches are not so much reassuringly expensive as deeply offensive. For some consumers, at least.

**REVOLTING REASONS**

While a classification of crapulence can help researchers comprehend the sheer scale of advertisers’ offensive ambitions, it does not explain why they choose to do so. Clearly, any attempted explanation cannot be incontrovertibly proven, not least because advertisers themselves may be incapable of articulating their revolting rationale. Nevertheless, it can be tentatively hypothesised that both micro-scale (industry specific) and macro-scale (broader environmental) factors are at work. With regard to the former, four main reasons for the rise of revulsion can be posited. The first of these is that offensiveness is effective. At a time when consumers are bombarded day and daily by countless commercial messages – most of them safe, sanitised and deadly serious – blasphemy, ribaldry and scatology stand out from the crowd in all their gory glory. In the words of new wave advertising gurus, Bond and Kirshenbaum (1998), outrageousness gets ‘under the radar’, the mental screen that today’s sated shoppers use to filter unwanted marketing communications. And, if proof be needed, one need only note that the in-your-face advertising of Carl’s Junior led to unprecedented increases in traffic and transactions, reversing the Anaheim based company’s five-year slide in sales (Stevens 1997). Likewise, Calvin Klein’s kiddie pornography prompted a six fold increase in jeans sales among the target market segment, who rebelliously revelled, as teenagers are wont to do, in their guardians’ moral outrage (Schroeder 2000). If it works, in other words, why not?

Second, offensiveness is efficient. Abominable ads not only stand out from the complaint commercial crowd but almost always stimulate a (horrified) second look, a (disgusted) double-take that sends ‘frequency’ figures skyrocketing, for starters (to say nothing of ‘gross rating points’). Granted, the second glance is often reluctant, the double-take virtually involuntary, but this merely confirms offensive advertising’s remarkable ability to stop ‘em in their tracks. Its impact, in effect, rests upon the admittedly paradoxical psychology of disgust, which comprises a strange combination of repulsion and attraction. William Miller, a leading academic authority on distasteful behaviour, contends that we are mesmerised by the mephitic, fascinated by the fetid, hopelessly drawn to the distasteful. We can’t bear to look, yet can’t bear not to look at, say, horror movies, auto accidents, fist fights or bodily waste, especially our own. ‘Even as the disgusting repels,’ he says, ‘it rarely does so without capturing our attention. It imposes itself upon us’ (Miller 1997, p. x).

A striking example of this repulsion-attraction quality is found in a Singaporean magazine advertisement for Spin washing powder, which portrays a pair of soiled underpants alongside an invitation to scratch ‘n’ sniff (Saunders 1996). One’s total revulsion at the very idea is immediately followed by a spontaneous sense of curiosity, a mental race through the moral and mechanical possibilities (‘Surely they haven’t gone that far, have they?’ ‘If they can reproduce eau-de-cologne, can they replicate the repugnant?’ ‘Dare I test it?’) No less magnetic in its repulsiveness is the much-cited ‘disembowelled shark’ shocker of Kadu, an Australian clothing manufacturer (Saunders 1996). The ad’s infamy is largely attributable to its timing, since it appeared at the same time as two fatal shark attacks – to a predictable torrent of mass media outrage – but its impact is almost entirely due to the arrestingly revolting imagery. A great white shark’s technicolour innards ooze across a wooden quayside. The masticated contents include a semi-digested human corpse and immaculately indigestible Kadu beachwear. Tough clothes, indeed!

Third, offensiveness is cheap (as well as nasty). As the Kadu controversy indicates, there’s nothing quite like provocative advertising to attract the attention of news-hungry media. Sensationalism, alas, sells newspapers, attracts audiences and provides endless opportunities for sanctimonious, space-filling op-eds. A product or service can thus be publicised for next to nothing. When salaciousness is on offer, so it seems, minuscule advertising budgets can stretch a very long way indeed. Take Benetton, perhaps the most infamous exponent of unexpurgated advertising (Carroll 2000; Falk 1997; Mantle 1999). The company grabbed headline after headline, generated afforded editorial after afforded editorial, and garnered sale after sale – at least initially – with its willfully offensive images of human immiseration, tastefully interspersed with collages of multi-coloured condoms, a rogues’ gallery of male genitalia, the stark naked posturing of Luciano Benetton and, lest we forget, scandalous shots of a shot soldier, a car bombing and a
dying AIDS victim. All on a Lilliputian advertising spend of £5.6 million. French Connection, similarly, offended all and sundry for less than £1.5 million, most of which was recouped through the sale of 150,000 ‘f**k me’ T-shirts, and Calvin’s kiddee campaign captured the front pages of both the Washington Post Style section and the Business section of the New York Times. Most advertisers would cut off their right arms for that kind of media exposure, though dismembrement might not be sufficiently newsworthy these degenerate days.

Fourth, like it or loathe it, offensiveness is easily emulated. A copy-cat element is clearly at work. Many corporations, so it seems, are content to follow Benetton’s feculent lead. When the singer’s the place to be, there’s no shortage of wannabe sewer-rats determined to out-plumb each others’ depths of degradation (Marconi 1997). Hence, sheets of extra-soft toilet tissue are attached to magazine ads for a Citroen sports car, which guarantees a ‘positively sphincter twitching 0-60 in 7.2 seconds’; a child relieves itself in the street to remind British dog-owners of their rectal responsibilities; a dead horse hangs from a hook, thereby promoting animal welfare; a single raised digit, the international sign language of obscenity, helps sell cheap cigars; a naked woman is tied to a chair with items of clothing from the ‘slightly twisted’ Full Circle range; the Vegetarian Society articulates its ‘much easier not to eat meat’ message with photographs of operation scars labelled ‘stomach cancer’, ‘throat cancer’, ‘bowel cancer’; a man is kicked viciously in the crotch for borrowing his girlfriend’s Nissan without permission; the naked model in a life-drawing class is smitten by an Impulse body-sprayed art student, only to be embarrased by his ensuing erection; a dead man’s body complete with engorged member advertises Sky Broadcasting’s movie channel (meanwhile the Playboy Channel promises ‘Morgasms’); an Italian ISP employs a bare-breasted Amazon to pose the provocative question, ‘why pay for it when you can get it for free?’; Ogilvy and Mather concocts completely phoney facts about the incidence of under sex – 61% of 12-year-olds are sexually active, no less – only to disingenuously claim that they represent ‘the statistics of the future’; and, in a textbook example of the not-so-so soft sell, a cinema ad for London’s Great Frog jewellery store ends with that celebrated commercial show-stopper, the fabled magic bullet of marketing communications: ‘If you don’t like it….fuck off.’

They make Jerry Della Farnina’s (1970) ‘from those wonderful folks who gave you Pearl Harbour’ seem like a model of marketing decorum.

Offensive as today’s advertising undoubtedly is, and much though it owes to the industry’s internal machinations, the growth of gross-out cannot be separated from macro-scale developments. Once again, four main explanatory factors can be identified, the first of which is societal. Simply put, this suggests that advertising reflects socially accepted, if not universally endorsed, norms and expectations. We live, after all, at a time of supposed national dumbing-down, when shock-jocks rule the airwaves, pornography pervades the Internet, television channels are choc-a-block with ‘documentaries’, and prominent talk-show hosts, such as Conan O’Brien, openly boast of gas-passing, sniffing and kindling competitions. Is it surprising, therefore, that today’s advertisers are bending with the wind, as it were? At a time, moreover, when Young British Artists like Damien dissected-sheep Hirst, Tracey dirty-bed Emin, Chris elephant-dung Ophilli and Ron dead-dad Mueck adopt a I-see-no-shit attitude, is it any wonder that English advertisers endeavour to outdo whatever YBAs throw at them? At a time, indeed, when cult cartoon series like South Park embrace Christmas poo, foetal millinery and chocolate salty balls, amongst others too mephitic to mention, and each summer unfaithfully excretes a top grossing gross-out movie – Dumb and Dumber (Vesuvius of diarrhoea erupts in Dolby stereo), There’s Something About Mary (extra-hold, bodily-fluid enhanced hair-gel), American Pie (making out with Granny Smith’s shortcut), Scary Movie (all of the above, with an increased sperm count) – is it fair to condemn today’s advertisers for grabbing a slice of the repellent action, for tapping this vein of venality, for trying to catch a fragrant whiff of celebrity pheromone?

Above and beyond developments in the socio-cultural sphere, there is an important demographic dimension to advertising’s headlong plunge into putrescence. Namely, the rise of Generation X (Miller 1995; Richie 1995; Tulgan 1997). Although baby boomers remain the driving force of western economies, in terms of sheer numbers, spending power and market orientation (that is, the principal focus of marketing activity), the cutting edge of consumer cool is firmly in the hands of post-boom cohorts. Generation Next now counts key opinion formers, political movers and shakers, television producers, network schedulers, movie stars, top musicians, literary luminaries, legal eagles, hi-rolling stockbrokers, leading fashion designers, computer programmers, cultural commentators, advertising creatives, marketing executives and, not least, new age management gurus amongst its number. Granted, the rise of a new demographic cadre is unprecedented in itself, but what makes Generation X relevant to our present concerns is its (oft commented upon) sophomoric sense of gross-out humour. This is the cohort, remember, that grew up in the permissive society, courtesy of make love not war, contraceptive pill-popping, Valley of the Dolls-reading baby boomers. They endured adolescence when Mel Brooks was breaking wind in Blazing Saddles, Divine was dining out on ordure in Pink Flamingos and President Nixon was deleting expletives amongst other less salubrious activities. What’s more, they reached full maturity when the ironic smirk of David Letterman was endearing rather than irritating, Bret Easton Ellis touched the nadir of rat-wrangling degeneracy in American Psycho and Jerry Seinfeld handled masturbation in a prime-time sit-com. Pornography is thus par for the course, obscenity seems normal, grossness is no big deal for today’s cadre of consumers. Leading Gen-X spokesperson, Geoffrey Holtz (1995, p. 199) goes so far as to suggest that his peers’ fondness for offensiveness is a reflection of, and commentary on, ‘the banality and vapid commercialism omnipresent in our culture’.

This could well be the case, though maybe there’s something more fundamental, more developmental, at work. According to Andrew Calcutt (1998), post war western society (as a whole, not just the individual demographic cohorts of Generations W, X, Y or whatever) is characterised by arrested development, by aspirations to adolescence. Whereas adulthood was once deemed an admirable state, a right and proper place of maturity, solidarity, seriousness and societal responsibilities, these days no-one wants to grow up, never mind grow old. We reside in a world of middle-aged teenage rebels, who were weaned during the post war boom – the television age – and whose world view was shaped, in its entirety, by the jeans wearing, rock ‘n’ rolling, Tolkien reading, drugs taking, anti-establishment ethos of pop culture. In this society of perpetual Peter Pans and Lost Boys, where even the establishment is anti-establishment and there is nothing left to rebel against (except rebelliousness), everyone aims to remain, in the words of middle-aged rocker Bryan Adams, ‘Eighteen Till I Die’. Slick Willy Clinton plays sax, amongst other teenage pursuits; Tony ‘Bambi’ Blair boasts of his long-haired, bell-bottomed, rock band past; forty-something CEOs rollerblade to the office with a copy of The Face tucked inside The Financial Times; and Homer Simpson, Springfield’s father of the year, is our adult role model of choice.
Almost inevitably, therefore, the culture of our times reflects this adolescent sensibility. Sex, smut, snot, flatulence, foul language, bodily functions, bad manners, new laddism, narcissism, superciliousness, scatology, secretions, sarcasm, cynicism, irony, ribaldry, offensiveness, truculence and an overwhelming desire to shock, subvert, revolt are par for our course. Or should that be coarse?

The fourth and final macro-level factor that might account for our ostensibly descent into degradation is the so-called fin de siècle effect (Jay and Neve 1999; Showalter 1991; Stern 1992). Just as the turn of the twentieth century was characterised by depravity, decadence, despondency, sexually transmitted diseases, economicum-technological dislocation and an extraordinary preoccupation with divination, necromancy and matters paranormal, so too the twenty-first century cusp seems obsessed with analogous concerns. Only nowadays UFOs have superseded ouija boards, AIDS occupies the syphilis slot, cyber barons are reconfigured robber barons, genetic defects have replaced ‘bad blood’ in the chamber of scientific horrors and child sex abuse is to today’s moral guardians what homosexuality was to Oscar Wilde’s contemporaries. Indeed, these parallels are so marked that some prominent theorists of postmodernity, principally the incomparable Jean Baudrillard, maintain that the western world is engaged in a massive process of rewinding, replaying, reviewing and re-presenting the long march of history in order to solve our collective concerns concerning the complete mess we made of the century just past. And, naturally, he employs arrestingly revolting imagery to illustrate his thesis:

When ice freezes, all the excrement rises to the surface. And so, when the dialectic was frozen, all the sacred excrement of the dialectic came to the surface. When the future is deep-frozen – and, indeed, even the present – we shall see all the excrement come up from the past. The problem them becomes one of waste. It is not just material substances, including nuclear ones, which pose a waste problem but also the defunct ideologies, bygone utopias, dead concepts and fossilized ideas which continue to pollute our mental space. Historical and intellectual refuse pose an even more serious problem than industrial waste. Who will rid us of the sedimentation of centuries of stupidity? As for history – that living lump of waste, that dying monster which, like the corpse in Ionesco, continues to swell after it has died – how are we to be rid of it?

(Baudrillard 1994, p.26)

How indeed?

DISCUSSING DISGUSTING

Regardless of the reasons for the rise of revolting advertising, this putrescent propensity raises a number of important research issues. Space does not permit a detailed discussion but, in light of the authors’ exploratory empirical investigations, four key considerations can be identified. The first of these is the enormous variation from sector to sector. While gross out advertising is well known ubiquitous among desperate-for-an-image dotcom companies, anything-to-attract-attention charities, and eat-my-soiled-shorts fashion-forwarders, it doesn’t follow that feculence is right for, say, financial services, fresh fruit or home furnishings, to name but three. Their time may well come of course and, as the above typology indicates, offensiveness itself comes in several different varieties. Revolting researchers, nonetheless, are required to examine the sector-specific penetration of purulent promotions and consider what, if anything, is acceptable in one domain but not in another. Barnes and Dotson (1990), is what more, usefully distinguish between offensive products (condoms, sanitary protection etc.) and offensive treatments (sexist, blasphemous et al.), which suggests that the most offensive advertisements of all are those that combine unmentionable products and unsavoury executions. Additional empirical research is called for.

A second scholarly consideration pertains to the consumption of crumpulence. By its very nature, provocative advertising isn’t designed to appeal to everyone. Quite the opposite, in point of fact. Nor, for that matter, does it necessarily affront or appall all and sundry. On the contrary, the splatter treatment seems to be particularly attractive to nerds and nose-pickers of all ages, whereas many women are deeply upset by the ostensibly offensive, especially when it involves egregious exploitation (as exemplified by the recent anti-advertising protests in France (Henley 2000) and the establishment of Guard Bitches, an organisation dedicated to stamping out sexism in public life). Younger consumers, according to Vezina and Paul (1997), are also more favourably disposed towards off-colour adverts, though once again this is likely to vary from country to country, between contrasting social classes and depending upon the particular category of offensiveness – carnal, corporeal, creedal or cultural – that is being pressed into service.

If the first two research issues are essentially spatial, insofar as they refer to the variations that are identifiable across the obnoxiouscape, the final two are predominantly temporal. One of the most striking aspects of odious advertising campaigns is the speed with which they cease to offend. The trajectory from horrific to honorific, from sensationalist to sensational, from preposterous to prepossessing, seems extraordinarily rapid. FCUK may have triggered howls of protest in 1997, but less than a year later it was included in a government sponsored, best-of-British exhibition at the Victoria & Albert Museum and a right wing political association, Conservative Futures UK, adapted the celebrated acronym, only to be sued by French Connection for pirating its proprietary profitability. The copywriter behind the campaign, furthermore, was subsequently appointed as the Labour Party’s official marketing maestro (‘fcuk politics’, perhaps?). Be that as it may, revolting advertising’s seemingly swift shift from rebel to reactionary is worthy of further investigation, as is the associated issue of excessive excess. How much is too much?

Although, with apologies to Warhol, the advertisers of the future will be infamous for fifteen minutes, our last research consideration looks back to the past. Far from being a recent development, the history of advertising and promotion reveals that the industry has long been in love with the loathsome, whether it be development, the history of advertising and promotion reveals that the industry has long been in love with the loathsome, whether it be
Everyone ‘knows’ that selling, marketing and advertising types are hucksters, shysters and outright cheats, whose claims to care for their customers are just another con, another three card marketing monte, another attempt to pull the wool over credulous consumers’ eyes. No matter how much marketing communicants may protest their innocence, the advertising industry is, and always will be, associated with provocation, offensiveness and outrage (Brown 2001). Gross, in sum, is good. Revolting advertising represents the return of the marketing repressed. And if you don’t believe us, you can…f**k off!

**REPUGNANT REFERENCES**


Consumer Research Implications of Marketing and ICT Developments
Theo Poiesz, Tilburg University, The Netherlands
Johan de Heer, Tilburg University, The Netherlands
W. Fred van Raaij, Tilburg University, The Netherlands

ABSTRACT
This paper addresses the question to what extent consumer behavior research may change as a result of market and marketing developments related to the ‘new economy’. First, three developments are discussed that may be assumed to affect the nature of consumer behavior. The first concerns the development from single transaction units (products or services) to integrated combinations of multiple products and services. This development implies that marketing may change its focus from the optimization of isolated products and services to the optimization of the fit between a product or service and the already available set of products and services. The second development concerns the growing emphasis on a longer time span of customer relationships. In some markets, even lifetime relationships become the focus of interest, which implies that particular suppliers and particular consumers may become (economic) partners for life. These two developments are facilitated and accelerated by a third development: the growth of the Internet, which eventually may result in the possibility, for supplier and consumer alike, of being on-line anywhere, anyplace, and anytime. A related development is the increasing sophistication of consumer search and decision support systems (‘intelligent agents’). Combined, these developments may have important consequences for consumer behavior and, hence, for the consumer behavior research agenda. This paper presents a provisional inventory of such possible implications in the form of research questions.¹

GENERAL INTRODUCTION
The emergence of the ‘new economy’ raises the question whether there may be a fundamental change in the nature of near-future consumer behavior. To what extent will market, marketing and ICT developments affect consumer need identification, information search, decision making, consumption and product/service evaluation? This question seems relevant from the perspective of both theory development and practical application. Because of the strong emphasis on empirical work in consumer behavior research, researchers’ attention is unlikely to be drawn to future issues, of which, by definition, no data are available. Yet, we want to argue that the consideration of possible future implications of market and marketing changes for consumer behavior (research) may be important. There seem to be three risks associated with an overemphasis on the present and recent past. These risks are particularly critical in a period characterized by an unprecedented high speed of change. The first risk is that not considering possible future consumer behavior issues is that, at present, research questions may be formulated that, given the market developments, may become less relevant or obsolete. The second risk is that new and promising research questions may be overlooked. And the third risk is that consumer behavior research may lag behind actual developments in markets and marketing, thus limiting its external validity and practical value. While, on the one hand, it may be argued that the old economy and traditional markets are here to stay for at least a while, there are, on the other hand, strong indications for an explosively growing impact of the new economy. It is estimated by practitioners that 15 per cent of the market transactions will be e-commerce by the year 2010. The implications of the new economy concerns consumer research. For example, Alba et al. (1997) examined the implications of interactive home shopping in electronic market places and raised some important research questions pertaining to consumer behavior. One question concerns how interactive home shopping interacts with developments in markets and marketing. This paper elaborates this issue. One of these developments is that the role of information has become more important relative to the product or brand itself (Berthon, Holbrook and Hulbert, 1999). These authors examined possible future trajectories of the new information economy as well. They argue that consumer purchase decisions will become more and more be based on the basis of informational representations and without direct exposure to the product itself. We want to argue here that the potentially intriguing implications of the new economy for consumer behavior research should be explored systematically and should not be ignored. Therefore, the goal of the present paper is to make an inventory of the most critical market and marketing developments and to assess, in the form of a discussion, the consequences for consumer research questions.

INTRODUCTION
Present developed markets in Western Europe, USA, Japan and Australia/New Zealand are largely saturated markets with sophisticated consumers. In these markets, it is vitally important to acquire and retain consumer franchise, i.e., a group of loyal and satisfied consumers. Due to technological and social developments the interactions and relationships between suppliers and consumers will change.

One of the most prominent changes involves the introduction and explosive growth of marketing initiatives on the Internet. Although the number of consumer transactions through the Internet is still small relative to the number of conventional purchases through stores and mail-order catalogs (The Economist, 2000), the Internet as a medium for consumer (pre) purchase information seeking and actual purchases is growing.

Considering the impact of this development and the potential for future change, it is important to explicitly assess the possibility that, in several ways, consumer behavior on the Internet may differ from ‘conventional’ consumer behavior, as shown in more traditional market settings (Alba et al., 1997; Haugtvedt, 2000). Therefore, we want to address the question to what extent consumer behavior on the Internet is different from conventional consumer behavior. We will take a dynamic perspective: an attempt is made to answer the question by explicitly considering possible future market and marketing developments. Before doing so it is interesting to observe that some other analyses of the implications of the Internet for consumer behavior and consumer behavior research are currently available (e.g., Sheth & Sisodia, 2001). However, the publications on Internet consumer behavior primarily viewed the Internet as a new medium, a new channel or a new research context for concepts that are already applied to conventional consumer behavior. Very little attention has been paid, so far, to the question

¹Regarding the three developments we take a rather positive perspective in this paper. The reader should note that space limitations did not allow us to take a more balanced approach.
to what extent consumer behavior itself may undergo substantial changes due to the Internet (Alba et al., 1997; Haugtvedt, 2000). We argue that, because the Internet is more than just a short-lived hype, consumer behavior research may risk lagging behind marketing developments and the marketing research in this area (see also Poiesz & Kuijlen, 1999).

Let us return to the question to what extent Internet consumer behavior differs from conventional consumer behavior and add the question what this means for future consumer behavior research. In our search for provisional answers we have to deal with three subquestions first:

- What are the major marketing implications of the Internet?
- What are the major Information and Communication Technology (ICT) developments since the introduction of the Internet?
- What are the implications of these developments for consumer behavior?

### 1. MAJOR MARKETING IMPLICATIONS OF THE INTERNET

It is difficult to identify marketing developments that are uniquely associated with the introduction and growth of the Internet. The Internet profits from autonomous marketing trends that were already there before its introduction, such as, for example, the increasing emphasis on individualization, loyalty, and seller-buyer relationships. The Internet stimulates and facilitates these trends. The Internet is not a ‘delivery medium’ conveying messages from suppliers to target groups, but a retrieval medium (database) in which consumers can find products, services and answers to their queries (Van Raaij, 1998). With the Internet, consumers can more easily take initiatives for contacts and transactions with suppliers. Consumers get more power vis-à-vis suppliers (Berthon, Holbrook and Hubert, 2000). We suggest that a variety of major marketing changes may be subsumed under two major developments: (1) individualized products and services and (2) long-term relationships between suppliers and their clients, and between consumers and their suppliers.

#### From Products to Provision Services

A stronger focus on individual consumer needs results into progressively individualized products and services. This focus is supported by two seemingly different marketing strategies. On the one hand, there is a strong emphasis on cost efficiency, resulting in the commodification of standard products and in lower consumer prices. On the other hand, there is a strong emphasis on the creation of surplus consumer value for which consumers are willing to pay a higher price (Day & Wensley, 1983). These two approaches together may form hybrid or multiple concepts of products and services that meet individual consumer demands. An example is provided by the so-called ‘all-finance’ notion in the financial services industry. Financial products and services that were originally separate, are now combined into new individualized consumer packages. This seems to imply that the product definition is expanding. Originally, ‘core products’ were to be taken as bundles of attributes that were functional to the majority of consumers. Subsequently, the ‘augmented product’ appeared, interpreted as consisting of bundles of inherently, directly functional attributes and indirectly functional attributes, such as, for example, special design, branding and packaging, post-purchase services and warranties. Functionality was related to particular consumer benefit segments.

More recently, products may be interpreted as bundles or packages of originally distinct goods and services that are synchronized to the needs of individual consumers. Bundles may be formed in a domain or category, for example the financial domain, the recreational domain, or the educational domain. Products become part of a ‘provision service’ to consumers. A provision service is a service to a consumer or household to deliver informational (see also, Berthon et al., 2000) or transformational benefits. Informational benefits pertain to problem solutions and guarantees of undisturbed functioning, e.g., telephone and transportation services and insurance coverage. Informational benefits transform a possibly negative situation (disturbance, dysfunctioning) into a neutral situation. Consumer emotions related to informational services are trust and relief. Transformational benefits pertain to a higher level of experience, e.g., British Airways making an airline flight into a memorable experience with meals, entertainment and other services (Pine & Gilmore, 1999). Transformational benefits transform a neutral or negative situation into a positive one. Consumer emotions related to transformational services are pleasure, excitement, enjoyment and wellbeing.

Packages may also be assembled across domains, e.g., a package in which the house, indoor and outdoor furnishing, cleaning, care and maintenance, and finance are all provided in one all-inclusive simultaneous deal. Another example may be provided by the package formed by health care, personal care, and leisure facilities. Cross-domain packages can also be informational (problem solution), transformational (experience) or, preferably, both. A future scenario is that service providers create attractive and memorable experiences for their clients. These clients become participants due to their loyalty and commitment to the service provider. These experiences are created by service provisions, consisting of an integrated and attractive combination of products and services, including surprise elements.

These cross-domain provision services may be provided by companies branding these packages with an attractive (meta) brand name, loaded with relevant and favorable connotations and values. These companies position themselves close to their clients, servicing and assisting them almost as a consumer organization. These companies take away consumer chores, inconsistencies (e.g., over or double insurance), information search, and product/service selection. Intermediaries may also compose these provision services from separate products and services, take the role of consumer (financial, lifestyle or otherwise) advisers, and sell or lease these packages to their clients.

Consumers may also compose these packages themselves with help of intelligent search agents. The search agent then selects and creates the provision service. See below for a discussion of this option.

Packaging and bundling are related to brand extension. At the level of core and augmented products, extensions are mainly technical line extensions in size, color, taste and format. Van Raaij & Schoonderbeek (1993) discuss line, benefit and value extensions of products and services. Benefit extensions pertain to similar and related functions in the same domain, whereas value extensions are often cross-domain extensions based on the same lifestyle, same target group and similar brand connotations. The motorcycle brand Harley-Davidson can be better (value) extended to beer and cigarettes, rather than (technically) extended to scooters and lawnmowers. The brand Harley-Davidson has the potential of becoming a cross-domain brand representing a certain lifestyle (Hell’s Angels).

The provision services dimension may be called the simultaneous dimension. The key idea of this development is that marketing will change its focus from optimizing separate products and services to optimizing provision services leading to problem solutions...
**Relationship Dimension**

The second dimension may be called the sequential or temporal dimension. In this development, there is a strong focus on long-term relationships between suppliers and consumers leading to improved customer retention. Over the past few years, many companies have shown a considerable interest in retaining existing clients/customers as compared to acquiring new customers (Peppers & Rogers, 1993; Wayland & Cole, 1997). Companies carefully consider the duration, quality and value of these relationships. We observe that the duration of the relationship will be extended. In financial markets the notion of ‘life-time value’ (of a customer) (LTV) has been introduced, meaning that the value of a customer for the company is considered based on transactions and profits over a long period, ranging between youth and old age (Antonides & Van Raaij, 1998). The supplier-client relationship will be strengthened by successful transactions, product servicing, replacement and updating, cross-selling and additional services.

Also from a consumer perspective the relationship should remain attractive, due to privileges, loyalty bonuses, and, above all, trust, mutual commitment and positive experiences. Consumers may even become shareholders of the service-provision company. The traditional opposition and mistrust of suppliers and customers may thus be ‘solved’ and changed into trust and partnership.

**Combination of the Simultaneous and Sequential Dimensions**

Service provisions can easily be extended over time. The service provider makes an agreement or contract with the client for a long-term service provision. These developments are supported (and even made possible) by information and communication technology (ICT). For example, the management of longer-term relationships with consumers requires the use of customer relational databases. The individualization of goods and services, possibly in the form of innovative product combinations, requires considerable fine-tuning of the particular fit between product benefits, on the one hand, and the consumer desires and characteristics, on the other hand. It means that provision services will be extended over time in the form of a long-term informational or...
transformational experience.

We assume that these two developments are conceptually independent. In the reality of the market, companies may follow strategies that relate to one of the developments and not to the other. Yet, companies may also select a combination of both. The different strategies have different implications for consumer behavior. In order to analyze the singular or combined developments, we combine the simultaneous (product/service) and sequential (relationship) dimensions into a matrix. See Figure 1.

In Figure 1, different types of interactions between sellers and buyers are identified. Space limitations do not allow discussing all 16 cells of this matrix. Instead, we select a number of cells to give examples.

In cell 1, the focus is on ad-hoc transactions regarding the core product. The supplier is not interested in the individual consumer, and is merely focussing on the profitability of transactions. Product and delivery quality is monitored only to avoid the hassle of complaints. Product quality is an issue; customer satisfaction is not. There is strong price competition. Consumers use the Internet for product information, brand and price comparisons, and ordering.

In cell 2, the emphasis is on providing surplus value that warrants a higher consumer price. Customer satisfaction is considered relevant for word-of-mouth communication, but is not considered to be part of an integral customer loyalty policy. In both cells, the interest is in the short-term transaction, and not in the consumer behind it. The consumer is satisfied with the product or service provided, and may show repeat-purchase behavior. Repeat purchases are based on routine and comfort, however, not on a true commitment. The consumer may easily switch to another brand or supplier if a better alternative is available.

Cross-selling in one transaction may be placed in cell 3. Cross-selling often pertains to products and services in the same domain. Cross-selling in the context of a relationship may be placed in cells 5 or 6.

It may be hypothesized that cell 4 represents the most effective marketing approach from the supplier’s perspective, and the most effective need satisfaction approach from the consumer’s perspective. The remaining cells provide extrapolations of these examples.

In cell 9, a supplier attempts to attract consumers into long-term bonds, for example by presenting a stamp saving program, customer (‘loyalty’) cards, or by offering a long-term contract. In this cell, the period of the interaction is not based on the particular surplus value of the product or service involved. In a sense, the supplier pays for the consumer’s apparent loyalty. If another supplier pays a higher price, consumer loyalty is very short-lived. The consumer perceives the ‘relationship’ as a purely instrumental one.

In cell 11, a long-term orientation and an individual customer value orientation coincide. Marketing efforts are simultaneously aimed at the continuous addition of surplus product value and at the continuation of the relationship with individual customers. In this cell, the two types of orientations are mutually supporting. This is not the case in the other cells.

Obviously, cell 16 is the most intriguing one. It refers to a possible future scenario. We discuss some of the possible consumer behavior implications, if the combined market, marketing and ICT developments would indeed point into the direction of cell 16. First, the scenario of cell 16 is not unrealistic or unfeasible. Second, considering the speed of the current marketing and ICT developments, we may not be addressing a far away but possibly a rather near future. Third, the implications will have a strong impact on consumer behavior research. Fourth, the scenario of cell 16 cannot be imagined without the Internet as a communication and transac-
Proposition 3
At present, consumer needs are often derived from the market performance of products (instead of forming their starting point). The formation of packages or bundles of products and services requires a theoretical and methodological reconsideration of the need concept. Product or attribute related need concepts should be expanded to incorporate product and service bundles. To our knowledge, no package related need concepts are available in the consumer behavior literature. The existing concepts of line and brand extensions do not cover the notions as implied here, but may prove useful after further elaboration.

Proposition 4
Consumers will evaluate market offerings more in terms of indirect and aggregate-level quality criteria (‘trust’, ‘famous brand’, ‘good reputation’, ‘reliable company’, ‘endorsed by ...’, ‘international- ally reknown’, ‘also used by ...’, etc.) as compared to direct quality criteria related to product characteristics and attributes. Consumer behavior research should more strongly focused on the nature and function of such (indirect) heuristics.

Proposition 5
The focus will shift from satisfaction with individual products to satisfaction with overall packages. In this sense, a consumer may be satisfied with a single product but dissatisfied with its contribution to a service provision. Even the reverse is conceivable. Research should be aimed at the adaptation of the satisfaction concept. As satisfaction will be expressed with regard to larger combinations of products and services, so that satisfaction relates to a more aggregate domain, the distinction between consumer satisfaction and wellbeing is likely to diminish.

Proposition 6
The traditional antagonism between the market’s supply side and demand side will disappear. Long-term relationships require more openness between both sides. Profits need to be reinvested in a way that is considered most functional by consumers. Companies may operate on behalf of the consumer, almost as consumer organizations. Consumers may become shareholders of a service company or members of a cooperation or association rather than ‘targets’ or outsiders. This proposition calls for both sociologically and psychologically oriented research. It may be hypothesized that the communication between the two market parties will be more open, more interactive and more continuous. So far, consumer behavior research predominantly has dealt with non-interactive information transfer.

Proposition 7
Customer lifetime loyalty is functional to the providing party (company or agent) because of continuity reasons. Loyalty is functional to the consumer because of overall consumption utility and efficiency reasons. Transition costs and inconvenience may become too high to shift to another service provider. To our knowledge, there is no systematic analysis of cost-benefit trade-offs regarding relationship (dis)continuation.

Proposition 8
The notion of the consumer will change from buyer to consumer. In the consumer behavior literature, very little attention is paid to the way consumers actually consume products and services. Consumer (dis)satisfaction research touches on this issue, but does not really cover it. Because of the growing emphasis on the need concept, there will be also a growing emphasis on the actual
functionality of the products and services provided. Prepurchase information seeking will become less of an issue. Instead, attention will be more focused on information supporting consumption, i.e., post-purchase activities.

**Proposition 9**

The responsibility for effective and efficient buying decisions and consumption related decisions is delegated to another party (see also Poiesz, 1993). The intelligent agent will take over traditional consumer responsibilities. It is expected that the notions of consumer responsibility and autonomy become more important concepts, but are, to our knowledge, not considered in the consumer behavior literature. Research should be aimed at the relationships that will develop between consumers and their economic guardian angels: the intelligent agents. The characteristics and behavior of these agents and the underlying ‘intelligence’ paradigms become of central interest.

**Proposition 10**

Manufacturers and their brands may become less visible to individual consumers relative to the agents that assemble the products and services for end users. Product brands may be replaced by meta-brands. Because of their broad impact, the corporate identity of these mega-brands will refer to fundamental societal values and issues. Because of this expected tendency, it is important for consumer behavior research to more explicitly incorporate values as predictors of consumer decision making.

**CONCLUSIONS**

The paper sketches that current marketing developments (product packaging and provider-customer relationships) are accelerated and reinforced by ICT developments and progress made in Intelligent Agent technology. To put it differently, the gravity point of the matrix (cell 16) may be reached in the near future. This implies that consumer behavior will (and is) changing over time as possible future scenarios will become reality in the virtual market place. Our conclusion is that it is not sufficient to apply existing consumer behavior concepts to new consumer behavior phenomena. Subsequently we have to rethink the current consumer-behavior paradigm.

**REFERENCES**


Trust me, I’m a computer: Consumer evaluations of branded electronic agents. *Advances in Consumer Research Conference*, Columbus, Ohio.


URL 1: Hobbes’ Internet Timeline v5.0
[http://info.isoc.org/guest/zakon/internet/history/hit.html]
A Value Inventory and Value Dimensions
Joke Oppenhuysen, University of Amsterdam, The Netherlands
Dirk Sikkel, University of Tilburg, The Netherlands

ABSTRACT
Most contemporary research on values is based on the lists of Rokeach (1973). A new value inventory is constructed starting from qualitative interviews. The coded conversations yielded 1372 value descriptions, that were condensed to 160 representative values. From the database in which the condensation process was coded, a value thesaurus could be constructed. From the 160 values, six factors emerged: relations, social orientation, values from old, safety, family life and to be conformistic. These factors appeared to be stable. Some of the factors are similar to factors in other studies.

INTRODUCTION
Since the ground breaking work of Rokeach (1973), values have become a common concept in the study of consumer behavior and an important tool in marketing research. Many marketing research agencies routinely include Rokeach’s 18 instrumental values and 18 end values into their questionnaires to measure life styles and preferences. After Rokeach, many approaches to apply values in consumer research have been developed. Well known examples in consumer research are LOV (Kahle, 1996), VALS (Mitchell, 1983) and VALS 2 (Winters, 1989). The value concept has been refined by Vinson, Scott & Lamont (1977) and Gutman (1982), Reynolds and Gutman (1984), where values are ordered in the form of chains.

A more general line of value research is followed by Schwartz and Bilsky (1982), where values are ordered in the form of chains. Schwartz and Bilsky (1982, 1990) and Schwartz (1992, 1994). They hypothesized that values arise as a cognitive representation of general human needs that are general to all cultures:

- the needs of an individual as biological organism
- the needs of coded social interaction
- the needs of survival and well being of groups

Those needs give rise to eleven value domains into which all values can be grouped: power, achievement, hedonism, stimulation, self-direction, universalism, benevolence, tradition, conformity, security and spirituality. With the exception of spirituality, these domains are recovered as value clusters in a scaling analysis. Values within each of the clusters are positively correlated in the sense that when an individual gives one value within a cluster a high priority, he has a relatively high probability to give other values within the same cluster also high priority. The analysis is based on the Rokeach values, supplemented with 35 other values of which the origin is unclear; all values, can be attributed to the domains that were postulated by Schwartz and Bilsky.

Both lines of research have their value in our attempts to understand how values come into existence, how they can be compared across cultures and what role they play in consumer behavior. There is, however, one question that receives little attention in these research areas, namely: which values are there? This question was, of course, addressed by Rokeach as he provided the fundamental starting point from which the others carried on. The procedures he used, however, although quite laborious, seem to be undocumented and rather subjective. His 18 end values were based on

- research of the literature, both inside and outside the American society

- the personal end values of Rokeach himself
- the values of 30 psychology students
- values from a representative survey in the city of Lansing

This resulted in a list of several hundreds of values. This list was reduced on the basis of a number of considerations. The following values were deleted

- synonyms
- values that empirically appeared to be synonyms
- values that overlapped
- values that were too specific
- values that could not be end values

For the 18 instrumental values, similar procedures were used. Rokeach (1973, p. 30) contains the following comment

“As can be seen, the overall procedure employed in selecting the two lists is admittedly an intuitive one, and there is no reason to think that others, working independently would have come up with precisely the same lists of 18 terminal and 18 instrumental values. It would be interesting to see which values other might produce working independently and using the same criteria that have been described here.”

This, however, never happened, at least not on the scale of the Rokeach project. Many researchers have used the Rokeach values or, like Schwartz, have taken it as a starting point. In almost all fundamental value research, the focus is on value structure or value dimensions, but not on procedures to construct a set of values that is in some sense complete.

In marketing practice, values are used for market segmentation and for brand positioning. Brand personalities mainly are made up of values, which are communicated through advertising and product design. The reason for starting a new value project was the feeling in advertising agencies that for communication purposes the Rokeach values were outdated. In the new project an attempt is made to elicit values in a way that

1. it satisfies scientific standards like verifiability, reproducibility and reliability.
2. it gives at least a rough idea about its completeness
3. it yields tools for practical application

The values are based on qualitative interviews with a representative sample in the Netherlands. Given the fact that the field of application is communication we have chosen to compare and scale the values on the basis of similarity of meaning (instead of correlation between priorities). This leads to a set of procedures that is entirely different from those used by Schwarz and Bilsky (1990).

Section 2 gives some general considerations about choices that had to be made at the start of the project. The actual value inventory is described in section 3. In section 4 the underlying value dimensions are discussed and the results are compared to those of others. Section 5 deals with validity and reliability issues. Section 6 concludes.
GENERAL CONSIDERATIONS

Value definitions

There are many value definitions. Lautmann (1971) found 178 definitions in 400 different references. According to Becker and Nauta (1983) the value definitions can be split into two different groups.

1. Values that are viewed from the needs of the individual; they are linked to motivation and satisfaction of needs.

2. Values that are viewed from the needs of society; they are linked to purposes, guidelines for behavior and evaluation of behavior.

For application to consumer behavior, the obvious approach is to take the individual level as starting point and to investigate what a consumer considers to be values. Schwartz and Bilsky (1987) conclude that the majority of value definitions have a number of common characteristics. In their view, values are

a) concepts or beliefs
b) about desirable end-states or behaviors
c) that transcend specific situations
d) guide selection of evaluation of behavior and events
e) are ordered by relative importance

The definition of Rokeach is in agreement with these elements:

a value is an enduring belief that a specific mode of conduct or end-state of existence is personally or socially preferable to an opposite or converse mode of conduct or end-state of existence

Rokeach explicitly states that each individual has a value system, which is an ordering of values by relative importance; this system serves to determine which value has priority in practical situations where there is a conflict between values, e.g. between honesty and responsibility or between friendship and patriotism. In the situation of the new inventory, thousands of sentences had to be examined with respect to the presence of values. This required a simple criterion to determine if a concept was a value. The following working definition, which is a simplified version of Rokeach’s definition, appeared to be convenient

a value is a state or a mode of conduct if people strive at it or consider it to be desirable

This definition covers only the elements a) and b) that were mentioned by Schwartz and Bilsky (1987). The requirement that values transcend specific situations was met by the design of the interviews (see section 3). The last two elements have more the character of properties and may be checked in subsequent research.

There is mixed evidence on the distinction between end-values and instrumental values. Heath and Fogel (1978) conducted an experiment in which they had their respondents classify Rokeach values into instrumental values and end-values. It appeared that there was a lot of disagreement among the respondents and between the classification of the respondents and the classification of Rokeach. Given the results of much laddering research it is obvious that at the individual level the distinction between instrumental values and end-values is valid, but that it is not possible to make fixed classification of values that holds for all individuals. Therefore the distinction between instrumental and end-values was dropped.

Cultural limitations

Values, and especially value descriptions, have a cultural component. Cultural differences may arise in

1. The value concept. A concept may exist in some cultures and not in other cultures. A striking example is the Rokeach end value ‘salvation’; its Dutch translation, verlossing, has lost its religious meaning for the majority of the population. Many interpreted the word as ‘delivery’ or ‘stopping of pain’. 

2. The perception of a concept as a value. A concept may exist in different cultures, but may not be seen as something to be strived at. A clean environment has not always been seen as something desirable.

3. The importance of a value. Dependent of economic conditions, a clean environment may or may not be seen as an issue of high priority.

4. The wording of a value. The word ‘environment’ has only in the last decades obtained the meaning of ‘ecological environment’.

All these considerations show that the usability of value lists have their limitations. The Rokeach value ‘salvation’ has lost its meaning in Dutch society in 2000; similarly, values which are elicited from the Dutch population in 2000 can not (uncritically) be used in other societies. This does not necessarily hold true for underlying structures, which, according to Schwartz, may be universal but take their own shape in every different culture. For the value inventory it was decided to restrict it to the autochthonous population in the Netherlands.

THE VALUE INVENTORY

The basic idea of the value inventory was to elicit values without using any preconceived notion or idea of how values can be ordered, clustered or arranged into dimensions. The values had to be based on empirical data; they had to be very or fairly general, thus satisfying requirement c) of Schwartz and Bilsky (1987). Given these requirements it was decided that the interviews had to cover general life domains. After experimentation with different interviewing techniques it appeared possible to elicit values from respondents in qualitative interviews, in which many aspects of life in general were discussed. Examples of such aspects are: children, work, friendship and politics. An exhaustive list is given in the appendix, table A1. The interviews were conducted in a style that resembles laddering. They had the following format: Each aspect of life was introduced by a photograph or a set of photographs, mainly taken from newspapers and magazines. After a few introductory questions on each subject, the respondent was prompted to explain why he had given his answer and, more in particular, why the values he mentioned were important. A significant difference from laddering interviews was that the values did not necessarily have to relate to the respondent, but could also be values of specific groups or other people in general.

The data were collected in 20 qualitative interviews, each of which lasted approximately three hours. The respondents were evenly spread with respect to sex, education and region. The conversations were taped and later transcribed. Every single sentence was scanned for values. The words of the respondents were taken literally and left as much as possible in their context. The result was that a large number (1372) of different value descriptions were obtained. These descriptions did not represent 1372 different values, but they did indicate 1372 different ways people talk about
values. A problem with 1372 value descriptions is that their number is too large to do subsequent quantitative research. As Table 1 shows, there is however much redundancy in the meanings of the different value descriptions. From the 1372 descriptions, 160 values were selected by the researchers that were representatives for larger sets of value descriptions. The value descriptions in table 1 are connected to ‘being boss’.

In selecting the 160 values, the following principles were used:

1. Synonyms; value descriptions that were synonymous were brought together
2. Ambiguity; value descriptions that had more than one meaning are excluded
3. Number of times a value is mentioned; frequently mentioned values are chosen
4. Dictionary; value descriptions which were correct according to the Dutch Van Dale dictionary were selected.

An English translation of the 160 values is given in the appendix (Table A2). Like in the selection process of Rokeach, this part of the process depended partly on the intuition of the researchers. The main difference is that the decisions of the researchers are documented in a database and can easily be checked by others.

The attribution of value descriptions to sets is not exclusive, i.e. a value description can be a member of more that one set that is defined by a representative value.

### VALUE DIMENSIONS

Table A.2 shows that the number of representative value descriptions is still large, far too large to include them routinely into questionnaires. Moreover, the value descriptions may contain a hidden structure that may be of theoretical interest. It is, therefore, desirable to uncover such a presumed structure. Basically, there are two ways to obtain evidence about such a structure:

a. Collect data about the importance or priority of the values. This leads to a correlation matrix, where a pair of values that have simultaneously low and high importance has a positive correlation and a pair of values in which a high importance of one value predicts a low importance of the other value, has a negative correlation.

b. Collect data about the meaning of the value descriptions. This gives evidence about what consumers consider to be similar descriptions. Two values which may have simultaneously high and low importance still can be considered to be dissimilar.

Because the field of application, advertising and the construction of brand personality, mainly is concerned with meaning, it was decided to use the second method. The implication was that 160*159/2 = 12720 pairs of value descriptions had to be judged with respect to similarity of meaning. This was carried out by the CentERpanel, a panel of 2000 households who respond every week to a computerized questionnaire. The pairs of value descriptions were distributed over the respondents in such a way that every respondent judged approximately 60 pairs of values. In this way, for every distance between a pair of value descriptions, approximately 12 observations were obtained. This led to a distance matrix to which Principal Components Analysis (PCA) was applied. The factor solution was not rotated.

The PCA yielded six factors with a clear interpretation. For both directions the ten value descriptions with the most extreme factors scores are listed in Table 2.

All factors showed a contrast between value descriptions with a clearly different meaning. This meaning is printed bold in table 2. All factors have, surprisingly, a common element. All can be interpreted as the distinction between bond and freedom. The object of the bond is different for each factor. Factor 1 can be interpreted as the bond to relations and social life in contrast to the freedom of making a career (although it is the only factor where it could be argued that the object of the bond is at the opposite end: career, leaving no freedom for social relations). In factor 2, the object of the bond clearly is the fellow human being. Factor 3 shows a bond with rather traditional values like patriotism, pride, distinction and toughness. Factor 4 expresses a different type of bond; values like cleanliness, richness, safety and to make a living all point to personal security. Factor 5 expresses bond to family life. In factor 6, the object of the bond is the approval or admiration by others, with the extreme opposite ‘to go your own way’. Given this interpretation, it is clear why the factors emerged this way: they all correspond to a very general aspect of life.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>VALUE DESCRIPTIONS</th>
<th>VALUE DESCRIPTIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To leave one’s mark on something</td>
<td>To be superior</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Being your own boss</td>
<td>To rule</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To arrange things</td>
<td>To govern</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To guide someone</td>
<td>To supervise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To command</td>
<td>Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To control</td>
<td>To have more than others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Being dominant</td>
<td>To be more than others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To push through</td>
<td>To have others below you</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To force</td>
<td>To run things</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Being the pace-setter</td>
<td>To have authority over others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To keep things in hand</td>
<td>To outdo someone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Being head</td>
<td>To be at the top</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To enforce something</td>
<td>To give assignments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To have influence</td>
<td>To have a grip on</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Being a leader</td>
<td>To make the rules</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Macho</td>
<td>To have your way</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### TABLE 1

A sample of the value descriptions associated with ‘being boss’
VALIDITY AND RELIABILITY

As it is claimed that the procedure that is used in this project is an improvement compared to Rokeach, the issue of validity and reliability is very relevant. The fact that in some sense few observations were used ('only' 20 qualitative interviews and 'only' 12 observations per distance between a pair of values), makes this issue even more pressing. In this section, some evidence with respect to validity and reliability is presented. We will discuss the stimuli that were used, the values extracted from the interviews and the stability of the factor solution.

The stimuli

The photographs that were used as stimuli were meant as an introduction to a subject. It was, of course, undesirable, that respondents reacted to specific details of the photographs. In the preparatory stage it appeared that some photographs caused such unwanted reactions. To test whether the particular choice of the photographs had any influence on the results, two different series were used. When the series are equivalent, there may be no difference in the average scores of the elicited values on the factors (a difference would indicate that a stimulus created a bias with

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>factor</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>bond</td>
<td>Relations</td>
<td>Socially oriented</td>
<td>Values from old</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to cuddle</td>
<td>to be understanding</td>
<td>to be helpful</td>
<td>to be distinguished</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>friendship</td>
<td>to be responsible</td>
<td>to be helpful</td>
<td>to be distinguished</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>love</td>
<td>to have knowledge of human character</td>
<td>to be considerate with someone</td>
<td>to be mortal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cosiness</td>
<td>to be serious</td>
<td>to be considerate with someone</td>
<td>to be mortal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a good atmosphere</td>
<td>to work together</td>
<td>to be considerate with someone</td>
<td>to be mortal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to do things for others</td>
<td>to be serious</td>
<td>to be considerate with someone</td>
<td>to be mortal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to have a partner</td>
<td>to work together</td>
<td>to be considerate with someone</td>
<td>to be mortal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to have a nice family</td>
<td>wisdom</td>
<td>to have prestige</td>
<td>to have prestige</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be easy-going</td>
<td>to solve (something)</td>
<td>to have prestige</td>
<td>to have prestige</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be self-opinionated</td>
<td>to look well-groomed</td>
<td>to have prestige</td>
<td>to have prestige</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be tenacious</td>
<td>to have sexual intercourse</td>
<td>to have prestige</td>
<td>to have prestige</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to go your own way</td>
<td>to get a kick</td>
<td>to have sexual intercourse</td>
<td>to have prestige</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>expertise</td>
<td>to have fun</td>
<td>to have fun</td>
<td>to have fun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to achieve</td>
<td>to be active</td>
<td>to be active</td>
<td>to be active</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to have ambitions</td>
<td>to be healthy</td>
<td>to be healthy</td>
<td>to be healthy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>perseverance</td>
<td>to be/stay young</td>
<td>to be healthy</td>
<td>to be healthy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>power</td>
<td>to be without worries</td>
<td>to be healthy</td>
<td>to be healthy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be fanatic</td>
<td>to be attractive</td>
<td>to be healthy</td>
<td>to be healthy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to take it higher up</td>
<td>to enjoy</td>
<td>to be healthy</td>
<td>to be healthy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>freedom</td>
<td>Achievement</td>
<td>Individually oriented</td>
<td>Contemporary values</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>factor</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bond</td>
<td>Safety</td>
<td>Family life</td>
<td>Conformistic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>neatness</td>
<td>to be mother</td>
<td>to look well-groomed</td>
<td>to be thrifty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be rich</td>
<td>to have children</td>
<td>to be attractive</td>
<td>to be thrifty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be clean</td>
<td>to cuddle</td>
<td>to have prestige</td>
<td>to be thrifty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>safety</td>
<td>to look after</td>
<td>neatness</td>
<td>to be distinguished</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rest</td>
<td>to spoil</td>
<td>to be distinguished</td>
<td>to be distinguished</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>luxury</td>
<td>to have a partner</td>
<td>to have authority</td>
<td>to be distinguished</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to have your own place</td>
<td>to mollify</td>
<td>politeness</td>
<td>to be distinguished</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be thrify</td>
<td>to raise children</td>
<td>to be clean</td>
<td>to be clean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to make a living</td>
<td>to have sexual intercourse</td>
<td>to be boss</td>
<td>to be boss</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>certainty</td>
<td>love</td>
<td>to be the central figure</td>
<td>to be the central figure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tension (desired)</td>
<td>to lack for nothing</td>
<td>to be thrifty</td>
<td>to be the central figure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be sturdy</td>
<td>to be independent</td>
<td>to be alone (voluntarily)</td>
<td>to be the central figure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be broad-minded</td>
<td>simplicity</td>
<td>to have a place of your own</td>
<td>to be the central figure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>humor</td>
<td>to be not jealous</td>
<td>freedom</td>
<td>to be the central figure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be a hero</td>
<td>humor</td>
<td>to be idealistic</td>
<td>to be the central figure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to have an opinion of your</td>
<td>to be content</td>
<td>to protect</td>
<td>to be the central figure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>own</td>
<td>to be without worrying</td>
<td>to be protected</td>
<td>to be the central figure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>freedom</td>
<td>rest</td>
<td>to be rebellious</td>
<td>to be the central figure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be interesting</td>
<td>to be ordinary</td>
<td>to believe</td>
<td>to be the central figure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to break new ground</td>
<td>to be invent</td>
<td>to believe</td>
<td>to be the central figure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be defiant</td>
<td>Freedom</td>
<td>To go your own way</td>
<td>To go your own way</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3
Comparison between the two photo series

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>dimension</th>
<th>Series a</th>
<th>Series b</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>weighted average</td>
<td>standard deviation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.23</td>
<td>6.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>-0.25</td>
<td>5.54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>0.32</td>
<td>4.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td>5.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>-0.08</td>
<td>4.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>-0.01</td>
<td>4.71</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 1 shows the average number of value descriptions that were found in a given number of interviews. The average is taken over all possible combinations of interviews (so for 5 interviews, $20/(5!x15!)$ combinations were considered). The figure shows clearly that at 19 and 20 interviews the number of descriptions is still growing steadily. As a consequence, it has to be assumed that there exist many more value descriptions, and the list of 1372 descriptions is far from complete.

In Figure 2 it is shown that the average number of representative value descriptions practically stops growing after eleven interviews. At that point the average number has reached 148. Of course, the lack of growth at the 17 and more can be considered to be an artefact, since the total number of representative values was fixed to 160. Therefore other arguments have to be found to show that the 160 representative values are sufficient to reveal the underlying factor structure. This will happen in the next subsection.

The similarity of the figures for photo series a and b in Table 3 show no evidence that the specific characteristics of the photographs have led to any bias.

The number of qualitative interviews

A rule of thumb for qualitative interviewing is that the number of interviews is sufficient when no new information is encountered in new interviews. We can apply this rule both to the total number of value descriptions and to the 160 representative values. The rule can also be applied to the factor solutions.
The stability of the factor solution was tested by three split-half experiments:

a. The judges of the distances between pairs of value descriptions were randomly split into two equal groups; the PCA’s were replicated for each group.

b. The qualitative interviews were split into two groups; the PCA’s were replicated for the value descriptions that came from each of the groups.

c. The 160 representative value descriptions were randomly split into two groups of 80 descriptions; the PCA’s were replicated for each of the groups.

The results were evaluated on the basis of correlations between factor scores. Because of the possibility that a factor solution in a subsample was rotated with respect to another factor solution, also multiple regression was applied to see whether the factors spanned the same linear subspace.

In Tables 4a and 4b the results of experiment a are shown. The judges were split into two random groups. As a consequence, on the average each of the distances was judged six times. This led to two new distance matrices. On both of them PCA was applied. The first three factors appear to be stable. For the factors 4 through 6, however, the correlations, especially between subsamples 1 and 2 are low. This may be caused by the fact that the factors of the first subsample are rotated with respect to the factors of the second subsample. This can be verified by regression of the factors on the first subsample on those of the second subsample. The figures in Table 4b show that this is the case. The multiple correlation between the factor scores of factor 4 in the complete sample and the factor scores of factors 4 through 6 of subsample 1 is equal to .892. The multiple correlations between the factor scores in each of the subsamples are somewhat lower. This is, naturally, due to the fact that these subsamples are independent. Generally speaking, the correspondence between the different factor solutions is satisfactory and indicates that the distances between the value descriptions are judged by a sufficient number of judges.

In experiment b (Table 5), the interviews were split into two subsamples. The first subsample corresponded to photo series a, the second subsample to photo series b.

### Tables

#### Table 4A

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimension</th>
<th>complete sample and subsample 1</th>
<th>complete sample and subsample 2</th>
<th>subsample 1 and subsample 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>.991</td>
<td>.991</td>
<td>.968</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>.980</td>
<td>.974</td>
<td>.920</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>.909</td>
<td>.899</td>
<td>.684</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>.752</td>
<td>.560</td>
<td>.081</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>.792</td>
<td>.376</td>
<td>.055</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>.051</td>
<td>.611</td>
<td>.089</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Table 4B

| Dimension | subsample 1 and complete sample | subsample 2 and complete sample | subsample 1 and subsample 2 | subsample 2 and subsample 1 |
|-----------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|----------------------------|
| 4         | .892                            | .874                            | .724                       | .630                       |
| 5         | .955                            | .914                            | .710                       | .611                       |
| 6         | .824                            | .882                            | .614                       | .744                       |

#### Table 5

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimension</th>
<th>complete sample and subsample 1</th>
<th>complete sample and subsample 2</th>
<th>subsample 1 and subsample 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>.999</td>
<td>.996</td>
<td>.995</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>.994</td>
<td>.993</td>
<td>.981</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>.988</td>
<td>.989</td>
<td>.986</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>.952</td>
<td>.977</td>
<td>.886</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>.940</td>
<td>.916</td>
<td>.796</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>.928</td>
<td>.837</td>
<td>.853</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
values that were in both samples that were compared. It is immedi-
ately obvious that all factor solutions are virtually identical, which
could, of course, be expected as both subsamples have the majority
of the representative value descriptions in common.

A much stricter test is experiment c, where it is examined how
the factor solution depends on the particular choice of value
descriptions. The representative value descriptions are randomly
split into two groups of 80 descriptions. On both groups PCA is
applied. In this case it is impossible to relate the two subsamples
each other as they have no value descriptions (and hence no factor
scores) in common. It is, however, possible to relate the factor
scores from the subsamples to the original factor scores, using
multiple regression as in experiment a. The results are given in
Table 6.

The correlations show how well the first 6 factors of the
subsamples explain the corresponding factor scores of the complete
sample of value descriptions. Again, the correlation coefficients are
quite high, which indicates that the factor solution is stable. This
result is very significant. Its implication is that, although we can not
claim that the 160 representative values are in some sense complete,
minimal or objective, their underlying semantical structure is stable
and apparently does not depend very much on the particular choice
of descriptions, as long as all value dimensions are sufficiently
represented.

**SUMMARY, DISCUSSION**

The study started at the same point where Rokeach started in
the mid sixties: how to construct a list of values from scratch? It was
decided to use only data from qualitative interviews. Given the
results of the analysis:

- a set of 160 representative values could be constructed that
  was almost complete after 10 interviews,
- the underlying dimensions appeared to be stable and robust
to the use of the representative values,

this decision seems to be justified. The underlying dimensions can be interpreted as the bond to six very abstract, but also very
recognizable life domains: social life, the fellow human being, the
past, personal security, family life and approval by others. These are
domains in which, in the view of the Dutch respondent, values can be
different for different people; apparently, such differences matter. A significant result also may be the value dimensions we did not
find: politics and religion. These subjects were explicitly discussed in
the interviews (see Table A1, topics 12, 13, 14, 15, 19, 22) but
did not lead to clearly contrasting values. Apparently, to the
average citizen (and consumer) these subjects are not relevant in
daily life.

**REFERENCES**

waarden in Nederland na 1945. ’s Gravenhage: VUGA.

---

**TABLE 6**

Multiple correlations between the factor scores based on the complete sample of 160 values the factor scores based on the subsamples of 80 values.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>subsample (80 values)</th>
<th>Dimension complete sample (160 values)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>.972</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>.961</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---


### TABLE A.1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Introductory questions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1. Children           | Why do people take children?  
Why do people want a large family?  
Why do people not take children? |
| 2. School             | What does school mean to people? / What did school mean to you?  
Why do people send children to school; what do they expect? |
| 3. Reading/books      | Why do people read books?  
Why do people possess/want books? |
| 4. Puberty            | Why do these people look different?  
Put yourself in their place. What will be important in the lives of these persons? |
| 5. Marriage/love/sex  | Why do people marry?  
Why do people have a big party when they marry?  
Why can a marriage go wrong?  
Why do people want to play with each other?  
Why do people have sex? |
| 6. Animals            | Why do people have animals?  
Put yourself in the place of this lady; what will be important in her life |
| 7. Friendship         | Why do people have friends?  
Why do many people go to crowded places? |
| 8. Work               | Why do people work?  
Why do people want to work?  
Why do people want to make money?  
Why do people want higher jobs?  
Put yourself in the place of these persons; what will be important to them? |
| 9. Home               | Why do people want a house of their own?  
Why do all houses look so different, both from the outside and at the inside |
| 10. Holiday/sport/health | Why do people go on holiday?  
Why do they want to rest?  
Why do they want thrills?  
Why do they do sports?  
Why is health so important? |
| 11. Poor/rich         | What is the contrast in these pictures?  
What values will be important to each of the groups? |
| 12. Religion          | Why do people go to church?  
Why do people believe?  
What is the meaning of life? |
| 13. Royalty/army      | Why do people want a queen/a royal family?  
Why don’t they want it?  
Why do we have an army?  
What is characteristic for Dutch people |
| 14. Technology/future | Why is man developing technology?  
What does the future mean to people? |
| 15. Environment       | What do you see on these pictures?  
What are the differences between the pictures? |
| 16. Appearance        | Why do people use cosmetics?  
Why is appearance important to people? |
| 17. Food, sweets      | Why do people sometimes eat a bag full of sweets? |
| 18. Young/old         | Why do people want to stay young?  
Why, in other cultures, are old people sometimes more important? |
| 19. Death             | What does death mean to people?  
Why are many people afraid of death? |
| 20. Taking care of others/charity | Why to people take care of others?  
How do people feel about being taken care of? |
| 21. Violence          | Why do we have police?  
Why do people use violence? |
| 22. Politics          | Why do people want to go into politics?  
Why are older people important in politics? |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>to solve (something)</th>
<th>to be obedient</th>
<th>to be immortal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>to give attention</td>
<td>to be right</td>
<td>to relax</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be attractive</td>
<td>to be equal</td>
<td>to be in time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to have prestige</td>
<td>to believe</td>
<td>to be rebellious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be kind</td>
<td>to be happy</td>
<td>to be optimistic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to accept</td>
<td>to be easy going</td>
<td>to raise children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be active</td>
<td>to enjoy</td>
<td>to get old</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be alone (voluntarily)</td>
<td>to be ordinary</td>
<td>to be convincing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to have ambitions</td>
<td>to have authority</td>
<td>to have fun</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be boss</td>
<td>cosiness</td>
<td>to achieve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be understanding</td>
<td>to be healthy</td>
<td>to be considerate with someone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be helpful</td>
<td>to function well</td>
<td>to have respect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to take an interest in culture</td>
<td>to break new ground</td>
<td>to be rich</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>politeness</td>
<td>to have memories</td>
<td>to be romantic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to protect</td>
<td>to be busy</td>
<td>to have roots</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to belong to a group</td>
<td>to be the central figure</td>
<td>to be generous</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be glad</td>
<td>to take it higher up</td>
<td>to be broad-minded</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be interesting</td>
<td>humour</td>
<td>rest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be capable</td>
<td>to be idealistic</td>
<td>to work together</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be in good shape</td>
<td>to make something</td>
<td>to be clean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to have contact with others</td>
<td>to do things for others</td>
<td>to have sexual intercourse</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be creative</td>
<td>to make a living</td>
<td>to be serious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be thankful</td>
<td>to be intelligent</td>
<td>a good atmosphere</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be distinguished</td>
<td>to take an interest in something</td>
<td>to be slender</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be democratic</td>
<td>to go your own way</td>
<td>to be thrifty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>perseverance</td>
<td>to feel pleasant</td>
<td>tension (desired)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to have a goal</td>
<td>to recognise yourself in your children</td>
<td>to take example from</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to have a nice family</td>
<td>to be/stay young</td>
<td>to be spontaneous</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be a good human being</td>
<td>to have opportunities</td>
<td>to be sportsmanlike</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to have good taste</td>
<td>to make choices</td>
<td>to be sturdy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be a hero</td>
<td>to have children</td>
<td>to be content</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to have a hobby</td>
<td>to be available to help someone</td>
<td>to have time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to get a kick</td>
<td>to cuddle</td>
<td>to keep traditions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be a matter-of-fact person</td>
<td>to learn</td>
<td>pride</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to have a partner</td>
<td>love</td>
<td>to be loyal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be a personality</td>
<td>to have love for nature</td>
<td>to be defiant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to have a future</td>
<td>to listen to someone</td>
<td>patriotism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>simplicity</td>
<td>luxury</td>
<td>expertise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be honest</td>
<td>power</td>
<td>to be tenacious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to have an opinion of your own</td>
<td>to have knowledge of human character</td>
<td>safety</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to have your own place</td>
<td>to be modern</td>
<td>to be responsible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>self-respect</td>
<td>to have courage</td>
<td>tolerance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be self-opinionated</td>
<td>to be a mother</td>
<td>to mollify</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be enthusiastic</td>
<td>neatness</td>
<td>trust</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to look well-groomed</td>
<td>to be not alone</td>
<td>to spoil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to get recognition</td>
<td>to be not jealous</td>
<td>to be perfect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>experience</td>
<td>to lack for nothing</td>
<td>progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to have family ties</td>
<td>to be curious</td>
<td>friendship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be fanatic</td>
<td>to be useful</td>
<td>freedom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hospitality</td>
<td>to be objective</td>
<td>wisdom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>security</td>
<td>to be independent</td>
<td>certainty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to have patience</td>
<td>to be without worries</td>
<td>independence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be no materialist</td>
<td>unspoiltness</td>
<td>to look after</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>to be out of the daily routine</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Deriving Wine Marketing Strategies by Combining Means-End Chains with an Occasion Based CHAID Segmentation Analysis

John Hall, Victoria University, Australia
Peter P. Oppenheim, University of Ballarat, Australia
L. Lockshin, University of South Australia, Australia

ABSTRACT

In this paper we attempt to address three issues: first to investigate the suitability of using situations as a segmentation base, Secondly to assess the importance and role that values play in this segmentation process and thirdly to assess the effectiveness of CHAID as a segmentation methodology when using means-end chain analysis. The paper first reviews the literature on situation or occasion-based behaviour and means-end research. A brief summary of the interview process for the data collected based on wine consumption occasions is provided before the analysis is discussed. The paper concludes by discussing the theoretical and managerial implications of this research.

INTRODUCTION

The goals of this paper are three-fold: first to investigate the suitability of using situations as a segmentation base, Secondly to assess the importance and role that values play in this segmentation process and thirdly to assess the effectiveness of CHAID as a segmentation methodology when using means-end chain analysis. The paper first reviews the literature on situation or occasion-based behaviour and means-end research. A brief summary of the interview process for the data collected based on wine consumption occasions is provided before the analysis is discussed.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Situation

Situational influences have a theoretical foundation in Lewin’s field theory (1936) and the modern interactionism conception of human behaviour. These perspectives asserted that human motivations, intentions, and behaviour are a function of the interaction between consumers and situations. According to these theories different individuals view their physical and social settings somewhat differently.

A limited number of researchers have investigated situational factors as a determinant of choice behaviour. Sandell (1968) presented subjects with an inventory of beverages and found that personal differences and differences in situations, considered separately, were poor predictors of product preference. Their interaction, however, provided a better predictor of beverage preference. The same type of interaction between product choice and usage situation was found by Green and Rao (1972), Belk (1974), and Srivastava, Shocker, and Day (1978). In a later study, Srivastava (1980) examined the appropriateness of financial services in a particular situation and found it to be relatively stable across situations, thus providing further support for using consumption situations as a basis for segmenting the market. Dickson (1982) combined these previous studies into a call for more research after creating a person/situation segmentation model. Dubow (1992) compared occasion-based and user-based segmentation for the wine market in the US and concluded that the occasion-based segmentation was richer and more relevant for brand positioning and advertising strategy.

Values

Values are responsible for the selection and maintenance of the ends or goals toward which individuals strive (Vinson, Scott and Lamont 1977). A value is a centrally held, enduring belief which guides actions and judgements across specific situations and beyond immediate goals to more ultimate end states of existence (Kamakura and Mazzon 1991). Various combinations of values significantly differentiate individuals (Rokeach 1968). Personal values have a major influence on a person’s lifestyle, interests, outlook and consumption priorities and therefore can play an important role in the development of strategies to understand markets (Muller 1991).

Studies using value orientations to enrich the segmentation process have become increasingly popular (Boote 1981; Holman 1984; Kahle 1986; Muller 1989, 1991; Kamakura and Novak 1992; Blamey and Braithwaite 1997; Thrane 1997; Jago 1998). The most frequently used instrument for measuring values is the Rokeach Value Survey which consists of 18 instrumental values and 18 terminal values (Kamakura and Mazzon 1991). The List of Values (LOV) developed by Kahle (1983) modifies Rokeach’s scale of terminal values into a smaller set of nine primarily person-oriented terminal values more directly related to a person’s daily life roles and situations (Beatty et al 1985; Kamakura and Mazzon 1991) and as such, it has been utilised in a variety of segmentation studies (Kahle 1986; Muller 1989, 1991; Kamakura and Mazzon 1991; Kamakura and Novak 1992; Blamey and Braithwaite 1997; Jago 1998).

In order to identify values and value chains, means-end analysis (Gutman 1982, Reynolds and Gutman 1988) provides a methodological approach used for identifying values as well as the attributes, benefits and consequences related to these values.

Means-end Chains

The means-end chain is a conceptual model that relates salient values of the consumer with evaluative criteria (attributes) of the product (Howard, 1977; Vinson, Scott, & Lamont, 1977; Gutman, 1984). The model offers a procedural guide that establishes linkages connecting values important to the consumer to specific attributes of products, through psycho-sociological and functional benefits called ‘consequences’. A sequence of in-depth probes traces the network of connections or associations in memory that eventually lead to values. This ladder process is accomplished by asking a ‘Why is that most important to you?’ question at each level and uses the response as the basis for the next probe. The process continues until both a consequence and a personal value are elicited from the consumer, or the consumer has no further answers to the probes (Reynolds and Perkins 1987). Gutman’s original model (1982) used situation in the theoretical description as one part of the matrix. Situation was deemed an input to the process of consumer decision-making. However, in various empirical examinations of the model, situation was not included (Reynolds and Gutman 1984; Reynolds and Gutman 1988; Gengler and Reynolds 1989).
Market Segmentation

Market segmentation is the process of partitioning a heterogeneous market into segments. The various segments that are identified should be homogeneous within themselves with respect to critical marketing variables, but heterogeneous in total. Market segmentation may be accomplished using a variety of methodologies (see Struhl (1992) for a review). A frequent problem of using inappropriate marketing variables to partition the total market has been noted by Riquier (1997) who states that variables used as a basis for segmentation are often chosen for their availability, or exotic nature, rather than their relationship to differences in buyer preference. A preferred approach to segmentation therefore requires consumers to be classified into groups according to their likely response to some marketing stimulus, rather than background variables such as age or gender. In this study occasion is used as an a priori basis for segmentation and the factors associated with wine choice are investigated to determine the category of factors that drives wine choice on various occasions.

CHAID Analysis

To determine the factors that drive choice a segmentation modelling approach was adopted. Wine choice for various occasions acted as a convenient dependent variable to guide the segmentation process. Wine is a useful category for segmentation studies, because it offers a wide set of prices, product characteristics, and usage situations. Personal values, consequences and attributes of wine acted as predictor variables. Implementation of the CHAID algorithm operationalized this analysis. CHAID (Chi-squared Automatic Interaction Detector) is a multivariate criterion-based approach to cluster analysis (Magidson 1993). The CHAID algorithm assumes that the population represents a heterogeneous grouping with respect to some dependent variable and divides the population into two or more distinct groups based on the categories of the most significant predictor variable. Statistical significance is measured using the chi-square test of independence. CHAID assesses each of the predictor variables based on the appropriate chi-squared significance test. The categories of the most significant predictor are used to divide the sample into subgroups. Then the next most significant predictor is identified and used to split the subgroups again. Any subgroup, which cannot be further subdivided, because there are no other significant predictor variables or because some user-defined stopping rule is met, becomes a terminal subgroup or segment (Magidson 1993). The CHAID algorithm therefore effectively performs segmentation analysis by dividing the sample population into segments that differ with respect to a designated criterion. In addition the CHAID procedure has the advantage that it also identifies those factors that are most significantly related to the criterion under consideration, in this case – occasion.

METHODOLOGY

This study is based on a sample of wine buyers and was conducted in Melbourne Australia. The product selected for this study is wine. Previous research in occasion-based segmentation has shown that wine is chosen and consumed for different reasons in different situations (Dubow 1992, Lockshin, McIntosh and Spawton, 1997). Wine has a wide variety of attributes and as shown by Dubow (1992), a number of different consequences and values associated with its use. Therefore, the means-end approach adopted for this study used occasion as a factor for each ladder, rather than brand as in previous research. Indeed the seminal article in the means-end chain literature relies on data collected about wine coolers (Reynolds and Gutman, 1988).

A sample of 233 respondents were interviewed using a means-end analysis procedure. A convenience sampling approach was used. Respondents were required to be over 25 years of age and to have consumed the wine, which they had purchased in the last three months. The survey was administered in Melbourne, Australia. The interview schedule was based on the identification of personal values, consequences and values which provided an underlying structure for the in-depth interviews. Trained interviewers were asked to follow the means-end procedure for a specific purchase and consumption situation (some respondents discussed the last two occasions). The interviews thus produced 648 ladders for 356 occasions. Attributes, consequences and values were identified through the interviewing process and confirmed by independent researchers. A realistic representation of age and gender was obtained from the sample. In addition as the and respondents had purchased a variety of both red and white wines, responses were not biased by being wine type specific.

RESULTS

The 356 individual consumption occasions were aggregated into eight specific occasions that summarised and reflected the occasions presented by respondents (Table 1). All three researchers independently classified the individual occasions into the categories. Differences were resolved through discussion. Based largely on the work of Rokeach (1973) the nine terminal values developed by Kahle (1983) were used to measure personal values in this study. The nine personal values are: Fun and enjoyment in life, Being well respected, Warm relationships with others, Self-fulfilment, Security, Self-respect, Sense of belonging, Sense of accomplishment, and Excitement. The values elicited from the respondents were coded to reflect those of the LOV scale.

Most frequently cited attributes, consequences and values

Respondents were asked what had influenced their selection of a particular wine for a particular occasion. Following the interviews, the attributes were categorised. Table 2 shows these categories and the number of chains on which each attribute occurred. Taste (n = 285), price (n = 221), type (n = 215), and brand (n = 111) were the attributes of wine most frequently listed.

Table 3 lists the consequences identified and the corresponding number of ladders. A number of consequences were frequently suggested as a result of attributes associated with selected wines. Selected attributes were indicators of quality - a consequence appearing in most means-end chains (n = 212). Other frequently cited important consequences included: Socialise (n = 168), Complement Food (n = 135), Impress Others (n = 131), Value for Money (n = 123), and Mood Enhancement (n = 118).

Table 4 lists the values (from the LOV Scale) and corresponding number of ladders. All values except Excitement (n = 6) and Sense of Accomplishment (n = 35) were well represented. Fun and enjoyment in life (n = 226) was the most represented value on the means-end chains. Other popular values were: Being well respected (n = 148), Warm relationship with others (n = 121), Self fulfilment (n = 119) and Security (n = 109).

To identify more specifically the factors associated with occasion based consumption of wine, a CHAID analysis was conducted using the buying occasion variable as a binomial dependent variable and the entire set of value, consequence and attribute statements as predictor variables. SPSS Answer Tree® 2.0 was used to estimate a CHAID Tree for each occasion. To illustrate the nature
of the results obtained, three of the resultant trees obtained from the analysis of the eight occasions are included in this paper. The initial node at the top of the tree diagram contains a frequency distribution for the binomial occasion variable.

For example in Figure 1, the total number of individual responses (ladders) equalled 648. Of these respondents 62 had purchased wine for an intimate dinner within the previous 12 weeks. The CHAID procedure then identified the most significant

\[
\begin{array}{|c|c|}
\hline
\text{Occasion Type} & \text{Percentage} \\
\hline
\text{Intimate Dinner} & 9.8 \\
\text{Eating with friends} & 21.7 \\
\text{Eating with family} & 12.6 \\
\text{Business related} & 11.1 \\
\text{BBQ/Outdoor/picnic} & 9.8 \\
\text{Party/Celebration} & 16.0 \\
\text{Drink by self} & 10.4 \\
\text{Casual drink friends} & 8.6 \\
\text{Total} & 100\% \\
\hline
\end{array}
\]

\[
\begin{array}{|c|c|}
\hline
\text{Attributes} & \text{Number of ladders} \\
\hline
\text{Taste} & 285 \\
\text{Price} & 221 \\
\text{Type} & 215 \\
\text{Brand} & 111 \\
\text{Label/Package} & 66 \\
\text{Practical} & 43 \\
\text{Alcohol content} & 38 \\
\text{Region} & 36 \\
\text{Age} & 18 \\
\text{Colour} & 17 \\
\hline
\end{array}
\]

\[
\begin{array}{|c|c|}
\hline
\text{Consequences} & \text{Number of ladders} \\
\hline
\text{Quality} & 212 \\
\text{Socialise} & 168 \\
\text{Complement food} & 135 \\
\text{Impress Others} & 131 \\
\text{Value for Money} & 123 \\
\text{Mood enhancement} & 118 \\
\text{Avoid negatives} & 66 \\
\text{Treat} & 51 \\
\text{Health benefits} & 24 \\
\hline
\end{array}
\]

\[
\begin{array}{|c|c|}
\hline
\text{Values} & \text{Number of ladders} \\
\hline
\text{Fun and enjoyment of life} & 226 \\
\text{Being well respected} & 148 \\
\text{Warm relationship with others} & 121 \\
\text{Self-Fulfillment} & 119 \\
\text{Security} & 109 \\
\text{Self-respect} & 78 \\
\text{Sense of belonging} & 69 \\
\text{Sense of accomplishment} & 35 \\
\text{Excitement} & 6 \\
\hline
\end{array}
\]

TABLE 1
Occasion Classification

TABLE 2
Attributes identified and number of ladders

TABLE 3
Consequences identified and number of ladders

TABLE 4
Values identified and number of ladders
variable that discriminated between those respondents that had and those respondents that had not purchased wine for this occasion. In this instance the value “A warm relationship with others” is identified as being the most significant ($p=0.0001$; Chi-square=14.97; df=1). Using this variable the CHAID procedure then divides the population into two groups; group 0 being respondents that had not identified “A warm relationship with others” as being appropriate and group 1, as those respondents who had identified “A warm relationship with others” as being appropriate. As a result of this division 23 respondents are identified as having both purchased wine for an intimate dinner and responding positively to the value statement “A warm relationship with others”. These respondents account for 18.85% of the 122 respondents who felt that a warm relationship with others was important. In a similar way this group is then divided by the CHAID algorithm according to responses to the next most significant variable, in this case the value of “Self fulfilment”. Finally as a result of the second division a third division occurs using the third most significant variable, a consequence “Complements Food”. Following this division, inspection of the terminal nodes reveals that there are two nodes or segments with relatively concentrated representations of “Intimate dinner” consumers, one node has 44.44% of the node’s respondents while the other node has 31.03% of the node’s respondents.

The results displayed within the CHAID tree can now be used for two purposes. First, if the objective of this research was to target “Intimate dinner” consumers it would now be appropriate to profile the respondents represented within these nodes in order to devise a targeting strategy as these nodes provide the greatest probability of reaching “Intimate dinner” consumers. On the other hand if the objective of this research was to identify the variables that most significantly discriminate between “Intimate dinner” consumers and “non-intimate dinner” consumers, the tree clearly shows that various values are of primary significance followed by a consequence. It should be noted that the relatively small numbers of sample respondents in the terminal nodes is not necessarily of concern as our objective at this point is to identify discriminating variables as opposed to market targets.

Inspection of the remaining CHAID trees revealed a consistent pattern, in virtually all occasion based CHAID trees, values were found to be of primary significance in discriminating between occasion based wine purchases. Various consequences were in—

---

### FIGURE 1

**CHAID Tree for Intimate Dinner**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>90.43</td>
<td>586</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>9.57</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>(100.00)</td>
<td>648</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Value: Warm relationship with others**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>97.01</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.99</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>(20.68)</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**P-value: 0.0185; Chi-square: 5.5443; df: 1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>83.19</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>16.81</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>(17.44)</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Value: Being well-respected**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>93.29</td>
<td>459</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>6.71</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>(75.93)</td>
<td>492</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Consequence: Treat**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>91.90</td>
<td>329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>8.10</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>(55.25)</td>
<td>358</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Value: Self-fulfillment**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>88.10</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>11.90</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>(12.96)</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Consequence: Complement Food**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>92.59</td>
<td>487</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>7.41</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>(81.17)</td>
<td>526</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Value: Warm relationship with others**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>81.15</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>18.85</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>(18.83)</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**P-value: 0.0414; Chi-square: 4.1602; df: 1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>55.56</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>44.44</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>(1.39)</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
variably of secondary importance while attributes were ranked in third place.

For example, using a different situation, the business related occasion, the most important factor discriminating between those who purchased wine for a business related occasion and those who did not, was the value, “Being Well Respected”. Another value “Security” differentiates between those whose ladder had the value, “Being Well Respected” and those that did not. As in the previous analysis, a consequence, “Avoiding Negatives” in this case, discriminates between those who had the value, “Security” and those that did not.

Figure 3 shows that the third occasion also results in a value as being the most significant segmenting variable between those that consumed wine for this occasion and those that did not. “Fun and Enjoyment in Life” not surprisingly was the value that was most significant on this occasion. It was followed by the consequence, “Complement Food” which itself was delineated by another consequence, “Sense of Belonging”.

**DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS**

The results of our investigation using CHAID to develop segments from wine drinking occasions and associated means-end chains has shown that higher order personal values are the best discriminator between different occasions. This adds to our knowledge that values can be used for segmentation (Kahle 1986; Muller 1989; Kamakura and Mazzon 1991; Kamukakura and Novak 1992; Blamey and Braithwaite 1997; Jago 1998). Our work extends this usage to situations rather than individuals. Research on wine has shown that the same person often buys low priced and high priced wines (Lockshin, Spawton and Macintoch 1997). We are better able to account for the fact that the same person often purchases different products by associating the purchase with different usage occasions. Contrary to previous situation research, which focused on the product attributes and situation for segmentation (Green and Rao 1972; Belk 1974; Srivastava, Shocker, and Day 1978; Srivastava 1980; Dickson 1982), our work has found that personal values are a better predictor of the usage situation. The same person typically has multiple terminal values (Kahle 1983), but the importance of each in driving product choice changes with the situation.

The means-end chain approach for eliciting attributes, consequences, and values has been used to develop positioning and advertising messages for differentiating specific brands (Reynolds and Gutman 1984; Reynolds and Gutman 1988; Gengler and
FIGURE 3
CHAID Tree for BBQ or Outdoor Picnic

BBQ/Outdoor/Picnic
Value: Fun and Enjoyment in Life
P-value=0.0002; Chi square=13.5543; df=1
Cat | %   | n  | 0 | 89.97 | 583 | 1 | 10.03 | 65 | Total (100.00) 648
---|-----|----|---|-------|-----|---|-------|----|------------------

Consequence: Complement Food

Value: Sense of Belonging
P-value=0.0271; Chi square=4.8854; df=1
Cat | %   | n  | 0 | 57.14 | 141 | 1 | 42.86 | 18 | Total (1.08) 159
---|-----|----|---|-------|-----|---|-------|----|------------------

Attribute: Color
P-value=0.0161; Chi square=5.7905; df=1
Cat | %   | n  | 0 | 93.19 | 397 | 1 | 6.81 | 29 | Total (65.74) 426
---|-----|----|---|-------|-----|---|-------|----|------------------

Consequence: Quality
P-value=0.0053; Chi square=7.7587; df=1
Cat | %   | n  | 0 | 90.81 | 247 | 1 | 9.19 | 29 | Total (44.98) 276
---|-----|----|---|-------|-----|---|-------|----|------------------

Value: Sense of Belonging
P-value=0.0477; Chi square=3.9196; df=1
Cat | %   | n  | 0 | 73.58 | 39 | 1 | 26.42 | 14 | Total (8.18) 25
---|-----|----|---|-------|----|---|-------|----|------------------

Attribute: Color
P-value=0.0161; Chi square=5.7905; df=1
Cat | %   | n  | 0 | 88.68 | 141 | 1 | 11.32 | 18 | Total (24.54) 159
---|-----|----|---|-------|----|---|-------|----|------------------

Consequence: Quality
P-value=0.0053; Chi square=7.7587; df=1
Cat | %   | n  | 0 | 93.19 | 397 | 1 | 6.81 | 29 | Total (65.74) 426
---|-----|----|---|-------|-----|---|-------|----|------------------

Value: Sense of Belonging
P-value=0.0271; Chi square=4.8854; df=1
Cat | %   | n  | 0 | 57.14 | 141 | 1 | 42.86 | 18 | Total (1.08) 159
---|-----|----|---|-------|-----|---|-------|----|------------------

Attribute: Color
P-value=0.0161; Chi square=5.7905; df=1
Cat | %   | n  | 0 | 93.19 | 397 | 1 | 6.81 | 29 | Total (65.74) 426
---|-----|----|---|-------|-----|---|-------|----|------------------

Consequence: Quality
P-value=0.0053; Chi square=7.7587; df=1
Cat | %   | n  | 0 | 90.81 | 247 | 1 | 9.19 | 29 | Total (44.98) 276
---|-----|----|---|-------|-----|---|-------|----|------------------

Value: Sense of Belonging
P-value=0.0477; Chi square=3.9196; df=1
Cat | %   | n  | 0 | 73.58 | 39 | 1 | 26.42 | 14 | Total (8.18) 25
---|-----|----|---|-------|----|---|-------|----|------------------

Attribute: Color
P-value=0.0161; Chi square=5.7905; df=1
Cat | %   | n  | 0 | 88.68 | 141 | 1 | 11.32 | 18 | Total (24.54) 159
---|-----|----|---|-------|----|---|-------|----|------------------

Consequence: Quality
P-value=0.0053; Chi square=7.7587; df=1
Cat | %   | n  | 0 | 93.19 | 397 | 1 | 6.81 | 29 | Total (65.74) 426
---|-----|----|---|-------|-----|---|-------|----|------------------

Value: Sense of Belonging
P-value=0.0271; Chi square=4.8854; df=1
Cat | %   | n  | 0 | 57.14 | 141 | 1 | 42.86 | 18 | Total (1.08) 159
---|-----|----|---|-------|-----|---|-------|----|------------------

Attribute: Color
P-value=0.0161; Chi square=5.7905; df=1
Cat | %   | n  | 0 | 93.19 | 397 | 1 | 6.81 | 29 | Total (65.74) 426
---|-----|----|---|-------|-----|---|-------|----|------------------

Consequence: Quality
P-value=0.0053; Chi square=7.7587; df=1
Cat | %   | n  | 0 | 90.81 | 247 | 1 | 9.19 | 29 | Total (44.98) 276
---|-----|----|---|-------|-----|---|-------|----|------------------

Value: Sense of Belonging
P-value=0.0477; Chi square=3.9196; df=1
Cat | %   | n  | 0 | 73.58 | 39 | 1 | 26.42 | 14 | Total (8.18) 25
---|-----|----|---|-------|----|---|-------|----|------------------

Attribute: Color
P-value=0.0161; Chi square=5.7905; df=1
Cat | %   | n  | 0 | 88.68 | 141 | 1 | 11.32 | 18 | Total (24.54) 159
---|-----|----|---|-------|----|---|-------|----|------------------

Consequence: Quality
P-value=0.0053; Chi square=7.7587; df=1
Cat | %   | n  | 0 | 93.19 | 397 | 1 | 6.81 | 29 | Total (65.74) 426
---|-----|----|---|-------|-----|---|-------|----|------------------
Reynolds 1989). The same method can be used to develop positioning and advertising platforms for individual brands for specific occasions. For example, a wine can be positioned as a serious and risk-free choice for that important business dinner by visually showing the purchaser achieving respect and assurance for making the right choice of wine. A different wine could be positioned as the perfect drink for that BBQ or picnic by showing the fun and enjoyment inherent in that occasion along with a perfect match for the foods being served. As Reynolds and Gutman (1988) showed in their article, a powerful positioning statement can be made by showing the attributes, consequences, and values linking the brand by means of the most common ladder. The consumers viewing such an ad feel comfortable associating the product with the desired end state values being demonstrated. Our research validates the depiction of specific usage situations along with the means-end chain as a more powerful positioning tool.

Another use for the segmentation we have provided is at the point of purchase. The salesperson in a wine shop or waiter in a restaurant can ascertain the situation for which the wine is being purchased. This can be done through simple questioning in a wine shop or often by observation in a restaurant. It is then possible to suggest the right choice of wine by alluding to the value associated with the situation at hand. For example, a waiter may observe an intimate dinner occasion and suggest a wine that accentuates the mood and feeling by complementing the food and at the same time providing that ‘warm’ feeling.

Our contribution should be evaluated in light of the limitations of this particular research. We have only analysed data for one product category in one major city. Other product categories should be tested before usage situation and terminal values are used indiscriminately for segmentation. It is possible that wine choice behaviour differs in other countries outside Australia and this research should be replicated elsewhere. The sample was a convenience sample of wine drinkers. Although, it had a wide range of demographic characteristics, such as age, income, and amount of consumption, it may not represent Australian wine drinkers on average. Future research might seek to address these issues and build upon them. For example, a series of products might be examined within a number of different cultural contexts.

We have demonstrated the use of personal values as a segmentation variable for distinguishing among products used for different occasions. Our contribution is threefold: first we provide evidence that segmenting on the basis of usage situation is both useful and feasible; second, we show that means-end chains can be used in a CHAID analysis to create the segments; and finally, we found that personal values are the most powerful segmenting variable across the different usage situations.

REFERENCES


Motivations Underlying Commercial Web Sites Censorship: The Third-Person Perception

Fang Wan, Vanderbilt University, U.S.A.
Seounmi Youn, University of North Dakota, U.S.A.
Ronald J. Faber, University of Minnesota, U.S.A.

ABSTRACT

Given the increasingly important role the Internet plays in consumers’ lives, people have become more and more aware of the potential adverse effects of the Internet and have called for regulations and restrictions of some commercial web sites. This study set out to determine why people oppose or support the censorship of commercial web sites. Specifically, this study examined how the perceived impact on self, other adults, and teenagers predicted one’s willingness to censor commercial web sites. The results indicated that people perceive commercial web sites to have a significantly greater effect on others than themselves, and the perceived effects on third-persons were positively related to pro-censorship attitude, even when a host of potentially confounding variables were controlled.

INTRODUCTION

The Internet has become a borderless marketplace for searching for information, purchasing, and exchanging products and services. Recent studies of online users found that at least one third of interactive households used the web to investigate or buy products or services (Moran, 1997), with as many as 70% of regular web users having made one or more online purchase (Magill, 1998). The U.S. spending for online advertising is expected to grow from $1.3 billion in 1998 to $10.5 billion in 2003 (Mand, 1998). Internet-related commerce is projected to increase from $1.9 billion in 1998 to around $4 billion by year 2000 (Jupiter Communications, 1998).

As a consequence of this exponential growth in commercial domains, there have been increasing concerns about “commercial harms” that the Internet supposedly causes (Donnelly 1996). The concerns about the darker side of the Internet have been directed toward a number of web sites considered to be potentially dangerous or harmful to consumers, especially to children or teenagers. These include commercial web sites devoted to activities such as gambling, pornography, and online auctions.

Efforts to prevent the potential harm that the Internet allegedly inflicts on consumers have come from many sources, such as online industry themselves, consumer protection groups, law enforcement, and government agencies including the FTC. Claims of undesirable effects resulted in numerous calls for regulations on Internet content. These regulations include the Child Online Protection Act (COPA) to restrict obscene material to minors (McNeely and Moorefield, 1999), the Project Safe Bid to curtail online auction fraud (Roth, 2000; Snyder, 2000), the Internet Gambling Prohibition Act to ban cyber gambling (Rosen, 2000), and various attempts to preserve consumers’ online privacy (Furger, 2000).

Consumer’s growing willingness to restrict commercial web sites for products or services relies on the belief that these restrictions will help reduce pornography distribution, violations of intellectual-property rights and consumer privacy, new types of crime such as online auction fraud and addiction to online gambling. Critics also believe that these regulations can protect “vulnerable groups” such as children, teens, women, or minors from harmful materials or activities on the Internet.

One example of the attempts to regulate or censor Internet content is the current debate on gambling web sites. As the most popular form of entertainment in US, gambling is moving to the Internet. To date, there are more than 700 unregulated gambling web sites in U.S. (Mainelli, 2000). About 5 million Americans engaged in online gambling or played an online lottery in 1999, according to a survey conducted by non-profit Pew Internet & American Life Project (Mainelli, 2000). In 1999, 100 gambling sites generated approximately $1 billion in revenues (Cato Institute, 2000). These cyber casinos offered everything from casino games to horse and sports betting. Similar to real casinos, cyber casinos allow people to gamble for real money. Unlike real casinos, online casinos are not subjected to industry regulation and scrutiny, and their mostly offshore bases make such regulation difficult if not impossible.

Because offshore gambling operations are beyond the reach of both state gambling and regulatory laws, online gamblers did suffer from the misconducts of Internet gambling operators—their losses are deducted immediately from their online accounts and their winnings often fail to appear (Keller, 1999). In most instances, the individual gambler does not know, or have the resources to determine, who exactly the Internet “house” is, further reducing the guarantee of a fair payout (Keller, 1999).

Moreover, gambling web sites present many other problems—uneasiness about the morality of the activity; the likelihood of addiction; and the possibility of fraud. Questions of morality primarily surface in connection with gambling web sites’ accessibility to children or teens, which are reminiscent of arguments made by the Communication Decency Act (Kish, 2000). Because children or teens have potentially unlimited access to computers and the Internet, it is possible that without proper monitoring they will access gambling web sites. This concern mirrors the concern frequently expressed regarding children’s access to indecent materials. The likelihood of addiction of Internet gambling among both younger consumers and adults is another area of concern. For example, the video game-like nature of virtual casinos, (labeled the “crack cocaine of gambling”), could make online gambling a temptation difficult for children or teens to resist. Furthermore, the easy access and the fact that the visitors of gambling web sites need not leave the comfort and privacy of home could mean that an individual might become easily addicted. Therefore, supporters of a ban of Internet gambling maintain that outlawing the activity for all individuals is the only way to insure that a segment of the population, especially children or teens, will be adequately protected from corruption (Kish, 2000).

The Congress is working on the Internet Gambling Prohibition Act (H.R. 3125) that bans all online “gambling” and will seek to further create federal control over the Internet (McDonald, 2000). Supporters of the bill (antigambling forces) claimed that the legislation would protect U.S. citizens from threats such as fraud, addiction, crime, and moral decline as well as from the dangers of untaxed and unregulated online betting (Mainelli, 2000). Also, they were worried that the expansion of Internet gambling could carry with it potentially devastating results for those Americans who are at risk of gambling addiction or are compulsive gamblers (Birnbaum, 2000). Whereas opponents—the American Civil Liberties Union and online gambling advocates—argued that the federal government erodes civil liberties and rights of computer gamers. However, the language of this legislation is vague enough to allow abuse down the line that could wind up effecting online gaming.
The controversy concerning the regulation of e-commerce and the protection of minors is not limited to gambling web sites. Online auction sites, auctioning everything from oil field equipment to fake human bones, are one of the most hotly debated areas in electronic transactions. According to e-commerce analyst at Forrester Research, by 2003, $19 billion in goods will be sold to consumers through online auctions and other supply-driven dynamic pricing schemes, up from $1.4 billion in 1998 (O’Brien, 2000). Though online transaction via auction sites is booming, eighty-seven percent of the Internet fraud complaints reported by the National Consumer League in 1999 were related to online auctions.

To address the fraudulent practice of online auction, the Federal Trade Commission (FTC) released a consumer alert notifying prospective online auctioneers that fraud was becoming more prevalent. However, the FTC has limited success in policing the auctions and bringing prosecutions of fraudulent merchants. Moreover, little has been done to address whether or not the provider of the online auction site should be held accountable for providing the arena in which fraudulent practice occurs.

Another concern about online auction is the controversial products put on sale. In 1999, a human kidney garnered bids up to $5.7 million on the Internet auction site e-Bay before the firm pulled the plug on the sale (Henderson, 2000). Most auction sites now cooperate with law enforcements to prohibit the sale of endangered species, internal organ of animals, police badges and human organs. However, it is difficult to police other controversial products sold on the net, especially when the bidding of the products is accessible to minors and teenagers. Consumer protection groups advocate for restrictions of online auction sites because the sites are held accountable for online fraud, and controversial products encourage consumers to engage in behaviors that are both “undesirable” at a societal level and “harmful” at a personal level.

However, online industries are worried that these restrictions discourage consumers from participating in online commercial transactions and make the commercial growth shrink in an online marketplace. Not surprisingly, online industries are strenuously arguing for a laissez faire government approach, pursuing an industry self-regulation standard (Snyder, 2000). Furthermore, the opponents of commercial web site regulation asserted that the regulation would deprive adults of the opportunity to acquire lawful products and services.

Lawmakers and e-commerce industry advocates have expressed conflicting viewpoints on censoring commercial web sites and regulating e-commerce. However, little research has been done to examine consumers’ attitude toward censoring commercial web sites. Therefore, the primary purpose of this study is to examine how consumers think about the censorship issue and what kinds of factors underlie their censorship attitudes.

Third-Person Effect

Previous research on the censorship of controversial media content has suggested that people support censorship in part because they perceive other members of society to be vulnerable to these messages. This explanation is frequently referred to as the third-person effect in the field of mass communication.

The third person effect claims that people perceive media messages to have a greater impact on others than on themselves (Davison, 1983). Furthermore, this theory argues that a perceptual disparity between the estimated effect of a media message on self versus others may lead people to support censorship or restrictions on speech (Gunther, 1995; McLeod, Eveland, and Nathanson, 1997; Shah, Faber, and Youn 1999). People may believe that advertising for controversial products does not have any negative effects on them, but fear it will adversely affect others. It is for this reason that they may support censorship on advertising for controversial products in general (Shah et al., 1999). However, little research in the past explored people’s attitude toward censoring commercial web sites promoting or selling products or services. The purpose of this study is to employ the third-person effect and explore people’s attitude toward censoring commercial web sites.

Several studies, across a variety of message topics and methodologies, found that people see a discrepancy between the effects of media on others and on themselves (Lasorsa, 1992; Perloff, 1993; Price & Tewksbury, 1996; Tiedge, Silverblatt, Havice, and Rosenfeld 1991). Research suggests that people are more likely to systematically overestimate the extent to which others are affected by mass media while they are more likely to underestimate the effect on themselves (Gunther, 1991).

Some scholars tried to explain the processes underlying the third-person effect by employing concepts in attribution theory like “fundamental attribution error” and “egotistical” or “differential” attributions (Rucinski and Salmon, 1990; Gunther, 1991). According to the fundamental attribution error, observers generally underestimate other people’s awareness of situational (external) factors such as the persuasive intent of media content and, thus, overestimate others’ susceptibility to the media content. But in judging themselves, observers are quite aware of the role of situational factors like persuasive intent. Due to their awareness, they view themselves as less susceptible to these message effects.

Observers may also engage in egotistical or differential attributions (Miller, 1976; Stephan and Gollwitzer, 1981) or self-preference bias (Perloff, 1993). When a message is deemed negative or when being persuaded by it would be regarded as unintelligent, people perceive the message to have more influence on others in order to enhance their perception of personal invulnerability and control. Individuals may estimate more influence on others in order to preserve self-esteem and a sense of control by seeing themselves as more intelligent. Consequently they deem themselves less susceptible to undesired influence (Gunther, 1991). However, when a message is considered to be positive, people attribute more effect on themselves since they are “smart enough” to recognize its value (Cohen and Davis, 1991; Gunther and Thorson, 1992).

Theorists have examined the conditions that prompt these perceptual discrepancies. Some studies found that there is a greater disparity between perceived effects on the self and others when the source of the message is judged to be negatively biased (Cohen, Mutz, Price, and Gunther, 1988; Gunther, 1991) or when the audience attributes persuasive intent to the communicator (Gunther and Mundy, 1993). Other research shows that those who consider an issue important (Matera and Salwen, 1997; Mutz, 1989), perceive themselves as experts (Lasorsa, 1989), or are highly ego-involved in the message (Perloff, 1989) tend to perceive that others will be more affected by message content. Further, the extent of biased perceptions may increase as the hypothetical others become progressively more psychologically distant from the respondents (Cohen et al., 1988; Cohen and Davis, 1991; Gunther, 1991).

While much research has born out of Davison’s (1983) initial assertion that a bias in perception exists, his contention has received less support that the overestimation of negative or harmful effects of message on others leads people to take some preventive or compensatory action. Most of the initial research examining a behavioral outcome of the third-person effect failed to detect one (Gunther 1991). One explanation for these findings is that people do not exhibit the expected behavior because they view their perspective as different from the opinion of the general public—a spiral of silence effect inhibits their behavior (Mutz, 1989). However, recent
work has linked the third-person effect to a willingness to censor some type of media content such as excessive violence, violent and misogynic rap lyrics, advertising for controversial products or services, or pornography (Gunther, 1995; McLeod et al., 1997; Rojas, Shah, and Faber, 1996; Shah et al., 1999).

Other Factors Affecting Censorship Attitudes

Research on factors contributing to support for expressive rights of the mass media in general or advertising in particular has been rather limited, and often yielded mixed results (Andsager, 1993; Shao and Hill, 1994; Tewksbury, Huang, and Price 1996). Some studies found that attitudes toward censorship are significantly associated with religiosity, authoritarianism, conservatism, and traditional family ideology (Hensen and Wright, 1992; McClusky and Brill, 1983; McLeod, Guo, Huang, Rzeszut and Voakes, 1992; Ritts and Engbreton, 1991; Tewksbury et al., 1996). However, not all studies have found support for these relationships. For example, some studies reported little or no relationship between pro-censorship attitudes and authoritarianism (Schell and Bonin, 1989), or conservatism (Christensen and Dunlap, 1984; Thompson, 1995). One study even found a reverse relationship between conservatism and censorship attitudes (Suedfeld, Steel, and Schmidt, 1994).

Comparable confusion surrounds demographic predictors. Studies have yielded mixed findings regarding the relationship between demographic variables and support for individual and media rights of free expression. Some studies suggested that men are more tolerant of expressive rights than women (Andsager, 1992; Miller, Andsager, and Wyatt, 1992). However, others reported no gender differences (Schell and Bonin, 1989; Tewksbury et al., 1996). Tolerance for speech was also shown to correlate with age and educational level in some studies (Miller et al., 1992; White, 1986); while other studies reported no significant differences based on these variables (Ryan and Martinson, 1983; Schell and Bonin 1989).

It seems that the existing literature on demographic and ideological predictors provides a limited theoretical framework to understand the motivations for censorship of advertising. One commonality across studies appears to be that a willingness to restrict freedom of speech is associated with the belief that the outcome of communications will be negative (Marcus, Sullivan, Theiss-Morse and Wood, 1995; Sullivan, Pireson, and Marcus, 1982). Perceived harmful effects are important in explaining the willingness to censor media content or speech. Therefore, it seems reasonable to expect that the third-person perception holds the most promise to account for the willingness to restrict or prohibit commercial web sites for products or services.

**HYPOTHESES**

The primary purpose of this study is to examine the relationship between the third-person effect and pro-censorship attitudes towards commercial web sites. Specifically, this study explores beliefs about commercial web sites in general as well as two specific commercial web sites that have frequently fueled the censorship debate—online auction sites (e.g., eBay) and gambling sites. These two web sites were chosen because they share some similarity, but differ in some aspects. Both web sites are controversial. As discussed earlier, online auction sites have problems like fraudulent practice or controversial products put on sale. Comparatively speaking, gambling web sites are more controversial due to the nature and the consequence of the service they provide—gambling. Additionally, online auction sites seem to be more beneficial to the consumers than gambling sites. For example, online auction sites provide a new mode of commercial transaction and contribute to the rapid growth of e-commerce because consumers (for B2C site) and companies (B2B site) can bid for and purchase products at significantly lower price than buying them from a distributor or directly from a manufacturer.

Recently, much of the discussion regarding commercial harms the Internet cause is centered on the impact of commercial web sites on children or teenagers because of their vulnerability to promotional messages (Henke 1999). Teenage Research Unlimited (TRU), a Chicago market research firm, reported that 81% of teens were using the Internet (Brown 1999). They used the Internet to search for information, download photos, chat about entertainment starts, or purchase products. As the Internet has become an essential part of their life, they are more likely to be exposed to potentially harmful message posted on web sites or socially undesirable products or services promoted by web sites. Thus, teenagers’ easy access to harmful materials available on the net makes the concerns about the potential impacts of commercial web sites timely and important.

Based on the findings on the third-person effect reported previously, it is expected that third-person effects will occur for general and specific commercial web sites, and the perceived effect will be greater for others, both adults and teenagers, compared to one’s self. Thus, we expect that

H1a: People will judge commercial web sites to have a greater impact on other adults than on themselves.

H1b: People will judge commercial web sites to have a greater impact on teenagers than on themselves.

The next set of hypotheses deal with the relationship between the third-person effect and censorship attitudes. Davison (1983) originally stated that the overestimation of the negative impact on others would lead people to engage in some form of protective action. When messages are thought to have more powerful and harmful effects on others as compared to one’s-self, people may manifest pro-censorship attitudes. An important motivation for censoring a message is the paternalistic desire to protect others from the harmful effects of this message. These beliefs could stem from “biased optimism” (Weinstein, 1989) and/or “self-positivity bias” (Fiske and Taylor, 1991; Raghubir and Monen, 1998), or from attribution errors (Rucinski and Salmon, 1990). As a result, censorship attitudes are predominantly due to a concern that others will be affected by these messages rather than any sense of personal vulnerability. The third-person perception regarding commercial web sites should result in greater support for restrictions on commercial web sites. Accordingly, we expect that:

H2a: The greater the perceived third-person effect of commercial web sites on other adults, the more willing people will be to censor these web sites.

H2b: The greater the perceived third-person effect of commercial web sites on teenagers, the more willing people will be to censor these web sites.

**METHODOLOGY**

Data were collected in a large Midwestern American city during the summer of 2000. Overall, 171 undergraduate students and 103 adults participated in the study. In the student sample, most respondents (90%) were between the ages of 19 and 23. The majority (65%) were females reflecting the general make-up of the
class. Just under half (47%) came from households with an annual family income between $20,000–$59,999. Thirty-eight percent reported their family income as $60,000 and over, while 15 percent reported their family income to be less than $20,000. Students received an extra credit in return for their participation.

Adult respondents were interviewed at an airport in a manner similar to a mall intercept technique. Ages ranged from 17 to 77, with a mean age of 41 years old. Fifty-three percent were women. As for education, 14% completed high school, about half (50%) had attended or completed college, and 36% had attended or completed graduate school. Forty-five percent came from households with an annual income between $40,000–$79,000. One third of respondents (33%) reported an income of $80,000 and over, and 22% reported an income of less than $39,999. These demographic data suggest that the interview at the airport produced a sample that was more educated, and affluent than the general population. However, these differences are also reflective of Internet users in general. Completion time ranged from 20 to 30 minutes for both groups.

Measurement

The survey instrument measured: (1) the third-person effect; (2) censorship attitudes toward advertising to each type of web sites; and (3) control variables including attitudinal or personal values, political affiliation, media use, Internet usage, and demographics.

To assess the third-person effect, this study took the typical approach in the third-person effect literature. That is, respondents were asked in separate questions to indicate how strongly they agree or disagree that each type of commercial web site has a powerful impact on Others, self, and teenagers. The wording of the items was identical except for the first- or third-person connotation. Respondents rated their level of agreement with each item using five-point Likert scales ranging from 1 “strongly disagree” to 5 “strongly agree.” Two kinds of third-person effects were measured for examination: the difference between estimates of an impact on self versus other adults; and on self versus teenagers.

To minimize response reactivity, the order of items measuring “self” and “others” in terms of perceived impact was randomized. Though recent work has demonstrated that question order does not alter measurement of the basic effect (Price and Tewksbury, 1996), the “self” and “others” questions on the third-person effect were randomly arranged throughout the entire questionnaire as an additional safe-guard. Questions regarding each type of commercial web sites were also randomly interspersed to avoid any response bias due to the order of presentation.

Censorship attitudes toward commercial web sites were assessed with two separate items for each type of web site examined. The first one dealt with attitude toward restricting a web site (e.g., “There should be restrictions on auction web sites such as e-bay”), while the other measured the attitude toward an outright ban on commercial web sites (e.g., “Auction web sites such as e-bay should be banned”). Responses were given the same five-point scale. For each type of commercial web site, the two items showed acceptable internal consistency (α=.64 for commercial web sites in general; α=.74 for auction web sites; α=.79 for gambling web sites). Thus, scores from both items were aggregated for subsequent analysis.

To explore other factors that may affect people’s willingness to censor commercial web sites, this study included two attitudinal variables—religiosity and authoritarianism—that had previously been found to influence pro-censorship attitudes. The religiosity scale was measured by four items (e.g., “I very often think about matters relating to religion”) constructed by Putney and Middleton (1961). The authoritarianism scale includes ten items (e.g., “Obedience and respect for authority are the most important virtues teenagers should learn”), developed by Altemeyer (1996). Both scales had acceptable internal consistency with an alpha of .87 for the religiosity and .79 for the authoritarianism. For each scale, individual items were summed for further analysis.

As for other attitudinal variables, innovativeness and general attitude toward web sites were also included because they were expected to have a negative relationship with pro-censorship attitudes toward commercials web sites. The innovativeness scale was estimated with six items (e.g., “I like to experiment with new ways of doing things”) and had an alpha of .71. The attitude toward web sites in general was measured with nine items (e.g., “Commercial web sites are the best place to get information about products and services”), part of which were adopted from the Attitude Toward the Site (Ast) scale developed by Chen and Wells (1999). Cronbach’s alpha of this measure was .72. For each scale, individual items were aggregated for subsequent analysis.

To control for personal experience with web sites, respondents were asked to indicate how much time they spent online in an average day and how many times per month they purchased products or services on the net. To control for other factors that might relate to censorship attitudes, respondents were asked to indicate the amount of local and national TV new watching; their frequency of newspaper reading per week; and to indicate their political ideology (conservative to liberal) and political involvement (least involved to most involved) by using five-point Likert scales. Finally, demographic variables such as gender, age, education, and family income were included.

RESULTS

Hypotheses 1a and 1b predicted that people would perceive commercial web sites to have a greater impact on others than on themselves. To test these hypotheses, paired t-tests were run for each type of web sites. Since the respondents in the study were composed of both adults and students, we ran paired t-test for adult sample, student sample, and the total sample separately for each type of web sites (see Table 1). For all respondents, a significant third-person perception was found for all three sites—commercial web site in general, online auction sites, and gambling web sites. Additionally, significant effects were found when the comparison group was either other adults or teenagers. Therefore, H1a and H1b were supported.

Overall, commercial web sites that promote gambling activities showed the largest disparities between the estimated effect on self versus others. The pattern remained the same when we ran the t-tests for student and adult sample separately or for the combined sample. For example, for the combined sample, the perceived impact on other adults was 1.61 points higher than on self (t=20.64, p<.001) and the perceived impact on teenagers was 1.45 points greater (t=16.77, p<.001). For student sample, the perceived impact on other adults was 1.49 points higher than on self (t=16.41, p<.001) and the perceived impact on teenagers was 1.25 greater (t=12.70, p<.001). The pattern is the same for adult sample, where the perceived impact on other adults was 1.83 points higher than on self (t=12.86, p<.001) and the perceived impact on teenagers led the perceived impact on self by 1.78 points (t=11.34, p<.001). It seems that adult sample tended to show a larger magnitude of third person effect than student sample. The difference here may be due to the fact that when compared to student sample, adult sample tended to have a higher estimation of the impact of gambling web sites on other adults (mean=3.14 for student sample; mean=3.42 for adult sample) and on teenagers (mean=2.90 for student sample; mean=3.37 for student sample).
Motivations Underlying Commercial Web Sites Censorship: The Third-Person Perception

Comparatively, commercial web sites in general and online auction sites produced somewhat smaller discrepancies between the estimated impact on self versus others. For auction sites, the findings of the combined sample showed that the mean difference in the perceived impact between self and other adults was 0.97 points (t=12.11, p<.001) and the mean difference between self and teenagers was 0.61 points (t=0.62, p<.001). When compared to the combined sample, student sample showed a smaller magnitude of third-person effect (mean difference between impact on other adults and self=.86; between on teenagers and self=.46; p<.001); while adult sample demonstrated a larger magnitude of third-person effect (mean difference between impact on teenagers and on self=1.16; p<.001). However, the pattern was reverse when others were adults (for student sample, mean difference=1.05; for adult sample, mean difference=.70; p<.001).

Among three types of commercial web sites examined, the larger third-person gap for gambling is primarily due to less of a perceived effect on self for this type of site. Thus, respondents appeared to believe that they are better able to avoid being effected by gambling sites than other commercial web sites, although they saw other people as being similarly effected by all three types of commercial web site.

Hypotheses 2a and 2b stated that the perceived effect of commercial web sites on others would lead to people’s willingness to censor commercial web sites. The findings in Table 1 revealed a very similar pattern of third-person perception in terms of each type of commercial web sites for student sample only, adult sample only, and the combined sample. Therefore, we combined student and adult sample and conducted regressions to test H2a and H2b (see Table 2). The impact of the first- and third-person variables were analyzed individually as suggested by Stenbjerre and Leets (1997). Censorship attitudes toward each type of commercial web sites served as the dependent variable. Overall, the results demonstrated a linkage between the third-person perception and pro-censorship attitudes. The third-person variables combined with the first-person variable accounted for from 12% to 17% of total variance in the pro-censorship attitudes.

A closer examination of regression results revealed different patterns of how the third-person effects predict pro-censorship attitudes. Specifically, for general commercial web sites, the perceived effect on teenagers ($\beta=.32$, p<.001) appeared as a strong predictor in explaining people’s desire to censor general commercial web sites, but the perceived effect on other adults ($\beta=.08$, ns) for adult sample). The mean difference between adult and student sample in terms of perceived impact on other adults and teenagers are statistically different.

Comparatively, commercial web sites in general and online auction sites produced somewhat smaller discrepancies between the estimated impact on self versus others. For auction sites, the findings of the combined sample showed that the mean difference in the perceived impact between self and other adults was 0.97 points (t=12.11, p<.001) and the mean difference between self and teenagers was 0.61 points (t=0.62, p<.001). When compared to the combined sample, student sample showed a smaller magnitude of third-person effect (mean difference between impact on other adults and self=.86; between on teenagers and self=.46; p<.001); while adult sample demonstrated a larger magnitude of third-person effect (mean difference between impact on other adults and self=1.16; p<.001). However, the pattern was reverse when others were adults (for student sample, mean difference=1.05; for adult sample, mean difference=.70; p<.001).

Among three types of commercial web sites examined, the larger third-person gap for gambling is primarily due to less of a perceived effect on self for this type of site. Thus, respondents appeared to believe that they are better able to avoid being effected by gambling sites than other commercial web sites, although they saw other people as being similarly effected by all three types of commercial web site.

Hypotheses 2a and 2b stated that the perceived effect of commercial web sites on others would lead to people’s willingness to censor commercial web sites. The findings in Table 1 revealed a very similar pattern of third-person perception in terms of each type of commercial web sites for student sample only, adult sample only, and the combined sample. Therefore, we combined student and adult sample and conducted regressions to test H2a and H2b (see Table 2). The impact of the first- and third-person variables were analyzed individually as suggested by Stenbjerre and Leets (1997). Censorship attitudes toward each type of commercial web sites served as the dependent variable. Overall, the results demonstrated a linkage between the third-person perception and pro-censorship attitudes. The third-person variables combined with the first-person variable accounted for from 12% to 17% of total variance in the pro-censorship attitudes.

A closer examination of regression results revealed different patterns of how the third-person effects predict pro-censorship attitudes. Specifically, for general commercial web sites, the perceived effect on teenagers ($\beta=.32$, p<.001) appeared as a strong predictor in explaining people’s desire to censor general commercial web sites, but the perceived effect on other adults ($\beta=.08$, ns)
was not significantly related to censorship attitudes. These findings indicate that the concern about teenagers’ susceptibility to general commercial web sites plays a pivotal role in accounting for pro-censorship attitudes toward these web sites. As expected, the perceived effect on self was not linked to censorship attitudes for general commercial web sites ($\beta=-.09$, ns).

In the case of online auction sites, the perceived impact on other adults ($\beta=.16$, $p<.05$) and teenagers ($\beta=.21$, $p<.01$) were both significantly associated with pro-censorship attitudes. Notably, the first-person variable had a negative relationship with a willingness to censor online auction sites ($\beta=-.16$, $p<.01$), indicating that the larger the estimated impact of auction sites on self, the less willing people are to censor these web sites. The results suggest that people may consider online auction sites have a powerful impact on themselves, but this impact on themselves is not perceived as potentially negative or harmful. Instead, they likely saw the commercial benefits of auction sites to themselves, but the more they saw an impact on others, the more willing they are to censor these sites.

For commercial web sites promoting gambling activities, the perceived impacts of other adults ($\beta=.20$, $p<.01$) and teenagers ($\beta=.28$, $p<.001$) appeared to be strong predictors in accounting for people’s willingness to censor these web sites. The perceived impact on self was not significantly related to censorship attitudes ($\beta=-.07$, ns).

To determine if third-person variables were still predictive of censorship attitudes after controlling for other confounding variables, hierarchical regression analyses were performed (see Table 3). A total of eighteen independent variables were grouped into seven separate blocks. To control for the difference between student sample and adult sample in terms of the attitude toward censorship, we created a dummy variable with 0=student sample and 1=adult sample and entered it as the first block in the regression. Demographics (gender, education, and income), orientational variables (media usage and political orientation), and attitudinal variables (religiosity, authoritarianism, and attitude toward sites) were entered in the second three blocks. Internet usage was included in the fifth block, first-person effects were entered sixth and finally, the two third-person variables were entered in the seventh blocks.

Overall, the full model explained from 21% to 35% of total variance in an individual’s willingness to censor. After controlling for all other variables, the estimated impacts on the third-person variables remained stable for each form of commercial web sites, consistent with patterns found in Table 2.

For general commercial web sites, consistent with prior findings, the estimated effect on teenagers remained a significant predictor of pro-censorship attitudes ($\beta=.28$, $p<.001$), while the estimated effect on other adults was not a significant predictor ($\beta=.04$, ns). The perceived effect on other adults and teenagers accounted for additional 8% of the total variance. In the case of general commercial web sites, student and adult sample showed no significant difference in terms of pro-censorship attitude, as indicated by the insignificant regression coefficient of the dummy variable entered as the first block. Demographic and attitudinal variables accounted for 10% and 15% of the variance, respectively, but orientational and Internet usage variables did not significantly predict pro-censorship attitudes. Women ($\beta=.24$, $p<.001$) were more willing to restrict general commercial web sites than men; more authoritarian people were more willing to censor commercial web sites in general ($\beta=.37$, $p<.001$). Interestingly, the attitude toward the web showed a negative relationship with pro-censorship attitudes ($\beta=.29$, $p<.001$). The result implies that people who had more favorable attitudes toward the web in general were less willing to censor commercial web sites.

For online auction sites, there was no difference between adult and student sample in terms of pro-censorship attitude. Demographic and attitudinal variables accounted for 5% of the variance in pro-censorship attitudes, respectively. Consistent with the results for general commercial web sites, women tended to support pro-censorship attitudes toward online auction sites and people with the more favorable attitude toward sites in general were more reluctant to censor Internet auction sites.

Consistent with prior results in Table 2, the perceived impact on self was negatively associated with an individual’s willingness to censor online auction sites when other variables were controlled ($\beta=-.14$, $p<.05$). After controlling for other variables, the estimated impact on other adults ($\beta=.15$, $p<.10$) had a weaker relationship with pro-censorship attitudes toward Internet auction sites than initially found. Perceived impact on teenagers ($\beta=.15$, $p<.05$) however continued significantly predicting the willingness to censor even after accounting for the influence of all other independent variables. The third-person effects on other adults and teenagers explained an additional 6% of the variance, beyond that explained by the five previously entered blocks. In the case of gambling

### Table 2: Regression of Censorship Scales on First- and Third-Person Effect Variables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pro-Censorship Attitude&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</th>
<th>Commercial Web Sites</th>
<th>Internet Auction Sites</th>
<th>Gambling Web Sites</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Effect on</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self</td>
<td>-.09</td>
<td>-.16**</td>
<td>-.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Adults</td>
<td>.08</td>
<td>.16*</td>
<td>.20**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teenagers</td>
<td>.32***</td>
<td>.21**</td>
<td>.28***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total R&lt;sup&gt;2&lt;/sup&gt;</strong></td>
<td>.13***</td>
<td>.12***</td>
<td>.17***</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

High scale value represents greater willingness to censor

*\(p<.05, **\(p<.01, ***\(p<.001, n=274* for all other variables, the estimated impacts on the third-person

---

<sup>a</sup> For all other variables, the estimated impacts on the third-person

---

<sup>a</sup> For all other variables, the estimated impacts on the third-person...
web sites, student and adult samples showed significant difference in pro-censorship attitude ($\beta=.21$, $p<.01$) and adult sample were more likely to favor censoring gambling web sites than student sample. The dummy variable itself explained 5% of the total variance. The difference between student sample and adult sample may be due to their age, since after controlling for sample difference, age became insignificant predictor of censorship attitude. Demographic variables explained 10% of the variance in the censorship attitudes. Constantly, women were more willing to regulate gambling web sites ($\beta=-.21$, $p<.001$). Notably, attitude toward the web in general was not related to pro-censorship attitudes for gambling web sites ($\beta=-.04$, ns), even though it was significantly and negatively related to pro-censorship attitudes toward general commercial web sites and online auction sites. These results suggest that the attitude toward sites in general might play a different role in explaining pro-censorship attitudes, depending on the degree of the perceived controversy of web sites.

When the censorship for gambling web sites served as the dependent variable, the estimated effect on other adults and teenagers remained to be the significant predictors of people’s willingness

### TABLE 3
Hierarchical Multiple Regression Predicting Willingness to Censor Web Sites

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pro-Censorship Attitudea</th>
<th>Commercial Web Sites</th>
<th>Internet Auction Sites</th>
<th>Gambling Web Sites</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$\beta^b$</td>
<td>$\beta$</td>
<td>$\beta$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group$^c$</td>
<td>.08</td>
<td>-.01</td>
<td>.21***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$R^2 \Delta$</td>
<td>.00</td>
<td>.00</td>
<td>.05***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Demographics</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender$^d$</td>
<td>-.24***</td>
<td>-.14*</td>
<td>-.21***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>-.04</td>
<td>-.06</td>
<td>-.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Income</td>
<td>.04</td>
<td>.02</td>
<td>-.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$R^2 \Delta$</td>
<td>.10***</td>
<td>.05*</td>
<td>.10***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Orientational</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TV news</td>
<td>-.02</td>
<td>.06</td>
<td>.12#</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newspaper</td>
<td>-.04</td>
<td>-.06</td>
<td>.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ideology</td>
<td>.11</td>
<td>.00</td>
<td>.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political involvement</td>
<td>.06</td>
<td>-.09</td>
<td>.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$R^2 \Delta$</td>
<td>.02</td>
<td>.03</td>
<td>.04*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Attitudinal</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religiosity</td>
<td>-.17**</td>
<td>-.09</td>
<td>-.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Authoritarianism</td>
<td>.37***</td>
<td>.10</td>
<td>.37***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Innovativeness</td>
<td>.04</td>
<td>-.07</td>
<td>-.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attitude toward Web</td>
<td>-.29***</td>
<td>-.19**</td>
<td>-.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$R^2 \Delta$</td>
<td>.15***</td>
<td>.05*</td>
<td>.11***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Internet Usage</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hours on the net a day</td>
<td>-.04</td>
<td>.10</td>
<td>-.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buy on the net$^e$</td>
<td>.04</td>
<td>.07</td>
<td>.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$R^2 \Delta$</td>
<td>.00</td>
<td>.02#</td>
<td>.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Effect on</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self</td>
<td>-.00</td>
<td>-.14*</td>
<td>-.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$R^2 \Delta$</td>
<td>.00</td>
<td>.00</td>
<td>.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Effect on</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other adults</td>
<td>.04</td>
<td>.15#</td>
<td>.12#</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teenagers</td>
<td>.28***</td>
<td>.15#</td>
<td>.15*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$R^2 \Delta$</td>
<td>.08***</td>
<td>.06***</td>
<td>.04***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total $R^2$</td>
<td>.35***</td>
<td>.21***</td>
<td>.35***</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. High scale value equals greater intention to censor five controversial web sites.
b. Beta weights from final regression equation with all variables included.
c. Coded as 0=student group, 1=adult group.
d. Coded as 0=female, 1=male.
e. Coded as 0=never bought products on the net, 1=bought on the net in the last month.

# $p<.10$, * $p<.05$, ** $p<.01$, *** $p<.001$, n=274.
to censor (β=.12, p<.10 for other adults and β=.15, p<.05 for teenagers), even after all other independent variables were controlled. The effects attributed to other adults and teenagers explained a significant amount of additional variance in pro-censorship attitudes (R²=.04, p<.01). As expected, no significant relationship was found between the pro-censorship attitudes and first-person effect on self (β=-.02, ns).

**DISCUSSION**

To examine the third-person effect and its relationship with censorship attitudes toward commercial web sites, this study focused on three kinds of commercial web sites: commercial web sites in general, online auction sites, and gambling web sites. These sites were chosen because of growing complaints about undesirable effects of commercial web sites and the concomitant calls for regulation or censorship of them (Roth 2000; Snyder 2000; Rosen 2000).

Consistent with previous work on the third-person effect, this study demonstrated that there was a significant disparity between the perceived effects of commercial web sites on self and others. This is true when other adults and teenagers were used as the comparison group. The third-person effect also emerged when we analyzed student and adult samples separately. The results also provided additional support for the theorized linkage between the third-person effect and pro-censorship attitudes and the findings extended the conclusions drawn for traditional media content to a new medium—commercial web sites.

Although most of the findings were similar for the general and specific forms of commercial web sites, there were some differences worth mentioning. Respondents were more likely to believe that they were personally influenced by general web sites and online auction sites than gambling web sites (M=2.29 vs. 2.37 vs. 1.63, F=56.28, p<.001). Respondents may perceive themselves to be wise enough to avoid being influenced by web sites promoting gambling activities or they may think they were unlikely to encounter such sites.

We also found that student sample yielded a smaller magnitude of third-person effect than adult sample in each type of the commercial web site examined. That is either because adult sample tended to overestimate the impact of commercial web sites on other adults or teenagers, or because student sample tended to overestimate the impact of commercial web sites on self.

Support for censorship also showed significant differences across the three web sites examined. Overall, respondents were less supportive of restrictions for general web sites and online auction sites, while they showed greater support for censoring gambling web sites (M=4.59 vs. 4.18 vs. 5.97, F=106.36, p<.001). Student and adult samples showed difference in terms of censorship attitude only for gambling web sites. That is, adults favored censorship of gambling web sites more than students.

Less support for regulations of commercial web sites in general and online auction sites in particular may stem from the belief that these web sites were seen as having commercial benefits. Consumers go online because they want to search for information about products or services or purchase items. People may perceive these electronic transactions to have positive social consequences. In contrast, people are more willing to regulate gambling web sites because they want to protect children and communities from the problems of addiction, crime, bankruptcy, and family difficulties that come from online gambling (Rosen 2000).

This study examined several important factors influencing people’s attitude toward commercial web sites. Consistent with previous research, gender was significantly associated with a willingness to restrict commercial web sites—women were more in favor of censoring web sites than men (Andsager 1992; 1993; Miller, Andsager, and Wyatt 1992). As to attitudinal variables, this study revealed some interesting findings across the three types of web sites. Authoritarianism was positively related to a willingness to censor commercial web sites in general and gambling web sites. People with a low level of tolerance of socially deviant behaviors, which is one of the major characteristics of authoritarianism, were more supportive of censoring gambling sites as well as general web sites. Such finding suggests that people’s willingness to censor commercial web sites may be due to a predispositional preference. In this situation, the motivation of censorship is more trait-based and inherent of individuals themselves.

Notably, general attitude toward the web emerged as a significant and negative predictor of a willingness to censor commercial web sites in general and auction web sites in particular. These results indicated that the more favorable attitude consumers held toward the Internet in general, the less supportive they were of censoring these sites.

One surprising finding was that Internet usage did not emerge as a significant predictor in explaining pro-censorship attitudes toward web sites. This study included the two Internet usage measures, amount of time consumers spend online in a day and the frequency of buying products or services on the net. When predicting censorship of auction sites, amount of time spent on the Internet approached, but did not reach significance. The findings here contradict the literature that prior product usage has a significant and negative relationship with a willingness to censor advertising for controversial products (Youn, Faber, and Shah, 2000). One explanation is that our Internet usage measure is a global one. In future research, it may be more desirable to use more specific measures of Internet usage (e.g., prior experience with online gambling or auction site) to predict the censorship of a specific kind of web site.

The contribution of this study lies in its attempt to examine the relationship between the third-person perception and people’s willingness to censor or restrict commercial web sites. With regard to commercial web sites in general, the strongest predictor among the third-person variables was the perceived impact on teenage consumers. Respondents were more likely to perceive commercial web sites in general to be harmful to teenagers and such perception resulted in greater willingness to censor commercial web sites. For controversial web sites promoting online gambling, we found that the estimated impact on both other adults and teenagers led to a greater willingness to censor gambling sites. Respondents may perceive that gambling sites have more powerful and negative impacts on both other adults and teenagers because of the easy access, when compared to gambling at casinos or buying lottery tickets at the stores. For both general commercial web sites and gambling sites, the relationship between the third-person variables and pro-censorship attitudes remained stable even after other factors were controlled. As expected, the first-person variable was not related to pro-censorship attitudes toward these sites.

In the case of online auction sites, after controlling for possible confounding variables, the estimated impact on other adults appeared to be a weaker predictor, but was still significantly significant. The estimated impact on teenagers remained a significant predictor in explaining pro-censorship attitudes. Interestingly, the estimated impact on self had a negative relationship with pro-censorship attitudes toward auction sites. One possible explanation is respondents perceived that online auction sites had a powerful impact on themselves, but they did not think the impact was negative. Therefore, the perception of a positive benefit for them-
selves created a desire not to restrict the sites. This is consistent with
the notion that the third person effect occurs only for perceived
negative effects (Gunther and Thorson 1992).

Regardless of different findings across the three types of web
sites, one commonality is a concern about teenagers’ susceptibility
to commercial web sites. A stronger belief that commercial web
sites will have an impact on teenagers leads to a greater willingness
to censor the commercial web sites. The results echo with the
controversy concerning the regulation of Internet content and the
protection of minors, especially children and teens, from harmful
materials on the net (McNeely and Moorefield 1999). Therefore,
our finding resonates with the public’s concern over the impact on
young people.

The study also has some implications for public policy related
to the regulations of commercial web sites. Despite the rapid growth
of e-commerce, people are concerned about the harms or the adverse
effects commercial web sites inflict on consumers. To date,
numerous calls have been made to limit or restrict commercial web
sites. Advocates may believe that regulations help preserve con-
sumers’ online privacy, reduce violations of intellectual-property
rights, curtail online fraud, and protect vulnerable minors from the
harmful materials on the net. However, the contrasting view is that
regulations discourage consumers from participating in electronic
transaction on the net, shrink the commercial growth in an online
marketplace, or deprive adults of the opportunity to obtain informa-
tion of lawful products.

The findings in this study indicate that when it comes to the
regulation of the commercial web sites, consumers are concerned
more about how other people, especially teenagers, are affected by
web sites. It is important for policy makers to separate public
opinion from actual affects when they make policy decisions.

Though it is prevalent that consumers perceive that other
adults and teenagers are potentially affected by commercial web
sites in a negative way, the perception may not be the true reflection
of the reality. Nonetheless, such overestimation prompts a willing-
ness to censor the commercial web sites. Therefore, it remains to be
discovered that whether consumers’ perception of the negative
impact of commercial web sites is a true reflection of reality or a
perceptual bias. A readiness to regulate commercial web sites
based on consumers’ misperception may cause problems in terms of
policy efficiency and consumer protection (Petty 1992). There-
fore, the policy debates on the regulation of commercial web sites
need to rely on the actual effects of commercial web sites rather than
the perceptions of the effects.

REFERENCES
MA.: Harvard University Press.
demographic variables relate to support for freedom of the
press. Paper presented at the Association for Education in
Journalism and Mass Communication, Montreal, Canada.

expressive rights: Development of parallel scales. Paper
presented at the Association for Education in Journalism and
Mass Communication, Kansas City, MO.

Birbaum, J.H. (June, 2000). Wanna bet this bill is really
strange? Fortune, v141, i12, p.70.

tolerance: Testing the effects of cognitive sophistication and

Brandt, A. (2000). Auction payment sites—what do you know
about who’s holding your money. PC World, V18, i7, p64.

Brown, E. (April, 1999). The future of net shopping? Your teens:
Loving Leo online. Fortune, v139, i7, 152(1).

Cato Institute (October, 1999). Gamblers in cyberspace. The
Futurist, v33, i18, p.18.

Chen, Q. and Wells, W. D. (1999). Attitude toward the site,
Journal of Advertising Research, 39, September/October.

and American political ideology: Race and gender differ-
ences, Social Science Quarterly, 65, 861-867.

differential impact in negative political advertising. Journal-

impact of defamation: An experiment on third-person effects,
Public Opinion Quarterly, 52, 161-173.

Davison, W. P. (1983). The third-person effect in communica-

Donnelly, D. F. (1996). Selling on, not out, the Internet. Journal
of Computer-Mediated Communication, 2 (1).

Advertising censorship: factors accounting for a willingness
to restrict commercial speech for legal products. Working
manuscripts, University of Minnesota.

McGraw-Hill, Inc.

World, v18, i3, 33.

Gunther, A. C. (1991). What we think others think: Cause and
consequence in the third-person effect. Communication
Research, 18(3), 355-372.

perception and support for censorship of pornography.

Gunther, A. C. & Mundy, P. (1993). Biased optimism and the

effects of product commercials and public service announce-
ments: Third-person effects in new domains. Communication
Research, 19(5), 574-596.

An Exploratory Study. In D. W. Schumann and E. Thorson
(Eds), Advertising and the World Wide Web, NJ: Lawrence
Erlbaum Associates, 73-80.


toward censorship questionaire. Journal of Applied Social
Psychology, 22, 1666-1675.

Keller, B.P. (1999). The game’s the same: Why gambling in
cyberspace violates federal law. Yale Law Journal, v108, i7,
p1569-1609.

government’s role in addressing Internet gambling. Federal

Journalism Quarterly, 66, 373-378.

Effect, In J. D. Kenname (Ed.), Public Opinion, The Press,
and the Public Policy, New York, Praeger, 163-175.

Magill, K. (1998, August 3). Merchants—not consumers—are
blocking e-commerce, study says. Direct Marketing News,
20, 19-20.


SESSION OVERVIEW

All papers deal with recent retailing phenomena from a behavioural point of view. Swoboda analyses preferences of convenience shoppers and traditional shoppers for different retail formats. He indicates important attributes for retailing strategies focussing on the convenience shopper on the basis of a conjoint analysis. Morschett analyses the question of brand equity from a retailer’s perspective. He develops a model of influence factors on and effects of a retail brand. Terlutter and Diehl use an environmental approach to trade. Terlutter suggests to make more use of the lifestyle when designing trade environments. He recommends to replace the variable personality by the lifestyle in the environment model of Mehrabian/Russell (1974). Diehl offers a model of consumer behaviour for internet stores. She transfers the knowledge gained from real shops to virtual shops taking the specifics of the internet into account.
1. INTRODUCTION

The term “convenience” does not only refer to characteristics that customers should experience with every product or service. Instead it means the convenient purchase of a product (in particular food) which is easy to prepare and generally available in small quantities. Consumption is quick and immediate.

Since the end of the 1970s, convenience has been of enormous significance in the USA and in Japan. Some research was carried out in the early seventies (Anderson 1971) and eighties (Capps et al. 1985); one of the main issues was the link established between convenience and working-wife families (Reilly, 1982; Darian/Klein 1989; Darian/Tucci 1992, Kim 1989 and Yen 1993).

In contrast, convenience is a relatively new consumer trend in Europe. This development contrasts with the low level of knowledge about the trend. A paper attempts to fill the gap. The focus is on convenience-oriented stores—shops at service stations and dedicated convenience-stores—with convenience-products and convenience-services (traditional fast-food and home-delivery services) playing a subordinate role. The analysis concentrates on two main aspects:

- What do consumers expect from convenience-oriented purchases and to what extent are these expectations satisfied by stores?
- How can the target groups and their preferences be characterised?

2. THEORETICAL AND EMPIRICAL EXPLANATORY APPROACHES

The important factors behind the increased consumer focus on convenience reflect social trends. They are associated with consumer desires to improve their quality of life, expressed as “lightening the burden” and in a general reduction in stress along with demands for more leisure time. A framework for recording these determinants differentiates between socio-demographic, psycho graphical, technological, political and legal developments (Zentes/Swoboda 1998).

In order to analyse convenience-oriented purchasing behaviour, it is useful to identify a separate reference framework which initially goes beyond a deterministic examination, i.e. one that takes into account expectations/conceptions and thus the active role of consumers when selecting convenience-oriented shops. Behaviour theory approaches relevant to this selection process or applicable to relevant sets of marketing problems include dissonance, learning and risk theory etc. Gratification research deals with behaviour motivation as a function of the desire for gratification, in other words the aims, needs and expectations of consumers. Out of the numerous gratification approaches (cf. Altheide 1985), it is possible to revert to one elementary model. Expressed in simple terms, it compares the gratification sought with that received. It therefore indicates superficial parallels to the confirmation/disconfirmation paradigm (cf. Yi’s overview 1993).

According to this model, the way people perceive individual alternatives and their assessment of these alternatives influence the gratifications sought. This behaviour leads received gratifications to be perceived as a consequence of it; these in turn reinforce or modify individual conceptions of gratification-linked properties of certain products or points of purchase (cf. with reference to mass communications: Palmgreen 1984). One interesting aspect of this approach is that different gratification expectations are assessed for each specific application. Seen within the context of inadequate knowledge about convenience-purchases it is indeed essential, while nevertheless placing special demands on empirical study design.

Overall, the motives behind the expectation dimensions for convenience-purchases are examined on the basis of a research approach that largely reveals structures and subjective perceptions of similar dimensions. As a logical consequence, these are contrasted with conventional purchases, so that the following questions can be answered: to what extent are different dimensions applied to expectations about points of purchase for convenience and weekly (supply) shopping and do convenience-oriented retail formats satisfy convenience-purchase expectations more efficiently than traditional ones. Initial clues to the competitive factors determining convenience-purchases can be deduced from this.

As emphasised earlier, the crucial factors determining convenience-shopping are linked to social trends, which do not apply equally to all consumer groups, however. This prompts the question of the attributes of the target group for convenience-oriented offers, esp. socio-demographic and psychological attributes.

3. EMPIRICAL FINDINGS

3.1. Results of the preliminary study

In order to determine the factors for rating expectations and assessments vis-à-vis convenience-oriented-offers, consumers were asked in a study to state their reasons (30 items) for selecting particular points of purchase in order of importance. A factor analysis was carried out to select the items relevant for explaining the key attributes. Using the component analysis method, the initial set of items was satisfactorily narrowed down to eight (ct. Swoboda/Morschett 2001). This result, supplemented with expert interviews, was used as the basis for the main studies.

3.2. Results of the main studies

The main studies were carried out during a one-week period (from Monday to Sunday), so that daily variances were adequately taken into account in the results. They covered customers at 90 convenience-stores. 658 consumers were surveyed using conventional questionnaires and a further 535 were interviewed by means of a laptop-supported conjoint measurement. The respondents were chosen randomly.

3.2.1. Results of the conventional interviews

The first step was to analyse possible differences between consumers’ expectations about their weekly shopping and about convenience-purchases and then to examine whether, when they make convenience-purchases, their expectations about convenience-shops and traditional retail outlets are satisfied in different ways. The consumer assessments, summarised in Table 1, reveal long opening hours and the fact that purchases can be completed quickly as the dominant expectations of convenience-purchases. As far as weekly shopping is concerned, friendly service and price are more important.

According to the gratification approach, expectations about convenience-purchases then had to be compared with assessments of the convenience-shops. Supermarkets were selected as the traditional format, and the expectation and perception assessments were subtractively linked. The results reveal that (Table 2):
When convenience-shops are compared with supermarkets, different levels of gratification are found in all expectation dimensions. Convenience-shops satisfied consumer expectations about convenience-purchases better than supermarkets in three dimensions.

3.2.2. Results of the conjoint analysis

A conjoint measurement demands “trade-off” decisions from respondents. Based on combined judgements, the conjoint analysis calculates the contribution of each store attribute (partial benefits) to the overall preference judgements vis-à-vis stores. This method is hence more “realistic” than direct interviews. The eight identified attributes were used for the measurement (Table 3).

A total 1728 possible store profiles could be constructed from these manifestations. Preferences were measured by choosing interview rankings specified by Adaptive Conjoint Analysis—according to Wittink et al. (1994), Europe’s most common program—based on the respondents’ replies. ACR allows consumers to eliminate right from the outset those store attribute manifestations they reject for shopping purposes. The importance of the attribute dimensions selected by the program was then surveyed and compositionally apportioned before choice decisions between individual and combined store attributes were arrived at in a series of decompositional analyses.

The analysis reveals partial preference functions. Since the benefit values are comparable for all attributes, the benefit ranges shown in Table 4 indicate the relative importance of each one. On
that base the overall benefit values of different store type can be determined. Its usefulness for describing customer preferences is limited, though, because information about segment-specific preference structures is lost.

3.3. Segment-specific analysis

3.3.1. General results

A discriminant analysis was carried out in order to gain precise information about the contribution of gratification considerations towards explaining decision-making processes. A comparison was drawn between those who frequently make convenience-oriented purchases (at least once a week) and those who only do so occasionally. All the gratification dimensions listed proved to isolate the groups (Wilks’ Lambda=0.79; canonical correlation=0.43; chi²=72.51). The standardised discrimination coefficients confirm that long opening hours, additional services and the quickly purchase are the most important variables. The discriminant analysis performed for the conjoint yielded no new results. The respondents were subdivided into three groups by means of a cluster analysis.

The identified customer groups exhibit different preferences (Table 5):

- To the members of cluster 2 the price level is by far the most important aspect, all other store attributes being comparatively insignificant (26% of respondents).
- Cluster 3 is characterised by a customer group (35% of respondents) that attaches most importance to the purchase duration and to opening hours.

Overall, the clusters differ as regards the store attributes, so that it appears possible to delimit and systematically process customer segments on the basis of the conjoint data.

3.3.2. Attributes of convenience-shoppers

Convenience-shoppers tend to be male and younger (aged under 34), relatively affluent, living in one and two-person households, better educated and self-employed (significant results). Their attitude towards convenience is more positive; they go shopping more often per week; they spend a higher proportion of their household budget on food; they exhibit very little sensitivity to price and they tend to plan their purchases (in convenience-stores) in advance.

On the base of the ACR-solution it was possible to verify the extent to which the evaluated judgements (preferences) are reflected in real purchase behaviour (cf. attitude-behaviour hypothesis). The preference structure is significant for the choice of store (supermarket or convenience-store), as is the frequency with which each customer group shops in the various retail formats.

### TABLE 3
Relevant Store Attributes and their Manifestations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Store attributes</th>
<th>Attribute manifestations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Presentation of goods</td>
<td>Exciting, plain presentation, goods purchased from cardboard boxes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Additional services</td>
<td>Additional services offered, not offered¹</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality of offer</td>
<td>High offer quality, average offer quality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchase duration</td>
<td>Possible to purchase quickly, shopping is time-consuming</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Price level</td>
<td>Supermarket prices, 10 %, 25 %, 50 % above supermarket prices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assortment</td>
<td>Predominantly packaged products, packaged and fresh products</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service</td>
<td>Friendly service, unfriendly service, self-service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opening hours</td>
<td>Weekdays 9 a.m. to 6.30 p.m., weekdays 7 a.m. to 8 p.m., 24 hours/7 days</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

¹Real additional services were proposed in the empirical survey.

### TABLE 4
Relative Importance of Store Attributes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Store attributes</th>
<th>Benefit range</th>
<th>Benefit share in %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Presentation of goods</td>
<td>0.39–0.05=0.34</td>
<td>8.53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Additional services</td>
<td>0.32–0.08=0.24</td>
<td>5.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality of offer</td>
<td>0.55–0.05=0.50</td>
<td>10.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchase duration</td>
<td>0.84–0.05=0.79</td>
<td>17.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Price level</td>
<td>1.00–0.04=0.96</td>
<td>21.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assortment</td>
<td>0.33–0.09=0.24</td>
<td>5.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service</td>
<td>0.96–0.02=0.94</td>
<td>20.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opening hours</td>
<td>0.54–0.03=0.51</td>
<td>11.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>4.57</strong></td>
<td><strong>100.00</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### TABLE 5

Importance of the Store Attributes in the Three Clusters

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PB=Partial benefits</th>
<th>Overall PB</th>
<th>Cluster 1 PB</th>
<th>Cluster 2 PB</th>
<th>Cluster 3 PB</th>
<th>Diff. Sign.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Presentation of goods</strong></td>
<td>0.34</td>
<td>0.38</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>0.31</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchase from cardboard boxes</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plain presentation</td>
<td>0.08</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>9.0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exciting presentation</td>
<td>0.39</td>
<td>54.4</td>
<td>28.3</td>
<td>38.7</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Additional services</strong></td>
<td>0.24</td>
<td>0.20</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>0.28</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Additional services A</td>
<td>0.32</td>
<td>10.4</td>
<td>11.1</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Additional services B</td>
<td>0.08</td>
<td>35.9</td>
<td>28.7</td>
<td>35.6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Quality of offer</strong></td>
<td>0.50</td>
<td>0.48</td>
<td>0.27</td>
<td>0.57</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average quality</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High quality</td>
<td>0.55</td>
<td>64.6</td>
<td>45.6</td>
<td>62.7</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Purchase duration</strong></td>
<td>0.79</td>
<td>0.73</td>
<td>0.45</td>
<td>0.95</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shopping is time-consuming</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Possible to purchase quickly</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>96.6</td>
<td>72.6</td>
<td>106.6</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Price level</strong></td>
<td>0.96</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>0.99</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50 % above supermarket prices</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25 % above supermarket prices</td>
<td>0.39</td>
<td>37.7</td>
<td>60.0</td>
<td>33.8</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 % above supermarket prices</td>
<td>0.73</td>
<td>77.4</td>
<td>103.6</td>
<td>62.2</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supermarket prices</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>102.0</td>
<td>145.2</td>
<td>85.2</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Assortment</strong></td>
<td>0.24</td>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Packaged and fresh products</td>
<td>0.33</td>
<td>30.5</td>
<td>22.8</td>
<td>36.6</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Predominantly packed products</td>
<td>0.09</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Service</strong></td>
<td>0.94</td>
<td>0.99</td>
<td>0.52</td>
<td>0.88</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unfriendly service</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-service</td>
<td>0.73</td>
<td>87.7</td>
<td>67.1</td>
<td>75.1</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friendly service</td>
<td>0.96</td>
<td>125.3</td>
<td>80.0</td>
<td>95.9</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Opening hours</strong></td>
<td>0.51</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>0.89</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weekdays 9 a.m. to 6.30 p.m.</td>
<td>0.03</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weekdays 7 a.m. to 8 p.m.</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>22.0</td>
<td>19.1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24 hours and 7 days</td>
<td>0.54</td>
<td>22.9</td>
<td>54.7</td>
<td>98.4</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Significance-levels: 0.05=*; 0.01=**; 0.001=***

---

### 4. OUTLOOK

There is only room here to mention a few of the many conclusions—concerning both content and method—that could theoretically be drawn from the analysis. Regarding customers’ gratification considerations when comparing convenience-oriented purchases with weekly shopping, the arguments of long opening hours and fast, convenient-purchasing predominate. Convenience-oriented retail outlets satisfy consumer expectations about purchasing speed and opening hours. These are their key competitive advantages over traditional retail outlets such as supermarkets.

### REFERENCES


_Rundfunk und Fernsehen_, 1, 51-62.
1. INTRODUCTION

This study analyzes the brand concept with regard to the branding object “retail company”. It looks into the establishment and the effects of a retail brand as well as into the measurement of the brand equity.

The importance of retail brands enhances, since retail marketing has developed substantially in the last years and takes a more strategic focus (cf. Mulhern 1997). One consequence is, that the branding concept is being utilized in the marketing strategies, whereby the branding objects are retail outlets (cf. Liebmann/Zentes 2001, p. 87).

In this field, important deficits of existing research can be seen:

• Surveys dealing with brands and brand equity mainly focussed on (consumer) goods. There exist almost no surveys dealing with retail stores and their branding.
• There is still no commonly agreed upon concept for the measurement of brand equity.
• Even though an “integrated” marketing has often been demanded, most studies focus on the isolated effects of single marketing instruments. The interdependency and its effects have rarely been looked into.

This study analyzes the establishment and the effects of a retail brand as an S-O-R-process. It considers the perception of the marketing instruments by the consumer as the stimulus (S), and the brand equity as an intervening variable (I), that affects the behavior of the consumer (R).

2. PERCEPTION OF RETAIL MARKETING INSTRUMENTS

2.1. Evaluation

The concept of the retail brand seems to have a lot in common with the store image, a phenomenon, that has been intensively analyzed (see Osman’s overview 1994).

Most authors have emphasized the holistic character of the store image. They pointed out that the image is more than the sum of its parts and that there is substantial interaction among attributes (cf. Keaveney/Hunt 1992). Considering those definitions, the retail brand is closely connected with the store image. However, aspects that are relevant for the brand, such as awareness, salience and uniqueness, are in most cases not taken into account in the store image research (see e.g. Osman 1994).

However, there are more substantial differences, when one looks into the operationalization. Here, the interdependency between the store attributes and the holistic character is usually not taken into account (cf. Keaveney/Hunt 1992, p. 165). In most cases, store image is seen as the rational evaluation of a store through a multiattributive function (cf. Osman 1994). Store image measured that way represents the cognitive and rational evaluation of a brand rather than the holistic brand phenomenon.

But even for this purpose, one should take into account the simplification of consumer’s evaluation processes. Often consumers are not able to judge object attributes independently. Information chunking and irradiation effects lead to higher-than-actual correlations (cf. Kroeber-Riel/Weinberg 1999, pp. 298ff.).

2.2. Fit of the retail marketing instruments

The retail brand requires a comprehensive, integrated marketing concept for retailers. A brand should be a consistent entity. The “fit” means the avoidance of contradictions, because a strong brand can only be achieved with a combination of attributes that are compatible.

To develop a scale for the fit of the marketing mix, a pilot study was carried out, in which a telephone survey was used to collect the data for 13 indicators for the theoretical construct “fit”. On this basis, the number of indicators was systematically reduced, considering the comprehensibility by the respondent and also the item-to-total-correlation and Cronbach’s alpha. The remaining six indicators (consistent marketing, combinations of: communication/assortment, communication/service, store/expectations, quality/expectations, and combination of all marketing instruments) obtained a Cronbach’s alpha slightly above 0.7 in the pilot study. This was accepted to be sufficiently reliable and the (only) factor in an exploratory PCA was used as a measure for the fit.

3. BRAND EQUITY

The quantification of the “value” of a brand emerged as an important research topic in the late 80s. However, there is still no agreement on how to measure brand equity (cf. Silverman et al. 1999). An important impulse for the discussion came from Keller’s (1993) consumer-oriented brand equity concept. Sattler (1995) gives an overview on potential brand equity indicators. As the most suitable for this study, the indicators awareness, uniqueness, sympathy, trustworthiness, brand loyalty (attachment and willingness to recommend), and the vividness of the (visual) brand image are used.

Following Keller’s approach, many authors considered the consumer-oriented brand equity to be made up of two dimensions: the brand appreciation (Keller’s “brand image”) and the brand awareness. The same approach has been transferred to the brand equity of a retail brand (cf. Esch/Levermann 1993). This structure will be analyzed empirically in this study:

\[ H_{BE} \]: The consumer-oriented brand equity of a retail brand consists of two basic dimensions: the awareness and the appreciation of the brand.

4. THEORETICAL RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN THE CONSTRUCTS

While the evaluation of the marketing instruments is seen as one of the dominant influence factors for the brand equity (cf. Bekmeier-Feuerhahn 1998, pp. 153-155), it is not discussed in great detail in this paper, since the focus is more on the integration of the marketing mix as an influence factor.

Several theoretical explanations could be given for the influence of the fit on brand equity. According to the theory of cognitive equilibrium, every consumer strives to achieve a consistent, in other words compatible and harmonious, combination of inner experiences, cognitions and attitudes (Kroeber-Riel/Weinberg 1999, pp. 181ff.). Other approaches can be based on the concept of the
The following hypothesis is formulated:

\[ H_{Fit-BE} : \text{The perceived fit of the retail marketing instruments influences the retail brand equity positively.} \]

The retail brand equity in this paper is considered to be on an individual consumer basis. It is an attitudinal measure, that—in contrast to some other brand equity concepts—does not include behavioral aspects. A separation between brand equity as an intervening variable and actual purchasing behavior is made. However, an influence from the brand equity on the store choice has been shown in several studies (see for an overview: Woodside/Trappey 1992, p. 76). Therefore, the following hypothesis is formulated:

\[ H_{BE-PB} : \text{The consumer-oriented retail brand equity influences the purchasing behavior.} \]

### 5. EMPIRICAL FINDINGS

For the empirical study, 560 consumers in one German city, Saarbrücken, have been surveyed. The study was carried out in November/December 2000 with oral interviews.

#### 5.1. Evaluation of the marketing instruments

In a first step, a principal component analysis was used to extract the central factors behind the evaluation attributes. The PCA (using oblimin rotation) resulted in three factors: (1) Quality of Performance, (2) Scope of Offer/Convenience, (3) Price Level. The analysis showed weak, but significant correlations between them: \( r_{1,2} = 0.096; r_{1,3} = 0.156; r_{2,3} = 0.166. \)

#### 5.2. Brand equity

To test two-factor structure of brand equity a PCA with an oblimin rotation was carried out. Before, the mentioned indicators were analyzed for their suitability as brand equity indicators. The “visual brand image”, being measured on a Marks-scale, showed a low ability to discriminate between the stimuli. For seven different retail companies, the difference between the indicator values was significant, but the F-value of the variance analysis was only 5.864, and the Scheffé-test showed, that only a single retail brand differed from the others on this scale. Therefore, this indicator is not used in the further analysis.

The PCA results in two factors (see Table 1) and the variables, that load high on these factors allow the interpretation as brand appreciation and brand awareness.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor 1</th>
<th>Factor 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brand Appreciation</td>
<td>Brand Awareness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sympathy</td>
<td>.858</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trustworthiness</td>
<td>.823</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attachment</td>
<td>.763</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Willingness to Recommend</td>
<td>.710</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uniqueness</td>
<td>.617</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recall</td>
<td>.146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. of Top-of-Mind-Associations</td>
<td>.746</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Rotation: Oblimin with Kaiser normalization. Values absolutely below 0.1 are not shown.

#### 5.3. Perception and brand equity

Next, the influence of the perceived fit of the marketing mix on the brand equity is to be analyzed. Here, a regression analysis shows a clear influence. Taking the measure for the perceived fit as the independent variable, and the brand appreciation as the dependent, a beta of 0.814 and a determination coefficient \( r^2 \) of 0.66 show, that the appreciation is substantially influenced by how fitting (or consistent) the consumer perceives the retail marketing instruments. A much smaller, but significant influence can be shown on the brand awareness (\( \beta = 0.14, r^2 = 0.02 \)).

With these analyses, we may accept \( H_{Fit-BE} \). The perceived fit has a positive influence on the brand equity of the retail company.

Together with the influence of the evaluation of the marketing instruments, the simultaneous influence of the perception (evaluation and fit) on the brand equity is analyzed in a causal model.

Since there were a number of missing values in the data set, AMOS does not calculate values for the global fit measures GFI, AGFI and RMR. However, there is quite a large number of established alternative fit measures, on which Homburg/Baumgartner (1998) give an overview.

As the results show, all of the used global fit measures show that the model fits the empirical data very well. All of the requirements are met, so that there can be confidence in the appropriateness.
of the specified model. It is also shown that the fit has a strong influence on the brand appreciation, even stronger than the dimensions of the evaluation.

5.4. Brand equity and purchasing behavior

Since the brand equity in this model is understood to be an intervening variable, the success of the retail company has to be measured separately on the basis of the individual consumer's purchasing behavior. As indicators for the purchasing behavior, the share of food expenditure at the observed retail company and the frequency of visits was used.

A regression analysis shows, that a rather high share of variance in the purchasing behavior can be explained by the variance in the brand equity dimensions. $r^2$ is 0.373, whereby the brand appreciation has a much stronger influence on the purchasing behavior than the brand awareness (beta=0.567 vs. beta=0.166).

As a result, substantial effects of the retail brand equity on the purchasing behavior are confirmed, so that the hypothesis $H_{BE-PB}$ may be accepted.

Woodside/Trappey point out, that most studies on the influence of the store attribute evaluation on the store choice explain between 15-20 percent of the variance (cf. Woodside/Trappey 1992). This supports the suggestion, that the "indirect" approach, with the retail brand equity as an intervening variable greatly enhances the explanatory power.

To analyze the important relationship between brand equity and brand success simultaneously with its operationalization, the following causal model is tested.

Correlations between the exogenous latent variables are not shown for reasons of clarity.

**TABLE 2**

Global fit measures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Fit Measure</th>
<th>Required Value</th>
<th>Value of the causal model</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CFI</td>
<td>$\geq 0.9$</td>
<td>0.956</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NFI</td>
<td>$\geq 0.9$</td>
<td>0.948</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TLI</td>
<td>$\geq 0.9$</td>
<td>0.940</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IFI</td>
<td>$\geq 0.9$</td>
<td>0.956</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3 shows the global fit measures for the causal model. As the results show, all of the used global fit measures show that the model fits the empirical data very well, so that the relevance of the brand equity for the actual shopping behavior can be confirmed.

6. CONCLUSION

For retail brands, the two-dimensional measure, that has been postulated for consumer-oriented brand equity, has been confirmed. Also, the behavioral effects of this brand equity have been shown. Concerning store image research, it was made clear, that the store image has often been operationalized rather as a cognitive evaluation of the retail brand than in accordance with the holistic definitions of image or the brand equity.

As an important result of the study, the importance of the perceived fit of all marketing instrument has been shown. For the specific branding object “retail outlets”, this study gives first hints towards the measurement of the fit of the marketing instruments and its effects.

REFERENCES

1. THE EMOTIONAL APPROACH TO ENVIRONMENTAL PSYCHOLOGY

The (classic) emotional approach of environmental psychology is based upon the fundamental notion that emotions determine human behavior (Mehrabian, 1978, p. 14f.). A certain environment evokes emotional reactions in a person which in turn, cause a person to more or less approach this environment (Mehrabian, 1978, p. 15). According to Ittelson (1973, p. 16), the first reaction to an environment is affective and, in general, determines the behavioral tendency expressed in connection with an environment.

1.1. The classic environment model

Based upon the aforementioned considerations, Mehrabian/Russell (1974) developed a psychological environment model representing the effects of environmental stimuli and personality factors on primary emotional reactions and, consecutively, on behavioral reactions in form of approach and avoidance (Figure 1).

Following the model, an environment produces reactions to the three dimensions pleasure, arousal, and dominance described as primary emotional responses. Holders of the psychological environment model attribute the inconsistent reactions of persons shown in identical environments to differences in personality. In their opinion, inconsistencies might arise in the three dimensions of emotional reactions as named above. However, de facto only differences in the arousal dimension are taken into consideration.

In trade, above all, the Mehrabian/Russell model was applied. Donovan/Rossiter (1982) are among the first ones transferring parts of the model to (retail) trade. Many research papers, e.g. by Anderson (1986), Donovan et al. (1994) or Gröppel-Klein (1998) followed. Studies in cultural institutions are based upon this model as well (Terlutter, 2000). Often, only parts of the model were tested partly relinquishing the consideration of the personality as influence variable.

The goal of this contribution is to show that it is more advantageous for the application in the trade to use consumers’ lifestyles in place of personality. Lifestyle is a variable with numerous advantages with regard to the explanation of behavior in a given environment. This is why a modification of the psychological environment model is suggested.

1.2. The meaning of lifestyle in the environmental setting

Generally in marketing, but also in the literature of environmental psychology, the orientation on the consumers’ lifestyles plays an important role (e.g. Banning, 1987; Terlutter, 2000; Diehl, 2001). Gröppel (1995, col. 1021) e.g. emphasizes that the goal of the emotional store setting in retail trading should be the development of a pleasant, varied store atmosphere appealing to the visitor or customer in his/her lifestyle. Closely adhering to the visitor’s lifestyle seems to contribute to achieve a higher approach behavior of the visitor.

2. MODIFICATION OF THE PSYCHOLOGICAL ENVIRONMENT MODEL

2.1. Advantages of lifestyle compared with personality as influential factor

Although literature demands to adjust the environmental setting with lifestyle, the lifestyle variable is not being considered in the psychological environment model by Mehrabian/Russell. Instead, personality is used as influence variable.

On closer inspection of the advantages of lifestyle or personality as influential factors in the psychological environment model, the following results are shown in summary:

– The survey of personality in the psychological environment model as carried out up to now shows deficiencies. According to Mehrabian/Russell (1974, p. 30), the most important differences in personality are to be derived from the dimension arousal. This predisposition in personality can divide individuals in their most extreme markedness into arousal-seekers and non-arousal-seekers. The arousal-seekers perceive more stimuli in a pleasant environment than the non-arousal-seekers and are more easily aroused by a certain environment. Arousal has an intervening influence on pleasure.

If differences in personality are taken into consideration, research up to now focuses on the arousal dimension. The effects of differences in the dimensions pleasure and dominance are mainly neglected. This is highly surprising insofar as the dimension pleasure is considered to have the highest predictive power with regard to behavior (Donovan/Rossiter, 1982, p. 52). To explain varying reactions to an environment, not only personality differences with regard to arousal have to be taken into account. Human personality is formed by individual (i.e. biological or physiological predispositions) and by environmental (cultural and social settings) determinants (Banning, 1987, p. 97; Terlutter, 2000, p. 45). The praxis for the personality survey restricted to the dimension arousal, therefore, has to be considered with reserve.

– For the application in marketing, the personality is too general a variable. According to research in lifestyle, the data collection on a general variable as the general lifestyle is not very promising for the analysis of consumer behavior. Thus, it may be supposed that the collection of data on the (general) personality might be of disadvantage. Numerous possibilities for a specific product survey for lifestyle render much more specific information for consumer behavior.

– Lifestyle is a variable widely spread in marketing and trade (Weinberg/Terlutter, 1999). Thus, the lifestyle is a better known and more “tangible” variable than personality for the praxis of decision makers.

– Lifestyle does not exhibit as many operationalization problems than personality. Personality as a hypothetical complex variable is difficult to operationalize. On the other hand, lifestyle criteria can be collected through observable behavior (Kroeb-Riel/Weinberg, 1999, p. 547) and is easier to ascertain.

– Since personality is an important decision factor for the lifestyle (Banning, 1987; Terlutter, 2000), personality aspects relevant for lifestyle and therefore also for marketing are implicitly ascertained when lifestyle data are collected. If the goal of the environment setting is to appeal to the customer’s lifestyle, lifestyle as influencing factor offers more accurate information for the environment setting than the individual’s personality. For example, if a person’s lifestyle is featured by activity, it may be immediately inferred that activity opportunities should be offered in the environment setting. Is an individual’s lifestyle characterized by communication, preferences for a communicatively formed environment will be triggered in this person.
Therefore, it seems considerably advantageous to modify the Mehrabian/Russell model in so far as to apply instead of the personality factor, the lifestyle as influence variable. This modification permits to represent consumer behavior more accurately. Moreover, this model allows a more practicable application in the trade and offers instantaneous links for a market segmentation by forming lifestyle groups.

2.2. Empirical results for the influence of lifestyle

To test the influence of lifestyle on the emotional and behavioral reactions the following empirical results from the cultural field may be used for comparison (comp. in detail Terlutter, 2000). It may be supposed that these results can be used for the trade sector as well.

Tests were carried out for three lifestyle groups identified empirically:

Lifestyle group 1: “The emotional type”: This group showed an active, social, communicative, and modern lifestyle.

Lifestyle group 2: “The prestigious and educated type”: This group showed a more traditional character and preferred prestige and education. This group was highly exteriorly oriented.

Lifestyle group 3: This third group showed little interest in cultural institutions and should only be considered marginally. They were called the “cultural grouch”.

With regard to their reactions, these three lifestyle groups were tested in two differing (cultural) environments:

Environment A: “The traditional concept”: This concept was a “typical” museum (uniform structure, big show rooms etc.); comparable with a soberly furnished store.

Environment B: “The modern concept with emotional aspects”: The interior of this museum was emotionally appealing and should especially meet the needs of lifestyle group 1 (rooms of varying size, stimulating colours, etc.); comparable with an emotionally designed store.

The variables of the primary emotional reactions pleasure and arousal as well as the intended approach as behavioral variable were ascertained (the dimensions pleasure and arousal of the primary emotional reactions were combined).

Multifactorial variance analyses show the influence by environment and lifestyle on the variables in question (Table 1).

As shown by the above Table 1, both isolatedly and jointly, the two factors environment and affiliation to a lifestyle group exert a highly significant influence upon the perceived pleasure and arousal. The environmental influence is stronger than that of the affiliation to a lifestyle group. The lower part of Table 1 shows the average characteristic of pleasure and arousal experienced in the environments classified in lifestyle groups. Positive values in the table signify a characteristic of the dependent variables above average, negative values a characteristic of the dependent variables below average.

According to the results of Table 1 and the following tables, the emotionally designed concept arouses higher positive reactions than the traditional concept in all the groups.

In this context, the value denoted as “Increase” in this table is of high interest. This value shows how much better the single groups experience and/or evaluate the emotional museum (environment B) compared with the traditional museum (environment A).

This shows that the emotional lifestyle group realizes a significantly higher increase (1.48) than all the other visitors (0.76 and 1.00 respectively). They experience the emotional and modern concept (environment B) as significantly more pleasurable and exciting than the traditional concept (environment A).

In the intended approach to the environment, both in isolation and in combination, the kind of environment and the affiliation to a lifestyle group are influential (Table 2).

As clearly represented in Table 2, the emotional individuals show a significantly higher intended approach to concept B compared with concept A than the other lifestyle groups. This again proves the applicability of lifestyle as influential factor on behavior in environments.

Comparing the influence of the environment with the influence of the lifestyle, the environment setting exerts a higher influence on the emotional reactions pleasure and arousal and on the behavioral reactions. The influence of lifestyle on the variables in question is also significant.

Summarizing, it may be ascertained that a significant influence of the lifestyle on the reactions in a given environment is evident. Accordingly, it seems advantageous to perform an environment setting in the lifestyle of the target groups.
Taking the individual lifestyle as a basis for the environment setting, this should also be integrated into the models of environmental psychology. For the environmental psychology, this means to use the variable of lifestyle as influential factor in the model instead of the variable personality.

### 2.3. The modified psychological environment model

Consequently, the suggested psychological environment model could be represented according to Figure 2. Personality is replaced by the more practicable lifestyle. Future research must validate the influence of lifestyle. Especially a direct comparison of the influence of lifestyle vs. personality should be carried out.

#### TABLE 1

Multifactorial Variance Analysis of Pleasure and Arousal

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Main effects:</th>
<th>F-Value</th>
<th>Sig. P</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Environment (concept)</td>
<td>257.97</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group affiliation</td>
<td>6.75</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interaction effects</td>
<td>11.57</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Average Value of the particular combinations: | 1 | 2 | 3 | Sig. Groups 1 and 2 | Sig. Groups 1 and 3 | Sig. Groups 2 and 3 |
| Environment (concept) | Emotional Type (n=110) | Prestigious and Educated Type (n=129) | Cultural Grouch (n=62) |
| A: traditional | -0.81 | -0.24 | -0.66 | 0.000 | 0.001 | ns |
| B: modern | 0.67 | 0.52 | 0.34 | ns | ns | 0.016 |
| Increase | 1.48 | 0.76 | 1.00 | 0.000 | 0.008 | ns |
| Sign. Level | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 |

#### TABLE 2

Multifactorial Variance Analysis of the Approach Behavior

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Main effects:</th>
<th>F-Value</th>
<th>Sig. P</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Environment (concept)</td>
<td>257.97</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group affiliation</td>
<td>6.75</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interaction effects</td>
<td>11.57</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Average Value of the particular combinations: | 1 | 2 | 3 | Sig. Groups 1 and 2 | Sig. Groups 1 and 3 | Sig. Groups 2 and 3 |
| Environment (concept) | Emotional Type (n=110) | Prestigious and Educated Type (n=129) | Cultural Grouch (n=62) |
| A: traditional | -0.65 | -0.03 | -0.56 | 0.000 | ns | 0.000 |
| B: modern | 0.40 | 0.41 | 0.21 | ns | ns | ns |
| Increase | 1.05 | 0.44 | 0.77 | 0.000 | ns | ns |
| Sign. Level | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 |

#### REFERENCES


FIGURE 2
Modified Psychological Environment Model


Virtual Stores on the Internet: Design of Emotional Online Shopping Offers on the Internet from a Behavioral Point of View
Sandra Diehl, Saarland University, Germany

1. INTRODUCTION

In spite of the growing importance of electronic commerce for retailing, a behaviorally founded analysis of e-commerce offers is not yet available. Presently, technical aspects of web-site-design are predominant. Consumers’ and thus the users’ needs regarding shopping offers on the internet are being neglected. These are the reasons for this contribution dealing with a theoretically and empirically founded analysis of online shopping offers from a behavioral point of view. A behavior model for virtual stores is developed (for details, cf. Diehl, 2001).

For the development of this behavior model, the author follows a two-step process: In a first step, findings of real store design are being tested with regard to their transferability to virtual internet stores. The second step will consider specific internet characteristics of virtual store design.

2. TRANSFERABILITY OF THE FINDINGS OF REAL STORE DESIGN TO VIRTUAL STORE DESIGN

The behavior model is based upon the psychological environment model by Mehrabian and Russel which will be fundamentally enhanced and modified in this contribution (c.f. Figure 1).

At first, it has to be ascertained whether or not results of the reliable research findings of real store design can be transferred to virtual stores. A transferability of these psychological environmental findings to a virtual store can be assumed for various reasons. The consumer constructs his/her own reality on the basis of real experiences and experiences conveyed by the media. Frequently, he/she is not able to distinguish between experienced and media environments (cf. Kroeber-Riel/Weinberg, 1999, p. 409). Furthermore, the sources of consumer experiences are becoming blurred sooner or later since contents are not linked to the source of the message any more (“Sleeper Effect”, cf. McGuire, 1985, p. 290ff.). Virtual three dimensional stores enable the viewer to make three-dimensional movements. Due to increasing possibilities of immersion and interaction, the immersion into virtual worlds is being facilitated and is connected with a growing real three-dimensional experience. Likewise, the practical linguistic usage with expressions as “data highway”, “cyberspace” and “surfing in the internet” also suggests a transferability of the psychological environmental findings (for details, cf. Diehl, 2001, p. 94ff.).

In the following, the enhancements of the classic psychological environment model will be discussed (for details, cf. Diehl, 2001, p. 93ff.).

The psychological environment model by Mehrabian and Russel attributable to the emotional approach of environmental psychology leaves cognitive variables unconsidered. This contribution integrates the cognitive variable easy orientation to the model from which an important influence upon the liking of the environment is anticipated.

Results in lifestyle research are also tested with regard to their contribution for virtual store-design. It is anticipated that the match-up, which the consumer perceives between his lifestyle and the store is of high importance for the consumer’s preferences for a certain store. The lifestyle in form of the match-up between the consumer and the store will be integrated into the behavior model for real and virtual stores. Positive implications on the liking of the store are anticipated from the perceived match-up. This contribution concurs with the criticism of the personality variable as used by Mehrabian/Russel (cf. Terlutter in this Volume)–in the behavior model the personality variable is replaced by the lifestyle of the consumers.

A further research approach tested is the involvement research. Here, the consumer’s involvement before entering a store is of interest from which a positive effect on the consumer’s activation and intended environmental approach is expected. Involvement is also integrated into the behavior model.

A general behavior model for real and virtual stores is developed from the hypotheses derived from environmental psychology, lifestyle and involvement research (cf. figure 2).

The general behavior model was empirically tested in
- real stores in Germany, USA and France and in
- the virtual store.

All in all, 943 consumers were interviewed during these four surveys.

The virtual store was specially designed for this test and is based on the concept of one of the tested real stores. According to the theoretical analyses, a three-dimensional representation was chosen for the virtual store which allowed the test persons extensive interactive possibilities. In addition, they were able to move through the virtual store in real time causing high reality proximity. Furthermore, the virtual store has a multi-sensual design. In summary, this is a highly innovative concept of store design for internet shops.

By causal analysis, the behavior model for real and virtual stores was confirmed both for real stores in Germany, France, and the US and for the virtual store. The degree to which the causal model fits the empirical data was extensively tested. The model showed high fit measures (cf. Diehl, 2001, p. 190ff.).

The concept achieved in all stores comparable effects among consumers. Causal analytical multi-group analyses showed that there is hardly any difference between the three countries indicating a confirmation of the thesis of convergence as discussed in literature. Thus, a standardized design concept for stores can be used in these three countries. Since, according to Hofstede (1997) these three are countries representing different cultural clusters a standardizability of the concept is probable in other countries of the particular cluster.

Since the general behavior model could also be confirmed for the data set of the virtual store design, this implies that the behavior model is valid both for real and for virtual stores. Thus, findings of the real store design can be transferred to the design of virtual stores.

Repeated multi-group causal analyses hardly showed any differences between the real stores and the virtual store; as a result, it may be assumed that the virtual store can be applied as standard in other countries as well.

3. CONSIDERATIONS AS TO SPECIFIC INTERNET CHARACTERISTICS IN AN ENHANCED BEHAVIOR MODEL FOR VIRTUAL STORES

With regard to virtual stores, the general behavior model for real and virtual stores will be additionally specified. The objective
is to consider the characteristics of the internet in the design of virtual stores.

An important characteristic of the internet is the possibility to represent multimedia information. To ascertain results about the modality to represent information so that the process of consumers’ information processing is supported, results of learning with multimedia particularly considering Paivio’s dual coding theory (1991) and Engelkamp’s multi-modal memory theory (1991) are being analyzed. From learning psychology, the variable information gain is integrated into the enhanced behavior model.

Further relevant internet findings can be derived from the flow research (cf. Csikszentmihalyi, 1999, 2000). The flow sensation to be described as immersion into an activity in which the consumer loses the feeling for time and is all wrapped up in the activity is characterized as a very pleasant feeling which the immersing person wants to experience again and again. It is supposed that virtual internet stores may support the development of a flow sensation since, caused by the stimulus field limited by the display screen, a focusing on the virtual store is easily feasible. Diversions and disturbances through real environment are extensively excluded.

This contribution examines the time structure of the flow feeling. Differentiations are being made between the prerequisites supporting the development of a flow sensation, the immediate consequences of the flow sensation and the implications from the flow condition with regard to consumer behavior in virtual stores. It is anticipated that the flow sensation splits up into the components surfing fun and situational control triggering behavioral effects. In addition, situational control exerts a positive effect on the variable information gain representing a more cognitive variable.

Figure 3 shows the enhanced behavior model for virtual stores which considers the results of the flow research and learning psychology. The general behavior model for real and virtual stores is enhanced by the flow construct and its immediate consequences surfing fun and situational control. Furthermore, the variable information gain is integrated.
In a next step, the enhanced model for virtual stores is examined by a causal analysis. Figure 4 represents the model with all estimates.

The global fit measures (cf. Homburg/Giering, 1998) of the enhanced behavior model are represented in Table 1. The values of Table 1 show a high fit of the causal model indicating a high quality of the model especially with regard to the complexity of the model.

Table 2 contains the local fit measures of the causal model. Every one of the estimated parameters was significant.1

With few exceptions, the requirements for the local fit measures are met by this model. Merely one single indicator reliability

1Ascertaining of local matching values requires at least two indicators per latent variable.
and the average variance ascertained for one factor ($\eta_6$) do not meet the required values. Falling below a single local fit should not lead to the rejection of a model (cf. Homburg/Giering, 1998). Since this is a highly complex model and the other fit measures meet the requirements, a high quality of the measurement model can be assumed.

The enhanced behavior model for virtual stores could be confirmed and proves that the flow sensation has a highly important influence upon the consumer’s behavior in virtual environments. This shows that the consumers’ feelings to control the situation were supported by an immediate feedback of the system, which, in turn, has a positive effect upon the number of the acquired information (information gain).

Accordingly, an extensive behavior model for virtual store design could be empirically confirmed representing—and thus predicting—the consumers’ behavior in virtual environments.

**REFERENCES:**


---

**TABLE 1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Global Fit Measure</th>
<th>Requirement</th>
<th>Value of the Causal Model</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GFI</td>
<td>$\geq 0,9$</td>
<td>0,93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AGFI</td>
<td>$\geq 0,9$</td>
<td>0,91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFI</td>
<td>$\geq 0,9$</td>
<td>0,96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NFI</td>
<td>$\geq 0,9$</td>
<td>0,91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IFI</td>
<td>$\geq 0,9$</td>
<td>0,96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RMR</td>
<td>$\leq 0,05$</td>
<td>0,051</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RMSEA</td>
<td>$\leq 0,08$</td>
<td>0,049</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\text{Chi}^2/\text{df}$</td>
<td>$\leq 2,5$</td>
<td>1,9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


TABLE 2
Local Fit Measures of the Enhanced Causal Model for Virtual Stores

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Latent variables (factors) with indicators</th>
<th>Standardized estimates of parameters</th>
<th>Reliability of the indicators</th>
<th>Factor reliabilities</th>
<th>Average of ascertained variance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Factor loads</td>
<td>Variances of erroneous measurements</td>
<td>Requirement: 0.4</td>
<td>Requirement: 0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>information rate $\xi_1$</td>
<td>$\lambda_{x_1}=0.87$</td>
<td>0.24</td>
<td>0.76</td>
<td>0.87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$\lambda_{x_2}=0.88$</td>
<td>0.22</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>involvement $\xi_2$</td>
<td>$\lambda_{x_3}=0.52$</td>
<td>0.73</td>
<td>(0.27)</td>
<td>0.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$\lambda_{x_4}=0.91$</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>lifestyle $\xi_3$</td>
<td>$\lambda_{x_5}=1$</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>lifestyle $\xi_4$</td>
<td>$\lambda_{x_6}=1$</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>activation $\eta_1$</td>
<td>$\lambda_{y_1}=0.70$</td>
<td>0.50</td>
<td>0.50</td>
<td>0.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$\lambda_{y_2}=0.84$</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>liking $\eta_2$</td>
<td>$\lambda_{y_3}=0.88$</td>
<td>0.22</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>0.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$\lambda_{y_4}=0.77$</td>
<td>0.40</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>flow $\eta_4$</td>
<td>$\lambda_{y_8}=0.78$</td>
<td>0.39</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td>0.81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$\lambda_{y_9}=0.73$</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$\lambda_{y_{10}}=0.79$</td>
<td>0.37</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>surfing fun $\eta_5$</td>
<td>$\lambda_{y_{11}}=1$</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>control $\eta_6$</td>
<td>$\lambda_{y_{12}}=0.65$</td>
<td>0.60</td>
<td>0.41</td>
<td>0.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$\lambda_{y_{13}}=0.67$</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>information gain $\eta_7$</td>
<td>$\lambda_{y_{14}}=1$</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>approach behavior $\eta_3$</td>
<td>$\lambda_{y_5}=0.75$</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td>0.74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$\lambda_{y_6}=0.62$</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$\lambda_{y_7}=0.72$</td>
<td>0.48</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ABSTRACT

The significant influence of cultural factors on consumer behavior has been widely recognized. However, systematic research examining cultural influences has been somewhat limited. While some studies have recently addressed cultural issues in consumer behavior, extant research in this area continues to be fragmented and lacks compelling theoretical frameworks. This session attempts to provide a forum for researchers in the area of cross-cultural consumer behavior to discuss their findings and address the issues related to conducting research that spans across national boundaries. These issues will range from conceptualization of theoretical constructs, alternate theoretical frameworks, methodological and data collection constraints.

Four papers will be presented in this session that address several aspects of cross-cultural research. The paper by Klein and DeBroux examines the construct of cultural animosity and the Theory of reasoned action in Japan. The paper by Wong, Rindfleisch and Burroughs investigates how perceptions of materialism differ in the United States, Singapore and Thailand. Lee, Garbarino, Lerman, Horn and Satow address the cultural variations in country of origin perceptions in twelve countries. Finally, the Agrawal, Maheswaran and Mandhachitara paper provides an integrated review that identifies the conceptualization and methodological issues that are critical in conducting research in the global context.

The papers featured in the session represent insights from multiple countries and present the operationalization of multiple theoretical constructs and conceptual frameworks. This session will provide a broad and rich coverage of critical consumer behavior issues in the global context.

“Subjective Norms and the Animosity Model: Social Pressure within a Collectivist Culture”

Jill G. Klein and Philippe DeBroux

Consumer animosity—defined as anger related to previous or ongoing political, military, economic, or diplomatic events—can have a direct, negative effect on consumers’ purchase behavior. Further, these effects are unrelated to product quality. In other words, angry consumers do not distort or denigrate images of a target country’s products, they simply refuse to buy them (Klein, Ettenso and Morris 1998).

These are the propositions of the animosity model of foreign product purchase. The model has been supported in multiple settings. For example, angry consumers in Nanjing, China were less likely to purchase Japanese goods than those who were less angry, but anger was unrelated to judgments of Japanese product quality (Klein, Ettenso and Morris 1998). Other contexts in which the model has been supported include: consumers in Belgrade and U.S. products (NATO bombings), Australian consumers and French products (French nuclear testing in the South Pacific), U.S. consumers and Japanese products (strained trade relations and World War II) (Ettenso and Klein 2000).

An important question not previously explored is whether social norms play a role in these and similar contexts. If a consumer does not feel angry but perceives that relevant others are angry, will this affect product purchase? This question was tested within the framework of Ajzen and Fishbein’s theory of reasoned action. The theory proposes that a person’s intention to behave in a given manner is a function of two factors: personal attitudes and social influence. This second factor, known as subjective norms, is the person’s perception of social pressures to behave in a particular manner. Subjective norms, in turn, have two sources: normative beliefs, which are beliefs about how others (e.g., friends, parents) would want one to behave, and the importance the individual attaches to complying with the beliefs of these important others.

Thus, subjective norms were incorporated into the animosity model and the expanded model was tested in Hiroshima, Japan. Animosity was measured within the context of anger toward the United States due to the nuclear attack on Hiroshima in 1945. In collectivist cultures such as Japan, individuals are particularly concerned about adhering to group norms and being an accepted member of their group. Thus, if social norms do play a role in the animosity model, Japan is a setting in which this effect should be discernable.

Data were collected from 250 adults in Hiroshima at shopping areas, train stations and other public places. Results supported the animosity model and the important role of subjective norms. As Figure 1 shows, both respondent animosity and subjective norms were significant predictors of purchase intentions, with subjective norms playing a dominant role. Further, both constructs were predicted by the perceived animosity of others. Consumer ethnocentrism—the belief that one should buy domestic rather than foreign goods—also predicted purchase intentions. Animosity was unrelated to product judgments and purchase intentions were not predicted by product judgments. (SEM results: CFI=.92, NNFI=.91, RMSEA=.064; *=p<.05, **=p<.001.) An additional finding was that greater social pressure to avoid U.S. goods was experienced by respondents who had family members in the Hiroshima area, or who personally lived in the area, in 1945.

Future research will be discussed, including: a study to replicate these findings in South Korea, a comparison of these results with those of an individualist culture (and an examination of the relationship between animosity and individual scores on an individualism–collectivism scale); and an investigation of the effects of priming individual and collective self-esteem on the relationship between animosity and purchase.

“A Cross-Cultural Assessment of Materialism’s Conceptualization, Characteristics, and Consequences”

Nancy Wong, Aric Rindfleisch, and James Burroughs

This past century has seen the emergence of consumption as a culturally accepted means of seeking success, happiness, and the populist notion of the good life. As we enter the twenty-first century, material messages, themes, and desires have increasingly transformed into a “world standard package of goods” (Ger and Belk 1996, p. 70) whereby its ownership for consumers around the world represents entry into the global consumption community.

Although materialism research has largely focused on Americans, a growing number of researchers have begun to explore the nature of materialism in other cultures. These recent cross-cultural inquiries have produced a mixed array of findings concerning the generalizability of American materialism research in other cultures. We suggest that these divergent findings can be meaningfully...
classified into two emerging schools of thought. Specifically, some researchers appear to subscribe to a Universal perspective, which suggests that the characteristics and consequences of materialism are culturally invariant, while other researchers adopt a Cultural perspective, which suggests that the nature of materialism is culturally bound.

After identifying the origins, assumptions, and findings of each of these two schools of thought, we examine their empirical validity through two studies that employ over 600 adults from three different nations. We measured materialism using the Material Values Scale (MVS) (Richins and Dawson 1992) and to assess the characteristics of materialism, we also included measures of individualism and collectivism (Triandis and Gelfand 1998), religiosity (Koenig et al. 1997), and religious service attendance. Prior research suggests that materialism should be negatively related to religiosity and religious service attendance (LaBarbera and Gurhan 1997) and positively related to individualism (Belk 1985). To assess the consequences of materialism, we included a measure of overall life satisfaction (Diener et al. 1985). Our results suggest that the conceptualization, characteristics, and consequences of materialism may be culturally dependent. First, measures of materialism yield different factor structures in collectivist cultures such as Singapore and Thailand. In addition, the characteristics associated with materialistic individuals appears to vary somewhat between cultures, as religious service attendance appears to be negatively associated with materialism for Americans (most of whom are Christian) and Singaporeans (with different religious backgrounds) but unrelated to materialism for Thais (most of whom are Buddhist). Finally, the consequences of materialism appears to be heavily dependent upon cross-cultural differences, as materialism appears to run the gamut from reducing the life satisfaction of Americans, to being unrelated to the life satisfaction of Singaporeans, to possibly increasing the life satisfaction of Thais. We explore the implications of these findings and offer a set of recommendations for both researchers and policy makers interested in cross-cultural materialism and the emergence of a global consumer culture.

“The Influence of Cultural Orientation on Country of Origin Stereotypes”

Julie Anne Lee, Ellen Garbarino, Dawn Lerman, Marty Horn, Kay Satow

In a 12-country sample, when asked, “What country makes the best [product]?” consumers overwhelmingly chose their own country, in most cases, over the superior country of origin as identified across the entire sample of consumers. This was true for a wide array of products including athletic shoes, beer, wine, tea and even a car. The only exceptions were for electronic goods (a computer, color television and 35 mm camera), where there are more technological advantages and less potential taste issues. The data reported in this study is taken from an omnibus survey that was administered, by either a face-to-face or telephone interview, to a random sample of at least 1,000 respondents in 1 or 2 cities in each of the following 12 countries: Australia, Brazil, Canada, China, France, Germany, Italy, Japan, Mexico, Spain, United Kingdom and the USA.

To further understand the strong own-country bias, we looked at the effect of uncertainty avoidance on the consumer’s responses. Uncertainty avoidance is defined as the “extent to which the members of a culture feel threatened by uncertain or unknown situations” (Hofstede 1991, p. 113). This construct can be used to reflect how people respond to uncertainties and ambiguities in the market place. People who are low on uncertainty avoidance tend to be more comfortable with uncertainty, take risks more easily, and are more tolerance for opinions and behaviors different from their own (Hofstede 1991). People who are high on uncertainty avoidance have a need for explicit rules and more structured situations. As an example, they might focus on certain strategies to reduce uncertainty, such as taking extra time and effort to search out all options, buying a known brand, or one made by a superior country of origin, or buying one that someone they know and trust had bought before.

Certain market conditions might also interact with consumer’s uncertainty avoidance, offering a set of rules that might help to reduce uncertainty. For instance, in a market where your own
country is competitive you may be more familiar with these offerings or perceive them to be more tailored to your tastes. Or, in another market where there is a clear superior manufacturer, country-of-origin information may make the decision-making process easier, reducing uncertainty for products that may be difficult to evaluate. These conditions are likely to affect consumers who are high on uncertainty avoidance by making them less likely to seek out other products.

In order to test these propositions, consumers were allocated a score, based on Hofstede’s (1980) country level measure of uncertainty avoidance. The level of uncertainty avoidance was tested for its relevance to the population by correlating the country level scores with individual values reported by the respondent. We found that high uncertainty avoidance was related to being cautious, liberal, and demanding, while low uncertainty avoidance was related to being easygoing, innovative, a leader, open-minded and self-confident.

In support of our hypothesis, we found that, in high dominance markets—where there is a clear consensus about which country makes the best product—people from low uncertainty avoidance countries (e.g. USA, Canada, Australia and the UK) were more likely to choose a non-dominant country, than people high on uncertainty avoidance (e.g. France, Spain, Mexico and Japan). Going with the “underdog” in a high dominance market may tap into either a higher probability of failure (risk) or an unknown probability of occurrence (ambiguity), both of which are likely to be associated with uncertainty avoidance.

“Cross–Cultural Inquiry: Issues and Research Directions”
Nidhi Agrawal, Durairaj Maheswaran, and Rujitrana Mandhachitara

The interaction of culture and consumer behavior has received relatively less attention in extant literature. While the significant impact of cultural differences on consumer behavior has been widely acknowledged, published research in marketing that has incorporated data collected in countries outside the United States is limited (Winer 1998). Several factors may be responsible for the lack of such research studies. It is likely that the effort and investment involved in collecting data in many countries may deter the enthusiasm for such studies. Alternately, the methodological complexities of achieving construct equivalence and measurement equivalence across many countries may be daunting to many researchers. In this paper, we summarize the salient issues that contribute to the challenging nature of cross-cultural research and attempt to develop guidelines that would facilitate systematic scholarly inquiry in this domain.

Specifically, we address two aspects of cross-cultural research. First, we examine the appropriateness of the extant research orientation. Second, we examine the current approaches to defining and operationalizing culture.

We examine the research orientation by comparing and contrasting the emic-etic orientation to conducting studies across cultures. The specific advantages and disadvantages related to developing and operationalizing constructs within and across cultures in the marketing context are highlighted.

This paper also provides insights from both published research and ongoing studies to highlight the dynamic nature of culture and its characteristics. Specifically, the multidimensional nature of culture will be reviewed. The efficacy of operationalizing cultural orientation based on constructs such as Individualism–Collectivism (Triandis 1989) will be discussed. First, we suggest that the current conceptualization of culture as an enduring and chronically accessible construct, that is invariant across contexts is somewhat limited. Recent evidence shows that members of individualist cultures can have collectivist responses under certain conditions (Aaker and Williams 1998). In addition, within culture analysis in some studies have reported similar behavioral patterns as exhibited across cultures (Brockner and Chen 1996). These studies suggest that in any culture there could be varying levels of both individualism and collectivism. In other words, recent evidence calls for a more dynamic conceptualization of culture as a bundle of multiple and overlapping chronic tendencies. It is likely that some chronic tendencies are more dominant than others in the daily context. This view is also made plausible by the increasing trend in globalization and the corresponding exposure to stimuli from other cultures. In accord with this view, new evidence shows that the less dominant chronic tendencies can be made accessible by external priming (Oishi, Wyer and Colcombe, 2000, Lee, Aaker and Gardener, 2000). It is also likely that relevance and applicability of these less dominant tendencies may also encourage their use as decision making cues (Han and Shavitt 1994).

We also examine the efficacy of the new typology of Horizontal and Vertical dimensions of the Individualism and Collectivism framework (Triandis and Gelfand, 1998). Findings from three studies that operationalized this multidimensional scale to examine cultural differences in Thailand, Japan and the United States are discussed. Finally, we identify some interesting differences in some culture specific constructs such as loyalty and justice among members of individualist and collectivist cultures that need further investigation.

REFERENCES


More Than a Feeling: An Exploration into the Self-Symbolic Consumption of Music
Gretchen Larsen, University of Otago, New Zealand
Rob Lawson, University of Otago, New Zealand
Sarah Todd, University of Otago, New Zealand

ABSTRACT
This paper outlines an exploratory study into the self-symbolic consumption of music in social situations. A series of personal and group interviews were used to investigate a number of issues regarding the decisions made during this consumption process. Findings indicate that music is used to symbolise the consumer’s self-concept in social situations, and that this process is influenced by situational and self-concept variables. Propositions related to these findings have been developed, upon which further research can be based.

INTRODUCTION
People listen to, or consume, music in many different ways and for many different reasons. Music is a pervasive part of everyday life for most consumers, we hear it in numerous situations from walking down the street, eating a meal, watching television and shopping in retail outlets. In fact Merriam (1964) said of music that “there is probably no other human cultural activity which is so all pervasive and which reaches into, shapes and often controls so much of human behaviour” (p.218). While much of the consumption of music is passive, in that consumers don’t actually choose to listen to music in that situation, a significant amount of this consumption occurs because the consumer desired to listen to a particular piece of music at that time.

There are many reasons why someone might choose to consume music at a particular time. Hargreaves and North (1999) have proposed that music serves four main functions in people’s lives. These are emotional expression, aesthetic enjoyment and entertainment, communication, and symbolic representation. The majority of related literature focuses on the intrapersonal reasons for listening to music such as emotional expression, aesthetic enjoyment and entertainment (e.g. Holbrook and Gardner 1993). These factors do not, however, fully explain the variation of music consumption behaviour found in different settings. It is therefore important to investigate the interpersonal functions and processes (communication and symbolic representation) in order to fully understand behaviour related to the consumption of music.

It is a fairly widely accepted notion that music can be used as a tool to communicate extra musical (symbolic) meaning (e.g. Hargreaves and North 1999, Frith 1996). However there is very little understanding of how music is used symbolically, how decisions are made about what music best represents the consumer and what might influence these decisions. This paper outlines an exploratory investigation into these issues.

LITERATURE
Music and Consumer Behaviour
Within the consumer behaviour literature music has generally been treated as a factor influencing consumer decision making and intention to purchase other products. There is a notable amount of research that has examined the effects of music in advertising (e.g. Park and Young 1986). The influence of background music on purchase intentions has also been examined in some detail (e.g. Milliman 1986). This research however, focuses on the passive consumption of music, when consumers have not actually chosen to listen to music. Accordingly music has not been treated as a product in its own right.

The combination of unusual consumption features (e.g. consumption without purchase, mobility and repeated consumption (Lacher 1989 and Lacher and Mizerski 1994)) and pervasive influences on everyday life suggests that music should be an important area of study for consumer behaviour researchers. However, issues related to the active consumption of music have often not been considered and where work has been done, it has focused primarily on the choice and purchase of music. A small number of studies have investigated the intention to purchase music (e.g. Holbrook 1982, Lacher and Mizerski 1994). There has also been some interest in the development of musical preferences (e.g. Holbrook and Schindler 1989). The actual purchase of music is only a small part of the consumption experience as music can be "consumed without purchase and re-experienced without repurchase" (Lacher and Mizerski, 1994, p.367). Despite this, the post-purchase consumption of music is an area that has largely been ignored by consumer researchers.

Literature in both consumer behaviour and musicology has also tended to focus on the private, as opposed to social, consumption of music. Yet Bowman (1998) asserts that "music is fundamentally social" (p.304) as ‘the social’ is part of what music is. Music is socially constructed, socially embedded and its nature and value are inherently social (Bowman 1998). This notion is supported by a wider group of music researchers. For example, Hargreaves and North (1997) maintain that "what makes […] sounds into music is the way in which people collectively imbue them with musical meaning, and [that] a vital part of this process is the social and cultural context in which sounds exist” (p.1). This perspective is part of a general move within the social sciences towards the study of behaviour within its social context, a notion that has also gained support within the consumer behaviour field (e.g. Belk 1975). Consequently, it is unlikely that consumption practices in social situations are the same as those in private situations.

A number of reasons for listening to music have been identified in the literature. These can be classified as intra-personal (e.g. emotion management) and inter-personal (e.g. communication) (Hargreaves and North 1999). Related to the focus on private consumption of music, it is the intrapersonal reasons for listening to music, such as emotion and aesthetic enjoyment that have received the most attention from researchers. These factors alone however do not fully explain the variation in music consumption behaviour across all people and all situations. Hargreaves and North (1999) also suggest that there are interpersonal functions of music, including the symbolic representation of extra-musical meaning that may assist in explaining this behaviour. Relevant theories from consumer research, particularly self-concept and symbolic consumption, may provide explanations of this variation when considered alongside intra-personal factors, as they refer to the communicative and symbolic properties of products.

Self Concept and Symbolic Consumption
Symbolic consumption theory proposes that consumers utilise the symbolic meaning in products to communicate information about some aspect of themselves (e.g. Levy 1959, Hirschman 1980...
and Elliott 1994). In order to understand the processes that might be involved in the symbolic consumption of music, an understanding of self-concept must first be gained.

The definition of self concept has been the source of much argument in the literature. This is primarily a consequence of the variety of perspectives from which self concept has been studied (Sirgy, 1982). However there does seem to be some agreement that the term ‘self concept’ refers to the “totality of the individuals thoughts and feelings having reference to himself as an object” (Rosenberg, 1979, p.7). It has long been recognised that the boundaries of the self concept are not limited to the physical and mental self, but may also include the products and services that one consumes (James 1890, Belk 1988). Thus the consumption of products influences the self concept and the self concept influences the consumption of products.

This notion underlies much work in the area, but in utilising the self concept, it has been treated in a variety of ways. Sirgy (1982) stated that there is “ambiguity and confusion on the precise conceptualisation of self concept in consumer behaviour literature” (p.288). At that time, the main argument revolved around the question of a unidimensional versus multidimensional construct. Although a multidimensional approach has now become generally accepted, Hogg, Cox and Keeling (2000) have noted that there is still some debate surrounding the number and content of different views of the self. Recently, the idea of ‘possible selves’, as proposed by Markus and Nurius (1986) has gained much popularity (e.g. Hogg et al 2000). Possible selves include all of the selves which are possible for that person, such as what individuals could become, would they like to become and what they are afraid of becoming. Implicit in this conceptualisation is the role self concept plays in motivating all behaviour, including consumption behaviour.

Another aspect of self that is gaining more attention is that of the situational self concept (e.g. Schenk and Holman, 1980). This perspective proposes that the self concept is situationally defined. When the concept of possible selves is combined with that of the situational self an understanding of the self concept as a ‘working self concept’ is gained. The ‘working self concept’ consists of the core self conceptions embedded in a context of more tentative self conceptions that are tied to the prevailing circumstances” (Markus and Wurf, 1987, p.306).

The area of self concept that arguably forms the largest body of research is related to the image congruency hypothesis. First proposed by Grubb and Grathwohl in 1967 this hypothesis argued that people strive to achieve congruency between their self concept and the images of the products or brands they consume. This hypothesis is based on three propositions: (1) self concept is of value to the individual and behaviour will be directed toward the protection and enhancement of self concept, (2) the purchase, display and use of goods communicates symbolic meaning to the individual and to others, and (3) the consuming behaviour of an individual will be directed toward enhancing self concept through the consumption of goods as symbols (Sirgy, 1982, p.288). It is here that the link between self concept and symbolic consumption can be seen.

From the image congruency perspective, symbolic consumption is facilitated by the meaning attached to symbols and social interaction. Social interaction is important as it is only through communication that symbols obtain meaning (Hirschman 1980). However recent research has indicated that the audience for an individual’s symbolic consumption could be both themselves and others (e.g. Elliott 1997). Most research is however, focused on symbolic consumption in social settings.

Not all products lend themselves to symbolic consumption. Holman (1981) identified three conditions that distinguish products as vehicles for communication. These are visibility in use, variability in use and personalisability. Music is one such product as it is visible (audible), variable (many choices exist) and personalisable (certain genres can be attributed to a stereotypic image of a generalised user). However, as discussed previously, very little is known about how music is symbolically consumed in social situations.

METHODOLOGY

The literature review illustrates that there are a variety of theories that could be used to explain the self-symbolic consumption of music in social situations. However as very little research has been conducted on this topic there is little indication as to which theories are most relevant. For this reason an exploratory study was undertaken in order to provide insight into the specific issues involved in the self symbolic consumption of music in social situations and to assist in the development of propositions for future research.

The specific aims of the exploratory study were to explore the following three questions:

1. is music consumed symbolically and how is this facilitated?
2. how might decisions be made about what music best represents the consumer in a situation?
3. what factors might influence these decisions?

The exploratory study focused on those people for whom this behaviour is more common. The literature suggests that it is around 18-24 years of age that both musical preferences and the self-concept are being stabilised (Holbrook and Schindler 1989 and Dobson et al 1981). It was also assumed that those who have a greater interest in music would be more likely to use music in this way.

The methodology used was personal and focus group interviews and was based on friendship groups. Friendship groups were used mainly for the reason that the behaviour being investigated is based on social interaction. Thus, by involving members of a friendship group insight can been gained into the meaning of the behaviour and the context in which it occurs. In order to gain access to a defined friendship group, flatting groups (people living in a shared house) were used. Flats (shared houses) were sought via posters placed on public notice boards in various tertiary institutions in Dunedin. Incentives were offered in the form of a CD voucher for each individual respondent and a grocery voucher for the whole flat. Potential respondents were screened when they called to ensure that they, and the other members of their flat, met the criteria and were able to take part in each interview. Two friendship groups were selected, each with five participants.

The exploratory study comprised of two personal interviews with each respondent and one group interview with each flat. In total twenty personal interviews and two focus group interviews were conducted. These interviews and two practice interviews took place from August to October 2000. All interviews were semi-structured allowing the interviewer to follow interesting leads as they arose. The objective of the first interview was to gain an understanding of the respondent and how music fitted into their life. The second interview aimed to identify and describe instances of the social consumption of music in the respondent’s everyday life. The objective of the group interview was to discuss issues that arose from the personal interviews such as situations in which the self-symbolic consumption of music may be more apparent and the type of people who were more or less likely to behave in this manner. The interviews were transcribed and then content analysed in order to
determine common themes relating to the research objective. Propositions for future research were also developed. The findings are discussed in the following section and the propositions are presented in the Conclusion and Implications.

FINDINGS

A number of themes have emerged from the interviews. These are presented and discussed below.

Theme 1: The symbolic consumption of music.

The consumption of music was discussed mostly with reference to emotional expression in that music is often consumed because of the congruence between the emotion in the music and the mood of the listener. One friendship group actually had a ‘happy songs’ tape and a ‘sad songs’ tape that they listened to. In line with Hirschman and Holbrook’s (1982) work on the experiential aspects of consumer behaviour, it was found that music is also consumed simply for entertainment purposes. One respondent said that he enjoys music but “it’s background, it’s just music” [male]. These two reasons for consumption are directly related to the intrapersonal functions of music as presented by Hargreaves and North (1999). With regard to their communication function, there was very little evidence. The one exception was the respondent who described an occasion where he played angry music (Metallica) very loudly to annoy a flatmate in order to indicate that she should “get a life”.

In relation to the question of whether music is also consumed symbolically much evidence was provided to support this use. Most of the examples provided were observations of other people’s behaviour and it seemed that the respondents could not/would not recognise this behaviour in themselves. The manner in which respondents described their observations indicated that it is not socially desirable to use music in this way. An explanation for the lack of personal examples may therefore be that admitting to this behaviour would reflect negatively on the respondent’s self image. Alternatively the explanation could lie in the level of self monitoring the respondents undertake. Hogg et al (2000) found a result similar to this in their study of the consumption of alcoholic drinks, but only for those who were low self monitors.

However, the ease with which respondents could provide examples of this behaviour in others indicates that music is commonly used for this purpose. The following quotes illustrate that music is used symbolically to represent the self both through consumption and non-consumption. Each example refers to a situation where the person who is consuming the music publicly presents part of their self concept through the music. In the first quote it seems that the actual self is being presented. However, the following quotes are examples of attempts to present aspects of the ideal self, including both approach and avoidance selves. It could be assumed that because the observers recognised this, then the attempt to use the meaning inherent in the music to represent one self was unsuccessful.

“When it’s your friends and stuff, I notice that you listen to the music that they put on, like if you’re at a party, you can tell its like their personality, sort of thrashy [fast, head banging music] or slow. You can tell they put it on because they like it and because it’s sort of them, their mood and how they are” [female].

“At Art School, everybody puts on Radio One and everybody hates it. Its just at Art School it’s the station you are supposed to listen to” [female].

“I think there are some people who don’t like them [the Vengaboys] and then there’s some people who say they don’t like them because they want to keep up an image” [male].

“I remember at school, at a 7th Form party, someone put on Hanson and the big rugby heads were like ‘what did you put that on for?’ Then you see them tapping their feet and bopping their heads. They complain once just to say ‘right I’m disapproving’” [male].

Conversely, because they believe that a person’s musical preferences are a reflection of their self-concept, these respondents also use the public shared meaning (Richins 1994) related to music to help them get to know the person listening to the music. However, it was suggested by some of the respondents that musical preferences could provide insight into part of their personality and not the whole.

Theme 2: Means of symbolically consuming music.

Choosing music to listen to in the presence of others does not appear to be the only means of symbolically consuming music. The public display of music paraphernalia and memorabilia, particular styles of dress and the ability to knowledgeably discuss the music also appear to constitute self-symbolic consumption of music. Respondents also discussed the idea that the language you use while talking about music can communicate to others your relationship with music. For example, one female respondent used the term ‘pride’ when describing how she felt about her favourite band, Nine Inch Nails. The use of this term indicates that the respondent has incorporated this band and their music into her self and that she is able to extend and communicate her self through symbols related to this band. This is an example of a product being incorporated into the extended self (Belk 1988). On the other hand, the respondents caution that the use of a particular symbolic action does not guarantee successful self-symbolic consumption. If the signified does not believe that you genuinely like the music then the presented self is unsubstantiated – “there is a difference between singing along and actually liking it” [male].

Theme 3: Decisions governed by social norms

The first stage of the music consumption ritual is to determine who is going to choose what music the social group will listen to. This decision appears to be governed by a multitude of social norms. One particular example that was mentioned by several different respondents was that of listening to music while travelling in a car. In this situation the owner of the car normally chooses the music. “When I got in the car I was thinking well its not my car so I don’t really want to just put music that I like on, in case she might not like it and because I feel it’s a bit rude to jump in there and do that” [female]. Similarly, ownership of the stereo seems to be more influential in determining who will choose the music that the group will listen to than ownership of the music itself. This was also the basis for decisions at parties. A number of respondents indicated that because it was their stereo that was being used they were primarily responsible for the choice of music. One function of the self concept is to provide strategies for interpersonal interaction (Markus and Wurf 1987). If the motor vehicle or stereo has been integrated into the extended self through ownership then violating the social norm could be likened to attempting to control somebody’s actions. As a result of the mobile nature of music and because it can be consumed without ownership music is less subject to strict norms regarding social interaction.
Theme 4: Music is chosen from the set of music that the consumer prefers

Very rarely did respondents choose music that they didn’t normally listen to or didn’t really like. When in public, consumers present certain aspects of their self concepts (Rosenberg, 1979). If musical preferences represent the self concept then the music chosen should be selected from the pool of music that represents all aspects of the self. One exception was a female respondent who played music that she didn’t know because she wanted to keep her boyfriend happy. This respondent stated that she had compromised herself, but she was prepared to do that in order to make her partner happy.

Theme 5: Decision based on shared preferences, mood and projected image.

In general, respondents seemed to find it difficult to articulate what their musical choice decisions were based on. This notwithstanding, several factors recurred when respondents were asked what they considered when choosing which music to listen to in social situations. These were shared preferences, mood and projected image.

The respondents seemed to mostly be aware of the musical preferences of the people in the situation and would generally choose music that all of the people involved would enjoy. As one respondent said, in these situations “you don’t pick out obscure stuff” [male].

Compilation albums were deemed to be useful in social situations as they made it easier to cater to a diversity of preferences. Conversely two respondents stated that they sometimes played music that was opposed to peoples preferences in order to evoke some humour. For example one enjoyed putting on classical music and another said “I wouldn’t really put on B*witched, it would be like ‘Oh come on’, I’d put it on for a joke” [male]. This example offers a particularly interesting insight into the self-symbolic use of music. This respondent actually owns the B*witched CD and said that he enjoys listening to it. However, his flatmates tease him about this because they see this preference as contrary to his image. It could be presumed that he has reacted to this feedback by presenting this aspect of himself in a humorous manner to avoid negatively affecting the image he has previously created.

In addition to shared preferences, the mood of the situation was nearly always considered when choosing music to listen to. Respondents attempted to match the mood of the music with the mood of the other people in the situation, and they often change music if it is not congruent with that mood.

Underlying both consideration factors of shared preferences and mood is an attempt to project the right self-image. Respondents did not explicitly state this but it was implied in their expressed concern for making the appropriate choice of music. The consequences of an inappropriate choice were that their guests or friends would be made to feel unhappy or uncomfortable. It was implied that this would be viewed as a reflection of their own self-image through their ability to interpret the meaning inherent in different music options.

Theme 6: Influence of situational variables

A number of situational influences were mentioned by the respondents, the most common of which were the people participating in the situation and the kind of relationship that exists between the respondent and those people. The following quotes illustrate that the people involved in the situation impact upon what music is chosen.

Theme 7: Influence of personality variables

As with situational variables, a number of variables related to personality were identified as being influential on the decision of what music is appropriate. Much of what was discussed was actually dependent on the particular self-concept of the person, in that certain personality traits were more conducive to the symbolic use of music. For example,

“You are kind of influenced by the people around you” [female].

“If you are with friends you listen to one thing, and then you go home and listen to something different by yourself” [male].

The specific combination of people is also an important influence on the choice of music. This suggests that the identity of the group is dependent on the totality of individual self-concepts and that any change in the combination will impact upon the behaviour of the group as a whole. “Would any of you put on something different?” “Not if we were all still here” [male]. This quote also illustrates that the degree of familiarity and previous experience with a person might also be influential, in that consumption rituals are maintained over time. This is facilitated by the self-concept as one of its functions is to provide the individual with a sense of continuity in time. Conversely, people who are unfamiliar might pose less of a concern, “if you don’t know them very well you don’t really care what they think of you” [female]. However, this might be altered by the purpose of the interaction. Some respondents indicated that if they were trying to get to know someone and trying to make a good impression then the decision about what music to listen to became even more important. Additionally, respondents used music to create the appropriate mood for the purpose of the occasion. A lot of music consumption situations that were identified were centred around the consumption of alcohol. If the purpose of the occasion was to party then happy, hyped dance music was played. If however, the purpose was to relax, then a different kind of music was chosen.

European Advances in Consumer Research (Volume 5) / 127
to you in your life? Because music to me is just music, whereas maybe it’s a lifestyle to [another respondent]" [male]. The respondent referred to in this quote and her best friends are both heavily into bands such as Nine Inch Nails and Korn. They also partake in wider consumption activities such as the collection of paraphernalia and dress in a style congruent with the image portrayed by these bands in order to strengthen the link between their musical preferences and their self-concepts. Both respondents agreed that music means a lot to them and mentioned a sense of pride when discussing these bands. It was suggested that for people like these respondents, the decision of what music to listen to in social situations is more complicated and more important because music has been integrated into their self-concept to a much greater degree.

CONCLUSIONS AND FUTURE RESEARCH
The findings indicate that music is consumed for symbolic purposes in addition to emotional expression and aesthetic enjoyment. The ways in which decisions are made regarding the most appropriate music for self-symbolic consumption and the influences on these decisions can be described using aspects of symbolic consumption theory. For example instances of the following concepts have been observed in the process of consuming music in social situations: expression of different aspects of self; self and brand image congruency; interpersonal functions of the self-concept; self extension; symbolic communication; consumption rituals and meaning transfer. Propositions based on the findings have been developed. These are outlined in Table 1 and are linked to the themes to which they relate.

It appears that situational and self concept variables have an important influence on the self symbolic consumption of music in social situations, however the exact nature of the influence is unknown. Further research investigating the propositions outlined in Table 1 should be undertaken to facilitate the development of a theory of the self symbolic consumption of music in social situations.

REFERENCES
Belk, Russell (1975) “Situational Variables and Consumer Behaviour” Journal of Consumer Research, 2 (December) 157-167

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Proposition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1: The symbolic consumption of music</td>
<td>1a: Consumer who are low self monitors will not use music to symbolically represent themselves to others.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1b: Music is chosen for symbolic consumption when the shared image of the music is congruent with the actual self.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1c: Music is chosen for symbolic consumption when the shared image of the music is congruent with the ideal self.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1d: Music is rejected for consumption when the shared image of the music is congruent with the avoidance self.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2: Means of symbolically consuming music</td>
<td>2: The consumption of musical paraphernalia and visible knowledge of the music increases the authenticity of the message when consumed alongside music.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3: Decisions governed by social norms</td>
<td>3: The occurrence of the self symbolic consumption of music will be mediated by ownership of musical equipment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4: Music is chosen from the self of music that the consumer prefers</td>
<td>4: A positive preference for the music will increase the likelihood that it will be symbolically consumed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5: Decision based on shared preferences, mood and projected image.</td>
<td>5a: Music is chosen for symbolic consumption when it is congruent with the preferences of others in the situation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5b: Negative feedback will facilitate a link between that music and the avoidance self</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5c: The use of music for symbolic consumption will be mediated by the perceived mood of the situation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6: Influence of situational variables</td>
<td>6: Music will be chosen that is congruent with ones own self concept and the perceived image of others in the situation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7: Influence of personality variables</td>
<td>7a: Those with non-conformist personality traits will choose music that is incongruent with the perceived preferences of others in the situation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7b: The occurrence of the self symbolic consumption of music will be mediated by the individual’s preference for music in general.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TABLE 1
Propositions


Self-Identity and Purchase Intention: An Extension of the Theory of Planned Behaviour
Stefano Puntoni, London Business School, United Kingdom

ABSTRACT

To verify the influence of self-identity on purchase intention within the framework of the Theory of Planned Behaviour (Ajzen 1985, 1991) a research project was carried out. Two pre-tests and a main study were conducted ascertaining self-identity by using the self-schemata related to “being trendy”. Results showed that self-identity influences purchase intention in two distinct ways: directly, independently from the other behavioural determinants; and indirectly, through the behavioural beliefs related to the schemata with which self-identity has been defined.

In consumer behaviour literature several studies have regarded the analysis of the influence of self-identity on purchase intention and product preference (e.g., Aaker 1999; Graeff 1996; Landon 1974; Malhotra 1988; Sirgy 1982; Sirgy and Johar 1999). However, they have offered only an incomplete framework. None of them has conducted the discussion within a comprehensive model of the determinants of intention.

The Theory of Planned Behaviour (Ajzen 1985, 1991) - and its recent development, the Theory of Planned Behaviour (Ajzen 1985, 1991) - are two models for the analysis of behavioural intention originating from social psychology and widely used in marketing contexts (e.g., Bagozzi, Baumgartner and Yi 1992; Bagozzi and Warshaw 1990; Caprara, Barbaranelli and Guido 1998; Notani 1997; Sheppard, Hartwick and Warshaw 1988). The purpose of this study is to test, within the framework of the Theory of Planned Behaviour, the existence of a significant effect of self-identity on purchase intention.

In this research self-identity is defined as the salient part of an actor’s self related to a particular behaviour, coherently with Conner and Armitage (1998) and Sparks and Guthrie (1998).

Following the approach employed by Aaker (1999), self-identity referred to a behaviour could be defined through the self-schemata related to that behaviour (Markus 1977). Given that socially visible products reveal users’ personal characteristics more than products not consumed in a social context, self-identity is likely to be a better predictor of intention and attitudes in the first case rather than in the latter (Sirgy and Johar 1999). Wanting to conduct the survey with products of large diffusion characterized by a social consumption, a suitable way to assess the effect of self-identity was therefore identified in the use of the schematic information related to “being trendy”.

Contrary to what has been assumed by previous contributions dedicated to the analysis of the impact of self-identity on behavioural intention (e.g., Biddle, Bank and Slavings 1987; Chang, Piliavin and Callero 1988; Granberg and Holmberg 1990), we propose that the effect of self-identity is dichotomous in nature. According to this hypothesis, self-identity influences intention both directly, i.e. independently from the other behavioural determinants; and indirectly, i.e. through attitudes, and specifically through those behavioural beliefs that are related to the schemata with which self-identity has been defined.

RELEVANT LITERATURE AND HYPOTHESES

The Theory of Planned Behaviour

The purpose of the Theory of Reasoned Action (Fishbein and Ajzen 1975), hereafter TRA, and of the Theory of Planned Behaviour (Ajzen 1985, 1991), hereafter TPB, is the prediction and explanation of behaviour. The models assume that the proximal cause of behaviour is the intention to engage in that behaviour. According to the TRA, intentions are, in turn, functions of two variables: attitudes towards the behaviour (Ab) and subjective norm (SN), a factor of social pressure. Subjective norm represents the pressure generated by relevant “others” with respect to that behaviour.

The TPB postulates that in addition to these two predictors, in the study of non volitional behaviours, another factor, called the perceived behavioural control, is a significant determinant of intention and behaviour. The perceived behavioural control (PBC) represents the person’s beliefs as to how easy or difficult performance of the behaviour is likely to be (Ajzen and Madden 1986). Both the TRA and the TPB belong to the family of models called “expectancy-value” models. Therefore attitudes, subjective norm and perceived behavioural control are functions, respectively, of behavioural beliefs, normative beliefs and control beliefs, and of their evaluation, respectively: outcome evaluation, motivation to comply, and perceived power. To obtain an estimate of the determinants of intention, each salient belief must be multiplied by its evaluation, and then all these products must be summed (Fishbein and Ajzen 1975). To determine attitudes, for example, the most important consequences of the behaviour must firstly be identified through a pilot study. Secondly, in the main questionnaire two questions must be included for each of these consequences: “How likely is that X occurs as a consequence of the behaviour Y?” (representing the estimation of the behavioural belief Y) and “How important for you is the occurrence of the consequence Y?” (representing the outcome evaluation for the belief Y). Multiplying the results of these two questions and then adding all the products obtained in correspondence to each selected belief, we reach an indirect measure of attitudes.

Self-identity and the Theory of Planned Behaviour

In social psychology various studies have attempted to extend the determinants of behavioural intention postulated by the TRA or the TPB by including a measure of self-identity (e.g., Armitage, Conner and Norman 1999; Biddle et al. 1987; Chang et al. 1988; Granberg and Holmberg 1990; Sparks and Guthrie 1998; Sparks and Shepherd 1992).

These contributions suggest that self-identity has a significant effect on intention. The size of this effect varies with the behaviour investigated. The meta-analysis by Conner and Armitage (1998) recognises self-identity to be an independent predictor of intention, even controlling the effect of the other determinants postulated by the TPB. In the meta-analysis self-identity appears to explain in average 1% of the variance of intention. Armitage et al. (1999) have found evidence of a stronger effect. These authors investigated the significance of this construct in the explanation of intention together with the effect of mood on information processing. In a food choice context, self-identity was much more significant than attitudes in explaining intention (under positive mood condition for self-identity β=0.80, whereas for attitudes β=0.19; under negative mood condition for self-identity β=0.50, whereas for attitudes β=0.38).

With regards to the behavioural domain considered in this research, the purchase of products characterised by social consumption, like clothing, represents a common means of expression of the self. As noted by Ericksen and Sirgy (1992), in fact, “researchers have found that clothing is important in the perception..."
of others (…), that is indicative of role (…), and that it creates a symbolic image (…). Therefore, it is an expression of personality and of self “ (p. 408).

Shavitt and Fazio (1991) maintain, in a study about the way in which the salience of the attributes employed in the definition of attitudes influences the relationship between attitudes and intention, that “in evaluating an object that is perceived to create a particular social impression (e.g. trendy clothing, …), attributes related to that social impression may be naturally salient and drive one’s evaluation” (p. 508).

Almost all the authors who assessed the effect of self-identity within the context of the TPB attributed to this construct an independent effect on intention (e.g., Biddle et al. 1987; Charng et al. 1988) or on behaviour (Granberg and Holmberg 1990). For example, Biddle et al. (1987) wrote: “although the assumption of consistency between self-identity labels and other cognition may sometimes be warranted, this is certainly not always the case. One can think of examples likely to be characterised by the following reasoning: I would enjoy doing A (…) but I am the type of person more oriented to doing C” (p. 326, Italic added).

Despite the evidence of a direct effect of self-identity on intention, Sparks and Shepherd (1992) are sceptical about the theoretical rationale at the grounds of its definition. They hypothesised that self-identity would influence attitudes but were unable to empirically demonstrate the existence of a mediational effect of attitudes. By finding a significant effect of self-identity in the prediction of brand attitude, Sirgy and Johar (1999) offered such evidence.

Hypotheses

We hypothesise that the mechanism with which self-identity influences purchase intention is that suggested by the self-congruence hypothesis (Sirgy 1982), that states that purchase intention towards a certain product may be weaker or stronger depending on the amount of felt identification towards the image of the product, since such an identification leads to the satisfaction of the need for self-consistency (Sirgy and Johar 1999). The emergence of a relationship between purchase intention and the schemata related to the model that the product suggests is therefore possible, thanks to the presence of a contextual congruence between the image of the product and that of the self.

We contend that the effect of self-identity on purchase intention is dichotomous in nature. Self-identity is hypothesised to exert its influence on intention both independently from the other behavioural determinants and through those behavioural beliefs related to the schemata employed in the definition of self-identity.

According to Eagly and Chaiken (1993), the effect of self-identity could be subsumed under attitudes towards the behaviour because the outcomes of meeting or violating one’s self-concept are consequences of the behaviour. Yet the independent effect of self-identity on intention, shown in the studies listed above, even controlling the effect of the other determinants postulated by the TPB, leads to the following hypothesis:

H1: Self-identity towards the image of a product directly affects purchase intention towards that product.

As maintained by Shavitt and Fazio (1991), moreover, we hypothesise that self-identity labels would influence attitude - and then intention - through the behavioural beliefs related to the social model employed in the definition of those labels:

H2: Self-identity towards the image of a product affects purchase intention towards that product through its influence on the behavioural beliefs related to the definition of self-identity.

The rationale behind this hypothesis is intuitive. Coherently with the self-congruence hypothesis (Smith 1982), depending on the extent to which a certain aspect of the self is important for a person, the more an object is perceived to contribute to enhance that aspect of the self - i.e. the higher the behavioural beliefs related to the object -, the higher will be the purchase intention towards that object.

Hypotheses H1 and H2 together suggest a mediational model of the relationship between self-identity and purchase intention (Baron and Kenny 1986). In such model, the behavioural beliefs linked to the schemata employed in the definition of self-identity, i.e. in our context related to “being trendy”, act as mediator. These behavioural beliefs therefore “explain how external physical events take an internal psychological significance” (Baron and Kenny 1986, p. 1176).

METHOD

Sample and procedure

A branded product was chosen on the basis of a pilot study in which 85 undergraduate Italian students were asked to express their general attitudes towards a list of 10 branded products and their perception of the strength of the image of each brand. The branded products were: Adidas sport clothing, Calvin Klein perfumes, Diesel jeans, Hewlett-Packard calculator, Lacoste clothing, Levi’s jeans, Motorola mobile phone, Ray Ban sunglasses, Sony playstation and Swatch watches. The test clearly showed that Levi’s jeans was the brand with the highest score on both the requirements (attitude and brand image strength).

In a further pre-test with 35 undergraduate students we elicited the most salient beliefs regarding this brand for all the constructs included in the TPB, using the methodology proposed by Ajzen and Fishbein (1980) and widely employed in the literature.

The data for the main study was collected from Italian undergraduate students. The total sample size was 204, 54% male and 46% female (mean age=22.19, s.d.=1.94).

Questionnaire

According to the principle of compatibility (Ajzen and Fishbein 1977) the behaviour investigated was defined with respect to the four characteristics of every behaviour, as postulated by Ajzen and Fishbein (1977): action, target, context and time. We defined the behaviour as the purchase (action) of a pair of Levi’s jeans (target) in the three months after the experiment (time), therefore posing no constraints on context which is the norm for this kind of research (see, e.g., Caprara et al. 1998).

To measure the self-identity towards “being trendy” we used the methodology employed in the domain of green consumerism by Sparks and Shepherd (1992), Sparks and Guthrie (1998) and Armitage et al. (1999). The items were “I regard myself as a person who is very concerned with always being in expensive and high quality clothing”, “I think of myself as a person who is very concerned with the care of his clothes”, “I think of myself as a trendy person”.

The questionnaire contained 10 items for the measurement of attitudes towards the behaviour (5 behavioural beliefs and 5 evaluation of consequences), 6 for subjective norm (3 subjective norms and 3 motivations to comply), and 16 for perceived behavioural control (8 control beliefs and 8 perceived power). Intention has
been measured by the means of 2 items ("How strong is your intention to buy a pair of Levi’s jeans in the next three months?", "Evaluate the likelihood that in the next three months you decide to buy a pair of Levi’s jeans").

Results

The observed level of Cronbach’s alpha for the items about intention and self-identity is, respectively, 0.92 and 0.71. The data was analysed by the means of hierarchical regression, a methodology widely employed testing the TPB (e.g., Ajzen and Madden 1986; Armitage et al. 1999; Fishbein and Stasson 1990; Sparks and Guthrie 1998).

In the first step attitudes (Ab), subjective norm (SN) and perceived behavioural control (PBC) were entered. In the second step self-identity (SI) was added to the previous predictors (Table 1).

By far the most significant predictor is PBC. Results show that self-identity has a significant, but not very strong, effect on purchase intention even after taking into account the other variables.

Introducing gender into the model, as expected for this product, this variable turns out to be a significant predictor of intention (β = -0.255, p < 0.01).1 In fact, the personality of Levi’s is strongly characterised by a factor called “ruggedness” by Aaker (1997). This latent dimension is defined by adjectives such as “tough”, “masculine”, “outdoorsy”, “rugged” and characterises brands such as Levi’s, Marlboro, Nike and Harley-Davidson (Aaker 1997). We expect, therefore, the level of felt identification towards the model synthesized by Levi’s jeans to be much stronger for males than for females, i.e. we expect gender to moderate the relationship between self-identity and behavioural intention. We then conducted another hierarchical regression splitting the sample according to gender. In the case of male subjects, self-identity was more significant than in the complete dataset (β = -0.260, p < 0.01) - as significant as PBC. Moreover, for male subjects multiple R was higher than that reported in Table 1 (0.579). For female subjects, on the contrary, SI was non significant at the level 0.05 and multiple R much lower than that observed for male subjects. These results strongly support the conclusions of Aaker (1997) about the nature of the personality of Levi’s as well as the significance of self-identity in the prediction of purchase intention for male subjects, hence they strengthen the acceptance of H1.

Regarding the test of H2, Table 2 contains the correlations between self-identity and the salient behavioural beliefs selected within the second pilot study and employed in the main questionnaire - representing the subjective estimation of the consequences deriving from the purchase of a pair of Levi’s jeans. The variable included in the analysis, for each behavioural belief considered, was the product between the belief and its evaluation.

For the total sample the correlation between the belief related to the self-schemata used in the definition of self-identity (B1) is more than twice the correlation between self-identity and the others beliefs. In particular, the correlation between SI and B1 is very strong for male subjects (0.63).

Nevertheless, the correlation between self-identity and attitudes, calculated as the sum of the expectancy-value products associated to each belief is weak (0.137). This is due to the fact that B1 is the least significant belief among those considered. In fact, the mean values for each belief listed in Table 2 are respectively: 14.77 (s.d. 10.98); 33.72 (s.d. 12.89); 22.82 (s.d. 12.54); 32.30 (s.d. 12.73); and 29.83 (s.d. 14.55). This means that being trendy as a result of the purchase of a pair of Levi’s jeans was perceived by the subjects as the least significant among the consequences selected for the main study. The weak correlation between SI and attitudes is, therefore, due to the low level of salience of B1.

---

1 The value zero was attributed to male subjects.
To test the mediational model implied by the research hypotheses, we examined the significance of the mediation of the behavioural belief related to “being trendy” (B1) on the relationship between SI and purchase intention using the methodology described by Baron and Kenny (1986). Recently, the appropriateness of this methodology has also been underlined by Lehmann (2001).

SI is highly significant in explaining both the mediator variable (B1) and the dependent variable (intention). (In the first regression $\beta=0.259, p<0.001$ and in the second $\beta=0.095, p=0.01$). Moreover, including B1 in the regression of intention on SI, the significance of SI decreases considerably ($\beta$ from 0.259 to 0.174, p from <0.001 to 0.04). The behavioural belief related to “being trendy” therefore acts as mediator of the relationship between SI and intention. Such conclusion still holds repeating the analysis considering instead of B1 (the multiplication between the behavioural belief and its evaluation) only the behavioural belief. These results lead to the acceptance of H2.

**DISCUSSION**

The results obtained are consistent with both research hypotheses and show that, in the particular context of application chosen, self-identity represents a useful predictor of purchase intention. Although significant, especially for male subjects, the strength of the direct effect of this construct on intention is not very strong ($F_{change}$ significant at the level of 0.05 but not at that of 0.01). In their meta-analysis Conner and Armitage (1998) observed a stronger effect. However, the motivation associated with the behavioural domain investigated in this research is, usually, less intense than that related to the behaviours considered in the meta-analysis by Conner and Armitage (1998) - e.g. blood donation (Charn et al. 1988), or quitting college before finishing (Biddle et al. 1987) - and therefore this result was to be expected.

Concerning the original structure of the model, the research confirms the predictive power of attitudes and, especially, of the perceived behavioural control. As expected for the type of behaviour investigated, subjective norm was not significant. The definition of the determinants of intention made through the “expectancy-value” formulation appears to be a very useful approach, making possible a wide range of analyses of the mechanisms that lead to the formation of purchase intention.

Further research is needed to assess the role of gender in the determination of the link between self-identity and purchase intention. The study should be repeated using subjects belonging to other population segments and different categories of products, such as low involvement goods. The construct of involvement seems indeed to be linked to that of self-identity: the higher the felt identification towards the image of a product, the higher the involvement of the subject towards the purchase of that product. Further research is needed to verify the existence of a proportional link between the levels of the two constructs.

**Conclusions**

The purpose of the research was to verify, within the framework provided by the Theory of Planned Behaviour (Ajzen 1985, 1991), the existence of a significant relationship between self-identity and purchase intention, as well as to identify the mechanisms that exert such an effect.

A research project characterised by two pre-tests and a main study was carried out. Levi’s jeans was used as the stimulus product and self-identity was ascertained by using the self-schemata related to “being trendy”.

From an analysis of past research two different ways of interpreting the relationship between self-identity and behavioural intention emerge. The first one singles out a direct effect of self-identity not mediated by other variables (e.g., Chang et al. 1988; Biddle et al. 1987), whereas the second claims the existence of a mediating effect of attitudes (e.g., Sparks and Shepherd 1992). Instead of assuming one of these two views, we proposed that the relationship between self-identity and purchase intention is dichotomous in nature.

Results were consistent with both hypotheses and suggest that self-identity influences purchase intention in two distinct ways: directly, independently from the other behavioural determinants; and indirectly, through attitudes, and specifically through those behavioural beliefs related to the schemata with which self-identity has been defined.

From a broader perspective, this research confirms the need, in the study of purchase intention, for considering structural factors linked to the personality of the consumer together with the cognitive processes represented by the determinants included in the TPB.

**REFERENCES**


Fishbein, Martin and Icek Ajzen (1975), Belief, Attitude, Intention and Behaviour: An introduction to Theory and Research, Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley.


An Exploratory Study of Grocery Shopping Motivations
Maggie Geuens, Ghent University, Belgium
Malaika Brengman, University of Brussels, Belgium
Rosette S’Jegers, University of Brussels, Belgium

ABSTRACT
Increasing time pressure and declining discretionary time may have altered shopping motivations and shopping behaviour. In order to reveal contemporary shopping motivations a qualitative research method is used. Eleven different motivations are determined, and classified as functional, experiential and social. On the basis of these shopping motivations, six different grocery shopper segments are hypothesized. The results show that no real new demands seem to emerge, but that consumers seem to become very demanding: they expect a large assortment, high quality food, high quality personnel and management, but also low prices and a nice shopping atmosphere.

INTRODUCTION
An increasing number of females in paid work force, more one-parent families, less discretionary time, and more time pressure on the one hand (Lachance, Legault and Bujold 2000; Perry-Jenkins, Repetti and Crouter 2000), and more variation in retail outlets, more opportunities for e-shopping and increasing technological improvements on the other (Donthu and Garcia 1999; Kumar 1997), may impact current shopping behaviour. A recent study points out that about 20% of the Belgian citizens consider grocery shopping as a tough chore and 40% want to reduce the time they spend on it (Van Rompaey 1998). Therefore, the question arises whether these trends of the last two decades have changed consumers’ motivations and needs for grocery shopping. In order to answer this question, qualitative research is undertaken. Besides probing into shopping motivations, an attempt will be made to hypothesize a shopper typology.

SHOPPING MOTIVATIONS
According to Westbrook and Black (1985) one of the most appropriate bases on which to develop a shopper typology is the underlying shopping motivations. Therefore, a brief review of studies investigating shopping motivations is presented. One of the first researchers to investigate shopping motivations was Tauber (1972). Using depth interviews, Tauber probed into the satisfaction consumers experienced from shopping and identified six personal motivations: 1. Playing a culturally prescribed role, 2. Diversion from daily routine, 3. Receiving sensory stimulation, 4. Self-gratification, 5. Learning about new trends and fashions, and 6. Getting physical activity. Besides personal motivations, Tauber also distinguished five social shopping motivations: 1. Social interaction outside the home, 2. Communicating with others sharing similar interests, 3. Affiliating with peer groups, 4. Increasing social status and experiencing authority (with regard to the personnel who have to fulfill the customers’ wishes), and 5. Successfully bargaining and negotiating. The major contribution of Tauber is the recognition that shopping may occur not only for acquiring goods, but also for satisfying social and personal needs (Westbrook and Black 1985). Studies in the US, as well as in Europe, show that the importance of interactions with salespeople as a surrogate for social contact should not be underestimated (Forman and Sriram 1991; Reynolds and Beatty 1999). However, also some of the personal needs (hedonic, experiential and recreational motivations) seem to be universal and have been stressed by many researchers (Bellenger and Korgaonkar 1980; Bloch, Richway and Sherrell 1989; Van Ossel 1998). Westwood and Black (1985) include on top of personal and social motivations, a product-oriented dimension consisting of anticipated utility and satisfaction of obtaining what one was looking for.

Sheth (1983) distinguished functional and non-functional motivations. Functional motivations pertain to tangible aspects such as product assortment, product quality, convenience, price etc., while non-functional motivations comprise non-tangible aspects (such as store clientele, store reputation and promotions), social motivations (social interaction etc.) and personal motivations (enjoyable experiences). Similar classifications are proposed elsewhere. Dawson, Bloch and Ridgway (1990) classified shopping motivations in experiential (watching other people, enjoying the crowd, meet new people, etc) and product-related needs (find new or unique products, see new things, etc.). And Dholakia (1999) identified, besides a product-oriented motivation labelled “utilitarian” and a personal or hedonic motivation consisting of shopping as pleasure, a social dimension referring to having interactions with family members.

Shim, Gehrt and Holikova (1998) started their study from previously defined shopping orientation scales, and add items pertaining to food safety, health, and home cooking, leading them to seven dimensions: convenience, price consciousness, recreation, food safety, health, home shopping and enjoying home cooking. Although the first three dimensions have been encountered elsewhere, the other four dimensions are new. This shows that recently new shopping motivations may have arisen. And, unless newer aspects are incorporated in existing questionnaires, these changes cannot be revealed.

As a conclusion, a certain overlap in general dimensions seems to exist, no matter where the study is carried out (US, Canada or Europe). However, specific dimensions differ, even within the same country. Therefore, other variables besides cross-cultural effects impact shopping motivations: 1. Retail format. Value, convenience and price seem to be the most important motivators for home shopping, while a greater variety of motivations seem to prevail for in-store shopping (Eastlick and Feinberg 1999). 2. Shopping situation and personality. Situational shopping motivations are temporary and differ depending on a consumer’s situation such as time pressure (Dellaert et al. 1998), social surroundings or task definition (e.g. urgent versus regular purchase) (Van Kenhove, De Wulf and Van Waterschoot 1999). Enduring shopping motivations are relatively stable over time and are related with a person’s personality in the sense that some consumers may actually be “born to shop” (Mooradian and Oliver 1996). 3. Product category. Motivations for grocery shopping may be very different from motivations for apparel shopping. The former usually is considered as stressful and unpleasant, while the latter is more likely to be regarded as satisfying, rewarding, and as a way of self-expression (Aylott and Mitchell 1998; Dholakia 1999). The question then arises whether, for example, experiential and recreational motivations are as strong in grocery shopping than in shopping for products such as apparel.

SHOPPER TYPOLOGIES
Shoppers have been segmented on a wide variety of classification variables. In 1954, Stone offers the first typology based on
consumers’ attitudes towards shopping. The ‘economic consumer’ is concerned with price, product assortment and quality. The ‘personalizing consumer’ seeks social relationships with retail personnel. The ‘ethical consumer’ is concerned with moralistic concerns and is willing to give up lower prices or a larger assortment to help out the little retailer, for example. Finally, the ‘apathetic consumer’ shops out of necessity and is not involved at all with shopping.

Starting from perceived characteristics of preferred grocery shops, Williams, Painter and Nichols (1978) found four shopping segments: 1. Low-price shoppers, 2. Convenience shoppers, 3. Involved shoppers and 4. Apathetic shoppers. Lesser and Hughes (1986) surveyed 17 different US communities and come up with: 1. Inactive shoppers (not interested in shopping and not concerned about price, service or product assortment), 2. Active shoppers (looking for value for money, and interested in exclusive products and retailers with an upper middle class appeal), 3. Service shoppers (pay higher prices for additional services, seek convenient stores with friendly personnel), 4. Traditional shoppers (not enthusiastic about shopping, not very price sensitive nor very demanding), 5. Dedicated fringe shoppers (continuously looking for new products and new ways of shopping, not brand, nor store loyal, not interested in socializing), 6. Price shoppers (willing to give up quality, service and assortment for the lowest price), 7. Transitional shoppers (young people who often switch stores).

Bellenger and Korgaonkar (1980) classify shoppers into recreational and functional economic shoppers. Recreational, as compared to functional economic shoppers, spend more time per shopping trip, are less inclined to plan their purchases in advance, and are more likely to show a preference for department stores. In a similar way, Boecker (1995) segmented consumers into ‘new type shoppers’ and ‘traditional shoppers’. New type shoppers are very demanding consumers valuing not only the recreational, but also the economic and convenience characteristics of a store. They prefer a good above a nearby store, value service, and often do not pre-plan purchases. Traditional shoppers, on the other hand, only buy pre-planned products, are not the first to buy new products, compare prices, look for bargains, and do not value recreational aspects.

Segmenting on seven shopping orientation dimensions (price consciousness, recreation, food safety, health, convenience, home shopping and home cooking), Shim et al. (1998) came up with four grocery shopping segments: 1. Food safety/health shoppers, 2. Convenience shoppers, 3. Middle-of-the-road shoppers, and 4. Home shoppers. The first segment does not care about convenience nor recreation, but value food safety and health to a great extent. Convenience shoppers are willing to forego other characteristics for convenience and show a proclivity towards home shopping. Home shoppers score highest on the home shopping and the recreation dimension, while middle-of-the-road shoppers provide mid-rate scores for all dimensions.

Van Kenhove and De Wulf (2000) investigate both a personal factor (income) and a situational factor (time pressure), and classify Belgian grocery shoppers into “money-poor, time-rich”, “money-poor, time-poor”, “money-rich, time-poor” and “money-rich, time-rich” shoppers. Money-poor, time-rich shoppers switch store for bulky items in order to buy at cheapest prices. Money-rich, time-poor shoppers show less need for stock-up purchases since their time is more valuable than the savings from buying a large quantity at a lower price. Time-rich shoppers hold a positive attitude towards shopping, while time-poor shoppers express a negative attitude. As for one-stop shopping, only the attitudes of money-poor, time-rich shoppers are negative. This is not surprising since they have the time and a financial motive to search for low prices.

RESEARCH OBJECTIVES

One of the challenges facing retail management is not to lose touch with and remain responsive to consumers (Dawson 2000). Because of changes in people’s personal and professional life, as well as in the retail environment (see introduction part), consumer motivations and needs for grocery shopping may have changed over time. With increasing time pressure nowadays, functional motivations may have become much more important than experiential motivations. Moreover, the results of Shim et al. (1998) indicate that new shopping segments have recently emerged. Therefore, in order to better understand the consumer, an exploratory, qualitative study is undertaken consisting of listening to consumers rather than having them respond to predetermined questions. For, the results of Shim et al. (1998) show that it can be important to adapt existing questionnaires to actual life situations.

The objective of this study is twofold. The first objective consists of determining current and future grocery shopping motivations by investigating aspects of satisfaction and dissatisfaction with current retail formats, as well as by having respondents invent a future grocery store that they would like to patronize. A second objective is to formulate a hypothesized shopper typology on the basis of factors that seem to determine store preferences and shopping behaviour. Such a typology can give an answer to the question whether or not new kinds of shopper segments seem to be arising and if so, how grocery stores might deal with them.

RESEARCH METHOD

A qualitative research method, focus groups, is used since focus groups offer the advantage of interviewing several persons at the same time during which respondents can stimulate each other. Eight focus groups are run, on average consisting of 9 respondents. Four focus groups took place in the Dutch speaking part and four in the French speaking part of the country. Moreover, homogeneous groups were formed with respect to education level (university, college, secondary school) and working status (full time employed versus part time or unemployed). A professional moderator led the focus groups, and only intervened to probe into consumers’ statements. Every session was recorded on video and watched by five persons (2 of the authors, 2 students making a thesis on the subject and the moderator). Full write-ups and summaries were made of each session. The text of the write-ups was divided in chunks and coded and check-coded by all five members of the team. This way objectivity was enhanced and it was ensured that the reported motivations and typology came from the data and not from the researchers’ prejudices.

RESEARCH RESULTS

6.1. Shopping motivations

Shopping motivations are inferred by means of four different questions. First of all, negative and positive associations with grocery shopping are taken into account. Secondly, consumers are directly probed for their shopping needs. Next, consumers have to classify the available grocery shopping alternatives and indicate why they do or do not like the different alternatives. And finally, consumers have to compose a store that they would like to patronize in the future.

Associations, and negative and positive aspects

Going shopping, as compared to grocery shopping, is perceived to be a relaxing, recreational activity. The consumer can explore, be seduced, and spend money, without feeling the urge to return home with a full basket. As was indicated by Aylott and Mitchell (1998), and Dholakia (1999), grocery shopping has more
negative associations. Consumers see it as a functional or utilitarian activity representing a necessity. Frequently mentioned positive aspects of grocery shopping refer mainly to experiential motivations such as the discovery of new products and new tastes, the liking of animations, demonstrations and nice decorations especially during the Christmas and Easter period. However, also a social motivation (meeting of other people) and a functional motivation (sales promotions such as gadgets or gifts that accompany products) can be deduced. Negative associations predominantly point to functional motivations. For example, statements such as “too long waiting lines at the checkout”, “old people shopping during peak time”, “too crowded store”, “too narrow aisles”, “frozen products that start melting at the cash counter”, “no parking space available”, “badly manoeuvrable trolleys”, “bringing back trolleys on rainy days”, and “stress when closing hour is approaching” all refer to a lack of convenience. Lack of reliability also seems an important negative aspect as can be deduced from the mentioning of “out-of-stocks”, and “mistakes in the check”, while “decayed products on the shelves” and “ignorant personnel” seem to refer to an inadequate level of the quality of the products or of the quality of the personnel. However, not only functional motivations form the basis of negative associations as can be inferred from the remarks “annoying music” and “unfriendly personnel”.

**Grocery shopping needs**

The top-of-mind motivations indicated by the respondents for having a satisfying grocery shopping experience consist of five functional motivations (convenience, assortment, reliability and quality), and one experiential motivation (atmosphere). Convenience is related to opening hours, speed of shopping, and not having to drag the groceries. Assortment points to the fact that the consumer wants the assortment one is looking for: no more (too large assortments impediment the choice process) and no less (the consumer wants the advantage of one-stop shopping). Reliability is synonymous for availability: the consumer wants his or her favourite products to be available all of the time. Quality refers to the products, as well as to the personnel and the management. As was to be expected, the consumer is only satisfied when a minimum level of quality is reached. With respect to atmosphere, the consumer seems to favour the extremes: a very rational environment (no or very few services, entertainment and promotions) in which the consumer can keep control, or a nice shopping atmosphere aimed at seducing to which one can render oneself.

**Liking and disliking of shopping alternatives**

Respondents list all the different grocery shopping alternatives they know, after which they are written on separate cards. Next, respondents classify the shopping alternatives in different groups. No classification characteristics were given, nor the number of groups that were to be formed. In general, nine different store groups are composed (see Table 1). The advantages and disadvantages mentioned mainly refer to: 1. **Functional motivations** pertaining to the price, quality of products and personnel, whether interesting food or non-food promotions are offered, depth and width of the

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nr</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Likes</th>
<th>Dislikes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Hard discounters</td>
<td>Low prices, high quality, small assortment (no choice problem), quick checkout, non-food promotions</td>
<td>Unattractive store atmosphere, small assortment, inconvenient trolleys</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Supermarkets</td>
<td>Nice store atmosphere, quality of personnel, one-stop shopping, large assortment, specialised products, demonstrations and suggestions, loyalty cards, progressive character</td>
<td>Too much seduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Hypermarkets</td>
<td>Large parking &amp; assortment, cafeteria, restaurant, non-food promotions, only for major shopping trip</td>
<td>Large distances, less attractive atmosphere</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Small Supermarkets</td>
<td>Social contact with personnel, nice atmosphere, products are easily located, accessibility, for specific products or in case of an urgent purchase</td>
<td>Smaller assortment, higher prices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Corner shops</td>
<td>Social contact with personnel, trustworthy, in case of an urgent purchase</td>
<td>Small assortment, high prices, more frequent stock-outs, takes time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Bakery, butcher, specialty store</td>
<td>Quality, trustworthy, social contact with personnel, individualised service</td>
<td>Small assortment, more frequent stock outs, expensive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Night shops, vending machines</td>
<td>Convenience, in case of an urgent purchase</td>
<td>Small assortment, expensive, no social interaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Market place</td>
<td>Recreational atmosphere, social contacts, fresh products, specific assortment, social interactions</td>
<td>Open only half a day per week, dragging groceries all the time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Home shopping</td>
<td>Convenience, in case of extreme time-pressure</td>
<td>No sensory experiences, speed and time of delivery</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
assortment, reliability (no stock-outs) and convenience (speed at the checkout, the time needed for shopping, the quality of the trolleys, large parking lots, etc.). 2. **Experiential motivations** consisting of a nice and seductive store atmosphere, with demonstrations and the possibility of discovering and tasting special products, 3. **Social motivations** composed of social interactions with peers and store personnel.

The future store

Participants are asked, in groups of four or five people, to compose a future store they would like to patronize. Again, similar motivations as described above are revealed. **Convenience** is expressed by the desire for opening hours of 24 hours a day, seven days a week, as well as by the desire for large parking lots, stores easy accessible by public as well as by private transportation, one time scanning in order to reduce waiting lines at the checkout, repair services, child care services, and a home delivery service. The demand for specialised and fresh food, and for expert personnel points to an underlying need for **quality**. A desire for transparent and competitive pricing procedures reflects the **price** motivation, while the desire for a perfect stock management is associated with a **reliability** motivation. Furthermore, respondents explicitly mentioned that they would like to have broad product **assortments** consisting of both fresh and pre-packed foods, and a store **atmosphere** conducive of fun and seduction. Consumers want a bright, green store, with nice music in which they can shop without feeling stressed. Contrary to the statements made concerning current shopping motivations where respondents wanted or a rational, or a seductive environment, the future stores were all composed of fun and seduction. **Promotions**, demonstrations and tasting of products should be part of the shopping experience, as well as the possibility to **discover new products**. Finally, consumers stress the importance of **social interactions** with friendly and helpful personnel. They hold on to this even in case the designed store was made up of a very automated and rational environment. Surprisingly, no one mentioned anything about social interactions with peer groups. However, the desire for a cafeteria and a restaurant in the store may indicate a need for having social conversations away from the immediate grocery environment.

To conclude, the four ways used to reveal shopping motivations all lead to more or less similar results. The motivations discovered here are very similar to Sheth’s (1983) typology, but are rather different from the ones proposed by Tauber (1972), and Westbrook and Black (1985). Dholakia’s (1999) “interaction with the family” dimension is also missing, as are the newer shopping orientations detected by Shimp et al. (1998), such as food safety, health and home cooking. In view of the Belgian dioxin crisis that broke out 6 months prior to the focus groups, especially the fact that the participants did not make a reference to food safety and health is remarkable. Although time poverty was frequently mentioned, functional shopping orientations do not seem to overrule the hedonic or social motivations. All in all, consumers’ shopping motivations remain pretty similar than 15 years ago. Even in the description of the future stores, in which a lot of attention was paid to functional and efficient shopping, social interactions with store personnel and a nice shopping environment, that reminds more of going on adventure than doing grocery shopping were highlighted. The only difference with 15 years ago is the fact that consumers have become very demanding: they want professional personnel, high quality products, an efficient store management, a nice store environment and low prices. Boedeker (1995) also mentioned this demanding aspect for his 'new type shopper'.

**A hypothesized grocery shopper typology**

During the focus sessions, special attention was paid to shopping motivations, personal and situational factors that seemed to impact the respondents’ store preference and shopping behaviour. In this respect the following factors came up:

- **Time poverty**. Time poverty as defined here not only refers to the amount of time consumers are able to spend on grocery shopping, but also to the amount of time they are willing to devote to it (enduring involvement). Some respondents who were objectively not time pressured (e.g. part-time employment and no kids), had an active lifestyle and preferred doing other things to doing grocery shopping.
- **Social needs**. Some people were looking for social interactions with peer groups and/or preferred to engage in social relationships with store personnel, while other consumers were not looking for social contacts during grocery shopping.
- **Experiential needs**. Experiential needs reflect the extent to which the consumer looks for sensory gratification by the store atmosphere and/or his or her desire for new experiences such as new retail forms, new stores, and/or new products.

On the basis of these three factors, six grocery shopper segments are hypothesized: 1. **Convenience shoppers (time-poor, low social needs, low experiential needs)**. Shoppers in this segment exhibit purely rational shopping behaviour driven mainly by functional motivations: they want to buy good value for money products in an efficient way. Therefore, they engage in routine behaviour to reduce search costs and save time. The grocery stores most frequently patronized are larger hard discounters. The smaller assortment is perceived to be an advantage since this leads to less purchase decisions and saves them time. However, the assortment should be large enough in order for the consumer to take advantage of one-stop shopping. Supermarkets may also be visited if they are more conveniently located or in case they have more convenient opening hours. Convenience shoppers favour technological improvements and automatization since they do not care about socializing with the personnel. This type of shopper is also included in the typology of Williams et al. (1978) and Shim et al. (1998). 2. **Low-price shoppers (time-rich, low social needs, low experiential needs)**. These consumers have a lot of time and are willing to spend a lot of time on grocery shopping. They look for the cheapest prices and best bargains. Therefore, they are more likely to patronize multiple stores, and are category-specific store-loyal rather than category-independent store-loyal. They typically patronize hard discounters. This segment is also mentioned by Williams et al. (1978) and Lesser and Hughes (1986). 3. **Social shoppers (time-poor, high social needs, low experiential needs)**. Because of time-poverty, social consumers shop less frequently than intense social shoppers. The main shopping motivation for this shopper segment consists of a social need. Therefore, they are more likely to be category-independent store-loyal in order to increase the possibility of building social relationships with the store personnel. Therefore, antisocial ways of shopping such as internet shopping are definitely out of the question. 4. **Intense social shoppers (time-rich, high social needs, low experiential needs)**. The main motivation is again social interaction. These consumers either visit multiple small stores (bakery, butcher, corner shops) or visit the same store very frequently. They are also very likely to go shopping on the market since this is an ideal place for socializing. Similar to social shoppers, intense social shoppers do not consider internet shopping or another form of in-
home shopping as an alternative for in-store shopping. 5. Experiential shoppers (time-poor, low or high social needs, high experiential needs). The main motivation of experiential shoppers is sensory gratification. Therefore, store atmosphere is very important. They are willing to give up a lower price for a nice and stimulating shopping environment. Because of time poverty they do not often visit shopping malls, but try to satisfy their experiential needs in supermarkets offering both a large assortment (with several new and exotic products) making one-stop shopping possible, and a nice atmosphere with seductions, promotions and demonstrations. A remarkable finding is that, contrary to the time these consumers have available, experiential shoppers often exert a lot of effort (and lose quite some time) to patronize specialty and ethnic grocery stores. A similar observation was made in a Trends survey conducted by the Food Marketing Institute (Anonymous, 1998).

6. Recreational shoppers (time-rich, low or high social needs, high experiential needs). Recreational shoppers are identical to experiential shoppers, except for the fact that they are able and willing to spend time on grocery shopping. They have the opportunity to visit shopping malls besides supermarkets, and to patronize specialty stores. This satisfies their need for seduction, new products and new shopping experiences, as well as a possible need for socialization. As for experiential shoppers, recreational shoppers may enhance social interactions by frequently shopping in the same store. Recreational shoppers are also comprised in Bellenger and Korgaonkar’s (1980) typology and resemble the “innovator shopper” in Lesser and Hughes’ (1986) typology.

Three of the hypothesized shopper types (convenience, low price and recreational shoppers) appear frequently in the literature. The other types have not been explicitly mentioned before, although they are not real new kind of shoppers.

CONCLUSIONS

A qualitative research method was employed to increase the likelihood of detecting changes in shopping motivations. Nevertheless, current shopping motivations seem to remain pretty similar to the ones identified 15 years ago. In this study eleven motivations were registered: six functional motivations (convenience, product and personnel quality, price, reliability, assortment, and promotions), three experiential (discovering new products, store atmosphere, and demonstrations, animations and tasting experiences), and two social (meeting people, and social interaction with personnel). Moreover, consumers’ motivations and demands seem to differ for current and future shopping. In current stores a consumer looks either for efficiency and convenience, low prices, social contacts, experiential experiences, or for a combination of some of these characteristics. The future store consumers want to patronize encompasses all elements: e.g. large assortments for one stop shopping, fresh and pre-packed foods, techniques reducing shopping time, friendly and knowledgeable personnel, nice shopping atmosphere full of seduction, promotions and demonstrations, AND low prices. In this way, the six different shopping types hypothesized for current shopping behaviour and store preferences seem to merge in the ‘new type shoppers’ identified by Boedeker (1995). However, one can wonder how realistic it is to combine all these elements in the same store. The next question then becomes: if these store outlets are not feasible, which characteristics are consumers willing to forego for which others? How important is each characteristic for the different shoppers, and in what exact direction does the consumer want his or her currently preferred store to evolve? Future quantitative research should answer this question. Since the current study is only qualitative in nature, quantitative research is needed anyway in order to test whether or not the hypothesized segments can be confirmed and to investigate the size and profile of each segment.

REFERENCES


ABSTRACT

Behavioral research examining sales promotion has been heavily focused on the effects that price discounts have on consumer perceptions and purchase behavior. This session examines the advantages of using alternative promotional strategies to standard price discounts. These alternatives include promotions that increase the perceptual salience of products and thereby influence purchase and consumption behavior, as well as the use of everyday-low-prices and free gift promotions. Particular attention is paid to the conditions under which these alternative strategies are likely to be effective, as well as to identifying the psychological processes that underlie their effects.

Discounts are by far the most commonly used form of sales promotion. Indeed, their use has steadily increased in recent years. For instance, the number of price reductions offered in department stores grew from 6% of total sales to 19% between 1963 and 1986, while the number of coupons distributed by manufacturers tripled between 1976 and 1988, reaching, in 1995, the astonishing number of 3,000 per household (Blattberg and Neslin 1991, p.15). However, despite their growth in popularity, the use of discounts as a promotional strategy has received a good deal of criticism. For instance, it can be hard to predict sales volume and maintain inventory when using discounts, advertising costs are high, and consumers may be becoming increasingly wary of the initial price claims suggested by discounted price claims. In fact, many studies claim that the majority of price promotion programs are not profitable (Abraham and Lodish 1990).

The existing research on sales promotion has also focused almost exclusively on the effects price discounts have on perceptions of price, quality, value, and purchase intentions/behavior. Relatively little research has examined alternative pricing and promotion strategies, such as the offer of a free gift, everyday-low-prices (EDLPs), or nonmonetary promotions used at the point of purchase. Further, beyond its effects on purchase behavior, relatively little is known about the potential influence sales promotion can have on behavior outside the initial purchase context—especially its influence on consumption behavior. The papers included in this session focus on these somewhat neglected aspects of sales promotion, in order to better understand the full range of effects that sales promotion can have on consumer behavior. Particular attention is paid to the advantages and disadvantages of using alternative promotional strategies, and in determining the conditions under which these alternatives might be preferred to standard discounts. Overall, this special topics session provides new insights into the advantages of using alternative promotional strategies to standard discounts, as well as identifying the psychological processes that underlie these effects.

In a series of studies, Chandon examines the salience effects that non-monetary promotions can have on consumer attention, purchase and consumption. He shows that attention-grabbing promotions, such as shelf displays, can increase purchase intention without necessitating a price reduction, simply because consumers often buy the first thing that they notice on the store shelf. Interestingly, the attentional effects of promotions were more likely to occur for non-branded products than for branded products. Additional studies go beyond the initial purchase situation to show that an increase in visual salience in the house pantry caused by promotional packs can accelerate consumption behavior. The implication of this study is that marketers can improve the profitability of their promotions by increasing their attention-grabbing impact at the point of purchase and at the point of consumption.

In the second presentation, Darke and Chung examine the negative effects that different forms of promotional activity can have on product image. They show that discounted items are highly vulnerable to negative quality inferences which tend to undermine the perceived value of the offer in the consumer’s eyes. Although many marketing practitioners have suggested EDLP claims are less vulnerable to quality inferences than discounts, the data presented by Darke and Chung suggest this is not the case. EDLP claims were just as vulnerable to negative quality inferences as discounts. Importantly, Darke and Chung show that free gift offers were better able to communicate value to consumers, because they led individuals to use the higher original price as the basis of inferring the quality of the product. Finally, Darke and Chung show that the initial effects of advertising a sales promotion on perceptions of quality are further exaggerated following actual product trial. This last finding suggests that negative quality inferences that are initially made after seeing an ad for a sales promotion can “snowball” as consumers gain further experience with the promoted item. By drawing on the extensive price-perceived quality literature, Darke and Chung are able to provide clear advice about situations in which marketers should consider using free gift promotions rather than price discounts.

In the final presentation, Raghubir reports a series of studies investigating the impact of offering a product as a free gift has on perceptions of the quality of the free gift itself. Her studies suggest that the use of a product as a free gift may undermine perceptions of its quality, especially when the price of the product is not mentioned in the ad, the product is not well-known brand, or when the visual salience of the free gift is particularly high. Additional findings suggest that the value of the deal is undermined when the above factors cause consumers to doubt the quality of the free gift. One important conclusion is that marketers should carefully choose the manner in which they offer free gifts if they hope to increase the perceived value of the offer, as well as to avoid damaging the image of the product offered as a gift.

In addition to the three research presentations, our discussion leader Gilles Laurent provides his views on the papers, as well as the general topic of alternative promotional strategies. This discussion will focus partly on the importance of understanding the complexity of the effects that sales promotion can have on consumer perception and behavior. Especially in terms of appreciating that promotional activities often have a number of unintended effects on consumer perceptions, which may or may not be beneficial to the marketer. Furthermore, these effects concern a broad range of consumer responses to promotion, including purchase and consumption rates, perceptions of quality for the promoted item, and overall perceptions of the value of the deal. Greater appreciation of these effects is necessary if marketers are to make effective use of the range of promotional techniques available to them.
The Attentional Effects of Sales Promotions at the Point of Purchase and at the Point of Consumption

Pierre Chandon, INSEAD, France

Why do consumers respond more to sales promotions than to equivalent price reductions? Most prior research has addressed this issue by examining the symbolic and emotional consumer benefits of sales promotions (e.g., Darke and Friedman 1995; Lichtenstein et al. 1990; Strahilevitz and Myers 1998). In prior research (Chandon et al. 2000), we argued that sales promotions provide at least another nonmonetary but utilitarian benefit, reduced search costs, by raising the visual salience of products. Sales promotions increase visual salience either through distinctive and temporary packaging or through special signalling. This higher visual salience increases the chances that the product will be seen, a necessary condition for further consideration and choice. So far, the attentional effects of sales promotions have been studied using field experiments (e.g., Inman et al. 1990; Woodside and Waddle 1975). In this research, we use process-tracing data and lab experiments to examine how promotion-driven visual salience influences visual attention and brand consideration. We study the attentional effects of sales promotions not only at the point of purchase but also at the point of consumption. Finally, we study how these effects differ for new vs. established brands and for ready to consume vs. inconvenient to consume products.

In the first study, we examine the effects of shelf talkers on visual attention, brand consideration, and long-term memory at the point of purchase. Shelf talkers are simply shelf tags that display the name of a product in a prominent way. With the collaboration of Perception Research Inc., we ask 300 adult shoppers to look at a picture of a supermarket shelf and to tell which brands they consider buying while their eye movements are being tracked. We use a 4 (no promotion, shelf talker on new brand, shelf talker on established brand, shelf talker on new and 3 other brands) between-subject design. Prices are provided for each product and remain constant across conditions. We find that adding a shelf talker reproducing the brand’s logo increases the amount (number of looks), speed (time until the first eye fixation), and intensity (gaze duration) of attention for new brands but not for established brands. As a result, we find that shelf talkers only increase brand consideration and long-term memory for new brands. We also find that the effects decrease with the number of shelf talkers available on the shelf, and that adding a shelf talker decreases the overall amount of consumer search.

In the second study, we examine whether these results also hold at the point of consumption, and may thus explain why promotional stockpiling accelerates post-purchase consumption rates (Ailawadi and Neslin 1998). We ask 102 undergraduate students to choose what they want to consume by looking at a picture representing a pantry with eight different snack food products located on two shelves. Each product is assigned to one of four conditions according to a 2 (promotional stockpiling: 4 vs. 16 units) by 2 (salience: control vs. high) between-subject design with eight within-subject replications. To manipulate product salience, we place the brands in the “high” salience condition on the top shelf and spread them out on the shelf whereas the brands in the control salience condition are placed on the lower shelf and stacked on top of each other. We find that, in the control salience condition, promotional stockpiling increases product salience and consumption likelihood. On the other hand, promotional stockpiling has no effect when the salience of the product is fixed and at a high level. Further mediation analyses show that, as expected, the effect of promotional stockpiling on consumption incidence are partially mediated by the higher salience of promoted product.

In the third study, we examine the effects of salience on consumption intentions and brand search for convenient to consume products and for products that require preparation before being consumed. We use a 2 (high and low consumption convenience) by 2 (high and low salience) between-subject design with two within-subject replications consisting of two different products (a food and a beverage) in the same experimental condition. We ask 75 undergraduate students to choose something to eat and to drink from the products available in a schematic representation of a pantry and a refrigerator. We then collect brand recall and consideration information. We manipulate consumption convenience by using pudding or ice-tea mix either in dehydrated mix formula, or in refrigerated ready to consume formula. We manipulate product salience by placing the target drink and food either on the middle of the fridge or pantry with black font on a light-gray background, or by placing them at the bottom with black font on a dark-gray background. As expected, we find a significant interaction between convenience and salience: raising salience increases consideration when the product is convenient to consume, but not when the product is less convenient to consume. The memory data suggests that these results are caused by lower search and consideration in the convenient to consume condition. In fact, we find that salience increases recall for the target product and decreases the size of the attention and consideration sets only when the salient product is convenient to consume. When the target product is not convenient to consume, consumers continue to search and to add brands in the consideration set after seeing the salient low convenience product—most likely because they are looking for a more convenient alternative.

Overall, these results show that marketers can design more effective and cheaper sales promotions by emphasizing their attentional impact, both at the point of purchase, and at the point of consumption. Such attention-getting promotions would be particularly effective when the product is unfamiliar and convenient to consume.

Effects of Pricing and Promotion on Perceptions of Product Quality: It Depends on How You Frame It

Peter R. Darke, University of British Columbia, Canada
Cindy M.Y. Chung, Nanyang Technological University, Singapore

Sales promotion attempts to stimulate purchase behavior by increasing the perceived value of the offer in the consumer’s eyes. While price discounts have become the most dominant form of sales promotion, their use has also come under increased scrutiny. One of the main concerns is that discounts may lead to negative perceptions of product quality, which undermines the perceived value of the offer. While common wisdom suggests EDLPs may enjoy some advantage over discounts in this respect, the research described here shows that both strategies are vulnerable to negative quality inferences (Studies 1 and 2). In contrast, free gift offers were better able to maintain quality perceptions than discounts, and were ultimately more effective in communicating deal value to consumers (Study 3).

The notion of attribute framing (Levin et al., 1998) was used as the basis of our predictions. This occurs when superficial variations in the description of a single product feature leads consumers to make positive or negative inferences about the product as a whole. In the present context, the idea was that consumers would use the prices suggested by different promotional offers to infer product quality. To the extent that the prices included in the offer are lower, perceptions of quality should also be lower (Rao and Monroe 1989). EDLPs and discounts both frame price
STUDY 1
Experimental Conditions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OFFER-TYPE</th>
<th>SELLING PRICE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EDLP</td>
<td>EDLP .... $59.99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discount</td>
<td>Was .... $79.99</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The results showed that a lower selling price led to lower perceptions of quality [F (2,163)=5.92, p<.01], regardless of whether the offer was made as a discount or an EDLP [p' s=.25 for offer-type main effect and interaction]. This suggested it is relatively difficult to attenuate negative price-quality effects using discount and EDLP claims. In addition, a second study further confirmed that discounts and EDLPs were highly vulnerable to negative quality inferences.

The final study examined whether free gift frames could better maintain perceptions of quality. Framing the value of an offer as a free gift (price $59.99, plus a free gift worth $20) should provide a higher price standard for quality inferences than framing the offer as a monetary savings ($20 off the initial price). Framing suggests that consumers offered a free gift are more likely to view quality in terms of the full price, rather than correcting for the value of the free gift. To test this idea, subjects were randomly assigned to one of the following conditions: high price ($59.99) and moderate price ($39.99) controls, a standard discount offer (Was $59.99, now $39.99), and a free-gift offer (Price $59.99, plus free $20 gift). A repeated measure of product quality served as the main dependent variable. Product ads were presented to subjects online using a computer simulation of an internet shopping environment. In the free gift condition, the ad stated that the price of the headphones was $59.99, and included a free $20 CD of their choice. Pricing information in the control and discount conditions were varied as in studies 1 and 2. Subjects completed an initial set of quality ratings immediately after seeing the ad. They were then asked to directly examine a pair of the headphones, listen to a musical tape recording for 30 seconds, and rate the quality of the headphones again for a second time. Additional items examining the perceived value of the deal were also included.

The results suggested that the free gift offer maintained quality perceptions at a higher level compared to a discount of similar value [p<.05]. Furthermore, the initial quality differences produced by the free gift frame became further exaggerated following product trial [F (3, 81)=3.25, p<.05 for condition x repeated-measure interaction]. The free gift offer also significantly increased the value of the deal, while the discount frame did not. These findings confirmed the prediction that framing an offer as a separate free gift should be particularly good at communicating its value to consumers, while discounts were less effective in this respect.

The current findings suggest that free gift promotions provide some important advantages over discounts and EDLPs of similar objective value. These advantages should primarily exist in situations where consumers believe price is a good indication of product quality. The existing literature suggests this is most likely when: the brand name or the seller are not well-known, purchase frequency and product knowledge are low, consumers believe strongly in the price-quality rule, risk is high, and intrinsic quality cues are ambiguous or unavailable. Interestingly, it is relatively common for marketers to offer discounts to consumers under many of these conditions. For instance, when discounts or coupons are offered for generic products, or for new products or services, or when discounts are offered at new stores in order to encourage initial patronage. In such cases, the current findings suggest it would be preferable to use free gift offers instead.

“Free Gift with Purchase: Promoting or Discounting the Brand?”

Priya Raghubir, University of California, Berkeley, USA

“Free gift with purchase” offers appear to be inundating the marketplace. The offers vary: some belong to the same product category whereas others do not. Some gift offers are evidently a lower value than the product they accompany, whereas others are advertised as being of higher value. Some free gifts are products made by the same manufacturer albeit offered as trial sizes or regular sizes, whereas others are not. The offers also vary in the manner in which they are communicated: whether they mention
price or not. Some appear to be products in their own right, others
have more of the appearance of being freebies, while yet others
resemble product sampling transactions. While research in price
promotions is useful to understand how such offers affect current
and future sales of the promoted brand offering the free gift, an
unanswered question is how they affect future sales of the brand
being offered as a free gift.

This paper examines how consumers process a “free gift with
purchase” promotional offer. The focus of attention is implications
for the product offered as a free gift, rather than the product offering
the promotion. Seven experiments systematically examine the
process by which free gift promotions serve as a source of (favor-
able or unfavorable) information about the underlying value of the
free gift. Two competing hypotheses are tested. The Value Dis-
counting Hypothesis, based on information inferencing, argues that
by virtue of being offered as a free gift, products will be valued less
as evinced by lower purchase intentions and a lower price that
consumers are willing to pay for them. The Quality Signalling
Hypothesis, based on economic signalling, argues the reverse:
consumers believe that the free gift is being given because manu-
facturers are confident of its quality and wish to induce subsidized
trial to encourage later repurchase at full price. Conditions that
foster one or the other effect (including strength of the effect) are
developed. These include the (i) Presence of Alternate Information
to make judgments about the value of the gift. Studies 1–4 examine
the moderating role of severity of purchase preconditions, and the
cost of the brand offering the gift, both affecting the short term
profitability of an offer; (ii) Visual Salience of the gift. Studies 5
and 6 examine two contexts where the visual salience can “help” or
“hurt” the free gift, (iii) Framing of the Deal. Study 7 examines the
moderating role of semantics that frame the offer as a free gift or a
joint bundle.

Results show that free gift with purchase promotions can lead
to inferences about the value of the gift and the value of the
promoted product. Thus, (i) consumers were found to discount the
value of the gift unless the situation was one where the manufac-
turer could make up short term losses in the long term through
repeat purchase at full price; (ii) consumers behaved as though they
imputed gift value using purchase preconditions required to avail
of the gift; leading to (iii) consumers attaching higher value to the
same gift if it was given by a higher priced brand name; and
analogously (iv) consumers being willing to pay higher prices for a
product that offered a more valuable gift. However, interestingly,
(v) offering a free gift did not always increase purchase intentions
for the promoted product; and (vi) deal evaluations were a function
of contextual cues, such as the inclusion of the value of the gift.
Finally, we showed that contextual factors such as (v) the perceptual
salience of the gift; and (vi) the frame of the deal, also affected the
manner in which free gift promotions were processed by consum-
ners.

REFERENCES
the Most Out of Advertising and Promotion,” Harvard
Ailawadi, Kusum and Scott A. Neslin (1998), “The Effect of
Promotion on Consumption: Buying More and Consuming It
Faster,” Journal of Marketing Research, 35 (August), 390-
98.
Concepts, Methods, and Strategies,” Englewood Cliffs, NJ:
Prentice Hall.

Benefit Congruency Framework of Sales Promotion
Effectiveness,” Journal of Marketing, Forthcoming.
Motives and Bargain Hunting,” Journal of Applied Social
Psychology, 25(18), 1597-610.
Inman, Jeffrey J., Leigh McAlister, and Wayne D. Hoyer (1990),
“Promotion Signal: Proxy for a Price Cut?,” Journal of
Consumer Research, 17 (June), 74-81.
Are Not Created Equal: A Typology and Critical Analysis of
Framing Effects,” Organizational Behavior and Human
Decision Processes, 76, 149-188.
Lichtenstein, Donald R., Richard G. Netemeyer, and Scot Burton
(1990), “Distinguishing Coupon Proneness From Value
Consciousness: An Acquisition-Transaction Utility Theory
Perspective,” Journal of Marketing, 54 (July), 54-67.
Price, Brand Name, and Store Name on Buyer’s Perceptions
of Product Quality: An Integrative Review,” Journal of
Marketing Research, 26 (August), 351-357.
Strahilevitz, Michal and John G. Myers (1998), “Donations to
Charity as Purchase Incentives: How Well They Work May
Depend on What You Are Trying to Sell,” Journal of
Consumer Research, 24 (March), 434-46.
Woodside, Arch G. and Gerald L. Waddle (1975), “Sales Effects
of In-Store Advertising,” Journal of Advertising Research,
15(3), 29-34.
Families in the Transforming Russian Society:
Observations from Visits to Families in Novgorod the Great
Karin M. Ekström, Göteborg University, Sweden
Marianne P. Ekström, Göteborg University, Sweden
Helena Shanahan, Göteborg University, Sweden

ABSTRACT

The transformation of the Russian society into a democratic society with a market economy involves many changes for private households. This paper describes some recent changes in the Russian society and reports observations from visits to five Russian families. The purpose of the family visits was to provide an understanding of how some Russian families live today. Strategies in adjusting to the new economic situation as reported in the literature (e.g. Auzan 1995; The Economist 1998; Schleuning 1998) were found in the families visited. Another observation was that the families were very skillful resource managers. The families expressed that they experienced greater economic hardship today than a couple of years ago. The parents struggled, but believed that the situation would be better for their children. The visits also gave the impression of great family cohesiveness, which could be part of the Russian culture, signs of economic hardship, or both.

INTRODUCTION

Five Russian families were visited as a first step in a major study focusing on food related activities in households in the transforming Russian society, as a basis for curriculum development in home economics. The major study is a joint project between Novgorod State University (NovSu) and Novgorod Institute of Change and Increase Qualification Specialists in Agriculture (ICIQSA), Russia and the departments of Home economics and Business administration at Göteborg University, Sweden.

In a democratic society, it is considered a human right to acquire knowledge to become a citizen, that actively participates in the development of society, as well as obtaining knowledge for earning ones daily living. Home economics is an important school subject in the democratization of society in the way that it provides essential knowledge to manage ones own private life as well as to participate in community development. It is also increasingly recognised that education for everyone in performing the tasks of everyday life and in family resource management is a basis for equality between men and women, and thus being an essential dimension of a democratic society (Hjälmskog 2000). Skillful management of resources, material as well as non-material, becomes especially important in order to obtain optimal well-being of households, in particular where there is a lack of resources. Food management in everyday life is crucial in such circumstances. In this paper, some recent changes in the Russian society are first described followed by observations from visits to five Russian families.

TRANSFORMATION OF THE RUSSIAN SOCIETY

Since 1985 the Russian society has been in the process of transformation towards democracy and market economy. The ongoing changes have affected the Russian consumers in many different ways. A market economy expects the consumers to be able to make independent decisions. Also, consumers can no longer assume that state officials will provide information for making decisions. There are many changes, which have happened relatively rapidly for the Russian consumer, who has been used to living in a planned economy for many years. Russian consumer behavior during the planned economy in the Soviet union and the influences of Western ideas have previously been discussed by Gronow (1997) and Marling (1994). More specifically, Gronow (1997) described the democratisation of luxury goods. For example, caviar and champagne were available to everyone in order to symbolise that they lived in “the country of plenty” (Gronow 1997, p.57).

Auzan (1995) described changes in the behaviour of Russian consumers under recent reforms in terms of three stages: the period of customary consumer behaviour, the period of crisis, and the period of attempts to cope with the new market structures. According to Auzan (1995), the three stages are characterized as follows. The period of customary consumer behaviour (ibid., 73pp.) took place between 1955 and 1985, and the economy was at this time characterised by continued shortages. Auzan argued that the combination of the total deficit in the economy and the totalitarian power of the state brought about complicated and stable institutional behaviour such as queues, illegal personal favours (“blats”), household self-provision, and spreading of rumours. These institutions strongly influenced consumer behaviour. People often wasted so much time queuing that it could have an effect on time at work and GNP. Personal links and “blats” implied that relationships with dealers could result in the possibility of buying goods despite the shortages. Further, self-provision existed in that people developed skills to repair. Also, households were hoarding goods. Rumours played an important role, since consumers did not trust sources of information such as official commercials and advertising information. In general, consumers had a very positive attitude towards reforms, but stuck to their former behavioural patterns in everyday life.

Gorbachev was elected president in 1985 and the reform work was initiated shortly after. Price reforms were promoted during the 1987-1988 and according to Auzan (1995, 76pp.) this was the beginning of the period of crisis. A price reform was, however, not launched due to the fact that majority of people were against it. There was a lack of goods in the market place, queuing was still the norm, and conflicts between the people queuing become more frequent. Consumer groups made attempts to legitimise the black queues (for black market goods), which resulted in officials recognising the queues. The problem of the distribution of goods remained and attempts to transform the queues into consumer finance institutions did not succeed. The “blat” continued and sellers requested speciality goods or particular services, as additional compensation as well as cash payment. This resulted in social tension and a gap between old habits and emerging economic conditions.

Free trade was established in Russia in 1992 and this is the beginning of the period Auzan (1995, 78pp.) called the period of attempts to cope with the new market structures or consumer adaptation to market conditions. At this time, price shocks resulted in the level of output going down, but the level of demand remained stable. Consumers showed, in general, that they were able to adapt.
better than companies. A reason for this could be that consumers realised they could not rely on state support. Also, the family as an institution is, in general, more capable of survival under extreme circumstances than companies. During this period consumers requested more market information, began to demand legal consumer rights, and tried to engage in money and real estate management. The price liberalisation led to boycott attempts; consumers reacted to competitive prices and searched for lower prices. In 1992 the number of street markets increased substantially and the number of households who planted vegetables and fruits on their “dachas” (garden with or without a small cottage) increased dramatically. Consumers also had difficulty to adapt to the freedom of choice and free pricing. The old “snatch reflex” (ibid., p.79) manifesting the anxiety not to get hold of commodities, still existed. This meant that consumers often bought commodities at a high price, not shopping around for the lowest prices. Also, people showed at first excessive trust in advertising, Civil Court actions, consumer magazines, and consumer-oriented TV-programs led to that the consumers learnt to use new forms of information. Also, a law “on the protection of consumers’ rights” (ibid., p.81) was adopted in 1992. Consumer organisations have also played a great role regarding consumer protection. Furthermore, consumers have learnt to seek new ways of saving and investment. It happens that families in larger cities sell their apartments and build houses in the suburbs, or sublet their apartments and live on the rent. The best way to protect savings since 1992 has been to convert them into dollars, in order to avoid inflation. People also learnt to invest their money through credit institutions and in securities (ibid).

Since Auzan (1995) wrote his article, different circumstances have challenged the Russian economy. The most dramatic change happened in August 1998 when the economy collapsed with a crisis in the monetary system, falling currency rates and increasing prices (Robach 1999). The acute budget situation and the overvalued Ruble set off the crisis in August 1998, but structural problems in the Russian economy, as well as a lack of infrastructure for a functioning market are some of the underlying reasons (Edwards and Oxenstierna 1999). The Russian consumers have continued to struggle to cope with the changes. Many of the institutional changes described above therefore continue to exist, at the same time as adaptation to the market economy takes place. The garden plot means a lot for people as an independent source of food (Auzan 1999). The Russian consumers have continued to adapt to the market economy. They suggested that a price deregulation, where prices are determined by supply and demand, is necessary for the development of the Russian society. By doing this, a normal situation would be established with prices supplying the economic actors on the market with information. Edwards and Oxenstierna (1999) meant that the current deficiency in the economy as well as the inability to collect taxes are major problems in the Russian economy. Also, the gap between the rich and the poor has increased significantly during the 1990’s (ibid).

HOUSEHOLDS RESPONDING TO THE ECONOMIC CHANGES IN SOCIETY

Even during times of crisis households continue to manage resources. In general, resources represent what is available to be used. In home economics literature, resources are often defined as the means families have access to, or can create, in order to satisfy the family needs and desires (Deacon and Firebaugh 1988; Goldsmith 1996; Paolucci, Hall and Axinn 1977). Resources can be classified in many different ways, for example, material and immaterial resources. Material resources are real, touchable, or able to be appraised. They are, therefore, easy to observe and value. Examples of immaterial resources are knowledge, experiences, attitudes, values, skills, and social competence.

We believe that during economic transition and crises, like the ones experienced by Russian households, it is important to focus on both the material and immaterial resources in order to throw light over resource management processes. Household members work together and interact with their environment in order to cope with the crises, satisfy their needs, and reach their goals. There are dynamic ever-ongoing processes in households; negotiating, calculating, and balancing in order to fulfil everyday needs of household members (Ahme and Roman 1997; Ekström 1990). Each household develops its unique ways, or its rational strategies, in response to the demands of everyday life (Sontag and Bubolz 1996). The patterns of actions are a result of interaction between household members and possibilities and limitations of their surroundings. Decisions are shaped by values and goals, and facilitated, but also restricted by the availability of resources.

In order to relate to our overriding research question “How are households responding to the economic transformation when it comes to food provision”, we want to refer to some previous research on Russian consumers in particular. Schleuning (1998) studied women’s perspective on the transition to a market economy by interviewing 95 women in Moscow in 1995. The majority of the women interviewed had some kind of higher education, were married, and had children. The results show that almost half of the women had to take extra jobs in addition to their regular jobs, in order to cover expenditures. Also, the majority of the households owned a “dacha”, were gardening, and preserved food. Furthermore, the majority of the women reported that they were the main decision-makers when it comes to food for the households. Household work appeared to be strictly divided along gender lines. Women did the household work and men repaired the car.

Schleuning (1998) tried to assess the overall economic situation in the households by asking: “Over the last ten years, has your economic situation become better or worse?” The answers pointed in two directions; a little more than half of the respondents answered that it had become worse and a little less than half indicated that it had become better. When asked whether they felt that their income was adequate to meet their basic needs, the majority answered that it did and the rest that it did not. These proportions might be different today since households have experienced the collapse of the economy in August 1998. The households interviewed by Schleuning (1998) were better off than ‘the average’ Russian household.

In Romania and Turkey, studies were carried out by Ger, Belk, and Lascu (1993) about how consumer desires change with the rapid influx of consumer goods and services into economics of scarcity. They found rapidly escalating consumer desire, confusion, and frustration. Ultimate despair and feelings of lack of power due to relative poverty was also a common reaction when abundance of goods became available on the market. There were also the “nouveau riche” who showed off their possessions which added to their success, status, and consumption power. Ger et al. (1993) also found that since abundance is a recent phenomenon, consumers are not experienced in making choices, i.e. facing alternatives, searching for products and information about products, or evaluating products. Further, Belk (1997, p.202) discussed consumer desires,
deprivations, and frustrations in Romania and stated that: “current consumer frustrations in Romania coexist with great hope that the unprecedented levels of material consumer desires will some day be realized”.

After this brief review of the transition from planned economy to market economy in Russia, and with some examples how transition affects households, visits to five Russian families in Novgorod the Great will now be described.

VISITING FIVE FAMILIES IN NOVGOROD THE GREAT

Visits and observations

In order for the Swedish researchers to gain a better understanding of the situation in Russian households today and to develop questions for the major study in the joint Russian-Swedish project, an exploratory study (e.g Agar 1980; Kvale 1997) was undertaken. A total of five families were visited on a Sunday in October 1999. The questions and the answers were filtered through interpreters, all young university students. Facial expressions and gestures added to the understanding of people’s responses and reactions. Also, observations were made of the living environment and photos were taken. It had been decided not to use any guides for interviewing or observing. Questions were put to different family members by any one of the three Swedish researchers, as it felt natural in the general conversation. It was of interest to get a general understanding of levels of living, and in particular of food provision. All the families were asked the following questions: “Generally, what changes have you experienced during the last few years when it comes to the economy in your household?” and “In particular, what changes have you experienced during the last few years regarding food habits in your household?”

No notes were taken during the visits. However, after visiting all the families, the Swedish researchers documented their observations individually. The descriptions of the families below are based on discussions, photos, and reflections when comparing notes. Paying the visits was like performing a double role, both as a guest and as a researcher. Agar (1980) and Oakley (1976; 1981) have previously written about these double roles you have to cope with, especially when studying people in their own homes.

Novgorod the Great

The observations took place in Novgorod the Great which is one of the oldest cities of Russia. It was founded in the middle of the 10th century and is located in the county Novgorod Oblast in the north-west, near where the Volkhov river takes its waters from Lake Ilmen. The major road between Moscow and St Petersburg passes through Novgorod the Great, and the road system is the major transportation network. The new high-speed rail line between St Petersburg and Moscow is expected to benefit Novgorod the Great (Sidå 1996). The county Novgorod Oblast had 748,000 inhabitants and its capital Novgorod the Great had 240,000 inhabitants, according to statistics published in 1996 (ibid.). The town Novgorod the Great is dominated by electronic companies which mainly produce home electronics. They are nowadays facing severe competition mainly from Asian companies. Forestry and the food industry are the predominant industries in the county. Forestry is expected to be a future business, but investments, education, and attitudinal changes are required to make it profitable. Novgorod the Great is expecting to once again become an important place for trade on the waterways between the Baltic Sea and the Black Sea, as it was in ancient days. Novgorod the Great is also an important tourist destination and it is possible that its location has made it more likely to be influenced by Western values.

A DESCRIPTION OF THE FAMILIES

The visits and observations are reported under three themes; high-rise living, suburban farming, and ex-kolkhoz living, which represent the different living conditions of the families visited.

High-rise living

The first family we visited was a family of four: parents and two daughters, 14 and 20 years old. The family lived in a roomy apartment in a high-rise housing area, built in the 1970-80s (Figure 1). The exterior of the apartment blocks and the entrances made the impression of being run down. However, we observed that at this particular house, care had been given to the immediate surrounding by planting grass and flowers. The apartment had a large living room, three bedrooms, a hall, a separate toilet, and a bathroom. The father proudly showed us the kitchen, which was of a high standard, i.e. with functionally arranged work units and equipped with a gas stove, refrigerator, and deep-freezer. Different kinds of home picked foods, such as mushrooms and berries, were stored in the freezer. A large number of appetising pickled fruits and vegetables were stored on open shelves in the kitchen. Potatoes and tubers were stored on the balcony as well as in a big rectangular wooden box with a lock outside the apartment on the landing. The apartment was very tidy and clean. It appeared that parts of it had recently been redecorated. Generally, the high standard of the interior was in great contrast to the exterior of the apartment blocks.

We were invited to sit down at the dining table in the living room. The table was laid with cheese and paprika sandwiches home made jam, an apple cake baked by the mother, and a box of chocolates. We were offered tea to drink. The living room was furnished with a bookcase along one of the walls and a sofa and easy chairs around a low table in front of a large window. During the meal, the conversation was led into the economy of the household and changes they had experienced during the last years. The mother told us that she had three different jobs. Two of those were as a doctor at the hospital clinic and as a homeopath in a private clinic. The father mentioned only one job, as an engineer at an electronics company. They estimated that they had 950 Roubles (1 US dollars=23 roubles in January 1999) per person and month to live on. They said that there was not much change in their food habits after Perestroyka.

Towards the end of our visit, the daughters showed us their new winter coats, especially displaying their home sewing skills (Figure 2). They had made the coats themselves. The coats looked, indeed, professionally made and were skillfully tailored.

The second family we visited also lived in a high-rise apartment building. It was a family of four; parents, a daughter who was 20 years old and a son who was 15 years old. Only the daughter and the mother were present during our visit (Figure 3). Their apartment was smaller and made a duller impression than the previous one but generally decorated and furnished in a similar way. The company the father had worked for previously had allotted the family the apartment. In the daughter’s room, there was a large bed and a bed-sofa as well as a TV set. There were pictures of her as a child on the wall. The kitchen was of similar layout as in the first apartment, but less well equipped. Pickled fruit and vegetables were stored in a built-in cupboard underneath the kitchen window. The family had a “dacha” where they grew fruit and vegetables.

We gathered around the table in the middle of the living room, admiring the multi-layered, exquisitely decorated cake the daughter and her fiancée had baked for the occasion. We had tea and talked about the changing living conditions in Russia. The father had previously had a job as an engineer in a manufacturing company. The company closed down about seven years ago. He had been fortunate to find another job as a foreman for furniture making in the local prison. The mother worked as a librarian. They experienced
FIGURE 1
High-rise Living in Novgorod the Great

FIGURE 2
The New Winter Coats
their situation as more difficult now than before and were apprehensive for the future. They thought most families experienced the same. A great joy for them was that the daughter was getting married in the spring. The young couple still had to make up their minds where to live, with the bride’s or the groom’s family.

The third family, a single mother and her 13-year-old daughter, lived in another high-rise area. The mother was divorced since a couple of years ago. She and her daughter were still in contact with the former husband; especially the daughter seemed to have a good relationship with her father. They all met quite often and helped each other with practical problems of different kinds.

They had a one-bedroom apartment. The mother slept in the living room while the daughter had the bedroom. She had decorated the walls with advertisements (Figure 4). In the living room, there was a table, two easy chairs and a bookcase, in addition to the mother’s bed. In the bookcase were some glassed in display cupboards, books and some pieces of china. The kitchen was small but well equipped with a gas stove, a refrigerator, and a gas heater for hot water. About 45 minutes away by bicycle the family had a plot where they grew vegetables, which the mother carried home on her bicycle at harvest time. Pickled fruit and vegetables were stored away, all over the apartment.

Their living conditions had gradually become worse, particularly after the bank crash. Although the mother could not expect any support from her ex-husband, who was living on a very limited unemployment benefit, she felt it was an economic advantage to be divorced. She was nevertheless, continuously struggling to make ends meet. In addition to her regular job, she was taking any other possible jobs she could find to increase her income. This made her totally exhausted from time to time. She also subletted an apartment which she had inherited. The small surplus the rent gave provided her necessary extra income. When fixed costs were paid she and her daughter had 400 Roubles to live on per month. Her greatest concern was how to be able to keep her daughter in a private school, specialising in language training. The daughter had attended a private school for the last six years. If the daughter could not continue up to graduation, the mother felt all her economic sacrifices would be in vain. When it came to the family’s food habits, the mother said she could never afford buying fresh fruit and very seldom meat.

Suburban farming

In order for us to visit households living in a different setting than in apartment houses in town, our Russian colleagues introduced us to a family living outside town. The family was farming and breeding animals on the plot around their house. The father welcomed us on the porch. He was a veterinarian working in an animal clinic not far away. He showed us around in the garden where pigs, hens and geese were running around. There was also a cowshed in the garden and a separate little house containing a combined laundry and sauna. An ample wood supply was stacked along one of the outside walls.

The mother was busy indoors adding the last touch to the cabbage soup she was preparing for us in a big pot on the gas-stove, in the spacious “country-like” kitchen. There was a refrigerator and a deep-freeze. The mother worked as a shop attendant in a rural store about 6 km away, a distance she walked back and forth everyday. A daughter, 10 year old, was also at home, excited about our visit and following our conversation attentively. There were also two other children in the family, a boy of 15 and an 18-year old girl, but they were not present during our visit.

Next to the kitchen was a bathroom of ordinary modern standard, followed by a number of small bedrooms. We were shown into the parents’ bedroom and taken by a great surprise when the father suddenly pulled back the rug and opened a hatch in the floor leading down to a cellar with white washed walls. Neatly stored on shelves, in colourful display, were pickled and fermented fruits and vegetables, salted mushrooms etc. In one corner, there was a bin for potatoes, and in another were sacks of onions stored (Figure 5). They said this supply would take them through the year till the next harvest.

Seated around the big table in the kitchen spirits grew high from the hot soup, home baked bread, all the delicious home preserves, home made wine and special vodka. The interpreter had
FIGURE 4
A Teenager’s Room

FIGURE 5
Food Storage
a hard time to follow the conversation. The meal ended with tea served from an electric samovar standing in the middle of the table (Figure 6).

To our question regarding what changes they had experienced lately, the father, born in Ukraine, answered that he nowadays had to go abroad to go home. Visiting his relatives had become more complicated and expensive. Generally, the family appeared to have coped very well with the economic changes. Both the parents had jobs although we got the impression that they might have had more prestigious positions earlier on. They spent long hours working away from home every day, but managed the household and farm chores with the help of their children. One of their daily routines was to put notes on the kitchen table for the children, telling them what to do around the house when coming home from school. The parents proudly informed us that the children had made all the preserved fruit and vegetables.

Ex-kolkhoz living

Further out in the country we visited a family living on an ex-kolkhoz. A kolkhoz was a collectively organized farm during the Soviet Union period. This family lived in a two-story apartment block in a suburban-like settlement which formerly had been part of a kolkhoz. It was a three-generation family; father and mother, their two sons with their wives and children. Together they occupied three different apartments. The living room was decorated with carpets on the walls. We noticed that squashes were stored under the TV set (Figure 7). The kitchen was modern but simply furnished. It was clean and tidy and there was a homely warm atmosphere.

In the living room, a table was richly laid with sandwiches, cakes, milk, honey, and fruits. It appeared that growing vegetables, keeping bees and cows, picking berries, and hunting were the means of livelihood for this family. However, they were not “officially” farmers, but bartered and sold for low prices to neighbours and friends. To go into business would mean paying high taxes, which their small-scale farming could not sustain. It would also mean being more exposed to the Mafia. Furthermore, the family expressed that thieving was a problem in the area.

The father and the mother, both well educated, had had good jobs “in the old system”. They had both worked for a large cattle-breeding business that was located nearby, but which had closed down in the first era of privatisation in the beginning of the 1990s. The mother had worked as an agronomist and the father had had a leadership position. Since then, they had managed without a regular cash income. The father was bitter and frustrated. The mother was quiet and somewhat marked by hard work. They did not expect much improvement in their lifetime, but put their hope in a better life for their grandchildren. One grandchild, a boy of 12 years, was present during the visit as well as his mother, one of the daughters-in-law. She worked at a computer company in town. The boy had his own computer and became excited when we suggested exchanging e-mail addresses. He proudly let his grandmother know that he knew the Latin alphabet.

Before leaving we were taken to the fenced vegetable garden where the beehives were also kept (Figure 8) and to the cowshed, a part of the old kolkhoz establishment. Although primitive, it all witnessed exceptional inventiveness, resourcefulness and skills. Before saying goodbye, the father commented that in some ways he
thought he lived a rather healthy life, being outdoors a lot and physically active. On the other hand, he could never dream of affording to go to the dentist to get his bad front tooth fixed.

**OBSERVATIONS, IMPRESSIONS, AND REFLECTIONS**

Almost always when you carry out household research, visiting families in their homes, you feel overwhelmed and humble being let into their private spheres (Oakley 1975, 1981). There is also a feeling of gratefulness that people take the time sharing information with you, for whatever purpose the study has. We have all experienced this in previous research (Ekström 1990; Ekström 1995; Ekström and Shanahan 1999; Wallender 1977). Our visits to the families in Novgorod the Great were no exception. Visiting families in a different cultural setting, and in a culture where hospitality is an outstanding feature, reinforced these feelings. We were received with much warmth and treated most generously by all the families we visited, despite their difficult times. The atmosphere was cheerful, sometimes full of jokes and laughter. We were also greatly moved by the hardship and disappointments some of these families had experienced and had to cope with everyday. The visits became very emotional for us and will stay with us as unforgettable memories.

Among the families visited, we found some of the strategies in adjusting to the new economic situation as reported in the literature (e.g. Auzan 1995; The Economist 1998; Schleuning 1998). In three of the families, an adult member had additional jobs in order to cope with expenditures. All the families grew vegetables they preserved and stored for later use. We realise that this is a Russian tradition, but got the impression that this custom had become increasingly important during the last years. Together with animal husbandry, growing vegetables had become the main survival strategy for the family living on the ex-kolkhoz. Auzan’s (1995) observation of an increase in self-sufficiency after the Perestroyka can be assumed to have increased after the crisis in 1998. This corresponds with our findings. It is not unrealistic to assume that all the families we visited were close to self-sufficiency when it comes to tubers and vegetables. We also saw examples of home made clothes and maintenance work carried out by household members.

Although the results of our study cannot confirm the three stages Auzan (1995) refers to in the implementation of the economic reforms in Russia we identified some phenomenon that can be related to these three stages. Growing vegetables at the “dacha” relates to the period of customary consumer behaviour as well as to the period of crisis. To the latter could also be added increasing income through additional jobs, finding a living outside the formal economic system, and changes in diets such as having fresh fruit, meat, and fish less frequently. We also found an example of the third period called the period of attempts to cope with the new market structures or consumer adaptation to market conditions, in being able to buy and inherit an apartment and use previously governmental owned farming land for private use.

All the households we visited reported greater economic hardship today than a couple of years ago. In Schleuning’s (1998) study, only about half answered that the economic situation had become worse. Again, her data was gathered before the bank crisis of 1998. The women interviewed by Schleuning (1998) also lived outside Moscow, which is in a different economic setting compared to Novgorod the Great and surroundings. Further, Schleuning’s figures on income are difficult to compare with the figures that were mentioned in the households we visited. In the time period between her study and our visits, the Rouble has been devalued and a galloping inflation has also taken place.

A striking impression from our visits was that the families were very skillful resource managers. We witnessed as many have done before, that crises foster resourcefulness (e.g. Deacon and Firebaugh 1988; Goldsmith 1996). The importance of immaterial resources was especially highlighted in these times of scarcity of material resources. Different signs of competence were shown such as canning food and sewing clothes.

The visits gave many impressions and provided us with a greater understanding of how some Russian families live today. The limited number of families visited makes it impossible to
generalise the findings, but it provided us with some valuable insights. In addition to what is mentioned above, one example is that the family bonds appeared to be strong. The visits gave us the impression of great family cohesiveness. It left us with the question of to what extent this is either part of the Russian culture, signs of economic hardship, or both. We also found different generations, such as parents and adult children living together, or having the household economy in common. When children married, the young couple often stayed with their parents or their parents-in-law. In several of our interviews, it was also expressed that the children were the hope for the future. The parents struggled with a bad economic situation, but believed that the situation would be better for their children.

**FUTURE RESEARCH**

This visits to five Russian families are part of a project related to the development of curricula in home economics. We believe that home economics education is important for welfare and democracy in society in general, but in transitional societies in particular. Democracy in society takes its starting point in the organisation of the household (Hjälmeskog, 2000). It would be of interest to further study the organisation of the household concerning family members interactions involving negotiations and conflict resolutions. Households’ entrepreneurial strategies needs also to be investigated in a society with lacking monetary resources. Furthermore, a gender perspective (e.g. Tolstikova och Scott 2000) is necessary in order to understand the organisation of the household. We believe that cross-cultural studies focusing on the meaning of consumption and production in households may also benefit from further application and development of ethnographic methods.

**REFERENCES**


Ekström, M. P. and H. Shanahan (1999), *Ekologisk mat i hushållens vardag* [Ecological food in everyday life], in *Den flerdimensionella konsumenten; en antologi om svenska konsumenter* [The multi-dimensional consumer; an anthology on Swedish consumers], eds. K. Ekström and H. Forsberg, Göteborg: Tre Böcker.


Marling, K.A. (1994), As seen on TV; The visual culture of everyday life in the 1950’s, Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.


Robach, K. (1999), GP-Fakta, Från kommunism till kallt krig, perestrojka och ekonomisk kollaps, [From communism to cold war, perestrojka and economic collapse], Två dagar; bilaga till Göteborgs Posten, 4 december, 16-17.


Sida (1996), (Swedish international development cooperation agency), Landanalys Ryssland [Analysis of countries—Russia], Stockholm: Sida, Department for Central and Eastern Europe.


Islamic Consumptionscape in Turkey: Practices and Strategies of Faithful Consumption

Özlem Sandikç, Bilkent University, Turkey
Güliz Ger, Bilkent University, Turkey

ABSTRACT

The last decade witnessed the emergence of an Islamic consumptionscape in Turkey. Islamic style clothing stores and fashion shows, summer resorts, fitness and beauty centers and various religiously inspired popular culture and entertainment products became commonplace. In this paper we discuss the dynamics of the Islamic consumptionscape by exploring the daily consumption practices as well as the underlying marketing context. We focus on two cases: an Islamic summer resort and Islamic fashion styles. We discuss these practices as examples of consumption fusion and argue that Turkish Islamic consumption culture is characterized by pluralism and difference in which multiple tensions both between the local and the global and within the local itself are simultaneously negotiated.
From Fame to Fortune: A Meta-analytic Review of Celebrity Endorsements in Persuasive Communication
Angela van der Lee, University of Amsterdam, The Netherlands
Bas van den Putte, University of Amsterdam, The Netherlands

ABSTRACT
Although communicator characteristics are widely assumed to enable persuasion, disparate literature and their sometimes contradictory findings have made the source effects phenomenon not well understood. While integrated research is so far only narrative of nature, the present paper addresses spokesperson effects by means of a meta-analysis. By contrasting the persuasive impact of celebrity endorsers against that of experts, models, and typical consumers, the celebrity as a potential tool for persuasion is explored. The persuasive impact of celebrities was found to vary strongly between spokespersons as well as effects. Both substantive and methodological variables showed to mediate celebrity endorser effectiveness.
Symbolic Meaning and the Elaboration Likelihood Model: Preliminary Insights
Brett A. S. Martin, University of Auckland, New Zealand
Michael J. Sherrard, University of Auckland, New Zealand
Yasutoshi Imura, Mitsubishi Motors, New Zealand

ABSTRACT
Previous research suggests celebrity endorsers exert their influence primarily under conditions of low issue-relevant thinking, this study explores persuasive effects among high issue-relevant thinking consumers engaged in extensive ad processing. The results reveal that a celebrity endorsement can be processed through more message-based processing under high issue-relevant thinking. In particular, symbolic meanings possessed by celebrity endorsers are elaborated upon in order to form brand attitudes and purchase intentions under high issue-relevant thinking conditions. On the other hand, as previous research suggests, celebrity physical attractiveness was peripherally processed under low issue-relevant thinking conditions. Hence, the directions of celebrity endorser influence relate to two dimensions of the endorsement–symbolic meaning and physical attractiveness–depending upon the level of consumer issue-relevant thinking.
Advertising Repetition, Memory and Attitudes
Jennifer Christie, University of Arkansas, U.S.A.
Thomas D. Jensen, University of Arkansas, U.S.A.

ABSTRACT

Previous research has suggested that there is a relationship between the number of exposures to a stimulus and attitudes; this relationship is often described as an inverted-U curve (Berlyne 1970, Cacioppo and Petty 1979). In the marketing literature, however, there is mixed evidence for this inverted-U curve. This study examines how ad repetition affects attitudes by examining the role of memory. A three (number of exposures) by two (time of measurement) between-subjects factorial design was used. The results reveal strong effects of exposure and time of measurement on memory but not attitudes. In addition, there was no evidence for ad repetition and memory influencing ad and brand attitudes.

INTRODUCTION

The effects of repeated exposure to stimuli have long been of interest to researchers. Early studies in social psychology (e.g., Zajonc 1968) demonstrated that repeated exposure to neutral stimuli, lines, nonsense words, and socially relevant stimuli (i.e., faces taken from a yearbook) resulted in increased preferences/liking for the stimuli. Berlyne (1970) also found that repeated exposure to stimuli lead to more favorable attitudes. However, each subsequent exposure had less impact on attitudes until either attitudes leveled off or became less favorable. These findings lead to Berlyne’s two-factor theory, suggesting that during initial exposures affect is enhanced due to increased familiarity with the stimulus. At higher levels of exposure, however, a negative response or tedium occurs resulting in a decrease in affect (Bornstein 1990). Cacioppo and Petty (1979) also found this inverted-U curve, where message agreement increased and then decreased with repeated exposures.

The inverted-U relationship found between number of exposures and attitudes has been of interest to consumer researchers studying advertising repetition effects, essentially in the context of wearin (i.e., more favorable attitudes following each subsequent exposure to an advertisement) and wearout (i.e., a leveling or decline in the favorability of attitudes following the number of exposures has reached some critical point). Generally, attitudes have been found to be most favorable following three exposures to an ad and/or the same ad (Gorn and Goldberg 1980). Typically, any decline in attitudes or wearout reaches its lowest point at about four exposures; additional exposures beyond six have little impact on attitudes (for reviews see Craig and Sternthal 1986, Pechmann and Stewart 1989).

Cacioppo and Petty (1979; 1980) suggest that the inverted-U relationship between advertising exposures and attitudes (five of which indicated a linear or asymptotic relationship between ad exposures and memory). It was discovered to be a common assumption, as noted in the textbooks, that repeated ad exposures increase consumers’ attitudes toward the ad or brand. Nevertheless, the research findings suggest differently, at least for repetition main effects. While Cacioppo and Petty (1979), Calder and Sternthal (1980), and Gorn and Goldberg (1980) have shown some effects of repetition on attitudes and/or cognitive responses, others have not found an effect of repetition for the same ad on attitudes. For example, Belch (1982) found no effect of repetition on subjects’ attitude toward using the brand or purchase intentions. Schumann, Petty, and Clemons (1990) found no main effect of repetition on attitudes, although they found increases in cognitive thoughts. Ginter (1974) found that neither overall attitudes nor brand choice was affected by repetition. Similarly, Mitchell and Olson (1977), Batra and Ray (1986) and Zhang and Zinckan (1991) found no repetition main effects on brand attitudes or purchase intentions. Although some repetition may be advantageous for memory (to be discussed shortly), the results of any positive impacts on attitudes are mixed at best. Furthermore, while studies have suggested that repeated exposure to the same ad increases cognitive responses (and after a point negative cognitive responses), there is no evidence that repeated exposure negatively impacts ad or brand attitudes (e.g., Schumann, Petty, and Clemons 1990; Belch 1982).

Although reviews on the effects of advertising repetition and attitudes have concluded that there is some support for the inverted-U curve, the actual results of the studies are mixed. The varied findings on ad repetition and attitudes have led researchers to examine the potential mediators of the relationship. Some studies have examined the effects of ad variation and/or product relevance as a mediator (Unnava and Burnkrant 1991, Schumann, Petty, and Clemons 1990; Haugtvedt, Schumann, Schneier, and Warren, 1994). In their study on repetition and ad variation, Schumann, Petty, and Clemons (1990) found that ad repetition assisted with memory, especially when the ads were varied as compared to the same ad. Varied ads, at moderate levels of repetition, resulted in more favorable brand and ad attitudes than repeated exposures to the same ad or to an ad viewed only once. However, at higher levels of repetition the differences between the varied ads and the same ads tended to disappear. These effects were shown for cosmetic variations (i.e., message arguments held constant while ad elements were varied) under conditions of low relevance and for substantive variations (i.e., changes in the message arguments) under conditions of high relevance. In other words, product relevance and ad variation moderated the relationship between ad repetition and attitudes.

Ad Repetition and Memory

One area of research that has recently emerged, and the focus of this investigation, is the role of memory in the advertising repetition and attitudes relationship (Haugtvedt et. al. 1994, Pieters, Rosbergen, and Wedel 1999). Unlike repetition and attitudes, the literature on advertising repetition and memory is quite clear. A majority of these studies demonstrate that increased exposure to an ad increases recall, recognition, and cognitive thoughts about the ad or brand (McCullough and Ostrom 1974, Schumann, Petty, and Clemons 1990, Belch and Belch 1984, Batra and Ray 1986, Rethans, Swasy, and Marks 1986). Memory for the ad, brand name,
and information in the ad (i.e., copy) increases with increasing number of ad exposures in an asymptotic relationship (Cacioppo and Petty 1979; Cacioppo and Petty 1983; Schuman, Petty, and Clemons 1988; Burke and Slull 1988; Hitchon, Thorson, and Zhao 1988). The asymptotic relationship may be due to ceiling effects and/or to decreased attention to the ad for each subsequent exposure (Pieters, Rosbergen, and Wedel 1999). Pieters, Rosbergen and Wedel (1999) found that attention to print ads and the elements in those ads decreased by 50% from one to three exposures. Although some question exists concerning the ability (e.g., ad complexity, viewer knowledge) and motivation to process the ad (e.g., product relevance), some researchers have suggested that, at least for print ads, one or two exposures may be sufficient for placing the information in memory (e.g., Calder and Sternthal 1980). Others have suggested that memory may peak at about six exposures (Pechmann and Stewart 1989).

Effects of Time Delay

There is some evidence suggesting that although memory improves with repetition, attitudes will not change if measured immediately. Rather, attitudes may improve following a delay (Johnson and Watkins 1971). Haugtvedt et al. (1994, study two) examined the immediate versus delayed effects of ad repetition on attitudes. Basically, when measured immediately brand attitudes were more favorable for exposures to varied ads (both cosmetic and substantive) than for multiple exposures to the same ad or a single exposure to an ad. However, when measured following a one-week delay, brand attitudes were more positive for multiple ad exposures (whether varied or the same ad) than for a single exposure to an ad. Furthermore, there was no difference between brand attitudes for substantive, cosmetic, and multiple exposures of the same ad following the delay. Confidence in attitudes was higher for repeated exposures than for single exposures both when measured immediately and following the delay. Hence, repetition did impact upon persuasion and, importantly, attitudes were more persistent after repeated ad exposure.

Unfortunately, Haugtvedt et al. (1994, study two) did not measure attitudes toward the ad, nor did they measure memory for the ad immediately or following the delay. Pechmann and Stewart (1989) have suggested that following a delay after repeated exposures to an ad, “perhaps positive attitudes towards the brand are retrieved from memory whereas negative attitudes toward the ad [due to ad repetition] are forgotten” (page 293). Pechmann and Stewart’s proposition suggests that memory may mediate the relationship between ad repetition and ad and brand attitudes. It is possible that the presence or absence of any direct effects of repetition on attitudes may be due to memory.

One theory that might shed light on the potential relationship between memory and attitudes is the Elaboration Likelihood Model (ELM) of persuasion (Cacioppo and Petty 1986). According to the ELM, in order for attitude change to occur a persuasive message must be processed via the central route. Determinants of whether a message is processed via this route are the individual’s motivation and ability to process the message. As discussed, previous research has looked at motivation to process by manipulating the relevance of the product contained within the ad (Schuman, Petty, and Clemons 1990). It is possible, however, that subjects are actually being hindered by their ability to process the message, rather than their motivation to do so. Given that motivation to process exists, are subjects given the opportunity to process and form thoughts about the ad? It is possible that subjects are not remembering the ad long enough to form enduring attitudes.

The present study examines the relationship between ad repetition, memory, and brand and ad attitudes. Specifically, we will seek to define the impact of memory on the relationship between repetition and attitudes. Our focus is on the effects of number of exposures to the same ad on memory and attitudes using methods similar to those used by Schuman, Petty, and Clemons (1990) and Haugtvedt et al. (1994). Ad repetition effects on memory and attitudes are tested both immediately after ad exposure and after a time delay. Our hypotheses are based upon theoretical perspectives suggesting the inverted-U curve (e.g., Berlyne 1070, Cacioppo and Petty 1979), previous ad repetition research findings, and the proposition suggested by Pechman and Stewart (1989).

H1: Increased exposures to an ad will result in (H1A) improved memory (i.e., recall and recognition) for the product and brand name, (H1B) more favorable brand attitudes, and (H1C) less favorable attitudes toward the ad. (Main effects of repetition on memory and attitudes)

H2: Memory for the product and brand name will be better when measured immediately following the last exposure to an ad than when measured following a delay. (Main effect of time on memory)

H3: Improvements in memory for product and brand due to increased ad exposure will be more pronounced when measured after a delay. (Repetition by time interaction on memory)

H4: Increased exposures to an ad will result in more favorable attitudes toward the ad when measured following a delay as compared to immediately following the last exposure to the ad. (Repetition by time interaction on attitudes)

H5: The relationship between attitudes toward the brand and repetition will be mediated by (H5A) memory for the product and brand name and (H5B) attitudes toward the ad.

METHOD

Participants and Procedures

Two hundred ninety-three undergraduate university students participated in this study. Using block randomization procedures, participants were assigned to experimental conditions formed from a two (measurement time: immediate or delayed) by three (ad repetition: 1, 3, or 6 exposures) between-subjects design. Participants participated in two sessions of the experiment. Following the first session, participants signed up for a second session that was conducted at least twenty-four hours after the first session (delayed measurement time). Participants received a free product for participating in the first session and $5 for participating in the second session.

At the beginning of the first session, participants were informed that they would be participating in an advertising study dealing with the ability of consumers to match print advertisement with the magazines in which they appeared. Participants

---

1The product category from which subjects received their free gifts was systematically varied in an attempt to manipulate product relevance using procedures similar to Schumann, Petty, and Clemons (1990). Hence, some subjects chose between brands of pens (product in the target ad) while others chose between brands of candy or mouthwash (products in the functional ads). Manipulation checks for the pens revealed that personal relevance was not different when pens were the gift versus not the gift.
were further told that they would be asked questions about their feelings towards advertising and their exposure to advertising media. As a reward for participating in the study, participants were told they would be allowed to choose a free gift at the end of the first session. Each subject’s survey packet revealed the product category from which they would be allowed to select one brand from a set of brands as their free gift. This product category was revealed on the front page of the packet, as well as immediately before the matching task.

After signing an informed consent form, participants were given a packet containing twenty-one numbered advertisements, and were asked to view each ad in order and select from a set of four the magazine it most likely appeared in. The set of four magazines was different for all ads although the same magazine may have occurred in more than one set. This matching of ads and magazines served as a masking task to conceal the true purpose of the study. Participants were told to work in order, and not to skip ahead or return to any previous advertisements. They were also told that some ads might occur more than once since advertisers often place the same ad in different magazines. After this matching task, all participants were given a filler task rating the frequency of reading the magazines from the matching task.

After the filler task, participants assigned to the delayed measurement conditions selected their free gift, one brand from a set of brands, and signed up to attend the second session. These delayed condition participants were then thanked and dismissed. Participants assigned to the immediate condition completed a questionnaire containing the dependent measures (recall, recognition, and attitudes). After completing the dependent measure questionnaire, the immediate condition participants selected their free gift, signed up for the second session, and were dismissed.

The second session of the study was held from 1-7 days after the participants participated in the first session. During the second session, all participants completed the dependent measure questionnaire. Participants in the immediate conditions completed the same dependent measure questionnaire that they had completed at the end of the first session. Participants in the delayed conditions completed the dependent measure questionnaire for the first time. At the end of second session, participants were given $5.00, debriefed, and then dismissed.

Ad Booklet

Each stimulus booklet contained three types of ads: test ad, functional ads, and filler ads. All ads were black and white print ads. Each subject received a booklet containing the applicable set of ads for the given treatment condition. A total of twenty-one ads, both single and multiple exposures, were in the ad booklet. Within the constraints that follow, the test, functional, and filler ads were counterbalanced in the ad booklets. Filler and functional ads were used to bring the total number of ads in the test booklets to twenty-one. All three types of ads were repeated a variable number of times, depending on the treatment condition.

The test ads, under the multiple exposure conditions, were distributed evenly across the entire ad booklet. Test ads were never seen consecutively. To control for primacy and recency effects, the last (only) test ad always occupied the same position within the ad booklet (position 18). The test ad (writing pen) was identical to the one used by Schumann, Petty, and Clemons (1990), containing the same product and brand information (see Exhibit 1). The layout and copy of the functional (mouthwash and candy) and filler ads was similar to that of the test ad. Memory and attitude measures were collected for the test and functional ads. The purpose of collecting the measures for the functional ads was to mask the test ad.

Independent Variables

**Repetition.** In the packet of advertisements, participants were exposed to the identical target advertisement either once, three times, or six times. The last (only) exposure to the target ad occurred in the same position within the ad packet (i.e., position 18).

**Measurement Time.** Participants in the immediate condition completed the dependent measures questionnaire immediately after completing the filler task during the first session and again during the second session of the study. Participants in the delayed condition filled dependent measures questionnaire only in the second session. The time elapsed between the first session and second session was recorded for each participant (mean = 72.14 hours, std = 33.38 hours).

Dependent Variables

The sequence of the dependent variables in this section is identical to the sequence in the dependent measures questionnaire given to participants.

**Recall and Recognition.** Participants were asked to list the products and brands they remembered seeing in the ad packet (unaided recall). They were then asked to circle the products and brands from lists of products and brands (recognition). Some of the products and brands were in the ad booklet while others were not in the booklet. For both unaided recall and recognition, questions about the product were asked prior to the brand. Finally, as a form of aided recognition, participants completed three multiple choice questions in which they were asked to identify the brands shown in the advertisements when provided with the product categories (i.e., pens, mouthwash, and candy).

**Attitude Measures.** Participant’s attitudes were assessed for the ads and brands for pens (test ad), mouthwash, and candy shown in the ad booklet using seven-point semantic differential items. Attitudes toward the advertiser were assessed using five items (e.g., believable-unbelievable, unbiased-biased), alpha = .82. Attitudes toward the ad were assessed using ten items (e.g., interesting-uninteresting, high quality-low quality, favorable-unfavorable, good-bad), alpha = .91. Attitudes toward the brand were assessed using six items (i.e., interesting-uninteresting, pleasant-unpleasant, high quality-low quality favorable-unfavorable, good-bad), alpha = .93. Factor analysis for attitudes about the ad, advertiser, and brand revealed three major factors. Mean scores across items were used for each of the attitude measures for analysis purposes. As suspected, the attitudinal measures were correlated with one another.

**RESULTS**

For the results reported below, analyses were conducted for a two (measurement time) by three (ad repetition) between subjects factorial design. For the memory measures, logistic regression was used in testing the main effects and interactions. For the attitude measures, MANOVA and ANOVAs were used in testing the main effects and interactions.

**Memory**

For unaided product recall, main effects of repetition, Wald (1) = 21.92, p < .001, and time, Wald(1) = 6.35, p < .05, were found. Participants were more likely to recall the product category (pens) when exposed to higher levels of repetition (B = .38) and when recall was assessed immediately, as compared to after some delay (B = -1.37). The same two main effects and direction of the effects were found for unaided brand recall, Wald (1) = 20.56, p < .001 and Wald (1) = 4.81, p < .05, respectively. The interaction of time and repetition was not significant for unaided product or brand recall. These findings support both H1A and H2.
Main effects of repetition and time were found for product recognition (Wald (1) = 5.01, p < .05, B = .24, and Wald (1) = 24.29, p < .001, B = -2.98, respectively) as well as the interaction of repetition and time (Wald (1) = 8.81, p < .01, B = .53). Supporting H3, higher levels of repetition improved product recognition and recognition was better when tested immediately as compared to following a delay. The improvement due to repetition was more pronounced when measured following a delay than when measured immediately following exposure. The results for brand recognition mirrored those of product recognition with the exception that the interaction of repetition and time was not significant, \( p > .10 \). Increased exposures improved brand recognition (Wald (1) = 15.70, \( p < .001 \), B = .32) and the delayed measurement resulted in lower brand recognition (Wald (1) = 7.24, \( p < .01 \), B = -1.41). Finally, participants’ ability to correctly identify the test brand when presented with a list of brands in the product category (multiple choice task) was related to the number of times they had seen the target ad (Wald (1) = 9.94, \( p < .01 \), B = .36). The main effect of time of measurement and the time by repetition interaction were not significant for the multiple choice task, \( p > .10 \).

Since placing the brand name into memory is often a goal of advertising and brand recall is generally a stronger indicator than recognition, the data were re-coded to indicate strength of memory. Strength of memory was coded as a 3 if the participant recalled the brand name, 2 if they recognized the brand name, 1 if they correctly identified the brand name when provided with the product category, and 0 if they did not correctly provide the brand name on any of the memory tasks. Memory was stronger with increased repetitions (means: 1 exposure = 1.25, 3 exposures = 1.55, 6 exposures = 2.13), \( F (2, 311) = 26.55, p < .001 \). Memory was also stronger when measured immediately (mean = 1.89) than delayed (mean = 1.39), \( F (1, 311) = 18.51, p < .001 \). Not supporting H3, the repetition by time of measurement interaction was not significant, \( F < 1 \).

Overall, the results clearly indicate that increasing the number of exposures to an advertisement improves memory for the product category and, importantly, for the brand name. Furthermore, the advantages of increased repetition on memory still exist even after a delay between ad exposure and tests of memory.

**Attitude Measures**

Similar to results in other studies (Ginter 1974, Mitchell and Olson 1977, Belch 1982, Batra and Ray 1986, and Zhang and Zinkhan 1991), no significant main effect of repetition were found for any of the attitude measures (MANOVA and ANOVAs). In addition, the main effects of time and ad repetition by time interactions were not significant. Unlike for the memory measures, ad repetition and time of measurement had no effects on attitudes and, hence, no support was found for hypotheses H1B, H1C, or H4.

Since the treatments of interest (repetition and time) did not impact upon brand and ad attitudes, additional tests of mediation were not warranted (Baron and Kenny, 1986). No support was found for the hypotheses that memory (H5A) or ad attitudes (H5B) mediate the relationship between repetition and brand attitudes.\(^2\)

**DISCUSSION**

Employing stimulus materials and methods previously used by Schumann, Petty, and Clemons (1990), the present research examined the interrelationships of ad repetition, memory, and attitudes toward the ad and brand. The results of this investigation yielded strong effects of ad repetition and time of testing on product and brand memory. Overall, the results supported the predictions that increasing the number of exposures to an advertisement improves memory for the product category and, importantly, brand name. Furthermore, multiple exposures to an ad lessened memory decay over time more than it aided memory when assessed immediately following exposure.

Despite the positive effects of multiple exposures to an ad on memory, we did not find any effects of ad exposures on ad and brand attitudes. Unlike for the memory measures, ad repetition and time of measurement had no effects on either ad or brand attitudes. These findings are contrary to those suggested by Johnson and Watkins (1971) and Pechmann and Stewart (1989) and, at least in the case of brand attitudes, results found by Hautgvedt et al. (1994, study two) on the role of memory in ad repetition effects on attitudes. Our findings, as well as previous findings (e.g., Batra and Ray 1986, Belch 1982, Schumann, Petty, and Clemons 1990, Zhang and Zinkhan 1991), are also contrary to what is often alluded to in marketing and advertising textbooks. Repeated exposures to the same ad do not appear to result in more favorable or unfavorable attitudes toward the brand. The evidence thus far seems to indicate that repeated exposures to ads for a brand results in changes in brand attitudes only when the ads are different, cosmically and substantively (e.g., Schumann, Petty, and Clemons 1990). The rationale that subjects simply are not remembering the ads long enough to form enduring attitudes (consistent with the ELM) does not appear to be true. The persistence of attitude change due to repeated exposures for cosmetic and substantively different ads, however, remains unclear (Hautgvedt et al. 1994).

As with any study, the findings, limitations, and need for future research related to the present study are intertwined. The use of students as subjects and the use of an experimental lab setting versus field setting have been suggested as disfiguring any ad repetition effects on brand attitudes (Pechmann and Stewart 1989). Another methodological procedure that might impact the results, and specifically the lack of any repetition effect on attitudes, is the procedures used in collecting the dependent measures and manipulation checks. The memory measures were taken prior to the attitudinal measures. In addition, in order to ensure subjects were aware of the ad and brand they were evaluating they were shown the ad prior to completing the attitudinal measures. Cuing the subjects to the ad and brand may have countered any change in attitudes that may have occurred in the delay measurement conditions. Although subjects’ attitudes may have become more favorable with the passage of time, collecting the memory measures and showing the ad may have sensitized them to the first session ad repetitions and, hence, may have countered the changes in attitudes that could have occurred due to time (e.g., sleeper effect).

Unlike in social psychology where increased exposures to stimuli (e.g., nonsense works, social issues/arguments, people) have been shown to result in more favorable attitudes toward the object of interest (e.g., Zajonc 1968; Berlyne 1970; Cacioppo, and Petty 1979), there exists very little support in the marketing and advertising literature that repeated exposures to ads, in and of itself, directly influences consumers’ attitudes toward the ad and brand (e.g., Ginter 1974, Mitchell and Olson 1977, Belch 1982, Batra and Ray 1986, Zhang and Zinkhan 1991). Rather, increased exposures to ads seem to have a positive affect on attitudes only when in combination with other factors/mediators related to the ad and brand.
processing of the information. Factors such as the personal relevance of the product, attention to the ad, and ad variation (i.e., cosmetic and substantive variation) interact with ad repetition in affecting attitudes (e.g., Schumann, Petty, and Clemons 1990; Haugtvedt et al. 1994). The present study attempted to replicate some of the earlier findings and more directly examine the role of memory, as compared to processing, in mediating the relationship between ad repetition and attitude change. Additional research is warranted that examines the conditions under which increased ad exposures influences attitudes as well as memory and the role of ad repetition and memory in attitudes toward the ad and brand.

REFERENCES


SPECIAL SESSION SUMMARY
The Conscious and Unconscious Influences of Affective Responses on Consumer Experience, Choice, and Behavior
Jordan L. LeBel, Concordia University, Canada

ABSTRACT
It has become increasingly acknowledged that consumers’ judgments and behaviors are not shaped solely by the deliberative consideration of attribute value but also by affective responses to products and services. The focus of this session is on the variety of affective responses underlying judgments and behaviors. The first paper, by Winkielman, Berridge, and Wilbarger, examines the effect of subliminal happy and angry facial expressions on consumers’ behaviors and judgments. The second paper by Raghunathan, Pham, and Corfman, investigates the influence of the conscious experience of anger, anxiety and sadness on the attractiveness of different consumption activities and behaviors. The third presenters (Darke, Chattopadhyay, and Ashworth) consider the experience of pleasure induced by music and its impact on choice decisions. Finally, in the last paper, Le Bel and Dubé consider the effect of contextual manipulations on the subjective experience of pleasure and on behavioral judgments. The contributions of these papers enhance our understanding of the diversity of influences of affective experiences.
SPECIAL SESSION SUMMARY

Portrayals of Environmental Myths and Images in European Adverts and the News Media

Susanne Friese, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Lucia Reisch, University of Hohenheim, Stuttgart, Germany

SESSION OVERVIEW

The papers that comprise this special session all originate from an EU-wide project spanning research conducted in five countries (Austria, Denmark, Germany, Great Britain and The Netherlands). The focus of the project is on environmentally friendly consumer behaviour with a particular interest in the reciprocal transfer between consumer values and lifestyles, infrastructural components and the depiction of environmental myths and images in the media. A well-known fact is that favourable attitudes toward the environment often do not translate into corresponding behaviours. Our study sets out to test the hypothesis that non-ecological motivations, various lifestyle indicators and certain infrastructural drivers and obstacles can explain environmentally friendly consumer behaviours better than “matching” attitudes.

In terms of analysing the media output, the following research questions were guiding our analysis: How are ‘nature’ and ‘environmental themes’ presented in advertising spots and the news media within and across different European countries? In particular, we looked at the following aspects:

a) To what extent is there an appeal to quality of life indicators and to images and myths of nature?
b) How is the appeal made?

The answer the first question, quantitative measures were employed; the ‘how’ question was answered by carrying out a qualitative analysis with the aid of computer software that allowed for data input of various media types (here text, print and video data).

The papers that form the special session offer some insights into various aspects of the project, but do not aim at providing an exhaustive summary of all results. The first paper provides some background data in conjunction with the quantitative analysis of primary and secondary data; the second paper offers some insights into various categories of media types presented in advertising spots and the news media within and across different European countries. In particular, we looked at the following aspects:

To give the reader an overview of the kinds of data that were collected in all countries, below the data collection and analysis procedure is described briefly:

Data Collection. In addition to the secondary infrastructural, value and attitude data, in newspaper articles and print advertisements, television advertising spots and - where available - infomercials advocating environmental friendly behaviours were collected by sampling a rolling week over a seven-week period in March to April 2000 (i.e., Monday of week 10, Tuesday of week 11, Wednesday of week 12, etc.). According to Hansen (1993), this method of data collection yields a representative sample of media output. In each country two major TV channels and two newspapers (one broadsheet, one tabloid were sampled). Advertising spots were videotaped during 3 hours of evening prime time between 6 and 9 pm. Newspapers were inspected for topics related to the environment including all sections from front page, over domestic news, foreign news, gossip, sport, culture, travel, science, economy to the society pages. The sending organisations of interest for both TV and print media were: governments (public), non-governmental organisations (NGOs) and businesses (private).

Data Analysis. In a first step, an overview of the various infrastructural components with regard to recycling behaviour and facilities, organic food availability, purchase and labelling issues, matters of energy and transport, and legislative issues was prepared. The newspaper texts and advertising materials were then subjected to a quantitative and qualitative analysis. The quantitative findings provided us with a good overview of what there is in the data and allowed statistical comparisons across countries. The qualitative analysis offered a more in-depth understanding of how environment and nature are projected and reflected in newspaper articles and advertisements, how environmental messages are actually packaged, what cultural icons and symbols are drawn upon and what kind of textual and visual metaphors and metonyms are used. Even though the study was not designed as a Grounded Theory study, the various stages of coding described by Strauss and Corbin (1998) were nonetheless useful to follow. Thus, in addition to using the a-priori defined coding categories, we applied an open coding strategy, followed by axial and selective coding. Open coding is by definition “the analytic process through which concepts are identified and their properties and dimensions are discovered in the data” (Strauss and Corbin, 1998, p. 101). Axial coding is “the process of relating categories to their subcategories [...] at the level of properties and dimensions” (p. 123). Selective coding refers to “the process of integrating and refining the theory” (p. 143) that emerges from the data. For example, the myth that nature is a symbol of freedom is likely to unfold in various different ways. The qualitative analysis of the data can capture the variety of dimensions and their properties that are present in the data and we can map out when they are drawn upon, by which medium, in which context, by which culture, etc. This can then also be set in relation to the various value dimensions that are projected and reflected upon. The qualitative analysis thus provided the thick descriptions (Geertz, 1973) that are needed in order to develop the sought after deeper understanding of how consumers become socialised into certain views and beliefs about the environment and how this might affect and motivate their behaviour.

Via triangulation also including the secondary data, it then will be possible to draw the various threads together and to form a more comprehensive picture on how the various components play together to influence a consumers understanding of environmental issues.

“Environmentally Significant Behaviour in Europe: Media Coverage and the Political, Economic and Cultural Climate”

Linda Steg, University of Groningen, The Netherlands
Brigitta Gatersleben, University of Surrey, UK

As mentioned above, of particular interest to the present project is whether the various myths of nature in addition to various
quality of life indicators can actually be detected in media messages, especially in newspaper articles and advertisements (print and televised). And if so, in which way they are reflected, supported and perpetuated. However, whilst we were using cultural theory as a starting point, we did not confine ourselves to the four cultural biases identified by the theory, each of which integrates the two myths in a specific way (for a critical discussion see Grendstad & Selle, 2000).

As a way to better understand how and why particular messages were sent and how meanings are produced, we considered it necessary to also take into account institutional and infrastructural frameworks within given cultural contexts. Recent studies suggest that such overall frameworks affect the ways in which consumers make sense of environmental meanings, especially with regards to messages transmitted by the media (Anderson, 1997; Bell, 1991; Douglas and Wildavsky, 1982; Gooch 1996).

Environmentally significant behaviour is influenced by many factors ranging from micro-level factors such as individual motivations, opportunities and abilities to macro-level (infrastructural) factors such as technological, economic, demographic, institutional and cultural factors (Gatersleben and Vlek, 1998). A wide range of data is available on the relevant infrastructural factors that influence individual behaviour such as data on the availability of consumer goods. Moreover, a substantial amount of data has been collected by various researchers on motivations, opportunities and abilities to perform (environmentally conscious and unconscious) consumer behaviour. Little information, however, is available on the cultural meaning of the environment within different societies and its relationship with infrastructural factors and environmentally significant behaviour. One way to examine the value of nature within a society is by means of analysing how the national media incorporates the environment in their advertisement and news coverage. The present paper examined data on environmentally significant behaviour in various European countries focusing on recycling, biological food consumption, and household energy use. This data is related to information on the economic, institutional and political climate within each country and to data on environmental attitudes and values. Moreover, specific attention is paid to how media coverage of the environment differs in these countries, and it is studied whether any consistent relationship can be found between media coverage, environmentally relevant behaviour and the countries political and institutional climate.


Susanne Friese, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark

The opportunities and use of qualitative research can be expected to change drastically as the practical feasibility of using not only text data, but graphical materials and moving images in qualitative data analysis increases. Some of the computer programmes that have emerged over the past ten years that aid the process of analysing text data qualitatively have now been developed to incorporate the possibilities of working with multimedia material. As is the case with many of the IT solutions offered by the market, the opportunities are often provided before we have developed methods for implementing them (compare Friese, 2000). The data collected for the present project constituted ideal material for a provisional exploration of the new features offered by various software solutions. The recorded advertising spots were on average 30 seconds in length and therefore still manageable in terms of disk space and other current digital technology capabilities. The spots also contained significant variety to allow for more than just a basic experimental analysis. The aim of the presentation is to provide a ‘hands on’ demonstration of how videotaped advertising spots can be analysed using a software solution. Whilst there are a number of programmes that offer features to analyse multimedia data, ATLAS.ti was chosen over other programmes because it firstly allows the analysis of streamed video data; secondly it facilitates the joint analysis of various media data including text, images, audio and video material, which was a necessary prerequisite for the current project; and thirdly the qualitative data analysis approach chosen for the project is best supported by ATLAS.ti when compared with other packages.

“Mass Mediated Environmental Consumer Socialization in Germany: A Qualitative Investigation”

Lucia Reisch, University of Hohenheim, Germany

Marleen Strategier, Catholic University Brabant, Tilburg, The Netherlands

As outlined in the introduction of the special session report, a central research question was the investigation of representations of nature and environmental issues in the media. This paper presents the results of the in-depth qualitative analysis of the German data that followed the initial quantitative analysis. During a 7-week rolling sampling period data was collected from one of the leading German daily newspapers (the “Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung”, FAZ) and from Germany’s largest tabloid (BILD Zeitung). The selection of these two media sources ensured that the data consisted of material designed for a varied readership with regards to education level and political interests. In addition, data was collected from the two largest (measured in audience quota) nation-wide television channels—one public (ARD), one private (RTL). With regard to the choice of print media, the TV stations were selected with the objective of capturing key influential media outlets within German society, which have the potential of being important transmission means, agenda-setters and socialization agents.

The database of German media sources consisted of 19 newspaper advertisements, 55 television advertisement spots, and 64 newspaper articles, all of which explicitly or implicitly covered or used nature or ecological arguments. Also advertisements and articles which carried only subtle references to nature or ecology were included. The data was collected, recorded, and digitised (articles, video spots, and print ads) in order to make it accessible for computer assisted qualitative data analysis (CAQDA) within ATLAS.ti. This presentation focuses on the qualitative analysis of the video spots.

In order to maintain the integrity of the data analysis, the starting point for the qualitative coding scheme were both the “myths of nature” and the “Quality of life” (QoL) aspects identified in the earlier quantitative stage of analysis. However, other categories were allowed to emerge. The initial quantitative analysis clearly showed that advertisers of television commercials extensively utilise both suggested concepts, the “image(s) of nature” and “quality of life aspects”. The most frequently used “images of nature” were: “human mastery/power over nature” (8 ads), "nature as intrinsically good’ (14), and the ‘recreational function of nature’ (19). Only very few advertising spots portrayed nature explicitly as ‘something to protect’. Concerning the “quality of life” (QoL) aspects, beauty (16), environmental quality (16), leisure time (16), family life (20), freedom and control (21), challenge and pleasure (29), and nature (33) were most frequently referred to.

In the qualitative analysis, it became clear that certain QoL aspects were used to reach certain target groups. For instance, ads for cars and alcoholic beverages usually targeted a male audience, employing the QoL aspect "challenge and pleasure". The challenge usually consisted of a man struggling with and conquering elements...
of nature—alone in a car or in a group of peers with a beer (“human master/power over nature”). Another example is food stuff, non-alcoholic drinks, and body products, which often target families. Here, the QoL aspect “family life” was generally employed portraying ideal and happy families with small children. Moreover, “family life” did play an important role for body related products such as shampoo or medicine, as well as for cleaning products, most frequently targeting women. What was striking in all commercials is the fact that the story was always presented in good and warm weather. “Nature” was mostly portrayed as something to be enjoyed (recreational function), or as something good in the sense that it was pointed out that the components of the product in question were pure natural ingredients (e.g., food, beverages, body products).

The final synthesis of the findings, also including the newspaper articles and print ads, will offer a thorough portrayal of how nature and environmental issues are presented in the German media. Based on these findings plus the background data, recommendations regarding strategies on how to better promote environmental friendly consumer behaviour will be outlined.

Anders Hansen, University of Leicester, UK
Alison Anderson, University of Plymouth, UK

Studies of advertising from the early to mid-1990s suggested a considerable surge in the inclusion of environmental appeals in advertising, a ’greening’ of marketing to match the increase in media news coverage and public concern about environmental issues characteristic of the late 1980s and early 1990s. Drawing on results from a comparative European study of Environmental Socialisation in the Mass Media, this paper presents findings from an analysis of television advertising in the Spring of 2000 in the United Kingdom, Germany and Denmark. The analysis demonstrates overall that overt environmental appeals are now comparatively rare in television advertising, although there are interesting differences from country to country. While explicit environmental appeals and green marketing as such are rare, nature imagery and appeals to the ‘natural’ are prominently deployed. It is argued that advertising in this respect makes an important contribution to ongoing public definitions of the environment, consumption, and environmental categories. With an emphasis on product and country variations, the analysis shows how television advertising articulates and reworks deep-seated cultural categories and understandings of nature, the natural, and the environment, and in doing so, communicates important boundaries and public definitions of appropriate consumption and ‘uses’ of the natural environment.

REFERENCES
Shifting Masculinities: Advertising, Male Bodies and the Male Gaze
Maurice Patterson, Nottingham Trent University, United Kingdom
Richard Elliott, University of Exeter & Saïd Business School, University of Oxford, United Kingdom

ABSTRACT

The depiction of the female body in advertising has a long history and has received quite a degree of attention in the academic literature. In contrast there has been much less interest in the depiction of the male body in advertising. This paper seeks to underline the negotiated character of male identities by demonstrating the means by which lifestyle magazine advertising has caused men to gaze upon images of their own bodies and outlining the implications of this inversion of the male gaze. In dealing with these issues the paper begins by outlining the unfinished nature of the body and its role in identity projects. It then charts the emergence of men’s lifestyle magazines in the UK and their position in the representation of male bodies. Next, the paper outlines the traditional understanding of the male gaze and identifies how that gaze is being inverted by the advertising images contained in men’s lifestyle magazines. The paper then explains how men, like women, can adopt multiple subject positions in their consumption of such advertising and what the implications of this are for the negotiation of male identities. Finally, conclusions are drawn and recommendations made for further research.
Marketing’s Interpretive Communities: A Case Study of Gay Men’s Responses to Advertising
Steven M. Kates, Monash University, Australia

ABSTRACT
Interpretation of marketing communications has become increasingly problematic in the contemporary commercial environment, largely due to postmodern conditions characterized by an overabundance of available cultural meanings and interpretive perspectives and the instability of social categories. This problem has implications for segmentation and the positioning of brands, and strategic consistency of marketing messages becomes increasingly difficult. In response to this question, this article adopts a reader-response perspective. The purposes here are the following: to advance the theoretical constructs of interpretive communities and interpretive strategies; to present ethnographic evidence from a study of gay men’s consumption patterns, demonstrating these constructs’ critical roles in structuring and inflecting interpretation of marketing communications; and to demonstrate their usefulness and relevance to contemporary marketing theory and practice.
The Joys of Text: Women’s Experiential Consumption of Magazines
Lorna Stevens, University of Ulster, Northern Ireland
Stephen Brown, University of Ulster, Northern Ireland
Pauline Maclaran, De Montfort University, United Kingdom

ABSTRACT

This interpretive study explores the pleasures that women readers derive from their consumption of magazines. It describes the relationship between women’s texts and women’s bodies, and the extent to which women’s magazines offer women “feminine” pleasures. The findings reveal the physicality of reading and the conflation of body and mind that occurs in women’s experiential consumption of magazines. Indeed they suggest that women’s magazines offer women a totality of enjoyment akin to the concept of jouissance, and they enable women to celebrate their right to their own space, their own time and their own pleasures.

INTRODUCTION

This is a study of women’s genres and women’s pleasures. It is also about the relationship between women’s texts and women’s bodies, and the extent to which women’s magazines can be perceived as “feminine” texts offering “feminine” pleasures. The study, located within the experiential consumption paradigm, is based on in-depth interviews with women readers of magazines, and it explores the particular textual and experiential qualities of women’s magazines, and the nature of the pleasures they provide.

HEDONIC AND EXPERIENTIAL CONSUMPTION

The quest for pleasurable consumer experiences is a distinctive feature of modern consumerism that is characterised by an individual’s interest in the meanings and images that can be imputed to the product (Campbell, 1987). Hirschman and Holbrook’s work on experiential and hedonic consumption (1981, 1982) shifted the emphasis in consumer research away from the traditional view of consumers as rational information processors. They argued that consumers’ sensory-emotive stimulation and the stream of associations that occurred during consumption provided rich insights into consumer experience. They also noted that “emotional arousal” was a major motivation for the consumption of certain product categories such as novels. The authors concluded that consumer behaviour was “far more sensorily complex, imaginative and emotion laden” than had previously been reflected in marketing research. This focus on the experience of consumption has become an important one in contemporary consumer research, an on-going project to explore a more experiential, sensory stimulation approach to consumption experience. The relationship between genre and gender is an increasingly difficult nettle to grasp, perhaps because today categorisations along gender lines, or indeed any other lines for that matter, are widely regarded as “slipping” and in crisis (Curti, 1998). The political issues embedded within discussions of genre and gender fall outside the aims of this present study. Suffice to say that “women’s genres” is a recognisable category that is attributed with distinct characteristics and qualities. These are as follows: they tend to be open-ended, fluid and cyclical in form; they inscribe female desire; they comprise multiple, women-centred narratives; they have a relational and private sphere focus; they are primarily written by and consumed by women; and they address or construct a feminine subject/spectator. Perhaps most significantly, they are perceived as literary forms that reflect women’s lives and indeed women’s sexuality (Modleski, 1982; Kuhn, 1984; Geraghty 1991, Beetham, 1996).

Geraghty (1991) writes that women’s genres encourage us to “feel” our way into texts and “try out” a range of different personas without having to “live” any of them, and Ang (1985) likens women’s consumption of these genres to “dressing up”, trying out different modes of femininity without necessarily being committed to any of them. Ballaster et al (1991) suggest that women’s magazines - open-ended, heterogeneous and fragmented - mirror the contradictory nature of “femininity” itself: a woman becomes “a multi-faceted consumer who is in a continual, never-ending process of constructing herself” (p. 12). The conflation of sexuality with textuality, and female desire with consumption, that occurs in women’s genres, is aptly referred to by Winship (1987), in the context of women’s magazines, as “that nexus of femininity-desire-consumption”. To what extent are these elements processual and inter-connected? Can we define women’s magazines as “feminine” texts? Is sex and text conflated in them, with the one determining the other?

French feminists such as Hélène Cixous and Luce Irigaray believe that women’s language springs from the body, from female desire and sexuality, both of which they describe as multiple, diffuse, boundless, and impossible to pin down. Irigaray believes that women’s bodies and women’s meaning making in language are intimately connected (in Humm, 1995) and Cixous (1988) writes “there is a bodily relationship between reader and text” (p. 148). L’écriture féminine is a feminine linguistics that is characterised by simultaneity, plurality and mobility (Humm, 1992). It is “more fluid than direct, more experiential than argumentative” (Warhol and Herd, 1997, p. 344). Do women’s texts reflect women’s experience and speak to female desire as the French feminists claim?

The view that women’s language and women’s experience of language is inscribed with women’s sexuality is often critiqued as being an essentialist and thus limiting view that upholds a biological determinism and political conservatism. However Fuss (1989), for example, suggests that Irigaray’s work secures “a woman’s access to an essence of her own, without actually prescribing what that essence might be, or without precluding the possibility that a subject might possess multiple essences” (in Fraser and Bartky, 1997).
The Joys of Text: Women's Experiential Consumption of Magazines

WOMEN'S GENRES AND JOUISSANCE

Women's genres such as romance fiction, soap opera or women's magazines offer a rich source of pleasure and fantasy, of escapism and gratification for women which often has little or nothing to do with their "real" experience, their everyday lives. Indeed Ang (1996) suggests that women may enjoy being seduced by such genres precisely because they don't have any "reality value". Pleasure, she argues, has nothing to do with outcomes but everything to do with "the process of seduction"; fantasy is "a reality in itself, a fundamental aspect of human existence which enables us to evoke alternative and more attractive scenarios than those experienced in real life" (p. 93).

Gratification, as such, resides not in the realisation of fantasies but rather in the activity of fantatising itself, or, to put it another way, pleasure resides in the activity of reading, the experience of reading.

Romantic fiction is a self-perpetuating genre, both textually and in its mode of marketing (Philips, 1990). It is a genre that creates "a perpetual desire to repeat the experience" (Radway, 1987, p. 105), largely because, as a woman's form, it resists closure. As a genre, women's romance thus facilitates a repetitive consumption pattern; consumption is never achieved and thus we return to them again and again; they offer "a permanent state of foreplay" (Light, 1984, p. 23).

McCracken (1993) notes that the way in which magazines are read: the delays, the interruptions, etc, may even heighten women's pleasure as readers. Pleasure, for the reader, is in the journey, the quest itself, and the promises it offers.

Ballaster et al (1991) write that "reading" a magazine involves pleasures of action and participation, of reading ahead, of reading back to front; of creating one's own narrative. Women's magazines, they conclude, offer women the excitement of consumption, whether this is imagined or actual consumption. Whilst pleasure has increasingly been focused on in research on women's genres, pleasure continues to be perceived as problematic from a feminist perspective (Tasker, 1991; Hollows, 2000). Hollows suggests, however, that pleasure need not be categorised as positive or negative, but merely as an intrinsic and important aspect of contemporary consumption. The pleasurableness inherent and embedded in the experience of reading a woman's magazine may be sufficient reason, in itself, for valuing and indeed privileging the consumption experience facilitated by it.

The concept of jouissance in French feminist theory contributes further insights in the context of women's genres and the pleasures they offer, not least for the connections jouissance makes between the female body, desire and language. Humm (1995) refers to jouissance as a totality of enjoyment - sexual, spiritual, physical and conceptual, an experience that is outside of linguistic norms in the realm of the poetic. According to Shildrick (1997) jouissance is not only an alternative linguistic discourse that overflows the closure of male discourse, but "an expression of a process of production at the interface of body, desire and language." (p. 178). Roland Barthes in The Pleasure of the Text (1976) makes a distinction between texts of pleasure (plaisir - contentment) and texts of bliss (jouissance - rapture). He describes the former as enjoying a consistency of selfhood, and the latter as seeking a loss of selfhood. Texts of bliss are usually regarded as symptomatic of "feminine" reading: "an active, free, but crisis-ridden dissolution of subjectivity and ecstasy" (Irigaray, 1981, in Ballaster et al, 1991, p. 31). Kristeva also makes a distinction between "plaisir" (sexual pleasure), and "jouissance" (total joy or ecstasy) (in Humm, 1995). According to Barthes, jouissance is being beyond words and impossible to express in words. It is about action, not words, about experience, not ideas. In keeping with this emphasis the present study's focus is on the action and the experience of reading, and the extent to which women's magazines offer women pleasures akin to the concept of jouissance.

METHODOLOGY

Consistent with an interpretive and feminist approach, the analysis of findings is done from the perspectives of the consumers involved, with the objective being to understand their motives and feelings. In keeping with the aims of a phenomenological interview, the research study was concerned with exploring the "lived experience" of respondents (Thompson et al, 1989, p. 135), and with letting subjects speak for themselves. As such the emphasis was on respect rather than concern, reflecting a postmodernity rather than modernity discourse (Hermes, 1997).

In her study of romance fiction Radway (1987) privileges readers over text. She argues that reader response theory enabled her to understand what reading these books meant to its audience, addressing contextual issues and romance reading “as a form of behaviour” (p 7). Suleiman (1980) writes that a focus on readers assigns itself to "the multiplicity of contexts, the shared horizons of belief, knowledge, and expectation, which make any understanding, however fleeting, of minds or of texts, possible" (p 45). Privileging the reader is compatible with much feminist research, as it alters the traditional balance of power and enables the reader to make of text what she will. This present study also privileges readers, focusing on readers’ experience of text, rather than text itself.

The study is based on sixteen in-depth interviews and four focus groups with women, all of whom were in what the women’s magazine market like to refer to as the “middle-youth” age group, that is to say they were mostly in their 30s. Most of the women were married or co-habiting with partners, most had children, most worked full-time, and all read women's magazines. Compatible with a phenomenological interview the goal was to obtain a first-person description of a particular aspect of the interviewee’s experience (Thompson et al, 1989). Accordingly the interviews were conducted in an informal fashion; they each lasted at least an hour; and any questions or probes were aimed at bringing about as much detailed descriptions of experiences as possible.

The women were recruited using the researcher’s professional and personal network, employing “snowballing” or “friendship pyramiding” (Kitzinger 1989, p. 87 in Hermes, 1997).

FINDINGS

The Experience of Reading

The pleasures of anticipation

When the women described the experience of reading a magazine and the rituals attached to their reading of magazines, there was a strong emphasis on the anticipatory aspects of consumption, and how anticipation enhanced their pleasure. For example, several made the point that the situation had to be right: they didn’t want to read the magazine when they weren’t sufficiently relaxed and thus couldn’t give it their full attention. As
the following extract also indicates, Katie realised that when she spoke about her magazine consumption she might in fact have been talking about love making, perhaps a good illustration of Irigaray’s “erotics in reading”:

“I would see it there and say I’ll leave it until - it’s like opening a Christmas present, isn’t it? You have to - it’s tempting but you don’t actually open it .... It’s like you’re building up to something, it’s something you’re looking forward to - It’s like foreplay! [laughs] It’s like looking forward to Christmas or something and [the build up] is generally more exciting than the actual thing!”
(Katie)

Delaying its consumption in no way detracts from the pleasure it provides, in fact it may even enhance the pleasure. After all, the reader doesn’t want to “ruin” it by reading it at a time when she cannot devote her full attention to it:

“Yeah I might have it for a couple of days before I would read it you know, I wouldn’t want to ruin it by just bringing it home and having a look through it when I’m making the tea, I would have to be able to have that wee bit of time to myself and sit down and have a look through it .... I usually flick to start with, I flick through everything, I don’t read anything the first time around, and then I start working my way through it then slowly.”
(Helen)

Sarah put her magazine on a table in the hallway. She would wait until she had a chance to read it properly: “I’m just waiting for the opportunity, but I know it’s there”, she said. Occasionally this sense of anticipation was accompanied by feelings of anxiety, not unlike Campbell’s (1987) romantic ethic perhaps, that consumption would result in disappointment: “Sometimes the idea of it is so nice that I’m scared of being disappointed”, said Karen. Very often women’s anticipation is bound up with other sensual pleasures, such as chocolate, coffee, wine, or physical comfort. Erin described it thus: “you’re on your way home and you’re thinking yeah, great, I’m going to sit, and I’m going to have a cup of coffee and a bar of chocolate and my magazine”.

_Loving Oneself:_ Women’s magazines often enable women to express their regard and indeed affection for themselves, to experience a sense of nurturance in a life where the demands of children, work and home may give them little opportunity for that. Sarah described how reading her magazine in the bath as “time well spent.” She goes on: “Half an hour in the bath is like looking after ourselves really”. Karen also described the pleasure of going into a world where she could just forget about everything and “pamper myself for a change”. The more common expression would be “pamper”. In saying “pamper” she may be suggesting both that reading magazines enables her to “spoil” (pamper) herself and also gratify (pander to) herself. Most of the women described their reading of magazines as one of a number of things that enabled them to be “self-indulgent”. In order for it to be a self-indulgent experience, the women, almost without exception, liked to read alone, regarding the experience of reading a magazine as a private one. As Helen expressed it: “You can’t do it when the kids are around, or when you have friends round. It’s not very sociable ... because you do have to be quite focused on it to enjoy it and appreciate it”. Another reader, Marie, said: “It’s my little egocentric world that I’m satisfying and nothing beyond that, you know. It’s very, very insular”.

_Losing Oneself:_ The women who were interviewed used magazines to bring about a desired state of mind. Often this state of mind is relaxation; or pleasure; it makes no demands on them, it is just “there”. They enter a zone of pure indulgence, a “winding down” that enables them to stop worrying about their everyday concerns, and the demands that others make on them. The way that magazines enabled women to “switch off” and “lose” themselves was often described as one of their main advantages:

“I think it’s just been a way of switching off and getting engrossed in something else for a while ... switching off from my life. It’s nice to just lose yourself ... either magazines or books - I can get totally engrossed ... Switching off from whatever I had been doing before.”
(Katie)

_Relaxing the Body:_ As the above extract also indicates, magazines are endowed with the ability to bring about physical changes in the reader. They enable them to relax, wind down and feel happy. It is not so much what they are as what they can do. They seem to have transformative power and even therapeutic qualities:

“I’ve found that maybe I’ve woken up at three or four if something was worrying me and I know that I’ll put the light on and read and that is actually a way of clearing my - the clutter if you like, out of my brain, because it comes back to this, you know ... It unclutters my brain. ... I mean it goes back to that sort of escapism thing again, that it allows you to clear your mind and relax .... It’s a total switch-off, that lets you relax. You know you can almost feel yourself ... if I go to bed quite hyper the only way I can actually slow myself down even on a physical note is to read, and reading a magazine does that, you know, so there is a physical side to it - as well as a sort of an emotional shutdown there’s also a physical shutdown, because I need to be lying over on my side, and I would sort of flick through it like that, and that’s me, sad as I am! [laughs]”
(Caroline)

Magazines “allow” Caroline to clear her mind; they “let” her relax. Sarah also alluded to their ability to “slow you down”. She goes on to say “it’s not that it’s boring but I feel a bit calmer. I’m in the bed, reading a magazine. I just drop it on the floor, and that’s me”.

_Stimulating the Body:_ Aside from their power as relaxants magazines are often used to have the opposite effect. Magazine consumption is often referred to as “instant gratification” or “quick fix” stimulants, likened to sugar or chocolate, that act as “pick me ups” but whose effects are short-lived and whose benefits are somewhat dubious:

“... it’s just completely in your face, there on the plate and you don’t have to do anything. It is just instant gratification with calories attached and you know, it’s empty, it’s like sugar, it’s empty calories sort of thing. But that’s okay for when you want that, you know, it has a purpose, it fulfils a need sort of thing at that time, but for long term nourishment I would prefer a book, ... It’s very hedonistic, isn’t it? Very kind of self-gratification kind of - you know, none of it is pure genuine sustenance.”
(Marie)

Janice draws a similar analogy to Marie, this time with chocolate, and describes the guilt that is often bound up with the pleasure of indulging in a magazine: “You get a quick fix, you know, you’re on a high, and then after you finished it you’re on a sort of a down - and sometimes a magazine would leave you feeling like that, you know, back to life. ... you think I shouldn’t have eaten that chocolate! [laughs]”.

_A Feminine Form?_

_Easy Reading:_ As suggested in the literature on women’s genres, many women found that the form of women’s magazines increased their enjoyment, because they were compatible with the
pattern of their lives. They particularly liked the fact that they were easy to “dip in and out of” and put down, and they didn’t require much attention, or intellectual effort. This “ease” with which women’s magazines could be read was a point that was frequently made by the women readers. Siritar expresses it thus: “it’s just being able to pick it up, and you can flick through it.”

Everything is at your fingertips.- At other times the “ease” of magazines also resided in the fact that they offered variety and choice in an easily assimilated form, and this was an important aspect of the pleasure they provided:

> “Everything is at your fingertips. Rather than waiting on your programme coming on or trying to do this or - you’ve got your clothes, your food, everything’s there for you ... you switch off and information is given to you, you know, you don’t have to think or - it’s just all there - and there’s pictures - it’s all there.” (Jules)

Most of the women readers used phrases like “flicking” or “dipping” or “browsing” to describe how they read magazines. The way in which magazines were read, the reading act itself, was described in positive terms, as an intrinsic part of the pleasure. This perhaps recalls Moore’s (1986) observation that browsing can, of itself, be both a liberatory and very enjoyable act on the part of the magazine reader. Above all, the women emphasised that women’s magazines offered immediate pleasures, requiring the minimum of effort for the maximum return:

> “It’s the instantaneous pleasure and the short-lived pleasure from magazines, because you can’t get it out of a book until you’ve read the whole book, whereas you can get it from a magazine, just dipping into it, dipping in, and you get a wee bit of it and you dip back out again.” (Helen)

Another reader, Lisa, comparing magazines to books, said, “to me a magazine is just something that doesn’t require anything of me”.

Enjoying the Journey: The form of women’s magazines themselves were often referred to as being intrinsically pleasurable, as in the following extract from Finnoula’s interview, when she makes specific reference to their open-ended and cyclic nature. Interestingly, she suggests that the ease with which they can be read means that there’s less “guilt”. This may be because less time and effort are invested in their consumption and thus she has no difficulty justifying the time she spends on them, or perhaps she is suggesting that whilst guilt and pleasure so often go together, in this instance they do not:

> “It’s enjoyable. There’s no beginning, middle or end. And you know there’s no guilt about it or anything. You just enjoy it. ... that’s the beauty of magazines - that you can kind of flick through them and pause when you want. And pass things by, and maybe go back.” (Finnoula)

Much of the instantaneous pleasure seems bound up with their freedom and choice as readers. After all, the journey is not prescribed, but is defined by the reader herself.

Reading Scenarios

Private Places- Most of the women who were interviewed read magazines in places and spaces that enabled them to relax and have privacy. The favourite places mentioned were baths, sofas, armchairs, beds and toilets, usually in that order! In these places they had physical comfort, silence and, perhaps most importantly, solitude. The right scenario enabled them to devote themselves to their own pleasures, and magazines had a key role in these “self-indulgent”, “time for me” periods. Sarah describes one such scenario:

> “I read them, not as a pastime but as a time for me. ... That’s something that I do for myself, it really is something that’s completely self-indulgent. I get in the bath, the lights are off, the candles are on, everything’s steamed up because I have to have it so I’m nearly boiling myself. The bubbles are there, the door’s locked, she [her daughter] could be squealing blue murder, but it’s got to be something good to get me out of the bath. It’s very self-indulgent, whereas I think I do the rest of the stuff because I think that’s what everybody else expects me to do.” (Sarah)

This is a zone that enables Sarah to focus on herself. She is no longer doing what is expected of her from other people. Instead she is doing what she wants to do. Her magazine consumption is intricately related to sensual pleasures and self-gratification as she describes a private space that enables her to focus on her “self” and her pleasures. The experience of reading a magazine is intricately connected with a sense of self-identity, and indeed self-regard. It is part of an almost ritualistic celebration of her body.

The importance of privacy, silence, and solitude in terms of the right reading scenarios was emphasised throughout the interviews and was a key element in women’s experiential consumption of magazines. Essentially it was an act of self-love that was done behind closed doors. As Katie expressed it “there’d be no noise; silence; you’d just want to be on your own and lock the door ... I would need total peace”. It was not so much what magazines were as what they could do for the reader, as is vividly conveyed in the following extract:

> “I wouldn’t read anywhere may except in bed, or god help me, sitting on the loo or something like that, because I connect it with relaxation and I don’t want anybody else around and I don’t want - I wouldn’t want to sit beside someone in the living room and read a magazine: You know, I would - it’s almost like a personal thing - go away and do it - because I want my attention focused on that ... I really have to be removed... For me it’s more this escape to be by myself and relax, wind down, and use a magazine in that way.” (Caroline)

Caroline’s extract, whilst emphasising the intrinsically private nature of her magazine consumption also emphasises the predominance of experiential aspects in magazine reading. The magazine’s importance for her resides in its ability to have a certain effect on her. She “uses” a magazine in a certain way, in order to achieve a desired effect.

DISCUSSION

To what extent is reading a magazine a physical experience? From the interviews it is apparent that most of the women are indirect communication with their bodies when they read, wrapped up in a private pleasure zone which has much more to do with sensuous, sensual and emotional aspects than with cognitive, rational ones. From the findings it also seems at times that we are not far from Irigaray’s auto-erotics of reading or Cixous’ erotics of language (in Humm, 1995). The interviews certainly reveal the physicality of reading, as well as the conflation of body and mind that occurs in experiential consumption of magazines. They also perhaps illustrate what Barthes refers to when he writes that “the pleasure of the text is irreducible to physiological need.” (p. 17). From the findings it seems women’s magazines give women a “totality of enjoyment” that recalls descriptions of jouissance. In this context they enable
women to simultaneously enjoy, through the text, the “consistency” of selfhood and “its collapse, its fall” (Barthes, 1976, p. 21), and this loving and losing of self, this “dissolve”, is the essence of *jouissance*.

Radway (1987) writes that romantic fiction provides its readers “with an important emotional release that is proscribed in daily life because the social role with which they identify themselves leaves little room for guilt-less, self-interested pursuit of individual pleasure” (p. 96). She writes that they express women’s ritual wish to be cared for, loved, and validated in a particular way; and they offer women “a vicarious experience of emotional nurturance and erotic anticipation and excitation” (p. 105). From this study it seems that women’s magazines are also a medium and a means through which women can experience nurturance; they are a haven at both a physical and an emotional level.

Women’s magazines enabled the readers in this study to validate themselves as women and as individuals. They enabled them to celebrate their right to their own space, their own time, and their own pleasures. The women who were interviewed emphasised that such moments of “self-indulgence” were rare, but the rarity of these moments made them all the more desirable and precious. Holbrook, recalling the Romantic Movement, refers to the joys and longings of consumption. The joys of reading magazines, of experiencing women’s magazines, are that they may enable women to experience emotional and sensory pleasure, not least since they provide them with a reason to take a long hot bath!

REFERENCES


A multiattribute range model is proposed. The range model assumes that consumers represent a brand’s level of attribute delivery as a range, which is compared to a range of the desired level of the attribute, and weighted by a range of importance of the attribute. This model allows for the possibility of uncertainty in the perception of a brand belief, a “latitude of acceptance” (or tolerance) for the desired level of an attribute, and contextual variability in the perceived importance of an attribute.

The model was tested with an experiment. Two hundred fifteen undergraduate students were given taste samples of an unfamiliar brand of vegetable juice. One third of the students received factual information about one of the attributes of the juice, which was intended to change their belief about the attribute level. Another third of the students received normative information in the form of other students’ evaluation of the attribute, which was intended to change their belief about the attribute level and the confidence with which they hold the belief. A final third of the students were given unrelated information. The results demonstrated that the range model better predicted students’ overall evaluation of the juice than did the conventional ideal point model, particularly in the normative information condition.

Brand attitude is a critical determinant of brand choice (Kraft, Granbois & Summers 1973), and is said to be “the pillar on which sales and profit fortunes of a giant corporation rest” (Aaker & Myers, 1987, p. 160). Though its importance is undeniable, researchers in behavioural decision theory have provided dozens of examples of the apparent instability of brand attitudes (see Payne, Bettman & Johnson 1993 for a review). There is a great deal of controversy over how to approach specifying the construct to capture its instability over contexts. It is proposed here that each of the components of attitude in a multiattribute framework would be more accurately represented as a range rather than a point estimate.

Our model extends the conventional ideal point model by including ranges around each of the components to capture a consumer’s uncertainty when estimating attribute levels of a brand, a latitude of acceptance for desired levels of an attribute, and uncertainty in stating the importance of an attribute. The two models, the ideal point model and the range model, are tested with data collected in an experiment to investigate which specification captures the changes in the estimation of one or more of the components caused by the post-consumption word-of-mouth.

EXPLAINING OVERALL EVALUATIONS

If product judgments are considered as an overall evaluation of a brand in a multiattribute framework, they are a function of the strength of the beliefs that a brand possesses certain attributes weighted by the evaluations of those attributes (Fishbein 1963). Ahtola (1975) extended Fishbein’s multiattribute attitude model in his Vector Model, which sums the probabilities that a brand has specific levels of an attribute multiplied by the evaluations of those specific levels. Ahtola asked individuals to estimate probabilities for a number of levels of each attribute, which results in a vector or a distribution-like representation of brand beliefs.

Another version of the multiattribute model used in the marketing literature, the ideal point model (Green & Srinivasan 1978), incorporates: (1) brand beliefs – the perceived level a brand has of a particular attribute, (2) attribute level desirability – the desirable level of a particular attribute, and (3) attribute importance. The ideal point model assumes that the consumer has an “ideal point” or a preferred level of each attribute on a continuum of attribute levels. By comparing the perceived level of a particular attribute, or a brand belief, with the desired level of the attribute, consumers can evaluate brand performance with respect to their preference for each attribute. The effect of the evaluation on brand attitude is a function of that attribute’s importance to the consumer.

The ideal point model has been used in perceptual mapping (Johnson 1988) to create shares of preference between brands available in the marketplace which are useful for purposes of segmentation (Feick 1998; Johnson 1995). Some critical limitations of the current form of the model will be discussed in the next sections. An extension of the model to include ranges is designed to resolve these shortcomings.

EXTENDING THE IDEAL POINT MODEL

Brand Belief

Uncertainty in establishing brand beliefs

Multiattribute attitude models typically used in marketing research, such as the ideal point model, are constrained by the assumption that consumers are fully aware of the amount of each attribute a brand possesses (Meyer 1981). Brand attribute beliefs are most often measured by asking the individual to choose a rating scale category that describes the likelihood that a brand has an attribute, with seven categories of likelihood ranging from “very likely” to “very unlikely.” The problem with this type of scale is that the amount of uncertainty in the judgment is not captured. Consumers are not able to communicate that they are very certain (judgment is concentrated in one category of the rating scale), or that they are very uncertain (judgment is spread over adjacent categories), or that the uncertainty is asymmetrical (judgment is not equally spread above and below the most probable category).

Ahtola (1975), in his Vector Model of preferences, enabled consumers to distribute poker chips over the rating categories, allowing them to communicate the degree of uncertainty in their estimates, and, if it was skewed, the direction of their uncertainty. The respondents, however, were still limited to the fixed categories composing the rating scale. In our range model, we allow individuals to express their brand beliefs as ranges from a minimum level ($B_{ik}^{min}$) to a maximum ($B_{ik}^{max}$) indicating a “confidence interval” around the point estimate of the brand belief ($B_{ik}$) (see Figure 1).

Conditions under which uncertainty might arise

We use two sources of information when forming a brand belief: our perception of the physical reality, and what others say (Van Avermaet 1996). When we estimate $B_{ik}$ with our “own perception of reality” information only, uncertainty may arise because of a lack of confidence in our ability to accurately make an assessment. The uncertainty in brand beliefs is exaggerated for those less knowledgeable (Biswas & Sherrell 1993) or unfamiliar.

---

1 This research was funded by an Australian Research Council Small Grant RMC2332. Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Elizabeth Cowley, School of Marketing, John Goodsell Building, University of New South Wales, Sydney NSW 2052, Australia. Electronic mail may be sent via the internet to e.cowley@unsw.edu.au
(Estes & Hosseini 1988) in the domain. When using information from the environment that constitutes "others’ perception of reality," uncertainty may arise because of a lack of credibility or trustworthiness of the information source (see Woodruff 1972). In both of these cases the range around the estimate of the level of an attribute increases (Cowley & Rossiter 2000), reflecting an increase in uncertainty. When the information from the environment is consistent with "own perception," then the range of uncertainty decreases (Cowley & Rossiter 2000), reflecting the boost in confidence that occurs when our judgments are legitimized.

The situation becomes more complicated when there is a discrepancy between "own perception" and information from the environment. Three outcomes could result from the contradiction. First, the point estimate of the attribute level could be altered to be more consistent with the information from the environment. This might be likely if the consumer learns a new fact about the brand that causes them to update their belief by changing their point estimate. Second, the range around the point estimate could increase because information from the environment calls into question the basis of the point estimate. Third, a combination of an alteration of the point estimate and a change in the confidence with which the belief is held could occur. This might be the case if the consumer is provided information about "everyone else’s opinion". In the process of comparing "own evaluation" to "others’ evaluation", "own evaluation" may be altered to be more consistent with the presumed majority evaluation of others (Festinger 1954; Schachter & Singer 1962).

Consider the following scenarios. You are having dinner with five friends. Dinner is served, the wine has been breathing. One of your friends pours the wine, you take a sip, you think the wine is quite light, but before you can comment, you notice that the label describes the wine as a heavy, full-bodied wine. In this case, you might change your point estimate of its heaviness. In the second case, you have always thought this particular wine was quite heavy because a wine expert reported it as such, but one of your friends says during dinner that the expert is not at all credible. In this case, you would be fairly confident that the wine, if anything, is not lighter than your original assessment, but you may be unsure about whether it is actually heavier. Your point estimate might change, but also the range would be asymmetrically skewed toward the comment.

The ideal point model would detect any change in the point estimate based on what is perceived to be a fact, but would not detect changes in confidence based on changes in the range around the estimate. In our range model, both changes in brand beliefs and changes in the confidence with which beliefs are held are captured.

Desired Level of an Attribute

A range of acceptance around the desired level

Economic theory is based on the assumption that consumers have an underlying preference structure that guides them in their decisions. This assumption allows consumers to make economically rational judgments using these relatively stable preferences. Behavioral decision theorists have called this assumption into question by demonstrating that both the task and the context impact preferences because preferences, typically, are constructed during their elicitation (Lichtenstein & Slovic 1971; Tversky, Sattath & Slovic 1998). One explanation is that when estimating the desired level of an attribute, E_{ij}, the estimate is actually a range around the point estimate that can be conceptualized as a "latitude of acceptance" (Coombs 1964; Hovland, Harvey & Sherif 1957). Within the range the consumer may not receive the exact ideal level of attribute, yet the level would not be considered undesirable. Outside of the range, below E_{ij}^{min} or above E_{ij}^{max}, the level of attribute would be considered undesirable. In our range model the consumer is allowed to specify a range of acceptable attribute levels between E_{ij}^{min} and E_{ij}^{max}, indicating a tolerance in preference.

Conditions under which the range might change.

Information from another consumer may influence the desired level of attribute or the acceptable range around attribute if the comment provides a context that alters the outcome of a specific level of the attribute. Consider the following scenarios. Imagine that while you are drinking a beverage, your friend makes a comment about salt. The comment might describe the attribute positively by suggesting that natural salt is part of a healthy diet, or negatively by suggesting that all forms of salt are not healthy. If the comment is consistent with your previous estimate of the desired salt level, then there may be a reduction in the range around your ideally desired level, reflecting a reduction in your tolerance for levels other than your ideal level. Conversely, if the comment is inconsistent with the consumer’s previous estimate of the desired salt level, the range may shift in the direction of the comment, reflecting an increase in tolerance for attribute levels in the direction of the comment. In our model we allow consumers to represent their desired level as a "latitude of acceptance" around E_{ij} which extends on either side of a previously established point estimate.

Attribute Importance

Uncertainty in Attribute Importance.

An individual’s assessment of the importance of a particular attribute (Imp) has been manipulated by the context (Huber, Payne & Puto 1982; Simonson & Tversky 1992), and with the frame (Fischhoff 1983; Thaler 1985). Additionally, consumers’ assessment of Imp has been shown to change with accumulation of experience in a product category (Hoeflter & Ariely 1999). Market researchers using decompositional procedures believe that individuals may not be accurate in their assessment of the importance of each individual attribute (Green 1984) which is supported by more general findings revealing inaccuracies in the reporting of attribute importance (Shepard 1964). We believe that the inaccuracy may be the result of constraining the consumer to a point estimate instead of a range of importance. Although consumer researchers have provided importance information in the form of a distribution (Kahn & Meyer 1991), our model captures a range estimate indicating the consideration of contextual variation for Imp.

THE RANGE MODEL

Winkler (1966; 1967) pioneered the range method as a way of estimating Bayesian prior distributions. It was first used in marketing by Woodruff (1972), who used 19 fixed rating categories (half-points on a 1 to 10 scale) to measure beliefs only. Since then, the only marketing study we could find that employs the notion of the individual’s belief variance is by the marketing consultant William T. Moran (1985), who may have arrived at the notion independently as the earlier work by Woodruff was not cited. A related method, the grain-scale method, has been used recently in decision making to test judgmental estimation models (Yaniv & Foster 1996). In that study, respondents were allowed to choose one interval from one of six scales varying in graininess, or interval size, from 290 years to 2.5 years. Respondents could indicate greater confidence by selecting an interval from a finer scale.
Our range model may be expressed algebraically as:

$$OE_{ik} = \sum_{i=1}^{n} \left[ \frac{\text{Imp}_{ij}}{\text{Imp}_{ij}^\text{max} - \text{Imp}_{ij}^\text{min}} \right] \left( \text{sign} \left[ \min (\text{B}_{ik}^\text{max} - \text{E}_{ij}^\text{min}, \text{E}_{ik}^\text{max} - \text{B}_{ik}^\text{min}) \right] \right)$$

where:

- $OE_{ik}$ = individual (i)’s overall evaluation of a brand (k)
- $B_{ik}$ = individual (i)’s estimate of brand (k)’s level of a particular attribute (j)
- $B_{ik}^\text{max}$ = the maximum point in the range around the estimate of $B_{ik}$
- $B_{ik}^\text{min}$ = the minimum point in the range around the estimate of $B_{ik}$
- $E_{ij}$ = individual (i)’s estimate of the most desirable level of an attribute (j)
- $E_{ij}^\text{max}$ = the maximum point in the range around the estimate of $E_{ij}$
- $E_{ij}^\text{min}$ = the minimum point in the range around the estimate of $E_{ij}$
- $\text{Imp}_{ij}$ = the importance of an attribute (j) to individual (i)
- $\text{Imp}_{ij}^\text{max}$ = the maximum point in the range around the estimate of $\text{Imp}_{ij}$
- $\text{Imp}_{ij}^\text{min}$ = the minimum point in the range around the estimate of $\text{Imp}_{ij}$

We incorporate a range around each of the components of the ideal point model to allow for a confidence interval around brand beliefs, a latitude of acceptance around preference and contextual variation for the importance of an attribute. We use the ranges to estimate the degree of utility or satisfaction with a brand by measuring the distance between (or degree of overlap of) the range around the desired level ($E_{ij}^\text{max}$ to $E_{ij}^\text{min}$) and the range around the brand belief ($B_{ik}^\text{max}$ to $B_{ik}^\text{min}$) for each attribute. If the two ranges overlap, the utility is positive because the perceived level of the attribute offered by a brand is within the range of desired levels of the brand. If the ranges do not overlap the utility is negative because the consumer believes that the brand offers a level of an attribute that is not within the range of levels acceptable to that consumer. The greater the distance between ranges, the greater the disutility. It is critical to keep the sign of the difference, hence the inclusion of sign in the equation. For instance, if the consumer indicates that they believe the level i of attribute j is between 40-60 on a scale of 100. And that same consumer would ideally like the level to be between 70-90. The utility would be –10. If on the other hand, the ideal point was between 40-60, the utility would be positive.

We use both the point estimate of importance and the range around the point estimate to represent the importance of each attribute. If the subject reports that the importance of the attribute ranges dramatically with the context (ie. reports a large range), then the weighting of the rating is reduced. If the subject believes that the importance does not vary with the context, then their ability to identify the importance is improved and the weighting increases. For instance, if the consumer says low sugar content is always important to them 90/100 with a very small range 85-95, then the utility would be multiplied by an importance factor of 9. Conversely, if the consumer indicated that the range was between 10-100 depending on the context, the importance factor would only be 1. (See Figure 1)

THE INFLUENCE OF THE OPINION OF OTHERS ON OVERALL EVALUATIONS

The reactions of others are often incorporated in the decision of appropriate behavior for self (Festinger 1954; Schachter & Singer 1962) as has been illustrated in the scenarios in previous sections. In the process of comparing “own evaluation” to “others’ evaluation”, “own evaluation” may be altered to be more consistent with others (Festinger 1954). In the context of product evaluation, it is now well documented that the opinion of others heard during the consumption of a product can affect the evaluation of the product (Bone 1995; Burnkrant & Cousineau 1975; Cohen & Golden 1972; Venkatases 1966).

It is proposed here that the range model will better explain consumers’ overall evaluations, particularly when the opinion of others serves to alter the range around the estimate of brand belief, attribute desired level, or attribute importance. As a first step toward testing the explanatory power of the model, the empirical work here includes a manipulation of the information concerning a brand belief presented in the post-consumption environment. The study includes three levels of information: factual, normative and unrelated (as a control condition). We expect a change in the point estimate when factual information is introduced post-consumption, a change in point estimate should be explained by both the range model and the ideal point model. We expect a change in both the point estimate and the symmetry of the range in the normative condition. A comment suggesting that most people think the product has a lot of one attribute will result in an asymmetry in the range. The asymmetry will be captured by the specification of the range model, but not by the ideal point model.

METHODOLOGY

Sample
Two hundred fifteen undergraduate students enrolled in an introductory marketing course at a large Australian university received course credit for participation in the study.

Product Category
Vegetable juice was chosen as the product category because it is a product that is purchased by university students. The brand was Campbell’s V-8, an unfamiliar2 brand.

Design
There were three conditions in the study. In the factual condition participants were exposed to a fact about the level of salt in the juice immediately after consumption and just prior to reporting their evaluation of the juice. In the normative condition...

---

2 Pre-testing revealed that although many of the students had heard of V-8 juice, very few had tried it recently. In the sample used for the results reported here, 79% reported they had tried it before, and 18% reported they rarely drank the brand. This may be surprising for readers in North America where the brand is heavily supported with promotional spending. In Australia, Campbell’s does not support the brand with advertising or point-of-sale material.
participants were informed of the evaluations of the level of salt in the vegetable juice of the majority of other participants. In the control condition participants heard a comment that was unrelated to the juice.

Procedure
Students were randomly assigned to the comment condition. Students were told that during the cracker taste test they must drink some of the juice before, in between, and after tasting each brand. Direct experience, as in a taste test, enables consumers to form what should be for them a highly valid evaluation of the product with a high degree of certainty (Fazio & Zanna 1983; Smith & Swinyard 1981). Immediately after consumption of the juice, the study administrator told the participants in the factual condition that “the juice was chosen because it has a high salt content which helps clear the palate.” Subjects in the normative condition were told that “your fellow students in past sessions thought the juice was very salty.” Subjects assigned to the control condition were told that “the crackers brands are both popular in Europe”.

Post-consumption ratings were gathered for attribute importance, attribute level desirability, and brand beliefs for 4 attributes (the scales are described in the next section) for both brands of cracker. Participants were then asked to evaluate the juice on 4 attributes (the scales are described in the next section). Participants then provided responses on unrelated tasks, were debriefed and thanked for their participation.

Dependent Measures
The importance ratings were made for “sweetness,” “salt content,” “thickness” and “tomato content” on 100mm continuous scales with the following instructions (the scale is exemplified in Figure 2): “Please use the scale below to indicate how important the attributes of vegetable juice are to you. It is often difficult for people to indicate exactly how important any particular attribute is to them. Please identify a point on the line that represents the approximate importance of the attribute (mark it with an X). Draw a vertical line to indicate the maximum importance you would give to the attribute. Draw another vertical line to indicate the minimum importance you would give to the attribute. Then please shade the area in between, creating a range of importance around the X. The X does not need to be in the center of the range.”

The desirable levels of the attributes were indicated for the four attributes on a second set of 100mm scales (the scale is exemplified in Figure 3) with the judgment described as follows: “Please use the scale below to indicate the level (or how much) you like of each of the attributes of vegetable juice. It is often difficult for people to indicate exactly…” The rest of the instructions, asking for the point estimate and the range, were as above.

The attribute level beliefs for V-8 were rated for the four attributes on a third set of 100mm scales (the scale is exemplified in Figure 4) with the judgment described as follows: “Please use the scale below to indicate the level (or how much) the V-8 brand of vegetable juice has of each attribute. It is often difficult for people to indicate exactly…” The rest of the instructions, asking for the point estimate and the range, were as above. Participants also provided an overall evaluation of the juice on a 100mm continuous scale anchored with “dislike very much” and “like very much.”

3 The four attributes were determined in a preliminary study to be the most important for student evaluations of vegetable juice.
RESULTS

To test whether the range measure contributes to the explanation of the overall evaluations of consumers, the data were used to estimate the fit of the range model versus the ideal point model. The results are shown in Table 1. The adjusted R-squared statistic indicates that the range model better explains the overall evaluation of consumers, than does the ideal point model. As expected, the range model is particularly sensitive to the change in overall evaluation when a normative statement is made altering both the point estimate and the range around the estimate.

The Akaike’s Information Criterion (AIC) is used to consider whether the attributes measured contribute to the overall evaluation. In both cases the lowest AIC which indicates a better fit with a lower number, occurs when all components of all 4 attributes are included in the models (range model AIC = 1298, ideal point model AIC = 1313).

To look more closely at the results of the manipulation, an ANOVA run on the change in the level of salt belief in the juice revealed a significant effect for the word-of-mouth factor (F(2, 214) = 16.1, p < 0.0001). As expected, the point estimate is significantly higher in both the factual and normative condition compared to the control condition (factual = 67.4, normative = 66.5, control = 51.9).

The symmetry in the range for the level of salt belief varies between conditions. In the control and the normative condition the ratio of area above the point estimate compared to below the point estimate should be close to 1, indicating that no systematic asymmetries are present in the ranges. In the normative condition the ratio should be significantly larger than 1, indicating that the range is larger above the estimate in the direction of “more salt”. This pattern of results is expected because word-of-mouth from unfulfilled desires and values are better represented as ranges than points on a continuum. Of course, the study represents only one small manipulation of a brand belief. Future research could incorporate manipulations of the desired level of an attribute or the importance of the attribute, as well as different combinations of discrepancy between information in the post-consumption environment and “own perception” of attribute level, desired level, or importance of an attribute.

REFERENCES


ABSTRACT

The study discusses the advantages and disadvantages of the survey approach. It is hypothesized that observational methods sometimes constitute reasonable and powerful substitutes to traditional survey methods. Depending on the environment of the phenomena under study, unobtrusive approaches may even outperform traditional survey methods. Non-reactive approaches seem especially appealing in situations, where instrumental effects threaten to bias findings. The empirical study investigates whether it is possible to estimate readership of trade circulars (sales flyers) by uncovering fingerprints on the pages. Samples of issues collected at a local recycling center were appropriately analyzed by an expert. According to the pilot study involved, it is possible to measure readership by analyzing fingerprints. However, an estimate thus generated can probably only serve as a conservative prognosis (lower bound) with regard to the true but unknown readership of a flyer. The paper finishes with a discussion of future studies using unobtrusive methods in consumer research.

INTRODUCTION: PROS AND CONS OF OBLTRUSIVE METHODS

Historically, the survey approach has been the prevailing technique for gathering marketing research information, while observational methods have been applied far less frequently. Due to several reasons, both the academic community and the commercial industry apparently prefer the questionnaire to observational investigation. Why is this so? First, when using a survey the researcher has full control of the experimental design. Second, the questionnaire can be structured properly. Third, the method is well-established. Fourth, the questionnaire can be easily analyzed by using computerized procedures. However, an estimate thus generated can probably only serve as a conservative prognosis (lower bound) with regard to the true but unknown readership of a flyer. The paper finishes with a discussion of future studies using unobtrusive methods in consumer research.

NON-REACTIVE TECHNIQUES (I.E., OBSERVATION)

A quarter of a century ago Ray (1973, foreword) argued that there has been “an overdependence on interview (i.e., obtrusive) measures in marketing research.” In a recent review article on the future of marketing research Malhotra, Peterson, and Kleiser (1999) provide recommendations concerning future methods for collecting marketing research information: “The challenge for ... researchers will be to use ... technologies ... in natural settings and in less-intrusive ways.”

Thanks to recent technological improvements observational or tracing methods are increasing in popularity. This development has been facilitated by advances and breakthroughs in a variety of fields like data warehousing, data mining, and neural networks. Since the mid-eighties retail scanning has been has gained widespread use in marketing and consumer research. See Walters (1988, 1991), Walters and MacKenzie (1988), Kumar and Leone (1988), Karande and Kumar (1995), Mayhew and Wiener (1992).

“Classical” examples of empirical unobtrusive studies are (Webb et al. 1966):

• The wear of floor tiles in a museum indexed by the replacement rate was used to determine the relative popularity of exhibits
• The setting of car radio dials brought in for service was used to estimate share of listening audience of various radio stations
• Cigarette butts collected after a football game were treated as indicator of market share of selected brands

In other cases household garbage and toilet graffiti has been subject to detailed content analysis. Advantages of unobtrusive methods, according to Kellehear (1993, 5-8) are:

• They study actual rather than reported behavior
• Are regarded safe (discrete procedure)
• Easy repeatable (re-checking is possible)
• Non-disruptive, non-reactive (non-involving)
• Research access is very easy (no cooperation of others is necessary)
• They are often inexpensive
• Constitute good source for longitudinal analysis

While disadvantages are (same source):
DISTRIBUTION AND DISCARDING OF CIRCULARS

In Figure 1 we have tried to model how circulars / flyers are distributed to and afterwards discarded by Danish households. The Danish Society consists of about 2.2 million households. Basically, an advertiser (producer or retail chain) wanting to forward his circular to a broad audience, can choose between two big distributors and several small ones. The two big distributors - the Danish Postal Service and a commercial player (Forbrugerkontakt) - are able to deliver advertising messages to both the majority of households and to geographically specified target markets (other segments are difficult to target because of legal restrictions ensuring privacy of individuals). Due to cultural habits and legal considerations the overwhelming majority of circulars distributed to Danish households are unaddressed, while in other countries circulars are either addressed to “Resident of X-Street Number Y” or even to “John Doe, X-Street No. Y”.

While the Danish Postal Service is obliged by law to deliver material to every Danish household, its main competitor (Forbrugerkontakt) does not distribute circulars in rural districts with a low population density. Therefore, this private company only covers 80% of households (1.7 mio).

According to a recent poll, more than two thirds of all circulars that households receive are recycled. While 20% of them end up in a container reserved for circulars and magazines, about half of them are put into a container allowing for all forms of paper, especially newspapers. Approximately one out of six flyers are put into a disposable bag and thus mixed with ordinary garbage. Finally, five percent burn up in a tiled stove (See Figure 1).

EVALUATING READERSHIP OF ADS BY ANALYZING FINGERPRINTS: TECHNICAL CONSIDERATIONS

In this section we describe how the empirical sample was collected and subsequently analyzed.

First, a sample of 20 circulars was extracted randomly by using gloves (fear of contamination, self-integrity considerations) at a local recycling center (table 2). Fortunately, the center has separate containers for newspapers and for trade circulars (and weeklies). The total sample involved 30 circulars. They were gathered in January 1999 by use of different procedures. Ten “fresh” items (table 1) were collected immediately after having been studied by a few nonrandom respondents, selected by one of the authors. One of the authors was personally observing and supervising the event, thus ensuring that every page of the involved circulars was touched via fingerprints by the individual respondent and by no one else.

Next, the sample was sent to and afterwards analyzed by one of the authors who works at the headquarter of The Danish Commissioner of Police. The Commissioner’s office includes a department for analyzing fingerprints. This department contains a small office with employees that specialize at locating fingerprints on paper. Usually these experts look for fingerprints on bad checks, forged banknotes etc. However, they do have the expertise to analyze a wide array of paper, including trade circulars for human fingerprints. Fingerprints appear because people sweat. 98% of human sweat consists of water and 2% of amino acid. The water must evaporate prior to analysis, since only the “pure” amino acid is traceable. Sweating is an individual characteristic. Typically, fat, young, temperamental, and nervous individuals sweat more than others. Likewise sweating correlates with season: People are sweating much more on a hot summer day as compared to a cold winter evening. To complicate matters, individuals with (1.) comparable physical and
psychological characteristics, and (2.) being exposed to same conditions (temperatures) tend to generate different amounts of sweat.

Analyzing fingerprints on paper is a rather complicated procedure: First, all pages of a circular need to be separated. Second, every page has to be dipped into a liquid called ninhydrin. Third, the wet page must be dried in a high tech device resembling a big microwave oven. Finally, each page has to be scrutinized for fingerprints appearing on the page. A magnifying glass or even a microscope may facilitate and support the process of inspection. Unlike in criminal investigations, it is not necessary to perform a match concerning the uniqueness of an individual fingerprint. Based on prior behavioral studies and experience, the expert has a reasonable idea concerning where precisely on a page to look for fingerprints (far left, middle and bottom of left page and far right, middle and bottom of right page).

What causes interest is whether the page contains a fingerprint or not. It is assumed that a person has been exposed to a page (and to all other pages!), provided that at least one valid fingerprint is found on a page. This corresponds to the Opportunity To See (OTS) concept - the prevailing definition of readership being used in interview-based surveys of magazine and newspaper readership: If the respondent reports readership of a specified media, it is automatically assumed that she/he has been exposed to all pages (and imbedded advertisements).

Given the setup chosen it was not possible to make assumptions concerning the characteristics of an individual fingerprint: Did it belong to a small girl or to a grown up male? Additionally, fingerprints appearing on the pages of a given circular may belong to different persons (of a household). According to the expert these problems might have been included in the research design. However, including this feature would have made the analysis much more complicated. Moreover, findings derived from such detailed analysis will be of a speculative nature.

In most cases fingerprints only appear a few times across a trade circular. If the circular consists of, say, 32 pages, then one typically will uncover only 2-4 fingerprints across all pages.

Furthermore, the frequency of identified fingerprints varies inversely with the number of pages of the individual trade circular: More fingerprints will be found on the first pages as compared to the last ones. Nevertheless it is reasonable to assume that the person who has left a few fingerprints, say, on the first four pages indeed has been flipping through the whole circular - although no traces are to be found on the remaining 28 pages.

For methodological reasons the front and rear page of each circular were excluded from analysis since they may have been touched (contaminated) by the messenger (an errand boy on a bike) or by the person of the household who carried the circular to the recycling center.

Unlike his wife (her husband), there is a chance that he (she) himself (herself) never read it. However, a figure that includes front and rear page is recorded in tables 1 and 2 (numbers in brackets) for illustrative purposes (one should keep in mind that they are not valid for scientific purposes).

1 Since the procedure described here was not in use (even within criminal investigations) before the late nineteen- seventies, early efforts to use the technique within marketing research were deemed to fail. However, technological breakthroughs in measurement of fingerprints has changed this.

2 While the rationale of this assumption may be questioned, indeed, it will not be addressed in this paper.

182

RESULTS

1. Non-random test sample

The study reported on here is a pilot study and is part of a far more comprehensive project being under preparation. The purpose of the pilot study has been to generate knowledge and experience concerning the measurement of fingerprints on circulars.

Table 1 displays the findings of the analysis of fingerprints with regard to five non-randomly selected respondents. ID-numbers 01/02, 03/04, 05/06, 07/08 and 09/10 refer to the same respondent, respectively. Each respondent was exposed to two circulars. Person 01/02 refers to one of the authors. 01 was read immediately after spending 20 minutes in a sauna. 02 was studied after having walked around for 20 minutes outside a Helsinki hotel in early January only wearing a T-shirt (-15°C).

The supposition that a person generates more sweat and thus more finger-imprints when he sweats as compared to when he freezes, was confirmed. However, the “sample” consisted of one (!) person. Numbers in brackets in the far right columns of table 1 relate to the total number of fingerprints traced on the circular, including front and rear page. Unfortunately, these fingerprints could relate to someone different from the reader(s) - see above. Therefore, these gross-estimates were not used for statistical and computational purposes.

Two respondents (03/04 and 05/06) were exposed when the room temperature was 2°C, while the other two (07/08 and 09/10) were exposed at 25°C.

Findings based on the Empirical Sample:

• One respondent (03/04) provided no valid fingerprint.
• Four circulars (03, 04, 08, 09) contained no valid fingerprints
• Two circulars (04, 08) had no fingerprints whatsoever (even not on front/rear page)

Concerning four respondents 03/04, 05/06, 07/08, 09/10 we can make the following estimates: In total respondents were flipping through 112 pages. For each of the eight circulars we must detract the front and the rear pages. Thus, we end up with 96 valid pages. Across these pages the expert found seven fingerprints. Stated differently, 7% of all pages analyzed contained fingerprints. If we allow for the front and rear page to be included the figure rises to 11%.

This computation can be repeated once for every respondent. The number of fingerprints varies considerably from respondent to respondent. For instance Respondent 05/06 is much more successful with regard to generating traces as compared to 03/04.

2. Random Sample

Table 2 displays results concerning the twenty randomly selected circulars. We possess no background information on the readers of these circulars. The 20 circulars were randomly selected across two days at the local recycle station and drawn from a container reserved for circulars and magazines. On the first day of data gathering the sky was clear and the weather was rather cold (+4°C, +39°F), while it was raining on the second day (+7°C, +45°F).

Although the temperature on the day of collecting the items has little influence on the quality of the fingerprints, wet conditions may deter traces. What really counts is the temperature and the conditions prevailing in the environment of the person while she/he is flipping

3 In the present pilot study (involving IDs 03-10) doing so might seem justified, since the sample was drawn from a stable of new circulars, supplied by the retailers. Probably, they were solely touched by the researcher, who only touched them while wearing gloves.
through the pages of the circular. Doing it in front of a fireplace will obviously generate more sweat as compared to doing it in a cold kitchen.

The sample analyzed here was collected during wintertime when people do not sweat much, ceteris paribus. So, the technical conditions for identifying fingerprints were far from ideal.

Table 2 also displays the highest as well as the average daily temperature at the day the circulars were received by the households.4 Next, the temperatures of the corresponding days were collected from the nearest meteorological office. The office performs measurements approximately 20 kilometers from the city where the sample was drawn.

The sample consisted of 860 pages and 55 valid fingerprints were identified. 60% of the circulars identified (12 out of 20) contained at least one valid fingerprint. We assume that the 60% is a lower level or bound with respect to readership. Regarding the remaining eight circulars (seven of them contained no fingerprint at all) we cannot state that they have not been read. We can only say that no fingerprints were traceable. It is remembered that respondent 03/04 in table 1 did not provide any valid fingerprints, although one of the authors observed her while performing the task. Note also that no valid fingerprints were identified on ID 30. However, it must have been studied since someone had encircled the price of a product with a pen.

Once we observe significant variation across circulars. ID’s 17, 21, 23, 25 and 29 produced lots of fingerprints, while others like 11, 16, 20, and 24 only left a single fingerprint. We can just speculate about the underlying reasons for this (see above).

Looking at table 1 it seems to make sense exploring whether there is correlation between gender, age, weight, height etc. of respondents and the propensity to produce fingerprints on ads. This phenomena can be investigated using a multiple regression analysis. But the test sample is very small (four respondents), thus making it impossible to identify significant correlations between, say, weight + age + room temperature and the propensity to produce fingerprints.

Concerning table 2 we do not have any background information on the respondents. However, we do have more observations and are thus able to formulate a tentative regression model, based on the data provided in table 2:

\[
\Sigma (\text{valid fingerprints})_{\text{circular}} = \Sigma C^o_{\text{max, day}} + \Sigma C^o_{\text{ave, day}} + \Sigma \text{papers circular} + \text{paper format}
\]

Unfortunately, the multiple coefficient of determination is quite low (.23) and not significant due to the small sample size (20 observations). None of the four explaining variables have parameter estimates significantly different from 0. There is, however, a slightly positive correlation (.11) between the dependent variable (number of fingerprints) and the number of pages of the circular (which is no big surprise and of little interest).

Alternatively to using regression one could define a two group discriminant model where the classification variable could be paper quality (magazine versus newspaper quality) and the explaining variables being the remaining columns of table 2. Results are shown in table 3.

The significant value with regard to the number of pages makes sense and can be explained by typographical reasons (desk top publishers prefer the magazine format as the number of pages grows). We cannot explain, however, why there is a significant F-value concerning the corresponding temperatures. We think these significances are spurious and due to the small sample size. The expected correlation between paper quality and fingerprints was not significant.

Figure 2 displays the results of a multiple correspondence analysis based on the data in table 2. However, some manipulations have been performed prior to analysis. First, circulars that contained no valid fingerprint were coded as “Fingerprints 0”, while circulars containing at least one fingerprint were coded as “Fingerprints 1”.

Second, circulars having fewer pages than the average number of pages were coded “Pages low”, whereas circulars with above an average number of pages were coded “Pages high”. Finally, the two measures on temperature were coded accordingly as \( C^o_{\text{max}} = \text{max} C^o_{\text{ave}} \) and \( C^o_{\text{ave}} \) respectively, with the average value on each of the two measures being the cutoff value between the high (gh) and low (lw) level. Technically speaking, the two temperature variables of table 2 were transformed from interval scales to categorical scales while the variables measuring the number of pages and fingerprints were altered from discrete ratio scales to categorical scales (the variable measuring paper quality was left unchanged since it was

---

4 The day of reception could be positively identified since one of the researchers possesses an archive where all locally distributed circulars across fifteen years are registered and the day of reception is notified.
Fingerprint-analysis of twenty randomly selected trade circulars

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ID</th>
<th>Paper Quality</th>
<th>(C^*) max</th>
<th>(C^*) ave</th>
<th>(\Sigma) Pages</th>
<th>(\Sigma) Fingerprints</th>
<th>(\Sigma) pages with fingerprints/(\Sigma) all pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Magazine</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>1 (2)</td>
<td>0.02 (0.07)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Magazine</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-3.5</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>3 (3)</td>
<td>0.07 (0.06)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Magazine</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>2 (2)</td>
<td>0.04 (0.04)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Newspaper</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>-3</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Magazine</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Newspaper</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>1 (3)</td>
<td>0.03 (0.08)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Newspaper</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-5</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>8 (13)</td>
<td>0.80 (1.08)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Magazine</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Magazine</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Magazine</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1 (1)</td>
<td>0.25 (0.17)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Magazine</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>8 (10)</td>
<td>0.10 (0.12)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Magazine</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Magazine</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>8 (8)</td>
<td>0.18 (0.17)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Magazine</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>1 (3)</td>
<td>0.03 (0.08)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Magazine</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>5 (6)</td>
<td>0.36 (0.38)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Newspaper</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Newspaper</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Newspaper</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4 (7)</td>
<td>0.40 (0.58)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Magazine</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>13 (13)</td>
<td>0.09 (0.08)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Magazine</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-4</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>0 (4)</td>
<td>0 (0.22)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(\bar{x} = 6.6\) \(\bar{x} = 4.0\) \(860\) \(55 (75)\) \(0.06 (0.09)\)

DISCUSSION AND FUTURE RESEARCH

Our analysis of fingerprints indicates that at least 60% of the circulars must have been studied by at least one individual. The remaining 40% may (1.) have been read by one or more individuals who have left no trace of the task, (2.) they may have been discarded by the household unread. (3.) There is a chance, however, that the circular never made its way to the prospects (See Figure 1): It is usual that the person distributing the circulars is equipped with too many circulars as compared to households or addresses en route. Since these printed ads typically have a life span of a single week, they are to be compared with perishable goods.

Consequently, the messenger - either a postman or a teenager on a bike and/or with a box barrow - will carry the remaining undistributed circulars to the recycling center and throw them into the container. Usually such circulars are easy to identify because they show up in the container as stacks of the same circulars, whereas other circulars are distributed randomly across the container (in the present study care was taken to circumvent this problem). According to annual polls on readership of circulars, conducted by the Danish Gallup company, approximately 80% of persons interviewed report readership on circulars for supermarkets and related retail stores. The readership of specialty retailers like fashion-, toy-, and hardware stores is slightly lower. Only about or less than every second person reports to read

...
circulare for retailers selling products like TV’s, computers, and photographic equipment. Our study does not contradict with these findings (11 of the 20 issues originated from supermarkets and only 2 did not contain fingerprints).

Presently research is carried out based on a sample of several circulars that were distributed during very hot days in May and early June of 1999. During some of the days the temperature was above 30°C. At the same time care was taken that the days, on which the circulars were received by households, were outside (just prior to) the normal Danish industrial holiday period. We assume that by choosing this research setting we improve our possibility with regard to identifying fingerprints. Most people must have been sweating on the day they received the circulars, while only few of them might have left their home for holiday (when the probability of not reading the circulars is greater). The fingerprint-analysis of these data have just been finished and presently the data are analyzed for construct and criterion validity using an array of multivariate statistical methods.

Reports on this bigger study will be published in spring 2002. The work-in-progress study is based on 120 circulars. While this may still seem to be a small sample, analyzing the material for fingerprints involved separating, treating and individually scrutinizing of approximately 5000 (!) pages. Consequently, the technical analysis has necessitated more than a year. Preliminary results of this large-scale random sample seem encouraging. One of the strengths of our approach is that we can estimate readership across “brands” of circulars. For instance, it seems that circulars distributed by some retailers are more popular than those distributed by others. So far, measurement of circulars across retailers has not been possible to cover by using the self-reported approach. Due to limitations linked to the self-reported approach, data can only be gathered on a “generic” level. (A Questionnaire by Gallup in Denmark only differentiates between circulars originating from “Supermarkets”, “Males Clothing”, “Toy Stores”, “TV/Radio Stores”, “Stores on Furniture Equipment” etc.)

In a follow-up study it is planned to combine the purely observational method reported on here with interviews. In a modified research setting we expect to interview respondents when they approach the paper container at the recycle center. First, they will be asked whether we are allowed to “inherit” their collection of circular for further study (of fingerprints etc). Next, they will be asked a couple of screening questions on their background. Finally we will ask the person for his phone number and ask him/her if we are allowed to call back at a later point of time.

In a different and unrelated study on of the authors is coding and analyzing a sample of five hundred shopping lists, discarded by consumers and found at parking lots, in garbage boxes etc. outside grocery stores (i.e. at supermarkets and discount stores). We expect this study to shed some light on topics like:

---

**TABLE 3**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Paper Quality (average values)</th>
<th>F-value</th>
<th>Prob-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>magazine</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of pages</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C&lt;sub&gt;x&lt;/sub&gt;</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C&lt;sub&gt;x&lt;/sub&gt;</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>.8</td>
<td>.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Valid number of fingerprints</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>.1</td>
<td>.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total number of fingerprints</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>.1</td>
<td>.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n</td>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**FIGURE 2**

Multiple Correspondence Analysis of Fingerprints and Related "Categorized" Variables

---

**TABLE 2**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>magazine</th>
<th>newspaper</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>F-value</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>2.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prob-value</td>
<td>.04</td>
<td>.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Valid number of fingerprints</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total number of fingerprints</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>3.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

*Newspaper Pages*
• How do consumers plan their shopping trip?
• How many products appear on the average list (and what is the variance)?
• Which product categories are most frequently mentioned?
• To which degree do consumers note brand names (“Jacobs”) and not just product categories (“Coffee”)?
• How many consumers do explicitly note prices and quantities?
• Is it provable or probable that the shopping list is directly influenced by the appropriate circular distributed by the store, informing about products on sale week? 

The research approach used in the paper presented here - to the best of our knowledge - has not been seriously investigated by marketing scholars up to this point of time. However, our approach in some regards resembles the analysis of consumer garbage (Ritenbaugh and Harrison, 1984, Cote, McCulloch, and Reilley, 1985) and may be seen as a continuance of this research tradition.

REFERENCES


ABSTRACT

There exists a lot of research investigating the role of the brand name in the consumer purchase decision. Especially in the second half of the eighties a vast amount of experimental studies have been carried out on individual data of decision processes with mixed results. In this paper we use data from a representative consumer panel and a hierarchical modeling approach. The study is based on the hypothesis that the brand name is the key criterion in nondurable consumer goods. The method of hierarchical models is used to investigate the meaning of “brand name” versus “product attributes” as key criterion. The paper is organized as follows: After a review of the theoretical approaches to explain the choice decision, we describe the method of hierarchical model and show that this approach has some advantages to investigate the meaning of different choice criteria. As a result we prove that in a broad diversified product category brand name is a more decisive choice criterion than other product criteria.

INTRODUCTION

To satisfy our daily needs we in general purchase the necessary product bundle, that means for each product class, we have chosen between two or more alternatives. In classical economic theory it is assumed that these decisions are the result of a rational decision process. But in reality this assumption is not tenable, since in most purchase decision processes the consumer does not have the capabilities to compare all advantages and disadvantages of each alternative in a multi-product market to identify the best choice. In real life, decision processes in general will be based on a limited set of comparable attributes or on the use of some key information and a simplified decision process. As such the knowledge about the use of specific key information is critical for the marketing manager.

Although we have considerable knowledge about consumer decision processes, empirical results are still limited. First, most of the earlier studies are rather small and solely based on experimental data. Second, later studies start to use real market data but are frequently concentrated only on single hypothesis or sometimes disregard the hierarchy of the decision process. In this study we use real market data, especially aggregated household panel data, but apply the method of hierarchical linear models to investigate the relative relevance of information like brand names and product attributes in a choice hierarchy. In the first section we describe some aspects of the brand choice decision. At first we review the results of experimental studies concerning choice criteria, with a focus on the brand name. Then we present some empirical studies with panel data that investigate the meaning of different choice criteria. Subsequently we will provide the alternative way of hierarchical models to describe and evaluate the meaning of these features.

THE MEANING OF BRAND NAME IN THE BRAND CHOICE DECISION RESEARCH

Experimental studies

In economic theory consumers are assumed to make rational purchase decisions by using and evaluating all available information. In consumer behavior research this approach has been rejected because it does not properly represent the decision process of the consumer. The key work of Bettman (1979) on his information-processing model already stressed that consumers only have a limited capacity for processing information.

Classical experimental studies have shown that consumers only process a few information dimensions (chunks) to make a buying decision for frequently purchased goods (e.g. Jacoby, Szybilko & Busato-Schach 1977, Alpert 1980). This behavior can be described by applying decision models based on cognitive algebra. Some studies investigated the meaning of brand name versus other product attribute information for the decision process. A focal point is the question if consumers make a choice by processing brand names or by processing attributes. The results of the experiments are mixed with a slight advantage for processing by attribute as the preferred evaluation strategy (Bettman & Kakkar 1977, Biehal & Chakravarti 1986), but the brand plays a key role as a product attribute.

The results of experimental studies show that brand names as well as price information are used as indicators for quality in the purchase decision process (Obermiller & Weathley 1985, Dodds & Monroe 1985, Obermiller 1987, Lefkoff-Hagius & Mason 1993). Some researchers also assume that the use of brand names is a choice tactic for inexperienced consumers to choose among different brands and that positive experience with a brand increases the ability to remember the brand (Biehal & Chakravarti 1986, Hoyer & Brown 1990).

Household panel data studies

In contrast to the use of experimental studies many researchers in later studies have analyzed consumer panel data (or market data) to investigate the brand choice decision. Most of the studies examine the hierarchy of the evaluation procedure. The results of these studies depend in general on the examined product category. But even for the same product category the choice criteria may differ. The reported studies on switching and brand choice behavior for soft drinks or coffee characterize the status of the research field.

Rao and Sabavala (1981) applied hierarchical cluster analysis on switching data for 17 soft drink brands. The results show that national vs. regional distribution seems to be the most important criterion, followed by brand names for the regional products, while four of the national brand names formed own segments. For the national brands the diet vs. non-diet attribute appeared as the next most important attribute, followed by the flavor (lemon vs. cola) for the diet segment. Kumar and Sashi (1989) analyzed switching data of eight soft drinks and compared different market structures by using different sequences of choice criteria. They came to the result that diet (vs. non-diet) is the most important criterion in the case of brand switching. A consumer already drinking a diet drink will switch to another diet drink no matter of cola or non-cola. An alternative approach by Moore and Lehmann (1989) used dissimilarity ratings and constant-sum buying intentions to rate twelve soft drinks. They found that either flavor, diet (vs. high calorie) or caffeine (vs. none) is the first decision criterion and no more than two criteria are necessary for the decision.

Currim, Meyer and Le (1988) investigated the consumer choice of coffee with so called concept learning system (CLS) algorithm. CLS is a classification procedure that relates a set of
predictor variables (like product attributes) to a discrete outcome variable (like choice) and generates decision trees. The sample contained data of five regular ground coffee brands with the variables price levels, features, displays as well as brand names and store chains. They found three major decision trees. 35% of the consumers consider price in the first step, 33% starts with the brand name and 27% with features. 60% of the consumers who consider brand name as the first criteria use price as the second attribute. In the same product category Vilcassim (1989) tested different choice hierarchies by comparing corresponding regression models of choice criteria and came to the result, that the first decision is made between ground and instant coffee, then between caffeinated and decaffeinated, followed by the choice between regular and freeze dried.

Although the previous studies have contributed significantly to the research of decision processes, they suffer from several problems. Experimental studies miss external validity because of the artificial buying or choice situation. The main problem with studies using household panel data is the use of only product category specific choice criteria like caffeinated vs. decaffeinated for coffee or diet vs. non-diet for soft drinks. Therefore the results are limited to the selected product category. More general product attributes like brand name or price are rarely part of the analysis. Second, the applied methods (like hierarchical cluster analysis) are not able to measure the size of the effect of the product attributes.

AN ALTERNATIVE APPROACH APPLYING HIERARCHICAL MODELS

The study conducted here differs from the existing research in three aspects. First, instead of individual choice data we analyze aggregated household panel data which from the practical perspective are available in every retail chain, second, we choose general choice criteria like brand name and price so we can in a further step compare different product categories, third we apply the method of hierarchical models to investigate the meaning of brand names vs. product attributes for the choice process. An advantage of the hierarchical method is that we can measure the size of the influence of the choice criteria.

Based on the results of the experimental and individual household panel data studies we investigate the following two hypotheses:

Hypothesis 1: The brand name is more important than the product attribute in nondurable consumer goods.

This hypothesis is coincide with many experimental studies and also with the panel study by Currim, Meyer and Le (1988), where, apart from price, the brand name is the most important variable.

Hypothesis 2: The size of the influence of the brand name remains high while controlling for further criteria.

This means, that the brand name is a relative robust and independent attribute in the brand choice process. After a brief introduction in the method of hierarchical models, we describe our data set and specify the model and its extensions. Subsequently we will present and discuss the results.

Hierarchical linear models

Hierarchical models are able to analyze data structures in which units are nested within larger clusters (like people which can be grouped into families) (Bryk & Raudenbush 1992). In our kind of data some units should be more similar than others and the assumption of independent observations, which is a basis for classical statistical analysis, can not be upheld. The idea of hierarchical models is to consider that units in the same group are more related than units in different groups, because they share common, possibly unobservable characteristics, which are causing correlation between disturbances (Bryk & Raudenbush 1992). In hierarchical models this disturbances are covered by random effect variables for the groups. Consequently, hierarchical models must consist of at least two levels. The level-1 is the lowest level and represents the individual unit, like people or products. The level-2 is the grouping level, like families. For each level an equation is set up, where one or more of the coefficients of the level-1 are functions of level-2 effects.

The most simple case of a hierarchical model is an unconditional two-level model:

Level-1: \[ Y_{ij} = \beta_{0j} + r_{ij} \]

Level-2: \[ \beta_{0j} = \gamma_{00} + u_{0j} \]

with \[ Y_{ij} \]: response variable, \( i = 1, \ldots, N \), \( j = 1, \ldots M \) \[ \beta_{0j} \]: intercept, determined by a higher level \[ r_{ij} \]: random error, \( r_{ij} \sim N(0, \sigma^2) \) \[ \gamma_{00} \]: overall mean \[ u_{0j} \]: random effect parameter, \( u_{0j} \sim N(0, \tau) \)

The substitution of the level-2 model into the level-1 model leads to the combined hierarchical model:

\[ Y_{ij} = \gamma_{00} + u_{0j} + r_{ij} \]

where \( u_{0j} \) is a random variable with normal distribution, mean of zero and variance of \( \tau \). This specification allows to take into account the heterogeneity which is used as an indicator for unobservable characteristics of the level-2 groups. The random effect parameter \( u_{0j} \) explains part of the variability in level-1 (Littell et al. 1996).

The basic model can be extended to a conditional model by the introduction of variables in level-2:

Level-1: \[ Y_{ij} = \beta_{0j} + r_{ij} \]

Level-2: \[ \beta_{0j} = \gamma_{00} + \gamma_{01}W_j + u_{0j} \]

Substitution of level-2 model yields to the combined conditional model:

\[ Y_{ij} = \gamma_{00} + \gamma_{01}W_j + u_{0j} + r_{ij} \]

The same is possible in level-1. The introduction of covariates in level-1 leads to a random-coefficient model (Longford 1993):

Level-1: \[ Y_{ij} = \beta_{0j} + \beta_{1j}X_{ij} + r_{ij} \]

Level-2: \[ \beta_{0j} = \gamma_{00} + \gamma_{10}W_j + u_{0j} \]

\[ \beta_{1j} = \gamma_{00} + \gamma_{11}W_j + u_{1j} \]

Substitution of level-2 model yields to the combined model:

\[ Y_{ij} = \gamma_{00} + \gamma_{10}X_{ij} + \gamma_{01}W_j + \gamma_{11}X_{ij}W_j + \gamma_{0jX_{ij}} + \gamma_{1jX_{ij}} + + u_{0j} + u_{1j}X_{ij} + r_{ij} \]
with 
\[ r_{ij} \sim N(0, \sigma^2) \]
\[ (u_{0j}) \sim N \left( \begin{bmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}, \begin{bmatrix} \tau_{00} & \tau_{01} \\ \tau_{10} & \tau_{11} \end{bmatrix} \right), \quad \tau_{00}, \tau_{11}, \tau_{01}: \text{level-2 variance-covariance components} \]

This model contains fixed and random effects and the estimation of the combined model is here done by PROC MIXED of SAS with the maximum likelihood estimator. Criteria used for the goodness of fit of the models are AIC (Akaike’s Information Criterion), SBC (Schwarz’s Bayesian Criterion) and the intraclass correlation coefficient. They are defined as follows:

\[ AIC = \ln(L) - q \]
with \( \ln(L) \): log likelihood function
\( q \): number of covariance parameters

\[ SBC = \ln(L) - q \ln(n)/2 \]
with \( n \): number of observations

Intraclass correlation:
\[ \hat{\rho} = \frac{\hat{\gamma}_{00}}{\hat{\tau}_{00} + \sigma^2} \]

A higher value for AIC and SBC indicates the better model. Basic prerequisite of using these criteria for model comparison is that the models contain the same fixed effects (Latour 1994). The intraclass correlation coefficient \( \hat{\rho} \) (with values between 0 and 1) measures the proportion of variance in \( Y \) between the groups (Bryk & Raudenbush 1992). The higher the intraclass correlation the more variance is explained by the level-2 groups.

In our study we want to compare the influence of brand name and of product attribute on product outcome. For this reason we analyze products as level-1 units. The level-2 grouping variables are in one specification the brand names (in this study the name of the firm) and in the other specification a product attribute (in this study the flavor). We analyze which specification of the second level is better to explain the differences between the market share of the products. So far there are hardly any studies comparing the importance of brand name and product attribute. We compare the following structures:

Alternative 1:
- product attribute 1
- product attribute 2
- product 1
- product 2
- product 3
- product 4

Alternative 2:
- brand name 1
- brand name 2
- product 1
- product 2
- product 3
- product 4

In the extended model two other explaining variables will be introduced.

**Data base and model specification**

The set of aggregated household panel data is provided by the GfK, Nürnberg and contains information regarding yogurt with three product flavors: natural, fruit and drink. In the selected data set are 62 products from six firms, that means six different brand names. It is a time series with 25 months (September 1995–September 1997) and 1360 observations. As the dependent variable we use market share.

At the lowest level, the level-1, we have time series for each of the 62 single products.\(^1\) For the higher, second level, we compare two different alternatives. In the first specification brand names build the second level, in the other specification the product attribute flavors build the second level.

According to these models we specify our model as follows:

**Level-1: Products**

\[ Y_{ij} = \beta_{0j} + r_{ij} \]

**Level-2: Brand names respectively product attribute**

\[ \beta_{0j} = \gamma_{00} + u_{0j} \]

Substitution of level-2 model leads to the unconditional hierarchical model:

\[ Y_{ij} = \gamma_{00} + u_{0j} + r_{ij} \]

\( i = 1, \ldots, N \) products
\( j = 1, \ldots, M \) brand names or product attributes
\( r_{ij} \sim N(0, \sigma^2) \)
\( u_{0j} \sim N(0, \tau) \)

**RESULTS**

The estimation of the parameters of the unconditional hierarchical model are presented in table 1 and 2. The results for the fixed effects show that only the overall mean for the brand name is significant and the maximum likelihood estimate is 0.9308. In the specification with brand name as grouping (level-2) variable most of the variance in the outcome is at the product level, \( \hat{\sigma}_2 = 1.7487 \), but a great part of the estimated variability is between the different brand names, \( \hat{\tau}_2 = 0.4091 \). In the other specification the variance of the level-1 is similar, \( \hat{\sigma}_2 = 1.8957 \), but the variability between the product attributes is much less, \( \hat{\tau}_2 = 0.1584 \), than in the other specification and not significant, so we may assume that all flavors have the same mean. The same is evident in table 3: The proportion of variance between brand names is much higher than between product attributes: 19% vs. 8% which means that the brand names are more different than the product attributes. AIC as well as SBC is higher for brand name than for product attribute. It seems that the brand name is more important for the product choice than the product attribute flavor. Therefore in this analysis our hypothesis 1 cannot be rejected.

The next step is the integration of further variables to test the meaning of other choice variables. We introduce the level-2 variable “number of products” \( W_{ij} \). For the first alternative this variable measures how many products a firm offers in the product category. The more products the firm offers (means broader product line) the more power the firm has. Similar for product attribute: The more products are in the single category, the more important is this category.

\(^1\)We could also specify a three-level model with time series for each product as level-1, products as level-2 and product attributes resp. brand names as level-3.
The conditional hierarchical model is:

\[ Y_{ij} = \gamma_{00} + \gamma_{01}W_{10} + u_{0j} + r_{ij} \]

The tables 4 to 6 provide the results of the maximum likelihood estimation. The variable “numbers of products” has a significant effect on market share in both model variations. But the direction of the influence is not clear. If brand name is the level-2 variable then the market share decreases with an increasing number of products of one firm, but if product attribute is the level-2 variable then the relationship is positive. A reason might be that the products in the shelves are sorted by flavor not by brands. And therefore the probability of buying a flavor with more products is greater than for a flavor with less products. However, the width of the product line of the firms is not obvious for the consumer. The covariance parameters for both cases are not significant, but the goodness criteria still favor the brand name model. Therefore the next step only concentrates on the better model, the brand name model.

Now we will examine the meaning of price (similar to Currim, Meyer & Le 1988). The integration of the variable “price” \(X_{ij}\) as a level-1 variable leads to a random-coefficient model:

\[ Y_{ij} = \gamma_{00} + \gamma_{01}W_{10} + \gamma_{10}X_{ij} + \gamma_{11}W_{10}X_{ij} + u_{0j} + u_{1j} + r_{ij} \]

The covariance parameter estimations in table 7 show significant effects (at the 10% level) for the variance of the intercept \(\tau_{00}\) and the slope \(\tau_{11}\). That means that intercepts and slopes vary significantly between brand names. The fixed effects in table 8 show a significant positive overall mean which is estimated to be 3.3968. The number of products has still the negative effect on market share. The price is not significant, so it does not have a meaning for product choice. A reason could be that 11 of the 62 products are very successful new products with a high price. A separation between the new and the old products might be meaningful. The cross-level effect “product*price” is significant (at the 10% level) with a negative sign which means that firms with more products have lower price slopes on average.
These results support the importance of the brand name in the decision process. Even after controlling for other choice criteria like “price” and “number of products” the influence of brand name is still the highest. So, we cannot reject our hypothesis 2. In sum, our analysis shows the relevance of brand name in comparison to other choice criteria and thus supports the results of many experimental studies.

**SUMMARY**

The study shows that hierarchical models are able to show the meaning of different choice criteria and how they can be used to measure the size of the influence. As expected the brand name turns out to explain more variation in the market share of the products than the product attribute flavor and therefore it seems to be a more decisive decision criterion. The number of products also has a significant effect, it represents a context variable in the buying situation. The price in this study is without influence, which could be explained by the low-price category or the number of innovative new products. This could be a way for further studies where old and new products are separated. Another extension could be the analysis of other variables beside brand name and flavor or a comparison with similar product categories.

**LITERATURE**

### TABLE 7
ML Estimation of Random Effects for the Random-Coefficient Model

| Cov. parm. | Estimate | Std Error | Z   | Pr>|Z| |
|------------|----------|-----------|-----|-----|
| $\tau_{00}$ | 0.7548   | 0.4447    | 1.70| 0.0897 |
| $\tau_{10}$ | 8.3288   | 5.2311    | 1.59| 0.1113 |
| $\tau_{11}$ | 116.8624 | 69.3472   | 1.69| 0.0920 |
| Residual $r_{ij}$ | 1.4263 | 0.0549 | 25.96 | 0.0001 |

### TABLE 8
ML Estimation of Fixed Effects for the Random-Coefficient Model

| Effect         | Estimate | Std Error | DF | t  | Pr>|t| |
|----------------|----------|-----------|----|----|-----|
| Intercept $\gamma_{00}$ | 3.3968   | 1.0222    | 4  | 3.32| 0.0293 |
| Products $\gamma_{01}$ | -0.1442  | 0.0630    | 1348| -2.29| 0.0223 |
| Price $\gamma_{10}$ | 27.1187  | 12.7479   | 4  | 2.13| 0.1005 |
| Products*Price $\gamma_{11}$ | -1.4015 | 0.7855 | 1348 | -1.78 | 0.0746 |


This session addresses the issues of scale development, focusing on nomological validity testing as a means of developing better marketing measures. The first paper illustrates nomological validity issues that may emerge later in the “life” of a measure, suggesting that the context in which a measure is administered can compromise its validity. The other two papers explore remedies for such problems by conducting nomological validity tests at the scale development stage.

“Using Nested Models to Examine Perceptions of Easy-Difficult”

Mark Leach, Loyola Marymount University
Michael Hennessy, The University of Pennsylvania
Martin Fishbein, The University of Pennsylvania

Leach, Hennessy, and Fishbein discuss nomological validity issues pertaining to the attitude construct. The purpose of their study is to investigate whether or not perceived difficulty items (i.e., easy-difficult) should be considered a measure of attitude or a measure of self-efficacy. The relationship between ease-difficulty and the concepts of attitude toward the act and self-efficacy are particularly interesting given the use of difficulty items in the measurement of both constructs. When investigating perceptions of difficulty, insight may be gained by paying attention to what “difficult” means to respondents in various behavioral situations. Fishbein and colleagues (Fishbein 1993; Chan & Fishbein 1993) point out that there are difficult behaviors that are nonetheless under volitional control. Thus, there are likely to be difficult behaviors that people feel confident they can perform well. For these types of behaviors, how do respondents evaluate items asking them to rate their perception of difficulty? When perceived volitional control is low, asking whether this goal or behavior is easy or difficult may reflect one’s perception of control. When confidence or perceived competence is low, assessments of perceived difficulty may tap self-efficacy perceptions. When both perceptions of control and self-efficacy are high, then something that is perceived to be easy may be liked and something that is hard may be disliked. In this case, assessments of difficulty will reflect one’s attitude toward the behavior. This situation illustrates the possibility that the context of a study may impact the relationship of an indicant to the construct it is purported to measure.

A sequence of nested confirmatory factor analysis models (James, Mulaik & Brett 1982; Anderson & Gerbing 1988) are employed to systematically test three alternative explanations: first, the easy-difficult item measures the attitude construct, second, it measures self-efficacy, third, it poorly discriminates between both constructs. The models are fitted using data from two large health intervention programs on condom use behavior. Their results indicate that perceptions of difficulty or ease can be highly related to either or both attitude and self-efficacy for different populations and behaviors. For male participants reporting condom use with their main sex partner, the easy-difficult item loads highly with other measures of attitude. For females (and to some extent males with occasional sex partners), the easy-difficult item appears to tap both attitude and self-efficacy dimensions. Females may be less likely to view condom use as a behavior and instead consider it a goal; particularly when measurement items specifically identify the behavior as getting a sex partner to use condoms rather than as using condoms. Thus, when evaluating a behavior that is considered a goal, responses to easy-difficult items appear to be partially based on feelings of confidence that the goal can be reached. In these situations, the use of easy-difficult type items is likely to confound measures of attitude with self-efficacy.

By showing that easy-difficult items act differently depending on the type of behavior investigated, this paper illustrates the existence of a moderator that shifts the relationship between an indicator and a construct. Specifically, this research demonstrates the moderating role of perceived volitional control in assessments of perceived difficulty, which in turn affects the construct tapped by the item. These findings illustrate that even a widely accepted theoretical construct is not exempt from measurement concerns, further highlighting the need to conduct appropriate nomological validity test as early possible in the scale development process.

“The Consumption of Regular Television Programming: Development and Validation of the Connectedness Scale”

Cristel A. Russell, San Diego State University
Andrew Norman, Iowa State University

Russell and Norman present nomological validity tests of their television connectedness scale. The connectedness scale is a multi-factor measure that captures the complex set of relationships that individuals develop with “their” television shows. Their presentation illustrates the need to complement traditional reliability and validity tests with tests of nomological validity by checking the psychometric properties of individual difference measures in multiple administration contexts.

As a follow-up to the Russell and Puto (1999) exploratory paper which determined that individuals differ in the way they relate to television shows, a scale was developed to assess individuals’ level of connectedness with television shows. The process of developing the connectedness scale was two-phased. In the first phase, a battery of 67 items generated in three focus groups was administered to 175 student subjects, which generated data for an exploratory factor analysis of the connectedness measure. In the second phase, additional data from other student samples (N=265) were collected to confirm the factor structure that emerged in Phase 1. This process resulted in an internally valid and reliable 24-item measure of connectedness.

Connectedness thus emerged as a multi-faceted construct capturing the complex set of relationships that individuals develop with “their” television shows. While some factors reflect the vertical relationship formed between an individual and a television program; others illustrate the horizontal linkages among audience members (networks of co-consumers); and yet others capture the connections formed between the individual and the characters in the show. The vertical dimension is of particular relevance to nomological validity testing as it is theoretically related to the construct of involvement. It is comprised of four factors. The “Must see” factor indicates how dedicated an individual is to watching the program every time it is on. The “Quality” factor refers to the inherent quality of the entertainment experience. The “Escape” factor is the cathartic element of television shows, which allows viewers to relax and forget about their problems. Finally, the
“Paraphernalia” factor describes the fact that people collect items that are related to the programs.

In an attempt to investigate nomological validity, the relationships between connectedness and established constructs were tested across different scale administration contexts. In particular, a series of studies included the administration of the connectedness scale and Zaichowsky’s Enduring Involvement scale (1985) in a variety of applications and contexts. In line with predictions that involvement is more situational than connectedness, the results demonstrate that viewing a segment of the TV show prior to the administration of the measures increases the level of correlation between connectedness and involvement scores, thereby suggesting that prompting the show moderates the hypothesized relationship between the two constructs. The authors conclude by emphasizing the importance of being able to empirically discriminate between the construct of involvement and that of connectedness. They argue that these nomological validity tests help support the claim that connectedness extends beyond the mere viewing experience and depicts a show’s contribution to its viewers’ self-definition.

“"I Got a Deal!?" Defining the Affective Dimension of Promotional Purchases”

Darren W. Dahl, University of Manitoba
Heather Honea, San Diego State University

This article examines the psychometric properties of consumer affect that is produced by a promotional offer: e.g., price discount, coupon, free gift, etc. Building from the existing sales promotion and emotion literature, we propose a general model that identifies the affective response resulting from a promotional purchase. The proposed model is operationalized and tested with a new scale instrument that measures affective response to promotion. Classic scale development procedures, as well as specific efforts in nomological validation, are undertaken to test the properties of the scale instrument, the Promotional Affect Thermometer (PAT), can be used by both researchers and marketing practitioners to examine the affect elicited by a promotional offer.

We propose that promotional affect is a multi-dimensional construct with both positive and negative dimensions, ranging in their degree of specificity. Thus, while there are generic positive and generic negative feelings of happiness and sadness due to a promotional purchase, there are also more specific valenced feelings along these positive and negative dimensions. The positive dimensions identified are feelings of happiness and activation, feelings of being a smart shopper, feelings of gratitude, and feelings of being lucky. The negative dimensions identified are feeling of unhappiness, feelings of self-consciousness, feelings of being deceived and annoyed, and feelings of uncertainty.

Three phases of data collection are reported that systematically examine the content validity, criterion validity, and construct validity of the proposed scale instrument. Results indicate that PAT is a good measurement tool of the affect produced by a promotion. In terms of content (face) validity, variables such as the type of promotion and product category impact the sub-dimensions of the affect scale in the expected direction. In addition, affect is shown to mediate the route to promotion evaluation and purchase intentions. The scale is also able to discriminate between people who have positive, negative, and neutral thoughts regarding the offer as well as discriminate between those individuals who choose to buy and not to buy a product on promotion; all evidence of criterion validity.

While the issues of content and criterion validity are important to the acceptance of PAT as a measurement tool, the construct validation process undertaken in this research serves to solidify the value of this scale. Drawing on the proposed affect response model the paper focuses on certain components of construct validation, specifically trait and nomological validity.

This research contributes towards a better theoretical understanding of the consumer affect resulting from promotional purchases, and provides a readily usable measurement instrument for theoretical researchers and marketing practitioners. It contributes to the sales promotion literature by suggesting that different types of promotions, products, consumers, and contexts arouse differential levels and dimensions of affect. A better understanding of the antecedents of promotion evaluation and purchase intentions can help managers to better design and implement their promotional efforts. In addition, this paper contributes to the development of “better marketing measures” and continues to advance the general process of scale development by providing concrete examples of how individual difference variables and experimental manipulation can be used to support the construct validation process before a scale is ever put into use.

REFERENCES


Past research provides a mixed picture of the quality of human judgment of probabilities and assessments of risk. Research based on inductive probability learning suggests that people behave much like intuitive statisticians, and provide probability assessments that by in large conform to the norms of probability calculus (e.g., Peterson and Beach 1967). Although these studies concluded that people behave like intuitive statisticians, the studies also found that people’s probability and risk assessments were not perfect and that in some cases people behave more like biased statisticians. For example, subjects don’t always extract as much information from samples as required by Bayes rule, they sometimes misperceive elements of Bayes rule (e.g., priors=base rates), or they fail to combine them correctly. Still, by and large this stream of research concluded that humans performed well in assessing probabilities and risk.

A very different view of human probability and risk assessment came to light in the early seventies when Kahneman and Tversky introduced their influential research stream and identified many heuristics and biases people use in assessing probabilities and risk (Kahneman and Tversky 1973; Tversky and Kahneman 1974). Their stream of research suggested that people are not simply myopic or imperfect Bayesians, but rather people are not Bayesians at all. Instead, they argued that people assessed probabilities and risk using heuristic processes, such as assessments of representativeness (similarity) or availability in retrieval from memory. Their research showed that use of such heuristics can result in reasonable probability and risk judgments in some circumstances, but in many situations they lead to serious and systematic errors, variously referred to as “cognitive biases” or “cognitive illusions”. Examples of such biases are the overconfidence bias (Mahajan 1992), the self-positivity bias (Taylor and Brown 1988) and base rate neglect (Ofir and Lynch 1984). Thus, this research provided a more negative picture of human competence when it comes to probability and risk assessment, suggesting that the cognitive algorithms deviate from normative principles.

Most of the past research on people’s assessments of probabilities and risk has demonstrated either that people behave like intuitive statisticians or that people’s assessments are biased. Few studies have focussed on understanding why such assessments are sometimes accurate and other times are biased. In addition, little research has examined the behavioral consequences of biased assessments. In this special session, we sought to answer the following questions. What factors influence the methods people use to assess probabilities and risk? What factors dictate biases in such assessments? And what are the behavioral consequences of the different methods people use? In an effort to illustrate the robustness of the phenomena, this session explored biases in the assessment of probabilities and risk—and the antecedents and consequences of these biases—in three different settings: contracting an infectious disease, having a successful auction outcome, and predicting the outcome of a sporting event.

Each of the four papers demonstrated the antecedents and consequences of one or more bias in the assessment of probability and risk. The first paper by Menon, Block and Ramanathan examined individuals’ predictions of their likelihood of contracting hepatitis C and the risk of contracting the disease from engaging in different behaviors. They demonstrated that individuals’ assessments of their likelihood of contracting hepatitis C are prone to a self-positivity bias and they identified factors that reduce this bias. In a similar domain, the second paper by Sen, Bhattacharya and Johnson illustrated that an individual’s estimate of their (untested) partner’s likelihood of being infected with HIV can be biased, particularly when they have been tested for the disease. The extent of this bias is moderated by several individual-level variables such as promiscuity, perceived vulnerability and, more generally, sexual attitudes.

The third paper examined the effect of biases in probability assessment in a different domain, namely auctions. This paper by Greenleaf examined how the process sellers use to assess the utilities and probabilities of auction outcomes affects the reserve prices they set in open English auctions. In this auction context, in order to set the optimal reserve, sellers must assess the utility they earn from different auction outcomes and the probabilities of each outcome. Greenleaf showed that sellers are prone to certain biases—their utilities are affected by anticipated regret and rejoicing, and their probability assessments by a tendency to favor frequency information over magnitude information. Finally, Kiesler, Morwitz and Yorkston examined how the process used to assess an outcome varies for experts and novices. In the context of predicting sports outcomes, they showed that contrary to intuition, experts are not more accurate than novices in assessing probabilities. They showed that an inverted U can describe the relationship between accuracy in predictions and knowledge with the most knowledgeable subjects in fact performing the worst. Their data indicated this occurs because people performing the best tended to use base rates (team past performance) more often than others. More knowledgeable subjects did not perform as well in this task because they too often relied on their own specific basketball knowledge and did not utilize base rates as often as they should. In addition, they found evidence of an additional perceptual bias they call the false-loyalty bias.

The papers in this session provided distinct perspectives in the study of biases in the assessment of probability and risk. The studies employed different empirical and methodological techniques to examine the antecedents and consequences of the self-positivity bias, overconfidence bias, frequency-over-magnitude bias, and base-rate neglect. The results of the set of papers provide an understanding of the factors influencing the methods people use to assess probabilities and risk, the factors that lead to biases in these assessments, and the behavioral consequences of the biased assessments.

REFERENCES


Experiential Positioning: Strategic Differentiation of Customer-Brand Relationships
Michael S. Mulvey, Rutgers University, U.S.A.
Dan Padgett, Tulane University, U.S.A.

ABSTRACT
Positioning is one of the most important strategic activities in marketing. This research introduces the concept of experiential positioning to demonstrate how firms can differentiate their offerings from competitive offerings in the pursuit of long-term relationships with customers. We analyze a large sample of TV commercials to examine how online brokerage firms can achieve competitive differentiation using experiential positioning. Archetype analysis and relationship theory are used to identify the pairings of customer and organizational archetypes that constitute the basic forms of relationship experience available within the category of online trading. Our approach offers a systematic analysis of category positions and allows us to make strategic suggestions to manage positioning strategies over time based on the viability of different archetypes and their corresponding shadow forms.
Specialty Magazines and Flights of Fancy: Feeding the Desire to Desire
Russell W. Belk, University of Utah, U.S.A.

ABSTRACT
An increasing profusion of specialty consumer magazines crowds the newsstands, supermarkets, and mailboxes of the more economically developed world. Based on qualitative interviews and journals investigating how we use these magazines, this study presents a simple, but compelling and important finding: we use specialty magazines to inflame our consumer desires. Quite at variance with marketer concerns about breaking through consumers’ perceptual barriers in a world of advertising clutter, the present findings suggest that readers seek out, relish, study, and dwell upon both the advertising and consumption-focused editorial material of specialty magazines, expressly in order to find new objects to wish for, long for, and desire. In doing so, these readers also celebrate their commitment to an intense specialized consumption interest and to the virtual community of others who share this passion. This study explores this cultivation of desire and considers the revisions it necessitates in our understandings of consumption.

Lastly Criminale would turn to the advertisement pages, which for some reason seemed to give him the greatest delight. ‘Sale at Bloomingdales,’ he would suddenly announce, ‘Sepulchra, look, a big deal on bras I think would very much interest you.’ Sepulchra in the chair beside him, would look up and say, ‘I have enough of those things to last at least two lifetime.’ ‘Not like these,’ he would say, ‘Ah, special offer on garden recliners.’ ‘No garden,’ Sepulchra would say. ‘Ninety-nine cents off tin of peas,’ he would say, ‘Life of Michael Dukakis reduced. Ah, shopping, shopping, shopping.’ You seem very interested in shopping,” I risked saying once, looking up from some article on the growing Gulf crisis that I was reading. ‘Of course,’ he said, ‘At the theoretical level only.’ ‘He never buys a thing,’ said Sepulchra. ‘You see, now sexual eroticism is exhausted, this is the one eroticism we have left….we know so much about the body now it has nothing else left to give. But shopping, now that is different.’(Bradbury, 1992).

The observation that consumer desire is a state of enjoyable frustration and longing (Campbell 1987, p. 86) and a key form of contemporary eroticism suggests that as consumers we have a “desire for desire” (Lefebvre 1991, p. 394) and accordingly strive to multiply, expand, and deepen our desires for consumer goods. Desires to desire are sometimes called second-order desires and are thought by Frankfurter (1971) to be an essential feature distinguishing between persons and other creatures. Sontag (1978, p. 45) precedes Campbell (1987) in suggesting that these intense longings to feel desire are born of contemporary romanticism, prompted by our feared inabilities to feel any emotion at all. Prominent ways to intensify consumer desires include window shopping (Benjamin 1970; Bowly 1985), browsing (Bloch and Richins 1983b; Bloch, Ridgway, and Sherrell 1989), film viewing (Doane 1987; Friedberg 1993), pondering the “wish books” of mail order catalogues (Carrier 1995; Schlereth 1989), Internet surfing (Miller and Slater 2000), and contemplating consumer magazines with advertisements and articles about our areas of special interest (Bloch and Richins 1983a; Grahame 1985). Although all of these sources of stimulation continue to fire our imaginations and consumption fantasies, my focus in this study is on specialty magazine consumption in the United States. Jarrell (1992) observes:

When one finishes reading Holiday or Harper’s Bazaar or House and Garden or The New Yorker or High Fidelity or Road and Track or—but make your own list—buying something, going somewhere seems a necessary completion to the act of reading the magazine. Reader, isn’t buying or fantasy-buying an important part of your and my emotional life? (p. 141).

The vicarious fantasy mode of consumption is an anticipatory phase that Rudnick (1989, p. 145) calls “brain shopping.” The specialty magazine seems a near-perfect vehicle for such fantasizing because its periodical nature, together with “the cult of the new” (Leach 1993), can continually serve to invigorate, enrich, and renew our desires with ever more objects for further wishes. A general hunger for more and better is crystallized into a vivid fantasy involving specific new goods.

Starting a century ago, popular American consumer magazines helped fuel consumer desires for new fashions, furnishings, foods, homes, and entertainments, as more Americans joined the middle class consumer society in which they were increasingly embedded. These general interest magazines focusing on home, family, women, youth, and popular culture, helped provide images of more luxurious and conspicuous consumption for the new middle class to emulate, while nourishing a dream of pervasive abundance (Belk and Pollay 1985; Lears 1994; Schneirov 1994). They instructed people “how to dress, to furnish a home, the wines to put away, the cheeses to cultivate—in short, the style of life appropriate to new middle class status” (Bell 1957, p. 283).

But predictably, in a later period of increased affluence, market fragmentation, and niche marketing, thousands of specialty magazines have emerged to cater to the interests of narrower consumer subcultures. Whether the consumer’s interest lies in personal computers, sports cars, mountain bikes, classical music, camcorders, tennis, tattoos, Barbie Dolls, needlepoint, guitars, gourmet foods, snowboarding, or African art, there are numerous periodicals to serve, cultivate, and nourish these interests. By 1969 there were already over 22,000 such publications (Ford 1969) and by 1997 there were 40,000 in the U.S. alone. Moreover, readers of these publications are eager, thorough, and ardent consumers of the articles, photographs, and advertisements so lavishly presented in their favorite specialty magazines. Where once we learned from general circulation magazines how to embrace a general culture of consumption, we now learn from specialty magazines how to embrace specialized consumption communities.

In order to investigate such uses of specialty magazines, I first had 32 undergraduate and 25 graduate university students write their specialty magazine readership autobiographies addressing a skeletal agenda of topics involving their use of these magazines. The students (trained in depth interviewing procedures) then conducted, recorded, and transcribed interviews covering a related agenda with a convenience sample of non-student readers of specialty magazines. The resulting sample of 196 (combining autobiographies and journal transcriptions) is biased toward young males with nearly half in their twenties and 61% male. Both past and present magazine reading were probed, but this analysis concentrates on present reading. Although the consumption of specialty magazines was found to serve multiple purposes including enhancing knowledge, ideas, skills, and self-definition, as well as providing vicarious enjoyment and hero worship opportunities, the
focus of this paper is on the role of these magazines in stimulating our desires to purchase equipment, services, and accessories in the area of focal interest. This role was found to be pervasive among the present sample of readers.

SOME CONSUMER USES OF SPECIALTY MAGAZINES

Reading magazines devoted to an activity or topic that is the reader’s major area of avocational interest, is an enthralling and engrossing act. It is far more powerful, emotional, and all-embracing than envisioned by cognitive models that frame magazine reading as an attempt to gain information to facilitate better product choices. Instead, readers relish, absorb, read, and re-read these magazines with joyful and studied enthusiasm. Many claim that they read every word in multiple periodicals in their area of special interest, and then save these magazines for years of future use. Reading them is a favorite leisure activity and is often used as a self-reward or regarded as a treasured time for self. In reading these publications people feel part of a “virtual community” (Reingold 1993) of those who share their enthusiasm, even if they do not personally know anyone with similar interests. Reading can also be seen as a ritual act of identification, an attempted acquisition of esoteric cult knowledge, and a veneration of cult heroes and sacred secular objects featured in the magazine. In this process of study and worship, it appears that desire is born, reborn, nourished, and sustained. Three types of emergent consumer desires were detected in this study: hopeful fantasies, hopeless fantasies, and enchanted illusions.

Hopeful Fantasies

For almost all readers to some degree and for some more than others, reading magazines in their area of special interest is an exercise in fantasy consumption that they hope will translate into actual consumption some day in the future. For example, one single woman who is now 19-years-old has been reading actual consumption some day in the future. For example, one single exercise in fantasy consumption that they hope will translate into illusions.

In another case a 24-year-old woman saw her use of fashion magazines, as analogous to her use of wistful window shopping and catalog shopping. She described the magazines as:

...my way of browsing. I enjoy designing different styles and prints [in my mind]. I still receive enjoyment from shopping. I go to the mall about two weeks and just walk around. It’s relaxing and gives me a chance to view new products or stores. I love to look at exotic jewelry. For entertainment I used to pretend that I could only buy my clothes from one catalog and then I would go through that catalog and pick what I would buy. So I still tend to think of magazines as escapism into fantasy.

Similarly, one 39-year-old man reflected:

I’m one of those guys—I don’t go to the porno shops; I go to REI [Recreational Equipment, Incorporated] and lust and drool and fantasize. And frankly, some of the [products] are from here [Outside Magazine] that I go to look at. But actually, more are due to Backpacking [Magazine] than from Outside.

What makes this last case especially interesting is that hiking trails, in the mountains that border the city where he lives, are as close to the man’s office as the outdoors stores are. Yet he prefers to go to the outdoors stores to lust, drool, and fantasize about hiking equipment instead of actually hiking in the nearby outdoors. The equipment seems even more alluring than the activity it is meant to facilitate, although both are a part of his fantasy future.

It is perhaps understandable that for some people the purchase desires stimulated by these magazines remain in the realm of fantasy. Kron (1975) found that the cost of the furnishings shown in a single room on the cover of the March, 1975 issue of House Beautiful was U.S.$26,500, or almost twice as much as the average reader earned in a year. However, even if many readers realize that the objects in the magazines that excite their desire are beyond their current economic grasp, that is part of the attraction. As a woman who is an avid reader of bicycle publications explained, she likes the advertisements for outrageously unaffordable bikes “because they help you to dream big.”

This desire to enter a magical dream state, like that which Rosalind Williams (1982) saw as induced by early department stores, is also evident in the desire for the magazines that inspire these dreams. As one 23-year-old woman described her passion for acquiring fashion magazines,

It happens every mid-month. I get that mad urge to run to the store and see if the new issues have come out yet. I seriously look forward to this event every month. So there I am at the magazine rack scanning for a new cover that I haven’t seen before. I spot one and then another! I grab them both (I only buy two at a time; otherwise I’m afraid the people at the checkout counter will think I’m weird) and race to the checkout stand.

In subsequently reading these magazines she is able to renew her hope for a future self as irresistible as the models pictured wearing the latest fashions. Others with mail subscriptions to their favorite specialty magazines are visibly upset when they don’t arrive on the appointed day. And for the majority who save these magazines, a real sense of loss is felt if an issue is lost. While it is often seen as desirable that the consumption fantasies inspired remain just out of reach, for the latest magazine source of these fantasies to be out of reach is unthinkable. Rather, these periodicals are relied upon to continually provide new stimulation and inspiration for the excited state of hopeful desire their readers seek to magically invoke. Accordingly, to be deprived of their magazines is be deprived of prescriptions for hope via new objects of desire.

Hopeless Fantasies

However, there is also a type of fantasy, evoked most often by women’s beauty and fashion magazines, that seems totally out of reach and that appears to produce more pain than pleasure. For readers of these magazines, the hopeless fantasy is that of being like the impossibly slender, beautiful, and youthful models portrayed. Kathy, a 32-year-old secretary, is upset by the models in the fashion magazines she reads, because:

The main issue is that we should be made to feel proud about our bodies and good about our bodies. ... But they are only showing beautiful, young—see I’m calling them beautiful because I’m so conditioned that when I put on a bathing suit,
I feel fat, I feel hairy, I feel disgusting, because I don’t look like this. And that’s offensive to me.

Similarly 39-year-old Heidi saw the models as representing more successful rivals in the world of beauty: “I hate them! I hate the fact that they are young and they are pretty and skinny and can wear all these really nice clothes.” A related state of comparative self-loathing among beauty magazine readers has been observed by others (e.g., Richins 1991; Wolf 1990). The irony is that readers turn to these magazines hoping to discover a magical formula to transform themselves into irresistible beauties (the Cinderella myth detected by Schouten 1991), only to become more disillusioned (i.e. deprived of illusion; disenchanted) and dissatisfied with themselves. It might seem less painful to simply stop reading these magazines. But in a culture that places extreme value on youthful standards of slimness and beauty, this seems like giving up. Thus there is a double bind, as 32-year-old Jan explained:

I think that the whole thing that these magazines do in our culture, making us women feel insecure about their bodies and about who they are. They’re telling us, all those articles, “Change Your Beauty Personality.” I mean look at this, you know [pointing to an article in a beauty magazine], “Nude and Shrewd.” I mean it’s like not okay unless you’re twenty years old and gorgeous. And I think it’s so ingrained in us and we walk away feeling upset when we close the magazine, that we’re not twenty and gorgeous. And I think as we get older, you know, it gets more and more ingrained. Men, it’s okay for them to get old. But the message in our society is it’s not okay for women to get older. I think with these magazines, when I look for fashion clues and hints...I look at hairstyles a lot. Because I’m always wanting to change my hair. Make-up, because make-up has gotten so much softer and understanding and figuring that part out. I look at that, and accessories. ... And I think as I’ve gotten older I avoid reading these articles about cellulite and firmer breasts because I know it’s a bunch of crap. It’s a bunch of crap and I don’t want to get into it.

Jan’s way of dealing with the impossible fantasy images of the models in beauty magazines is to focus on the things she may be able to change through a purchase. She has learned to avoid contemplating more difficult or impossible changes. As readers get older, another way of compensating is to switch to beauty and fashion magazines targeted to an older audience, even if the models are still impossibly idealized. Eventually they may give up reading such magazines regularly or entirely, but often not until years of self-torture have passed.

Although this cultivation of hopeless fantasies was most commonly encountered among female readers of fashion and beauty magazines, it also occurred in other interest areas and among men. For instance, those whose passions are inflamed for impossibly expensive automobiles, travel locales, or collectibles, also sometimes report profound frustration and depression when they realize that in projecting themselves into the consumption worlds promoted in these magazines, they are dreaming the impossible dream. A more fulfilling fantasy is one that inspires a believable illusion of obtainable pleasure beyond measure. Thus readers attempt to reenchant their consumption aspirations and to convert hopeless fantasies into a hopeful fantasies or enchanted illusions of purchasable bliss.

**Enchanted Illusions**

Most commonly readers of specialty magazines were found to be looking for imagination-inspiring consumption illusions in which they can believe. They read in order to find new things to want. And they buy these things for the same reasons that they buy the special interest publication itself: to stoke the fires of passion for their special interest; to add to the cycle of desire for ever more secrets and sacra promising improved performance, beauty, health, knowledge, or enjoyment within their favorite domain. In this case the magazines offer magical enchantment through readily purchased objects instead of fantasies based in a more distant and imaginary future. As Raymond Williams (1980) has observed, advertising plays a lead, although not solo, role in creating such enchanted illusions.

While it is often assumed by advertising researchers that readers ignore or avoid most advertisements, readers of specialty magazines were found to be more likely to seek them out. Consider these accounts of reading bicycling and mountain climbing magazines:

I generally first like to look at the ads. I like to see what is new and also to see what new developments have occurred. ... Usually I read about new products and reviews of new bikes

When I read a bike magazine I usually look at the front cover and the table of contents and go to what catches my attention first. Usually it involves a new product review or product testing. But, it does not really matter where I start because I pretty much read everything. ... I especially read the advertisements. I do so because ... they are a great source from which to learn about new products and their features

Climbing and Rock and Ice are the two major American magazines. I also read German and Spanish climbing magazines—anything in which I could understand the language. I’d read them three times. The first time I’d blast through and then read them cover to cover, even the advertisements

In part, there is simply a keen interest in improving equipment and performance shown here. For example, another mountaineer explained that:

Mountaineering equipment is becoming increasingly high-tech, both in materials and design. I take my hobby very seriously and I want to be on the leading edge of this sport. Due to the degree of physical risk involved, I need to be on the leading edge of this sport

But even in this pragmatic account, note the naturalizing transformation of wishes and wants to needs. Such transformations appear common in a consumer society (Finkelstein 1989, p. 119; Shabad 1993). Others read advertising and equipment reviews to reduce cognitive dissonance about purchases they have already made (a form of reenchantment). Besides reading advertising for brands they have purchased, they look for photographs of others in the magazine using “their” brands and equipment reviews that obsequiously flatter these brands and those who buy them. One man who reads mountain bike magazines even reported using a magnifying glass to try to discern the brand of sunglasses being worn by riders shown when he thinks it may be the brand he wears.

For many however, the main point of reading these magazines is to find new things to desire and buy; new sources of anticipated pleasure. One woman estimates that her purchase rate of compact discs has doubled since she started subscribing to Rolling Stone magazine. The desire to desire was most evident in those who seek “neat stuff” to buy. People with an avid interest in an activity like skiing, woodworking, or mountain biking are not satisfied simply
to buy equipment and enjoy using it with no further purchases. Instead the association of buying equipment with deriving great pleasure from using it, seems to lead these enthusiasts to try to replicate this pleasure with further purchases of additional equipment, accessories, and embellishments. The equipment, transformed by brand advertising and laudatory reviews, comes to be seen as the key to transcendental pleasure. A further way to implement this formula is to upgrade equipment. If buying a low or mid-priced piece of equipment provided pleasure, the inference seems to be that buying more expensive equipment will provide even greater ecstasy by enhancing performance, elevating status, or simply reifying the enthusiasts’ love for their special interest. It provides something to yearn for and believe in. It brings the buyer that much closer to perceived perfection in both equipment and self. At the same time, a purchase in the reader’s field of special interest is an act of affirmation, commitment, and devotion. Martin, a 58-year-old avocational duck hunter, recently bought an expensive new shotgun and a duck sculpture he had seen in the duck hunting magazine whose logo is emblazoned on both of these objects. He explained that, “These publications reflect everything I live for at this moment in my life.” If having a special interest infuses consumption with meaning and joy, then to buy things that serve this interest is to live. Conversely, to stop buying is to allow the interest, and perhaps the person, to wither and die.

As a result of such an outlook, a number of those studied are self-admitted “gear heads” or “equipment freaks.” They cannot get enough “neat stuff.” And once their immediate desires have been fulfilled by buying these things, they can count on still more and better “neat stuff” in the next issue. One 25-year-old bicycle enthusiast who also works in a bicycle store recognized that his interest had become an obsession: “That’s why I quit reading bike magazines. It got too expensive to need all that nice stuff.” He also described a male customer of 30 who had come into the store recently asking, “Do you have any really trick new gear that is outrageously expensive and that I just have to have?” This customer seemed to feel that the more he spent the greater was his act of devotion, the greater would be his pleasure from using the object, and the greater would be the admiration and envy of other devotees. For many others who come into this bike shop, their desires are already fixed on a certain “trick” new component that has caught their fancy in a bicycle magazine article, review, or advertisement. They come to temporarily quench these aroused desires.

**Metaphors of Desire**

The desire in such cases is described by some as not unlike sexual arousal (see Belk, Ger, and Askegaard 1996). Heart rate and blood pressure increase and pupils dilate in looking at images and reading descriptions of the latest goodies. For the men and women who seek out images of the desiderata in their areas of special desire, no pornography or romantic story could be any more exciting than the “neat stuff” they covet. These objects act as “yuppie porn” (Handy 1988) for those who have sought them out in specialty magazines. Recall the man who by-passes pornography stores in order to stop at the local outdoors store after work, where he can “lust, drool, and fantasize” about equipment he has seen in the latest outdoors magazine and Sepulchra’s view of shopping as eroticism in this article’s epigraph. The male gazer and tourist gazer (Urry 1990) are replaced in such cases by the consumer gazer, and specialty magazines become vehicles for consumer auto-eroticism. A second frequent metaphor for the consumer desire inspired by these magazines is thirst or hunger. Hal, a 48-year-old computer enthusiast explained that computer magazines are his nourishment: “It is food for the spirit. We need to eat for our stomach, so we need knowledge for our brain.” Others spoke of “devouring” the latest issues of specialty magazines and of “drooling over,” “thirsting for,” and “hungering for” the objects found within. Besides sexual arousal and thirst or hunger, a third appetitive metaphor used in describing the desires formed in specialty magazine reading is addiction. This is seen for instance in the bicycle store employee who had to quit reading bike magazines in order to avoid uncontrollably spending all of his income on bike paraphernalia and in the woman who is so powerfully drawn to magazine racks in search of new issues of fashion magazines every mid-month. The magazines in these instances act as a fix rather than as a more positively characterized excitation to lust or hunger. And a final set of metaphors for desire which emerged is that of religious and secular love, devotion, and worship. Readership rituals, feelings of symbolic communion with other aficionados, and loving acts of reverence and sacrifice, suggest that specialty magazines often serve as inspiring sacred texts. In this instance, however, the sacred text is rewritten each month and new objects of devotion are continually revealed and heralded.

**CONCLUSION**

While hopeless fantasies reflect the possibility of disillusionment and the addiction metaphor suggests enslavement to desires, these negative aspects of specialty magazine readership are the exception rather than the rule. Because the specialty magazines that rose to prominence in the Twentieth-Century are focused on areas of intense personal recreational interest or on enhancing personal appearance, they virtually all (including even exercise and Sadism/Masochism publications) emphasize the general theme that indulgence and pleasure are good. The person who buys these magazines implicitly subscribes to and endorses this pleasure ethic. While reading and poring over each issue is pleasurable, it is for most readers not enough. It only whets their appetites for more; indeed fueling appetitive desires is the *raison d’être* for many to read the magazine. The whetted appetite is also not sufficiently slackened by simply engaging in the focal activity. For readers in our consumer society, a key part of the worship ritual within their area of recreational interest is desiring and buying the “neat stuff” encountered in the latest issue of their favorite magazine.

And if the consumer desires stimulated cannot quite be afforded, this may be better still. For the state of desire and longing is exciting, stimulating, and, for most, is a state of hopeful anticipation which, when it is ultimately realized, will soon be rekindled by a new object of desire that surely awaits in a forthcoming issue. During the interim state of unfulfilled desire, consumers can vicariously rehearse the bliss that they hope will one day be theirs, actively plan for accomplishing this magical purchase, and enjoy the sacrifices that may be needed to do so. For this is the magical dream state sought by readers like the woman who reads advertisements in bicycle magazines because they help her to “dream big.” Through creating intense excitement, consumer fantasies, and the illusion of purchasable pleasure, the specialty magazine has come to act as a perpetually renewable fountain of desire. Far from being feared as an evil enticement to lust, gluttony, avarice, and covetousness, we buy and subscribe to these magazines expressly to cultivate these desires. Thus do the impassioned rhetoric and luscious visual images of these magazines, express, nourish, and sustain our desire to desire. Although some prior treatments have focused on the effect of magazines in stimulating women’s desires (e.g., Beetham 1996; Currie 1999; McCracken 1993; Scanlon 1995; Winship 1987), this study suggests that men are equally susceptible.

It cannot be ascertained from the present purposive sample of specialty magazine readers how prevalent the self-cultivation of consumer desires through such magazines may be. But of the 57 students completing the journal portion of the study, only two had
difficulty identifying specialty magazines that they read. The portion who reported intentionally discovering and avidly wanting products encountered in these magazines was about three of every four. Whether or not such numbers are representative of specialty magazine readers generally, it is clear that intentional auto- arousal of consumer desires in this way is widespread. This accords with work on self-gifts (e.g., Mick and DeMoss 1990; Mick 1996; Sherry, McGrath and Levy 1995), but it challenges dominant views that see consumers as either searching for information only when needed for a planned purchase or else developing strategies to resist the temptations that confront them (e.g., Ainsley 1985; Hoch and Lowenstein 1991). Far from resisting temptations, these consumers read specialty magazines (and no doubt use other sources of stimulation as well) specifically in order to find new and better things to wish for, want, and own. Far from resisting advertisers’ appeals and ignoring their messages, they hang on every word and image and return to these ads repeatedly, as if they were religious scholars studying a sacred text. And far from a cultivated equilibrium of consumer satisfaction balanced between rationality and passion (Sherry 1990), they seek a frenzied madness in the market and relish allowing their desires to run wild (see Bakhtin 1984; Buttimmer and Kavanagh 1995). All of this suggests revision in dominant understandings of consumption and further work on consumer fantasies, dreams, wishes, and illusions. In an affluent postmodern consumer society, we find our inspiration for these fantasies not only in specialty magazines, but in other media as well as theme parks, shopping malls, and gambling meccas (Belk 1996; Holbrook and Hirschman 1982; Rook 1988). Accordingly, investigating the processes through which our consumption fantasies are acquired, nourished, sustained, fulfilled, and frustrated should be an important part of our agenda in consumer research.

REFERENCES
Bakhtin, Mikhail (1984), Rabelais and His World, Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.
Doane, Mary Ann (1987), The Desire to Desire: The Woman’s Film of the 1940s, Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.


Dance Clubs, Rave, and the Consumer Experience: An Exploratory Study of a Subcultural Phenomenon
Christina Goulding University of Wolverhampton, United Kingdom
Avi Shankar, University of Exeter, United Kingdom
Richard Elliott, University of Exeter, United Kingdom

ABSTRACT
This paper uses the example of dance culture in order to demonstrate its significance to the self concepts and consumption behaviours of participants. It draws on a qualitative study of consumer experiences in the dance club and proposes that there are issues of identity, the emergence of new communities, escape, engagement and hedonism which could inform the tailoring and targeting of products to this group.

INTRODUCTION
Increasingly, market segments are being conceptualised in terms of activities, aspirations, and the influences and behaviours which constitute the foundations of the many subcultures within which people exist. This paper uses the example of ‘rave’ or ‘dance’, culture in order to demonstrate its significance and influence upon the self concepts and consumption behaviours of those who participate. It suggests that things may not always be what they seem, and that while we immediately tend to associate rave with working class youths, eager to get high on ecstasy, this is not necessarily the case. There are lessons to be learnt, as the leisure, tourism, music and advertising industries have already recognised, from developing an understanding of the behaviour of these consumers.

The paper begins by discussing the commercialisation of dance culture and its entry into the mainstream realm of popular culture. It uses one of the UK based super-clubs as a case for analysing the experience. The research which is discussed next employed two basic methods. The first consisted of observations of the process and the rituals associated with consumption behaviours at the club. The second, involved the collection of data drawing upon the descriptive stories of regular club users. The paper contextualises the data by integrating the findings within the literature on contemporary consumer behaviour and popular culture and concludes by considering the marketing implications of the research.

THE COMMODIFICATION OF ‘RAVE/DANCE’
British club culture as we know it, exploded onto the scene in 1988 with the emergence of organised, often illegal, pay parties, held in disused warehouses and fields (McRobbie 1995; McRobbie & Thornton 1995; Measham et al 1998; Sellers 1998). News of these events was spread by word of mouth; they were secret, they were underground, and they offered a chance to collectively engage in a common experience (Redhead 1993; Arnett 1995; Stappleton 1998). As rave grew and spread throughout the country, so did media interest and media created moral panics (McRobbie & Thornton 1995), particularly in relation to the corresponding drug culture which seemed to accompany the movement (Measham et al 1998; Sellers 1998). As a result of bad publicity, reports of drug related deaths at venues, and the constant definition and redefinition of the mutating types of music, the term rave has now largely been superseded by the label ‘dance’.

According to Hesmondhalgh (1998), as the credibility of dance music began to rise amongst middle class audiences, the relationship between the urban underground, and the provincial mainstream began to change. The promoters of rave, took the concept out of metropolitan sites, and for the first time, out of city youth were exposed to dance music. This exposure provided the opportunity for the commodification of rave. McRobbie and Thornton (1995) argue that when a scene is transformed into a movement there is a growth in accompanying paraphernalia in terms of clothes, style, haircuts and records. Knowledge of this ethos is such that its exploitation has become a routine marketing strategy for the recording and publishing industries. Accordingly, the development of rave was accompanied by the opening of numerous specialist record shops which thrived at the same time as other independent outlets (punk, soul, indie) were closing down.

Today most mainstream retailers such as Virgin and HMV, have a section dedicated to dance music (Measham et al 1998). Additionally, the success of the early illegal festivals and pay parties has not been lost on the leisure industry who have been quick to provide venues and promotion for dance nights catering for thousands of people. The major breweries have also recognised the potential of the multimillion pound rave market and are attempting to realise opportunities through sponsorship of dance clubs, advertising campaigns, and the opening of pre-club feeder bars and post-club chill out cafés (Measham et al 1998).

There is of course one other sector which has benefited from the rave phenomenon and that is the tourism industry. According to Sellers (1998) both the major tour operators and independent travel organisers have profited greatly by tailoring products targeted at the younger rave market, with a particular focus on Ibiza, the capital of rave. The commercialisation of this market has led to brochures being produced and packages with a dance theme developed. She provides the example of 2wenty, who send approximately twenty thousand individuals (fifty percent of their youth market) to the destination every year. Club 18-30, has also repositioned its products, with the rave market now accounting for forty five percent of bookings travelling to Ibiza, their number one destination. Additionally, ‘Escapades’ have introduced a long haul rave destination, Cancun, and an air rave weekend break to Amsterdam (Sellers 1998). Accompanying this exodus to dance destinations, disc jockeys and promoters produce a constant steam of compact disks, with titles such as ‘The Ibiza Album’, ‘The Moneypenny’s Album’, ‘Cream’, and the ‘Ministry of Sound’s guide to Ibiza Album’. According to McRobbie (1994 p170)

“Rave promoters have become wealthy business men (the majority are male), employing large numbers of people, including DJs, technicians and professional dancers. This kind of organisation puts rave alongside the main stream of club and concert promotion and removed it from small scale entrepreneurialism.”

METHODOLOGICAL ORIENTATION, AIMS, AND METHOD
The key questions driving this research were very simply, why do people go? and what are the experiences which have seen rave grow into an international and sustained, multimillion pound phenomenon? These questions were borne out of an interest in an
ongoing and seemingly sustainable marketing phenomenon. In effect the aims were to gain an insight into the nature of the experience and to examine the findings in relation to contemporary theory on consumer behaviour. Finally, to examine the implications for marketing.

In order to illuminate these ruminations a two stage methodology was employed. The first stage involved interviews with the organisers of one of the major dance/rave clubs in Britain. The venue was chosen because it was typical of a rave super-club, it attracted individuals from across the country, and was also a well known and developed brand. This stage also included participant observation of the process and experiences encountered at the club. The observation process was based largely on the rationale that sometimes actions speak louder than words (Grove & Fiske 1992; Adler & Adler 1994). Observation of behaviour also locates the researcher within the context under investigation, a point which Belk et al (1989, p1) propose leads to “pro revelatory incidents”. These observations are described in the form of a memo in order to provide context and insight into the setting. The second stage of the research utilised interview data gathered from informants aged between twenty and thirty-seven in order to compare and contrast the experience. The research, however, was only made possible by the co-operation of the organisers who generously gave up their time to discuss operations, allow access to the club, and provided contacts for interview.

**RESEARCHER’S MEMO ON OBSERVATIONS OF THE PROCESS**

“The club attracts a wide cross section of people, ranging in age from around eighteen to forty. All were dressed well, the younger ones in clothes designed to make a statement and get them noticed such as swimwear, tight shorts, and even fancy dress such as one man dressed as a French mime artist and another as a half naked Satan. The older clubbers dress in labels such as Patrick Cox, Vivienne Westwood dresses and shirts. The club operates a three queue system. The first queue is for people who are not sure if they will gain entry or not. This line is subject to the inspection of the ‘fashion police’ who patrol up and down selecting individuals on the basis of good looks or extreme fashion. These are then taken to the front and allowed entry. Others have to wait their turn and many are turned away when they reach the door. The other two queues are for paying guests (queue two) and non paying friends (queue three).

Once inside the atmosphere changed. Clubbers were greeted by a tall transvestite who hugged them and saw them through into the club room. As I entered the club I was hit by a blast of music, the volume so loud that I could feel the vibration through the floor. At one end of the club were two bars, one selling alcohol which was virtually empty, the other only water and high energy drinks. There were few chairs and no tables. The whole focus was on the dance floor which occupied the majority of space and was crammed with heaving bodies all frantically dancing, keeping time with the increasing speed of the repetitive rhythm of the music. Dotted around the dance floor were podiums upon which the more flamboyant danced, showing themselves off to the crowd. The room itself was dark, lit only by lasers and strobe lights which were activated by the beat of the music. The whole effect was hypnotic. Some people danced for hours, pausing only to drink water to avoid dehydration. Throughout the night the DJ worked the audience altering the music as the evening went on, varying the tempo from frenetic to a slower more laid back beat as the evening drew to a close. Towards the end of the evening several people disappeared to the chill out room. Here the driving beat of house and rave were replaced by softer music. Low comfortable sofas and cushions were spread around the room, the lighting was dim and the overall ambience assisted in the process of ‘chilling out’ ready for departure, either for home or for another venue.”

These observations proved useful as a means of gaining first hand understanding and familiarity with the experience which is the object of consumption. In effect they provided the foundations upon which to locate the analysis of consumer behaviour. However, the problem with observational understanding is its inability to open up the meaning of an individual’s lived experience for the observing individual (Costelloe 1996). In isolation it does little to explain what is happening, why people continue to come, and why they are willing to pay extraordinary prices. Therefore having stated that the aim of the research was to gain an insight into the nature of the experience from the perspective of the user, the second approach borrowed from Thompson, Locander and Pollio’s (1990) description of the phenomenological process.

**PHENOMENOLOGY**

Essentially, the goal of phenomenology is to enlarge and deepen understanding of the range of immediate experiences (Spiegelberg 1982). Accordingly, the aim of the researcher is to construct a model of the sector of the social world within which only those events and behaviours which are of interest to the problem under study take place (Costelloe 1996). With this in mind, only those individuals who regularly attended rave venues were considered for interview.

**SAMPLE**

The problem of gaining access to individuals who could provide real life accounts of the experience was minimised by the co-operation of the organisers of the club. The aim was to talk to a cross section of customers who would represent a profile of the club’s users. Interestingly enough, this turned out to be a wider range of ages than originally anticipated. While there is an assumption that rave is part of youth culture, the original ravers, now in their middle to late thirties, are still around, more than a decade later. Ultimately interviews were conducted with twenty informants. Questions were asked regarding the nature of their work, perceptions of work and ‘play’, other leisure activities, friends, clothes, and the reasons for frequenting dance clubs. Other questions probed the nature of the experience itself from getting ready to go out, the physical nature of dancing, through to the use of alcohol and drugs. Each interview session was held in a private house, lasted an average of forty minutes, and was tape-recorded. Table I represents an overview of the informants who took part in the research.

**INTERPRETATION OF FINDINGS**

The following central concepts proposed by Thompson, et al (1990) were addressed in the collection and analysis of data relating to the consumer experiences, in one particular social world, that of the dance club.

1) **Intentionality.** Here the researchers concepts must remain secondary to the participant’s experiential descriptions. This required keeping an open mind as to the nature of the experience. Consequently any pre-conceptions, such as the link between dance culture and drugs, had to be set aside, or ‘bracketed’, in order to allow the informant’s accounts to steer and shape the interpretation.

2) **Emergent dialogue.** This depends on the establishment of a trusting relationship which allows the informant to express their opinions freely, without undue prompting
from the researcher. This relied on using a very loosely structured interview schedule in order to allow the informant’s to develop their own stories. In effect, the interviews were mostly conversational in nature.

3) Hermeneutic Endeavour. The central proposition here is that phenomenology proceeds by an interactive series of revisions of text in an attempt to relate various meanings to a whole. The first stage was to simply reflect on the text and describe the key events. These reflections provided the focus for thematic analysis, after which patterns were noted across transcripts, relationships sought, and an interpretive picture constructed.

Significant themes were identified on the basis of regular recurrence across informant’s stories and were clustered under explanatory labels. What emerged were a series of themes which have been abstracted from the interviews and integrated with the literature in order to offer an explanation of the behaviour of these consumers. Although expressed in different words these themes were common across most of those interviewed although it must be recognised that individual situations, circumstances, and perceptions of life outside of the club did differ. However, it was the similarities in the way in which experiences were meaningfully shared in the context of the rave club that formed the basis of interpretation (Thompson et al 1990). The next section looks at the themes which emerged from the data which include individualism and identity, the creation of new communities, fantasy and escape, engagement, and prolonged hedonism.

**AN EXAMINATION OF THE THEMES AND THEIR RELATIONSHIP TO THEORY**

**Individualism and identity**

The construction and expression of ‘one’ identity was a key theme across the informant’s stories. Langman (1992) proposes that identity is dependent upon the specifics of gender, parental socialisation, values and practices. But it is also provisional and dependent upon class, subculture and the general environment of the social group where selfhood is recognised and confirmed. There is a constant movement in our own self visualisations: a playing off between a visualised sense of ourselves and those images of us held by others. This was evident in the data. For example:

**Sash**

“My clothes make a statement, they’re about me, they say who I am. I would just die if I walked in and someone else was
wearing the same thing...and...Dancing is an individual thing, everyone is doing it, but not with each other, everyone’s in their own little world"

But at the same time:
“a friend of mine got married not long ago. She went down to London get her outfit, a dress with a feather boa. Everyone at the wedding wore black and most of the conversation was about the clothes everyone had on, not the wedding or anything like that”

There was an near obsessive need to be perceived as an individual, as different, whilst at the same time there was almost complete conformity to the codes of the group expressed through clothes, music, and in many cases the consumption of drugs such as ecstasy and cocaine.

The creation of new communities
The findings lend support to Thornton (1995) who reworked Bourdieu’s theory of economic, social, and cultural capital. She introduced the term ‘subcultural’ capital which “confers status on its owner in the eye of the relevant beholder” (p11). Increasing an individual’s subcultural capital, or ‘hipness’ is a prime motivator for people within the club subculture. Being in the know, using appropriate language, wearing the right kind of clothes, and listening to the right kind of music are all ways of increasing one’s subcultural capital.

Veronica
Clothes are very much part of the culture. It’s quite funny when you think about it, someone can walk in and you think what they are wearing is awful and then they tell you, oh I don’t know it’s katherine Hammett and all of a sudden everyone loves it. It’s like that.

According to Willis (1990), the process by which people comprehend their social and cultural world is not by merely accepting what is given, but by embarking on a project of ‘symbolic creativity’, whereby they re-interpret the social and cultural world so that it makes sense. Club culture, music and dance therefore helps people to make sense of their world and their place in it (Shankar & Elliott 1999). Moreover, the findings of this study, while highlighting the need for all involved to be perceived as different, whilst at the same time there was almost complete conformity to the codes of the group expressed through clothes, music, and in many cases the consumption of drugs such as ecstasy and cocaine.

Fantasy and escape
According to Zukin (1991) the features and experiences of contemporary leisure sites include spatial practices of displacement and travel to distinctly separate zones. These zones are thresholds of controlled and legitimate breaks from the routines of everyday, ‘proper’ behaviour in which individuals look for alternative social arrangements. It may be argued that nowhere is this more obvious than in the dance club where temporary new communities are formed, bonded together by a common experience. The dance club was described as a kind of fantasy land, where individuals could adopt roles, play act, and escape from normality:

Mark
At the moment there’s a lot going on that I want to forget about...at work they’re talking about redundancy so there’s that hassle...of course you’ve got to think about the mortgage and bills, but you need to get away from all that stuff, forget it for a while and switch off. Rave is certainly one way of doing that. You can be a different person...you can get on a real high, feel really loved up, you want to kiss everyone and dance for hours.

What the experience appears to offer is a temporary form of escape, a feeling of being ‘loved up’ and a context for artificial and fleeting affection through communal identification. Quite often however, these feelings are further exacerbated by taking drugs which increase energy and confidence without the person ‘losing it’.

Sash
On Friday the fun starts early. Usually a group of us will meet up, sometimes at my flat, or someone else’s. We might take an e, or occasionally a line of Charlie (cocaine) just to put us in the mood

With ecstasy you can do it, you’re not falling around drunk. You’re in control, you can dance all night if you want to

Whilst the club has a very strict drugs policy many reported taking drugs before going to the club. The younger informants spoke about ‘dropping e’s’, whilst the older club goers tended to favour cocaine. Nevertheless, these were not habitual drug users. It was perceived very much as a ‘weekend thing’ and closely linked to the dance experience and the extension of pleasure.

Engagement
According to Campbell (1987) modern hedonism is characterised by a shift in concern from emotions to sensations where what is sought is more often to do with the imagination. With rave, the beat of the music is repetitive and hypnotic, devoid of lyrics which may require thought and analysis, in other words, a form of escape Rehead (1993).

Sash
The music is just a blend of rhythms, its all a variation on a theme, but it’s part of the experience...you don’t need to worry about too many changes, or words, it just gets faster or slower..................You don’t have to think, just listen to the music, let yourself go with it.......in a way your body just takes over your mind.

Rave attracts individuals from all walks of life, class, education, race and gender. The emphasis is on a feeling of well being, camaraderie and group affiliation in a climate where everyone is experiencing the same emotions. The important point here is the emphasis on ‘mindlessness’, lack of effort or desire for analysis. However, whilst, the music may appear depthless, and the emphasis on ‘not having to think’, this does not mean that the experience is void of meaning. It is the degree of personal involvement and engagement that is a critical part of the experience.
Mark
I do recognise the different music styles, although I didn’t to begin with….I’ll travel if there’s a particular dj playing in a club in London or Manchester. I’m not fanatical, some people follow their favourite dj all over the place, they get hooked on a particular style, and let’s face it, it’s the dj’s who are the kings in those sort of clubs, not the artists, they can work the audience, create the atmosphere without saying a word

Moreover, mindless was countered by descriptions of total inner absorption congruent with Csizscentmihalyi’s (1992) account of flow. This concerns conscious effort and the direction of psychic energy to produce a feeling of well being. A flow experience involves complete immersion in an activity and demands real involvement. According to Campbell (1987 p60) “to search for pleasure is to expose oneself to certain stimuli in the hope that they will trigger a desired response”. Once this response was achieved, the emphasis moved to maintaining it for as long as possible.

Prolonging the experience
The final recurring theme was the notion of extending the experience. This is a legacy of the early pay parties which were renowned for continuing through the night and into the next day.

One of the attractions of rave is that “unlike the concert or ‘gig’ it goes on, it doesn’t stop. This hyperreality of pleasure, this extension of media produces a new social state, a new relationship with the body, the pleasures of music and dance, and the new technologies of the mass media” McRobbie (1994, p171)

Whilst most clubs close their doors at approximately 2.00am, the majority of the informants described a reluctance to go home, a desire to continue the experience, and to forget about the pressures of ‘the real world’.

Sash
When I go out I never want to go home, I like the party to continue. Usually someone will know of something going on afterwards… I remember once not going to bed for three days...

The immersion of self in this hyperreal but secure environment contrasts sharply with the anxieties faced in everyday life and might be described as symptomatic of the postmodern condition.

CONCLUSION
Much contemporary work into subcultures tends to be grounded in the Chicago School of critical analysis, exemplified in the work of Hall and Jefferson (1996), Clarke et al (1997), Hebdidge (1997), and Willis (1996). The position adopted by these scholars is to locate subcultural movements within a framework of social resistance and reaction against dominant hierarchies of control. Historically this perspective has been used to explain the emergence of such subcultures as the ‘Teddy Boys’ (Fyvel 1997), ‘Punks’ (Frith 1997) and drug cultures (Willis 1990, 1996). Most of these studies identify social class and particularly the powerlessness of the working class as the main catalyst for the development of these subcultures. However, although some researchers have suggested that rave is a working class phenomenon, (Redhead 1997) this is open to question. What differentiates rave from other sub-cultures is that it is neither class nor age biased. In fact rave attracts individuals from all walks of life and social position. Furthermore it is not reactionary. Unlike the working class ‘Teddy Boy’ and the middle class ‘Hippy’ movements, rave is void of political expression in the orthodox sense. Neither is it a constant part of the individual’s lifestyle as in the case of Punk which carried with it a highly visible and distinct code of dress and indeed ideology. Rather, for the majority, rave is a ‘weekend’ culture of hedonism, sensation, and escape. The aim of this research was to gain an insight into the experience of ‘rave’, a phenomenon which has existed in Britain for over a decade. The findings suggest that this experience is closely linked to issues of identity, community, fantasy and escape, and prolonged hedonism. It would appear that in contemporary society there is an active quest for alternative social arrangements and new communities based around common bonds and experiences. On face value it might look as if rave is merely an extension of the hippy movement with its emphasis on community and shared behaviours. Nevertheless, there are distinct differences. Contemporary ravers are able to compartmentalise their lives; careers are to be pursued, and the weekend is the time for consciously adopting an identity which allows for escape and hedonism.

IMPLICATIONS FOR MARKETING
As mentioned earlier, breweries, the travel sector, and the music and fashion industries have already recognised the significance of the movement and the commercial implications. Additionally, some companies are appealing directly to those associated with club culture in their advertising. For example, Siemens use the image of young, good looking men and women to advertise their mobile phones. The male is seen talking while the female dances to the sound of a rave beat emanating from the phone. The setting is stark and modernistic and the music can be selected as a ringing tone option on the phone itself. Other advertisements by Nokia appeal to the playful aspects of youth and dance culture by symbolising the phone and its detachable and interchangeable covers as a fashion accessory. These individuals embrace images that they see as reflecting their personalities; modern, fun loving, but ‘cool’ and chic at the same time. An analysis of magazines, such as Ministry of Sound directly aimed at this group of consumers reveals that a growing number of companies have recognised this fact and are tailoring their communication accordingly. For this group of people status and identity are conferred by labels and a reflection of a desired self image in the eyes of others. They look for material symbols to aid in the projection of self and in effect invent and define themselves and others by the labels worn; these are the badges of group membership. Nevertheless, they have also grown up in a highly technological world and are aware of the power and rationale behind advertising. Consequently, communication aimed at this group of people has to take account of this.

FURTHER RESEARCH
This study has concentrated on a small number of consumers who use rave and dance as a recreational activity. The study was located in only one club, largely for practical reasons and the fact that we had access to the promoters. However, as indicated earlier in the paper, it is not only the young who attend these venues, but a smaller, but still significant number of those in their mid twenties to late thirties. Indeed, many of the leading disk jockeys and major figures in the promotion and management of rave are in their late thirties. It is suggested that individuals exhibiting the characteristics of those discussed in this paper would make an interesting group to study in relation to age perception, leisure activities and advertising response.

REFERENCES


Presenter Effects in Advertising: The VisCAP Model  
John R. Rossiter, University of Wollongong, Australia  
Ale Smidts, Rotterdam School of Management, The Netherlands

ABSTRACT
The choice of presenters in advertisements requires a great deal of care. The VisCAP Model (Rossiter & Percy, 1997, pp. 260-268) provides a mechanism for evaluating the Visibility of an endorser along with Credibility, Attractiveness, and Power, among target audiences. Presenter characteristics should align with the communication effects that need to be boosted. The manager should seek a presenter who offers a profile of characteristics that have positive hooks to the targeted communication objectives and is not negative on others. This paper presents new data supporting this position and suggests a possible resolution of the theoretical differences in presenter psychology.
The Impact of Contrast Interval Length and Type on Information Retention: Are Silence and Music Equivalent?
Douglas Olsen, University of Alberta, Canada

ABSTRACT
Highlighting certain items of information in an auditory context by altering the background underlying this information (i.e., employing a contrast interval) has been demonstrated to enhance recall. This research pursues this issue further, and manipulates both the amount of information highlighted and the nature of highlighting in an experimental context. Results suggest that the optimal contrast interval is a maximum of three seconds long. Additionally, findings indicate that recall is superior in conditions where information is highlighted with silence relative to conditions where information is highlighted with music.
A Test of the Renewable Resources Model of Multiple Gains and Multiple Losses
Sandra C. Jones, The University of Western Australia and Curtin University of Technology, Australia

ABSTRACT
Eight choice scenarios were used to test Linville and Fischer’s (1991) Renewable Resources Model, which predicts that people will prefer to separate multiple gains over time and also to separate multiple losses over time, the latter prediction being contrary to Kahneman and Tversky’s (1979) Prospect Theory. The Renewable Resources Model was tested under conditions that, theoretically, should enhance the dual separation outcomes. However, in seven of the eight choice scenarios, complete reversals of these outcomes were observed – that is, the participants in the experiments preferred to combine multiple gains and to combine multiple losses. Explanations of these unexpected results were sought in differences in rating procedures and task presentation between the original study and the present study. The conclusion is that the Renewable Resources Model is not robust.

INTRODUCTION
Whereas some of the important events in people’s lives happen by chance, in many other cases people have some degree of control over the occurrence and timing of these events. For example, people can choose to pay bills all at once or at the end of the month or separately when they arrive; similarly, when planning a trip overseas they can choose to have immunizations for various diseases all at once or to spread them over several visits to their physician. For positive events, too, there is often a degree of time-related control. For example, people can take their retirement payout as a lump sum or spread it over monthly amounts (this is also an option offered by many government lotteries); and they may choose to take one long vacation or several short ones.

Kahneman and Tversky’s (1979) Prospect Theory (PT) predicts that, because of diminishing marginal returns to beneficial outcomes, people will prefer to separate multiple gains so as to experience a greater subjective total utility than would be achieved by considering the gains together; and, because of diminishing marginal returns to costly or harmful outcomes, they will prefer to combine these so as to experience less subjective negative utility than would be incurred by considering them separately. These two predictions were also made by Thaler (1985) as the main two of his “Hedonic Editing Principles (HEP).” Initial tests of PT/HEP were supportive. However, participants in these tests were presented with choices between combined or separated events occurring on the same day (for example, winning $50 in one lottery and $25 in another on the same day, or $75 in one lottery). When the tests were extended by introducing a time dimension (Thaler and Johnson 1990), such that the events could occur combined on the same day or separated by two weeks, the loss prediction of PT/HEP failed to hold. When given a choice of a combined simultaneous loss and time-separated losses of equal magnitude, people preferred to separate the losses. We note that separation of events in the real world is more likely to happen by people choosing to space them over time and thus time is a critical consideration in multiple gain or loss scenarios. Thaler and Johnson (1990) therefore proposed, to account for temporal separation of events, the “Quasi-Hedonic Editing Principles (QHEP),” which predict preference for separation of gains (as does PT and HEP) and also separation of losses. It is important to note that, in the above experiments, the choices were all monetary. This raises the question as to whether people would still prefer to combine or separate as predicted by the theory when the choices are on non-monetary dimensions, such as multiple health or social outcomes.

Independently of Thaler and Johnson’s (1990) QHEP, Linville and Fischer (1991) proposed a time-related “Renewable Resources Model (RRM).” Whereas the QHEP focuses on utility, the RRM introduces a cost factor, namely, people’s cognitive, emotional and physical resources. They propose that the preference for separation not only of gains but also of losses is due to people’s limited “gain-savoring” and “loss-buffering” resources, respectively, and that, once these resources are consumed, they are renewed over time. That is, while QHEP and RRM make the same predictions, RRM is based on a more definite causal rationale.

Linville and Fischer (1991) examined gains and losses across three domains (academic, financial and social) in terms of large gains/losses, small gains/losses, and mixed gains and losses. We are interested in the main phenomena of multiple gains and multiple losses, not mixed gains and losses, thus only the relevant portion of Linville and Fischer’s study will be discussed here.

Participants in Linville and Fischer’s study were given pairs of outcomes (e.g., in the large gains condition, “You receive an excellent grade, better than you expected, on an exam that counts 40% towards your grade in an important course in your major” and “You receive an excellent grade, better than you expected, on a paper that counts 40% towards your grade in another important course in your major”) and asked to state whether they would prefer to have both events occur on the same day or on different days. It is important to note, and this will be considered at length in the discussion of our results, that Linville and Fischer had their participants pre-rate the individual events for desirability before they undertook the choice phase.

Linville and Fischer found a strong preference for separating large gains (78% of participants chose this option) and a non-significant preference (52%) for separating small gains. Further, they found a strong preference for separating large losses (72%) and a weaker but significant preference (56%) for separating small losses. The findings were robust across the choice tasks in academic, social and financial domains.

Thus, the findings of their study evidenced strong support for the predictions of the RRM (and QHEP), for both losses and gains, as long as these are of reasonably substantial magnitude. Explanations sought from participants by Linville and Fischer following task completion suggested, in accordance with RRM theory, that resource renewal and depletion over time was the most prevalent cause of preferences.

Despite the apparent support for RRM, we believe that Linville and Fischer’s results may have been induced by the specific procedure and method of task presentation that they employed. We designed the present study to examine these concerns.
Fischer presented participants with pairs of events that made only four decisions. For example, in their study, Linville and Fischer presented participants with pairs of events that were similar, but not identical. For example, in their study, Linville and Fischer presented participants with pairs of events that were similar, but not identical.

1. We increased the number of events in each choice scenario. Linville and Fischer presented participants with pairs of events. We used three events. If the separation of events is due to the need to “recover” from each before incurring the next, and the separation of gains is due to the desire to “savor” each, then the tendency to separate should be higher when the number of events is increased.

2. We did not have participants pre-rate the individual events for desirability. This prior task might, in our view, encourage cognitive separation of the events.

3. Whereas Linville and Fischer presented participants with all possible choice pairs – that is, each participant made 38 decisions about different combinations of the same 24 events – we used only eight events and each participant made only four decisions.

4. We increased the domain specificity of events. Linville and Fischer presented participants with pairs of events that were similar, but not identical. For example, in their “small financial losses” condition, the events were “You lose a paperback novel that you just bought for $5” and “You lose a $5 bill.” Kahneman and Tversky (1984) have demonstrated – in relation to financial events – that people will be more inclined to combine events where the events are coded by the individual as part of the same “mental account” (e.g., “regular bills”); and more likely to separate when the outcomes are coded to separate accounts (e.g., “regular bills” and “unforeseen medical expenses”). Conversely, the concept of “renewable resources” would imply that the more related the groups of events, the more likely it is that people will separate them; that is, the more they will deplete – and thus require the recovery of – the same resource(s). Therefore, if Linville and Fischer’s respondents coded the events into separate mental accounts this would provide a rival explanation for separation that does not depend on renewable resources.

To test the Renewable Resource Model’s predictions, in the present study, the events used within each scenario were identical (e.g., three x $10 library fines, three x distinction-graded assignments). If the RRM is correct, this should favor separation. We note that “mental accounting” suggests that the more related the groups of events, the more likely that people will combine them; this would favor combination of events in the case of both positive and negative events.

## TABLE 1
The Choice Scenarios

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gains</th>
<th>Losses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Academic</strong></td>
<td>Imagine you have been doing very well in your course. You have three assignments which have just been graded, one for each of three different units, and you have achieved a distinction for all three. Would you rather: have all three handed back in the one day OR have each one handed back on a separate day.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Financial</strong></td>
<td>Imagine you have a number of books on loan from the department which are overdue. They can be returned to your lecturer in your normal class time. Each one will incur a fine of $10. Would you rather: return all three books, and pay all three fines, in the one day OR return each one, and pay each fine, on a separate day.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Social</strong></td>
<td>Imagine you have just been to the dentist in the Campus Medical Centre for your annual check-up. The dentist tells you that you need to have three fillings. Would you rather: have all three handed back in the one day OR have each filling handed back on a separate day.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Physical</strong></td>
<td>Imagine you have not been doing very well in your course. You have three assignments which have just been graded, one for each of three different units, and you have failed all three. Would you rather: have all three failed assignments handed back in the one day OR have each failed assignment handed back on a separate day.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### THE PRESENT STUDY

The present study’s methodology differed from Linville and Fischer’s in four main aspects:

1. We increased the number of events in each choice scenario. Linville and Fischer presented participants with pairs of events. We used three events. If the separation of losses is due to the need to “recover” from each before incurring the next, and the separation of gains is due to the desire to “savor” each, then the tendency to separate should be higher when the number of events is increased.

2. We did not have participants pre-rate the individual events for desirability. This prior task might, in our view, encourage cognitive separation of the events.

3. Whereas Linville and Fischer presented participants with all possible choice pairs – that is, each participant made 38 decisions about different combinations of the same 24 events – we used only eight events and each participant made only four decisions.

4. We increased the domain specificity of events. Linville and Fischer presented participants with pairs of events that were similar, but not identical. For example, in their “small financial losses” condition, the events were “You lose a paperback novel that you just bought for $5” and “You lose a $5 bill.” Kahneman and Tversky (1984) have demonstrated – in relation to financial events – that people will be more inclined to combine events where the events are coded by the individual as part of the same “mental account” (e.g., “regular bills”); and more likely to separate when the outcomes are coded to separate accounts (e.g., “regular bills” and “unforeseen medical expenses”). Conversely, the concept of “renewable resources” would imply that the more related the groups of events, the more likely it is that people will separate them; that is, the more they will deplete – and thus require the recovery of – the same resource(s). Therefore, if Linville and Fischer’s respondents coded the events into separate mental accounts this would provide a rival explanation for separation that does not depend on renewable resources.

To test the Renewable Resource Model’s predictions, in the present study, the events used within each scenario were identical (e.g., three x $10 library fines, three x distinction-graded assignments). If the RRM is correct, this should favor separation. We note that “mental accounting” suggests that the more related the groups of events, the more likely that people will combine them; this would favor combination of events in the case of both positive and negative events.
METHODOLOGY
The present study was designed to replicate the main sections of Linville and Fischer’s study (with modifications as discussed) and to examine the applicability of the Renewable Resources Model to decisions in four domains:

- Academic
- Financial
- Social
- Physical

Linville and Fischer used “large” and “small” events, and obtained clear support for RRM only with the large events. We therefore chose “medium” value events, because we wanted events that were of sufficient magnitude to require resources, but not so large as to virtually guarantee separation. For example, in the social domain, Linville and Fischer used “You share a pizza with some good friends” (small) and “The friends that you would most like to live with want you to join them in a suite next year” (large); we used “You have done something which will make three of your close friends very happy” (medium).

The eight conditions (four domains, positive and negative) and the verbatim tasks are shown in Table 1.

It is important to note that our events were chosen to minimize any financial cost or physical effort differentials between the combined and separate events. That is, the library fines were described as payable in class, thus eliminating the possibility of choices being influenced by the additional physical effort which would have been required for separate payment of fines. Similarly, the dental scenario referred to visiting the campus dentist, rather than the respondent’s regular dentist (who may have been located some distance away).

Hypotheses
Given that we removed three task factors (see points 2, 3 and 4 above) that appear likely to favor preference for separation of events, our main hypothesis is that we would not replicate Linville and Fischer’s findings of separation preference for gains and separation preference for losses. Thus, compared with Linville and Fischer’s results:

H1: Participants will show a lesser preference for the separation of gains.

H2: Participants will show a lesser preference for the separation of losses.

H3: H1 and H2 will hold for all four domains of choices (academic, social, financial, and physical).

Participants
Participants were 175 2nd, 3rd, and 4th year students in the Department of Human Movement and Exercise Science at a large Australian public university. The participants’ ages ranged from 18 to 53 (mean age 22.4); 57% were female; and 84% were born in Australia. Scenarios were randomly allocated to participants such that each received one scenario in each domain and, in total, two positives (“gain scenarios”) and two negatives (“loss scenarios”). The questions were presented as forced-choice (i.e., the instructions stated that participants must choose one of the two options) as in the previous studies.

RESULTS
The percentages of participants stating a preference for the separated gains and separated losses in each domain – across the Linville and Fischer study and the present study – are shown in Table 2.

Multiple Gains
As we hypothesized, participants did not demonstrate a preference for separation of gains; instead, in three of the four domains, they demonstrated a preference for combining gains.

Academic Achievement Domain. Consistent with H1, only 32% of participants chose the separated gain (i.e., to receive each assignment back on a separate day), compared with 80% in the Linville and Fischer (large) academic gain condition. Preference for combining gains in the academic achievement domain was significant at p<.005.

Financial Domain. Consistent with H1, only 40% of participants chose the separated gain (i.e., to receive each lottery win on a separate day) compared with 84% in the Linville and Fischer (large) financial gain condition. Preference for combining gains in the financial domain was significant at p<.01.

Social Domain. Consistent with H1, only 28% of participants chose the separated gains (i.e., tell each friend the good news on a separate day), compared with 70% in the Linville and Fischer (large) social gain condition. Preference for combining gains in the financial domain was significant at p<.001.

Physical Domain. Contrary to H1, 75% of participants chose the separated gain (i.e., to be told at each visit that they had lost 0.5kg). Preference for separating gains in the physical domain was significant at p<.001.

Multiple Losses
As we hypothesized, participants did not demonstrate a preference for separation of losses; instead, in three of the four domains, they demonstrated a preference for combining losses.

Academic Achievement Domain. Consistent with H2, only 27% of participants preferred to separate the losses (i.e., to receive each failed assignment one at a time), compared with 63% in the Linville and Fischer (large) academic loss condition. Preference for combining losses in the academic achievement domain was significant at p<.005.

Financial Domain. Consistent with H2, only 29% of participants preferred to separate the losses (i.e., to pay each fine one at a time), compared with 78% in the Linville and Fischer (large)
financial loss condition. Preference for combining losses in the financial domain was significant at p<.001.

Social Domain. Consistent with H2, only 21% of participants preferred to separate the losses (i.e., to have each friend get mad on a separate day), compared with 74% in the Linville and Fischer (large) social loss condition. Preference for combining losses in the social domain was significant at p<.001.

Physical Domain. Consistent with H2, only 9% of participants preferred to separate the losses (i.e., to have each filling one at a time). Preference for combining losses in the physical domain was significant at p<.001. (This domain was not examined by Linville and Fischer.)

Potential Mediators

Gender. There were no significant effects of gender on preferences for combination or separation across seven of the eight scenarios. In the physical health loss scenario (dental fillings), the gender difference was significant at p<.01, with 100% of men choosing the combined option, compared with 84% of women, though majorities of both genders chose to combine the losses.

Nationality. It was originally intended to compare the outcomes between Australian and non-Australians. However, given that only 28 of the participants were born outside Australia, and only 12 of these had lived in Australia less than 10 years, such comparisons were not made.

Income. Income was measured as this was seen to be a potential mediator – at least in terms of the financial domain – and participants were divided into three categories of monthly income: those earning less than AUD$500 (47%); those earning $500-999 (34%); and those earning more than $1,000 (19%). The only significant income-related difference across all eight scenarios was in relation to the academic loss scenario, with the proportion of participants choosing the combined outcome increasing consistently with income (61%; 83%; 93%; p < .05). There was no income effect for the financial scenarios.

DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS

The findings of the current study suggest that the preference for combining gains applies in three of the four domains, which is contrary to the Renewable Resources Model (and also contrary to the PT, HEP and QHEP prediction). Also, the preference for combining losses, in all four domains, does not support the Renewable Resources Model (and it supports the PT and HEP but not the QHEP predictions).

As discussed in the methodology section, the scenarios in the present study were deliberately designed to favor the theory of Renewable Resources, which predicts separation. We used three events, rather than two, which should have been more depleting of participants’ resources. However, what we found – in relation to both gains and losses – was a strong preference for combination. It is proposed that the most likely explanation for Linville and Fischer’s findings is found not in the Renewable Resources Model, but in Kahneman and Tversky’s (1984) “mental accounting” theory. Linville and Fischer employed somewhat dissimilar choice options that participants probably assigned to separate mental accounts, whereas we were careful to keep the options in exactly the same dimension.

Moreover, the preference for separation that they observed may have been increased by the manner of presentation of the questions. Their participants rated each event separately, before completing 38 questions, each question requiring them to state a preference for having two specified events occur on the same or different days. Several of the events were seen more than once, in conjunction with other events, and in the same or different domains. Moreover, the pairs of events in their choice scenarios were presented quite separately (as separate paragraphs) whereas we presented them together (in one paragraph). Thus, it is quite likely that the way in which the events were presented in their study design encouraged participants to consider them separately. On the other hand, it is possible that our presentation may have encouraged combination. But even if so, the Renewable Resources Model should not be so sensitive to lexical differences in task presentation, recalling that our results were the reverse of theirs.

A limitation of our study was that we did not collect process data, relating to subjective perceptions of resource expenditure, as they did. However, it is quite typical not to do so in studies of preferences (e.g., Thaler 1985; Thaler and Johnson 1999) and, in any case, process data might shed light on, but would not alter, the fact of the failure to replicate.

Of great interest to those in the health behavior area is our finding that the strongest tendencies for combination of losses, and the only (and very strong) tendency for separation of gains, were found in the domain of physical wellbeing. This may have occurred because the particular event chosen in the gain condition (weight loss) was perceived by participants as rewards for progress and thus was separated. Nevertheless, the physical (health) domain does appear to be different from the other domains of social, academic and financial, and will be separately investigated by the author in a series of future studies.

Clearly, the Renewable Resources Model is not robust. It does not provide a complete account of the way people evaluate multiple, temporally separable choices. Future studies will need to be alert to and control for other influences, such as mental accounting.

REFERENCES

Product Instructions as a Means of Fulfilling Consumers’ Usage Goals
Ingrid M. Martin, California State University-Long Beach, U.S.A.
Valerie S. Folkes, University of Southern California, U.S.A.

ABSTRACT
A set of three studies examined consumer’s intended and actual usage behavior when the congruency between goals and product usage instructions varied. Two goals when using products were manipulated—maximizing the outcome (benefits) from product use and minimizing the effort expended to use the product. Two straightforward forms of product instructions, commonly found on consumer products, were manipulated—one that provided a range of amounts to use (congruent with the effort minimization goal) and one that specified ideal amounts to use for particular task sizes (congruent with the outcome maximization goal). The studies examined the means of attaining one of two goals when instructions were either congruent or incongruent with the task goals. The experimental results revealed that the goal of maximizing the outcome from product usage lead to different notions regarding product preference, intentions, and the actual amount used compared to the goal of minimizing effort depending on the type of product instructions. The results of Study 2 found that consumers intended to deviate from instructions when goals and instructions were incongruent. Consumers in Study 3 deviated from instructions by using more than the instructed amount replicating the reported intentions to deviate by Study 2 consumers. Thus, this research demonstrated that actual behavior was consistent with intended behavior.

One important implication of this research is that consumers actively customize products in a purposeful way so that the product better fits their needs (usage goals). This demonstrates that consumers do not passively accept marketer’s mandates about how to use or not to use products. This stream of research is consistent with the warnings literature but instead of focusing on risky or toxic products it uses a common household product.

As consumers we seek product usage information that will ensure that the product will provide the benefits that we value. Firms often expend considerable resources to identify how consumers should use products and to persuade them to comply with their recommendations. For example, clothing manufacturers provide labels explaining how to clean clothing, prepared food manufacturers offer directions on packaging specifying how to combine ingredients, and pharmaceutical manufacturers identify steps for using drugs in disclosures enclosed with the medicine. As consumers we constantly face decisions on whether to follow the mandated instructions or to customize those instructions to attain the benefits that we want from product use. Firms are faced with the question of whether they should provide product usage information that will ensure that consumers attain these salient benefits and how that information should be communicated.

Instructions tend to be product specific information that vary across brands and even models within a product class. Because they convey information about procedures for using the specific brand, one would expect product users to value and adhere to instructions. However, it is well documented that people often do not comply. For example, large-scale studies of patients who are prescribed medical regimens show compliance rates range from as low as 3% to as high as 95% (Maatman, et al., 1997; Pepin, et al., 1996). Compliance is important to marketers not just when health and safety are involved but more generally because products used as intended by the manufacturer are more likely to meet the expectations created by marketers.

Research shows that people frequently deviate because they cannot comprehend instructions, find it difficult to recall a complex series of required steps or lack the time and materials for proper execution (Celuch, Lust, & Showers, 1992; Mustard & Harris, 1989; Wright, 1981). The implication is that to attain compliance one must have simple instructions, be given sufficient time to complete the task, and have the necessary implements (Wright, Creighton, & Threlfall, 1982).

Our approach to compliance with instructions emphasizes motivation when using the product. Thus, we examine peoples’ deviations from the kinds of simple, straightforward instructions commonly found on consumer products when they have read the instructions and have the ability to comply with them. We propose that compliance will vary depending on an individual’s goals, the form of product instructions, and the relationship between these two factors. A goal approach provides the theoretical grounding for understanding consumers’ motivations to comply with marketer communications concerning product usage and the resulting product benefits. Hence, this research provides a broadened understanding of a common and fundamental but somewhat atheoretical notion—that of consumer benefits.

Our research focuses on two important usage goals—maximizing outcomes from using the product and minimizing one’s effort while using the product. The importance of these goals is indicated in the pervasiveness of appeals in the marketplace that emphasize maximizing outcomes from product use on the one hand and minimizing effort on the other hand (Beach & Mitchell 1978). These same goals have been examined in the consumer decision making literature (effort minimization in brand selection and making the best choice among brands, Bettman, et al. 1998). They have been shown to be negatively correlated such that when the importance of one increases, the other decreases (Bettman, Luce, & Payne 1998). For example, when a consumer’s goal is to prepare a gourmet meal, the person is unlikely to concurrently hold as a goal having a very easy and quick meal to prepare (Martin & Folkes, 2001).

We examine people’s behavior when the means to attain their goals are readily accessible and contrast it to when the means are incongruent with the goal that they wish to attain. We compare behaviors of individuals with an outcome goal who use a product with instructions that fit with the goal to those with a mastery goal that use a product with instructions that fit with an effort minimization goal, and vice versa. Three studies focus on the effects of the fit between the usage goal and instructional format. When instructions do not fit with a consumer’s goal, the individual is more likely to deviate from even simple, straightforward instructions. Study 1 looks at whether products with instructions designed to achieve consumers’ usage goals will affect their preferences.

STUDY ONE
A consideration of the means to achieve a goal may provide some insight into why goals are incompatible. The hierarchical nature of goals has been represented in various ways in the goals literature but probably the most widely accepted structure is based on the concept

The authors appreciate the helpful comments of Marty Roth, C.W. Park and Niraj Dawar.
of subgoals as the means to achieve higher order goals (e.g., Brewer & Dupree, 1983). For example, the way a set of product instructions are written can provide the “in-order-to” relationships that guides the achievement of a higher level goal (e.g., minimize effort required to use the product). In essence, this “in-order-to” relationship guides goal accomplishment (Lichtenstein & Brewer 1980).

Consumers are likely to have developed some generalized expectations about the means of achieving outcome maximization and effort minimization (Bettman, et al. 1998). These expectations are likely to include aspects of the product instructions. The type of instructions that consumers perceive as the means to achieve the goal of maximizing product performance may be different from those to achieve the goal of minimizing effort. They should differ in the extent to which they constrain usage. When instructions provide a means to achieve a goal, an individual should prefer that product to one that has instructions which do not provide the optimal means to achieve the goal.

**Precise Instructions.** People perceive that optimizing performance entails more constraints and restrictions as a means to achieve one’s goal as compared to when performance standards are more lax (Heider, 1958). Some instructions are quite constrained in their directions for product usage. An example of this type of instructions is one that guides the use of houseplant fertilizer by stating: “use 1 cup of fertilizer for a plant less than one foot tall in height and use 1 cup of fertilizer for a plant that is one foot tall or more in height”. Precise instruction clearly specify the ideal points for the amount of a product to be used and so fits with the goal of outcome maximization. Hence, instructions that narrowly specify the way to use a product and allow less flexibility in use are likely to be adhered to by an individual with an outcome maximization goal.

**Range Instructions.** An effort minimization goal suggests a means that is less constrained than an outcome maximization goal. Instructions should require less precision on the part of the consumer. Range instructions fulfill this criterion by providing a more open-ended process. For example, instructions that provide a means of minimizing the effort to use houseplant fertilizer might state: “use 1/2 to 1 cup of fertilizer per plant”. This type of instructions provides some flexibility in selecting how much of the product to use and fits better with an effort minimization goal. The instructions allow the individual with the effort minimization goal to be less precise in measuring out an amount of fertilizer. The individual could select ‘cup’, 2/3 cup, 1 cup, or some other amount without a focus on any exact amount unlike the precise instructions.

In addition, the lack of task size information in the range instructions can be interpreted by the individual as not being important. In other words, the individual does not have to expend much effort to measure and use the product since that information is not provided in the instructions. By providing the task size information, the precise instructions draw attention to the importance of expending effort in this process, thus, ensuring “healthy, lush plants”. Precise instructions are hypothesized to be the means to achieve the outcome maximization goal and the range instructions are hypothesized to be the means to achieve the effort minimization goal. Preferences for a fit between goals and sub goals should be reflected in product preferences (Guttman & Reynolds 1988).

**Method**

A questionnaire was given to 99 undergraduate students from three universities. The questionnaire described a houseplant fertilizer and asked subjects to indicate which of two brands they would purchase given each of the two usage goals. Half (49) the subjects were randomly assigned to the effort minimization condition. They were told that their usage goal or benefit sought was to have “a fertilizer that is as easy as possible to use” (effort minimization). The remainder (50) was assigned to the outcome maximization condition that stated “to have lush, green and healthy plants”. The two brands differed only in the type of instructions (precise vs. range). The precise instructions stated to “use 1/2 cup of fertilizer for a plant less than 1 foot tall and 1 cup of fertilizer for a plant one foot tall and greater” and range instructions stated to “use 1/2 cup to 1 cup of fertilizer per plant”.

Product preference was obtained followed by perceptions of goal congruency. Subjects were asked to rate both the range and the precise instructions on three 7-point scales for a total of six items. They indicated how well each type of instructions provided a means for the individual to achieve the goal, how well each ensured that the individual achieves the goals, and how well the instructions fit with the goal (1=not at all and 7=very much). The scales were collapsed into a composite measure for the goal congruent and incongruent brands (α=.86 & .87, respectively).

**Results and Discussion**

Given the goal of effort minimization, 82% (40 out of 49) selected the brand with the range instructions. Given the goal of outcome maximization, 90% (45 out of 50) selected the brand with the precise instructions. A difference of means test was conducted within each usage goal condition to test whether there was a difference in perception of fit between the congruent and the incongruent set of instructions. The results of the Z-test confirmed that the range instructions were perceived as the better means to attain the effort minimization goal (M=4.51 vs. 2.76, Zα=.86 & .87, respectively). In the outcome maximization condition, subjects rated the precise instructions as the better means to achieve the outcome maximization goal (M=5.07 vs. 2.89, Zα=.87, respectively). In sum, the set of instructions that were the perceived means of achieving an outcome maximization goal and an effort minimization goal are different, with each set of instructions being incompatible with achieving the other goal. In addition, the product with the congruent set of instructions and usage goal was preferred to the other product with the incongruent instructions and usage goal. The next step was to determine whether this preference for congruent instructions and goals would impact consumers intended compliance with product instructions.

**STUDY TWO**

Although people may prefer brands with instructions that are congruent with their goals, they may be faced with incongruent instructions for a variety of reasons (e.g., the existence of uniform instruction types in a product category, legally mandated instructional formats, the individual’s goal changes over time, the instructions are not visible prior to purchase). Studies Two and Three contrast consumers’ responses when instructions are congruent with the individual’s usage goal to the situation when the instructions are incongruent with one’s usage goal. Study 2 focused on consumers’ intentions to comply with instructions and Study 3 went the next step and focused on their actual usage behaviors. The hierarchical structure of goals suggests that goal should guide behavior so that the consumer pursues the accessible course of action more closely when it is congruent with one’s goal than when it is perceived as incongruent (Lichtenstein & Brewer 1980).

In addition, we examined other ways in which the product usage instructions are perceived to differ for the two goals. The goal of outcome maximization entails both more physical and cognitive effort than does the goal of effort minimization (Chaiken, Giner-Sorolla, & Chen, 1996). Ideal outcomes are perceived to require the identification of ideal points of individual causes of outcomes and maintenance of these ideal points in the ensuing application. A focus on the physical effort involved in product usage (e.g., using measuring implements, precision in measuring amounts) as well as cognitive effort (e.g.,
assessments of plant health and product effectiveness) should be more apparent with the outcome maximization goal as compared to the effort minimization goal.

In contrast, the means to achieve effort minimization involves reducing the complexity of the decision making process (e.g., reducing the amount of information sought and used when deciding how much of the product to apply) (Chaiken, et al., 1996). It also involves reducing the number and intensity of actions needed to execute the decision (e.g., skipping prescribed steps, decreased attentiveness to the task). For example, a homeowner applying fertilizer may have as a usage goal to obtain the greenest and healthiest lawn possible (outcome maximization goal). The homeowner who assigns the same task to a teenager in the family might find the teen’s goal in applying the fertilizer is to expend as little effort as possible (effort minimization goal). Thus, intentions regarding the means of using products should differ depending on one’s goal. In sum, fit between usage goals and product instructions was tested to determine its influence on the intended compliance with instructions. Goals (but not the fit with instructions) were predicted to influence exertion of cognitive and physical effort.

**Method**

Subjects were 143 undergraduate students from two universities. Students came in groups of six to eight persons to a small room where they were seated around a conference table. In the middle of the table were two large plants and two small plants, two one-gallon bottles filled with a green liquid fertilizer and two measuring cups. Subjects were told they were participating in a marketing research study to test a new product concept - premixed houseplant fertilizer. The experimenter, who was blind to the goal and instruction conditions, explained that the fertilizer was premixed and could be applied directly to the plants. The small plant was less than one foot tall growing in a small pot and the large plant was more than one foot tall growing in a large pot.

The two manipulated goals were consistent with the usage situation. The effort minimization goal fit with the description of the product given to subjects - the fertilizer was described as “premixed”, so it should be assumed to be easy to use. The outcome maximization goal — use of the product would ensure lush, healthy plants — also fit with the use of houseplant fertilizer in general. Thus, the situation presented to subjects was not in itself incongruent with either goal. Subjects read the product instructions and completed a survey asking them to respond to a series of 7-point rating scales. The two scales of degree of intended compliance to instructions were “how likely would you be to use more/less than the instructions state”, anchored by 1=not very likely and 7=very likely.

Additional measures were collected to confirm subjects’ beliefs about the physical and cognitive effort needed to accomplish their goal. Three measures of physical effort included “how important is it to be precise about the amount of fertilizer to use”, “how important is it to use a measuring cup”, and “how careful do you need to be when pouring the fertilizer”. The first two scales were anchored by 1=not at all important and 7=very important, and the third scale was anchored by 1=not at all careful and 7=very careful. Since these three measures were highly correlated, they were combined into a composite measure of physical effort (α=.73). Three measures of cognitive effort included “to what extent would you take into account how healthy the plants are before applying the fertilizer” (anchored by 1=not much and 7=very much), “would you think a lot about the optimal amount of fertilizer to use before putting it on the plants” (anchored by 1=not at all likely and 7=very likely), and “how interested would you be in the effect of the fertilizer on the plants” (anchored by 1=not at all interested and 7=very interested). The measures were highly correlated and combined into a composite measure of cognitive effort (α=.81).

**Results**

The measures of intended compliance, physical effort, and cognitive effort were analyzed using 2 by 2 ANOVA with two usage goals (outcome maximization vs. effort minimization) and two sets of product instructions (precise vs. range instructions). The analysis reveals an interaction between goals and instruction type for one of the compliance measures (F(1,139)=15.56, p<.001). When subjects were asked whether they would use more than the instructions specify, those in the incongruent conditions (outcome maximization-precise and effort minimization-range) were more likely to use more as compared to those in the congruent conditions (outcome maximization-precise and effort minimization-precise) (F(1,139)=13.99, p<.001 and F(1,139)=21.03, p<.001, respectively). Subjects do not intend to use less than the instructions specify, as indicated by the low cell means for the “underdose” measure in Table One.

![Image of Table 1](https://example.com/table1.png)

**Table 1**

Mean Ratings for Goal and Instruction Conditions in Study Two

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dependent Measures</th>
<th>Outcome Maximization</th>
<th>Effort Minimization</th>
<th>F-Statistics* for Contrasts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Precise (Fit)</td>
<td>Precise (No Fit)</td>
<td>Effort-Precise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1) Intentions to</td>
<td>Range (No Fit)</td>
<td>Range (Fit)</td>
<td>Max-Precise vs. Effort-Range</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use More</td>
<td>2.15</td>
<td>2.39</td>
<td>13.99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Overdose)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use Less</td>
<td>1.79</td>
<td>2.50</td>
<td>ns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Underdose)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) Physical</td>
<td>5.69</td>
<td>2.59</td>
<td>ns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cognitive Effort</td>
<td>5.62</td>
<td>3.59</td>
<td>11.54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) Cognitive</td>
<td>4.80</td>
<td>3.91</td>
<td>ns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effort</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Degrees of freedom are 1,139, p < .01.

* Higher means indicate more effort and a greater likelihood of using more or less.
Analysis of variance revealed a significant main effect for the usage goals for the composite measures of physical effort and cognitive effort (see Table One). Subjects in the outcome maximization condition indicate they would follow a different procedure than subjects in the effort minimization condition. As expected, the cell means show that physical and cognitive effort exerted was greater for outcome maximization subjects compared to effort minimization subjects (M=5.21 v 3.75, F1,139=16.81 and M=5.59 v 2.57, F1,139=14.63, respectively).

The goal main effect is qualified by an interaction effect for cognitive effort (F1,139=8.46, p<.01). Contrasts reveal that more cognitive effort would be expended when outcome maximization goal subjects were given precise instructions than when they were given range instructions, (M=5.62 v 4.80, F1,139=11.54, p<.01). Nevertheless, differences across usage goals remain. Those individuals with the outcome maximization goal were more likely to put more cognitive effort into the usage process. This is seen in the comparison between the outcome maximization-precise instruction condition with the effort minimization-precise instruction condition and the outcome maximization-range instruction condition with effort minimization-range instruction condition (F1,139=15.09 & F1,139=8.10, respectively).

Discussion

The means to achieve an outcome maximization goal is perceived as requiring greater cognitive and physical effort than does an effort minimization goal. One might expect that this difference would influence compliance with instructions. Compliance typically requires physical effort (measuring amounts, careful pouring), which suggests that outcome maximization subjects would be more likely to comply with instructions compared to effort minimization goal subjects. On the other hand, deviation from instructions can require cognitive effort (e.g., generating hypotheses about the effect of overuse or underuse might be), which suggests that outcome maximization subjects are more likely to deviate from instructions compared to effort minimization subjects.

Had we not provided subjects with different types of instructions, we might have concluded simply that goals influence compliance for different reasons. However, the effect of goals on compliance is more complex. Instructions provide information in a format that is either congruent or incongruent with individuals’ usage goals. Compliance with instructions is greater when the instructions are perceived as a means to achieve the usage goals. Using more than the instructed amount appears to serve the goal of outcome maximization when products provide range instructions and to serve the goal of effort minimization when products provide precise instructions - goal incongruent instructions. Although the results are largely consistent with the predictions, they describe the manner in which actions are executed and not the outcome of usage (the amount used). It is unclear whether subjects would actually use a different amount than that prescribed by the usage instructions and this is addressed in Study 3.

STUDY THREE

Study 3 replicated Study 2 subjects’ intentions to comply with instructions by focusing on actual usage behavior rather than intended behavior. People should adhere to instructions that are congruent with their goals. When instructions are incongruent, people are likely to seek different means of pursuing their goals. A secondary purpose was to examine effects of goal congruency on confidence. Instructions that provide a means to achieve one’s goals should increase the person’s confidence in using the product. Lack of congruent information on how to achieve one’s salient usage goal should decrease one’s confidence in using the product. Certainty that one will achieve one’s usage goal increases when one has identified the optimal means to achieve the goal (Gollwitzer, 1996; Petersen & Pitz, 1988). For example, an individual who wants healthy, lush houseplants will have a higher confidence in achieving this goal with precise step-by-step instructions that provide the guidance needed than instructions that are more open-ended (range instructions).

Method

As in Study 2, the same two usage goals and the same two sets of product instructions were manipulated via experimental instructions making one of the four goal congruency conditions more salient. The task size variable was also used as a way to confirm the generality of the findings (e.g., deviation is not limited to particular plant sizes or types). Subjects were 92 students taking marketing courses at a major university in the western U.S. The stimuli used in Study 3 were the same as those used in Study 2 in order to replicate the situation as closely as possible. There were plants of two sizes in the office but only one small and one large plant was on the table facing the subject. The plants were the same size and varieties as those used in Study 2.

The major difference between Studies 2 and 3 was that actual usage behavior was the focus in Study 3. After reading the instructions, students were told to fertilize one small and one large plant on the table with the houseplant fertilizer. After fertilizing both plants, subjects were given a questionnaire. Using live plants in this experiment provided the advantage of presenting subjects with a task in which product usage had actual consequences. All plants maintained a healthy appearance for the length of the study. No systematic differences across conditions were expected in the perceived health of the plants since plants size was randomly assigned to subjects.

Dependent measures

Two types of dependent variables were collected: behavioral measures of the amount of fertilizer poured on each plant and rating scale measures. The amount of fertilizer applied to each plant was measured by weighing the bottle of fertilizer before and after the individual poured an amount on the plant. The scale used to weigh the bottles was hidden from subjects’ view and the quantities were ascertained when subjects were not in the experimental room. Amounts were measured in pounds, with the amount indicated on the measuring cup as one half-cup weighing .23 pounds and the amount indicated on the measuring cup as one cup weighing .51 pounds. The amounts marked on this standard measuring cup were slightly in error so that the quantity marked as one half cup did not in fact weigh half the quantity marked as that of a whole cup. An individual viewing the measuring cup would not detect this unintentional discrepancy.

We did not simply use the amounts stated in the instructions when developing criteria for behavior consistent with the instructions because this would hold the subjects to an unrealistically stringent standard. It is important to realize that subjects relied on a visual assessment of the quantity in the measuring cup when they used the product. The usage dependent variable was based on a more accurate measure, the weight on a scale of the quantity of fertilizer poured into a measuring cup. In the precise instruction condition in particular, measurement error could plausibly account for a degree of deviation from the exact amounts stated in the instructions. Thus, to arrive at a realistic criteria of conforming to the range instructions, we examined this interval extended from .21 to .53 lb. (a slightly broader range than the .23 to .51 lb. amount that corresponds to one half to one cup). For the precise instructions this interval extended from .21 to .25 lb. for the small plant (.23 lb. or one half cup in the instructions) and from .49 to .53 lb. for the large plant (.51 lb. or one cup in the instructions). Both instructions still maintain the same boundaries of .21 to .53 lb.

Survey measures consisted of 7-point rating scales. Subjects were asked “how confident/certain/sure can you be about selecting the right amount of fertilizer so as to achieve the goal of outcome
Students’ perceptions of the product and the plants were also examined. They were asked “how strong do you think this fertilizer is?”, anchored by 1=very weak and 7=very strong. The product was perceived as moderately strong, M=4.73, sd=.91, with no differences across conditions. The plants were also perceived similarly across conditions. The plant perception scales asked about each plant’s hardness and fragility, anchored by 1=at all hardy to 7=very hardy and 1=at all fragile to 7=very fragile. The combined hardness/fragility measures were also correlated (r=.61 for the small plant and r=.58 for the large plant, p<.0001) and were formed into a composite measure of plant hardiness. Both plants were perceived as moderately hardy, M=4.41 for the small and 5.09 for the large plant with 7=very hardy/not at all fragile. In addition, there were no significant differences across task size, providing support for the generality of the results.

To rule out the possibility that expertise might also influence compliance with instructions, previous domain relevant experience was examined with subjects indicating their experience with houseplants (anchored by 1=no experience and 7=much experience), their experience with plant fertilizers, and the extent to which they had used a product similar to that in the study (anchored by 1=none at all and 7=a lot of similar products). As anticipated, the mean ratings suggest that subjects had little relevant experience (M=3.47, 2.71, and 2.59, respectively). These three items form a composite measure of expertise and did not differ across conditions (α=.69).

**Manipulation checks**

Subjects were asked to rate how well the instructions provide a means for the individual to achieve the respective usage goal, how well they ensure that the individual achieves the respective usage goal, and how well the instructions fit with the usage goal. The three 7-point scales were anchored by 1=not at all and 7=very well (α=.90). Consistent with both Studies 1 and 2 results, there was a difference in fit with the goals and instructions (F(1,95)=210.08, p<.0001). The *precise* instructions were evaluated as a better means to achieve the outcome maximization goal than the effort minimization goal, (M=5.32 vs. 2.77, F(1,95)=124.16, p<.0001). Subjects perceived the *range* instructions as a better means to achieve the effort minimization goal than the outcome maximization goal (M=5.17 vs.3.38, F(1,95)=114.34, p<.0001), confirming the link between instructions and goals.

**Results**

The actual usage amount was measured and used to calculate the average amount of deviation from instructions within each group. The results indicate that consumers are more likely to comply with instructions when the form of the instructions are perceived as congruent with a usage goal than when instructions do not fit a goal. The amount of deviation was examined with a 2 by 2 between subjects ANOVA with goals and instructions as between subjects factors.

There was a significant interaction between goals and instructions, which highlights the impact of congruency between the goals and the instructions. Subjects deviated less from instructed amounts when the instructions were perceived as a means to achieve a usage goal, (F(1,95)=47.26, p<.0001) (see Table Two). Further, subjects are more likely to use more rather than to use less than the instructed amount when given instructions that are incongruent with their salient usage goal.

The same pattern of results is also found when comparing the percent of subjects who used more fertilizer in each condition. The majority of Study 3 subjects used more when given the outcome maximization goal with the range instructions (n=17 or 71%). In contrast, a minority of subjects used more when given the same outcome maximization goal but with the precise instructions (n=7 or 30%). There was a significant difference between those subjects that used more in the congruent condition and those that used more in the incongruent condition (Z=.82, p<.05). The congruency effect emerged for the effort minimization goal with subjects using more when given the effort minimization goal with the precise instructions (n=18 or 75%). In contrast, few subjects used more when given the effort minimization goal with the range instructions (n=11 or 46%).

The difference between the congruent and incongruent conditions was significant (Z=.26, p<.05).

Goals, instructions, and the goals’ congruency with instructions influenced subjects’ confidence in their usage behavior. Ratings were analyzed using a 2 by 2 between subjects ANOVA. Subjects expressed more confidence in their choice of amounts to use when the goal was outcome maximization rather than effort minimization (M=4.4 v. 4.0, F(1,95)=11.59, p<.001), when presented with precise instructions rather than range instructions (M=4.6 v. 3.8, F(1,95)=13.22, p<.0001), and when instructions were congruent with usage goals (F=73.11, p<.0001). Those with an outcome maximization goal were more confident when given precise instructions than when they were given range instructions. Those with an effort minimization goal were more confident when given range instructions rather than precise instruction.

---

**TABLE TWO**

Mean Amount Deviated, Confidence Ratings, and Contrasts for Study Three

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dependent Measures</th>
<th>Outcome Maximization</th>
<th>Effort Minimization</th>
<th>F-Statistics* for Contrasts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Measures</td>
<td>Precise (Fit)</td>
<td>Range (No Fit)</td>
<td>Max-Precise vs. Min-Precise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Max-Range (Col 1 v Col 2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Min-Range (Col 3 v Col 4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Max-Precise vs. Min-Precise</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Max-Range (Col 2 v Col 4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean amount deviation:</td>
<td>0.50</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Confidence Ratings:</td>
<td>5.00</td>
<td>3.89</td>
<td>2.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Degrees of freedom are 1,95, p < .0001.
Discussion

Study 3 results are consistent with the results of Study 1 and 2 that show subjects must reconcile the incongruency between these two types of goals. When instructions were perceived to be the optimal means to achieve a particular goal, the discrepancy between the amount used and the amount prescribed in the instructions was less than when the goals and the instructions were evaluated as incongruent. The method used in the experiment suggests that noncompliance did not arise merely because subjects did not pay attention to or did not read or comprehend the instructions. Although consumers do search for goal consistent information (Gollwitzer 1996), the procedures in Study 3 ensured that all subjects were exposed to the instructions and had plenty of time to finish the task. Also, the instructions were simple and required little effort to comprehend.

The finding that subjects in the incongruent groups deviated by using more fertilizer may be due to beliefs about the particular product category or a general belief that using more of a product is the better direction to deviate. For example, consumers might generally assume that detecting an effect from product usage is generally more likely when using more rather than using less. Alternatively, using more than the instructed amount of a product might also be interpreted as a sign of overconfidence. Deviation implies that the individual believes that his or her means of using the product is better than that provided by experts who manufacture the product. However, the mean confidence ratings rule out overconfidence as an explanation for overdosing in the incongruent instruction conditions (see Table Two). Confidence when using the product is associated with the outcome maximization goal more than the effort minimization goal, with precise rather than range instructions, and particularly with the fit of goals with instructions. The instruction main effect reflects the added information given on task size differences in the precise instructions and not in the range instructions. Research has shown that an increase in the amount of information enhances confidence (Petersen & Pitz, 1988).

More importantly, the goal main effect appears irrelevant due to the goal by congruency interaction (see reversal in the direction of the means in Table Two). The influence of goal congruency on confidence suggests that subjects’ overuse in the incongruent conditions is regarded as somewhat tentative, consistent with Gollwitzer (1996). Thus, deviation reflects subjects’ attempts to arrive at a means of using the product that is more compatible with their goals, despite the recognition that overdose may not accomplish these goals. In sum, the congruency between usage goals and product instructions (as evidenced by the goal by instruction interaction) accounts for the differential compliance to instructions and the enhanced confidence in their usage choices.

GENERAL DISCUSSION

Taken together, these three experiments advance our understanding of postpurchase behavior, a neglected area of inquiry in marketing and consumer behavior (for an exception see Folkes, Martin, & Gupta, 1993; Wansink, 1996). Most research in consumer behavior focuses on purchase whereas most consumer behavior occurs at postpurchase. The research presented here takes a novel approach by examining ways people act upon products to achieve their goals rather than just examining the way people think about brands they might purchase or evaluate products after purchase. Consumers deviate from instructions in purposeful ways so that the experience conforms to their needs. The results demonstrate that consumers can actively customize products rather than passively accepting marketers’ mandates about how to use products. Also, this research shows a consistency between intentions and actual behaviors, a neglected area of consumer behavior research.

Second, the research expands our understanding of usage goals. These two usage goals are similar to those emphasized in the consumer decision making realm (e.g., Bettman, et al.’s 1998 work comparing effort minimization and outcome maximization). Further, the foundation has been laid for the development of a taxonomy of usage goals and the identification of congruent and incongruent goals. A goal approach provides a promising path for theoretical advancement for the otherwise limited notion of consumer benefits.

The findings also provide insight into instructions as a product attribute as well as a means to attain a particular product benefit. As pervasive as instructions are, it is surprising that little thought has been given to their nature and how they guide consumption (see related research on warning labels, Stewart & Martin, 1994; Stewart, Folkes, & Martin, 2000). Informational instruction can provide the starting point for use, use that can be modified by more general goal-linked knowledge.

Instructional congruency with consumers’ goals was found to influence important aspects of usage. Consumers’ health and safety often rests on compliance with instructions (e.g., Mahmoudi & Iseman, 1993). To achieve compliance, experts often recommend specific instructional features (e.g., Wright, 1981). In contrast, the research presented here suggests that merely reducing the complexity of instructions may be insufficient to elicit compliance. Instead, when marketers write instructions they need to take into account what motivates consumers and how consumers’ goals may vary across individuals and even by usage situation. Such a task may not be as formidable as it seems. Perhaps the two types of instructions examined in these studies have achieved their prevalence in the marketplace partially because of the ubiquity of these two task goals.

The findings in this research demonstrate that consumers’ deviations from instructions can be systematic and intentional rather than merely a result of random error. Lack of compliance may sometimes reflect hypothesis-testing procedures in which consumers’ search for the optimal means to attain salient goals other than those facilitated by instructions. Correcting for, or at least compensating for, systematic deviations rather than for random error should be easier for firms. Thus, a marketer who segments the market based on the benefits (usage goals) sought by a target set of customers should design instructions so that they facilitate attaining that salient goal. This can be combined with other product design strategies targeted towards a particular group. For example, marketers should offer products with range instructions and premixed solutions that hinder pouring too much to customers who want a product that is “easy to use”. Alternatively, marketers should offer products with precise instructions that include warnings and admonitions to avoid using too much to customers who want a product that maximizes outcomes from use.

REFERENCES


Wright, P. (1981). The instructions clearly state ... can’t people read, Applied Ergonomics, 12, 131-41.

A Differentiated View of Pleasure: Review of the Literature and Research Propositions
Laurette Dubé, McGill University, Canada
Jordan L. Le Bel, Concordia University, Canada

ABSTRACT
Within the choice and decision making literatures pleasure is conceptualized as an undifferentiated common, fungible currency that consumers strive to maximize. We review the literature on pleasure and focus on an alternative view of pleasure as a multidimensional, differentiated phenomenon. We propose a formal model based on categorization theory and developed to reconcile these two views. We elaborate a set of testable propositions regarding the implications of our model for consumer experience, choice and decision making research. We propose that (1) different kinds of pleasures may be anticipated, experienced, and remembered in different ways. Thus, different pleasures will exhibit different patterns of change over the course of an experience and different discounting rates in memory-based judgments. We further propose that (2) the simultaneous experience of pleasures of different kinds may alter their respective intensities; and that (3) pleasure of different kinds may differentially contribute to consumers’ approach behaviors.

There has been significant development lately in the consumer literature on the study of hedonic consumption and on the role that pleasure (or experience utility) plays in choice, decision making, and behavior. The implicit assumption throughout this literature is that all pleasurable experiences can be reduced to a single, unique dimension. Under this “unitary” view, pleasure is independent of the qualities of the stimuli that produced it. Further, pleasure is also seen as independent of one’s subjective experience including, but not limited to, emotions, beliefs, desires or intuitions about pleasure. Even though pleasure may be subject to many influences, from simple sensations to complex cognitive inferences, even influences outside of awareness (c.f., Ledoux, 1996), the unitary view does not account for the possibility that these various influences in effect create distinctively different pleasures. If this unitary view has been helpful in understanding evolutionary and motivational correlates of pleasure, relying too heavily on this conceptualization may have constrained research and theory development. As Higgins (1997) argued, when a principle such as the hedonic principle is intuitively appealing, simple and of general applicability, it tends to be overused with little questioning of its hidden assumptions.

Alternatively, it may be that people approach and experience different types of pleasures in substantially different ways such that different types of pleasures correspond to different psychological realities. If this assumption were true, further scientific investigation of the concept of pleasure would be profitable. Such investigation may reveal, for example, different ways in which pleasure is experienced, anticipated or remembered depending on what type it is, why it occurs or where it comes from. Such insights would be inaccessible under the unitary perspective outlined above.

In spite of their high relevance for the understanding of human behavior in general, and in consumption contexts in particular, there is a dearth of research focusing on the essence and experience of different types of pleasures. In this paper, we review the literature on the unitary and differentiated notions of pleasure. We then propose a model developed to reconcile these two views based on prototype theory. Finally, we outline a set of testable propositions pertaining to the implications of the proposed model for consumer research.

LITERATURE REVIEW
The unitary and unidimensional essence of pleasure
From ancient Greek philosophy to modern neuropsychology, the hedonic principle of seeking pleasure and avoiding pain has pervaded scholarly attempts to understand behavior, animal or human. In fact, pleasure has for long been considered the primary motivator of human behavior. In physiology, Cabanac (1971) demonstrated that pleasure corresponds to a pleasant sensation that arises when hunger, bodily comfort, or other visceral drives are satisfied, thereby reestablishing homeostasis. Cabanac also showed that pleasure depends on internal, physiological signals and behaves as a common currency that people trade like money or time as they choose among alternative, sometimes conflicting courses of action (see Cabanac, 1992, for a review).

Research on human emotions also subscribes to the unitary conceptualization of pleasure. In that area, pleasure is seen as being of a single kind and varying on a single continuum from displeasure to pleasure (Larsen and Diener, 1985; Watson and Tellegen, 1985; Russell, 1980). According to these frameworks, the diversity of affective experiences can be organized around a circumplex that combines pleasure and arousal. The location of an emotion along the dimensions of pleasure and arousal defines the affective state associated with that emotion (Feldman, 1997). There is a reasonable degree of agreement on this general structure of affective experiences.

Research on pleasure as a measure and expression of utility also adheres to the unitary conceptualization of pleasure (Cabanac, 1971; Kahneman, Fredrickson, Schreiber, and Redelmeier, 1993; Kahneman, Wakker, and Sarin, 1997). Inspired partly by Bentham’s theorizing, the function of pleasure has been that of an axiom, a remote psychological substrate that acts like a common currency that people trade and attempt to maximize given a certain investment (Kahneman, Wakker, and Sarin, 1997; Cabanac, 1971; Elster and Loewenstein, 1992). Pleasure informs the individual that a beneficial stimulus is present and provides a signal to approach or avoid the target object or to continue or stop its consumption. This pleasure currency is used in decisions that involve conflicting options, providing a stop-or-go signal as the ratio “pleasure/cost” evolves over time. Not surprisingly, abundant research has focused on the relationship between this currency and behavior (Cabanac, 1971) and recently, on the relation between the instant-by-instant measure of this currency and overall utility derived from an experience (Kahneman et al., 1993).

The conceptualization of pleasure common across these different areas can even be found in the first of many definitions in the Oxford English Dictionary, which defines pleasure as “the condition of consciousness or sensation induced by the enjoyment or anticipation of what is felt or viewed as good or desirable.” (in Rozin, 1999). In fact, this view of pleasure underlies much of modern scientific thinking on related issues, as captured by the following citation from Kant’s Critique of Practical Reason (in Duncker, 1941, p. 392-393):

“Just as to the man who wants money to spend, it is all the same whether the gold was dug out of the mountain or washed out of the sand, provided it is everywhere accepted at the same
Recent contributions notwithstanding, the literature on pleasure suffers from an important gap. Researchers have yet to determine how pleasures resulting from qualitatively different antecedents and producing widely different affective experiences are distilled into a common currency and expressed as a single degree of goodness/badness. It is generally accepted that the subjective experience of pleasure is diverse and complex. Even Bentham (1781/1988), whose ideas have fueled modern utility theory, recognized the diversity of hedonic experiences when he outlined no less than 14 different kinds of pleasures such as pleasures of sense, wealth, skill, and memory. As a further sign of the nuance existing among pleasures, he listed nine subtypes under “pleasures of sense.” Unfortunately, neither Bentham nor contemporary researchers have integrated any of this richness in theoretical formulae for computing the intensity or common currency derived from a hedonic experience.

The claim for differentiated pleasures

Higgins (1997) highlighted the need for a better understanding of the various facets of the psychological experience of pleasure and their relationship to approach-avoidance motivations. A similar claim was made some time ago by Duncker (1941) who argued against the idea of reducing pleasure to a common currency. Using Kant’s analogy of pleasure and gold, Duncker pointed out that “a product like gold emancipates itself from, and exists independently of, its source. Is the pleasure separable from the flavor in the same sense? Clearly not. The experience of pleasure remains dependent upon the experience of the flavor (or whatever other source it may have.)” (p. 399).

There is no shortage of expressions to describe the various ways in which pleasures may differ, from the discourse of Greek philosophers (see Bailey, 1928; Gaskin, 1995; Le Bel and Dubé, 1997) to a diversity of qualities assigned to pleasure by artists of all philosophers (see Bailey, 1928; Gaskin, 1995; Le Bel and Dubé, 1997). There is no shortage of expressions to describe the various ways in which pleasures may differ, from the discourse of Greek philosophers (see Bailey, 1928; Gaskin, 1995; Le Bel and Dubé, 1997) to a diversity of qualities assigned to pleasure by artists of all philosophers (see Bailey, 1928; Gaskin, 1995; Le Bel and Dubé, 1997). There is no shortage of expressions to describe the various ways in which pleasures may differ, from the discourse of Greek philosophers (see Bailey, 1928; Gaskin, 1995; Le Bel and Dubé, 1997) to a diversity of qualities assigned to pleasure by artists of all philosophers (see Bailey, 1928; Gaskin, 1995; Le Bel and Dubé, 1997). There is no shortage of expressions to describe the various ways in which pleasures may differ, from the discourse of Greek philosophers (see Bailey, 1928; Gaskin, 1995; Le Bel and Dubé, 1997) to a diversity of qualities assigned to pleasure by artists of all philosophers (see Bailey, 1928; Gaskin, 1995; Le Bel and Dubé, 1997). There is no shortage of expressions to describe the various ways in which pleasures may differ, from the discourse of Greek philosophers (see Bailey, 1928; Gaskin, 1995; Le Bel and Dubé, 1997) to a diversity of qualities assigned to pleasure by artists of all philosophers (see Bailey, 1928; Gaskin, 1995; Le Bel and Dubé, 1997). There is no shortage of expressions to describe the various ways in which pleasures may differ, from the discourse of Greek philosophers (see Bailey, 1928; Gaskin, 1995; Le Bel and Dubé, 1997) to a diversity of qualities assigned to pleasure by artists of all philosophers (see Bailey, 1928; Gaskin, 1995; Le Bel and Dubé, 1997).

Kubovy (1999) recently provided a typology that builds on Duncker’s work but returns to the body-mind distinction. Kubovy differentiated “pleasures of the body” as either triggered by sensory contact that creates positive hedonic states (i.e., tonic pleasures) or as borne from the relief of tension or discomfort (i.e., relief pleasures). As for the pleasures of the mind, Kubovy defined them as collections of emotions distributed over time, regardless of whether they are aesthetics or accomplishment pleasures. He suggested that emotions triggering pleasures of the mind result from violation of expectations activated by sensory stimuli such as music or humor, from curiosity (learning something new), or from virtuosity (feeling you are doing something well). For completeness, he also acknowledged the pleasure of nurture and the pleasure of belonging to a social group as additional varieties of pleasures of the mind.

Kubovy’s typology parallels the sociological account of pleasure offered by Tiger (1992) who identified four types of pleasures. Physio-pleasures involve sensations or the physical impressions obtained from eating, drinking, or lying in the sun, to use some of his examples. Socio-pleasures are borne out of experiencing the pleasure of the company of others. Psycho-pleasures stem from the satisfaction from acts initiated and enjoyed by individuals, while ideo-pleasures are borne of ideas, images, and emotions privately experienced. This typology, like previous ones, has never been empirically tested and, as Tiger pointed out, the categories are loose, blend into one another, and are not mutually exclusive.

If most of the typologies outlined thus far are intuitively appealing, they fall short of providing a window onto the relationship between different types of pleasure and approach-avoidance behaviors. First, even recent conceptualizations (e.g., Kubovy, 1999) remain at a rather general level, without providing a systematic representation of the various features of experiences that make up different pleasure categories. Second, to the best of our knowledge, beyond phenomenological and introspective exploration (e.g., Duncker, 1941), no empirical validation has been presented in support of any of these proposed typologies. In fact, empirical research on pleasure has focused primarily on sensory pleasures, particularly their immediate physiological antecedents and consequences (e.g., Cabanac, 1971), as well as the biological, psychological, and social influences producing shifts in sensory pleasure (e.g., Rozin, 1990).

PROPOSED MODEL OF DIFFERENTIATED PLEASURABLE EXPERIENCES

In this section, we outline a model of differentiated pleasures based on categorization theory (Rosch, 1975; Rosch and Mervis, 1975). We propose that unitary pleasure corresponds to the superordinate level of a hierarchical category, and differentiates itself into four basic pleasure prototypes. Expanding upon Kubovy’s (1999) suggestion that pleasures of the mind can be described as a collection of emotions, we propose that each basic-level prototype entails a set of common and distinctive emotional qualities that define its affective makeup. The proposed model, illustrated in Figure 1, includes the following four basic-level pleasures derived from existing typologies: (1) sensorial, (2) emotional, (3) social, and (4) intellectual. In our model intellectual and emotional pleasures are reminiscent of Duncker’s (1941) aesthetic and accomplishment pleasures, later subsumed by Kubovy (1999) under...
pleasures of the mind. Sensory and social pleasures as discussed by Tiger (1992) are also represented in our model.

How do the four pleasure prototypes compare to each other? It is likely that some affective qualities or reactions are common to all pleasure prototypes. For instance, it is entirely reasonable to expect that clearly positive feelings such as excitement and joy would be common across all four prototypes. Secondly, across the four basic-level prototypes, it may well be that, as Rozin (1999) suggested, sensory pleasure is the most representative prototype of the whole general category of pleasure. However, by opposition to earlier work, we do not assume that sensory pleasures are emotion-free. The affective constitution of sensory pleasures is likely to include accomplishment, excitement, and happiness as typical qualities. Even negative affective responses may be part of the typical script of sensory pleasures. Guilt, anxiety, laziness, nervousness, sadness even vulnerability are likely to be more frequently associated with sensory pleasure than with the general concept of pleasure.

How do the four basic-level prototype compare to unitary pleasure, at the superordinate level? We propose that certain affective features will be more typical of each of the four pleasure prototypes than of the superordinate concept of pleasure. For example, social pleasures are likely to be dominated by the experience of more relational qualities such as feelings of altruism, empathy, caring, love, and warmth than the general category. Emotional pleasures, on the other hand, are more likely to include feelings of bliss, contentment, and ecstasy. Intellectual pleasures are likely to present a unique profile of affective qualities and include affective experiences such as a feeling of accomplishment, fulfillment, pride, confidence and esteem, and perhaps even negative affective experiences such as procrastination, anxiety and worry. Finally, sensorial pleasures may include experiences such as laziness and guilt.

RESEARCH PROPOSITIONS

Our proposed model is accompanied by the assumption that the affective script or qualities associated with each prototype can have an important impact on consumers’ choice and decision making, and on behavioral manifestations as well. In this section, we explore three propositions that stem from our model.

Proposition 1: The unfolding of pleasure

Differentiated pleasures may vary in the relative contribution that anticipation and memories make to the intensity of the overall experience. For example, it is reasonable to hypothesize that anticipation may be a more important generator of pleasure intensity than memories for sensory pleasures given the forward-looking nature of such pleasures and the possibility that guilt differentiates them from the superordinate level. For intellectual pleasures, one could argue the opposite. Given their demanding nature suggested from emotions reflecting goal attainment (i.e., accomplishment, fulfillment, pride) and emotions experienced in anticipation like anxiety, nervousness and sadness, memories are likely to surpass anticipation as sources of intellectual pleasure intensity.

The differentiated affective constitution of the four pleasure prototypes may also bear on intertemporal choice. Research in this area has revealed a strong tendency to postpone pleasant outcomes, a phenomenon referred to as negative temporal discounting (Loewenstein and Prelec, 1993). Under a differentiated view, the anticipation of different pleasures may be reflected in different rates of temporal discounting. We may be willing to postpone a dinner in a fancy French restaurant and prefer to take on the challenging revision of a paper because the affective make-up of the former is more clearly positive than that of the latter, even though on the same intensity scale, both may deliver equal amounts of pleasure.

Proposition 2: Combinations of pleasures

The differentiated pattern of emotions observed between pleasure prototypes may not only influence temporal structure, and intertemporal choice. It may also change the relationship between the on-line, momentary experience of pleasure, and its retrospective global judgment. So far, current models of retrospective judgments have been developed with largely unidimensional, and most often aversive stimuli like colonoscopy procedure (Redelmeier and Kahneman, 1996) or video clips of amputation (Fredrickson and Kahneman, 1993). Such models hold that specific moments (e.g., peak and end) within a single episode are averaged into an overall evaluation (e.g., Kahneman et al., 1993; Redelmeier and Kahneman, 1996). However, given the complex affective content of the four basic pleasure prototypes, it is highly unlikely that retrospective judgments of all types of hedonic experiences can be reduced to a simple matter of aggregating pleasure intensity over a few select moments within an episode.

What, then, may be an alternative account for the formation of retrospective judgments in the context of pleasurable experiences presenting differentiated emotional makeup? Thomas and Diener (1990) suggested that “people could reconceptualize their emotional experience when the episode comes to an end; therefore their recall is not of the on-line experience per se but of the way they currently conceptualize and chunk the experience. They may form a gestalt of the emotional experience when it is over, depending on their self concept and the outcome of the episode.” (p. 296). This
proposition is consistent with philosopher John Dewey’s theorizing: “An experience has a unity that gives it its name, that storm, that friendship. The existence of unity is constituted by a single quality that pervades the entire experience in spite of variation in its constituent parts. (…) In going over an experience in mind after its occurrence, we may find that one property rather than another was sufficiently dominant so that it characterizes the experience as a whole. (…) Yet, the experience was not a sum of these different characters; they were lost in it as distinctive traits.” (Dewey 1934/1980, p. 37, original italics).

The simultaneous delivery and consumption of pleasures of different kinds could also bear on the formation of retrospective global judgments and on the subjective experience itself. Different pleasures consumed simultaneously may alter each other’s intensity in such a way that retrospective judgments may no longer be a simple averaging matter but rather a function of the sequencing and balance among the different pleasures. Further, combinations of different pleasures may reduce the onset of habituation, boredom or otherwise satiety that takes place within a consumption episode and alter the experience itself. The resulting experience may be one where hedonic reactions and behavioral manifestations over time form a pattern unforeseen by traditional approach-avoidance models.

**Proposition 3: Approach/avoidance consequences**

Consistent with past research in categorization (Rosch and Mervis, 1975), we propose that basic-level pleasure prototypes convey more, and more specific information about category members than the unitary pleasure at the superordinate level, while being more parsimonious than subordinate level in discriminating between categories. This has significant impact in understanding the approach-avoidance manifestations of pleasure. Since basic level prototypes are the most accessible memory representation of a concept when a relevant stimulus is encountered (Rosch et al., 1976), they are also likely to be most influential in shaping subsequent behavior. This challenges the currently prevailing assumption that one can infer the behavioral impact of a given “pleasure” intensity, regardless of the affective qualities of the experience. Consider, for instance, the affective qualities that may be more typical of intellectual pleasures than of pleasure in general, such as anxiety, contentment, and nervousness. The pleasurable experience of a given intensity that entails such a complex portfolio of positive and negative emotions is likely to have decision making and behavioral correlates distinctively different from other types of pleasure of the same intensity. These unique behavioral and decision patterns are unlikely to be uncovered when researchers treat pleasure as a “general” superordinate concept. Overlooking such defining differences among pleasures may well lead to incomplete interpretations and conclusions with regards to the approach-avoidance properties of various types of hedonic experiences (Higgins, 1997).

We propose that pleasures of different kinds may differentially contribute to overall approach tendency. Consider, for instance, the implications of the four pleasure prototypes for the temporal frames of pleasure and their underlying psychological processes. As Elster and Loewenstein (1992) argued, the overall utility of an event is the summation of the utility derived from anticipating, experiencing and remembering that event. Even if a large share of the total pleasure is likely to be derived from the experience or consumption proper for all prototypes, there may still be considerable variations between different pleasures in terms of their moment-to-moment unfolding. Consider the experience of intellectual pleasure that includes a strong sense of accomplishments with feelings of anxiety and nervousness. This type of experience is likely to color in important ways processes such as how pleasure unfolds, including the amount of attention available to non-focal pleasure-eliciting activities.

**FUTURE DIRECTIONS**

Perhaps the most challenging implication of a differentiated view of pleasure is the question of when and how different hedonic attributes collapse into a single, unitary state, or currency. Such a process is most likely to occur at the neural level if decision making and behavior are to be adaptive. At the neural level, Ledoux (1996) suggested that each emotional unit can be thought of as a set of inputs, an appraisal mechanism, and a set of outputs. The appraisal mechanism, akin to cognitive models of appraisal (e.g., Ellsworth and Smith, 1988) is programmed by evolution to detect certain inputs or trigger stimuli that are relevant to the function of the network. These networks evolve because they have the function of connecting trigger stimuli with responses that are likely to succeed in keeping the organism alive. Unidimensional dis/pleasure may be the common substrate that determines the relevance of a stimulus to the function of the neural network. However, the appraisal mechanism has the capacity to learn about stimuli that are associated with and predictive of the occurrence of natural triggers. Beyond general pleasantness, what multidimensional information on differentiated pleasures might be profitably preserved and processed?

On this issue, results from animal studies provide valuable insights. Shizgal and his colleagues (Shizgal, 1999; Shizgal and Conover, 1996) have studied pleasure (or more correctly the computation of utility) with rats. Based on experiments on the relationship between the rewarding effects of electrical brain stimulation and gustatory stimuli, they propose that brain stimulation reward arises from the electrical activation of neurons that convey a unidimensional representation of the utility of objects. It is the unidimensional character of this encoding that enables the electrical stimulation to produce a meaningful signal. However, they argue that survival and adaptive choices rely on multidimensional processing at earlier stages when physiological feedback exerts its specific influence on goal selection. For choice to be adaptive, the representation of the stimulus must retain qualitative information reflecting level of need, biological benefits, etc.

The question remains however, for animal as well as for human beings, as to what may be the contribution of unitary and differentiated components of pleasure that makes approach-avoidance responses most adaptive. Studies looking at expectations of monetary gains and losses (c.f. Shizgal, 1999) suggest that rewards of different kinds involve overlapping patterns of neural activation. Shizgal proposed a three-channel model that recognizes the common (unitary) nature of stimuli while allowing for differentiation at early stages of processing. Perceptual channels handle perceptual attributes and provide objective information. For choice to be adaptive, the distinct qualities of stimuli are preserved in an intermediate channel enabling the animal to account for type, amount, and even timing of reward. Finally, an action-oriented evaluative channel collapses multiple attributes of a stimulus into a single unidimensional signal. Moving from the intermediate to the action-evaluative channel is most probably when the specific information contained in the differentiated prototypes blend into a unitary signal of pleasure intensity. The answer to this and other unresolved aspects of hedonic information processing will have to
await theoretical and empirical developments, especially in terms of new measures of subjective experience and brain imagery techniques.

**CONCLUSION**

The challenge emerging from this review and our proposed model is to proceed with conceptual and methodological developments that integrate current knowledge of the different dimensions of the subjective experience of pleasure into existing decision-making and approach-avoidance models. This step is critical in order to better understand when and how different pleasures become and behave as a common currency. While, as Ledoux (1996) suggested, nonverbal and unconscious systems underlying hedonic experiences may render some dynamics inaccessible to techniques most frequently used in consumer research such as introspection and self-reports, new developments in brain imaging may one day allow us to determine if and how different pleasures correspond to different realities at a neurological level. In the meantime, consumer researchers need to acquire a better understanding of the differences between pleasures and how these differences impact behavioral manifestations.

**REFERENCES**


Consumer and Happiness. An Approach to Integrate the Concept of Happiness into Marketing Theory

Pakize Schuchert-Güler, Freie Universität Berlin, Germany
Martin Eisend, Freie Universität Berlin, Germany
Holger Lütters, Freie Universität Berlin, Germany

ABSTRACT

This study makes an approach to integrate the concept of happiness into marketing theory. Happiness is defined and categorized with the state-trait-concept. We chose two qualitative methods: a focus group and ZMET (Zaltman Metaphor Elicitation Techniques) in order to affirm our assumptions and to point out the relevance of happiness in marketing. We derived a formula to interpret the value of happiness in concrete purchase situations. At the end of our study we mention some possibilities to integrate the concept of happiness into existing marketing and consumer behavior theories.

1 INTRODUCTION

Happiness is an issue rich in tradition. People were interested in this issue ever since. Scientific discussion about happiness seemed to be reserved mainly to philosophers for a rather long time. Other scientific disciplines seldom dealt with the issue of happiness. However, in the last years other scientific disciplines like sociology, biology, economy, politics etc. developed interest for this topic. All these disciplines look for a definition, determinants and possible consequences of happiness, and the reciprocity with similar phenomena like for instance welfare. Happiness is still to be scientifically discussed in marketing (cf. Assael 1995). Though happiness is mentioned in consumer research as an emotional state, it is not discussed any further (Kroeber-Riel/Weinberg 1996: 54; Mowen 1993: 182). There are only a few empirical studies which deal with the construct of happiness in the context of “locus of control” but not even these studies are very specialized (Rinehart 1998; Srinivasan 1992).

We try to show whether and how the issue of happiness can be used to benefit consumer research and marketing research. First of all, we try to define and categorize the concept of happiness. Within the empirical part of the study, we use two qualitative surveys: a focus group and a method based upon the ZMET-analysis. With the help of these two methods, we find first results describing the relevance of happiness and the kind of happiness people experience in purchase and consumption situations. These results help us to find links to the discussion of happiness within marketing theory as well as possible implications for the practice.

2 DEFINITION AND CATEGORIZATION OF HAPPINESS

2.1 Approaches to define happiness

Happiness is a broad concept with a lot of different facets (Barrow 1980: 64ff; Veenhoven 1984: 13ff). This becomes obvious if we take a look at the philosophical history of this issue. Ancient philosophers were mainly interested in the ability to influence and foresight happiness. They related happiness first of all to personal characteristics like special virtues and later on also to interpersonal, social and political affairs like justice or technological progress (Schaff 1999: 36ff). Nowadays, empirical research focusing on happiness is above all located in sociology, social and personality psychology and physiology. Economical and social sciences focus primarily on prosperity and welfare, psychology concentrates primarily on subjective well-being and physiology regards happiness as a bio-psycho-social unit of emotional processes (Mayring 1991). Similar to the research in physiology, consumer research deals with happiness as an emotion within psychological determinants of consumer behavior (cf. Kroeber-Riel/Weinberg 1996: 54 and 100). Some authors also describe ways to detect the emotional state of happiness by analyzing non-verbal communicational elements like the lift of the corner of one ‘s mouth, the lift of the cheeks and the hatching of the lower part of the eyes (Ekman/Friesen 1978).

2.2 The state-trait-concept

Obviously there are different concepts and meanings of happiness. Therefore, a more specialized categorization is required. The distinction between external and internal models of happiness are common in all scientific disciplines (cf. Otsch 1999). Happiness “from outside” is a state that depends on external and objective conditions, like material prosperity or consumption. Happiness “from inside” is a state that depends on internal and subjective judgments. With respect to the social-psychological tradition of consumer research as well as to empirical findings of prosperity and welfare research, it seems reasonable to deal with happiness “from inside”. That means we conceptualize happiness as a subjective phenomenon of internal states that are only partly influenced by objective factors. Happiness has a strong emotional component as well as a cognitive component so that happiness is based on an interaction between activation and subjective interpretation (Kroeber-Riel/Weinberg 1996: 56; Stock/Okun/Benin 1986). We follow a rather cognitive approach to explain happiness. That can be put down to the facts that there are less measurement problems compared to affective conceptualizations and that cognitive concepts are more appropriate to show ways to influence happiness (Michalos 1980). Furthermore the cognitive approach is more adaptive to subdivide the phenomenon happiness into four groups (cf. Mayring 1991: 74f.). absence of burden is a quite unspecific emotionally and cognitively determined well-being, joy and in part also the feeling of being lucky are restricted to concrete situations and are quite short-lived mainly emotional states, happiness goes further than the feeling of being lucky and it is not restricted to an actual situation and lastly, contentedness is a mainly cognitively determined state of well-being. We consider the state-trait-concept to be an appropriate concept to categorize happiness because it is based on psychological theory of emotions which considers a cognitive dimension to be an important component of all affective processes. This theory is quite similar to the understanding of happiness within consumer research. Besides, this concept has already been confirmed empirically (Mayring 1991: 87ff. and 1999: 160; Veenhoven 1991: 15). “State” stands for an actual and

1 According to social indicator research, people who live under favourable objective conditions can feel unhappy (dilemma of discontent) whereas people under unfavourable objective conditions can feel happy and be satisfied (paradox of satisfaction) (cf. Zapf 1984).
3.1 Preliminary study

3.1.1 Methodological principles of the focus group

Contrary to classical exploration that tries to get insight into individual behavior, opinions and attitudes, the focus group wants to obtain a broad perspective of opinions, ideas and expectations. These opinions are generated through the conversation in a small group.

We have chosen a focus group because we regard this method as being the best way to generate starting points for new concepts. This method was useful to draw the structure of our approach and to find useful and continuing thoughts (cf. Bünning et al. 1981: 79).

Relevant literature and practical experiences both suggest a group size of six to ten persons. These people should discuss the topic with the guidance of a trained person. Discussions should go on for about 90 minutes and be recorded on tape or video. Situational conditions of the discussion should be similar to an everyday conversational situation where opinions are formed and changed. Mutual motivation by the participants of the discussion is an advantage of focus groups where detailed comments and statements are born and possible inhibitions are reduced. Analyzing recordings can throw light on hidden motives, attitudes, etc. The process of opinion formation, the main focus of the discussion or even non-verbal reactions of the participants can serve as useful indicators for an analysis.

3.1.2 Implementation of the preliminary study

The focus group took place on August 25th 2000 at the Free University, Berlin. The group consisted of students and employees of the Free University, Berlin. We took a random sample of ten persons which got no preliminary information to guarantee the same conditions. At last three female and two male participants aged between twenty-four and thirty-three attended the focus group. After a short introduction, the presenter explained the topic (happiness) to the participants. The further process followed the rules of qualitative methods. In order to stimulate associations the topic was formulated in three questions written on a flip chart. The questions were: What is happiness? How does happiness feel like? When do you experience happiness in everyday-life? After presenting the questions, participants were asked to give their permission for the conversation to be recorded. They were also pointed out the scientific use of the discussion. The conversation lasted 80 minutes. The flow of the discussion and thereby the motivation of the participants could be maintained by mentioning some quite provocative proverbs ("Everyone is the architect of his own future", "You can lead a horse to water but you can't make him drink").

3.1.3 Results of the preliminary study

We used a content analysis method to structure the recording of the focus group. According to Mayring (1983) and Salcher (1978), content analysis looks into the frequencies and categories of the relevant statements. We focused on aspects and qualities related to the phenomenon of happiness, fields and determinants of the concept and experiences with happiness during purchase and consumption.

The main qualities related to happiness are:

- **Happiness is a temporal phenomenon**
  the duration of feeling happy and the experiences with happiness are limited, the time is not determinable ("Happiness is a brief experience")
- **Happiness does not remain steady**
- **Happiness has different intensities**
  - **Happiness is a subjective feeling**

---

\(^2\) Comments within quotation marks are verbatim quotations of the participants of the focus group.
Happiness is experienced quite differently by individuals (“Happiness is individual”)

-Happiness is an emotion or emotional state
Happiness is a state of activation that is experienced and judged as a pleasant feeling (“Happiness is related to your heart”)

-Happiness can partly be influenced
Happiness can be influenced by external and internal factors

Analyzing the discussion we found different ways to categorize the concept happiness:

- by the different qualities of happiness like joy, satisfaction etc.
- by the means that help us to achieve happiness: one can experience happiness under social conditions (leisure time, relationship, family, friends, peer groups) and under individual conditions (consumption, special events). Material as well as immaterial means can trigger off emotions like happiness.

The participants identified different intrinsic variables (e.g. personality) and extrinsic variables (e.g. situations) as determinants of happiness. The attribution theory (c.f. Kelley 1967) seems to be appropriate to explain these factors. Attribution theory as a cognitive approach describes how people relate or attribute their experiences to causes. This theory tries to explain when which types of attribution emerge and how the attribution of certain causes influences the behavior of the person. The following example shows the relation to attribution theory. People usually tend to attribute positive feelings of passing an exam, solving a difficult problem or handling an unpleasant situation to themselves. Thus, it is one’s own efforts and skills that give a reason for positive feelings. In the case of attribution of success to a certain situation (for instance if the questions of the examination were quite easy), it is coincidence that is described as the main determinant for the experience of happiness.

The evaluation of the focus group with respect to the topics consumption and happiness suggests the following insights. The participants experienced happiness above all by going shopping since they considered it as a willful and conscious experience. On the one hand, positive feelings are related to the experience of “shopping” as a whole. On the other hand, participants experienced happiness by making unplanned purchases, especially bargains (for instance, when someone finds a high-quality brand product with an unexpectedly reduced price or when somebody finds a product that means a lot to this person).

We also tried to find a definition of happiness that is appropriate to marketing theory by analyzing the individual statements of the participants as well as the theoretical considerations described in chapter 2. People don’t experience happiness as trait when they buy something but rather as a feeling restricted to a situation. That corresponds exactly to the concept of happiness as state. Thus, it can be assumed that the state-trait-concept has relevance even to marketing theory. All relevant elements of the state-trait-concept could be identified. With regard to marketing theory, the relevance of the separate units that serve to derive useful conclusions for marketing practices seems to be more interesting. The elements of the state-trait-concept (cf. figure 1) can be ordered into two categories: a subjective category and a situation restricted category. However, neither subjective experience of happiness nor the restriction to a situation can be fully detected by analyzing only focus group or individual depth interviews. Thus, participants have to be briefed more intensively. Mentioning merely the main topic is not enough. In order to approach the relevant categories we tested a new, innovative method based on ZMET analysis. This method provides a check of the first insights of the focus group with concrete experiences. ZMET is described in the following section.

3.2 Main survey

3.2.1 Methodological principles of ZMET

The Zaltman Metaphor Elicitation Technique (ZMET) is based on theoretical ideas about mental models. Mental models steer human behavior and thinking by using constructs and metaphors. The method provides deeper insights into latent as well as active wants or expectations concerning the occurrence of positive events for the consumer (Zaltman 1997; Zaltman/Coulter 1995). Basic assumptions of ZMET are: most human communication is non-verbal communication, thoughts are mainly based on images and metaphors are the basics of emotions and cognition. ZMET uses visual and other sensorial objects, e.g. photos or drawings, and obtains thereby those metaphors.

We have modified the ZMET by selecting and combining basic steps of the method that seemed appropriate to our research question. The selected steps were story-telling, missed aspects and images, and sorting of objects. We added a diary method. This method is the so-called Collective Note Book Method (CNBM), that is also used in the context of creative techniques (cf. Salcher 1978: 209). Using CNBM, we were able to register concrete situations that are related to happiness more consciously for they were noted down independent of the time of their occurrence.
The situational category is characterized either by an unexpected focus on the product related consumption experience of happiness. As mentioned before we derived from storytelling, results related to events (point 3 and 4) were also derived from missed aspects and images. As a result, the subjective category is either related to a product or an event. Results related to products (point 1 to 3) were above all derived from storytelling, missed aspects and images delivered to the consumer. Thus, the intensity of the experience of happiness depends on surprise as well as the impact of the objects to the consumer. Hence, the intensity of the moment of happiness (value of happiness) can be described with the following components⁴:

\[
H_{t+1} = H_{t0} + S_i \times I_o
\]

with

\[
H = \text{value of happiness experienced by a person before } (H_{t0}) \text{ and after } (H_{t+1}) \text{ the consumption situation}
\]

\[
S_i = \text{individual degree of surprise in a situation, measured by}
\]

\[
1 - p \text{ (the improbability } (i) \text{ of the occurrence of a situation } (s) \text{ or event)}
\]

\[
I_o = \text{impact of the object } (o) \text{ to a person } (i), \text{ bandwidth of measure from -1 for highest negative impact to +1 for highest positive impact}
\]

The application of this hypothetical formula is restricted to the product related experience of happiness that depends on both components, surprise and impact. However, event related experiences of happiness, e.g. shopping, is not necessarily dependent on surprise. Besides, the formula is limited to happiness as state and not applicable to happiness as trait. Happiness as trait can certainly be generated by another means than those mentioned here.

3 Comments within quotation marks are verbatim quotations of the participants of the main survey.

4 Rescher describes a similar formula (1995: 211). Besides, probability theory has been concerned with the options to calculate happiness for instance in relation to games of chance for more than 300 years. Here luck means the same as chance.
4 CONCLUSIONS FOR MARKETING THEORY AND PRACTICE

In the following section we present potential links to the integration of our results into existing marketing theories and concepts. These links are to be found at every stage of the consumer decision process.

Regarding different kinds of consumer decision processes, the surprise effects suggest that we deal with unplanned purchases (cf. Assael 1995:155). This is also indicated by the examples of purchases mentioned by the participants of the surveys. However, our study deals only with two of the four categories of unplanned purchases detected by Assael. These two categories are: the “memory effect” and “impulsive purchases”. Nowadays, it is well-known that unplanned purchases play an important role within consumer behavior. The link of happiness to unplanned purchases gave us the idea to derive first implications for the arrangements of the point of sale and also for product presentation.

In the first phase of the decision process, consumers gather and process information. The construct “happiness” seems to have relevance for the models of product choice and especially for the model “by chance” that is used in consumer behavior research (cf. McFadden 1981: 198ff). In this model, the judgment of uses and the following choice of a product are influenced by many factors. These factors are instable in time, are hard to measure or are completely unknown. Therefore, it is obvious that consumers’ decision-making is considered as a probabilistic process underlying the concept and methodological principles of uses of chance. The use that an object has for the consumer consists of a deterministic and a stochastic component. The first component describes the systematic influence of product qualities perceived by the consumer and his personal qualities. That corresponds to the mentioned component “impact”. The second component describes all influences “chance” has on the individual judgment of the uses of a product, which corresponds to the surprise effect.

Product-choice-models deal with the external information acquisition, whereas the theory of semantic networks explains internal information processing. Within this theory, associations are differentiated according to their quality and intensity (cf. Klix 1988). Especially, the intensity of an association that stands for the proximity of two concepts corresponds to the inverted relation to the surprise effect. Therefore, only weakly associated concepts, like brand and cheap price can lead to a strong surprise effect. At the same time, we can use the theory of semantic networks to explain the subjective component of happiness (see also figure 1). The abstract and ideal ideas of a product saved as mental schemata represent latent or conscious wants of consumers that correspond also to the expectations of the occurrence of positive events.

Another point that is relevant after consumers make a purchase decision is the concept of consumer satisfaction. Consumer satisfaction is defined as the difference between expectations before purchasing and experiences made after the purchase. Recent studies point out that customers not only need to be satisfied but also delighted (Oliver et al. 1997; Vanhamme et al. 2000). Customer delight is considered as an extreme level of satisfaction. This fact corresponds to our categorization of different kinds of happiness (as joy, delight, satisfaction, cf. Mayring 1991: 69ff.). It is especially the broad concept of happiness that can explain the cognitive aspect of consumer satisfaction as well as its emotional aspect. With our proposed concept of product or service related happiness there seems to be a mean to generate consumer delight in addition to consumer satisfaction.

5 SUMMARY AND PERSPECTIVE FOR FURTHER RESEARCH

The purpose of the presented study was to provide a definition and categorization of happiness that is appropriate to marketing and consumer behavior theory. We defined happiness using the state-trait-concept. A focus group indicated that - in marketing - we deal above all with happiness as state. For this category of happiness it is necessary to differentiate between a subjective and a situational category. Both categories could be identified within the main survey. As a result, we developed a formula that determined happiness in a concrete purchase situation. We have also pointed out possible approaches to integrate the concept of happiness into existing theories of consumer behavior research. Further research should focus on the measuring of the construct of happiness, its determinants and consequences and should be aware of the interaction between emotion and cognition. Besides there should be consideration of the broad concept of happiness and the impact of different kinds of happiness (especially happiness as state and trait) and their interaction. We also regard CNBM and ZMET as an interesting and innovative method to generate preliminary results on this kind of topic. Nevertheless there is need for more validation like e. g. the use of the experience sampling method (cf. Csikszentmihalyi 1990).

REFERENCES


ABSTRACT

We use an experiment to investigate the behavioral reaction component of consumer anger and anxiety during air travel and to show that the impact of these emotions on consumer evaluations is a function of the context specific nature of this component rather than of the overall subjective feeling state. We show that the behavioral reaction component elicited during anger and anxiety varies significantly from behavioral reactions in non-consumption contexts. Further, the impact of these emotions on consumer evaluation of the provider reaction to their emotions is a function of the correspondence between the consumer’s behavioral reaction and the provider response.
Interpretivist and Positivist Insights into Museum Consumption:
An Empirical Enquiry into Paradigm Compatibility
Andrea Davies, University of Exeter, United Kingdom
James A. Fitchett, University of Exeter, United Kingdom

ABSTRACT
This paper examines the potential of cross paradigmatic and multi-method research in terms of research practice. It draws on two independent empirical studies which examine the common question of museum consumption from alternative paradigmatic perspectives, i.e., from the positivist and interpretivist traditions. The commonality, contrasts and contradictions uncovered when comparing the two studies from different paradigmatic roots shows the charge of incommensurability to be extreme. The structural dichotomy of research paradigms, and the use and construction of appropriate research discourses, have the potential to limit creativity in consumer research and obscure a common underlying paradigmatic heritage.

INTRODUCTION
Since the organisation of consumer research into a more or less coherent discipline or sub discipline, there has been a general commitment to interdisciplinary achievements (Kernan 1995), with paradigm diversity being broadly welcomed as constructive and progressive (Kavanagh 1994). It remains unclear as to whether paradigm diversity locates consumer research as pre-paradigmatic (Canella and Paetzold 1994), experiencing a paradigmatic ‘shift’ (Kuhn 1970), or one that in some way has matured or been liberated (Anderson 1986, Firat and Venkatesh 1995). On-going and unresolved debates concerning paradigmatic orientation clearly illustrate that many academics involved with consumption related enquiry have come to recognise that assumptions regarding material or mental determinism of social reality drive the research questions and the methods considered appropriate to apply (Hirschman 1992).

The identification of structural dichotomies to help contextualise and simplify paradigmatic issues and the subsequent demarcation of ‘positivism’ and ‘interpretivism’ as representing unified yet opposite and competing ways of generating knowledge (Calder and Tybout 1989; Hudson and Ozanne 1988), is a lasting legacy of early attempts to draw attention to the epistemological premises underlying consumer research enquiry. The permanence of the interpretivist/ positivist classification together with the subsequent demarcation of qualitative/ quantitative methodologies can perhaps be more clearly understood as an expression and consequence of structuralist thinking which had a particularly salient influence in American consumer research throughout the 1980’s, a time when methodological plurality was also topical. The outcome of these methodological enquiries, which retain credibility in mainstream consumer research texts today (Solomon et al, 1999), seem to ratify the belief that the aims, methods and research communities associated with ‘positivist’ or ‘interpretive’ research cannot be combined and integrated. Different philosophical assumptions have made it seem impossible to agree on the appropriate use of qualitative and quantitative methods, or to find a common set of criteria to evaluate the quality of research for all paradigms (e.g. Hunt 1991, Thompson 1990). Differences in researchers’ personalities (Brown 1999; Hirschman 1985; Leong et al 1994), socialisation and cultural environments (Anderson 1986; Hirschman 1992; Trocchia and Berkowitz 1999) suggest that there is little, or perhaps no choice in the paradigmatic orientation researchers adopt as their own. That research paradigms can be conceived of as human or social constructions (Anderson 1986; Kuhn 1970) and that researcher choice is partly predetermined by social factors may foster a degree of resignation to claims of paradigm incommensurability. Such a development would be unfortunate and can only serve to fragment the field rather than encouraging the discipline to develop and build on current paradigm liberalism such as that advocated by Glen-Mick (1999) who, among others, continues to call for consumer researchers to explore the possibilities of multi-method, cross-paradigmatic and transdisciplinary research.

Some authors in both ‘positivist’ and ‘interpretivist’ camps have focused on the value added to research designed with some form of triangulation and mixed methods. Although the conceptualisation and use of triangulation differs in positivist and interpretivist perspectives, most studies have failed to recognise that the mixing of methods cannot be seen as synonymous with combining ‘positivist’ and ‘interpretivist’ world views, or the pursuit of cross-paradigmatic research (Silverman 1997). Positivist research integrates qualitative methods into quantitative research as a form of variable identification (Blumer 1967). Similarly, while an interpretivist may have used a numerical based analysis, this analysis is seen as a descriptive narrative constructed by the researcher (Charmaz 1995) which can be given no greater credibility than other discourses of explanation. Whilst there are examples of studies using a mixture of qualitative and quantitative methods (e.g. Nancarrow et al 1996; McQuarrie and Mick 1992), and others where attention has been given to the benefits of triangulation (Arnould and Price 1993), these studies and their use of mixed methods are typically based on one set of philosophical and ontological beliefs. A problem common to a liberal integrationist stance is that qualitative and quantitative methods are not given equal authority in the findings and conclusions drawn from empirical work (Hirschman 1985).

Phenomena-lead methodological choice, i.e. matching research paradigm and methods with the philosophical assumptions of the phenomena studied (Atkinson and Hamersley 1995; Lutz 1989) implies subject-specific limits to the application of cross-paradigmatic work. Phenomena-lead methodological choice holds that researchers could, or should, change their paradigmatic assumptions as they move from one subject of study to another, limited only by researchers aptitudes in more than one methodological area and willingness to venture beyond the comforts of tried and tested research methods (Lutz 1989). Some support for the viability of phenomena-lead paradigmatic choice can be found in the reported difficulties experienced by consumer researchers practising research within strict paradigmatic boundaries. Charges of the ‘muddling of method’ (Baker et al 1992), the ‘stand between’ metaphor (Charmaz, 1995) as a description of research practice, and Heath’s (1992) boundary blurring description of consumer researchers as ‘liberal naturalists’ or ‘conservative humanists’ suggests that strict theoretical justification for paradigmatic choice at least in terms of practice might be problematic. There would therefore appear to be a certain incongruency in the conceptualised
paradigmatic divide between ‘positivism’ and ‘interpretivism’ and the lived experience of conducting consumer research. The debate and defence surrounding the commensurability of research paradigms is sustained largely at a conceptual level and by the social institutions and alliances that form the identity and agenda of consumer research sub-communities (Hoffman and Holbrook 1993).

Calls for transdisciplinary and cross paradigmatic research implies that some in the discipline are questioning the utility of epistemological fundamentalism as desirable hypothesis for single research projects or papers. The challenge to these endeavours remains an examination of paradigm incommensurability at an empirical as well as a theoretical level, with attention being given to the practice or exposition of appropriate ways of generating cross-disciplinary knowledge. One starting point, and perhaps the strongest test of commensurability, and the issues involved with cross-paradigmatic research, is to join, cross or mix two paradigms from across the meta-paradigmatic divide.

METHODOLOGICAL APPROACH

Here we aim to detail the diversity and complexity of mixed paradigm consumer research not in terms of design, but rather in terms of practice, interpretation and use. The lack of broadly comparable case studies undertaken in similar research contexts has also hindered the exploration of paradigm commensurability as practised as opposed to conceptualised. We employ what can be broadly understood as a textual analytical perspective. That is, taking each of the two studies as texts we can consider the discursive framing, historical contexts and settings in which they were prepared and conducted. The aim of the analysis is to deconstruct the qualitative or descriptive contrasts evident in the two studies, to compare their respective assumptions and justifications, identify agreement and disagreement in the main findings, and to highlight the paradigmatic contradictions held within each study.

Two independent empirical studies which focused on museum consumption and the explanation of the museum visiting experience as a consumption experience are examined. The two studies were conducted in Scotland, UK between 1995 and 1997. Study A (Davies 1999) was undertaken in accordance with what would be identified as a positivist paradigm whereas Study B (Fitchett 1998, Fitchett & Saren 1998) was undertaken in the interpretivist tradition. The independence of the two studies in terms of design, field work and analysis offers a rare opportunity from which to explore the value-added, convergence, contradictions and problems of mixed paradigm research. Our present examination explores the limits of the incommensurability thesis uncontaminated by the compromises that can be incurred from an integrationist or pluralist stance. The present examination is grounded first and foremost in the empirical insights the two studies profess to offer so that the areas of compatibility and contradiction can be explored in terms of data rather than conceptual premise.

THE TWO STUDIES

Study A takes the traditional psychological/ behaviourist paradigm in consumer research as its basis, applying the Theory of Planned Behaviour to compare several predictive models of museum visiting behaviour, based on a stratified spatial random sample of 400 individuals, and using a two-stage structural equation modelling analysis technique. The intangible experiences outcomes shared by museum visitors, and disliked, or undervalued by museum non-visitors, is offered as the basis for enlarging the explanation of museum visiting and non-visiting behaviour by improved descriptive depth and predictive validity.

Study B draws heavily on Marxist and Post Marxist critical theory to examine whether the museum experience is organised in terms of a commodity code, and visiting a museum as an act of consumption. Study B offers a cultural/macro explanation of museum visiting, identifying the cultural processes which have enabled ‘aspects’ history and culture (museum exhibitions) to become represented and consumed as commodities. Based on a naturalistic methodology where 40 qualitative interviews are supplemented with photographs to ensure sensitivity to the natural setting, the design of the study aims to maximise thickness and depth and stresses the authority of the author in developing/presenting the description and interpretation the museum experience.

Both studies clearly justify their chosen research philosophies and conduct, analyse and report the research process in accordance with the principles ascribed to their respective methodologies. Study A presents data by drawing on conventions of quantitative modelling. Study B relies upon textual data and description. Study A maintains a focus on individual cognitive processes to explain museum visiting whereas Study B focuses exclusively on the explication of socio-structural codes to describe and understand the experience. Quantitative citation analysis (Davies & Fitchett 2000) further confirms Study A as subsumed within a ‘positivist’ mode of inquiry and the identity of Study B as within the ‘interpretivist’ tradition. Study B, consistent with the ‘newer’ or ‘radical’ element of consumer research and committed to a macro-analysis draws more heavily than Study A on disciplines out with mainstream consumer research, including sociology, anthropology and cultural studies. In contrast Study A, consistent with the characteristics of a maturing subject area (attitude-theory) draws less heavily on proximal parent disciplines, relying to a greater extent on self-references to both attitude theory and research design developed within the field of consumer behaviour.

A MARKETING ZEITGEIST

When analysed as a socially and historically located phenomenon marketing science can be shown to have common traits or dominant themes. For instance, broadly speaking one can identify periods when the discipline has been almost totally pre-occupied with psychological and economic theory to explain the behaviour of individual consumers, and other periods when social psychology and group processes theory was more widely used. The decision as to exactly what should become a major influence in the generation of consumer research knowledge is of course emergent and organic rather than explicitly planned by any one group or institution. It is dependent on the concerns and interests pervasive in broader society, the academic backgrounds of new consumer research scholars entering the field, as well as audiences out with academia who have an interest in consumer research. ‘This spirit of the times’ or ‘zeitgeist’ can perhaps be understood as providing a general backdrop or motivation which underlies the direction of the field.

The rationale for each study to consider a more or less identical subject (museum consumption experiences) is not coincidental but demonstrates the importance of location or environment, both in terms of disciplinary socialisation and broader social and cultural contexts. Both studies were conducted in the mid 1990’s when ideas relating to postmodernism, consumer culture, and consumption symbolism were becoming common aspects of marketing thought. The questioning of traditional disciplinary boundaries which located consumer research in commercial product based contexts, as well the opportunity to further empirically examine increasingly popular conceptual ideas concerning the
consumption experience, tourism and leisure activities as market-
ing related processes, provides a nominal explanation for the com-
mon research basis. The following extracts from the early chaps-
ters of both studies highlights the common research objectives
resulting from the zeitgeist of ideas in marketing at the concep-
tion of the studies. These include: 1) defining the consump-
tion experience, 2) extending the study of consumption to non-commercial
settings, and 3) an interest in what has been called post-modern
consumer behaviours.

**Study A:** “In an over-supplied heritage attractions market… and against a background of increasingly de-
demanding and discerning consumers bent on avid ‘experi-
ence’ seeking of the past, present and future… it has now
become a matter of urgency for museum professionals to
understand the determinants of museum visiting intentions,
customer satisfaction and the potentials for market develop-
ment…. Studies from diverse literatures beyond heritage
research have been relatively more substantial in their con-
cern with consumption experiences… An examination of
studies from [consumer research] offer[s] potential clas-
sifications of experience useful to understand the possible
‘nature’ of the museum experience, and to forward the con-
ceptual development of a research agenda focused on
consumer and non-consumer experiences of heritage
consumption…The overall aim of the thesis is to contribute
to the understanding and knowledge of museum consump-
tion behaviour framed within an experiential methodological
approach.”

**Study B:** “The museum profession, like many other
‘culture industries’, has had to respond to a changing
environment. The structure of public funding together with
the limitations placed on national and regional government
expenditure has meant that many museums have been
forced to reconsider their priorities and strategies for con-
tinued survival… As a consequence, the role of the visitor
has undergone somewhat of a metamorphosis. As museums
become organised like businesses, visitors become increas-
ingly redefined as consumers. The problem however, which is
central to this investigation, is what exactly constitutes
the museum commodity? If museum visitors are consum-
ers, then what do they consume? The museum, as a site of
consumption, presents several problems in terms of existing
theories of consumer behaviour, namely the lack of any
economic exchange, material acquisition or functional util-
ity relating to ‘needs’. The primary objective of this empiri-
cal investigation is to examine whether a semiotic, cultural
theory of consumption can be applied to understand mu-
seum consumption.”

The social, historical and disciplinary basis of the two studies
clearly identifies significant areas of similarity, and in some key
respects the premise for both studies is common. Despite clear
paradigmatic differences both studies can be seen to share these
common underlying themes and motivations. Whilst these com-
monalities in terms of what we refer to as the ‘marketing zeitgeist’
do not necessarily undermine or marginalise methodological dif-
fferences, it does place methodological questions in an appro-
ropriate context and further problematises dogmatic representations of
methodological commensurability associated with a phenome-

nalized logic to making methodological choices. To some extent
consumer research conducted under different paradigmatic as-
sumptions yet at common times, places, and with similar pre-

occupations, concerns and common world views would be ex-
pected to have considerable inter changability.

**COMPARATIVE ASSESSMENT OF FINDINGS FROM STUDY A & STUDY B**

Both studies confirm their respective schematic premises, namely Study A confirms the explanation of the museum experi-
ence using the Theory of Planned Behaviour and Study B finds
support for the macro/ cultural commodification thesis. The two
sets of findings in terms of their central premise neither compli-
ment nor contradict one another. Study A reports its findings with
little concern for the cultural, historical or social conditions of
consumer behaviour in the context of the museum and Study B
offers little behavioural explanation for respondents actions. Of
course it would be erroneous to assume that the fact that both
studies confine the use of their results within their own selected
theoretical frameworks as an indication of paradigmatic differ-
ence. The coherence and rigour demanded of all research, whether
interpretivist or positivist, by necessity leads to specialised modes
of enquiry.

As a result of textual analysis the findings evident in both
studies, whilst leading to somewhat disparate ends, do share some
common traits which are of interest to our current paradigmatic
exploration. These common findings might support a positivist
view that triangulation offers a useful methodological procedure
to uncover aspects of the consumption reality using more than one
method of analysis. An interpretive perspective on the other hand
would argue that common research findings from seemingly oppo-


stitutional methodological schools indicates more fundamental areas
of agreement within the discipline as a whole. The main areas of
commonality were identified with:

1. Visitors’ perceptions of authenticity
2. The issue of active participation and construction of
   the museum experience
3. Visitors’ desire to maintain a degree of personal
   control and to take responsibility for the museum
   experience.

**CONSUMPTION AS ACTIVE ENDEAVOUR**

Both studies identify consumer research as having tradition-
ally viewed consumption as a passive activity, with the main focus
being on the object of consumption and the manner in which it is
provided or supplied. The two studies use empirical evidence to
argue that consumption in a museum context is a mutually con-

structive process involving active interpretation and
personalisation/singularisation, furthering contemporary ideas of
consumer as producer (or co-producer) of the consumption expe-

ience:

**STUDY B:** When visitors come into contact with museum
artefacts, they use this experience to make stories about the past. In some cases this narrative construction was highly
personal, relating to aspects of the visitors own past. This
was particularly evident in the Museum of Transport with
visitors who could remember the exhibits when they func-
tioned as vehicles of public transport. In producing these
stories about the past, visitors used the artefacts to structure
their narratives, as if by being close to objects, the memories
and stories about the past were more visual and more real
and therefore more useful for visitors when constructing
their own narratives. … Museum artefacts have a unique
use value for visitors in the sense that no other form of
presentation can provide this insight into the past or provide
the components for this type of narrative construction. Visitors did not only construct stories around objects they had personal experience of but also with objects from periods beyond their own life time or from other cultural spaces.

**STUDY A:** Imagineering or the professional dreaming-up of three dimensional fantasies which are planned and reconstructed for the total experience has become common place in our developing urban landscape ...are characteristic of postmodern society as hyperreality (Eco 1986, Postman 1985, Firat 1997, van Raaij 1993). In terms of perceived positive reactions to the museum exhibitions, the idea and object based museums were found to significantly diverge in terms of hedonic cognitions and wakeful daydreaming, personal and non-personal imagery (Hirschman and Holbrook 1982). In particular, strong differences were noted for 'feeling the past is brought to life' (p<.000, Cramer’s V = .38) and 'creating images in your mind of how and who used the objects' (p<.000, Cramer’s V = .36). For example, 80.0% of idea-based museum respondents said it was extremely or quite likely that the 'past would be brought to life' (p<.000, Cramer’s V = .38), compared to only 46.5% of object-based museum respondents. Similarly, more respondents in the idea-based museum thought it was extremely or quite likely (77.0%) that would 'creates images in their minds of how and who used the objects', compared to 46.0% respondents in the object-based museum sample (p<.000, Cramer’s V = .36), ...These findings confirm that the idea-based museum is far more effective at facilitating respondents' imaginations. 'Imagineering' has been shown as a positive and enabling change agent (Lumley 1994, 1988) rather than an inability to come to terms with the past with its associated experiences of nostalgia and escapism (Hewison 1987, Lowenthal 1985),(and)... the fourth dimension extracted from principal component analysis (to describe the structure of museum experience) represents the experiential cognitions described by Hirschman (1985). Variables which loaded significantly on this dimension included 'feeling a connection with the past', 'imagining what your life would have been like living in the past', 'imagining who used and how the objects were used' and 'feeling admiration for the skill and craftsmanship of people in the past'.

This area of common findings presents both studies with the opportunity to develop and progress their respective theoretical starting points although for very different reasons. Study A uses the finding to suggest that behavioural assumptions need to accommodate a greater level of individual action which it has tended to lack. Study B uses a similar finding to propose that commodity theory (which represents the consumer as being alienated from the productive sphere) needs to be modified to incorporate an active or interpretive component.

Paradigmatic debates makes single authoritative interpretations difficult. A broadly realist or objectivist perspective might suggest that the both studies are reporting on the same phenomenon but using alternative frames of reference or discourses to explain it. The phenomenon can be taken as an empirical reality viewed through alternative paradigmatic lenses. Such reasoning might add weight to the view of triangulation as a method of empirical verification and validation and would also underplay claims of paradigm incommensurability. Taking a slightly more social constructivist stance, one might consider the general trend in consumer research towards giving greater expression to consumer action (Firat and Venkatesh 1995), and a general validation of consumption as legitimate personal expression as sufficient cause for the commonality in findings.

**CONSUMERS SEEKING CONTROL AND EXPRESSIONS OF THE AUTHENTIC**

Behavioural theory suggests that individual action, including consumption actions are determined by external antecedents and that value is to a certain extent imposed (Study A). Commodity theory concurs with this assumption in that individual action is considered to be regulated and formulated by the social relations of the commodity form (Study B). Both studies argue for a greater recognition of individual facticity in value creation than is generally permitted by either behaviourist or cultural (structural) theories. Consumption experiences in which the consumer is permitted to take a significant degree of control are perceived as being of greater value and significance than those where control is restricted or maintained by some other group, such as producers of the museum experience:

**STUDY B:** The reality principle is a compromise. On one level a video presentation offers greater potential in terms of an accurate depiction of history because it can show far more than the objects alone. It can depict the artefact in use, and in particular, the ability of visitors to engage with the already vague and disappearing past. Since close proximity to objects is of principle concern to museum visitors, the video, film or picture media loses its authenticity because of the distance it imposes between artefact and the visitor. The object display, as seen in the museum, allows this disadvantage to be overcome - but at a price.... The visitors’ choice is unanimous. The object discourse is given principle value and the visitor is prepared to ignore and even fail to recognise, the obvious disadvantages.

**STUDY A:** The largest differences in perceptions of the two museums were related to the interpretative environment, and in particular, the ability of visitors to engage with the objects displayed and to interact with interpretive media. ‘Being able to touch objects’ (p<.000, Cramer’s V = .49), ‘using computers’ (p<.000, Cramer’s V = .43) and ‘using models’ (p<.000, Cramer’s V = .41) were all more strongly observed in the idea-based museum. For example, 43.0% of respondents rated ‘being able to touch objects’ as extremely likely in the idea-based museum compared to only 8.5% of respondents who found this to be the case for the object-based museum”.

The influence of post-modern thought, questions over authentic representation, hyper-reality, and the primacy of the image over referents are evidenced in both studies. The debate in the museum profession over the importance of the “authentic” and criticisms about the ‘disingenification’ of museum interpretation emerge as common traits. Both studies focus on issues of authenticity as a vehicle to contribute to this debate, namely, that rather than being an externally verifiable construct authenticity is in fact a subjectively constructed condition, i.e. something that is created by the consumer/visitor rather than being established by an
authoritative body. Even when museum exhibits were clearly not ‘real’ in the sense that they were not original or actual examples of the object being represented, consumers were able to find authenticity in the ‘fake’ on account of the significance of their own experience. Reality emerges from the experience of being in the position to experience and is not located in the object.

**REFLECTIONS & CONCLUSIONS**

The present focus on commonalities in terms of findings illustrates the obvious problems associated with arguments regarding paradigm incommensurability when considered solely on a theoretical or conceptual basis. The two studies are both highly conformist to their respective paradigmatic schools, yet report common findings and use similar explanations to justify and elaborate their discussions. The degree of commonality would seem to indicate that although one study could accurately be described as positivist and the other interpretivist, this difference is in practice mainly a methodological, or surface level feature. There would seem to be a shared underlying cause to both studies which is defined by some basic paradigmatic/disciplinary assumptions present in consumer research. A pragmatic option may well be to reject theoretical incommensurability in favour of methodological integration, where results from both interpretivist and positivist schools are accepted as providing insight. However, an integrationist approach requires that one research position is retained as central and consequently data from other research traditions are unlikely to match a required standard or criteria. A positivist study does, for instance, have to be selective about the kinds of insights integrated from an interpretive study due to the absence of valid and reliable measures. The lack of descriptive depth in positivist studies may hinder any potential contribution to an interpretive piece, although if positivist methodology is accepted as one possible narrative or discourse of explanation it is at least plausible to develop an integrationist approach from a interpretivist perspective.

The main area of contrast would appear to be between the need to adhere to the principles of research conduct, rather than whether the studies are interpretivist or positivist in design. This implies that the prevailing role of philosophy of science issues, especially dichotomous categorisations, is to adequately represent the phenomenological basis of consumer research. The discourses that are used in consumer research to report and ‘construct’ an accepted knowledge base clearly share a common basis and this common paradigmatic heritage needs greater representation to avoid other differences from being exaggerated.

**REFERENCES**


Silverman, David (1997), Qualitative Research, Theory, Methods and Practice, London: Sage


ABSTRACT

This paper discusses the possible influences of the Internet on researchers’ and respondents’ objectivity. Cyberspace is a new environment for consumer behavior research because it exists only in the mind of the participants. The author reflects on three years of e-mail interviewing and participant observation in interest groups on the Internet. What emerges is the possibility of a researchers’ metamorphosis into someone more like their subject. This can be a positive aspect of research because much can be learned by becoming a more like one’s subjects.

Consumer behavior on the Internet is attracting the interest of academic researchers who use traditional ethnographic methods (e.g., Moore 1995; Rheingold 1995; Turkle 1995). These researchers are observing and interviewing consumers in their natural setting (i.e., the Internet). Because the Internet is a new environment and appears to be different than the real world environments where research usually takes place, consumer researchers may need to reexamine some of their assumptions about methods, especially the level of objectivity they maintain while conducting depth interviews or participant observations. This new Internet environment—cyberspace—has not yet been clearly defined. It has been described as a consensual hallucination (Gibson 1984), a technological environment where humans can interact (Sterling 1990), and an environment where the individual perceives they are present (Steuer 1992). Certain words in these definitions (i.e., hallucination, perceives, interact, and technological) suggest that this environment may be different in some ways from the traditional research environments. Thus, Internet researchers should proceed with caution when observing or interviewing consumers.

Cyberspace is hypothetical. In reality, individuals become an integral part of cyberspace when they turn on their computer, stare at their web browser (e.g., Netscape), and send their electronic messages at the speed of light back and forth across the wire grid that is commonly called the Internet. While individuals interact in this manner, they may perceive they are in cyberspace; yet all that is cyberspace is in their computers, electronic messages, and wires. One explanation for this perception is that connecting up to the Internet may be an activity that allows individuals to escape the physical world to the virtual world. This virtual world is actually in their own minds (Lupton 1995; Turkle, 1995). In this context, this paper suggests that cyberspace may be a new type of research environment (i.e., it takes place in the mind) with its own set of influences on those who are active in it. These cyberspace influences consist of the computer mediated effects of diminishing socially desirable responses and increases in candor, the ease, intimacy, and immediacy of electronic communication and, the perception that cyberspace is a real place. The author’s online experience, which consists of a two year period of depth interviewing using e-mail and over fifty hours as a participant observer in an online chat group, is the basis for this discussion.

The purpose of this paper is to discuss the possible effects of online depth interviewing and participant observation on both interviewer and informant. First, virtual participant observation (VPO) and virtual depth interviewing (CDI) are described. Then, to aid in the understanding of virtual interviewing and participant observation, the previously studied effects of computer mediated communication (CMC) are discussed along with suggested new effects that are emerging as a result of an individual’s participation on the Internet. Examples of the effects identified in the author’s previous research are presented. Next, the possible effects are discussed through a metamorphosis that takes place in the interviewer, the informant, and their relationship. Last, this paper discusses the possible implications of a lessening of objectivity during the research process while gaining in understanding.

INTERNET RESEARCH METHODS

Virtual participant observation (VPO) occurs when the researcher joins an online chat group. Chat groups are gatherings of individuals with similar interests (e.g., stamp collecting or genealogy) who “chat” with one another in real time. VPO is similar to traditional participant observation in that interaction takes place in the social milieu (i.e., cyberspace) of the subjects and data is collected systematically and unobtrusively. It differs in that, (a) visual observation is absent, forcing the researcher to rely on observation of the messages that are sent back and forth; (b) all conversations are recorded electronically; and (c) instead of going out into the field, the researcher sits quietly in front of his or her computer screen, gathering the information from cyberspace.

Virtual depth interviewing (VDI) occurs when the researcher interacts, one-on-one in cyberspace, with an informant who has agreed to be interviewed. This electronic interview can take place in real time or in a more extended version using e-mail which involves sending messages back and forth in a timely manner. These e-mail messages are similar to verbal reports used in traditional ethnography. VDI is similar to traditional depth interviewing in that it is conversational in nature and is one-on-one; but it is not face-to-face, it is screen-to-screen. Thus, the researcher loses the opportunity to interpret or use visual cues. For example, unplanned prompts such as raising one’s eyebrow can not be used by the researcher. In addition, the researcher must rely on text for interpretation of the subject’s tone or emotional level which may limit the analysis.

Researchers, whether using participant observation or depth interviewing, are usually seeking understanding in a natural setting from the words or actions of the individuals involved in the phenomena. The collected data, which can take many forms (e.g., verbal reports, field notes, and videotapes), is then analyzed. Virtual depth interviewing and virtual participant observation appear to be similar in some aspects with the traditional ethnographic approaches to these methods but, more importantly, different in some aspects (e.g., no visual clues).

METHOD

The author’s involvement in two previous research projects form the basis for the current discussion. One project consisted of nine depth interviews conducted over the Internet for a period of two years. This project was a pilot study to develop potential variables that might have an influence on the allocation of Internet time. The second project involved participant observation in 50 hours of “chat room” discussions with a group of consumers on a major commercial service provider. This study examined word-of-mouth on the Internet.

The virtual depth interviews in this study were conducted using e-mail. This approach allows the researcher and the informant the ability to answer at their leisure in a more thoughtful manner. Real time interviewing, although capturing the moment, appears to be problematic for some informants because they do not want to
spend the continuous time online in an interview because of online cost or lack of sustained interest. Adopting the long interview approach of McCracken (1988), a prolonged, systematic e-mail communication between researcher and informant was initiated. Informants were solicited to participate by e-mail. If they agreed to participate, the researcher began a series of e-mails with each individual that involved asking questions, prompting them on their comments, and responding to the informant’s questions. The subject matter for this two-year study was an exploration of their involvement in computers and the Internet.

Virtual participant observation was accomplished by the author joining a retirement oriented forum (i.e., chat group) on a major commercial service provider. Membership in this forum is open to anyone. The forum met twice a week in real time on the Internet for at least an hour, sometimes longer, to discuss topics as health, weather, politics, or retirement living. Participation in a real time session requires some typing skills and a knowledge of how to send your message so that everyone in the group sees it. The individuals involved can just watch the discussion (i.e., lurking) or participate. Just watching can be difficult as the other participants will sometimes address the lurker (everyone knows who is attending), trying to engage them in the conversation.

**COMPUTERS AND INTERNET MEDIATED EFFECTS**

The level of autonomy in communication can influence socially desirable responses (Nederhof 1989; Paulhus 1984). This may be true for computer mediated communication (Kiesler and Sproull 1986; Lautenschlager and Flaherty 1989; Martin and Nagao 1989). The most common effects studied are that socially desirable responses of the individual diminish and that candor increases. In addition to these previously studied effects, this paper identifies other effects that may be emerging as more individuals use the computer as a means to communicate on the Internet. This paper adds to the discussion of computer mediated communication (CME) by introducing two new possible effects: (a) the perception that cyberspace is real and, (b) the ease, intimacy, and immediacy of electronic communication.

**Social Desirability and Candor**

Socially desirable responses involve two components: impression management and self-deception (Paulhus 1984). Impression management is when an individual consciously reports behaviors in a manner that emphasizes desirable behaviors and under emphasizes undesirable behaviors. For example, a conversation occurred between the author and an interviewee about Gallic humor. As an example of the humor, this informant emphasized a situation where they go, and how they act). The computer and the Internet can be an extension of the self. Online individuals name their hard drives, decorate their computer with human accessories like Looney Tunes mouse pads or screen savers with family photos (Terenzini 1997). Some even talk to their computer. As the individual interfaces with their computer, identity can become more fluid. In

**The Perception That Cyberspace is Real**

In addition to the lessening of socially desirable responses and increases in candor, the individual who goes online may also be influenced by the environment where they interact (i.e., cyberspace). Turkle (1995) suggests that computer users develop relationships with their computer. In many ways, they define themselves by how they use the computer and the Internet (i.e., by whom they meet, where they go, and how they act). The computer and the Internet can become an extension of the self. Online individuals name their hard drives, decorate their computer with human accessories like Looney Tunes mouse pads or screen savers with family photos (Terenzini 1997). Some even talk to their computer. As the individual interfaces with their computer, identity can become more fluid. In
discussing the cultural aspects of Internet use, Turkle suggests that users abdicate authority to the simulation. They don’t really care much about how the computer works; they assume that what appears on the screen is real. It is, as she says, “the seduction of simulation.” For example, one respondent while being interviewed by the author, began talking about the guilt that arose when cheating on a computer game. This suggested a possible deeper relationship with his computer. He states,

“Playing scrabble against the computer does seem as if you are playing another person...sometimes if the machine gets ahead of me.....I cheat.....Ridiculous isn’t it?”

Moore (1995) also supports the notion that cyberspace influences behavior when he suggests computer users confuse virtual reality with the physical world in the games they play and the places they visit online. This confusion may contribute to a situation that allows the user’s deepest fantasies to surface because it is safe online and the virtual reality personality you create can receive little direct criticism or retribution. Over time, individuals may begin to confuse their online personality with their real world personalities believing that who they are online is the same person as who they are off-line.

In addition to the influence of the cyberspace environment on individuals, the individual’s attitudes toward technology, especially when taken to an extreme, may also be a factor. Tse, et al. (1995, p.441) identified something that they called “...the intangible quality and mystique associated with electronic communications and advanced technology.” This attitude of mystique also appeared in the words of informants. The words “astounding” or “fascinated” which might be characterized as code words (Arnould and Wallendorf 1994) appear many times in the interviews conducted by the author and the chat discussions attended when discussing technology. These code words can be interpreted as the mystique of technology.

“I was fascinated by the concept of computers...”

“...the process became so clear, I was astounded”

“Yes, I am amazed at what technology can achieve...”

“As far as I can see, technology will bring us higher and higher...”

Because of this strong positive attitude toward the Internet, the individual’s perception of virtual reality can become biased and influence their interpretation of events or texts that appear on their screens. That is, they begin to believe everything they see on the Internet.

Intimacy, Ease, and Immediate of Electronic Communication

Many individuals, when logged on to the Internet, sit in the quiet of their office or study. They position themselves before their computer, undisturbed and undistracted, focusing on the screen while they type messages. Their thoughts appear on their screen as they think them. This environment of the Internet user suggests a sense of intimacy between the user and the screen. It can be a sense of oneness with the screen. This intimacy can influence objectivity. The user can become more friendly, more attached to the communications which appear on the screen. In addition, the design of most e-mail software allows for an ease and immediacy of communication. That is, response to an e-mailed question requires typing an answer. Then, with the click of the send button, the message is electronically sent over the Internet, painlessly and efficiently. Moore (1995, p. 45) speculates on why this ease and immediacy in e-mailing is important:

“...it can be sent so quickly, with a push of a button, and second later it arrives at its destination. This surely encourages the impulsive nature in the writer. Am I sure I want to say that? Oh hell, just send it.”

THE METAMORPHOSIS

This paper suggests that the method of communication and the environment used in virtual research (i.e., Computers and the Internet) will influence the informant, the researcher, and their communication. As the relationship between the researcher and informant or group progresses during the research process, a metamorphosis of the researcher can take place. The genesis of this metamorphosis begins early in the research process because cyberspace informants can easily refuse to be interviewed or terminate the interview before any meaningful information can be collected. The potential informant has little face-to-face guilt problems in saying “no” to the Internet researcher. Thus, to develop a successful research interaction, the interviewee must quickly find a level of cordiality and trust to entice and hold the informant’s interest. The interviewee cannot just ask questions because of the ease in which informants can end the interview. Cordiality can be quickly accomplished, but not without the loss of some objectivity because the researcher becomes more personal. If the researcher is successful in building cordiality to hold the informant’s interest, a relationship begins to develop and over time trust between the researcher and informant develops. As with most relationships neither side is completely passive. Without being asked, informants begin to ask their own questions of the researcher. For example,

“Charles, you know now a lot about me, I’d be glad to read a little about you by return. Please tell me shortly what is the kind of your studies and a little of your life”

“I’ve a couple of questions for you. About how many people have you surveyed in this project of yours? Are you concentrating on a certain age or other demographic group, are you trying to at representable sample of people online? Hope you are keeping cool. It’s pretty hot here right now.”

“Charles, before I answer your latest complex question, I have one for you.”

In each of these cases, the author felt it necessary to answer the informant. As for discussing the study with informants, the author was able to delay comment until the depth interview process was completed. The questions about the author’s personal history could not be delayed because of the need to build trust. Thus, the author began e-mailing messages about his own personal history to the informant. As a researcher shares their personal history, the relationship deepens and a lessening of objectivity may occur.

In addition, informants, because they are free to write what they want in the safety of their own home, begin to discuss matters other than originally planned by the researcher. When this occurs, the researcher can not easily ignore the informant’s request without jeopardizing the completion of the interview. For example, a British informant e-mailed the author:

“To change the subject completely - I wonder if you have any contacts in the USA publishing world? Two years ago I had open heart surgery and have had four bypasses. I wrote a short
book which my wife, who is a commercial artist, illustrated...

Any ideas?"

In this case, the author contacted a friend in publishing and wrote back some recommendations on what this informant should do to publish his book in the United States. For some informants, as trust grows and the effects of social desirability lessen, discussion sometimes became more personal. The informant appears to forget that an interview is taking place. One international informant began asking why none of his American friends had responded to the Thanksgiving Day greeting cards he had sent. The informant wanted to know if he had done something wrong. To maintain the relationship, the author discussed this issue with the informant although it had nothing to do with the research. In another example, one respondent began telling his life story without any prompting from the researcher. Most of the comments revolved around his current situation, which had made him “a prisoner in my own home.” This respondent stated that his mother, who he was care giver for, had Alzheimer’s disease, his daughter had cancer, he had lung disease, and his son had left the house because he couldn’t take the pressure any more. Although these statements appear to be over generalizations reflecting the informant’s current situation, they brought the researcher and informant closer together and understanding increased. His messages were personal and frank suggesting increased candor:

“Your’s is the first message, I will catch up, but not now. I am tired, hungry, and getting drunk.”

“.I’ve just have been in a funk lately. Some days I just don’t get out of bed.”

Of special interest is the finding that the interviewer is also influenced by the effects of CMC and the Internet. If candor rises in the informant, it may also rise over time in the researcher. For example, a prospective informant, who had received an e-mail from me asking him to participate in a survey, wrote back “go fuc you self (sic),” the author immediately e-mailed a sarcastic reply, thanking him for the polite message and suggesting that correct grammar and spelling might be more effective. This individual replied again, this time with the correct spelling and grammar. The message was all caps too, suggesting an increase in emotional tone of the message. The researcher, like those individuals in Turkle’s (1995) work, sometimes becomes lost in the screen. This mental state, when combined with the ease, intimacy, and immediacy of e-mailing appeared to facilitate responses when objectivity might dictate that no response is necessary. In another case, an informant accidentally sent an e-mail to the author, which was meant to be sent to a close relative. In the e-mail, the respondent appeared disoriented and physically ill. In response to this, the author telephoned the informant to inquire about his health. This incident further bonded the two although, traditional ethnography might suggest distance between the researcher and informant. In a third case, the author received a cynical and paranoid e-mail refusal to a request to participate in the study. The author wrote back to the individual who had refused to participate in a survey suggesting the message writer not be so cynical and that there are many people on the Internet, including the researcher, who are honest and not out to cheat them. In this case, the author was applying some impression management to the situation. These are examples that show that the relationship that develops between the researcher and subject along with the effects of diminished socially desirable responding (i.e., impression management and candor) and, the ease, intimacy, and immediacy of the technology support the notion that a metamorphosis may have taken place as the researcher evolves into a less objective participant.

The bonding and honesty of the relationship that develops between the researcher and informant also influence the relationship. Researchers might find themselves straying from the original research objectives and beginning unrelated conversations. For example, when a sudden death of a friend occurred, the author shared his grief with informants. All e-mailed quickly with comments to console the author. Again, there was a bonding that allowed the author to better understand the deeper meanings of informant’s behaviors. After two years of interviewing, the informants and researcher know much about each other. The researcher’s detailed knowledge of informants and understanding of their online behavior could not have been attained without this sharing of the researcher’s personal history.

This paper suggests that, within the context of prolonged virtual research, either depth interviewing or participant observation, a metamorphosis can take place. A metamorphosis driven by the honesty and bonding nature of the relationship, by the lessening of socially desirable responses and increases in candor, by the ease, intimacy, and immediacy of the communication process, and by the effect of cyberspace itself. In this metamorphosis, the researcher becomes part informant/part participant, and manufactured distance begins to dissolve. One explanation for this is that, because of these influences, researchers on the Internet may be reinventing themselves as the idealized interviewer or participant because they are released from many of the real world constraints placed upon them when they proceed through the cyber-research process.

As the researcher loses some of his or her objectivity and manufactured distance diminishes, the interview or observed event may evolve to a form dictated more by the research subjects or the effects of the computer and the Internet mediated communication and less that of the researcher.

**DISCUSSION**

Participant observation and depth interviewing have been used in this study to discuss potential influences on the respondent and researcher. They also demonstrate the potential for using ethnographic methods on the Internet. They extend the scope of these methods into a virtual reality of the Internet and challenge the notion of personal contact as a necessary component.

McCracken (1988) suggests two issues limit qualitative interviewing technique: the time scarcity of informants and their concern for privacy. Virtual interviewing begins to resolve these two limitations. Informants can respond at their leisure and in the privacy of their home or office with some degree of anonymity. For participant observation, Arnould and Wallendorf (1994) point out that it is key for the researcher to gain access to backstage areas if they want to develop the “...complex, textured interpretations of culturally constructed behavior” (p. 486). This may be difficult in many traditional consumer research situations because of socially desirable responses and lack of candor among informants.

Virtual research may aid in overcoming these obstacles by partly metamorphizing the researcher into an informant. The loss of some researcher objectivity allows for a deeper bonding between researcher and subject. In addition, experiencing a phenomena first hand (e.g., by the influence of increased candor) can allow insights that might be overlooked by the more objective observer. Previous researchers have already used first hand experience in their research (Arnould 1991) or actual experience (Hirschman 1990).

Virtual research can be used in market ethnography because it meets the goals suggested by Arnould and Wallendorf (1994). It is
systematic in data collection, recorded in a natural setting (albeit virtual), can produce credible interpretations, and is one of the possible sources of data. The market ethnography approach also suggests the necessity of a manufactured distance between researcher and informant which may not be the case in virtual research. Manufactured distance is consistent with the traditional ethnographic approach which suggests that the personal experiences of the researcher, while necessary in the participant observation and depth interview processes, should be excluded from ethnographic writing because they are not scientific (Clifford 1986). Contrary to this point of view, a sub-category of ethnographic writing has emerged that discusses the subjective experiences of researchers (e.g., violence, desire, confusion, struggles with informants). The argument this sub-category makes is that personal experience is an integral part of the research process and should not be excluded as irrelevant (e.g., action research, participatory research). To understand a scientific phenomenon more fully, the researcher should have access to all the information that might lead to greater understanding, not just those deemed relevant by objectivist science.

This paper suggests that, like Gibson's (1984) cyberspace cowboys, we jack into the Internet, connecting up with respondents in a bond unknown to traditional face-to-face interviewers or those who participate to observe. If the computer is an extension of the self as suggested by Turkle (1995) and computer and Internet communication has an influence, then researcher and informant alike may be influenced by its mediating effects. On the Internet, socially desirable responses are lessened and candor increases. In addition, the environment itself (i.e., cyberspace effects), and the ease, intimacy, and immediacy of electronic communication play a role in the virtual research process.

This influence should not be looked upon as diminishing the effectiveness of the research process. Personal experience may be able to bring us to a deeper understand of consumer behavior. Barbara McClintock, the Nobel prize winning biologist, when asked how she saw cellular structures that no one else could see, said she found them by “thinking like” them (Keller 1983). McClintock’s point of view is worth noting. What understanding might be overlooked in exploring cyberspace if subjective insights are removed from discussion?

REFERENCES


The papers of this session investigate three different ways in which shoppers may cross borders on today’s European shopping scene. One way is the consumers’ direct possibility of simply displacing themselves to another country. A second possibility is that shopping concepts such as the mall cross borders and install a more or less globalized shopping environment in a local setting. Thirdly, the shopper may (seemingly) annihilate borders by relocating the shopping activities to cyberspace and purchase via the internet. The session discusses differences and similarities between these border crossings and their role in consumers’ shopping scripts at the dawn of the 21st century.

“A Tale of Two Malls: An Exploration of Shopping Practices and Commercial Designs across Cultures”

Fabian Faurholt Csaba & Asli Tokman, Bilkent University, Turkey

As shopping malls have proliferated worldwide they have come to stand as monuments to consumerism and, in the eyes of critics, bridgeheads of an all-conquering global capitalism (Miller et al. 1998). With their formulaic designs and international retail concepts, they are often regarded expressions of homogeneity, predictability and standardisation: If you have seen one, you have seen the mall, as Rob Kroes (1998) muses. Despite the apparent commercial and cultural significance of the mall, empirical studies of this modern retail institution are relatively scarce and limited in their scope. A number of reasons for this neglect could be stated, but no doubt the very presupposition that malls are all the same has made it difficult for consumer researchers to regard them as relevant or appropriate sites for closer investigation.

Morris (1988) notes, however, that while malls are built on more or less universal planning and design principles, they nevertheless display “an intense degree of aberrance and diversity in local performance” (Morris, 1988, p.206). As such malls cannot be regarded as fixed, consistent, or permanent and thus, Morris asserts, it makes sense differentiate shopping malls and seek elucidate the diverse local contexts in which they are situated and the complex affective relations shoppers, employees and others have to them. Our study follows this assertion but takes a further step by investigating and comparing two shopping malls set in widely different cultural contexts. The modern and elegant Akmerkez shopping centre is located in middle of Turkey’s bustling commercial centre of Istanbul only a few kilometres from the historical centre Byzantine and Ottoman empires with its grandiose mosques, palaces and bazaars. Rosengårdcenteret, on the other hand, sits on the outskirts of Odense, Denmark’s third largest city. Less glitzy, despite recent facelifts and expansions, Rosengårdcenteret commands attention for its relative size in a city of less than 200,000 and in a country whose politicians and planning authorities for the past decade have imposed some of the most severe restrictions found anywhere in the world on mall development. Juxtaposing two shopping malls from such diverse settings enable us to compare and contrast various aspects of the socio-cultural and commercial functions of malls.

The study looks at the consumer practices as well as the orchestration and representation of the two malls. Rather than relying on the familiar research technique of short interviews with mall intercepts—an approach whose limitations are illustrated in the work of Sandikci and Holt (1998)—the research seeks a deeper understanding of the total mall shopping experience of subjects. Using an ethnographic approach to the study of shopping followed by Miller (1998), this inquiry follows a cross-section of shoppers on their visits to the mall starting in their homes. Combining unstructured interviews with the subjects and observations of their shopping routines and habits as well as their domestic spheres, the method aims to account better for the social and spatial practices involved in everyday and leisurely mall visits. The ethnographic orientation aims to ensure that issues of gender, class, age, and ethnicity are fully explored. The orchestration of mall involves the efforts of mall management, designers, tenants, and mall employees to stage and manage the space and image of the mall. This dimension is investigated through observation and personal interviews with mall and tenant retail managers and staff as well as security and housekeeping personnel. Malls—sometimes by virtue of their own public relations efforts, sometimes because they are public geographical presence in local communities—have a tendency to be brought into focus in public discourse and political debates of consumer, public and urban culture. This aspect of the mall’s significance should not be overlooked. We study and contrast the ways in which malls are represented in public discourse in the media and elsewhere.

Bringing together managerial, consumer and the publics’ perspectives, the study illustrates the way malls work by identifying and analysing similarities and differences in managerial and consumer practices in diverse socio-cultural, urban and economic contexts. It concludes with discussing whether commercial designs and retail management formula are as universal as often assumed and points to the regional embeddedness and local articulations observable in the orchestration and social uses of shopping malls.

References


The other two presentations in this special session follow this summary as complete publications.
Cross-border Shopping in the Open European Market:
1 Litre of Hard Liquor, 20 Litres of Wine, 24 Litre of Beer, 400 Cigarettes, Max. 30 kilo!

Anders Bengtsson, Lund University, Sweden
Jacob Östberg, Lund University, Sweden
Søren Askegaard, SDU Odense University, Denmark

ABSTRACT
Using a participant observation approach, this paper examines consumer experiences, motives, and trouble involved in cross-border shopping in the open European market. A number of factors ranging from cultural differences to legal regulations maintain the consumers’ experience of crossing national borders, in this case between Sweden and Germany (via Denmark). This cross-border shopping behaviour involves various acculturation processes, types of shopping motivation, a dash of rebelliousness as well as a good part of physical and mental challenges. This report being mainly preliminary and exploratory, we conclude by pointing out directions for further exploration.

INTRODUCTION
Consumers living in regions close to the border of another nation oftentimes find lucrative shopping incentives for crossing the border. Despite the European Union’s (EU) efforts to create a single internal market, the phenomenon of cross-border shopping is a familiar activity to some consumers living in the common market. Swedish consumers, especially the ones living in the southern part of the country, have long had a tradition of making the journey overseas (20 minutes by ferry!) to Denmark to stock up on alcohol, tobacco and other products that are highly taxed in Sweden. During the last decade, an increasing number of Swedes travel over to Germany since prices on these pleasurable products are lower there compared to in Denmark. When Sweden joined the EU in 1994 there was an anticipation among Swedes to finally be able to partake in the free trade between the countries and thus be relieved from restricting import quotas. However, the Swedish government managed together with the Danish government to negotiate an exception for private import of alcohol and tobacco. The governments in Sweden and Denmark feared that consumers of the two countries would travel to Germany to buy massive amounts of alcohol and tobacco and thus make the high taxation of these products impossible. Despite the fact that the free trade wasn’t as free as many Swedish consumers expected it to be after joining the EU, a substantial amount of cross-border shopping is taking place. Bus-companies, ferry-companies, shopping malls, and of course consumers have shown enough interest in cross-border shopping trips that a cross-border shopping industry has emerged.

The single European market launched in 1992 is truly a paradox for consumers. While the governmental discourse suggests an open market with free trade between members of the EU, it appears as less of an open market for the individual consumers. The notion of crossing a border is maintained by the fact that many people still are obliged to bring their passports when travelling to another EU country. The Schengen agreement that potentially makes it possible for people not to bring their passports when travelling to another country that is a part of the agreement may not have the desired result. Even if regular passport controls are called off for Schengen passengers, people are still supposed to be able to prove their nationality while visiting another country participating in the Schengen agreement. Since most Swedes do not possess any other document except their passport for showing proof of their nationality, there is in essence still a requirement for bringing the passport when crossing a border. Import quotas restricting consumers’ import of alcohol and tobacco furthermore contribute to the notion of crossing a border. To cross the border is to many Swedes a moment of anxiety but also excitement. People may be anxious to be stopped at the customs and forced to leave liquor they bought on top of the allowance. If they manage to get through the customs, which most consumers do, they may feel excited about the fact that they have cheated the authorities. When cross-border shoppers enter the shopping environment at the other side of the border, they experience differences in both currency and language in addition to other cultural differences. The meaning of crossing the border is therefore just as prominent today as it has ever been.

Despite the number of consumers who devote themselves to cross-border shopping, only a few studies have examined the phenomenon in further detail. Timothy and Butler (1995) as well as Di Matteo and Di Matteo (1996) examine cross-border shopping between Canada and the United States. Timothy and Butler analyze the role of shopping for creating tourism whereas Di Matteo and Di Matteo investigate antecedents like gas prices and currency rates and its impact on the extent of cross-border shopping. Wilson (1995) provides an extensive analysis of the motives and contradictions facing shoppers at the border between Ireland and Northern Ireland. While Wilson discusses issues of national identity and the conditions for consumers crossing the borders, he does not examine consumers’ cross-border shopping experiences in much detail.

Given the number of consumers that are involved in cross-border shopping and the limited attention given to the subject in academia we found it interesting to study this phenomenon in further detail. Consumers’ experiences of cross-border shopping trips are not very well understood and we believe that a further examination of this empirical field can bring important knowledge to consumer behaviour. Even though in certain senses borders are dissolved between EU members, cultural borders will remain to be crossed in all foreseeable future. The subsequent section features a brief discussion of the methods used in this study of cross-border shopping. Following that is a description of some of the features of the trip starting with the route driven by the bus, continuing with an impressionist description of the actual destination of the trip – the Kaufland Mall – and finally a short description of the clientele travelling on the bus. The rest of the paper is devoted to discussing a number of themes that evolved from the data set and which shed light on some of the issues facing consumers on cross-border shopping trips.

THE PRESENT STUDY
The data presented in this paper emanate from participant observation and unstructured interviewing of consumers participating in cross-border shopping trips. The cross-border shopping trip we participated in started in the southern part of Sweden and ends at a mall in Rostock, Germany. Participant observation has been suggested as a suitable method when the phenomenon is observable within everyday life (Jorgensen 1989). The cross-border shopping trips we participated in allowed us to spend eighteen hours on each trip to observe and talk to the travellers. One of the authors has participated three times in this particular cross-border shopping
Impressions from the Route

As mentioned earlier, the extensiveness of shopping across the borders have created a cross-border shopping industry consisting of collaborations between bus-, and ferry-companies, and shopping malls. The number of Swedish shoppers heading for Germany is substantial enough to supply several different companies running buses from southern Sweden to Rostock on a daily basis. The fare for travelling on one of the buses is 250 Swedish kronor (≈27 Euros). The buses start out at different destinations in southern Sweden and end up in Helsingborg on the Swedish west coast to catch the ferry to Helsingør in Denmark. Our bus picked us up at 4.20 a.m. in Lund and then drove around to various small villages in the area to pick up more travellers before finally arriving at the ferry terminal in Helsingborg to catch the ferry at 6.00 a.m. In Helsingborg all the buses gather and almost everyone gets out and is assigned a new seat in a different bus to assure that the bus company drive to Rostock with as few buses as possible. After the 25-minute ferry-trip to Helsingør the buses drive straight for two and a half hours to Gedser in southern Denmark to catch the ferry to Rostock. After about two hours the ferry approaches the nice medieval Hansa-city Rostock with its picturesque half-timbered houses, cobbledstone streets and impressive town wall. Minutes later everyone is nicely seated in the bus as it hurries along the autobahn, passing the town of Rostock to reach the real destination – The Kaufland Mall. The buses unload the passengers at 11:30 a.m., and the travellers quickly pour in to the shopping mall where they shop for two hours until the buses start loading at 1:30 p.m. At 2:30 p.m., the buses leave the Kaufland Mall to return by the same route. The bus we travelled on arrived on time in Lund at 10 p.m., 17 hours and 40 minutes after departure with some of the travellers still on the bus waiting to be dropped off at other destinations.

Exhibit 1
Exterior from the Kaufland Mall

Impressions from the The Kaufland Mall

The final destination of the trip, the Kaufland Mall, is far from the charming streets of Rostock, both in physical and aesthetical distance (see Exhibit 1). The first thing a visitor sees is a McDonald’s sign and the vast parking space, followed by a few vendors selling bratwurst and other German delicacies. The main feature of the mall is the large store, Kaufland, carrying a large assortment from produce, fresh meat, various perishables and non-perishables, to wine, beer and liquor, and finally a rather large assortment of non-food items ranging from cheap clothing to lava-lamps. Kaufland is clearly the main attraction as the travellers pace like lemmings to the store and the lion’s share of the travellers continue straight on to the section of the store where beer, wine and liquor is displayed. Here, they end up spending most of the time looking for the best deals. Already on the way from the bus to the store entrance one is able tell which shoppers are the more experienced. They will be recognisable because they usually have the two-mark-coin necessary to get a shopping cart, whereas the others have to go through the burdensome task of changing money from unwilling and German-speaking natives.

The second most popular store among the travellers seems to be Aldi, a German discount retailer focusing on down-market brands. The logic for many shoppers seem to be to first check prices in both stores and thereafter divide their shopping between these two retailers buying the products from Aldi where they do not think the brand-names matter and buying the rest from Kaufland.

The Kaufland Mall also features a number of other stores selling things like sporting goods, electronics, leather goods, fash-
Impressions of the Clientele

Drawing on our observations as well as our conversations, we suggest that the people travelling on these bus-trips may be divided into a number of different sub-groups at various levels. The sub-groups are distinguishable by their somewhat differing motivations. These observations where further reinforced by an interview with one of the managers of the bus-company who talked about the different people travelling with them in terms consistent with our observations.

One major group consists of “the pros” who travel frequently on these trips – sometimes several times a month. They are very knowledgeable on what to buy and have usually planned ahead of time, buying more products like detergents and food and less alcohol than the other groups. “The pros” simply substitute one of their ordinary shopping trips with the trip to Rostock and stock up on the things they can find cheaper there. There is also a sub-group of “the pros” – “the booze-pros”, who don’t travel as frequently and focus on buying most or all of their liquor, beer, and wine in Rostock. They are nevertheless knowledgeable about what to buy and even though they don’t frequent Systembolaget¹ they know the prices and are able to assess what they perceive as good deals and not.

A second major group consists of “the addicted smuggler” who does not have any other objectives with the trip than to buy cheap alcohol and tobacco. Once again we see two distinct types. On the one hand we have those who go on the trips frequently and who, according to the interviewed manager as well as the media, sell the smuggled goods for a profit back home. On the other hand we have the ones that perhaps are not selling the goods to someone else but who still tries to smuggle as much as possible and is solely focused on buying goods that are subject to restricted import quotas.

The third major group is “the rookies”. who go on the trip just to pass time or to get a break form the ordinary. They regard the trip as something fun, a little adventure, but perhaps see it more like an alternative to going to a city visiting museums than as a substitute for their ordinary shopping trips. “The rookies” have usually not planned what to buy in advance and are not equipped with the right paraphernalia such as bags, boxes, wrapping paper, etc. They browse the stores and hope to find good deals.

FINDINGS

In this section, we will analyse cross-border shopping through several aspects derived from the data. The first theme deals with acculturation processes and the ways in which consumers as well as marketers adapt to each other. The second theme highlights the notion of saving money rather than spending money as well as the compulsive dimensions of cross-border shopping. The third theme deals (briefly) with the ‘shopping as sacrifice’ motif, drawn from Miller’s (1998) theory of shopping. The fourth theme deals with aspects of rebellious behaviour that is salient to many cross-border shoppers. Finally, the last theme discusses the experience of hassles and nuisances involved in the cross-border shopping trip.

¹ The Swedish state monopoly liquor store.

Acculturation

When cross-border shoppers enter the Kaufland mall and the Aldi discount store, they enter a new shopping environment that is different from everyday shopping back home in Sweden. The mall and store are bigger and have a wider range of products. The prices are also lower and there are fewer sales and discounts. However, the shoppers are not always familiar with the products offered in the store. Some shoppers are not familiar with the brands available and may have to ask the sales staff for help. Others may not speak the language of the country in which the store is located and may have difficulty communicating with the staff. In addition, the store layout and signage may be unfamiliar and may require some time to navigate.

In the absence of the required cultural (brand) knowledge, cross-border shoppers may use various other aspects to evaluate a product. One shopper mentioned the good deal on whisky that was available at the Aldi store. In this passage, it is apparent that the brand name is of minor importance whereas the product type and the country of origin dilutes the differences that brand names otherwise can evoke.

Connoisseur traveller: Once in a while I’ve bought whisky. It’s called Statesman. Costs about 55 kronor a bottle. You won’t get it for under 200 in Sweden (laughter). Actually, they don’t have Statesman at [System]bolaget but it’s Scottish whisky anyway, whisky is whisky, right?

We also recognised shoppers who had brought shopping lists. Interestingly though was the way in which they described the products noted on the list. One woman who was shopping beer for her son was looking for a specific beer in a white can with a blue sign containing less than 5 % alcohol. She had no idea about the brand but she was sure that she got the right beer since the can indeed was white with a blue sign and had an alcohol content lower than five percent. We also observed some shoppers who used a trial and error strategy to evaluate quality of the products. Comments like, “let’s get this one today and if it is not good we can try another one next time” were common among shoppers who were frequent cross-
The shopping experience is very much an acculturation process (Peñaloza 1994) in which the shoppers get acculturated to the particular cross-border/German shopping context. As many shoppers return to the mall several times, they learn which products are worth the effort of carrying back to Sweden. They also learn where to find different products and bring various paraphernalia to facilitate shopping like calculators, special carrying bags, and German coins for the shopping carts. More experienced shoppers served as acculturation agents, e.g., for friends they had brought who were first time travellers. They shared their prior experiences and educated first time travellers by giving them suggestions of where they could find the best deals.

In addition to consumer acculturation in which the travellers became more efficient cross-border shoppers, marketers also had acculturated (cf. Peñaloza 1999) as a result of the many Swedes visiting the mall. Many features of the shopping centre seem to be directed towards the Swedish travellers. Some of the vendors outside know a few words in Swedish and can manage to sell a bratwurst to Swedes who do not know any foreign languages. Some of the signs inside the shopping centre are written in Swedish, e.g., a sign featuring a Swedish flag and the text “fat öl” (draught beer in Swedish). Another sign written in rudimentary Swedish language informed the shoppers that it was no longer possible to return liquor bought in the store, therefore reminding them to think twice before buying too much liquor (see exhibit 2).

Saving Money

As indicated before, the major motive for shoppers travelling to Germany is the search for cheap liquor as well as other products that might be cheaper than in Sweden. Since cross-border shoppers can buy liquor at a substantially lower price in Germany, shoppers regard their spending as a way to save money (Miller 1998). The more shoppers spend on their trip, the more they will save. In his ethnographic study of everyday shopping in North London, Miller found that the experience of saving money through shopping was of profound importance. The notion of saving money is equally important to shoppers travelling to Germany. Even though participants pay 27 Euros for the trip, they estimate that their savings on shopping will compensate for this expenditure. Many of the shoppers we observed appeared to buy goods because they thought the price was a bargain. Several would engage in what we may call rationalisation comparisons, which tend to neglect the quality aspect in the price/quality ratio used for evaluating bargains. Some shoppers tend to compare brands sold in Sweden with lower quality brands sold at Aldi. By making this type of comparison, they could justify the trip with the argument of saving money. One couple claimed to do the trip a couple of times a year to stock up on wine. They talked at length about their knowledge of different brands of wine and how they bought the same brands in Germany as they could buy in Sweden at Systembolaget. When asked what brands they were referring to the husband proudly declared “Rioja!” Later in the store we observed the couple with a shopping cart loaded with very inexpensive wine in milk carton-type boxes. Wine of that quality is generally not stocked by the rather picky Swedish monopoly.

Overall, cross-border shoppers tend to over-emphasise the amount they save by making inconsistent comparisons or by rounding the currency to 4 Swedish kronor when the actual rate is 4.30 Swedish kronor. When consumer goods are priced in a foreign currency it appears that the notion of the actual cost for a good is lost. A good’s indicated price becomes just a number that has little or no correspondence to the currency the consumers normally use for determining if something is expensive or not.

The actual money travellers save on the shopping trip is furthermore diminished by the fact that they buy things they otherwise would not have bought. Some shoppers expressed an urge to buy stuff and fill up their 30-kilo-allowance since the prices were so low. Cross-border shoppers at the Kaufland mall tend therefore to become compulsive buyers who achieve gratification from the buying process itself rather than the consumption of the product (O’Guinn and Faber 1989). The combination of (apparently) lower prices and an allowance to fill up create this kind of compulsive behaviour.

The compulsion, though, is restricted partly by the bus company (30 kilo) and partly by the Swedish customs (1 litre of hard liquor etc.) that reflect the tension between freedom and restriction in shopping (Lehtonen 2000) in this cross-border shopping venue.
However, in addition to these external restrictions comes a group pressure from the cross-border community, which also encourages compulsive shopping behaviour. As a cross-border traveller, you are supposed to fill up your allowance or be considered as somewhat strange, getting comments like, “you have to seize the opportunity” and fellow shoppers/travellers would be prompt to ask if they could “borrow” any unused allowance.

Shopping as Sacrifice

A girl in her mid-twenties who we talked to after she was done with the shopping provided us with one striking empirical example of Miller’s (1998) idea about shopping being a sacrifice for significant others. Having bought her full share of what she could take on the bus and more than she was legally allowed to bring home to Sweden (see exhibit 3), she first spoke to us for a while about her decision to be a teetotaller and then told us about her shopping:

Teetotaller traveller: I have bought, I’m gonna use it for entertaining because I don’t drink myself. I’ve bought that stuff for girls you know.

Interviewer: What is that?

Teetotaller traveller: Well, what is it. What’s it called, aperitif, that’s it, isn’t it? And Jägermeister, whisky – Grant’s of course, and then Bacardi, and then I bought five bottles of wine and one champagne. And then I have beer at home too, if someone wants it.

Interviewer: Are you having a party?

Teetotaller traveller: No, but if someone wants it I can offer them.

The girl seemed quite excited about the fact that she would now have liquor at home but did not really seem too excited about the actual trip. It should be noted, however, that some of our informants really talked about the actual bus-trip and shopping as being something fun and pleasurable.

Rebelliousness

Many of the travellers seemed to draw substantial satisfaction from different ways in which they rebel against the others, i.e. the state and the other consumers who do not go on the trips but patronise Systembolaget in Sweden. It is a related albeit not quite the type of trickster rebellion described by Gabriel and Lang (1995). The rebelliousness generally is turned against the taxation policies, the legal age regulations and the import quotas. The first type of rebellion against the state is buying (legal amounts) of liquor abroad, thus avoiding the state taxes. A common topic for discussion among the travellers is what is considered to be ridiculously high taxes on alcohol in Sweden. They accuse the state of behaving like a chaperone, not letting the citizens decide their own consumption patterns. Being opposed to this type of intervention from the state several expressed their excitement in this kind of protesting behaviour.

Two young boys who were not of legal age to buy alcohol in Sweden exhibited the second type of rebelliousness against state regulations. The Swedish law that gives people the right to drink at restaurants at age 18 but sets the legal age for buying alcohol at Systembolaget at 20 upset them. They took great pride in circumventing these regulations and planned to sell some of their catch of the day to friends who were also suffering from the oppressive governmental regulations.

A third field of rebellion was directed towards the import-quotas. It is regarded as hypocritical bullying from the Swedish state to impose strict import-quotas in what is otherwise known as the open EU market. They are thus not only motivated by bringing liquor home for their own consumption but seem to get an extra kick out of violating the import-quotas. Smuggling hereby becomes a consumer protest in favour of free markets.

Finally, a certain pride in this active rebellious behaviour is expressed in relation to what is considered all the stiff people back in Sweden that are too dull to seize the opportunity to buy cheap...
liquor in Germany. This creates a sense of community among the travellers since they are all winners on this trip; they are not just putting up with the system as everyone else but are actively doing something.

**Much Must He Toil Who Serves the Immortal Go(o)ds**

Brown and Reid (1997) have pointed to the actual travelling to the shopping area as being a sensitive part of making a shopping trip a successful endeavour. They refer to a long trip as being the number one antecedent to “transforming even the most a menable, easy-going consumer into a cantankerous, foul-mouthed marketing misanthrope” (Brown and Reid 1997, p. 127). The set-up of this trip, with almost 16 hours of transportation time compared to approximately 2 hours of total shopping time (or approximately 11% shopping time) and several bus loadings and unloadings, would suggest plenty of opportunity for consumers to suffer nervous breakdowns. However, and perhaps not surprisingly since the travellers were aware of the agenda of the trip beforehand (cf. Brown and Reid 1997, p. 132), no resentment was expressed towards spending long hours on a bus. On the contrary, many talked about the time spent on the bus as a nice time for relaxation, taking it easy, chatting with their friends, or even enjoying the scenery.

However, as soon as something indicated a possible delay or if someone was not following the implicit strict script of how to behave on the bus, the mood quickly changed. Tactily, they seemed to have agreed to put up with the hardship of the long trip but were not willing to stretch this the slightest. The tolerance for the duration seemed higher, the more experienced the travellers were. Another source of distress connected to the travel part of the trip was the risk of coming across rough weather at sea. To limit the risk for this they choose to travel in seasons they thought were “safer”:

**Expert traveller:** …and then, I don’t really wanna go in the fall when there are storms either… It happened to us once down there, you know. I told her [referring to her co-traveler] when we went here that we were out there for two extra hours on the Baltic sea, we couldn’t dock in Gedser.

**Interviewer:** One could get seasick.

**Expert traveller:** Yeah, I didn’t become that, but all the others’ heads turned bluish, bluish-purple (Laughter).

One plausible explanation for the travellers’ willingness to spend the long hours on the bus could be that it was justified by the excitement of the shopping to come; that somehow all the hardship would be paid off by an awesome shopping experience. This did not seem to be true, however. Most talked about the shopping as a tough mission accomplished rather than something pleasantly exciting. This is consistent with Brown and Reid’s reports of their informants claiming that the best part of the trip was when it was over (1997, p. 123).

Another aspect of the trip that seemed to have potential to tip the travellers over the verge of nervous breakdown was communication with the natives. Although some of the vendors had learned a few words in Swedish and were quite proficient in communicating using sign language and scattered English words, many of the travellers seemed to be stressed out over having to deal with the German speaking personnel. One example is the confusion that occurred for one of the travellers when ordering food in the food court and not receiving what she thought she had ordered. She burst out in Swedish to her friends “But hey, this isn’t what I ordered, is it?”

There were a number of other incidents that caused nervousness among the travellers. Many seemed to be stressed out over the fact that many similar, and sometimes identical, items could be bought at both Kaufland and Aldi. Some used quite elaborate techniques to coordinate their shopping between the two stores. However, since the shopping-time is quite limited it is hard to first compare prices and then shop. One shopper had to run back into the first store to complement the shopping at the last minute and her returning just a few minutes before the bus would leave generated frowns among the other travellers. Furthermore, everybody had to pay attention to the imposed 30-kilo-limit, causing many lively discussions in the stores where travellers were trying to assess the weight of different bottles, cans, and various other types of goods.

One last, but definitely not the least, cause of potential nervous breakdown was passing through the customs coming back into Sweden. For a large part of the travellers the trip would be in vain if the customs officials searched the bus and all the alcohol in excess of the legal limit would be confiscated. As we drove off the ferry and approached the customs there was a very tense feeling in the bus. Tales were told about earlier trips where they had been stopped and all the liquor had been poured out. Some tried to lighten up the spirits by dropping a few one-liners but they fell stone-cold to the ground. This was obviously serious business. When it turned out that the bus was not searched, there was a collective feeling of relief as the bus left the customs and drove off into the night to drop of the travellers at their respective destinations with their precious goods.

**CONCLUDING THOUGHTS**

What precedes these concluding remarks can best be described as an initial exploration of the plethora of emotions and themes present in consumers’ experiences of this kind of cross-border shopping. All of the evoked themes are worthy of a more lengthy investigation.

For example, one might use this particular border-crossing to investigate how Peñaloza’s (1994) consumer acculturation can be adapted to account for temporary acculturation processes of short-term duration. Obviously, as indicated by our research, a different set of acculturation agents would be at stake here. Similarly, the acculturation outcomes are likely to be of a different kind from those evoked by Peñaloza’s model.

Furthermore, the relation between such acculturation processes and macro-social processes of globalization deserves further investigation. To what extent does cross-border shopping of this, and other types, engender processes of global homogenization, interest in the “authentic Other”, various forms of creolization, and possibly also reactions in the form of searches for authentic local consumption patterns (cf. James 1996)? The existence of a canon of global brands point in one direction, the various local translations of such transnational consumption items into others.

The notion of ‘saving money’ could likewise be explored much more deeply, and might be addressed from a number of other angles, combining, e.g., economic psychology and economic anthropology perspectives. The savings motive would also gain from being explored in relation to impact of the cross-border shopping patterns, following the path suggested by Miller (1998) more deeply in a cross-border context. Likewise, the idea of cross-border shopping as sacrifice, facilitating or even making possible a communitarian consumption pattern based on alcoholic drinks (cf. Douglas 1987) in the domestic context deserves more attention.

The rebelliousness-motive, could be explored by setting it in a larger context of consumer resistance, normally investigated in terms of resistance against marketing- or production-related activities (see, e.g. Dobscha 1998; Firat & Dholakia 1998). The theme of
resistance against state or legislative behaviours through smuggling would also border on, what has been called the dark side of consumer behaviour, investigating illegal or morally doubtful types of consumer behaviour.

Throughout this text, we have referred to our informants/observed consumers as travellers (or, occasionally shoppers/travelers). However, the tourism aspects of the cross-border shopping trips have been left largely unexplored. Nevertheless, the rather positive reactions to the long and cumbersome bus trip give reasons to believe, that there is indeed an aspect of tourism in these one-day shopping trips to Germany.

The extent to which the cross-border shopping trip have the character of a ritual (Rook 1985) is yet another unexplored opportunity. Our informants/participants definitely demonstrated ritualised behaviour in visiting the same stores and buying the same products each time they travel. For example, it seems like the ritual of border crossing in itself puts consumers in a shopping mood where the shopping of goods becomes a material evidence of their trip to a foreign country. This could be linked to an investigation of the dimension of exclusivity to the shopping experience where consumers feel privileged about being able, and also somewhat obliged to buy goods that people back home are unable to buy.

A final theme to be explored further is the relationship between planned and impulse buying. Contrary to findings by Brown and Reid (1997) and Thompson, Locander, and Pollio (1989: 1990) a successful trip seemed first and foremost to be one where all the things on the shopping list were found at a good price rather than a trip filled with exciting surprises. Most of the shoppers encountered had remarkably little room for spontaneous shopping behaviour and followed a predetermined shopping list, overtly proud of not letting themselves fall for any temptations. Any unused quota (weight or allowance) would predominantly be filled with ‘more of the same’. Further research and investigation of our own data is needed to throw light on these risk averse shopping tourists.

REFERENCES


The Paradox of Crossing Borders in a Border-less World
Diana Storm, SDU Odense University, Denmark

INTRODUCTION

It is a prevalent assumption within the field of consumer research that the conversion of the Internet into a global consumption venue works as a catalyst for profound changes in consumer behavior and experiences (Shih, 1998; Turkle, 1995; Venkatesh, 1998; Negroponte, 1997). Also widespread is an idealized notion of the Internet as a marketplace in which the consumer encounters almost no restrictions in quantity or quality of information and in which she is provided with search tools accompanied by few, if any, search costs (Sampier & Hamel, 1998). In this ideal scenario, consumers can shop for all types of information, products, and experiences at any time of the day, anywhere in the world – ostensibly a truly global, border-less enterprise. This paper investigates consumer experiences of this recent and seemingly revolution-ary form of shopping across borders: shopping via the Internet.

Recent years’ interest in cybermarketscapes as places where consumers and electronic markets come together has fostered studies of topics such as decision-making in online settings (Häubl, 1999), web-browsing behavior (Raman, 1997), the creation of personal web-sites (Zinkhan, Conchar, Gupta & Geisler, 1999), interaction in Internet newsgroups (Sheldon, 1999), and the influence of personal and situational factors on online behavior (Sherman, Schiffman & McMellon, 1997). Also, important contributions have been made to the study of consumer navigation behavior (Hoffman & Novak, 1996), to the understanding of consumer experiences and perspectives in relation to technological products (Mick & Fournier, 1998), and to the discussion of consumer identity in cyberspace (Venkatesh, 1998; Turkle, 1997).

While these studies are concerned with consumer experiences of technology and different aspects of online consumer behavior in general, few studies have been attentive specifically to the experiential aspects of Internet shopping. Therefore, the empirical study on which this paper is based takes a phenomenological approach to the venture of unpacking lived consumer experiences, meanings and perspectives of online shopping. It is interested in consumer perspectives of the Internet as a space for gathering product information as well as for purchasing products, and it is occupied with the experiences of the more overall atmosphere or ambience of the Internet as a servicescape (Sherry, 1998).

From among the findings of this empirical study of online shopping, the present paper focuses on a selected set of analytical ideas that deal with the interplay between the multitude of expected and lived experiences that were brought up in consumer depth interviews. In general, it reports of the existence of a number of paradoxes of Internet shopping from a consumer perspective and looks at ways of coping with these paradoxes (Mick & Fournier, 1998). As an illustrative example, it focuses on consumers’ experiences of being involved in a global cybermarketscape that facilitates shopping anywhere, in principle, yet for a range of products encourages a local purchasing strategy. A critical approach is taken to the prophecies of cyber revolution often publicized, and it is argued that consumers engage in a self-imposed construction of borders concerning appropriate and inappropriate shopping sites, also based on geographic criteria. In other words, we embark on an explorative journey into consumer encounters with paradoxes of technology (Mick & Fournier, 1998), such as constructing and crossing invisible borders in a context where borders are commonly assumed to be non-existent.

ONLINE SHOPPING – EXPECTED AND LIVED EXPERIENCE

As generally acknowledged, shopping experiences can be seen as complex formations that have numerous aspects to them and come into being in a dynamic interplay between a number of influential factors, such as personal taste, interest or experience, cultural tendencies, social circumstances, etc. (Falk, 1997; Miller, 1998). Obviously, this is also the case with regard to shopping in online environments. Nonetheless, some of the elements involved in and contributing to shopping experiences are perhaps even more interesting in an online context, at least as long as Internet shopping is relatively new to consumers. Here, only a few of these relevant aspects of the shopping experience will be emphasized. Figure One roughly maps out these aspects.

Clearly, these aspects are taken out at a composite experiential whole, and the distinctions made between them are entirely analytical. This is not least the case with respect to the two closely interrelated aspects of shopping experiences to which we turn first; expected and lived experience. Expected experience refers to those expectations that consumers hold about the qualities and consequences of Internet shopping, while the term lived experience covers interview participants’ descriptions of their actual encounters and experiences. Both of these are interconnected with the idealized, mythological conception of online shopping prevalent in e-commerce. And, both of these experiential aspects are examined from a perspective of action (Wallendorf & Arnould, 1994), that is, the interview data elicits value-laden information about participants’ perspectives and behavior, but does not necessarily mirror naturally occurring behavior.

On the backdrop of the discussion of expected and lived experience, an exploration of paradoxical undercurrents in the experiences and meanings of online shopping ensues, with a special focus on the paradox pair global/local. The paper closes with a brief discussion of two issues of vital importance to future research on the subject: coping strategies and influential factors.

Expected Experience

The development of the Internet into a commercial sphere (Stefik, 1996) has triggered a plethora of writings about the character and significance of e-commerce (Maroney, 1997; Ellsworth & Ellsworth, 1996; Schaffnit, Mehta & Thompson, 1998; Klein & Quelch, 1996; McCune, 1998; Stanners, Huang & Leong, 1998; Sampier & Hamel, 1998; Kandiah & Gossain, 1998; Deighton, 1996; Hoffman & Novak, 1996; Rafaeli & Newhagen, 1996). The literature on e-commerce holds a number of assumptions about online shopping. Often, the basic belief is that the Internet empowers the consumer in the shopping process and seemingly challenges traditional understandings of the power relations of the marketplace. Most commonly, the Internet as a market and medium for commerce is described as:

- Interactive, engaging
- Facilitating dialogue (or two-way communication)
- Providing easy access to information, services and products
- Reducing search costs

And consequently as:
· Making possible comparison shopping
· Allowing the consumer to take unprecedented control of the exchange of information between marketers and consumers

In this perspective, the consumer is typically seen as a “rational” being who wants “convenience, speed, comparability, [low] price, and service” (Sampler & Hamel, 1998, p.54), and of course “choice, freedom, and control” when interacting with the marketer (Sampler & Hamel, 1998, p.54). The following is a striking example of this mainstream view of consumers as “smart shoppers” (Mano & Elliott, 1997) in the “new” world of Internet marketing:

No more holding people hostage through 30-second commercials. No more hype. No more ignorant customers. No more local monopolies. No more search costs. No more Get in your car and come to us…. Consumers everywhere, stand up and cheer! (Sampler & Hamel, 1998, p.63)

It is noticeable that an underlying assumption of this type of conventional thinking seems to be that consumers act completely “rationally” in online environments. Hence the consumer is seen as a stereotypical “economic man” exclusively seeking to maximize utility in a traditional sense; as opposed to pursuing emotional, hedonistic, or transcendental experiences in consumption (Holbrook & Hirschman, 1982; Sherry, Wallendorf & Belk, 1989). In this perspective, online shopping is reduced to simple order entry and web pages to catalogues (Douglas, 1998). It is questionable if a (hypothetical) change in shopping setting from the pages to catalogues (Douglas, 1998) It is questionable if a (hypothetical) change in shopping setting from the pages to catalogues (Douglas, 1998) or to search for information and products on “one’s own terms” (e.g. by comparison shopping without having to visit different stores, or even different web sites):

· “It’s so easy on the computer. You just push a button and it’s done.” (Anne, female, 28 years)
· “It’s a matter of saving time, not having to wait in line and that kind of thing.” (John, male, 30 years)
· “It is so easy – it’s a relief.” (Marianne, female, 27 years)

Convenience is used, for example, to refer to easy access to a wide selection of products and product information, to save time by being able to shop at home or at work, and to be able to shop at any time convenient to the individual. In other contexts, the term encompasses the ability to retrieve “objective” information (e.g. in the sense that it is often not mediated by someone with an obvious interest in “making a sale”) or to search for information and products on “one’s own terms” (e.g. by comparison shopping without having to visit different stores, or even different web sites):

· “There are several web sites that allow you to compare prices directly. For instance, as regards hardware, it is basically the same things you buy, only in different stores. So, it’s cool that someone took the trouble and listed it on a single page… You can see: “how much is 32 megabyte RAM?” And it’s the same quality, so you might as well get the lowest-priced product.” (Kenneth, male, 30 years)

In turn, these characteristics are believed to enable the consumer to make better-informed decisions, act more rationally, and to offer consumer freedom and control:

· “I shop more rationally. When I shop at an ordinary store, I always buy candy and… unnecessary stuff. But when I’m in front of the screen, I only buy what I had planned. Often I’ll buy at the lowest price; that is, I’ll get the largest packet and things like that. Because I don’t have to think about bringing it home myself. So I probably buy more rationally than I do when I go into an ordinary store.” (Thomas, male, 33 years)

Interestingly, participants tend to describe the promises of consumer freedom and new opportunities chiefly as freedom from the hassles of “real life” shopping, such as the tediousness of everyday...
purchases, the annoyance of waiting in line, having to deal with shop assistants, not being able to find a specific product, or giving way to impulse purchasing:

“Impulse buying is usually something like: seeing, touching, and then bringing the product home. Here [online], you can only see, and then wait. And, I think that you’re more likely to consider your decision once more, when you’re entering your credit card information on a web page. You cannot completely block out the security issue from your decision. Also, this is new to you, it is not something that you do every day, whereas using your Dankort [Danish debit card] elsewhere is no problem. No one worries about that. So, usually if you’ve decided that you’re going to get something, you’ll just pay and then leave. But if you’re online, you’ve got time to think, because you have to go and get you credit card… and then you have: “click here”, “click to confirm”, and “we promise”… “please read these terms and conditions”, and so on and so forth. Clearly, that stops you from making impulse purchases that usually go simply from eye to basket.” (David, male, 24 years)

In contrast to elementary qualities such as convenience or access to a wider selection of products and services, the literature on the subject often emphasizes perhaps less conspicuous advantages such as the possibility to control the flow of information, for instance, or ordering products configured to individual requirements (Sampler & Hamel, 1998).

As mentioned to begin with, expected and lived experiences are tightly interrelated and difficult to distinguish from each other. This is illustrated by the fact that some of the previous examples are described by participants almost as if they were actual experiences, and ordering products configured to individual requirements (Sampler & Hamel, 1998).

Lived experience

Trying to capture the essence of how online shopping is experienced demonstrates that the phenomenon is indeed complex and multi-faceted in character. On a basic note, the novelty of shopping in virtual environments feeds into a number of problems and insecurities, associated with feelings of unfamiliarity and insecurity, lack of confidence, disappointment, and sometimes dissociation. Also fundamental is participants’ emphasis on the feeling of a social dimension which is strongly associated with “real life” shopping experiences, but is believed to be “lost” or missing online:

“You will never have the same… I mean, if you shop often in a particular store, it is usually a nice and fun place to be. You can’t have that feeling on the Internet.” (Marianne, female, 27 years)

“There’s no personal contact here. It’s like you don’t enter a store that somebody created.” (Anne, female, 28 years)

“I think that what’s missing is personal service. Of course you don’t get that. That service can be poor as well if you go other ["real"] places… But you really miss that – the “human-ness” which somehow disappears.” (Christian, male, 26 years)

European Advances in Consumer Research (Volume 5) / 255

Mentioned as missing is not merely the visceral experiences of e.g. seeing or touching, but also social aspects such as going shopping with a friend, meeting people from the neighborhood, talking to and being assisted by a shop assistant, or simply meeting different types of people than you do in other spheres of your life. This resonates with Campbell and Falk’s (Falk, 1997) observation that consumers engage in several different types of activities while shopping. In case that some of these activities are believed not to be reproducible in virtual settings, they can contribute to an incipient understanding of why online shopping is far from regarded a perfect substitute for “real life” shopping. Along this line of reasoning, some participants feel that when they shop online, they miss out on the personal service and the immediate satisfaction of buying the product, bringing it home, being able to try it out/on right away, etc. It is thus very much the “feel” of the experience which differentiates “real life” from virtual shopping: a physicality and a sense of being present in the moment, of being “here” rather than “there”.

A positive side to the feeling of a missing social dimension (and the accompanying fear of isolation and alienation) is – as touched upon earlier – that it is simultaneously seen as a freedom from the nuisances of everyday, “real life” shopping. For instance, a few participants suggest that the advantages to be gained from Internet shopping – such as not having to go to a crowded shopping street, not having to waiting in line, or being able to look forward to receiving a particular product – by far outweigh what is missed by not shopping at traditional retail channels. Furthermore, the interviews offer many examples of alternative social, recreational, and fun aspects involved in Internet shopping. For instance, Charlotte, a 27-year-old female, describes how in “real life” she and her friends joke about products found on the Internet and how they order clothes, and then get together in real life to try them on, having a lot of fun with this:

“I think it’s really cool that you receive the clothes at home, and then you can try it on, and just return what you don’t want. I’ve just ordered clothes from the fall selection [at a special store], and I think it’s kind of nice to wait for it to arrive. Usually I order with some friends, and we meet to try on the outfits. It ends up in fun and games, and we can’t remember who ordered what. It’s fun.” (Charlotte, female, 27 years)

Yet others remark that the Internet is best used as an easy way to shop for the “boring” everyday things – in turn leaving more time for fun, “real life” shopping. These reactions indicate that there are different types of strategies for dealing with the experience of the online environment as a fundamentally different way of shopping.

Also as a different, and distinctive, characteristic participants stress the engaging capacity of the Internet; its invitation to non-rationality in the form of surfing without a specific goal, or letting oneself be “drawn with the stream”. In these cases, the Internet is experienced as possessing an addictive and seductive quality (or power) which threatens to prevent the individual from being a “rational” consumer, and instead seduces her, leaving her a “slave to technology and marketing”.

Despite of this potential for facilitating flow experiences (Hoffman & Novak, 1996; Hoffman, Novak & Yung, 1999), participants tend to see online shopping as less entertaining, recreational, leisurely, and fun, and often espouse the view that shopping on the Internet should – and does – differ from other ways of shopping:

“The sort of instant joy you sometimes feel when you go shopping disappears. Unless you sit at home, just waiting for those three CDs which are supposed to arrive on Tuesday. So unless it is something very special… You can go shopping, just
because you feel like buying something. Or at least that’s how I feel. And that feeling, that joy, cannot really be restored on the Net." (Marianne, female, 27 years)

“...It would be trying to construct the Internet as if it was real, as if it was the real world, and it is not. When you use the Internet for something like this [shopping], you have to make things which are special, so you know that this is different from going to a ["real"] store.” (Anne, female, 28 years)

Again, we hear echoes of “common knowledge” of e.g. the trade press, espousing the view that shopping on the Internet should differentiate itself by identifying and taking advantage of the unique capabilities and opportunities offered by the technology, instead of imitating real life shopping, from which it is believed to be fundamentally different.

Participants’ experiences of Internet shopping as a little more difficult, bothersome, and less fun seem to instigate a requirement for “digital value”, a concept introduced by one of the participants:

“There has to be some benefit in it for you. It does not have to be money. It can be saving time or maybe that’s a cool search engine, or that you find the best solution. But there has to be some benefit. I’m not the type of person who would use the Internet out of principle or because I think it’s fun. There should be digital value – added value that I get for using the Internet instead of going somewhere else”. (John, male, 30 years)

This concept of “digital value” in many ways captures a shared notion that the advantageous aspects of online shopping should at least equal the experienced trouble and risk associated with shopping on the Internet. It should be emphasized that there is much subtlety and complexity to participants’ individual experiences of shopping in online environments and their interpretations of “digital value”. Still, it remains a conservative standpoint to see consumers as making comparisons and decisions (although individual, implicit, and not necessarily rational) on the backdrop of perceived risk and difficulty on the one hand, and perceived value or benefit on the other hand. As we have already seen, however, it is also a view that is grounded in participants’ description of their expected and lived experiences of the Internet as allowing them to act more “rationally” and “efficiently”. Here is another example:

“Somehow it feels more rational, because you are not distracted by music and things like that... what you see and so on. So you are very goal-directed – you have to get that CD. You don’t look for others, and don’t make impulse purchases when you just happen to walk by today’s special offers. It’s very much a question about getting what you surfed for and then getting out of there.” (Charlotte, female, 27 years)

Another participant described his use of the Internet as having “moved from surfing to tasking”, an expression that also entails the feeling of being able to behave more rationally and more goal-directed. Very much in line with this, several other participants characterize themselves as “poor surfers”, who dislike surfing the Internet (using it in a non-directed, time-passing manner), and prefer to pursue tasks systematically and effectively. Add to this the idea encountered earlier that the Internet provides the individual with the opportunity for making better informed decisions and thus promises to turn her into a more competent and, some say, more critical consumer. And that participants feel more rational and in control, preferring to see the Internet as a tool for problem solving and the pursuit of specific goals. The result is a recurrent theme of rationality and control which in turn may be interrelated with the “missing” social, physical, and spatial dimensions of online shopping, including such factors as the visceral “temptations” inherent in “real life” shopping experiences or the persuasive “power” of a sales person. It is easy to recognize participants’ focus on rationality and control as a reflection of the long-standing western cultural view of humans as rational and logical beings (Howard, 1991). And once again, as mirroring the contemporary (mythological) understanding of the Internet as an interactive and empowering technology that brings the market closer to the ideal, free market pertaining to a capitalistic mindset.

Participants also point out, nevertheless, that being rational and in control is an ideal for them, and that such ideals do not always reflect their lived experiences of at shopping on the Internet is like:

“If they had to send something to me, and I had to pay shipping costs anyway, I might as well buy two more [books], and not buy anything the following month. But that is not the way it works [laughs]... So in reality you just tell yourself that it is going to save you money...” (Anne, female, 28 years)

So, while participants wish to – and some times do – feel more rational and in control in virtual environments, being in front of a computer screen in itself does not necessarily mean that this is the case (Nass, Moon, Morkes, Kim & Fogg, 1997; Reeves & Nass, 1996). As an instance to the contrary, participants talk about the “temptation” to buy that they encounter in personalized book recommendations and search-related book suggestions such as those employed by Amazon.com. In addition, they comment on how “excuses” for impulse buying persist regardless of the retail form, as in the typical case of buying something extra when you get a good deal on the item you planned to buy. Similarly, participants provide rich examples of how the Internet may spur purchases that would alternatively not have been made at all. One such instance is that of a participant who reportedly had not bought music CD’s for several years:

“I buy other things here than I do elsewhere. For example, I discovered Boxman [www.boxman.dk] which sells CDs. And I had not bought music CDs for years, because you don’t always have time for things like that. But now I have started again, because I can sit at home at night and take a look at the selections and things like that. And often, I will order something.” (Thomas, male, 33 years)

Here, the convenience of being able to shop from home and at late hours paved the way for renewed interest in a particular product category.

Although consumers, as we have just seen, are by no means unaware or naive about the possible differences between their expected and lived experiences in regard to Internet shopping, it does not change the fact that they hold particular expectations, or that these expectations play an important role to lived experiences of Internet shopping. It is in the light of these interchanges between different aspects of consumer experience that, for instance, the co-existence of the notion of the rational, controlling, and efficient consumer empowered by the interactive, non-physical, transparent market with the experience of non-rationality in the form of surfing without a goal, or being “drawn with the stream”, should be seen. In sum, the paradoxical undercurrents of Internet shopping experiences that were brought up in the beginning of this paper have started to surface during the preceding discussion. The next section will attempt to create a framework for interpreting these paradoxes of Internet shopping.

PARADOXES OF INTERNET SHOPPING

So far we have found that there is a dynamic linkage between “common knowledge” about the Internet, consumer expectations,
and lived experience. Moreover, we have been occupied with the idea that while sometimes these facets can be almost identical counterparts, they can equally well be widely divergent. Such differences and similarities can be identified not only between aspects (e.g., between expected and lived experience), but also within each aspect (e.g., between types of lived experience). The last-mentioned type of cases, where differences, and even oppositions, are found within each experiential aspect, are central to the present analytical context, because they testify to the existence of paradoxical undercurrents in the experiences and meanings of online shopping. Interestingly, the experiential paradoxes found here are very similar to those identified by Mick & Fournier (1998) in their study of consumer relations with a range of different technological products. They propose that “a paradox maintains that something is both X and not-X at the same time” and argue that “when something is paradoxical, the saliences of the antithetical conditions are likely to constantly shift, probably due to situational factors, evoking the sensation of a teeter-totter, bobbing up and down between contrary feelings or opinions” (Mick & Fournier, 1998, p.125, their emphasis). In their specific framework eight central paradoxes are classified: control/chaos, freedom/enslavement, new/obsolete, competence/incompetence, efficiency/inefficiency, fulfills/creates needs, assimilation/isolation, and engaging/disengaging (Mick & Fournier, 1998, p.126).

Although there is of course variance in the degree to which specific situations and types of online shopping will reflect different paradoxes, analysis of the interview data clearly indicates that these underlying paradoxical qualities are relevant to online shopping in general. This paper’s interest in cross-border shopping calls for a more specific focus on consumer expectations and experiences related to the possibility for global shopping that e-commerce seems to promise. Indeed, several examples in the interview data provide vivid illustration of how online shopping bear the stamp of paradoxical undercurrents with regard to being both global and “not-global”/local at the same time. Since the paradoxical undertones of the co-existing notions of global and local are intertwined with a number of the paradoxes identified by Mick & Fournier, however, we will include a few of these in the discussion as well.

To begin with, the global character of the Internet is seen as enabling the individual to accomplish and experience things not possible, for instance by providing access to information or products that are rare or inaccessible in certain geographical areas:

“I’ve mostly used it [online shopping] in connection with things that I knew would be hard to find in this country [in Denmark]. So, of course I think that it’s fantastic that suddenly I have bought it on the Internet: “cool, now I’ve got that, I wonder when it’ll be in the stores”…” (Christian, male, 26 years)

Being part of a worldwide shopping network thus evokes two other paradox pairs: competence/incompetence and control/chaos. The Internet is believed to make the market completely transparent to the consumer by making information, and thereby control, freely and globally available to the consumer. The resulting potential for finding and managing information, services, or products otherwise unattainable or ascribed special meanings brings about feelings of competence and control:

“Last year, when we were going on vacation in Italy, we used the Internet for road directions and for finding lodging. I found an inexpensive apartment. I had no idea what kind of place it would be, but I figured that if it was really bad, we could just find something else once we got there. When we did, it turned out that it was a brand new place, it was big and had all the amenities you could ask for. It was the kind of place that would have been really expensive to get if you had rented it through a travel agency. Of course, I was really proud. And when you feel like that, you tell others about it. I brought pictures to show everybody at work and everything. So maybe you feel differently if you have made a good deal on the Internet. I think it makes you feel proud of it and makes you want to tell others about it… You could probably get something like this in other ways. But it is different that you search for yourself and find what you want, and can make a deal with them. I like that.” (Claus, male, 50 years)

Simultaneously, of course, it upsets and disorders the familiar market mechanisms and ways of informing yourself about the market, by expanding the possibilities and tasks involved in doing so immensely (creates chaos). Consequently, it can also leave the individual with a feeling (or fear) of incompetence and chaos, in case she fails in her pursuit:

“… But also like all sorts of different stores, well for us it has been mostly record stores, in the US for example, where you can buy CDs that you can’t get in Denmark, and things like that. I just think: “no, I’ve got no idea who this is, and I’m just sending them all this information” and: “what if they’re never going to send me anything, but just withdraw the money from my account”. Then there’s nothing I can do about it.” (Anne, female, 28 years)

In turn, this last issue feeds directly into the paradox of efficiency/inefficiency. Here, the ideal associated with the Internet is that of a transparent, efficient, and global market, which enables the consumer to make better informed decisions, but where lived experience at the same time entails an inherent threat to inflate the market to the point of confusion, chaos, and inefficiency.

It was mentioned early on that part of the Internet’s globalizing potential resides in freeing the individual from physical constraints; in offering freedom to shop anywhere, any time, and without quite a few of the hassles usually associated with “real life” shopping. At the same time, however, we have noted that participants feared the addictive or enslaving qualities of the very “freedom” thus granted. On the one hand, they were anxious that they would be addicted to Internet shopping (and surfing), and on the other hand, they were concerned about having to learn, and adapt to, the (in the beginning seemingly uncontrollable, chaotic, and enslaving) workings of a new market system. In other words, these tensions tie into another set of oppositions within consumer experience of Internet shopping: freedom/enslavement. Consumers are not only free to be global shoppers; they might feel obligated or enslaved to be so. At least, they have to develop ways of making sense of and dealing with the expansion of shopping possibilities that has accompanied the commercialization of the Internet.

In total the character of Internet shopping gives rise to a set of experiential opposites that can be captured under the heading “global/local”. This paradox pair relates to a series of other paradoxes in consumer experiences of online shopping, among them the eight pairs identified by Mick & Fournier (1998). Next, the existence of related paradoxes such as competence/incompetence, control/chaos, freedom/enslavement, and efficiency/inefficiency suggests that the freedom and control usually expected to go along with online shopping are far from unequivocal. On the contrary, it would seem that there are limits to the degree of increased ability, scope, and possibility that consumers are interested in or capable of managing – at least in the beginning phases where the new possibilities are highly likely to be equalized by insecurity and anxiety. Thus, the prophecies of con-
sumer revolution in cyberspace often espoused are considered somewhat exaggerated in the present context.

From here, it is time to move along to a discussion of the type of reactions and strategies that consumers make use of in order to make sense of their online experiences. This is where the construction of individual barriers for shopping comes into play.

COPING STRATEGIES

It is noticeable that the paradoxes encountered by consumers for the most part are not described as problematic in the data material analyzed here. Rather, consumers seem to find it quite simple and natural to interpret and make sense of the co-existence of these opposites by adopting different strategies for reducing the level of stress, insecurity and risk. Mick & Fournier (1998) term these approaches “coping strategies”, and show that a series of different strategies exist and that consumers are capable of shifting between these depending on the situation. The scope of the present paper does not allow any thorough discussion of the wide range of coping strategies that consumers employ. In the context of the global/local discussion, however, it is relevant to consider the particular coping strategy that entails a self-imposed construction of borders concerning appropriate and inappropriate shopping sites:

“Last fall I bought an expensive bicycle. And I tried, just for the fun of it, to check it on the Internet. There’s a lot to save if you buy it abroad. If you buy it in Italy, you get it for half the price. I searched for information on the Net, but didn’t have the courage to buy it. It was not that I was unsure of the bicycle itself, because it was a well-known brand. But you give up your guarantee. It can give you a lot of trouble. I think it depends on how willing you are to take risks. If there’s some sort of problem, I prefer that there’s a person I can communicate with, complain to… So I bought it here at full price.” (John, male, 30 years)

This incident illustrates that the appreciation of being involved in a global cybermarketscape that facilitates shopping anywhere, in principle, does not automatically translate into actualization of such possibilities. In this case, it actually encourages a local purchasing strategy, based on geographic criteria:

“I’ve got no problem with buying a bicycle from the Netherlands, but I don’t want to pick it up at the post office. I want to get it from a small shop in [the local shopping street]. There should be a person there, someone I can talk to if there’s something wrong… If I buy it in Luxembourg or the Netherlands doesn’t matter in itself, but he has to act the contact person and say: ‘I’m the one you can complain to’ or ‘I’m the one who’ll help you adjust the saddle’.” (John, male, 30 years)

Consequently, it appears that crossing – supposedly non-existing – geographical borders when shopping in a virtual environment can require a high degree of psychological border-crossing for some consumers and in some situations. This is clearly a case in which the ideals, expectations, and even the “actual” capacities related to the Internet as a marketspace turn out to be highly inconsistent with what is experienced as being within reach of the individual. In such instances, what we started out by describing as a “seemingly revolutionary form of shopping across borders” indeed only seems to be so in principle – at least at the moment.

INFLUENTIAL FACTORS

It is important to note that the experiential aspects of online shopping discussed here undoubtedly change over time, from one individual to another, from one situation to another, and so on. Accordingly, there are several crucial influential factors to be taken into consideration with regard to consumer shopping experiences on the web. These factors can be personal, situational, social or cultural, and hence can be extremely diverse.

Whether we look at personal factors that have to do with individual experience, interests, taste, involvement or time spend on the web, at situational factors such as type of product or purchase, or at cultural factors such as traditions or trends, they are all likely to be vital to both individual experiences and more general notions of Internet shopping. Or, as Mick & Fournier points out, “the saliences of the antithetical conditions are likely to constantly shift, probably due to situational factors, evoking the sensation of a teeter-totter, bobbing up and down between contrary feelings or opinions” (Mick & Fournier, 1998, p.125).

Likewise, Hoffman & Novak (1996) hypothesize that factors such as the period of time that the individual has had access to the Internet will influence consumer behavior in virtual settings, for instance the possibility of experiencing flow as an aspect of online shopping. Others have examined the influence of personal and situational characteristics on online behavior (Sherman, Schifffman & McEllern, 1997), and have found these to be crucial to our understanding of the phenomenon. Evidently, this is a research area that require continued attention, perhaps even more so as Internet shopping becomes more commonplace, less shrouded by myth and idealistic expectations, and less associated with risk and insecurity.

CONCLUSION

This paper set out on an explorative journey into consumer encounters with paradoxes of technology, and further into the particular case of constructing and crossing invisible borders in a context where borders are commonly assumed to be non-existent. As a result of the explorative intent of the paper, a range of findings have been presented, yet the analysis has far from been brought to a close. For instance, we could easily continue to find additional examples of co-existing and antithetical experiences and feelings, and to hypothesize about their internal relations and meanings. For now, however, the intention was merely to point out that paradoxical elements are common to Internet shopping and that the paradoxes found are numerous and tightly interwoven. Based on these considerations, a critical approach to the promises of cyber revolution often announced is advocated, and a continued focus on unpacking lived consumer experiences, meanings and perspectives of online shopping is encouraged.

REFERENCES


“Major role transitions are crucial times… but little is yet known about the consumption behaviors of liminal people” (Schouten 1991:50)

INTRODUCTION

This investigation seeks to increase our understanding of the complex relationship between consumer behavior and the psycho-social needs of individuals as they experience different life stages (Schouten 1991). In this project we investigate the life experiences and coping strategies female consumers use to negotiate identities and reconstruct the self in concert with role status transitions.

Specifically, we explore the behaviors and experiences of mothers whose grown children have recently left their homes. We seek to better understand the “lived experience” (Thompson, Locander, and Pollio 1989) of women who are negotiating the role status transition from being a mother with children in their homes to that of being a mother recently cast into the empty nest stage of the family life cycle. The strategies which contemporary women use to negotiate this role status transition are identified and examined. We explore the behavior and experience of ‘committas’ of empty nesters as ‘liminal consumers’ and the use of disposition and consumption in the reconstruction of self during the transitional period.

LITERATURE REVIEW

The Empty Nest Stage of the Family Life Cycle

The concept of the family life cycle has been widely studied in marketing and consumer behavior research (Arndt 1979; Danko and Schaninger 1989; Gilly and Enis 1982; Murphy and Staples 1979; Wells and Gubar 1966). Western society has changed dramatically over the last few decades with major demographic changes such as the postponement of marriage; an increase in divorce; more women entering the workforce in both full- and part-time capacities; the growth of step-families; the postponement of child bearing; an increase in the number of childless couples; and a growth in single parent and single person households (Yankelvich 1981). These dramatic changes in our population have resulted in the consensus that the family life cycle construct requires updating and renewed attention from contemporary researchers (Gilly and Enis 1982; Danko and Schaninger 1989; Glick 1977; Murphy and Staples 1979).

Our interest in this investigation lies in the empty nest stage of the family life cycle and its affect on women as they negotiate this life transition. Roper Starch Worldwide’s 1993 survey found that Americans feel, firstly that change is difficult; and secondly, that change is happening more rapidly than ever before. Further, watching the youngest child move out of the house was difficult for 46 percent of these empty nesters polled (Waldrop 1994). With baby boomers aging, empty nesters are a growing segment of both the U.S. and European populations; one that will continue to increase until approximately the year 2015 (Lefton 1996).

Although the popular press has devoted some attention to this stage of the family life cycle, most of that attention has focused primarily on the spending habits of this segment. Once children have left home married couples, especially those with two working spouses, often find themselves enjoying a big increase in discretionary income (Ambry 1993; Edmondson 1999). Consumers in the empty nest stage are prime consumers of gourmet foods, high quality fresh foods, take-out foods from restaurants and supermarkets; household furnishing and equipment; travel and investments (Edmondson 1999). However, most research into this segment has focused on basic economic projections and examining their spending habits; and there has been little attention to their psycho-social needs and wants in this phase of transition and adjustment to new identities and roles.

Theories Associated with Role Status Changes

There are three theories relating to role status changes that inform our research: role identity theory, role change theory, and role stress theory. Role identity theory argues that role loss will have a negative impact on psychological functioning. Role identities provide consumers with existential meaning and guidance in behaviors and actions. These qualities are thought to be essential to individual well-being. Therefore, according to role identity theory, the more roles individuals have, the better off they will be psychologically. Consequently, role identity theory suggests that, when children leave their parents’ home, their departure will be associated with a decrease in parental well being (Thoits 1983; White and Edwards 1990). However, this premise rests on the assumption that launching one’s children means that the parent then abandons the parental role. Many scholars reject this premise and believe that once individuals have had children, then they continue to occupy a parental role throughout their lives.

Role change theories, too, suggest that the role change associated with the empty nest stage will have negative effects on the individual’s psychological and physical well-being (Holmes and Rahe 1967; White and Edwards 1990). The empty nest phase of the family life cycle is thought to negatively impact parents transitioning into the empty nest stage because it accompanies a role transition in their parental role.

A more general perspective is that of the role stress theories which suggests a very different effect when parents reach the empty nest stage. These theorists suggest that the effect of a role change depends on the stress associated with that role. If there is stress associated with a role, then the individual that is able to shed that role will benefit from the role loss. Many studies find evidence that the parental role is a stressful one. Thus, according to role stress theory, the role status change to an empty nest stage of the family life cycle will result in a positive effect on the parents’ well-being (Barnett and Baruch 1985; McLanahan and Adams 1967; White and Edwards 1990).

Although a few clinical studies report depression following the launch of children from the home (Curlee 1969; Bart 1972) most studies find that the empty-nest actually results in greater global and marital satisfaction, although the positive effects are modest. Families with children in the home are generally worse off than families without children in the home (Glenn 1975; Glenn and McLanahan 1982). Several studies using cross-sectional data report a U-shaped pattern of marital happiness, with parental happiness highest during the
honeymoon stage, lowest when the children are school age or teenage, and higher again when the children have grown and left the home (Rollins and Feldman 1970; Rollins and Cannon 1974; Anderson, Russell, and Schman 1983). Glenn and McLanahan (1982) found no demographic groups for whom presence of children in the home was positively correlated with marital satisfaction, lending support to the role stress theory.

In summary, the empirical data appear to lend support to role stress theory. The role status transition from being a parent with children in the home to that of the empty nest stage should be accompanied by an overall, modest, but positive change in global and marital happiness. However, the theories of role change and role identity suggest that these will be stressful and difficult transitions for parents. This research seeks to develop a better understanding of these phenomena.

Role Status Changes and Rites of Passage

Transitions or liminal phases (Turner 1969) have been described as “a limbo between a past state and a coming one, a period of personal ambiguity, of non-status, and of unanchored identity” (Schouten 1991:49). Van Gennep (1960) posited that important role transitions generally occur in three stages and include: 1) separation, that disengages the individual from a social role or status, 2) transition, as the individual attempts to adapt and fit into new roles, and 3) incorporation, with the individual integrating the new role or status into the self. These three stages are very consistent with the role status change of empty nest mothers.

Role status transitions are accompanied by a liminal phase in which the individual holds an ambiguous non-status, and is between two different role statuses, but not firmly grounded in either. Turner (1974) describes how “culturally prescribed rituals, or rites of passage, provide individuals with an experience of ‘communitas’ or shared psychological support throughout major status passages. In the modern, secular world, however, people often experience liminoid states (cf. Turner 1974) devoid of such supportive formal rites of passage” (Schouten 1991:49). Without some type of societal support system firmly in place, consumers attempt to cope with this difficult transition and their ambiguous self concepts in a myriad of ways. Contemporary consumers who are left to their own devices, create their own personal rites of passage which are carried out, at least in part, through symbolic acts of disposition and acquisition of consumer goods. These acts of disposition and consumption allow consumers to utilize products in their role status transitions and in the transformation of their new concept of self. The reconstruction of self, that began with separation from the parental role and the end of the original child-parent relationship, is assisted through the disposition of consumer goods, the reconstruction of identity played out with material objects and communitas formed with other consumers also in this transitional phase.

In consumer research empty nest women have not been studied from the subjective perspective of the individual consumer. With this as our phenomenological objective, we seek to better understand the lived experience of empty nest women and of the coping strategies they employ to negotiate this role status change.

METHOD

This research design utilized mixed methods to collect two separate datasets using an interpretive methodology. Semi-structured in-person interviews and netnography were used to develop an understanding of the life experiences of contemporary women negotiating the role transition of the empty nest stage.

After examining relevant literature we began to explore these phenomena through semi-structured interviews conducted in person by researchers in three different geographical settings (the U.S.A, England and Ireland). In the first phase, we started with three interviews to develop an initial understanding of the phenomena. In the second phase, we collected a data set from an Internet bulletin board dealing with issues of interest to empty nest women. For this data set we employed netnography, an interpretive method developed specifically to study consumer behavior on the Internet (Kozinets 1998).

In the third phase, we augmented our data set with additional in-person semi-structured interviews, resulting in the final total of eleven semi-structured interviews for the in-person interview data set. This data set was complemented by the electronically derived data set collected via netnography.

The in-person interviews were conducted in two phases over a period of six months (June-November 2000). First, three in-person interviews were conducted in early summer 2000 as an exploratory measure to introduce us to the topic using informants’ perspectives. Subsequently, a further eight in-person interviews were conducted. The interviews lasted between 30 minutes and two hours, averaging one hour in length. They were audio taped and transcribed verbatim, resulting in approximately 300 pages of data. Transcribed interviews were read repeatedly by all research team members; and themes were identified independently and then discussed amongst the team members. Consensus was reached for each theme discussed in the final manuscript.

The second data set was collected by participating in an on-line (Internet) bulletin board. Netnography, a computer mediated data collection and analysis technique was selected as an appropriate method for researching our topic because it provided us with an excellent tool for unobtrusive observation of the population of interest. Data was collected by participant observation to develop a better understanding of the experiences of empty nester women and how they negotiate this transition in their lives as expressed via cyber-space bulletin boards.

The site selected in this investigation is specifically designed for women who are dealing with the day-to-day experiences of recently becoming empty nesters. Thus, it provided an excellent site for us to learn more about the phenomena of empty nest women. Through our on-line participation we were able to take part in these consumers’ discussions of their experiences of consumption, disposition and the informal rituals employed to negotiate this role transition.

1 The informants interviewed in-person had not participated in any online bulletin boards relating to their transition into the empty nest stage. Informants for the in-person interviews were selected based on their recent ascent into the empty nest stage. Of the eleven individuals participating in the in-depth interviews two seemed to be negotiating it with relative ease.

2 We do acknowledge the concern of self selection in this data set. By the act of seeking out and actively participating in this online bulletin board, these women may have been experiencing more difficulty with this transition than other that did not. However, we are not claiming generalizability in this project, but instead to develop a better understanding of our informants’ experiences with this common transition.

3 Problems of verifying the identity of participants in bulletin board discussions remain a central issue for all consumer behaviour researchers seeking to collect data unobtrusively from such sites. In the case of this project, there seemed ‘internal evidence’ from careful reading of the postings] that the participants were genuine empty-nesters. However we recognize the research issues surrounding the pursuit of identity/identification and roles on these sites by both participants and researchers.
Netnography is a new qualitative method developed specifically to investigate consumer behavior on the Internet. Netnography is based on the evaluative standards, the history and the techniques of cultural anthropology (Kozinets 1997, 1998; Kozinets and Handelman 1998). Resulting from a netnographic investigation is the written account derived from the fieldwork conducted in a computer-mediated environment. A large number of methodological tools are currently being adapted that arm consumer behavior researchers interested in studying cultures and communities residing on the Internet (Kozinets 1997, 1998; Kozinets and Handelman 1998).

Netnographic methods require the researcher to become immersed in the activities occurring on the Internet, through observation and participation in a particular site, community, or subculture existing on-line. Clearly, netnography, like cultural anthropology, and cultural studies requires the full participation in the culture being studied. The resulting data from a netnographic investigation are the field notes taken about the researcher’s participation, combined with the text downloaded from the site of interest. In our investigation, the second data set resulted in approximately 200 postings to the bulletin board.

Following research ethics suggested by other researchers involved in netnography (Sharf 1999), we announced on the bulletin board our presence as researchers interested in the topic of empty nest women, and of our plans to prepare research papers on this topic. We believe that we benefitted from the fact that the three members of our research team are women, and that two of the three team members are themselves empty nesters negotiating the same role transition as the participants in the bulletin board.

**FINDINGS**

In the analysis and interpretation of our data sets four main themes emerged: the distress caused by this role transition and identity transformation; the evaluation and redefinition of self which flowed from this experience of role status change and identity transformation; the use of transitional objects in the reconstruction of self; and enacting love and mothering through production and consumption. We will let our informants illustrate each of the themes we have identified, using representative comments from both the bulletin board and from the in-person interviews.

**Role Transition & Identity Transformation**

Clearly, the empty nester phase of a woman’s life cycle is a liminal state (van Gennep 1960). Our exploration found that informants’ adjustments are complex, idiosyncratic and affected by many factors including: their relationships to others, especially their children; roles occupied outside the home, including employment, and involvement in church or other organizations; and the length of time spent adjusting to this transition.

In a few cases our informants spoke of only minor difficulty negotiating this transition. For example, Priscilla, an accountant, is weathering this transition with seemingly minor problems in adjustment. She has two daughters, ages 18 and 21. Her oldest daughter has been attending college in another state several hours away for the last three and a half years. Her younger daughter started her college career this year and is approximately an hour and a half away. She often comes home with her laundry on Sunday afternoons. When Priscilla was asked about her life now that her children are grown and moving away, Priscilla responds:

Well, I guess one thing…It’s all [expenses are] budgeted and its predictable, so that, I don’t get surprises that can’t fit into things well. I know that I sound like an accountant talking about budgets, but you know it’s just the way I think. (laughs) I am an accountant. The thing that seems the oddest is how quiet it is in the evening. I used to go home in the evening and I’d rush to make supper and then there’d always be, nearly every day, there’d be a load of laundry. Of course you’ve got to run errands every day or two. Kids going to school for events, and it was very, very busy, and you know we were very stressed because we had to get everything done that had to be done. Now, the evenings are pretty quiet, and too quiet at times. I’ve started working a bit more. …Joe’s actually sort of cooking a little bit which he’d never done before. …So sometimes, not quite half the time, when I get home it’s made. (Priscilla, in-person interview)

Certainly Priscilla is experiencing and adjusting to a transition in her life as she speaks of the quiet in her home and how it is “too quiet at times.” She also alludes to a coping mechanism of working “a bit longer” which she talks about in greater depth later in the interview. Priscilla spends much more time, however, in introducing us to her life now, by talking about the predictability of budgeting, the reduced stress in her life and of her husband’s newly acquired interest in having supper prepared when she arrives home. These changes accompanying her transition to the empty nest stage are discussed positively, although she doesn’t like the quiet that has accompanied her children’s departure, there are many positives that have accompanied this new stage of her life.

However, many more of the women interviewees and all the bulletin board participants articulated difficulty dealing with this transition. The following informant illustrates just how difficult she found this transition to be:

“Hello to all, Melissa here, one daughter, Sandy, age 19. Sandy married on July 7 and moved to England to live. …Needless to say – I crashed and burned. It has been 4 months and I am happy to say, I am having some good days, more good days than bad. Between seeing a great doctor and some assistance from prozac, wellbutrin, and ambien, I am making my way back. I am hoping to be drug free soon.” (Empty Nest Syndrome Bulletin Board)

Illustrative of the great difficulty this woman was having navigating her way through this liminal state is her need for pharmaceuticals as part of her coping strategy for dealing with the role transition and its associated identity transformation. The next informant, too, was having trouble dealing with this transition. Although she says things have gotten much better for her, it is clear that this has been an incredibly difficult transition for her:

“This year hasn’t been bad. It’s the second year. The first year was… The first year started about Christmas time of her senior year and her graduation from high school and it was just devastating for me. …I mean, I stopped eating. I stopped sleeping. By the time she graduated from high school my parents were looking at my husband and going…(laughs) “Feed her, make her sleep” (laughs), because I looked horrible in the graduation pictures. Then we took her to school and I thought I was going to die. I cried all the way home. I literally made it from her dorm room to the elevator, which was probably about 6 yards and completely came unglued.” (In-person interview)

Many others who used the bulletin board to communicate discussed how difficult this role status change was for them. Many empty nester women openly questioned just what their role was. Women asked about their roles as mothers, wives, and career women. Most commonly though, women asked about their role as a mother,
and what their identity was, now that that role seemed to lie behind them. The following two postings to the empty nest bulletin board illustrated this:

“My nest has been empty for about one and a half years. Our daughter is married and lives 90 miles away. Our sons are in the army and will be for nearly another 3 years. So far empty-nesting is kinda like limbo. Putting up the Christmas tree was a bittersweet task. So many pieces of my life that now are part of the past. I am not the me I understood myself to be. I love being a Gramma but I miss being the mom I was.” (Empty Nest Syndrome Bulletin Board)

“Our youngest son (of three) is about to finish his sophomore year in college. When he first left all I noticed was how much I loved giving up the mommy duties (Food, clothing, worry), so I thought I had escaped the dreaded Syndrome. Now, I’m not sure. If I’m no longer a nurturer—my most satisfying role thus far in life, what am I? Has anyone else been through this? Any suggestions?” (Empty Nest Syndrome Bulletin Board)

As this informant illustrates, many women discuss the fact that they find it comforting to be able to talk to others going through the same experience they are. Participants commonly said that it was a relief to hear from so many others who were also having a difficult time with this transition. This bulletin board site focused on issues relevant for empty nesters and served as an important vehicle for participating in this web site, it became clear that for most of the active participants, negotiating this role transition, to share their thoughts, feelings and experiences with others who might understand.

Participation in this site served as a way to communicate with others also trying to make this transition in contemporary society in which there are no visible rites of passage to help those in this liminal state cope with the transition. Throughout the discussions a sense of ‘communitas,’ a form of shared psychological support associated with changes in role status, emerged clearly (Schouten 1991) among those participating in the empty nest web site, as discussants helped each other in negotiating this major role status change. As we participated in this web site, it became clear that for most of the active participants, visiting the empty nest bulletin board site became an informal ritual that helped the transition in role statuses.

Women contacted for in-person interviews often also had their own form of ‘communitas,’ or informal shared psychological support groups (Schouten 1991) that helped them, too, to negotiate this role status change. These women commonly became very close to other women also going through this same transition. The ability to feel a sense of communitas with others going through a similar situation, and sometimes children leaving the nest can result in positive effects on parents’ well-being. This is illustrated by this informant’s experiences as her first born child left for college:

“David had been problematical at home, bless him, and it was with some relief that we felt (laughter) that he should go, you know, because he was such darned hard work and we felt that if he goes, it might do him good, so there was a relief thing… but the interesting point is now that… [he’s] in Australia which is a long way. I am suffering ‘Emptynest’ syndrome with David and … I do find I’m missing him quite badly which is interesting but possibly also because, of course, he came back home after University and was, in many ways, much more mature and we were entering a sort of nice stage in more communication and more understanding which unfortunately, you know, has been broken by his going away” (In-person interview).

Role Transitions & Identity Transformation: Evaluation of their Role as a Mother

With this role transition, many women started to examine themselves. There was an interest in learning about self and a serious evaluation of the lives they were living, often for the first time in a long time. This self appraisal typically included an evaluation of their role as a mother, their role as a career woman, and their role as a wife.

Many women examined their role as a mother. Often this appraisal was bittersweet. Although they relished their role as a mother, they felt that it was a role they had outlived. Commonly, there was also a note of anxiety concerning how well they had performed their mothering role. The launch of their grown children into the adult world served as an ultimate test of their mothering ability. This launch was repeatedly met with uncertainty and some trepidation:

“It was time for the children to leave and I was ready. I knew they needed it as well as I needed it. It is just a fact of life. It was going to happen. ... It was just a way of knowing that I was somewhere close to being a good parent if they could stand on their own. If they could become productive individuals in society then I have done what I was suppose to do as a parent. The other thing was just loving them to the point that they could become this individual that could function in society.” (In-person Interview)

Many women referred to the success of their children along with a statement about their success as mothers – this was illustrated by the comments above.
Role Transitions & Identity Transformation: Evaluation of Role as Wife

In addition to their evaluation of their roles as mothers, informants in this project also evaluated their role as wives. Thus relationships with partners, as well as with children, were reviewed and evaluated. Some respondents recognized that their role as wife had often become secondary to their role as mothers as the family had been growing up; and thus, some were concerned they had neglected their role as a wife and evaluated this role with apprehension. A few women expressed considerable fears about the direction their relationships with partners might take once their children had left home. The following informant illustrates this evaluation of self:

“...My problem is that because I’ve been so wrapped up in the children that I feel I don’t have much of a relationship with my husband (and he’s probably not aware that I consider it a “problem.”) He’s basically a very nice guy, but is content sitting in front of the TV much of the time. We do go out to eat at least once a week (sometimes with the youngest daughter joining us), we go to the beach several times a year, an occasional movie, occasional visits/dinners out with friends. I feel I need to make a real effort to get to know him all over again and certainly we’ve both changed quite a lot in the last thirty years—me probably more than him. I’m not talking about a sexual renewal, but just having things to talk about, new things to do, etc. Does anyone understand what I’m saying and have a good starting point?”

(Empty Nest Syndrome Bulletin Board)

Again, we also see the importance of the bulletin board for a vehicle for understanding, as well as negotiating, this role transition by sharing experiences and feelings with others who might understand.

Some informants were less pessimistic as they evaluated the impact of their changing role as parent on their role as spouse. This informant mentioned how shared activities and interests with her husband had started to reemerge, having been in a period of almost hibernation whilst the children had been growing up and been the centre of attention:

“We have got interests in common which we can pursue even without our children... all sorts of things... not just music, we are interested in art, we like walking, we just have many interests in common... sometimes during the period of bringing up the children, they [the interests] went in the background, but we are bringing them out now”

(Empty Nest Syndrome Bulletin Board)

Role Transitions & Identity Transformation: Evaluation of Role as Career Woman

Informants repeatedly revealed that they were evaluating their role as a career woman, or their lack of a career role. Consistent with role identity theory, many women without a career now wished that they had cultivated one. These women were evaluating themselves and asking what they would do with the rest of their lives. With the reduction of what they saw as their most important role, that of a mother, many were envious of others, including some of their husbands, who had been nurturing careers. The following woman left this posting, illustrating this point:

“...Husband works full time. He is reaching his pinnacle at work. I’m a has-been. I’m going through a rough time with this second one. Something hurts inside, thought I was depressed but I think its a role change. I’m not sure what my role is. Never had much time to think about myself.”

(Empty Nest Syndrome Bulletin Board)

The transition seemed to be easier for those women who worked outside of the home. This observation is not limited to our present project but has also been suggested previously (White and Edwards 1990). Consistent with role identity theory, the more roles individuals have, the better able they are to cope psychologically with changes in one or more of their roles (Thoits 1983). The following informant illustrates how she has not had as difficult a time adjusting to this role transition, and had been able to focus some of her extra time on research projects instead of her children.

“I think I work more. I just spend more hours on work. I work at home at lot more. Not that I am on campus more. But, I work on weekends, which I never did before. I often have supper and then work 2 or 3 hours again in the evening. So, it changes the number of hours and the location, I think for my work. I am getting more research done that I did before.”

(In-person Interview)

Role Transitions & Identity Transformation: Role Transformation from the Role of Mother to the Role of Mother/Friend

Adjustment to becoming a successful empty nester seems to include a transformation of the mother-child relationship. Many of our informants suggested that the mothering role changes from being a “top–sergeant” to becoming a friend and a good listener.

“I look at her as more of an adult now definitely... I feel on a par with her more as a friend”

(In-person interview).

Informants suggested that once grown children leave the home, then parents lose their right to make judgmental statements as they were able to do previously. Not all parents are able to traverse this transition effectively as the following mother illustrates:

“Today I talked to a friend of my daughter’s whom I ran into while I was shopping and she is making plans to move out but her Mom doesn’t know yet. She is moving because she said at this time in her life she needs a Mom who can be her friend, but her Mom can’t seem to make the transition from Mother to friend. She always has to get critical about any situation her daughter shares with her. I try not to do that and my daughter shares many things with me.”

(Empty Nest Syndrome Bulletin Board)

This transition from the role of mother to that of mother/friend is not an easy transition for all to make.

Role Transition & Identity Transformation: Role Transformation from Parent-Child to Adult-Adult: Loss of Control

Informants also discussed how difficult it was for them to give up control of their children. Their children could now come and go as they pleased at their new homes, without any parental control. However, as many informants talked about this new lack of control, it sounded like the loss of control they were speaking of was strongly based on a loss of information. When the children lived under their roof, much information was communicated formally. Overhearing a phone conversation or siblings talking, parents were able to pick up a great deal of information without trying. Suddenly these women found themselves with a paucity of information about their children and what they were doing. They now were only able to learn about their children’s lives through more obtrusive means; and when their children chose to share the information with them – thus control of information had switched, and with this came a sense of relinquishing power as the power balance changed in the relationship:

“It’s so hard, yes, things have changed. (laughs). And I’m trying to back off and not ask a million questions on the
computer[via email], but, you know, as I’ve told her many times, give me time. It’s a weaning process and you sort of have to try to sit back and take what they tell you. You know, I’ve been there asking a billion questions, she’ll finally go “quit Mom.” It’s real hard.” (In-person Interview)

This lack of information is very tough on the informants, because when they ask questions their grown children may feel that their privacy is being violated. Further, adult children may also feel that these inquiries reflect a lack of confidence in their maturity and judgment. Thus, parents’ questions are often ignored or rejected as inappropriate in an adult-adult relationship, as opposed to a parent-child relationship (Berne 1961 cited Pitman 1982:47ff).

Role of Transitional Objects in Re-construction of the Self

There were many examples in our data of how women found comfort in objects left behind by their children. Similar to the ability of a blanket to provide security to babies as they start the ‘separation phase’, so adults, too, are often able to feel comfort with a particularly meaningful possession which helped them deal with the ‘separation’ phase from their children in this liminal or transitional state. The role of material objects and their symbolic properties during transition was a common theme found in the data for this investigation (Belk 1988, 1990; McAlexander et al. 1993; Price, Arnould and Curasi 2000; Silver 1996).

“Basically, as strange as it may seem, when you walk into their rooms, their rooms smell like them, even this one. When you just pick up something, even the odor smells like whichever boy it is. That’s a strange thing when you walk into there, you think (sniff), that’s them all right.” (In-person Interview)

This woman used her grown children’s rooms as a transitional object, that provided her comfort and made her feel closer to her boys who were away at college. She simply walked into their rooms and sniffed, and she immediately sensed and felt their presence. The following mother is comforted by the idea that when her daughter graduates from college that she will move back home and into her room again. When she sees her daughter’s room, she is convinced that her daughter will return home again:

Her room is basically, she left it like it would be when she came back …She left her room as in tact, as if she would be home for the weekends or come for a visit. Its just there and I can walk in at anytime and feel her presence there and know that she is going to be back. And see her school pictures and know as time has gone by those pictures will be taken down and replaced with other pictures of her new found friends and her new life. (In-person Interview)

This mother copes with this role status change by telling herself that the only change in her mother/daughter relationship is that the pictures currently hanging in her daughter’s room will be taken down and replaced with new ones. Thus, this woman is reinterpreting the meaning of material objects based on changed relationships (McAlexander, Schouten, & Roberts 1993). She now expects this room to become the residence for her adult daughter once she completes her college education. It is no longer the home of her little girl. She finds comfort in the idea that her daughter will move back into her home upon graduation.

Enacting Love & Mothering: Through Production and Consumption Production Based

Many informants discussed how they missed their previous ability to express their love for their children through doing household chores for their children (Miller 1998; Oakley 1976) and other tasks (e.g. taxiing their children around for different activities). Simple acts of ‘mothering’ such as cooking, cleaning and laundry, are often missed when children leave home. Also, the companionship of doing such ordinary, everyday tasks together is often missed. The following informant discusses how at one point in time her daughter depends on her to do “everything,” and the next day they are all grown up and doing things on their own:

“I still have a 17yr old daughter at home, so the nest is not completely empty. I do think about how its going to be when my baby goes off to college and it just tears me apart. I know I’ll get over all of this eventually, but it is really hard to just shift gears. One day you’re a mommy who your children depend on for everything and the next day they are all grown up and are doing things on their own. It’s great to see them doing so well and making their own decisions. I am so very proud of my girls and love them sooooooo much.” (Empty Nest Syndrome Bulletin Board)

Although this woman is proud of her daughters, she still misses the feeling of being needed by them. Another woman described how much she missed her old routine of cooking ‘proper meals’ for her children; and how much she loved to make her daughter’s favorite dish when her daughter came home to visit. This woman used this act of production to recreate her mothering role, if only temporarily. At the same time, this informant also described how much she and her son had enjoyed cooking together in the kitchen before he left home, thus this everyday task of co-production had reinforced their relationship:

“Coping with the shopping and the cooking.. yes I miss that really, because I do quite like cooking, but Alec [her husband] will quite happily have.. a slice of toast and cheese.. or something.. whereas I always cooked a nice meal for the kids with a pudding and all the rest of it. [Cooking]. was a pleasure because Lea [her daughter] loves eating ..” Shall I do you a Sausage casserole?’ ‘Oh, mum, a sausage casserole. I haven’t got a casserole dish .. so she does no cooking apart from baked beans, which is quite nutritious I suppose. ..Now Ewen [her son] is good in the kitchen now, he is vegetarian and has been for ages and he can concoct beautiful spicy vegetable curries and things and he’ll come and do that at home... he did enjoy food, and yes he was always the one in the kitchen who would come and mess around with me when I was making biscuits... whereas Lea didn’t do much”. (In-person interview).

Not only do these acts allow informants to express their love, but after their children leave home, the reduction of household chores that need to be done accentuate the void resulting from the children’s departure.

Consumption Based

Interestingly, we saw a shift in the data illustrating how the informants in this project moved away from an emphasis on expressing love through doing, or through production (cooking, cleaning, and laundry) to a focus on purchasing for their children or consumption as a way of expressing love (phone calls, cards, care packages, things for apartment or dorm). Thus, there was an interesting shift in the data from production to consumption (Firat & Venkatesh 1995)
during the role transition. This woman discusses how she, her husband, and their church express their affection through tangible gifts to the children who have moved away to college:

“Did you all send your “kids” Halloween boxes? Daddy sent Mandy tons of M&M’s, or m-em’s as she always called them. We sent her four boxes in the past three weeks plus she got one from our church and her grandmother! Does anyone else’s church send the college kids care packages? I sent her a food box, then she got very sick and I sent her a medicine box! Then daddy sent her a dehumidifier. Then the candy. And I know daddy has sent her $5’s in there, also!” (Empty Nest Syndrome Bulletin Board)

And another mother trying to traverse this liminal period talks about the things she has purchased for her daughter, now starting her second year away at school:

“I bought a new rug for her apartment, because we only bought one set and I figured she needed more. ...And I send her care packages. I send her a card, like once a week and in between I think I’ve sent her two or three care packages, no two. But I have some other things I like to buy for her when I see them, like last time I sent her a care package I sent her a CD and a magnet for her fridge and some jiffin pops... they’re like a cool-aidy stuff... just fun stuff... She loves getting real mail! She says e-mail is great fun and she hears from everybody, but... My mom will send her a card occasionally, sometimes with cash involved—she likes those. ...And it’s fun for me too.” (In-person Interview)

An outlet for expressing love and enacting the parental and mothering role seems to be aided by helping adult children adjust to their new homes. Although the empty nest women cannot continue to express their love as easily through cooking, cleaning, and doing laundry, informants commonly express their love and use consumption as an outlet for the enactment of their mothering role. Thus, the enactment of love and the mothering role change from an emphasis on expression through production related activities to activities related to consumption and purchases (Firat & Venkatesh 1995). The purchases informants made often still revolved around food and items for their children’s new homes. Consumption for items related to increasing communications and activities are also evident however, as parents seek to spend more time with their children who are no longer as accessible as they once were.

DISCUSSION

This initial data analysis suggests that during the empty nest liminal state identity is evaluated, the self is reformed and new consumption patterns emerge as these liminal consumers reconstruct their sense of self around the changes in their role status. Although a very difficult stage for those who find themselves recently in the empty nest stage, respondents seemed to suggest that with time they adjusted to having their grown children out of the house. Thus, we suspect that with time a rebirth or metamorphosis of the self may occur as the adult parent has time to identify who she is and reconstruct her identity into a self more consistent with her present role and with whom she would like to be (a possible self, Markus and Nurius 1986). This is consistent with the three theories suggested earlier on, related to role changes. Role change theory and role identity theory, argue that initially, role transitions are very difficult for individuals to cope with. However, these data extracts all lent support for role stress theory, providing evidence that after the parent becomes accustomed to having children out of the house that the reduced stress is welcomed.

Empty nest consumers made use of informal ritual and various other coping strategies in the reconstruction of their identity during this liminal state. They appeared to seek out others who were in a similar liminal state in the reconstruction of self. Communitas also appeared to play a prominent role during this transitional period.

LIMITATIONS AND FUTURE DIRECTIONS

This study has the limitation of only collecting and analyzing two data sets. This research stream could benefit from more empirical investigatory research involving more extended engagement with additional bulletin board sites and a longitudinal approach to bulletin board postings. The discipline could also benefit from further research using a multi-method approach which includes netnography as at least one method for generating and analyzing data sets. With the dramatic increase in the use of the net much remains to be learned about consumers through their use of the Internet to communicate with other liminal consumers.

This research project raises many questions that are worthy of investigation. Future research could explore related issues, such as, the experience of mothers who have one child as compared to mothers of more than one child; the different experiences of mothers involved in mother-daughters as compared to mother-son relationships; and the empty nest experiences of single and divorced mothers as compared to those who are married. This study was also focused narrowly on women to the potential neglect of men’s experiences. Our understanding of this important life transition would be improved by research investigating the experiences of men also going through this transition. In addition, dyadic research exploring parent-child experiences would provide valuable additional insights; and researching the wider family context of the empty nest experience could also be useful for promoting understanding of consumer socialization as the family unit changes and evolves.

However, this research clearly provides a rich arena for future research that could help us better understand an important consumer transition that will be occurring more commonly in the next decade and a half. Better understanding of consumer behavior during this transition could help us meet needs and wants more effectively during a time that is especially difficult for many consumers. We join others who have previously called for additional research into changes in consumption related activities that accompany role status changes (Andreasen 1984; Belk 1988; Schouten 1991); and the associated issues of identity and identification.

Further research to investigate the role of objects in reducing the emotional difficulty of the transition could be very helpful. This investigation does provide some evidence that tangible objects may provide emotional support and comfort for those undergoing painful life transitions. Some preliminary work has been done in this area (Belk 1988; Price, Arnould and Curasi 2000; Schouten 1991; Silver 1996), although more is needed before we will be able to understand this life transition and the many others consumers deal with. The changes in enacting mothering from production to consumption are clear from this data but could benefit from additional attention.

REFERENCES


Ambry, Margaret (1993), “Receipts From a Marriage,” American Demographics, (February).


Silver, Ira (1996) “Role Transitions, Objects and Identity” *Symbolic Interaction* 19 (1) 1-20


Exploring the Impact of Gender Identity within Consumers’ Self-schemas on their Consumption of Advertising
Margaret K. Hogg, Manchester School of Management, United Kingdom
Jade Garrow, Manchester School of Management, United Kingdom

ABSTRACT
This exploratory study examines the potential impact of gender identity within consumers’ self-schemas on their consumption of advertising. There is some evidence that individuals process gender-related information differently depending on the degree of centrality of gender to their self-schemas. Bem’s Sex Role Inventory was administered to twenty-five young adults who then watched two television advertisements. The focus group discussions were taped and transcribed. The data was analysed within the context of the respondents’ gender schemas identified via the BEM SRI scores: masculine, feminine, androgynous or undifferentiated; and largely supported the view that the centrality of gender identity affected how consumers process and interpret advertising.

Acknowledgement: The authors would like to acknowledge the grant from the Mark Harrison Bursary Fund, Manchester School of Management, UMIST which supported the costs of data collection for this study.
Using Self-Reference Theory to Explain the Effectiveness of Including Ethnic Minority Models in Advertising
Christina Kwai-Choi Lee, University of Auckland, New Zealand
Nalini Fernandez, Royal Sun Alliance, New Zealand

ABSTRACT
Advertising research has generally not gone beyond offering general support for a positive effect from using ethnic models in advertising on groups of the same ethnicity as the models portrayed. The aim of this study is to provide a theoretical basis to understand this phenomenon. We investigate the role of self-referencing on a minority ethnic group when exposed to an ethnic model in an advertising context and their subsequent influence on attitudes and purchase intentions. When an individual encounters a situation involving the personal self, or a dimension that is central to the individual (in our research, ethnicity is seen as one dimension of self), self-referencing is activated and becomes part of the available information processing system (Krishnamurthy and Sujan 1999). Research suggests that relating information to oneself can heighten information recall and enhances evaluations of ads (Meyers-Levy and Peracchio 1996). The rationale behind the assumption that ethnicity is a dimension of the self that is central for audience of ethnic minority groups is based on the distinctiveness theory (McGuire and Padawer-Singer 1976). The distinctiveness theory proposes that people who take a complex stimulus such as the self as an object of their perception, notice their distinctive traits and personal characteristics more readily because of their greater informational richness and value for discriminating themselves from others. In an integrated society, ethnicity is more salient in the self-concept of members of the minority group than of the majority group. Consequently, since an individual’s self is salient, being confronted with information that is consistent with this dimension should cause them to spontaneously self-reference that information.

These issues were studied using a 2 x 2 factorial between subjects experimental design. Two product categories were used; a watch and tissue paper, representing a high involvement and low involvement products respectively; and an Asian and White female models were used in the advertisements.

Our results reveal a strong self-reference effect from the Asian ethnic minority group, who reacted more favorably than the White ethnic majority group to an ethnic minority role model in an advertisement. However, while there was only a weak self-reference effect on the ethnic majority group, this did not affect their attitudes or purchase intentions. These results provide useful insights for academics and advertisers.

REFERENCES
ABSTRACT
This article is based on research on Web site design and the purchase environment in store to conceptualize the relationships between Web site design and the consumer behavior. The framework suggested here recalls the relationships between the design, the perception of the Web site and the consumers’ responses. It postulates that these relationships depend on the context of the visit. Its objective is to answer the question of the determining variables of action to influence the consumer behavior on the Web site, by taking into account the context of the visit.

INTRODUCTION
The number of companies creating Web sites is in perpetual growth since the advent of the Internet. These sites go from a simple page of advertising to the true environment of online shopping. Thanks to the multimedia and interactive character of the Internet, the Web sites provide greater capacities than the texts and photographs of booklets and catalogues. The Web designers must make decisions concerning all the elements which constitute their sites (Tiled background, typeface, music...) and do not always have at their disposal the tools to help them in their choices. However, professionals cannot always wait to have tools to make their decisions. Berthon et al. (1996) explain why the fear of not being on the Web overrides that of having a hastily and badly conceived site in such a way that the action often precedes the reflection.

There exists still few studies which provide solid elements to help the decision makers and it is clear that the rules of electronic commerce are new, complex and academic research will take a long time to apprehend the phenomenon as a whole. However, as Volle (1999) notes, if these rules are different, they must borrow from the past and a reflection on the electronic trade starting from the concepts of the traditional trade can only enrich our comprehension.

Concerning the consumer responses to the Web site as a virtual environment of shopping, the point of view defended here is that the findings resulting from research on the traditional point of sale find application in the Web site. This would initially make it possible to give elements of decision to the expert wishing to build a commercial site on the Internet. Moreover, that makes it possible to provide to the researchers a set of statements and hypotheses to be tested in this new field.

In the lines which follow, the influence of the Web design elements is presented within a framework of consumer behavior. It emerges from a review of the literature that the behavior of the Web user results from internal responses to the commercial environment (the Web site), themselves moderated by individual variables (characteristic and situational). The matter will be based on behavior models taking into account the environmental variables’ influence (Kotler, 1974; Bitner, 1992; Botschen et al., 1999).

Indeed, since the Seventies, academic research has paid increasing attention to the atmosphere of sale. Kotler is one of the first to have described the use of “atmospheres” such as the effort to design buying environment to produce specific emotional effect that enhances the purchase probability. The music, the colors, the scents, the luminosity... are such atmospheric elements. Thanks to the multimedia character of Internet, more and more of Web sites use such elements. How can the effects of these elements be predicted in this new environment which is the commercial Web site? Many studies are increasingly interested in Web site design elements. They show that the Web site, as an environment, can influence the responses and the behaviors thanks to its design elements.

The development of languages for Web site creation (Flash, php...), software and high flow connections (ADSL, cable...) accelerates the use of the “online atmospheres” as elements of Web site design. However, if technological solutions appear slowly, what about theoretical tools allowing the designer to suitably use these elements?

WEB SITE AS A COMPLEX STIMULUS
The Web allows the diffusion of information under multiple formats: text, images, sounds, animations, video... Hyper Text Markup Language allows the presentation of this information in various forms and allows navigation among information. Other languages (Perl, php, Java, JavaScript...) make it possible to make this presentation interactive by adapting it to the material and the user behavior. It is this total of information and functions which are represented by the Web site. The site is thus a complex environment that the designer often organizes it in an intuitive way. It has been shown in studies on the Web that the site can influence internal reactions and behavior thanks to the “online-atmospheres”: screen background (Mandel and Johnson, 1999), music (Galan, 2000), pictures, colors and comments (Drezé and Zafrydene, 1997), degree of abstraction of labels (Bensadoun-Medioni and Gonzalez, 1999).

Several studies exist on the elements of Web site design. However, very few studies state theories on the various forms which each element inside the Web site can take. Most studies deal with textual information. Lohse and Spiller (1998) state six categories in which the attributes from the Web sites fall. These categories suggest finally the various forms that information inside the site can take: merchandise (price, quantity, dimensions, variety...); service (information on policy, conditions of return of goods, various means of transport, FAQ...); promotion (conditions of reduction, innovations, last updates...); convenience (functions of assistance, comments of other users, documentation...); checkout (information related to the procedure of order); store navigation (information on navigation, hypertext links, menus, synopses, plans of site, return to home page buttons...).

HOLISTIC PERCEPTION OF WEB SITE
It is easy to record and analyze consumer behavior during the visit of a Web site: it is thus possible to make studies in a non-intrusive way. However, it is difficult to interpret the relationships between the purchase environment and the consumer behavior without knowing the perception of the Web site and the consumer’s internal states. On the one hand, the literature on environmental psychology suggests that it is the internal responses of the consumer, and in particular its emotional reactions, which influence its behavior (Bitner, 1992). In addition, several researchers show that the consumer behavior and its internal responses are influenced not

1 The authors wish to thank John W. Parmalee for his valuable contribution.
by the objective situation (purchase environment) but by the subjective situation (perception of the purchase environment).

All of the elements of Web site design are not perceived in an independent way but rather in a holistic way. Indeed, in a preoccupation with economizing processing resources, the human mind gathers information in dimensions determining the responses to the environment. Music, colors, typography... are elements of the palette which the Web designer can use to give the site its final form. It is the organization of these elements which will induce the consumer reactions. From this arrangement of stimuli several dimensions can emerge which are as many prisms through which each stimulus can be considered. The screen background color can be pleasant or not but can also form part of a color code and bring information.

Within the context of the Web site design literature, certain dimensions appear in a recurring way: informational dimension, entertaining dimension, interactivity and effectiveness (Eighmey, 1997; Dreze and Zufryden, 1997; Napoli and Ewing, 1998; Palmer and Griffith, 1998; Ghose and Dou, 1998; King et al., 1998; Muyllle et al., 1999; Chen and Wells 1999). The elements of design are not related to only one dimension and each one can be considered along these four dimensions.

**Informational dimension.** The perception which the user has of the information contained in the Web site. It is one of the most important Web site dimensions. Indeed, many users come onto a site to seek information or to find an answer to questions. Most often, the information is related to the product, the company or the sales contract. As noted in Alba et al. (1997), this information makes it possible to evaluate the alternatives within the consideration set. This information must make it possible for the consumer to envisage how s/he will be satisfied after her/his purchase. The nature and the reliability of information are thus important dimensions in order to decrease the perceived risk.

**Entertaining dimension.** The perception which the user has of the recreation and of the pleasure provided by the Web site. This dimension was regarded for a long time as being additional, however it acquires more and more importance. Indeed, today, users use the Web as a place of relaxation and recreation: the increasing use of the term “surfer” symbolizes this behavior perfectly. It is advisable to distinguish certain sub-dimensions. An “aesthetic” sub-dimension related to the perception of the site as an aesthetic object: its beauty, its pleasant character. An “escape” sub-dimension: Korgaonkar and Wolin (1999) suggest that the Web site can provide the user a means of escaping (“I need to escape from reality “”, “[the web] excites my emotions and my feelings“...). A “recreational” sub-dimension, defined by Boulaire and Mathieu (2000) like the propensity of the site to propose games and means of amusements.

**Interactivity.** The interactivity is generally heard within the Web site context as the extent with which the user can take part by modifying the form and the contents of the site in real time (Deighton, 1996). For Ghose and Dou (1998) interactivity is a multidimensional factor which is materialized on the site by 23 interactive functions. Recently certain authors added to the interactivity a social dimension which materializes by the interactions between users (forums, chat sessions...).

**Effectiveness.** It is the perception which the consumer has of the Web site effectiveness. GVU’s study (G.V.U., 1999) stresses the importance of this dimension which was often neglected by the researchers. Indeed, according to this study, the quality of the purchase experience is deteriorated mainly by a bad organization of the commercial Web site and by an incapacity to find the required information and products. Tools like search engines or FAQ make it possible to improve Web site use. However, Web site effectiveness is not limited to its ergonomics. The use of pictures, screen background, music, etc... makes pages which take much longer to load. As a result, the visit of the site is perhaps slowed down by a bad management of the Web site multimedia elements. One can thus isolate two dimensions of the effectiveness of the Web site: the ease of navigation and the loading time of the pages.

### CONSUMER RESPONSES

The Web site characteristics and the perception which the consumer of the Web site has of them can act on the various levels of response (cognitive, emotional, physiological) – as it is suggested for example, in Bittner (1992), Botschen et al. (1999), Fiore et al. (2000). Whereas research on the in-store atmosphere concentrates on the emotional reactions of the consumer, Bittner (1992) proposes to study in parallel the cognitive responses, the emotional responses and the physiological responses.

**Cognitive response.** The site always proposes a certain volume of technical or commercial information which is presented as text. The site also provides information through its environment, its design. As well as Bittner notes, (1992), the environment can make it possible for the consumer to carry out categorizations (expensive, elegant, cheap...) and thus to form or modify its beliefs. The Internet is a virtual world where the company must make a place in the minds of the consumers for its Web site, to relate it to what they know already, in order to reassure them. It would be interesting to study trust as a cognitive response to the environment of purchase. It could be also interesting to study the relations between the cognitive responses of the consumer and its emotional responses. Indeed, Fiore et al. (2000) suggest that the environment can also produce a cognitive pleasure by the mental imagery which it produces.

**Affective response.** The major idea is that the atmosphere acts in a context of minimal involvement, by a peripheral way. In particular its effect is often considered along the factors pleasure, activation and dominance of Mehrabian and Russel (1974). The environment can generate emotions which influence consumer behavior during the visit and the evaluation of their experience.

**Physiological response.** The Web site can involve certain physical reactions. Indeed, the luminosity, the sound volume are elements which the Web designer can modulate and which have a physiological impact. This results in behaviors of approach or avoidance. The human body adapts to the sound in the same way that it deals with the variations of light or temperature.

### Evaluative responses

Several studies show that the activity of shopping is judged according to two aspects: utilitarian or hedonic. Thus, according to Titus and Everett (1995), the effectiveness of shopping is judged compared to the achievement of a hedonic (recreation) goal and/or of a utilitarian goal (search for a product). Babin (1991) determine two values of shopping: a utilitarian value (effectiveness of the visit) and a hedonic value (recreation / pleasure). In the context of the Web sites, measurements of evaluation emphasize this distinction between utilitarianism and hedonism. The studies on the evaluative responses towards the Web site (attitude towards the site, satisfaction, behavioral intention) are often placed in one of these two prospects. Raman and Leckenby (1991) isolate two dimensions of the attitude toward the Web site: a hedonic dimension (evaluation of the Web site on dimension entertainment) and a utilitarian dimension (evaluation of the Web site on effectiveness dimension). The existence of these two dimensions of the evaluation of the visit was confirmed by Bensadoun-Medioni and Gonzalez (1999).

The utilitarian point of view is that the evaluation of the site arises from a variation of the information cost or from the informa-
He explained why the information of a site, if it is too expensive in information by modulating the time of remote loading of the pages. He suggested that the satisfaction of the Web user, its intention to visit the site again in the future and its intention to convey a positive evaluation by word of mouth depends on the value of the information obtained by the user. In particular, the authors suggest that relevance, precision, comprehensiveness, comprehensibility of information are dimensions which can influence the Web site evaluation.

Boulaire and Mathieu (2000) regard the Web site as an experiential product with a high hedonic value. Their postulate is that the emotions felt at the time of the visit build the affective commitment of the user and therefore, fidelity. Chen and Wells (1999) develop the concept of attitude towards the site by using, as a basis work, on the attitude towards advertising. Their measurement is founded on the idea that the Web user will have a positive evaluative reaction if s/he likes it overall.

The majority of the studies do not separate utilitarian and hedonic dimensions and approach both at the same time. Indeed, as Ehismey (1997) notes, Web site users benefit from finding information in a context that adds value in and of itself: effective Web sites demonstrate the productive intersection of information and entertainment.

No research establishes relationships between Web site perception, internal responses of the user, hedonic value and utilitarian value of the visit. However, the results of research on hedonic and utilitarian evaluations of traditional shopping and of consumption experience provide a first apprehension of these relationships. For example, Babin (1991) shows that the functional value of shopping depends on functional qualities of the store (judgement on the sale’s personnel, the layout of the store, localization etc.) whereas the hedonic value of shopping is influenced by the emotional states “pleasure” and “excitation”. Babin and Attaway (2000) suggest that there is a relationship between emotional states, hedonic and utilitarian value of shopping and customer share (the extent of temporal and economic resources proportionally spent in the store compared with the competition).

Behavioral reactions

Research on the atmosphere of the store studies (1) shopping behavior, (2) purchase behavior, and (3) the communication with the other consumers and the employees of the store. Within the context of the Web, certain studies were focused on these three levels of behavior.

Shopping behavior. Research on Web site design was often interested in its impact on the customer in terms of Web site traffic (Dholakia and Rego, 1997), duration of the visit (Raman and Leckenby, 1998; Dreze and Zufryden, 1997) and number of pages seen (Dreze and Zufryden, 1997). Initially criticized due to the fact that robots which search the Web in order to catalogue all the existing sites distort all measurements of audience, or because the use of proxies does not make it possible to obtain all the behavioral data, these approaches now reached rather high levels of sophistication by proposing marginal approaches of audience. For example, Ferrandi et al. (2000) develop a model of measurement of audience distribution between Web site pages, making it possible to measure the impact of ergonomic changes on the flow of visitors between the pages of the site.

Purchase behavior. The sales on the Web remain relatively weak: the Web remains firstly a means of collecting information. It is thus interesting to measure not only the purchase but also the intention to buy by the intermediary of another channel of distribution: “paper” catalogue or physical store. The majority of the measurements made in the study of product choice on the Internet are considered from the utilitarian point of view where the cost of information is the explanatory variable (Hoque and Lohse, 1999). The Web site is an informational environment whose contents can have an impact on the product choice. Thus, Deregatu et al. (2000) show that, for certain products (detergent, margarine, paper towel), the fact that much information is available and easily accessible decreases the impact of the sensory attributes of products and the impact of the brand name. On a hedonic level, some sites are conceived to be entertaining and thus to facilitate impulse purchases (Veillet, 1999).

Communication with the other consumers and the firm. Forman and Sriram (1991) note that the growing segment of the population which suffers from a feeling of loneliness often regards shopping as an privileged means of developing social contacts. There is no physical contact with other customers or the employees of the store. However, certain Web sites include elements (forums and chats) which make it possible for Web users to express themselves, to share their point of view, to find answers to certain questions, to exchange information, to meet new people. The fact that the consumers have the opportunity to have discussions about the products and services of the company makes it possible to decrease the perceived risk of the purchase decision. For Hendon and Hendon (1998), the fact that the site represents a virtual community allows the users to enter into a more stable relation with the company. The electronic mails sent by the consumer to the company as well as the requests for information also provide an indicator of the communication between the consumers and the company.

It is interesting to study the consumer behavioral reactions. Indeed, they provide an indicator of the Web site effectiveness. However, behavioral measurements remain ambiguous: how to explain the duration of a long visit? By an incapacity to find the product required or by the consumer involvement in the visit of the Web site (Bensadoun-Medioni and Gonzalez, 1999). In order to measure this Web site effectiveness, it is advisable to take into account the evaluative responses to the site and the moderators which can influence the consumer responses.

MODERATORS: INDIVIDUAL SENSITIVITY TO THE ENVIRONMENT

It is not possible to consider the environment and the behavior in an isolated way. The atmosphere influences behavior through cognitive processes but the cognitive processes determine which of the environmental dimensions have an influence (Everett et al., 1994). The responses to the environment are not the same ones for all the individuals, they are idiosyncratic. The individual sensitivity will be understood here as the individual propensity to react in a certain manner to the environmental modifications (here materialized by the elements of Web site design). This manner of reacting depends on individual characteristics (sex, age, socioeconomic status) and on situational factors (temporal pressure, waiting, familiarity with the environment...).

Personal factors

Demographics and personality. In a recent study, Donthu and Garcia (1999) try to give a profile of the online shopper in order to include/understand their characteristics, motivations and attitudes. On a sample of 790 respondents, their results suggest that age, income, innovativeness, risk aversion, impulsiveness, variety-seeking propensity, attitude towards direct marketing and attitude towards advertising are significant variables to explain online purchasing. For example, online shoppers are older and earn more...
money than the Web users which do not buy. They are also more impulsive and in search of variety.

**Expertise.** Familiarity with the Web in general is an important regulator of the behavior on the site. Boulaire and Baffolet (1999) explain why, for the laymen, the hindrances and motivations with regard to the Internet depend partly on experiences and attitudes with respect to the computer and on technology in general. In the absence of personal experiences, it is possible that the imagination, influenced by the media, plays a dominating part in the field of representation of the Internet and the electronic commerce. For Hoffman and Novak (1996) the skill of the Web-user must be balanced with the action opportunities on the site. If the expertise of the visitor matches the challenge posed by the Web site (and reciprocally), then the visitor can have an “optimal experience” of the site (flow construct).

**Situational factors**

**Familiarity.** There are two levels of situational familiarity: familiarity with a specific site, familiarity with the company. For Muylle et al. (1999), these types of familiarity are related to the satisfaction which the user can draw from the site.

**Involvement.** The process of visiting a retail Web site implies a certain degree of situational involvement: it is up to the Web user to seek the site, to go there to recover information or to carry out purchases. Hoffman and Novak (1996) isolate enduring involvement with the process, enduring involvement with the product, situational involvement with the product, situational involvement with goal. A study carried out by Mano and Oliver (1993) on the hedonic value and the utilitarian value shows that their intensity depends on the involvement with the product.

**Temporal pressure.** The temporal pressure is one of the important constraints which weigh on shopping (Park et al., 1989). In the context of the Web, this constraint is even more important since the time of connection is often paid for. Weinberg (2000) shows that the latency of perceived loading is directly related to the service evaluation and for reconsidering the site. In the event of strong temporal pressure, the consumer is more sensitive to the effectiveness of the Web site whereas in the event of low temporal pressure, the consumer is more sensitive to the recreation provided by the Web site.

**The motivations of the consumer at the time of the Web site visit.** In this area also, it is interesting to refer to the literature on shopping. Tauber (1972) is one of the first researchers to have been interested in the motivations of the consumer during a supermarket visit. He isolated some motivations which were synthesized by Dawson, Bloch and Ridgway (1990) in three motivations: (1) the purchase of a product or the search for information, (2) to have fun or pleasure, (3) a combination of these two motivations. This typology was taken again by Hoffman and Novak (1996). It distinguishes several objectives: to find a product, pre-purchase search for information, construction of purchase-related information database, opinion leadership, and to have fun. According to Hoffman and Novak (1996), each objective implies a behavior. Product purchase, pre-purchase search for information implies a goal directed behavior whereas the construction of a data-base of information, the desire to be a leader of opinion and to have fun imply an experiential behavior.

The intensity of the hedonic value and the utilitarian value of shopping seem to depend on the context of the visit. Indeed, Babin (1991) show that the individuals tending to have motivations of the

---

**FIGURE 1**

Webscape: a theoretical framework of Website design impact on consumers’ responses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Environment</th>
<th>Holistic Environment</th>
<th>Moderators</th>
<th>Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Creative Palette&quot; of the site: typography colors frames music layout concepts messages pictures images &quot;weight&quot; of information etc.</td>
<td>Informational Dimension</td>
<td>Physiological Response</td>
<td>Evaluative Responses Shopping values Satisfaction Attitude Intention to use the site again Intention to positive Word of Mouth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Entertaining Dimension aesthetic escape recreational</td>
<td>Cognitive Response</td>
<td>Behavioral Responses Shopping Behavior Purchase Behavior Communication with other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Interactivity interaction social</td>
<td>Affective Response</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Effectiveness ease of navigation accessibility</td>
<td>Individual Sensitivity to the Environment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Personal Factors age gender socioeconomic status expertise...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Situational Factors temporal pressure familiarity visit motivations...</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

![Diagram](lozenge)
experiential type test in a more intense way the emotional states “Pleasure” and “Excitation” and grant a more important hedonic value to shopping. One can thus make the assumption that the relationships between perceived Web site characteristics, internal responses, behavioral responses and evaluative responses depend on the objectives of the consumer.

CONCLUSION

The future of electronic commerce depends on the user interface which the Web site can provide. The Web site becomes the intermediary between the consumer and the company and makes it possible to replace a physical sales environment. This work stresses the impact which the design of a site can have on the responses of the user. The framework developed here takes into account the importance of the combination of perceptions of the site, the characteristics of the individual and the situation of the visit. The various variables of the models are exposed in figure 1. That makes it possible to provide to the researcher a certain number of hypotheses concerning the Web site elements and their relationships with the consumer responses. This framework can thus be used to study the relative influence of the various elements of Web site design, to measure the weight of the moderating factors, to determine the impact of the evaluative responses on the behavior and reciprocally. The influence of the situation of the visit appears to be very important. Upcoming research on the evaluation of the Web site as a shopping environment must introduce this variable. Research in store already showed that the evaluations and behaviors could be different according to whether the customer is goal-directed or is engaged in a hedonic surf behavior. Certain works (Raman and Leckenby, 1991; Bensadoun-Medioni and Gonzalez, 1999) suggest that within the context of the Web site this variable is just as important.


Veillet M. (1999), Le site de la semaine: La Boutique de TF1 parie sur la video, *LSA*, 1618, 22


Satisfaction, Trust and Commitment in Consumers’ Relationships with Online Retailers

Janet Wagner, University of Maryland, U.S.A.
Gabrielle Rydström, Barton-Cotton, Inc., U.S.A.

ABSTRACT
The purpose of this research was to explore how consumers perceive their relationships with online retailers. A conceptual framework was developed based on concepts from theories of social exchange, communication, and interpersonal relationships. A mail survey of a random, nationwide sample of 1,000 online shoppers was conducted in the U.S. with a 32% response rate. Nested regression techniques were used to test the hypotheses. The results showed that satisfaction and trust mediate the effects of perceived investments (communication, privacy, user-friendliness) by online retailers and consumers’ commitment to continue the relationship.

Online shopping is still in its infancy, currently accounting for 1-2% of all retail sales. However, the proportion of online to off-line sales is increasing (Harris Interactive, p. B6). In absolute terms, online sales to consumers are expected to increase from $38.8 billion in 2000 to $184.5 billion in 2004 (“B-to-C vs. B-to-B E-Commerce,” 2000). The results of a recent national survey show that U.S. consumers are generally pleased with online shopping and plan to do more in the future (Ernst & Young 2000). Despite positive forecasts for growth in online shopping, its impersonal nature makes it difficult for online retailers to establish enduring relationships with consumers. A challenge for online retailers is how to build and maintain relationships with their customers in a shopping environment that is essentially self-service.

The purpose of this research was to explore how consumers perceive their relationships with online retailers. There were three basic research questions. First, what relational “investments” by online retailers engender consumer satisfaction and trust? Second, how do these investments foster consumer commitment to an online retailer? Finally, do satisfaction and trust mediate the relationship between the online retailer’s relational investments and consumer commitment?

In our model of the consumer’s relationship with the online retailer (see Figure), concepts are borrowed from social exchange theory, communication theory, and interpersonal investment theory. Relational investments by the online retailer, including communication, privacy, and “user-friendliness” of the Web site, were culled from the emerging literature on consumer perceptions of electronic retailing (Donthu and García 1997; Ernst & Young 2000; Fram and Grady 1995; Hoffman, Novak, and Peralta 1999). Relational outcomes of trust, satisfaction, and commitment were derived from the well-established relationship marketing literature (Moorman, Deshpande, and Zaltman 1992; Morgan and Hunt 1994; Oliver 1997). Relational investments by the online retailer directly affect consumers’ trust (the cognitive outcome) and satisfaction (the attitudinal outcome). Trust and satisfaction affect commitment (the behavioral outcome), and mediate the effect of relational investments on commitment.

LITERATURE REVIEW
Relational investments are based on the ongoing exchange of valued resources by partners. In social exchange theory, a resource is defined as anything that provides pleasure and satisfaction (Bagozzi 1975; Holbrook 1999). In theories of interpersonal relationships, resources represent investments in building and maintaining relationships (Rusbult 1980; Rusbult and Farrell 1983). Consumers are more likely to develop relationships with online retailers they perceive to have invested resources in meeting their needs. Outcomes of such investments include relational characteristics such as consumer satisfaction (Altman and Taylor 1973), trust (Foá and Foá 1976), and commitment (Rusbult 1980; Rusbult and Farrell 1983). Because online retailing is so new, the nature of relationships between consumers and online retailers has received little research attention.

Relational Outcomes: Satisfaction, Trust and Commitment
Satisfaction is defined as “pleasurable fulfillment,” a positive affective state (Oliver 1997). It is a key concept in social exchange theory, and is well-established as an outcome of successful relationships in business-to-business and business-to-consumer marketing (Geyskens et al. 1996; Oliver and Swan 1989). To increase consumer satisfaction, organizations invest in resources. If consumers perceive that resources provided by an online retailer meet their needs, satisfaction should result (Oliver 1997). If consumers perceive that needed resources are delivered on a predictable basis, they should develop trust in the organization.

Trust is an individual’s belief that an exchange partner will deliver desirable resources in a predictable manner (Foá and Foá 1976). Trust has received little attention in the consumer behavior literature. Customers trust organizations when they perceive them to be making investments that reduce uncertainty, increase efficiency, and improve the effectiveness of their relationships (Gutek 1997). In business-to-business marketing, trust is considered an antecedent of commitment, and an essential feature of successful relationships (Morgan and Hunt 1994).

Commitment is defined as the intention to continue a relationship because it is worthwhile (Moorman, Zaltman, and Deshpande 1992). Consumers who perceive that the online retailer is investing resources in meeting their needs should consider the relationship important and should be more likely to continue the relationship. Commitment has both affective and cognitive components (Geyskens et al. 1996), so it should be influenced by both satisfaction and trust.

Relational Investments: Communication, Privacy and User Friendliness
Surveys of online consumers show that resources they value in relationships with online retailers include information, privacy, and the “user friendliness” of the Web site (Donthu and García 1997; Ernst & Young 2000; Fram and Grady 1995; Hoffman, Novak, and Peralta 1999).

Communication, the provision of relevant and timely information to the consumer, is essential in any marketing relationship (Berry and Cooper 1992; Dwyer, Schurr, and Oh 1987). It plays a dual role. First, it ensures the consumer has information with which to make decisions. Second, it serves as a vehicle for interaction between exchange partners (Dwyer, Schurr, and Oh 1987). For relationships between online retailers and consumers to flourish, communication must be two-way. Online retailers must provide relevant and timely information, and consumers must be willing to provide personal information for online retailers to use in customizing the shopping experience.

Privacy, as perceived by online consumers, includes the protection of personal information they provide, including credit card information. A notable exception is the recent work of Garbarino and Johnson (1999), albeit in a different context.
security (Fram and Grady 1995; Hoffman, Novak, and Peralta 1999). In communication theory, self-disclosure—willingness to reveal personal information to another party—is fundamental to the development of relationships (Altman and Taylor 1973; Taylor and Altman 1980). Self-disclosure is predicated on the assumption that personal information will be held in confidence by the recipient. Consumers believe that if they are willing to share personal information, the retailer is obligated to respect and protect their privacy. If consumers perceive that an online retailer protects their personal information, they should be pleased (see Oliver 1997), and should be more satisfied with the relationship. They should also be more trusting of the online retailer, because the perception of privacy reduces the uncertainty associated with self-disclosure.

User-friendliness is the ease or enjoyment the consumer experiences shopping with an online retailer. In surveys of Internet shoppers, consumers identify elements of user-friendliness, including ease of site navigation and transaction completion as important aspects of the online shopping experience (Donthu and Garcia 1999; Ernst & Young 2000; Maignan and Lukas 1997). User-friendliness implies that the online shopping experience pleases the consumer, thereby increasing satisfaction with the online retailer. User-friendliness also implies a more efficient and effective shopping experience, which should build trust and enhance commitment.

HYPOTHESES

In this section, we propose three sets of hypotheses. The first set, which includes Hypotheses 1-3, addresses the effects of relational investments on consumers’ satisfaction with, trust in, and commitment to the online retailer. The second set, which includes Hypotheses 4 and 5, deals with the effects of satisfaction and trust on commitment. The third set, which includes Hypotheses 6-8, deals with the mediating effects of satisfaction and trust.

Satisfaction should be a positive function of consumers’ perceptions of the relational investments of the online retailer. If communication from the online retailer contains relevant information received in a timely manner, consumers should be pleased. Similarly, if consumers perceive that personal data and credit card information are safe and secure, they should be pleased by the fact that the potential for an unpleasant experience has been reduced. Finally, perceived user-friendliness should increase satisfaction, because consumers enjoy the shopping experience more.

H1: Satisfaction is a positive function of consumers’ perceptions of a) communication, b) privacy, and c) user-friendliness.

Trust should also be a positive function of perceptions of relational investments. If consumers perceive that communication is predictable and contains useful information, their trust in the online retailer should be higher. The perception that personal information is held in confidence should reduce uncertainty associated with the online shopping experience, thereby increasing trust. Perceived user-friendliness should build trust, because the shopping experience will be seen as more efficient and effective.

H2: Trust is a positive function of consumers’ perceptions of a) communication, b) privacy, and c) user-friendliness.

Commitment should also be a positive function of perceived relational investments. The online retailer’s investments in meeting consumers’ needs should be perceived as increasing the worth of the relationship. Therefore, commitment to continuing the relationship should be higher.

H3: Commitment is a positive function of consumers’ perceptions of a) communication, b) privacy, and c) user-friendliness.

Both satisfaction and trust should increase consumers’ commitment to the online retailer. If consumers are satisfied with an online retailer, they should find the relationship pleasing and worth continuing. The effect of satisfaction on commitment per se, has not been studied. Rather, researchers have focused on related variables. For example, in business-to-business marketing, satisfaction has been shown to affect long-term orientation (Geyskens et al. 1998). Recent conceptual work in business-to-consumer marketing suggests satisfaction should affect loyalty (Oliver 1997; 1999). If consumers trust the online retailer, they should find the relationship predictable, efficient and effective. This implies that the relationship is worthwhile, so commitment should be higher.

H4: Commitment to the online retailer is a positive function of satisfaction.
H5: Commitment to the online retailer is a positive function of trust. Both satisfaction and trust should mediate the effect of perceived investments on commitment to the online retailer. The mediating effect of satisfaction is suggested in recent conceptual work on consumer loyalty (Oliver 1999). Satisfaction should mediate, because it is consumers’ response to the pleasurable fulfillment of needs. If needs are fulfilled satisfactorily, the consumer should be more committed to the relationship with the online retailer. Trust should also mediate. As a “psychological contract” between the consumer and the online retailer, it captures perceptions that relational investments make the shopping experience more efficient and effective, and therefore, more worthwhile.

H6: Satisfaction will mediate the effect of perceived investments on commitment to the online retailer.

H7: Trust will mediate the effect of perceived investments on commitment to the online retailer.

Finally, trust should mediate the effect of satisfaction on commitment to the online retailer. A shopping experience that meets the consumer’s needs should contribute to the perception that the relationship with the online retailer is effective and worthwhile.

H8: Trust will mediate the effect of satisfaction on commitment to the online retailer.

METHOD

The survey was mailed to a nationwide sample of 1,000 online shoppers, whose addresses were purchased from a commercial broker. In addition to the two-page survey questionnaire, subjects received a personalized cover letter explaining the purpose of the survey, and a postage-paid, pre-addressed envelope. The cover letter explained that the results would be used for educational purposes. Respondents were offered a summary of the results, and given two weeks in which to respond.

The questionnaire had three sections. The first section contained questions on the respondent’s online purchasing activities, including type of product purchased most recently, number of online purchases in the last year, and an open-ended question about what was liked or disliked about the online shopping experience. The second section included measures of the major constructs, including relational investments by the online retailer, and the relational outcomes of trust, satisfaction, and commitment. The third section had questions on the respondents’ demographic characteristics, such as age, gender, education, and annual household income.

Unless otherwise noted, the constructs were measured using 5-point, multiple item Likert scales, which were anchored “disagree/agree.” For each construct, items were summed and averaged to create an index. Perceived relational investments of the online retailer included communication, privacy, and user friendliness. The communication scale, which was adapted from Morgan and Hunt (1994), included three items: “Informs me of new products,” “Informs me of special discounts,” and “Informs me quickly of my order confirmation.” The privacy scale included items borrowed from Hoffman et al. (1999), which were, “Will not sell my personal information to other businesses,” “Is not a legitimate business” (reverse coded), and “Is safe to give credit card information to.” A scale for user friendliness was developed by the researchers, and included the following items: “Web site provides useful descriptions,” “Web site is easy to use,” and “Web site is enjoyable to order from.”

Satisfaction and trust were expected to mediate the effects of the relational investments on consumers’ commitment to online retailers. The measure of satisfaction was borrowed from the work of Oliver and Swan (1989). It was treated as a 4-item, bipolar scale. Consumers were asked, on a scale of 1-5, how they felt about the online retailer they were evaluating. The anchors were: pleased/displeased, sad/happy, contented/disgusted (reverse coded), and dissatisfied/satisfied. The measure of trust was adapted from Doney and Cannon (1997) and (Garbarino and Johnson 1999). Items included, “I am confident I will get what I ordered,” “Products always meet my expectations,” “Can be trusted to deliver a good product,” “Is a reliable online shopping resource,” and “Merchandise is of consistently high quality.”

The dependent variable was commitment, the measure of which was adapted from Morgan and Hunt (1994). Items included, “I consider myself a loyal customer,” “I plan to purchase in the future,” and “I care about the long-term success of this retailer.”

RESULTS

Descriptive Statistics

Respondents reported a mean age of 41 years. The majority were female (52%), well-educated (68% > a college degree) and from above-average income (67% > $50,000) households. Books (25%) and electronics (16%) were reported as the product categories purchased most frequently. A majority of respondents (61%) reported having made four or more online purchases in the past year. The profile of our respondents is comparable to that of respondents to a recent survey of U.S. online shoppers by Ernst & Young (2000).

Hypotheses Tests

The model to be estimated is presented in the Figure. The endogenous variables in the model were three relational investments of the online retailer — communication, privacy, and user friendliness. The exogenous variables were the consumer’s satisfaction with, trust in, and commitment to the online retailer. A series of nested regression models were used to test the hypotheses. The results are presented in Table 1. All models were significant, as shown by the F-values. The adjusted R-squared values ranged from 0.33 (Model 2) to 0.531 (Model 7).

Satisfaction with the online retailer was positively affected by perceptions of the online retailer’s communication and user friendliness, but not privacy (Model 1). This result supports H1a and H1c, but not H1b. Trust in the online retailer was positively affected by perceived communication, user-friendliness, and privacy (Model 2). This result supports H2a-c. Consumers’ perceptions of communication, user-friendliness, and privacy were all positively related to commitment to the online retailer (Model 3), supporting H3a-c.

Both satisfaction and trust were positively related to consumers’ commitment to continue to shop with an online retailer (Model 4). This result supported H4 and H5. Satisfaction fully mediated the effect of communication on commitment, as shown by comparing Model 5 to Model 3. It did not mediate the effects of either user-friendliness or privacy on commitment, however. Thus, H6 was supported with respect to communication only. Trust also partially mediated the effects of privacy and user-friendliness on commitment, as shown by comparing Model 6 to Model 3. Thus, H7 was partially supported, with respect to privacy and user-friendliness. Trust partially mediated the effect of satisfaction on commitment, as

2 In Model 3, communication affects commitment. In Model 5, satisfaction is added to the equation, and the effect of communication on commitment disappears.
shown by comparing Model 7 to Model 5. So H8 was partially supported.

Control variables of age (a continuous variable), purchase category (electronics), and number of purchases (coded as a dummy variable: four or more = 1; otherwise = 0) were included in the models. In Models 4-7, age was positively related to commitment to continue shopping with the online retailer. Older consumers were more committed than younger consumers. Number of purchases was negatively related to commitment. Consumers reporting four or more purchases were less committed than consumers who reported fewer than four purchases.

Analysis of Open-ended Comments

Respondents were asked to describe what they liked and disliked about the online shopping experience. The open-ended comments were coded as positive or negative, and are shown in Table 2. The attribute of the online shopping experience mentioned most often was convenience, followed by price. Other attributes frequently mentioned were product, navigation, service, deliver, and speed of transactions. Of the 507 comments, the vast majority (466) were positive.

DISCUSSION

In this research, we explored the effect of perceived relational investments by online retailers on consumer satisfaction, trust and commitment. By integrating concepts from social exchange theory and theories of interpersonal relationships, with the results of research in relationship marketing and services marketing, we developed a model of how consumers perceive their relationships with online retailers.

Consumer satisfaction is enhanced when consumers perceive that the online retailer has invested in resources fulfilling the need for information (communication) and convenience (user-friendliness) in the shopping experience. Contrary to expectations, satisfaction was not increased by perceived privacy. For experienced online shoppers, such as those in our sample, privacy may be considered a "hygiene" factor – a factor noted by consumers only when it is missing — thereby explaining its failure to affect satisfaction (Oliver 1997). The relative magnitudes of the standardized coefficients suggest that both communication and user-friendliness have strong effects on satisfaction with the online retailer (See Model 1).

TABLE 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Exogenous Variables</th>
<th>Satisfaction (Model 1)</th>
<th>Trust (Model 2)</th>
<th>Commitment (Model 3)</th>
<th>Commitment (Model 4)</th>
<th>Commitment (Model 5)</th>
<th>Commitment (Model 6)</th>
<th>Commitment (Model 7)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Satisfaction</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>0.084</td>
<td>0.094***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trust</td>
<td>0.421***</td>
<td>0.187***</td>
<td>0.189***</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>0.084</td>
<td>0.094***</td>
<td>0.126**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>0.520***</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>0.206***</td>
<td>0.098**</td>
<td>0.120***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Privacy</td>
<td>0.064</td>
<td>0.133*</td>
<td>0.192***</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>0.171***</td>
<td>0.073</td>
<td>0.073</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>User-Friendliness</td>
<td>0.391***</td>
<td>0.424***</td>
<td>0.312***</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>0.146***</td>
<td>0.163***</td>
<td>0.136***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>0.069</td>
<td>0.041</td>
<td>0.167***</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>0.137***</td>
<td>0.146**</td>
<td>0.146**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchase Category</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>-0.053</td>
<td>-0.151***</td>
<td>-1.350</td>
<td>-0.079</td>
<td>-1.359</td>
<td>-0.060</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. Purchases</td>
<td>-0.011</td>
<td>-0.046</td>
<td>-0.082</td>
<td>-0.176***</td>
<td>-0.145**</td>
<td>-3.523***</td>
<td>0.146***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adj. R²</td>
<td>0.442</td>
<td>0.330</td>
<td>0.0357</td>
<td>0.513</td>
<td>0.380</td>
<td>0.525</td>
<td>0.531</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F-values</td>
<td>40.85***</td>
<td>25.23***</td>
<td>28.31***</td>
<td>63.53***</td>
<td>43.19***</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*** p ≤ 0.000 ** p ≤ 0.01 * p ≤ 0.05

TABLE 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Total count</th>
<th>Number positive</th>
<th>Number negative</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Convenience</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Price</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Product</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Navigation</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delivery</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speed</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reliability/quality</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Security</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shop anytime</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reputation</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Returns</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Membership</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>507</td>
<td>466</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3 Coefficients reported are standardized
4 In Model 6, trust is added to the equation tested in Model 3. The significance levels of privacy and user-friendliness are reduced.

5 Respondents were members of Quixtar
Consumers’ trust in the online retailer was positively related to communication, privacy, and user-friendliness. The effect of communication on trust is consistent with previous research, albeit in a business-to-business context (Anderson and Narus 1990; Doney and Cannon 1997; Morgan and Hunt 1994). However, the effects of privacy and user-friendliness on trust represent new findings. Perceived privacy reduces the uncertainty associated with providing personal data to the online retailer. User-friendliness enhances the perception that the relationship with the online retailer is efficient and effective. The magnitudes of the standardized coefficients suggest that of the three perceived investments, user-friendliness is most important in increasing consumers’ trust in the online retailer (See Model 2).

Consumers’ perceptions of relational investments also affected commitment to the online retailer. Of the three, user-friendliness appears to dominate (see Model 3). Satisfaction mediates the effect of communication on commitment to the online retailer. The significant effect of communication on commitment was eliminated when satisfaction was included in the model (see Model 5 vs. Model 3). Apparently, satisfaction captures consumers’ perceptions that their need for information is being met (Oliver 1997). Trust is a partial mediator of the effects of privacy and user-friendliness on commitment to the online retailer. The significant effects of privacy and user-friendliness on commitment were reduced, but not eliminated, when trust was included in the model (see Model 6 vs. Model 3). Trust appears to capture some, but not all, of the effects of predictability and efficiency in the relationship with the online retailer.

LIMITATIONS AND DIRECTIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH

This research has limitations that suggest directions for future research. First, the perceived relational investments were limited to communication, privacy, and user-friendliness. The results of recent surveys of online shoppers, as well as the results of our own research (see Table 2), suggest that perceived relational investments should be explored with respect to online retailers’ delivery, pricing practices, and product quality. Second, the relational outcomes were limited to satisfaction, trust, and commitment. While these are well-established outcomes, consumer value is emerging as an additional outcome of satisfaction, trust, and commitment. The significant effects of privacy and user-friendliness on commitment were reduced, but not eliminated, when trust was included in the model. Trust appears to capture some, but not all, of the effects of predictability and efficiency in the relationship with the online retailer.

REFERENCES

ABSTRACT

This article explored consumer values of Web navigation and Internet shopping behaviors on a cross-cultural base. Through an online survey, 500 Korean and 133 American samples were completed. Consumer values of Web navigation divided into two factors; the utilitarian and the hedonic. Many differences were found in consumer values of Web navigation, the Internet usage, and the Internet shopping behaviors between Korean and American. The study presents empirical evidence that consumer values on the Web navigation are relevant constructs in understanding the Internet usage and shopping. The implications of the study were discussed and further researches were suggested.

The number of the Internet consumers and the amount being spent by the Internet buyers has been on the rise. By the end of 2000, worldwide Internet users were estimated 407.1 million (www.nua.ie). Forrester Research expects by the year 2003, the electronic commerce conducted globally will reach $3.2 trillion, representing 5% of global transaction (Forrester Research 1998). The Jupiter communications expects electronic commerce to exceed $6.3 trillion by year 2005 while OECD has a figure of $1 trillion by 2003-05.

The Internet is revolutionizing marketing and trade. As the Internet is essentially a global medium, it is one of the most significant and the greatest marketing tools for the global marketplace (Samiee 1998). The global nature of the Internet, combined with the nature of the communications that it can convey, makes it a perfect vehicle for international interactive marketing. The Internet promises to revolutionize the dynamics of international commerce and even small companies will be able to compete more easily in the global marketplace (Quech and Klein 1996).

International consumer research in a cross-cultural context is needed for better understanding of global online consumer behavior (e.g. Javenpaa and Tractinsky 1999). Cultural imperatives are likely to have a profound impact on the adoption and the use of the Internet in international marketing. For example, as the Internet shopping tend to be impersonal methodical, and policy-driven, it is not clear that Confucian-based cultures focus on personal interaction are fit to it. Furthermore, cultures that score high on uncertainty avoidance are less likely to be early adopters of Internet marketing schemes, even if other cultural imperatives are met. However some observers view the Internet-based transactions as essentially culture–free and personal due to the perception that it brings the parties closer (Peterson et.al 1997).

Some researchers found many international users of the Internet are similar to U.S. users (Quech and Klein 1996). Are Internet users in the world homogeneous and is there worldwide common culture of the Internet? The tremendous advances in global travel, communication, and media have led to suggestions that cultures are converging and that the globalizing of markets will create, or at least lead to, a common culture worldwide. However common or uniform behaviors appear, there continue to be clear differences in what behaviors mean to the individuals and groups of different cultures (Costa and Bamossy 1995). So, Internet users around the world may be surfing the Web in the same way, still there remains many differences in meanings and pursuing benefits relating to the Web navigation.

This research attempts to explore consumer values of Web navigation on a cross-cultural base. Values represent important and desirable end goals. A general view of values guided the research, recognizing both (1) a utilitarian outcome resulting from the conscious pursuit of an intended consequence and (2) an outcome related more to spontaneous hedonic responses (Babin et. al. 1994). The former is called a utilitarian value and the latter a hedonic value. Utilitarian consumer behavior has been described as task-related and rational (Batra and Ahtola 1991). Hedonic value is more subjective and personal than utilitarian counterpart and results more from fun and playfulness than from task completion (Holbrook and Hirschman 1982).

People use media because of the utility they derive from the medium. Consumer values on the Web navigation can be defined as values consumers derive from searching, surfing, or navigation on the Web. Consumers pursue values on the Web for their entertainment, informational (Ducoffe 1996; Eighemy 1997; Schlosser, Shavitt and Kanfer 1999) and purchase utility (Schlosser, Shavitt and Kanfer 1999), and use the Web socially, to gather information, and for economic reasons (Korgaonkar and Wolin 1999). Using the Internet for its informational value and purchase utility - such as directly searching for information to complete a task or to reduce purchase uncertainty - are goal-directed behaviors; whereas, relatively unstructured recreational use are experiential behaviors (Hoffman and Novak 1996). In contrast, experiential behavior has been likened to hedonic and ritualized orientations and reflects nonlinear search (Hoffman and Novak 1996). So the utilitarian value of Web navigation is defined as a value relating to informational, effectiveness, and working of Web surfing while the hedonic value relating to fun, entertainment, absorbing, and novelty.

Especially cross-cultural comparison of consumer values of Web navigation is attempted in this study. People are deeply influenced by the cultural values and norms they hold. Many researchers have classified cultures around the world in various categories. The most typical category is “Western vs. Oriental culture.” The Western cultural value describes individualism and low-context while oriental does collectivism and high-context (Kim et.al. 1998). Individualism-collectivism is a cultural-level variable referring to the extent to which members of a culture tend to have an independent versus interdependent construal of the self (Hofstede 1980).

These cultural values influence consumption related behaviors (Wang 1999). Western cultural values describe how an individual from an individualistic society fulfills his/her needs through a market system that emphasizes individualistic goals (Tse 1996). The independent construction of the self, which is dominant in Western cultures, is rooted in the belief that distinct individuals are inherently separate (Wong and Ahuvia 1998). As hedonic value primarily gratifies the internal, private self, Cheng and Schweitzer (1996) noted that American television ads stressed enjoyment much more than did Chinese commercials. Collectivists tend to be concerned with affiliating with close others, maintaining connect-

---

1 This work was supported by the 1998 Korea Research Foundation Grant.

281 European Advances in Consumer Research Volume 5, © 2001
samples were completed through the online survey. The American
they were given mileage points as rewards. Five hundred Korean
sample was visited and responded to it. They were given mileage
points as rewards. Five hundred Korean samples were completed
through the online survey. The American sample consisted of
65.2% males, 34.4% females, and 23.3% students. The mean periods
of the Internet usage was 4.14 years and the mean time of Internet
usage per week was 19.9 hours.

In the U.S sample, 4.5% were in their teens, 13.5% were
between 20 to 25, 27.6% were between 26 to 30, 38.8% were
between 31 to 39, and 14.8% were over forty years old. The mean
age was 30.8. The American sample consisted of 56.8% males,
43.2% females, and 23.3% students. The mean periods of the
Internet usage was 4.14 years and the mean time of Internet usage
per week was 17.7 hours.

Measurements

A measurement scale for consumer values of Web navigation
was developed according to Churchill (1979)'s framework. To
achieve some degree of measure equivalence, scale pretests were
conducted using American, Korean-American, and Korean.

A measurement of values of Web navigation included a five-
point Likert-type scale from “strongly agree” (5) to “strongly
disagree” (1). All items in the questionnaire used a similar five-
point Likert-type scale. After testing reliability and validity, the
final eight items were chosen (see Table 1). The Internet usage
period and time per week were measured by the open-ended
questions. A measurement of satisfaction of Internet shopping mall
included a five-point Likert-type scale from “very satisfied” (5) to
“very dissatisfied” (1). A measurement of visiting frequencies of
Internet shopping mall included a seven-point Likert-type scale
from “never visit” (1), “1-2 times per year” (2), “1 times per month
(3), “2-3 times per month” (4), “1 time per week” (5), “2-3 times per
week” (6), and “nearly everyday” (7). A measurement of buying
intention at the Internet shopping mall included a seven-point
Likert-type scale from “never buy” (1) to “must buy” (7).

Research Question 1: Are there any differences of utilitarian
and hedonic values of Web navigation between Korean and
U.S. samples?

Research Question 2: Are there any differences of correlation
of consumer values of Web navigation and Internet usage
between Korean and U.S. samples?

Research Question 3: Are there any differences of correlation
of consumer values of Web navigation and Internet shopping behaviors between Korean and U.S. samples?

METHOD

Samples and Procedures

An Online survey was performed for getting data. The Korean
subjects consisted of a panel from an online survey company in
Korea (www.survey.co.kr). A html-formed questionnaire was
on the Website and the panel members visited and responded to it.
They were given mileage points as rewards. Five hundred Korean
samples were completed through the online survey. The American
respondents were contacted through email, newsgroup, Web-board
posting and inviting them to visit the online survey site
(www.survvy.co.kr). The Korean traditional hand pan (bu-chae)
was offered as incentives for them. One hundred and thirty-three
US samples were completed.

In the Korean sample, 4.2% were in their teens, 34.2% were
between 20 to 25, 33.8% were between 26 to 30, 25% were between
31 to 39, and 2.8% were over forty years old. The mean age was
26.5. The Korean sample consisted of 65.2% (n=328) males, 34.4%
(n=172) females, and 38.0% students. The mean periods of the
Internet usage was 2.93 years and the mean time of Internet usage
per week was 19.9 hours.

In the U.S sample, 4.5% were in their teens, 13.5% were
between 20 to 25, 27.6% were between 26 to 30, 38.8% were
between 31 to 39, and 14.8% were over forty years old. The mean
age was 30.8. The American sample consisted of 56.8% males,
43.2% females, and 23.3% students. The mean periods of the
Internet usage was 4.14 years and the mean time of Internet usage
per week was 17.7 hours.

Measurements

A measurement scale for consumer values of Web navigation
was developed according to Churchill (1979)'s framework. To
achieve some degree of measure equivalence, scale pretests were
conducted using American, Korean-American, and Korean.

A measurement of values of Web navigation included a five-
point Likert-type scale from “strongly agree” (5) to “strongly
disagree” (1). All items in the questionnaire used a similar five-
point Likert-type scale. After testing reliability and validity, the
final eight items were chosen (see Table 1). The Internet usage
period and time per week were measured by the open-ended
questions. A measurement of satisfaction of Internet shopping mall
included a five-point Likert-type scale from “very satisfied” (5) to
“very dissatisfied” (1). A measurement of visiting frequencies of
Internet shopping mall included a seven-point Likert-type scale
from “never visit” (1), “1-2 times per year” (2), “1 times per month
(3), “2-3 times per month” (4), “1 time per week” (5), “2-3 times per
week” (6), and “nearly everyday” (7). A measurement of buying
intention at the Internet shopping mall included a seven-point
Likert-type scale from “never buy” (1) to “must buy” (7).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Web Navigation Values Items</th>
<th>Factor Loadings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Factor 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Factor 1 (Utilitarian Value)</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. I browse the Internet web-sites because it is a fast way to get information.</td>
<td>.776</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. I can collect a lot of information by searching through the Internet.</td>
<td>.711</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. I can easily get information through the Internet.</td>
<td>.697</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. I think it is not expensive to get information through the Internet.</td>
<td>.684</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. I can perform my work effectively through the Internet.</td>
<td>.606</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Factor 2 (Hedonic Value)</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The Internet helps me to forget my troubles, and gives me a chance to concentrate on something else.</td>
<td>.850</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Searching for information on the Internet, I forget how time passes by.</td>
<td>.803</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Searching for information on the Internet, I usually get a lot of precious and novel information.</td>
<td>.645</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. I feel pleasant and excited when using the Internet.</td>
<td>.639</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Cronbach's Alpha

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eigenvalue</td>
<td>3.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of Variance</td>
<td>44.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alpha</td>
<td>.781</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
measurement of purchasing frequencies of Internet shopping mall included a five-point Likert-type scale from “never buy” (1), “1-2 times per year” (2), “3-4 times per year” (3), “1 time per one or two months” (4), “2-3 times and more time per month” (5).

RESULTS

Factor Structure of Values of Searching for the Internet Information

Factor analysis, using the principal components method with varimax rotation, was performed to identify characteristics of consumer values of Web navigation.

The factor solution was based on a combined sample. For cross-cultural metric equivalence of two samples, standardizing of the data was applied. The factor structure and reliability coefficients for each factor are summarized in Table 1. The factor structure of consumer value of Web navigation consisted of two aspects, utilitarian and hedonic values. The two-factor solution explained 58.6% of the variance in the correlation matrix. The eigenvalue of the utilitarian value factor was 3.97, and for the hedonic value factor was 1.29. The reliability coefficient for the utilitarian value factor with 5 measurement items was .781, the hedonic value factor with 4 measurement items was .783.

Cross-Cultural Differences of Consumer Values of Web Navigation

To identify cross-cultural differences in consumer values of Web navigation, ANOVA procedures were performed. The dependent variables were the utilitarian and hedonic values using factor score and independent variable was national. For the utilitarian value, USA group was higher than Korean, but for the hedonic value Korean group was higher than USA.

Internet Usage and Consumer Values of Web Navigation

Pearson product-moment correlation coefficients were computed among consumer values of Web navigation and the Internet usage variables. The result is summarized in Table 3.

For Korea samples, both significant positive correlation was obtained between the utilitarian value and the Internet usage periods ($r=.2234$, $p < .001$), and also between the utilitarian value and the Internet usage time per week ($r=.1977$, $p < .001$). There was insignificant correlation between the hedonic value and any Internet usage variable.

For USA samples, a significant positive correlation was obtained between the hedonic value and the Internet usage time per week ($r=.2239$, $p < .001$), but there was insignificant correlation between the utilitarian value and any Internet usage variable.

Consumer Values of Web Navigation and Internet Shopping Behaviors

To identify cross-cultural differences of the relations between consumer values of Web navigation and Internet shopping behaviors, correlation analysis was performed. The results are summarized in Table 4.

Most Internet shopping variables (e.g., frequent visits to the Internet shopping mall, buying intention at the Internet shopping mall, and purchasing frequency of Internet shopping mall) had significant and positive correlation with the utilitarian value of Web navigation among Korea, while only the satisfaction of Internet shopping mall had a significant positive correlation with the utilitarian value of Web navigation among America. In the Korean sample, there were significant and positive relations between the satisfaction of Internet shopping mall and the hedonic value of Web navigation, and also between frequent visits to the Internet shopping mall and the hedonic value.

The results suggest that the more the utilitarian value of Web navigation has, the higher frequent visits of the Internet shopping mall, a higher buying intention at the Internet shopping mall, and a higher purchasing frequency of Internet shopping mall. The more the hedonic value of Web navigation has, the higher the satisfaction of Internet shopping mall and frequent visits of the Internet shopping mall among Korean. Among American, the more the utilitarian value of Web navigation has, the higher the satisfaction of Internet shopping mall is.
TABLE 4
Correlation Results of Values of Web Navigation and Internet Shopping Behaviors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Internet Usage</th>
<th>Korea Utilitarian Value</th>
<th>Korea Hedonic Value</th>
<th>USA Utilitarian Value</th>
<th>USA Hedonic Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Satisfaction of Internet Shopping Mall</td>
<td>.1004</td>
<td>.1098***</td>
<td>.3550***</td>
<td>.1724</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequent Visits to the Internet Shopping Mall</td>
<td>.1227*</td>
<td>.1403***</td>
<td>.0913</td>
<td>.0624</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buying Intention at the Internet Shopping Mall</td>
<td>.2230***</td>
<td>.0383</td>
<td>.1295</td>
<td>.0674</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purchasing Frequency of Internet Shopping Mall</td>
<td>.1471***</td>
<td>.0669</td>
<td>.0716</td>
<td>.0355</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**p < .01, ***p < .001

DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

In international consumer marketing, the Internet may be used for contract negotiations, advertising, direct sales of products and services, on-line distribution of digital information/data, and marketing research (Samiee 1998). So the more studies relating to the cross-cultural online consumer behavior are needed for the effective international Internet marketing.

This research attempted to measure consumer values of Web navigation – the utilitarian and the hedonic value - and to explored the relations between consumer values of Web navigation and Internet usage & shopping behaviors. Differences were found in consumer values of Web navigation, and the relations of these values and the Internet usage and Internet shopping related variables between Korean and American Internet users. The results of this study suggest that consumer values on the Web navigation are a relevant constructs in understanding the Internet usage and shopping.

Korean’s hedonic value of Web navigation was higher than American, and American’s utilitarian value was higher than Korean. These results can be understood that Korean people generally have dynamic characteristics and Internet usage is not limited in work. Koreans consider the Internet as friendly and a close instrument of life, not a calculative or hard machine in the workplace. As American cultural values emphasizes reasonable and analytical aspects of behavior or relation, Web navigation also focuses on the utilitarian value. In addition, this results may be from heavy Internet users of Korea. Hammond et. al (1998) explored the appreciation of the Web’s entertainment and informational value and found light users to perceive it as a source of information, but not entertainment or fun such as the heavy users perceptions.

Longer and heavier users of the Internet in Korea had a utilitarian value of Web navigation. Also Internet shopping variables were more related to utilitarian value in Korea. This means informational aspects of the Internet are important for heavy users and Internet shoppers consider convenience (e.g. time saving, easy to comparison of price, delivery service, etc.) as important factors in Korea.

Consumer values of Web navigation was correlated to the Internet shopping behaviors in Korean sample while was not in American sample. So, consumer values of Web navigation are relevant construct in understanding Internet shopping behavior of Korean than American. In addition, the utilitarian value of Korean is more related to buying intention and purchasing frequency of Internet shopping mall than the hedonic value. This means Korean Internet shopping mall should establish an informational, fast, and effective shopping site than fun and playful for increasing sales.

Present research is in the exploratory stage, and this study presents several challenges with respect to theory building and method. Some measurement scales were based on subjective interviews and the unbalanced sample size between two countries was a problem. It is important to achieve measurement equivalence for the accurate cross-cultural data comparison. Cultural differences were assumed a priori based on different national samples in this study. An explicit measurement of cultural differences is need for the accurate analysis. Also more Internet buying variables should be examined in order to connect consumer value of Web navigation. Unfortunately, this study could not suggest a causal model including these value and variables relating to the Internet. The contribution of the present work will be made clearer through that effort.

REFERENCES


SPECIAL SESSION SUMMARY
The Role of “Fit” in Cause Related Marketing
John W. Pracejus, University of Alberta, Canada

ABSTRACT
As more is learned about consumer response to associations between brands and causes, the issue of “fit”, or how logical the association seems, is emerging as an important area of investigation. The impact of the fit between brand and cause on consumer perceptions of the alliance partners, and the association itself are two of the important issues within this developing domain. It is also important to consider, however, whether fit only affects perceptions, or if it actually changes behavior toward one or more of the alliance partners. The three papers in this session carefully considers these three important issues, as well as corollary questions.

In the first paper, Becker-Olsen and Simmons consider how associational fit can impact important psychological outcome variables related to the sponsorship of non-profit organizations by companies. They not only find enhancement to the partners under high fit, but harm under low fit. In the second paper, Samu and Wymer finds that fit enhances the communication process with respect to alliances between companies and non-profits. They also demonstrate positive effects when the communication is dominated by the non-profit. In the third paper, Pracejus demonstrates that fit between the company and the non-profit can have a significant impact on choice behavior. The technique employed allows consumer attribute tradeoffs to be calculated, so that a dollar value associated with high fit (as opposed to low fit) association can be established.

Clearly the three papers are highly related and deal with an important, emerging issue in consumer psychology. While the substantive area addresses are very similar, different methods are employed, and different sub-issues are addressed. This provides the session with appropriate breadth, as well as depth. This session addresses cause-related marketing, sponsorship, and the psychology of communications.

“Fortifying or Diluting Equity via Association: The Case of Sponsorship”
Karen Becker-Olsen, New York University
Carolyn J. Simmons, University of Virginia

Does the fit between a cause and the sponsoring firm’s image moderate the efficacy of the sponsorship in creating or maintaining equity? Theory and empirical evidence on source identification, brand extensions and alliances, and information economics suggests that high fit should increase the likelihood of accurate awareness of the sponsorship, reinforcement rather than dilution of brand positioning, positive perceptions of corporate social responsibility, and increased brand credibility, all of which can lead to increased purchase likelihood. Further, work on brand alliances suggests that the sponsored cause or event may be similarly affected, leading to an increased likelihood of donations.

We experimentally examine the effects of sponsorship on cognitive and behavioral measures, and isolate the effects of fit (consistency) with brand/company image as a moderator of these effects. Because sponsorship marketers report that their primary objectives are to generate goodwill and promote a positive company or brand image (Cornwall and Maignan 1998; des Thwaites, Aguilar-Manjarrez, and Kidd 1998; Javalgi, et al. 1994), we focus on beliefs associated with general company/brand image. These beliefs include not only those intuitively related to “good works” such as corporate citizenship, but also those more broadly related to brand equity and credibility, such as product quality and management expertise.

Hypotheses
H1: Fit moderates the effects of sponsorship of a positively evaluated non-profit organization on the favorability of company beliefs, attitudes, and purchase intentions.
1. High fit, as compared to low fit, leads to more favorable judgments.
2. High fit, as compared to a no-sponsorship control condition, leads to more favorable judgments.

H2: Low fit, as compared to high fit, results in greater elaboration, more thoughts about fit, more thoughts about marketing motivations and benefits, more negative elaboration

H3: Low fit, as compared to high fit, results in less favorable attitudes toward the sponsorship.

H4: The effects of fit on attitudes toward the sponsorship are mediated by the elaborative processing described in H2.

H5: The effects of fit on beliefs, attitudes, and purchase intentions are mediated by attitude toward the sponsorship.

Experiment 1
The design is a 3 (sponsorship: high fit, low fit, and no sponsorship) x 4 (company) factorial, with subjects randomly assigned to conditions. The companies and high-fit and low-fit sponsored organizations are: Home Depot: Habitat for Humanity and the Girl Scouts; Tonka: the Boy Scouts and the Crisis Center for Women; Seagram: Mothers Against Drunk Driving and the Muscular Dystrophy Association; and Disney: Make a Wish Foundation and Alcoholics Anonymous. Pretests established that these pairings vary with regard to fit as intended and that liking for the non-profit organizations is not confounded with fit.

As predicted by H1, sponsorship of a favorably evaluated non-profit organization can have a positive effect on beliefs, attitudes, and purchase intentions and this effect is moderated by fit. Most benefits accrue only for high-fit sponsorships, and there are some harmful effects of low-fit sponsorships. These effects have high generality across beliefs and companies.

Experiment 2
The goals of this experiment are to examine H2-H5 regarding the cognitive processes mediating the effects of fit on beliefs, attitudes, and purchase intentions and to verify the construct validity of the fit variable. Because we manipulated fit via news stories that were more complex stimuli than the simple pairings of company and non-profit names used in the pretest, a manipulation check is needed to determine if we successfully manipulated fit as intended.

The design is a 2 (high vs. low fit) x 4 (company) factorial with subjects randomly assigned to conditions. Here we also measured retrospective thoughts about the sponsorship, and perceived fit of the non-profit organization with the company’s image. Low fit does not, as predicted by H5, and
H2°, increase the number of thoughts or the number of thoughts about marketing motivations and benefits. Low fit does, as predicted by H2a and H2b, lead to more thoughts about fit and to less favorable thoughts in general. As predicted by H3 and H3, attitude toward the sponsorship is more favorable when fit is high rather than low, and attitude toward the sponsorship mediates the effect of fit on company beliefs, attitudes, and purchase intentions. However, contrary to H4, the effect of fit on attitude toward the sponsorship is not mediated by thoughts about the sponsorship program. Instead, our analysis strongly suggests the opposite causal flow; that is, that attitude toward the sponsorship mediates the effect of fit on thoughts. Fit may serve as a heuristic cue in the formation of attitude toward the sponsorship (Eagly and Chaiken 1993, p. 327), which is interpreted via a general rule such as things that make sense are good; things that don’t make sense are bad. To the extent that fit operates heuristically—i.e., with little cognitive effort—mediating thoughts are limited and may be less accessible to be reported.

Conclusion:

We have experimentally demonstrated the predicted effects. In addition, we show that the sponsorship partners are not only helped by high-fit sponsorships, but that they are harmed by low-fit sponsorships. This equity dilution occurs even for the sponsored non-profit organization, despite a mission that is defined by a proactive socially responsible use of funds rather than by delivering economic value to stockholders.

These effects of fit are partially mediated by attitude toward the sponsorship, implicating affect transfer and attitude priming as an underlying cognitive mechanism. However, effects of fit are also mediated by brand and non-profit organization credibility, implicating consideration of the predictability of product performance and service activities as a cognitive mechanism. Hence, these effects appear likely under both heuristic and systematic processing conditions.

We also experimentally investigate how simple low-cost program and communication strategies can reduce the risk of equity dilution. Specifically, we show how sponsorship fit can be increased via program details such as gifts-in-kind, and how communications that are perceived as emanating from the non-profit organization rather than the sponsor can moderate the effects of low fit.

Taken together, our findings show how firms can maximize the benefits of sponsorship for themselves and the organizations they sponsor. When the firm engages in a sponsorship solely to increase profits, choice of a high-fit cause is the obvious course of action, and the sponsored organization will benefit as well. When the firm engages in a sponsorship primarily due to a sense of social responsibility, selecting a high-fit cause may be less feasible. However, increasing fit via program details such as gifts-in-kind and creating awareness via communications that emanate from the sponsored organization will benefit both the firm and the sponsored organization.

“Nonprofit-Business Alliance: Outcomes of Joint Communications”
Sridhar Samu, Memorial University of Newfoundland
Walter Wymer, Christopher Newport University

Business-to-business alliances have shown tremendous growth in recent years and demonstrated the potential to grow at an even faster rate (Bucklin and Sengupta 1993, Harbison and Pekar 1993). At the same time, nonprofit-business alliances (NBA’s) have also been growing at an increasing rate (Milne, Iyer, and Gooding-Williams 1996; Andreasen 1996). Such growth has led to renewed research interest in the nonprofit-business alliance sector.

Research on business alliances has had a broad focus and examined a number of different areas, including alliance formation and advertising (Samu, Krishnan, and Smith 1998). However, NBA’s have typically been examined in very specific and limited contexts. Previous research in this area has focused on cause-related marketing (Varadarajan and Menon 1988), sponsorships (Cornwell and Maigian 1998), and company advertising with a social dimension (Drumwright 1996). These topics have been considered as separate areas even though all three are cooperative relationships between a business and a nonprofit organization, charity, or cause. With the growth in new forms of nonprofit-business alliances, identifying and developing a common conceptual theme will aid the understanding of these alliances in general, and each type in particular. Such research will provide a better understanding of the antecedents and process of alliance formation as well as identify the consequences for partnering organizations. By synthesizing the different types of relationships that comprise NBA’s into a conceptual framework, further analysis of its components, like cause-related marketing, can be enhanced. While it is important to focus on the development and operation of nonprofit-business alliances, it is also important to focus on the outcomes of such alliances and that is the focus of this paper.

When examining NBA outcomes, it is important to have a consumer perspective. It is possible that consumers would be exposed to the ads leading to increased awareness; however, it is also important to examine changes in memory, attitude, and behavior to have a better understanding of the success of NBA communications.

Factors Affecting Alliance Outcomes:

The consequences of alliance communication would depend on consumer perceptions of the firms in the alliance. While the individual perception of each of the firms will be important in any evaluation, it is the combined effect of the firms in a communication that would have a larger effect. Hence, the fit between the firms (Variable 1) would play a significant role in the evaluation process (Andreasen 1996). Even if the for-profit firm is perceived to be unethical in its operations (e.g., Union Carbide accident in Bhopal, India), consumers may still be willing to accept a joint communication if the right type of nonprofit firm is a partner (e.g., nonprofit firm working with the affected people). Hence, the fit between the business and nonprofit firm could serve as a more powerful indicator than the perception of the individual firms.

The consequences for both firms would depend significantly on the fit between the two partners. If consumers perceive a good fit between the two firms, the relationship is more easily understood. Hence, they are more likely to process the information in a positive manner leading to increased liking toward both firms (Samu, Krishnan, and Smith 1999; Aaker and Keller 1990). On the other hand, if the perception of fit between the firms is weak, consumers may attribute negative reasons for the formation of the NBA (e.g., for-profit firm trying to look good), and this could result in a loss for both the firms.

A second factor influencing consumer processing and outcomes is the perception of dominance in a joint NBA communication (Variable 2). Dominance can be conceptualized as the amount of space/time occupied by each of the firms in any communication. If the firms share equal space/time, there is no dominance. In this situation, consumers could believe that both firms have contributed equally to the alliance and this belief could lead to positive feelings towards the firms. If the for-profit firm dominates, consumers could interpret this as an indication that the business may be interested in benefiting commercially from the alliance. This public perception
could lead to negative feelings towards the business. It could also lead to negative feelings towards the nonprofit firm for allowing it to be compromised by a business’s self-interest. On the other hand, if the nonprofit firm dominates, consumers are more likely to believe that the for-profit firm supports the cause and this could lead to positive feelings towards both the nonprofit and the business.

A third factor that could influence the evaluation of NBA communication is the type of NBA (Variable 3). A number of different types of NBA’s, ranging from corporate foundation to joint ventures, have been identified. Depending on the relative roles of the for-profit and nonprofit firms and their perceived locus of control and focus of interest in the NBA, consumers could attribute different motives for such communication. When the for-profit firm is perceived to have more control, it is possible that consumers could attribute profit oriented motives to the communication. When the nonprofit firm is perceived to have more control, consumers could view the communication in a positive manner.

Study 1:
A preliminary study used a 2 (fit) X 2 (dominance) design. The focal brand was “Gerber baby food”. Pretesting determined that a high fit cause was “Save the Children” and a lower fit cause was “National Wildlife Fund”. These associations were presented to undergraduate subjects in a cause related marketing scenario. Results indicated that both fit and dominance have a significant effect on processing (cognitive thoughts), attitude towards both firms, intention to purchase (for-profit), and intention to contribute (nonprofit). Consumers had more positive thoughts during processing, more positive attitudes and intention to purchase/ contribute when the fit was high and the communication was dominated by the nonprofit organization. On the other hand, when fit was low and the communication was dominated by the for-profit firm, the overall responses were negative. There was also a significant interaction between fit and dominance.

Conclusion:
This paper presents a structure for understanding the outcomes of an alliance between a nonprofit and a for-profit firm. The focus has been on identifying the factors that influence processing by consumers and the factors that affect the consequences.

A broad overview of alliance formation and outcomes is essential given the rapid growth of alliances between for-profit and nonprofit firms. Such an overview defines the scope of the alliance and provides directions for future research. The outcomes identified in this model can be applied to different types of alliances (e.g., sponsorships, cause-related marketing, etc) and comparisons would also be possible. Such a process will be extremely useful for marketing managers when trying to decide between different types of alliances. Such a comparison would also be useful for managers in nonprofit organizations in selecting the most appropriate form of relationship with for-profit firms. Initial results support this conceptualization. Future research will continue to examine other components of the proposed framework.

“Fit between Brand and Non-profit Organizations: The Impact on Choice for the Sponsoring Brand”
John W. Pracejus, University of Alberta
G. Douglas Olsen, University of Alberta

This paper attempts to determine whether perceived fit between a non-profit and a sponsoring brand can have an impact on choice for the sponsoring brand over a competitor. Two studies were conducted. In study 1, a 2(high/low fit)x2(brand name) between-subjects design was employed. One hundred twenty subjects read a one paragraph description of two brands within a category (theme parks). One of the parks was said to be sponsoring a non-profit. For half the subjects, this was a non-profit which was perceived to have “hi fit” with theme parks, for the other group, it was a non-profit which was perceived to be “low fit” with theme parks. Pretesting determined two non-profits that were equally well liked, but differed in perceived fit with theme parks. For fit, a seven point scale anchored by “very high fit” and “very low fit” was used. The well liked (M=6.1/7), high fit (M=6.1/7) non-profit was the “Children’s Miracle Network”, and the well liked (M=6.3/7), low fit (M=3.2/7) non-profit was the “Kennedy Center for the Performing Arts”. Perceived fit was significantly different for the two non-profits (F=45.81, p<.001), but liking was not (F=1).

Following the description of the theme park and the charity to which the donation would be made, respondents completed a series of 16 discrete-choice tasks. All choice tasks required the respondent to choose between the “Hudson” and “Davis” theme park alternatives. These alternatives were described along five different characteristics: admission price ($24.95 and $34.95); driving distance (45 minutes vs. 90 minutes); number of rides available (32 or 46); food quality (fair vs. good); and hours of operation (8 am to 8 PM versus 7 am to 11 PM). Subjects were told to consider what they had read about the two hotels in the advertisements, as well as the attribute information, which changed from task to task, in arriving at each of their 16 choices.

A full-factorial design was used to create all possible profiles (32) for the first option in each choice task. The choice sets were created by matching profiles from this set with a second set of all possible product profiles. This was done in a manner that permitted all attribute levels for the first alternative to remain orthogonal to all attribute levels for the second alternative. Specifically, the matching was conducted in such a way that all attribute levels for each of the attributes in the first set of profiles were paired an equal number of times with all attribute levels for each of the attributes in the second set of profiles.

In an effort to reduce respondent fatigue, a blocking technique was used, randomly assigning each of the choice tasks into one of two blocks. Hence, each respondent was only required to complete sixteen choice tasks (as opposed to all 32). The order of the choice tasks was randomised within each block.

A main effect of fit (p<.001) was observed, indicating that subjects in the high fit condition chose the sponsoring brand more often than those in the low fit condition. More interestingly, five significant interactions were observed. Significant interactions of fit with price (p<.05), driving distance (p<.01), number of rides (p<.05), food quality (p<.05) and hours of operation (p<.001) revealed that subjects in the high fit group were willing to pay more, drive farther, and deal with fewer rides worse food and shorter hours of operation for the sponsoring theme park than were subjects in the low fit condition.

Study two was done to replicate the findings in a different brand category, and to ensure that fit, and not some other aspect of the Children’s Miracle Network had been responsible for the findings in study one. Additional testing was done to find a product category for which the Kennedy Center would be high fit, and the Children’s Miracle Network would be low fit. Luxury hotels in Washington DC were found to meet these requirements.

One hundred twenty additional subjects participated in study two, which was identical to study one, except that product attributes for hotels replaced product attributes for theme parks. The five attributes used were price, number of free movie channels, exercise facilities, availability of free afternoon wine and cheese, and room service hours. The main effect of fit was replicated. That is, choice
for the sponsoring hotel was greater for the high fit (Kennedy Center) group than for the low fit (Children’s Miracle Network) group. None of the interactions between fit and the product attributes, however, were significant.

While the two studies indicates strong differences in stated preference choice behavior between high and low fit groups, process measures were not taken. A discussion of future research to determine why brand/non-profit fit might have this effect is proposed. Follow-up pilot studies suggest that people may equate fit with greater levels of helping, even when there is no logical reason to make such an assumption.

REFERENCES


Andreasen, Alan R; (1966)

Barbara, Loken, and Deborah Roedder John (1993)

Brown, Tom J., and Peter A. Dacin (1997)


Harbison, John R and Peter Pekar Jr. (1997) “Strategic togetherness” Across the Board, 34, 2 56-57


Loken, Barbara, and Deborah Roedder John (1993) “Diluting brand beliefs: when do extensions have a negative impact?” Journal of Marketing, 57, 3, 71-84


Simonin, Bernard L., and Julie A. Ruth (1998) “Is a company known by the company it keeps? Assessing the spillover effect of brand alliances on consumer brand attitudes” Journal of Marketing Research, 35 (February) 30-42


SUMMARY

"Forum for Advertising Research" is an initiative taken by Copenhagen Business School, in cooperation with a number of major actors in the marketing area in Denmark. Since its start in late 1998, a number of projects have been initiated. Among those, a major group are concerned with emotional effects of advertising, and low involvement data processing. In the present session, five such contributions are presented.

In advertising research, a growing concern has been with peripheral information processing (see, e.g. Petty and Cacioppo, 1988), emotional effects (see e.g. Richins, 1998) and low involvement information processing (see e.g. Rossiter and Percy, 1996). In neuropsychological research, improved insight into functioning of the brain has led to new understanding of emotion in controlling behaviour (see e.g. Dalmassio, 1994). In this special session, five contributions are presented, dealing with different aspects of this stream of research.

Larry Percy talks about low involvement and transitional information, and related emotional and attitudinal responses. Anders Rasmussen reports on a study of emotional responses to advertising, based upon electronic measures of facial response.

Tore Kristensen et al., show how effects of design variations should be studied in terms of peripheral information processing, where emotional responses and attitudes towards the design (A-De) are important. Jens Halling et al. look upon sponsoring as a low involvement information process, and present an index of effect of sponsoring, which relates to emotional responses and attitudes towards the sponsor (A-Sp).

Finally, departing from rhetorical theories, Christian Kock et al. talk about the dimensions in the perception of public spokes persons, and analyse how credibility, carisma, and emotional traits must be considered, in explanation of the popularity of different spokes persons.

In the Introduction and Conclusion of the Session, the interrelationship between the findings of the different projects, will be discussed.

"The Role of Emotion in Processing Low Involvement Advertising"
Larry Percy

ABSTRACT

A correct understanding of the role emotion plays in communication is essential to understanding advertising effectiveness, because emotion is an important mediator of processing. Yet the role of emotion seems to be misunderstood. There are at least two areas where we need to pay particular attention. First, we must be careful not to confuse ‘emotion’ with positive affect. Emotion, even negative emotion, energizes processing, especially memory. And as Rossiter and Percy (1997) have repeatedly pointed out, it is not necessary to ‘like’ all advertising for it to be effective. Emotion should and does operate in the processing of all advertising, even cognitive-oriented advertising. Because something is emotionally arousing does not mean it must be an affectively-oriented advert, at least not in terms of the affect-cognition distinction generally made.

Emotional stimuli should be included in adverts in order to serve an underlying purchase or usage motivation, where motivation is defined as a behavioural energizing mechanism. It is this emotional energy that affects brand attitude communication effects. At the low involvement level, when dealing with negatively motivated behaviour, emotion will operate directly upon brand attitude, but when dealing with positively motivated behaviour, emotion will operate on brand attitude indirectly through attitude toward the advertising. This is why it is essential that advertising dealing with positive motives must be seen as ‘emotionally authentic.’

The second area of caution deals with how we approach looking at emotion in communication. As Rossiter and Percy (1987), again, have suggested long ago, it is foolish to expect a single emotion to be operating throughout the processing of an advert. Yet even academic research continues to reflect a single emotion theory. What is needed for most brand attitude effects in advertising is a dynamic sequence of emotion. This is especially true of low involvement advertising when negative emotions are involved. We shall be discussing how this need for a transition from one emotional state to another follows from Hammond’s (1970) reconceptualization of Mowrer’s (1960) theory of emotions. From Mowrer, one may speculate that the effective emotion in advertising will be close variants of fear, hope, relief, and disappointment. As modified by Hammond, hope and fear lead to excitatory behaviour while relief and disappointment are inhibitors.

In this paper we will be exploring these issues, discussing examples, and presenting the results of research in support of our position.

“Emotions in Mass Communication”
Anders Rasmussen

A study investigating relations between cognitive categories / cultural narratives and psycho-physiological phenomenon in the perception of visual stimuli.

ABSTRACT

Purpose:
The overall purpose of this project is to study emotional, feeling and high reason reactions to visual stimuli and how they work together.

The specific purposes are:

1) To show that emotional processes are relevant and crucial to consumer’s decision-making processes and that it is necessary to distinguish between different levels of emotional responses. These different levels are termed emotions and feelings as described by Damasio.
2) To show how the contextuality of the decision making process determines if emotions or feelings dominates the outcome of the process.
3) To show that EMG and GSR can detect emotional responses while a projective technique as NeedScope can detect feeling responses.
Design:

50 respondents will be tested making decisions in different scenarios. Two of the scenarios will be typically for what Damasio would term emotional (involving sexual attraction and fear of violence) and two will be typically for what Damasio would term feelings (involving justice and morale).

Revealing the character of both the emotional and feeling aspects of the response a special test procedure will be used. The test procedure involves EMG and GSR to reveal the emotional response and the projective technique called NeedScope to reveal the feeling aspect of the response.

Before introducing the respondents to the scenarios they will be introduced to different pictures that will be involved in the scenarios. EMG, GSR, NeedScope and direct questioning will be used to detect responses to the pictures before the four different scenarios. These reactions will be used to predict the outcome of the four decisions making processes in the four scenarios.

Background:

It is a general observation that communication pre-tests reveal aspects of the communication effect related to attention, cognition, emotions and behaviour. It is also well known that market research has its focus on attention (e.g. which commercials do you remember?), cognition (e.g. what was the message of the commercial?) and behaviour (e.g. would you purchased the product after watching the commercial?).

Emotion on the other hand is, if not neglected, given a more superficial treatment, even though emotions often are the most important factor in the decision process. Often researchers rely on the very simple question about liking, “do you like the advertisement?” as an indicator of emotional reaction to the advertisement. This question raises two problems. First of all it is a superficial treatment of a complex phenomenon and second the question of ad liking is very often non-relevant. According to Larry Percy ad liking is not a demand to advertisements. Lots of advertisements sell the product successfully with no or poor ad liking.

Neither is a superficial treatment of emotions in market research harmonious with the strong emphasis on emotional communication in today’s advertising strategies or with the overall shift in cultural meta paradigm from the information society to the emotional society.

What is needed is a better conceptualisation and operationalisation of emotions in a marketing context as well as better test procedures for investigating emotional effects in mass communication. Today, and in the past, theories of emotions divides between biological and social constructivistic viewpoints. Trend setting scientist from both sides are talking about bringing the viewpoints together because both holds some of the truth.

Damasio’s Theory:

Damasio is a rather new researcher, bringing some new and interesting perspectives to the discussion of emotions. With a starting point in the biological aspects, this is his strength, but he is indeed covering both the biological and the social dimension. He distinguishes between emotions and feelings. Emotions represent the signal from the body (a primitive reaction to stimuli), while feelings are a higher perceptual level integrating the emotional signal from the body with sensory perception of the stimuli. In feelings emotions become images. Emotions are subconscious and feelings can be either conscious or subconscious. This is illustrated in the model below from Damasio.
The test clearly discriminates between “true” (existing) designs and artificial (new) ones. On all aspects except paper qualities there were clear indications that the design elements were perceived and that there were discriminating responses to them.

The design tests can be useful both as a pre design input to designers and as a test tool throughout the life-cycle in order to diagnose and identify improvements in the visual appearances and the material artifact itself.

“Estimation of Emotional and Evaluating Effects of Sport Sponsoring”
Jens Halling and Gitte Bach Lauritsen

ABSTRACT

Background:

Sponsoring is becoming still more common as a supplement or alternative to existing marketing, which of course has led to a growing interest in measuring the effects of sponsoring. Thus, the purpose of this project is to study whether it is meaningful to measure emotional and evaluating effects of sponsoring, and if so, to develop a standardised tool for these measurements.

Method:

This project is departing in the ELAM-model (Hansen, 1997), which contains a number of effect measures for advertising pre-testing. These are adjusted, so that they are usable for measurements of sponsoring, and on the basis of this, a pilot study about 21 sponsorships was carried out, with 156 students as respondents. These respondents were asked to evaluate a number of sports sponsorships and cultural sponsorships, as well as some false sponsorships, on the following eight dimensions:

- Awareness
- Emotions towards the sponsorship
- Attitudes towards the sponsorship
- Attitudes towards the sponsor
- Buying intention
- Linking between sponsor and the sponsored product
- Preference
- Liking

Results:

As a point of departure, the analyses are concentrated on the sports sponsorships, as these represent the majority generally, as well as in this particular study. The analyses show that it is possible, indeed, to evaluate sports sponsorships on the mentioned effect dimensions, and some very interesting conclusions can be made. Regarding emotions and attitudes, the factor analyses show that the responses are distributed very nicely in two (for emotions) and three dimensions respectively, so that the number of statements easily can be reduced. Besides, an effect score, consisting of three dimensions: Linking, liking and buying intention, is computed for the 12 sponsorships, which reveals a considerable fluctuation between them. Furthermore the data are analysed and compared in many different ways, such as team-vs. person sponsorships, handball-vs. soccer sponsorships revealing that it is very meaningful to study sponsorships on the above mentioned effect dimensions.
The Role of Emotion in Processing Low Involvement Advertising
Larry Percy, U.S.A.

A correct understanding of the role emotion plays in communication is essential to understanding advertising effectiveness, because emotion is an important mediator of processing. Yet the role of emotion seems to be misunderstood. There are at least two areas where we need to pay particular attention. First, we must be careful not to confuse ‘emotion’ with positive affect. Emotion, even negative emotion, energizes processing, especially memory. And as Rossiter and Percy (1997) have repeatedly pointed out, it is not necessary to ‘like’ all advertising for it to be effective. Emotion should and does operate in the processing of all advertising, even cognitive-oriented advertising. Because something is emotionally arousing does not mean it must be an affectively-oriented advert, at least not in terms of the affect-cognition distinction generally made.

How we evaluate information, the extent to which we attach positive or negative ‘feelings’ to something, is to a large extent an unconscious (non-declarative) product of learning. Much learning involving positive emotion can proceed independently of conscious cognition, and this distinction is critical in the relationship between emotion and motivation (which we explain below). But emotion also has the ability to enhance declarative memory. Although the amygdala and hippocampus systems of the human brain seem to support non-declarative emotional memories and declarative memories separately, they do work together, and this ability of emotion to also enhance declarative memory is mediated by the amygdala.

The second area of caution deals with how we approach looking at emotion in communication. As Rossiter and Percy (1987), again, have suggested long ago, it is foolish to expect a single emotion to be operating throughout the processing of an advert. Yet even academic research continues to reflect a single emotion theory. What is needed for most brand attitude effects in advertising is a dynamic sequence of emotion. This is especially true of low involvement advertising when negative emotions are involved.

**EMOTION AND MOTIVATION**

So what exactly do we mean when we are talking about ‘emotion’? Emotion, strictly speaking, is a response by the autonomic nervous system to a stimulus. There may or may not be a simultaneous cognitive response associated with it. Emotional responses are elicited, which means they occur automatically upon exposure to a particular stimulus, advertising in our case. Because advertising, to be effective, must relate to the underlying motivation that drives behaviour in the category, emotional response to advertising must relate to the correct motivation, and hence to brand attitude.

Rossiter and Percy (1991) see his happening along the lines proposed by Hammond in his reconceptualization of Mowrer’s theory of emotion. The antecedents of motivations are reflected in the operations of deprivation and are usually mediated by internal stimulus change. For Mowrer (1960 a, b) emotion is a key to learning, drives that are associated with specific eliciting conditions. He sees fear, hope, relief, and disappointment as the fundamental emotions. External stimulus changes which might elicit emotions such as hope and relief are thought to stimulate approach behaviour, while the emotions of fear and disappointment are thought to stimulate avoidance behaviour. When someone senses the possibility of danger, fear will occur, and when the potential danger passes, relief. In response to a stimulus where a person expects to be safe, hope will be elicited. But if that expectation passes, there will be disappointment (see Figure 1).

Hammond’s (1970) work is informed by Mowrer’s notion that rewarding events lead to drive reduction and punishing events lead to drive induction. But he reworked Mowrer’s original formulations, suggesting rather that stimuli likely to increase the occurrence of an adverse state or decrease the occurrence of a rewarding state will be excitatory, eliciting fear or hope; stimuli that are likely to decrease the likelihood of either an adverse or rewarding state will be inhibitory, eliciting relief or disappointment (see Figure 2).

Strongman (1987) feels that Hammond provides the best synthesis of behavioural work on emotion, bringing together as it does both Hullian and Skinnerian ideas of behaviourism. He sees emotion as a central state elicited by both learned and unlearned stimuli; and the stimuli in both cases may be the presence or absence of either reward or punishment. To Strongman, this represents emotion within a motivational framework. This fits nicely with the homeostatic concept of motivation advanced by Rossiter and Percy in which there are two fundamental motivating mechanisms, one positive and one negative.

This homeostatic view follows directly from a need for marketing communication to facilitate the formation or reinforcement of a positive brand attitude which is consistent with the appropriate motivation driving behaviour in the category. Most psychologists see all behaviour as the result of specific motivation. With few exceptions these motivations will be classified as positively originated or negatively originated. In their formulation, Rossiter and Percy call negatively originated motives ‘informational’ and positively originated motives ‘transformational,’ and as we shall see, very specific emotional responses will be associated with these different motives.

The onset of a negative stimulus should motivate a person to reduce or remove the stimulus in order to return to equilibrium. You have a headache and seek something to remove the pain (problem removal). You worry about what will happen to your young family if you have a fatal accident, so you buy insurance (problem avoidance). With the onset of positive stimulus, a person will maximize the utility of that stimulus until satiated, at which point they return to equilibrium. You smell fresh-baked cookies in the kitchen, seek them out and eat several until you are full (sensory gratification).

An understanding of this response relationship informs the distinction between informational and transformational brand attitude strategies for advertising. If the underlying motivation driving behaviour is negative, one set of creative tactics related to the emotional portrayal of the motivation will be required; if the underlying motivation is positive, a very different set of creative tactics will be required. We are looking for an emotional response that followed either indirectly from an evaluation of the benefit claim in our advert (the usual path for negatively motivated behaviour) or directly from executional elements within the advert (the usual path for positively motivated behaviour).

While emotional responses to stimuli are very specific, one can nonetheless look for certain emotions to be associated with particular motivations, very much in the spirit of Hammond’s reconceptualizations of Mowrer’s theory. Rossiter and Percy (1987) remind us that emotional stimuli in advertising should be used to
elicit responses that are associated with the appropriate underlying motivation that is driving behaviour in the category. At the same time they point out that there are really no general schema that represent the exact functioning of emotions. However, if we look at something like Russell and Pratt’s (1980) circumplex notion of emotion we can see that one can organize emotions into generalized categories.

Utilizing an emotional categorization theory (like Russell and Pratt), it is possible to see how one can match certain emotional categories with particular motivations. The Russell and Pratt emotional categorization theory arrays categories of emotions around the circumference of a circle in such a way that each category has a logical ‘opposite.’ Unpleasant-Pleasant, Dull-Exciting, Sleepy-Arousing, Relaxing-Distressing. Negative motivations such as problem-solution or problem avoidance are likely to follow a ‘distressing’ to ‘relaxing’ sequence of emotional response. A problem occurs, stimulating a ‘distressing’ emotional response, followed by a ‘relaxing’ emotional state when the problem is solved or avoided. Positive motivations such as sensory gratification are likely to follow a ‘dull’ to ‘exciting’ emotional sequence. Someone is feeling bored or ‘dull’ when confronted with an opportunity to enjoy themselves which elicits a positive ‘exciting’ emotional state.

Perhaps the most important insight here for advertising is the realization that in building or sustaining a positive brand attitude, to adequately address the originating motivation involved a dynamic sequence of emotional responses should be elicited. It would be inappropriate to think in terms of only a single emotion, or more precisely a single emotional state. What is likely to be involved is a transfer from one emotional state to another, and this must be implied or represented in the advertising. ‘Oh, no, look at those stains on my new shirt’ (mild anxiety). ‘Look, the advertised brand got the stain out’ (relief). This should be a very familiar scenario for every detergent or cleanser advert ever run. And it should underscore the fact that a sequence of emotion is involved (a point all too often ignored by both academic and practitioner advertising research).

EMOTION AND ADVERTISING

Let us now turn our attention specifically to emotional responses in advertising. Emotional stimuli should be included in adverts in order to serve an underlying purchase or usage motivation, where motivation is defined as a behavioural energizing mechanism. It is this emotional energy that affects brand attitude communication effects. At the low involvement level, when dealing with negatively motivated behaviour, emotion will operate directly upon brand attitude, but when dealing with positively motivated behaviour, emotion will operate on brand attitude indirectly through attitude toward the advertising. This is why it is essential that advertising dealing with positive motives must be seen as ‘emotionally authentic.’

These two dimensions of involvement and motivation are what define the brand attitude quadrants of the original ‘grid’ theory of Rossiter and Percy (1984). In their view, involvement is defined in terms of risk, either fiscal or psychological. The fundamental difference between low and high involvement advertising is that in terms of processing, low involvement advertising only requires attention and learning, but with high involvement advertising one must also accept the message as true. As a result, it is easier to process low involvement advertising because the target audience does not need to be convinced by the benefit claim, they only need to have their curiosity aroused.

The relative contribution of the emotional component of the benefit claim will differ significantly according to the motivational aspect of the brand attitude. Specifically, when dealing with low involvement/informational (i.e. negative originating motives) advertising the emotional portrayal of the motivation itself is not as important as adequate benefit claim support. Information must be provided that satisfies the need, ‘solves’ the problem being addressed. Emotion in this case will be largely confined to energizing the processing of the message, and the correct emotional sequence will facilitate this. In the low involvement/transformational (i.e. positive originating motives) case, however, the correct emotional portrayal of the motivation is critical to the delivery of the message. Emotional
responses stimulated by creative elements within low involvement advertising facilitate learning.

Rossiter and Percy (1987) proposed a set of specific emotional sequences that might be associated with particular positive and negative motivation in advertising. In their original formulation they are careful to remind us that these hypothesized emotional sequence are just that: typical emotions that might be used in advertising to elicit an emotional response that will help stimulate the motivation. There is no doubt that advertising, like any stimulus, will elicit emotional responses, and that these will be related to motivations. But as noted earlier, emotional responses are specific, not general. Nevertheless, certain categories of emotional response sequences do seem to make sense. To reflect a negative motivation, for example, they suggest an emotional sequence such as ‘annoyed–relieved’ (problem removal) or ‘fearful–relaxed’ (problem avoidance); and to stimulate positive motivations emotional sequences such as ‘dull (or neutral)–joyful’ (sensory gratification) or ‘apprehension (or neutral)–flattered’ (social approval). The debt to Russell and Pratt in this formulation should be clear.

Low Involvement/Informational Advertising

The emotional portrayal of the motivation is low involvement/informational advertising should follow a simple problem-solution format. The problem is presented first, then the brand is offered as the ‘solution.’ This follows from the emotional sequence generally associated with negatively originated motivations. This principle applies to both print and broadcast. Interestingly, low involvement/informational advertising does not need to be ‘liked.’ This type of advertising works by introducing a problem or disagreeable situation which must be associated with negative emotional states before they can be resolved and elicit more positive emotional responses.

Low Involvement/Transformational Advertising

In the case of low involvement/transactional advertising, an authentic emotional portrayal is essential because in most cases it is this emotional response which becomes the key benefit for the brand. When dealing with positive motivations in advertising, one is attempting to draw the target audience emotionally into the role of using the brand. They must ‘see’ or ‘feel’ themselves experiencing the brand’s benefit, satisfying the positive motivation that drives their behaviour in the category, and experiencing the appropriate emotional response. You quite literally feel the exhilaration of driving the car or sense the envy of others as they see how attractive you look (for example) as a result of the advertising. If this positive emotional response is better than what is experienced when exposed to the marketing communication for other brands, this will be reason enough for choosing the brand (given the low involvement nature of the decision).

Unlike when dealing with negative motivations, where there is an emphasis on both the initial negative emotional state followed by the positive emotional resolution, the emphasis here is on the positive emotional end-state of the sequence. Also, again unlike when dealing with negative motivations, it is important that the target audience like the advertising. This should be obvious given the fact that it is the positive emotional response that is created by the advertising which becomes the perceived benefit of the brand.

SUMMARY

In this paper, we have explored the role of emotion in the processing of low involvement advertising, pointing out the important link between emotion and motivation. Behaviour driven by negatively originated motives tend to be more a function of declarative than non-declarative memory, while behaviour driven by positively originated motives is more likely to be mediated by emotional learning associated with nondeclarative memory. Fortunately, the involvement of emotion in processing advertising (especially low involvement advertising) for both positively and negatively motivated product categories is mediated by the amygdala. This, of course, means that emotion plays a role in informational driven advertising strategies as well as the more obvious transformational strategies.

The precise emotional response involved in optimizing the processing of low involvement advertising will be a function of the underlying motivation driving behaviour in the category, as reflected in the brand attitude strategy. The important point is that an emotional sequence is involved, one that is likely to be consistent with the emotional memory associated with category behaviour: negative to neutral or slightly positive for negative motivation; mildly negative or neutral to positive for positive motivation.

Given the discreet nature of emotional responses, empirical testing of emotion-motivation associations and the idea of an emotional sequence is not easy. The problem, of course, is that when free to ‘describe’ one’s emotions, there is no necessarily common vocabulary; and when emotional check-lists are made, there is the problem of emotional meaning. Nevertheless, there is some empirical evidence that does tend to support the theory. Although not addressing the sequence issue, Kover and Abruzzo (1993) found that individual emotions do discriminate well between informational and transformational adverts. This was also supported by Percy and Rossiter (1991). Kamp and MacInnis (1995) found support for at least a low level version of the idea of an emotional sequence, as did Rossiter and Percy (1991). In their study, subjects had an opportunity to select from a list of emotional adjective pairs and single emotion adjectives which they felt ‘best described how they felt the (text) advertisement was trying to make them feel.’ For low involvement/informational adverts, 74% selected an emotional adjective pair; while for low involvement/transactional adverts, 99% selected a single emotional adjective (reflecting the hypothesized end-state emotion associated with positive motivations).

In conclusion, emotion influences the processing of low involvement advertising as these executions stimulate emotional responses consistent with the purchase motivations reflected in the brand attitude strategy. The appropriate emotional sequence, associated with the appropriate motivation, is what facilitates that processing.

REFERENCES


Emotions in Mass Communication

A Study Investigating Relations Between Cognitive Categories/Cultural Narrative and Psycho-Physiological Phenomenon in the Perception of Visual Stimuli

Anders A. Rasmussen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark

BACKGROUND

It is a general observation that communication pre-tests reveal aspects of the communication effect related to attention, cognition, emotions and behaviour. It is also well known that market research has its focus on attention (e.g. which commercials do you remember?), cognition (e.g. what was the message of the commercial?) and behaviour (e.g. would you purchase the product after watching the commercial?). Emotion on the other hand is, if not neglected, given a more superficial treatment, even though emotions often are the most important factor in the decision process (Ambler, 1999 & Hazlett, 1999). Often researchers rely on the very simple question about liking, “do you like the advertisement?” as an indicator of emotional reaction to the advertisement. This question raises two problems. First of all it is a superficial treatment of a complex phenomenon and second the question of ad liking is often non-relevant. According to Larry Percy ad liking is not a demand to advertisements. Lots of advertisements sell the product successfully with no or poor ad liking (Percy, 2000).

Neither is a superficial treatment of emotions in market research harmonious with the strong emphasis on emotional communication in today’s advertising strategies or with the overall shift in cultural meta paradigm from the information society to the emotional society (Jensen, 1999).

What is needed is a better conceptualisation and operationalisation of emotions in a marketing context as well as better test procedures for investigating emotional effects in mass communication. Today, and in the past, theories of emotions divides between biological and social constructivist viewpoints. Trend setting scientists from both sides are talking about bringing the viewpoints together because both hold some of the truth (Strongman, 1998, Griffiths 1997, Harré & Parrot 1996).

My purpose with this study is 1) to investigate the interaction of biological and social elements in consumer’s decision making and 2) to distinguish between different consumer decision context determining the relative importance of biological and social elements.

When it comes to purpose NR. 1 the study is primarily explorative, not knowing exactly what to expect and anticipate. But when it comes to purpose NR. 2 the study has some concrete hypothesis that will be tested through the nature of the research design.

It is important to emphasise that the overall purpose of the study is explorative. The findings should primarily prepare the formulation of a new and more precise research project to be conducted in about 6 month after this project.

Then–in the end–both the projects should help me in formulating a model of emotions in mass communication with an emphasis on an adequate test procedure, formulated in a PhD thesis, bringing together the biological and the social constructivist viewpoint.

DAMASIO’S THEORY

Damasio is a rather new authority, bringing some new and interesting perspectives to the discussion of emotions. With a starting point in the biological aspects, this is his strength, but he is indeed covering both the biological and the social dimension. He distinguishes between emotions and feelings (Damasio, 1995).

Emotions represent the signal from the body (a primitive reaction to stimuli), while feelings are a higher perceptual level integrating the emotional signal from the body with sensory perception of the stimuli. In feelings emotions become images. Emotions are subconscious and feelings can be either conscious or subconscious. This is illustrated in the model (Figure 1) from Damasio (Damasio, 2000).

According to Damasio our perception of stimuli is processed in different levels of perceptual maps. In the first level we have 1) a first-order map of our own body’s primitive reaction to the stimuli and 2) a first-order map of our sensory perception of the stimuli. At the next level these to maps–and especially the relation between bodily reaction and sensory perception–are brought together in a second-order map. This second-order map is the perceptual image that we experience in our consciousness, it is our feeling of the stimuli and it is a mentally constructed non-verbal narrative.

Both emotions and feelings can exist without language, but that is not to say that language does not contribute to the construction of feeling second-order maps–it does contribute. Both emotions and feelings are related to learning and memory, but it is only feeling that is related to working memory and consciousness. Feelings is also reflected in consciousness signalling to us, in our mental problem solving activities the personal and subjective relevants of stimuli and consequences. This makes feelings an important aspect of what normally is referred to as rational decision making. In Bechara gambling experiment it is shown that it is emotions that guide or decisions, even without a conscious knowledge of this. People relying on a 100% rational decision making capacity (can’t use emotional signals due to brain damage in ventromedial part of the neo cortex) can’t make rational decisions in a real life context. Rational decision making rely on emotional capacity (Damasio, 1995).

RESEARCH PROJECT

Purpose

The purpose of this project is to study emotional, feeling and high reason reactions to visual stimuli and how they work together. Cognitive categories and cultural narratives will be investigated in what Damasio terms high reason and feelings, while psychophysiological phenomenon will be investigated in what Damasio term emotion.

It is hypothesised that

1) It is possible to distinguish between emotion, feeling and high reason in decision making

2) Different decision making context gives different importance to emotion, feeling and high reason

Design

Step 1: Respondents (students from the Copenhagen Business School, male, age 18-25) are exposed to 9 pictures of different types of persons (3 appetitiv (1m&2f), 3 adversive (1m&2f) and 3 neutral (1m&2f)) one at a time while measuring their EMG and GSR responses.

Step 2: The respondents are asked to prioritise all the pictures according to personal liking.
**FIGURE 1**

Levels of Life Regulation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HIGH REASON</th>
<th>Complex, flexible, and customised plans of response are formulated in conscious images and may be executed as behaviour</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CONSCIOUSNESS</td>
<td>Sensory patterns signalling pain, pleasure, and emotions become images</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FEELINGS</td>
<td>Complex, stereotyped patterns of response, which include secondary emotions, primary emotions, and background emotions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMOTIONS</td>
<td>Relatively simple, stereotyped patterns of response, which include metabolic regulation, reflexes, the biological machinery behind what will become pain and pleasure, drives and motivations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BASIC LIFE REGULATION</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Step 3:** The respondents prioritise some other pictures of persons (from their own sex and age group) according to liking. The purpose is to find a person the respondent can identify with (without telling the respondent that this is the purpose). The chosen person is given a name, e.g. John.

**Step 4:** Decision scenario A. The respondent is asked to imagine that John is going on a summer holiday to a desert island near Honolulu with a secret room maid which none will ever come to know about afterwards. The task is to prioritise the pictures according to whom he would prefer to go with. The picture with the highest and the lowest priority is probed using NeedScope (relying on the psychological mechanisms of projection and transference) to let the respondent describe the reasons for the judgement in depth and in detail.

**Step 5:** Decision scenario B. The respondent is asked to imagine that John is walking very late all alone in the forest and for some reason everything is very frightening that evening. John is thinking about a series of awful murders that took place in that very same forest a year ago. At some moment in the forest John is surprised and scared by a person stepping out on the path from behind the trees. The task is to prioritise the pictures according to which you would the least like the person to be. The picture with the highest and the lowest priority is probed using NeedScope (relying on the psychological mechanisms of projection and transference) to let the respondent describe the reasons for the judgement in deep and in detail.

**Step 6:** Decision scenario C. The respondent is asked to imagine that John has been falsely accused of possession of Cocaine and replacement of GSR. GSR measures the autonomic reactions to external stimuli and is a supplement to GSR (Galvanic Skin Response) or as an improvement of the psycho physiological measurements of positive versus negative emotional reactions. The respondent is asked to imagine that John’s daughter has social problems at school—probably related to the divorce of her parents—and that the class teacher has recommended that John choose a counsellor to speak to his daughter. The task is to prioritise the pictures according to which John would prefer counselling his daughter.

The picture with the highest and the lowest priority is probed using NeedScope (relying on the psychological mechanisms of projection and transference) to let the respondent describe the reasons for the judgement in depth and in detail.

**SPECIFIC HYPOTHESIS**

1. The first prioritisation (step 1) will correlate with none of the other prioritisation’s (step 4 and 5).
   - Liking is not relevant for the outcome of decision processes.

2. The result of decision scenarios A and B will correlate with the psycho physiological measurements of positive versus negative emotional reactions.
   - Decision processes depend on context. The contexts in scenario A and B are very similar in their relations to basic needs and emotions (sex and fear). Therefore the psycho physiological measurements should give good predictions of the outcome of the decision processes.

3. The result of decision scenarios C and D will not correlate with the psycho physiological measurements of positive versus negative emotional reactions.
   - Decision processes depend on context. The contexts in scenario C and D are not directly related to basic needs and emotions. The decision contexts are more related to social and personal failure, family problems and concerns for people that you love.

4. The NeedScope probing in relation to decision scenario C and D will be more extended and elaborated than what is the case for decision scenario A and B.
   - The decision processes in scenario C and D will to a greater extend depend on cognitive categories and cultural narratives than what is the case for the scenarios in decision processes A and B.

**EMG/GSR AND NEEDSCOPE**

*EMG:* In the literature electromyography is either presented as a supplement to GSR (Galvanic Skin Response) or as an improvement and replacement of GSR. GSR measures the autonomic reactions to
stimuli, but you do not know whether the GSR reaction is positive or negative. What you get is a measurement of the strength of the reaction—the level of arousal, but you still need the valence—is it a positive or negative reaction? EMG is based on theories of interactions between the face and different emotions. The face is believed to both functions as displaying different emotions and as a feedback mechanism to the brain’s construction of emotions. This has been documented in several studies. Using EMG you measure the strength of the electric action potentials in different muscles in the face. Activity in the muscles called zygomatic is correlated with positive emotions whereas activity in corrugator is correlated with negative emotions.

In the research project both EMG and GSR will be used, trying to measure the emotional reaction to the stimuli.

NeedScope: NeedScope is a branded research tool used in market research. Another well-known method with similarities to NeedScope is IMPSYS.

Different sets of pictures with known properties related to projection and transference are used. The sets of pictures are tested and validated, as to the different emotions related to the different pictures. The method is very applicable to revealing the deep cognitive categories and cultural narratives associated with different stimuli at the feeling level.

Besides from choosing a picture from the different NeedScope picture sets that the respondents associate with a specific stimuli picture, the respondent is asked to elaborate and give reasons for matching the NeedScope picture and the stimuli picture.

In the research project NeedScope will be used, trying to capture the feeling reaction to the stimuli.

INDEX OF LITTERATURE
Hussey & Duncombe: “Projecting the right image—using projective techniques to measure brand image”. Qualitative Market Research, Volume 2—number 1.
Griffiths: “What emotions really are”. The University of Chicago, 1997.
A Procedure for Testing the Emotional and Attitudinal Effects of Design
Tore Kristensen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Gorm Gabrielsen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Flemming Hansen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Jens Halling, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark

ABSTRACT
This project presents the problem of testing decisions companies make about their visual appearances before investing heavily in a new design program. The test was developed on the basis of experiments that were inspired by advertising tests (ELAM). The experiments were based on visual material shown to respondents who used a questionnaire. The data has been analyzed by factor analysis and it is shown how the test can be conducted with a reduced questionnaire. We are able to distinguish between the emotions, attitudes, preferences and liking for designs. The findings are valid and the test can be used in practice for diagnosis, pretesting and planning.

INTRODUCTION
The need for pre-testing corporate designs is evident. Often, these programs have been launched with a minimum of tests. The tests most frequently used are qualitative and partial. They focus on one issue, e.g. the corporate reputation, an advert or a product. Comprehensive tests are not common. We, therefore, aim at developing a test that is robust and easy to use for companies and design consultants who want to test a corporate design.

To develop a relatively simple test procedure, a large design test program was initiated. Some findings from this program have been published earlier. The discrimination power of the earliest part of the tests is demonstrated in Gabrielsen et al. (1999). In Hansen et al. (2000), the special role of color in design is explored, and in Kristensen et al. (2000) the applicability of the results from testing different design is discussed. On the whole, the discriminative power of the test items used is well documented. The test took about 50 minutes for the respondents to complete. This procedure is both time consuming and costly, which demonstrates a need for a simplified test that requires less time for respondents to complete and less data analysis.

In this presentation, a reduced, standardized research instrument for applied testing of designs is presented. The process of development included the following steps:

The original data consists of 6 different samples of contrast between the actual design of a travel agency and an artificial design. The artificial design may be seen as an attempt to change the existing design to effect strategic renewal in an existing company. It may also be seen as the attempt, from an entrant, to capture the market by positioning himself closely to the incumbent’s design. Then we obtained data from a bookstore, which was also presented in its original design and contrasted with the artificial design. The artificial design was essentially identical in both samples. This means that we got two samples with the same artificial design, disguised as a travel agency and a bookstore. In both cases, pictures of the façade, brochures, stationary, ticket leaflets and 4 different paper qualities with the same stationary and 4 different colors of the logo represented the designs. Finally, we also tested 2 existing designs corresponding to the Danish railroad’s old and new designs (implemented in 1999 while our data collection took place). The respondents reported their emotions; attitudes and preferences according to words associations describing emotions and feelings based on Richins (1997) test battery. Furthermore, we added a few more words that we wanted to test too. The respondents were asked to indicate the suitability of the pre-selected appropriate words on a 5-point scale. In total, we had 4 different samples with single source data obtained from a monistic test. The data was analyzed in accordance to a factor analysis with varimax rotation. This resulted in a variety of significant factors explaining the discriminations obtained in the testing procedure. The findings are reported in Hansen et al. (1999), Kristensen et al. (2000) and Gabrielsen et al. (2000). Clearly, some word associations obtained a higher score, in the sense of being significant and discriminating factors, than others. The strongest indications were retested in a reduced test battery. We then proceeded to demonstrate how the reduced test might be used as a simplified test.

METHODOLOGY
Design testing involves two basic problems. First, the design must be presented to the respondents in a credible form and in a realistic context. It is seldom possible to do this in practice, either because the alternatives are too costly (car design) or because it is difficult to present the elements that are contained in a complete design line at the same time.

Secondly, unlike the testing of most other forms of communication, design testing deals with more diffuse, emotional, and thus less quantifiable effect measures.

This way of presenting the test elements is relevant when testing individual designs, as well as complete design lines. However, the presentation problem is most distinct in the testing of the design line. We chose to work with the design line problem in general, as well as in particular, e.g. paper quality and colors. We developed a test that would not force people to deliberate on the designs, but rather to entice them to give us their judgements in a natural way. With this kind of test, people usually focus on the company’s offers and not its design. Yet, we believe the design can influence people’s perception of a product or service when there is limited differentiation between competing products or there is quality uncertainty, similarly to corporate associations (Brown and Dacin, 1997).

An artificial design for a travel agency with the name “Subgate” was developed in the form of a logo, a letterhead, a brochure, a store facade, and a ticket envelope. This design was presented both as a new travel agency and as a bookstore. In addition, measures were obtained regarding existing travel agencies and an existing bookstore. Also, they were presented in the form of multiple design elements like those in Exhibit 1.

In this project, the focus is on the testing of the design line, as the experiences achieved here can be transferred to the testing of individual design elements; the reverse action is not possible. It was also chosen in order to work with an experimental set up in line with the research designs that are used in the testing of advertising, packaging, and other communication.

The study was conducted through interviews with student samples in five test rounds. The overall sample is composed of four subsamples consisting of respondents who were selected according to the matched sampling principle. The number of observations, for each of the four designs, is shown in table 1. In addition to
In the ELAM test, measurements reflect central as well as peripheral information processing. The measurements are illustrated in Figure 1. In the first part, the central processing is represented, in the second part we find the peripheral processing. In central information processing, as in problem solving, the individual is concerned with evaluating alternatives and their merits. In advertising, alternatives and their merit is brand/product/company related information.

In the second part of Figure 1, the peripheral, less involved, more emotional information processing is reflected in measurements relating to the story in the advertisement, to aroused emotions and to the execution of the advertisement.

Measurements relating to these two processes are applied to the extent that they are meaningful in concept testing. Using the measures used in advertising testing makes it possible to compare findings with results from other test areas. Measurements concerned with peripheral information processing (Petty et al., 1986) are particularly in focus, but other measurements are also included.

In the complete design evaluation questionnaire, with 228 items, the measures are:

1. Pre/post awareness of the company behind the design being tested.
2. Evaluative effects, Attitudes towards designs (A-De). In the ELAM standard test a battery of eight questions is used. Here, this is expanded to a total of 16 questions.
3. Emotional responses, measured partly with the use of a standardized simple, binary coded battery taken from the...
ELAM procedure. Additionally, considering the importance of the emotional responses in connection with design, an alternative international standardized measurement instrument is also used (Richins, 1997).

4. In the test, respondents are asked to give verbal reactions as to what they like and dislike about the design they are shown. In a sequence of eight questions, they are asked things like what they think the company/design holder wants to communicate through the design, what they would emphasize if they were to describe the design to others, etc.

5. Especially developed questions are used for the purpose of quantifying the role of particularly relevant design elements, logos, colors, paper quality, etc.

6. Word associations. The respondents were asked to choose 4 out of 26 words, such as movie, graffiti, family, etc. These words reflect possible product design related associations, suggested by the designer, indicating what best described the design they had just seen. Since some of the respondents had seen one of the existing companies’ designs, and other had seen only the artificial Subgate design, we expect very different responses corresponding to the different conditions. In association with the product area/company for which it is presented, the words chosen reveal part of the meaning covered by the design.

7. Preferences. From the answers to two different preference questions, a total preference score can be computed.

8. Intentions. Finally, intentions were measured, partly as straightforward “purchase intentions” and partly by asking people whether they found that the design made them more or less likely to choose the supplier with whom the design was associated next time they were to buy books/travel tickets.

**The Reduced Design Battery**

The original test battery, with its 228 items, is obviously far too complex for applied research.

From the measures employed in advertising pre-testing, using the ELAM battery, measures, numbered 2, 3, 5, 7, 8, 10 and 11, are included in the reduced design test battery. Additionally, in the proposed reduced test battery, it is suggested to include number 9, a measure of “design liking”, as well as a self-rated measure of attention value (number 1).

Furthermore, some of the additional measures, which were included in the large questionnaire to reveal aspects of the perception of the design, are also included in the reduced questionnaire.

**Brand Awareness (question)**

By measuring brand awareness, early and late, relative to the exposure of the test material, we hoped that changes in awareness of the name of the designing company could be measured. Such changes did not occur, and consequently we only work with one measure of awareness of the designing company in the reduced battery.

Awareness is, of course, higher for known companies, but it is remarkable that the rated awareness for Subgate is higher in the travel agency condition, than in the bookstore condition.

**Attitudes towards Design (A-De)**

Attitudes towards design are measured along the same attitude-dimensions used for measuring attitudes towards advertising. This battery was improved by adding attitudinal items thought to be particularly relevant for the respondents’ judgement of attitudes towards design.

The answers to these questions were submitted to a factor analysis for each of the five design tests. The factor structure was quite similar for all of the designs, and consequently a joint analysis across the four designs was conducted.

Here, a three-dimensional varimax-rotated solution was found to be very useful. This solution accounted for 58 percent of the total variance, and adding a fourth factor only modestly increased the amount of variance.

The solution is shown in table 2. The first factor obviously suggests entertaining, lively, untraditional and acceptable aspects of the design. We labeled this factor “enjoyment”. Similarly, in advertising testing, the same factor is also labeled “entertaining”.

The second factor reveals the “credibility” of the design. Descriptions such as “informative, trustworthy, effective” are loading on this factor. The third factor combines negative sides associated with the designs. It can be seen as “dislike”. For future analyses, the three highest loading descriptions on each of the three factors are included.

---

**TABLE 2**

Three factor Varimax-Rotated Solution for Attitudes towards Designs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Factor 1</th>
<th>Factor 2</th>
<th>Factor 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Entertaining</td>
<td>0.82</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lively</td>
<td>0.82</td>
<td>-0.06</td>
<td>-0.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exciting</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td>0.15</td>
<td>-0.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imaginary</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>0.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ordinary</td>
<td>-0.66</td>
<td>0.20</td>
<td>0.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dull</td>
<td>-0.63</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>0.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Worth remembering</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td>0.39</td>
<td>-0.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Warm</td>
<td>0.55</td>
<td>0.34</td>
<td>0.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informative</td>
<td>-0.20</td>
<td>0.79</td>
<td>0.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trustworthy</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>-0.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effective</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Realistic</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>-0.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comfortable</td>
<td>0.47</td>
<td>0.53</td>
<td>0.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sensitive</td>
<td>0.33</td>
<td>0.53</td>
<td>0.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stupid</td>
<td>0.08</td>
<td>-0.09</td>
<td>0.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irritating</td>
<td>-0.20</td>
<td>-0.07</td>
<td>0.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Artificial</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>-0.34</td>
<td>0.73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seen too often</td>
<td>-0.19</td>
<td>0.15</td>
<td>0.38</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In Table 3, the scores are indexed for each of the three selected descriptions, for each of the three factors and for each of the four alternatives evaluated. Here, it appears that for the travel agencies, the Kilroy version of the design scores higher than the completely unknown Subgate version in all categories. It scores higher on the stimulating and informative factor, but lower on the negative, evaluative factor.

With the bookstores, a somewhat more complicated picture emerges. Here, the Subgate design wins over the same design in the “Samfundslitteratur” association with regard to the “enjoyment” dimensions, but “Samfundslitteratur” scores higher on the information value and negative evaluations.

The context in which the design is presented influences the evaluations, but an existing, known company does not always give added value to a given design. Looking at the travel applications, in 6 out of 9 cases, the Subgate evaluations come out more positive than the “Samfundslitteratur” evaluations. The more positive evaluation of the artificial design, presented as a real travel agency in contrast to a real bookstore, also suggests a strong, positive interaction with the product area. There are only small differences between the Subgate versions.

**Evaluation of Design Elements**

A design line is composed of a smaller or larger number of elements through which the design is expressed. In the testing conducted here, each design line was represented with different items, as shown in Exhibit 1. Here, the artificial company “Subgate” was presented as a travel agency. In other conditions of the tests, it was presented as a bookstore. Furthermore, the same design elements were presented with the names of an existing travel agency (Kilroy) and an existing students’ bookstore (“Samfundslitteratur”).

The evaluation of each of the design elements may differ, and some evaluative dimensions (attitudes) may be specific to single design elements, such as the paper quality of the letterhead, or the illustrations of the brochure. Others are more general, such as colors, use of font in logos etc.

To explore how the four tested design lines were evaluated for each of the five elements through which they were presented, respondents were asked to evaluate each of the five design elements for each of the five design lines, along 7-8 evaluative statements. Analyzing these statements, design line by design line and design element by design element, we found a remarkable stability in the items, which explains most of the variations in the judgements.

Most of the evaluations were of a more general type, such as “modern, dull, exclusive”, etc. Consequently, it was suggested that we reduce this large element in the original questionnaire, (7 by 5 informational items). This was accomplished by having respondents associate the most general and most important test elements with the items representing the designs. This is shown in Figure 2.
Perceived Relationship among Test Elements

The perceived consistency of the design elements was rated on a single 5-point scale. This scale is maintained in the reduced questionnaire.

The average perceived relationship between the alternatives is shown in Table 4. It seems, for the similar design elements used here, that this relationship is not strongly influenced by the context in which the design elements are presented.

Word associations

To judge the extend to which the different design lines give rise to different associations in the target group, a number of items, such as “summer vacation”, “film”, “graffiti”, “crime”, were suggested by the designers, and the respondents were asked to select five of these. In table 5a and 5b, the varimax-rotated factor solutions is shown based upon the responses to the 26 items, for travel agencies and bookstores, respectively. Both result in three factor solutions affording reasonable interpretations. Obviously, the solutions are different for books and for travel agencies (and so are some of the statements). In applied use, it is recommended that you develop these statements with the tested product area in mind. To identify these items, preliminary research may be required.

In table 6, the percentage of respondents are given for the items loading highest in the first three factors for travel agencies and bookstores, respectively. It appears that these attitudes are different for Subgate and Kilroy Travels, and for “Samfundslitteratur” and Subgate Books.

If the purpose of the Subgate design is to generate an image of “modernity, it is obvious that Subgate, as a travel agency, out-performs the existing Kilroy. On the contrary, Kilroy stands out as more traditional (homemade summer holiday, seaside agency, out-performs the existing Kilroy. Similarly, with the bookstores, “Samfundslitteratur” is seen as much more traditional (80’s, classic, Danish), and much more as a “bookstore” (Special literature bookstore/library), but less “techno-advanced” (sex, “kings”, freedom).

Preferences

Preferences are measured with two 6-point scales taken from the ELAM battery. These are used in the reduced version too.

As seen in table 7, there is little or no effect using this measure. These measures are primarily indicators of central information processing. Here they give a limited indication of such processing, but the real-known companies, of course, score higher.

Purchase Intentions

Purchase intentions in the ELAM test are measured by distinguishing between a direct purchase intention and a self-rated change in purchase intention. The difference between the purchase intention, and the self-rated change in purchase intention may be

---

**TABLE 4**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Connection between Design Elements Index</th>
<th>Kilroy</th>
<th>Subgate travel</th>
<th>Samfundslitteratur</th>
<th>Subgate books</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Average (Index 100)</td>
<td>112.00</td>
<td>99.28</td>
<td>105.00</td>
<td>100.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TABLE 5A & 5B**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Crime</td>
<td>0.66</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>0.19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graffiti</td>
<td>0.66</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>0.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adventure</td>
<td>-0.51</td>
<td>-0.07</td>
<td>0.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adventure*</td>
<td>-0.46</td>
<td>-0.35</td>
<td>0.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Kings&quot;</td>
<td>0.45</td>
<td>-0.04</td>
<td>0.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trekking</td>
<td>-0.45</td>
<td>-0.15</td>
<td>0.37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eighties</td>
<td>0.37</td>
<td>0.28</td>
<td>0.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freedom</td>
<td>-0.33</td>
<td>-0.30</td>
<td>0.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Movies</td>
<td>0.28</td>
<td>-0.48</td>
<td>-0.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Underground</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>0.56</td>
<td>0.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Classic</td>
<td>0.37</td>
<td>-0.51</td>
<td>-0.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year 2000</td>
<td>0.41</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>-0.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discotéque</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.43</td>
<td>-0.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex</td>
<td>0.34</td>
<td>-0.37</td>
<td>0.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grassroot movement</td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>-0.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chaos-pilots</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.31</td>
<td>0.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Cool&quot;</td>
<td>-0.08</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td>0.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Violent</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>0.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East-Germany</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Homemade</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.08</td>
<td>-0.66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youth travel</td>
<td>-0.21</td>
<td>-0.06</td>
<td>0.59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summer holiday</td>
<td>-0.03</td>
<td>0.33</td>
<td>-0.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>seaside holiday</td>
<td>-0.06</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>-0.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA</td>
<td>-0.06</td>
<td>-0.16</td>
<td>-0.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family</td>
<td>-0.06</td>
<td>-0.02</td>
<td>0.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Danish</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.07</td>
<td>0.09</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| The 80's | 0.58     | -0.29    | -0.25    |
| Internet Café | -0.56  | -0.24    | -0.09    |
| Classic | 0.56     | 0.23     | 0.00     |
| Year 2000 | -0.52  | -0.19    | 0.47     |
| Danish | 0.50     | 0.10     | -0.03    |
| East-Germany | 0.50 | -0.27    | -0.21    |
| Family | 0.48     | -0.20    | -0.01    |
| "Cool" | -0.47    | -0.06    | 0.14     |
| Discotéque | -0.46  | -0.29    | 0.03     |
| Homemade | 0.45     | -0.37    | -0.22    |
| Underground | -0.43 | -0.37    | -0.24    |
| Movie | -0.32    | -0.09    | -0.02    |
| Crime | -0.09    | 0.00     | -0.05    |
| Scientific literature | 0.16  | 0.84     | -0.18    |
| Bookstore | 0.15    | 0.77     | -0.24    |
| Library | 0.15     | 0.73     | -0.05    |
| EU | 0.08     | 0.55     | -0.03    |
| Graffiti | -0.37   | -0.37    | -0.16    |
| Fiction | -0.07    | 0.34     | -0.09    |
| Grassroot movement | 0.02 | -0.22    | -0.14    |
| Youth travels | 0.05 | -0.18    | 0.02     |
| Violent | -0.05    | -0.11    | -0.02    |
| Sex | 0.14     | -0.02    | 0.88     |
| "Kings" | 0.14     | -0.02    | 0.88     |
| Freedom | -0.24    | -0.09    | 0.59     |
| Chaos-pilots | -0.31  | -0.15    | 0.36     |
seen as an effect measure of the exposure to the design. The data is shown in Table 8.

In this view, the real company designs generate more positive effects than the artificial Subgate design.

**Emotions**

Emotions were measured with the 12 item emotional battery used in advertising pre-testing. Factor analyses conducted on the emotional responses to the design tested here show that one factor accounts for more then 40 percent of the total variance, and covers the essence of these measures. This factor is shown in table 9a. Four statements, two positive and two negative, are recommended for use in the reduced version.

In addition, we included a selection of meaningful items from an alternative emotional measurement battery (Richins, 1997) based upon the assumption that emotional responses are extremely important in connection with design evaluations. 13 emotional items are rated according to their suitability with each of the four-design/product area combinations. Here, a varimax-rotated factor analysis identified two factors that account for 47 percent of the total variance in the data set. Additional factors account for only little more variance than any single question in the battery, and the two factors are easily identified as reflecting positive versus negative emotions. The solution is shown in table 9b. Thus, we recommend that the three highest loading positive and three highest loading negative items be included in a standardized battery. It is remarkable that the response to both batteries can basically be reduced to positive/negative emotional responses, rather than more elaborate feelings.

The percentage of the respondents who agree with the most important statements in each of the two emotional factor solutions are shown in table 10a. The remarkable sensitivity of these statements is obvious. Joy is definitely more related to the travel alternatives than to the bookstore alternatives. Among the travel alternatives, Kilroy gets the highest score. Grief is first and foremost associated with the bookstores, and so is anger. When the two Subgate versions are compared, the more positive evaluation of the travel version may be ascribed to its association with the travel

---

**TABLE 6**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Associations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kilroy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>factor I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>underground</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>homemade</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TABLE 7**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Preferences (Index 100)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kilroy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avr.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TABLE 8**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Purchase Intentions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bying Intension (Index 100)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kilroy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Avr.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Bying Intension after seen design (Index 100) |
| Kilroy | Subgate travel | Samfundslitteratur | Subgate books |
| Avr.   | 100,00 | 89,67 | 97,00 | 88,33 |
As similar picture, with less dramatic differences in the scores, appears when the second emotional battery is analyzed in the same manner. The data is shown in table 10b.

Here, the Subgate designs for travel agencies do very well.

**Recognizability**

As a separate item of particular importance in design evaluation, the extent to which respondents judge the designs as easily identifiable, is measured by having respondents allocate 100 points to five alternative well-known designs, among which the test-design is one.

In table 11, the artificial Subgate designs score remarkably higher on average both as a travel agency and as a bookstore. The lowest score assigned to the real travel agency and bookstore may be ascribed to the new design being unfamiliar compared to the designs of well-known companies. The lack of perceived recognizability for the known companies may be a result of a lack of recognizability in relation to the existing designs of these companies, as they are known in advance.

In the reduced questionnaire, a measure of recognizability is maintained by the inclusion of a single 5-point rating scale.

**Company Image**

To test whether the different designs influence the perception of the companies behind the designs in different ways, a number of general image statements were included in the battery. While analyzing these perceptions, it turned out, as expected, that different factor structures are found for bookstores and travel agencies, respectively. It turns out that in all four cases, three factor solutions provide meaningful interpretations.

### TABLE 9A & 9B

**Factor Solutions—Emotions**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Anger</td>
<td>-0.85</td>
<td>0.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sorrow</td>
<td>-0.79</td>
<td>0.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pleasure</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>0.73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enjoyment</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>0.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fear</td>
<td>-0.74</td>
<td>0.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Happiness</td>
<td>0.70</td>
<td>0.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mistrust</td>
<td>-0.70</td>
<td>0.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inspiring</td>
<td>0.66</td>
<td>-0.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dominating</td>
<td>-0.43</td>
<td>0.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hope</td>
<td>0.40</td>
<td>-0.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Surprising</td>
<td>0.24</td>
<td>0.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accept</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.56</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

### TABLE 10A & 10B

**Emotions**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Emotions ELAM(Percentage)</th>
<th>Kilroy</th>
<th>Subgate travel</th>
<th>Samfundslitteratur</th>
<th>Subgate books</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Factor I</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joy</td>
<td>55.56%</td>
<td>34.43%</td>
<td>8.33%</td>
<td>2.94%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pleasure</td>
<td>42.86%</td>
<td>45.90%</td>
<td>2.78%</td>
<td>8.82%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grief</td>
<td>4.76%</td>
<td>4.92%</td>
<td>33.33%</td>
<td>14.71%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anger</td>
<td>7.94%</td>
<td>13.11%</td>
<td>25.00%</td>
<td>44.12%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Emotions Richins (1 = Perfect association. 4 = No association)</th>
<th>Kilroy</th>
<th>Subgate travel</th>
<th>Samfundslitteratur</th>
<th>Subgate books</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Factor I</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anger</td>
<td>3.60</td>
<td>3.38</td>
<td>3.61</td>
<td>3.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sad</td>
<td>3.48</td>
<td>3.58</td>
<td>2.78</td>
<td>2.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anxiety</td>
<td>3.22</td>
<td>2.98</td>
<td>3.16</td>
<td>2.54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Factor II</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romantic</td>
<td>3.18</td>
<td>3.72</td>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>4.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Love</td>
<td>3.17</td>
<td>3.69</td>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>3.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Optimism</td>
<td>2.22</td>
<td>2.68</td>
<td>3.45</td>
<td>3.07</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As an example, the Subgate Travel solution is shown in Table 12. Here, the three factors explain 54 percent of the variance with the first factor that reflects "in-ness"; loading on "international", "modern" and "for young people", the second reflects "service", "good selection", "easy to communicate with" and "well-known".

The last factor reflects special "student"-related items, such as "student-friendly" and "long waiting time".

Once again, no standardized battery seems feasible. The questions chosen must be related to product/company/design. The most frequent answers for bookstores and travel agencies, among the statements used here, are: "not a good selection", "not friendly towards students", "not easy to communicate with".

Our research has shown that the different designs give rise to different evaluations along the dimensions used here, but in specific testing we recommended that you work with items selected for their particular relevance to the industry or company in question.

**CONCLUSIONS**

The purpose of this article is to investigate the possibility of a simple robust tool for design testing. Based on an experimental design test with a large questionnaire, we have been able to reduce the number of test elements by weeding out the less discriminative items of the experiments. Redundant information and noise has been removed. What is left is attitudes to the designs, which according to the factor analysis with varimax rotation yielded 3 factors that explained 58% of the variation. The Index Table strongly indicates that discrimination is possible, see Table 2. Also the attitudes towards individual design elements (see Figure 2) demonstrate an ability to distinguish between design elements using a reduced battery. The use of word associations as an additional method of testing reinforces the ability of the test to generate images of very different designs. The number of associative words can be reduced and still be able to represent the company’s images as, for instance, "techno-advanced" (Subgate) vs. homemade, summer seaside holiday (Kilroy). We strongly believe that such feedback provides important managerial information. It was possible to measure preferences and purchase intentions with the reduced test battery. The emotional reactions were measured adequately with 2 factors, indicating positive vs. negative. Additional factors yielded very limited information and a reduction to the 3 strongest positive/negative items in the test battery provided sufficient information. The test also indicated that recognizability strongly favored the artificial designs. Compared to the existing designs, this may indicate that changes in a design, to the extent Subgate differs form Kilroy and Samfundslitteratur, will prompt recognition. This, on the other hand, does not necessarily lead to preferences, because, as the next part of the test showed, incumbent firms (or existing designs) have a stronger foundation. We saw that Subgate was not perceived as credible.

The reduced test should become a useful, robust and practical tool. The reduction of information makes the data collection process faster, and the simpler test battery reduces the computational requirements. The next step will be to investigate other forms of design representation, such as pair wise comparison and the use of personal computers that the respondents would work with. When this is done, the process of transforming data from paper to a database will be eliminated and the test can be conducted over an even shorter period. Also, it will be possible to adjust the sampling during the process because the data can be analyzed along with the data collection. We predict that the use of a portable computer in hall tests and other places will provide feedback about designs from relevant samples faster. It should be possible to transfer such data to management input within a short period of time, so it becomes possible to experiment with more designs and get more detailed test data based on less data. More iterations of the test should support management learning in ways that are not possible when the test takes months to complete.

**REFERENCES**

EXHIBIT 1
Sample Design Line


Estimation of Emotional and Evaluating Effects of Sport Sponsorships

Flemming Hansen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Jens Halling, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Gitte Bach Lauritsen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark

INTRODUCTION

During the recent decades event marketing and sponsorships have become more and more visible as a supplement or a substitute to traditional advertising. It is therefore important to keep developing methods and instruments to measure the effects of this still progressing phenomenon. The purpose of this paper is to investigate whether it makes sense measuring emotional and evaluating effects of sponsorships, and if this is the case—to present a standardised instrument, which can be applied to future research.

Traditionally, effects of sponsoring have been looked upon in terms of an effect hierarchy, amount of exposure to banners etc. Recall of sponsorships and image have been studied generally, effects on the latter having been difficult to identify (Hansen & Scotwin 1994). The perception of sponsorships and related “signals” have rarely been looked upon in the lights of low involvement (Rossiter and Percy 1996) or peripheral information processing (Petty & Cacioppo 1988). It is the purpose with this project to develop a procedure that can do so.

METHODOLOGY

Permission was obtained to approach the new 1999 generation of students at Copenhagen business school, a total of app. 450. Data were collected with a mailed questionnaire and the final analysis was conducted on 150 respondents. It is likely that the non response has resulted in a sample, positively biased in terms of interest in sport and sponsoring. 21 sponsorships were included in the questionnaire, covering 15 sports sponsorships and 6 concerning cultural purposes. Furthermore four not existing sponsorships were included, two in each category, making it possible to do further research on the effects of overclaiming. This however, is not done out in this paper.

MEASUREMENTS

The effect measurements here were inspired by the standardised measures used in advertising testing: The (ELAM) Elaboration Likelihood Advertising Model (Hansen 1997).

In the ELAM test, measurements are made reflecting central as well as peripheral information processing. The measurements are illustrated in figure 1. In the upper part, the central processing is found, in the lower part we find the peripheral processing. In central information processing, as in problem solving, the individual is concerned with evaluation of alternatives and their attributes. When advertising is involved, alternatives and their attributes are evaluated. This may be brand/product/company related information.

In the lower part of Fig. 1, the peripheral, less involved, more emotional, information processing is reflected in measurements, relating to the story in the advertising, to aroused emotions, and to the execution of the advertising.

These measures are applied here to the extent that they are meaningful in testing the effect of sponsorships, and the relevant ones are highlighted in the above figure. The use of such standardised measures has the advantage, that it makes it possible to make comparisons with other test areas, such as advertising and design testing (Kristensen et al 2000). The selected measures in the questionnaire are:

1) Awareness of the sponsorships, simply implying if or if not the respondents has knowledge of the sponsorships existence. (1 in figure 1.)

2) Evaluating effects: Attitude towards sponsors. Here, a standard battery of 12 statements was used, and the respondents were asked to choose three statements that they associated with the sponsors. (4 in figure 1)

3) Evaluating effects: Attitude towards sponsorships. Again, a standard battery was used, and the respondents were asked to choose three statements that they associated with the sponsorships. (7 in figure 1)

4) Emotional responses associated with the sponsorship. Again the respondents were asked to choose three statements from a standard battery of 12 items inspired by the ELAM model. (8 in figure 1)

5) Liking. The respondents were asked to report their “all in all” liking of the sponsorships. (9 in figure 1)

6) Preference with regard to sponsor. Here, the respondents were asked to state, to which extent they would recommend the firms behind the sponsorships or their products, to other people. (5 in figure 1)

7) Linking: This refers to the linkage between the two parties involved in the sponsorship and how obvious the respondents experience this. (6 in figure 1)

8) Buying intention. This was partly measured as straightforward “general purchase intention” by any product from the current sponsor, and partly as the tendencies (more or less willing) to buy any product from the sponsor, after being aware of the existence of the sponsorship. (10 in figure 1)

Some of the measurements do not directly concern the sponsorships but only the sponsor. This could especially be a problem when it comes to firms, which have engaged in sponsoring with the primary purpose to increase their credibility or to enhance their company image, rather than to increase sales. Such firms may have little or no interest in how the sponsorship affects buying intention; still we feel that some sponsors indeed could benefit from these measures.

Development of a reduced measurement instrument

To make it possible to cover a large number of sponsorships in the same data collection a briefer version of the questionnaire than the one used here would be preferable. With all the measurements included in the questionnaire, it becomes quite long, and this of course makes it vulnerable to bias. This is particularly so if telephone interviewing were to be used. Hence, it’s reasonable to investigate, if a reduction of the battery can be made without distorting the basic idea and the results.

The reduction process can be divided into two major steps: first the reduction of the two attitudinal and the emotional response
Since sports sponsorships have by far the largest representation in the Danish market it is decided to concentrate the analyses in this paper on 12 real sports sponsorships, thus, the initial database comprise 1800 sport sponsorship evaluations. Analysis of, and comparisons with "cultural" sponsorships is an object for future research. In making this choice, the fact that the awareness of these cultural sponsorships is very low compared to the sports sponsorships, is also considered. Awareness is shown in table 1. The 12 real sports sponsorships used in this analysis are marked (1), the 4 real cultural sponsorships are marked (2), and the 4 non existing ones are marked (3). (It is seen that only very few respondents claim to be aware of these).

The last sponsorship, Codan--"Copenhagen Open" is omitted to avoid two sponsorships from same sponsor. Furthermore it is chosen to carry out this investigation only for respondents having claimed knowledge of the respective sponsorships, reducing the usable number of evaluations to 1038.

Attitudes towards sponsorships

Attitudes towards the sponsorships were measured along the same dimensions as attitudes towards advertising in general and the answers that emerged from this were submitted to a factor analysis. Both 2, 3 and 4-factor varimax rotated solutions were investigated and seemed to give meaningful interpretations, but the 3-factor varimax rotated solution was chosen because it made good sense and explained 32.4% of the variance, and only little more variance were explained by including a forth factor.

The solution is shown in table 2. The first factor can be characterised as "Attention value", loading high on not "seen to often", not "imaginative", "worth remembering" and "exciting". The second factor is loading on "unnatural relation", "different", not "trustworthy" and not "goodwill making". These statements can be seen as expressing, in a negative sense, the degree of
trustworthiness associated with the sponsorships. Finally the third factor loads on the negative associations indicating disgust, unappealing and inappropriate.

Since each factor in this representation has high loading on two questions, it is recommended that the report and the reduced questionnaire include only two statements from each of the three dimensions.

### Attitudes towards sponsor

Similar analyses were carried out on the data concerning attitudes towards the sponsors. Again several factor solutions were investigated and compared with regard to Eigenvalues, explained variance and theoretical interpretations, and a three factor varimax rotated solution was found to be the most useful. Data are shown in table 3.

The three dimensions found here cover very important dimensions of sponsor images. The first is loading on dynamic, modern and not traditional which easily can be associated with new or “trendy” firms. The second factor contains values that appeal to the “common people” indicating simple, social and not technical, and the third dimension covers the more classic, exclusive values such as conservative, prestigious and aesthetic.

Again it is recommended to continue with two statements from each dimension, this being adequate and it does not distort the original interpretation.

### Emotions associated with the sponsorships

Emotional responses play a major role in the peripheral information process. These reveal how the ad is received and they act as mediators between exposure and ad liking and brand evaluations.

Again a large battery was used and the data were submitted to factor analyses. This, not surprisingly, revealed that the variations could be explained in two dimensions, a negative and a positive. The first factor is loading highest on the negative emotions such as anger, fear and grief, while the second factor loads high on positive emotions such as joy, enjoyment and happiness. Here six statements should be sufficient to capture the essence from this battery, and these are recommended for use in the reduced version.

### Other effect measures

A slightly different approach to the reduction process is used with the remaining effect measures. These measures are concerned with purchase intentions, liking, liking and overall evaluation of or “preference for” the sponsor. Here, it is investigated if some of these measures explain the same variation, and if this can lead to omitting some of them.

All of these perform well in the sense that they are sensitive and seem meaningful to the respondents, however two obvious measures that may be reduced are the two buying intentions. The measure of general purchase intentions is less likely to relate to sponsoring activity, and also in earlier advertising pretests self rated

| TABLE 2 | Three factor varimax rotated solution for attitudes towards sponsorship |
|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|
|                | Factor I | Factor II | Factor III |
| "Attention value" | -0.70     | -0.07     | -0.07    |
| "seen to often"  | -0.69     | -0.01     | -0.03    |
| unimaginative   | 0.37      | -0.15     | -0.02    |
| worth remembering | 0.32     | -0.12     | -0.13    |
| attention making | 0.18      | -0.15     | 0.00     |
| unnatural relation | -0.03   | 0.57      | 0.04     |
| trustworthy      | 0.38      | -0.54     | -0.13    |
| different        | 0.30      | 0.52      | -0.26    |
| goodwill making  | 0.10      | -0.50     | -0.21    |
| misleading       | -0.16     | 0.34      | 0.04     |
| disgusting       | 0.02      | 0.11      | 0.74     |
| unappealing      | -0.96     | -0.11     | 0.67     |
| inappropriate    | 0.03      | 0.19      | 0.42     |

| TABLE 3 | Three factor varimax rotated solution for attitudes towards sponsors |
|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|
|                | Factor I | Factor II | Factor III |
| dynamic         | 0.69     | 0.16     | -0.04  |
| modern          | 0.57     | -0.06    | -0.19  |
| traditional     | -0.53    | 0.13     | -0.06  |
| extrovert       | 0.36     | 0.25     | 0.33   |
| simple          | 0.15     | 0.71     | -0.01  |
| social          | -0.18    | 0.59     | -0.28  |
| technical       | 0.02     | -0.46    | -0.16  |
| egocentric      | -0.15    | -0.29    | -0.26  |
| caring          | -0.17    | 0.21     | -0.04  |
| conservative    | -0.26    | 0.00     | 0.60   |
| prestigious     | 0.11     | 0.00     | 0.50   |
| aesthetic       | -0.08    | -0.11    | 0.50   |
buying intention after exposure has been the most sensitive and the most useful. Additionally the general buying intention has a very high correlation with the preference measure (0.527) indicating that this to a large extent pick up the same variance as the intent measure. With these considerations in mind, it is not felt important to include the general purchase intention, and it is therefore decided to continue with only one buying intention.

Thus, the overall sponsor battery comprises:

1) Awareness
2) Emotions associated with sponsorships (6 Statements)
3) Attitudes towards sponsorships (6 Statements)
4) Attitudes towards sponsor (6 Statements)
5) Buying intention after knowledge
6) Liking
7) Linking
8) Preference

In addition to this it is recommended to include a measure of the respondents involvement with the sponsored event (or the events associated with the teams or persons sponsored). For this purpose the following scale is recommended:

1) Participates actively in…
2) Sees frequently … on TV
3) Sees almost every week
4) Sees frequently on TV
5) Infrequently
6) Rarely
7) Not at all interested in…

**Total Sponsorship effect**

In the following it is attempted to create an overall effectscore for sponsorships. Again this is inspired by the ELAM model, and more directly by the ELAM pretest effectscore, used in measuring the effects of and comparing different ads. The ELAM effectscore is a combined and indexed score containing awareness, liking and (self rated change in) buying intention after seeing the ad, making comparisons between different ads possible. The score is computed as I.

\[ I = \frac{\text{Awareness}}{\text{AverageAwareness}} \times \frac{\text{Liking}}{\text{AverageLiking}} \times \frac{\text{BuyingInt}}{\text{AverageBuyingInt}}. \]

With this score a value larger than one indicates a better than average sponsorship and scores below one do the opposite.

In addition with sponsoring it makes sense to include the score reflecting the extent to which the sponsored event, team or person is seen as linked with the sponsor and the products associated with the sponsor. The respondents self rated perceived linking is, when it comes to sponsorships, very important, since it reflect to what an extent they have comprehended the link between the sponsors and the event, team or person. When this is included the ideal score becomes II.

In addition with sponsoring it makes sense to include the score reflecting the extent to which the sponsored event, team or person is seen as linked with the sponsor and the products associated with the sponsor. The respondents self rated perceived linking is, when it comes to sponsorships, very important, since it reflect to what an extent they have comprehended the link between the sponsors and the event, team or person. When this is included the ideal score becomes II.

Unfortunately awareness wasn’t formulated on a 5 point scale in the questionnaire making it impossible to include in the effectscore in the following analyses of the reduced battery. It is however recommended to work with a self rated attention score in future applications of the test, making it possible to compute the effectscore based on formula I or II. In the following the overall effectscore is computed as III.

\[ \text{II:} \quad \frac{\text{Awareness}}{\text{AverageAwareness}} \times \frac{\text{Liking}}{\text{AverageLiking}} \times \frac{\text{BuyingInt}}{\text{AverageBuyingInt}} \times \frac{\text{Linking}}{\text{AverageLinking}} \]

This approach means that for each measure the data are summarised and the average score indexed, before the final score is calculated as the three effect measure scores multiplied. The result of this is shown below (Table 5).

This table shows large differences in the way sponsorships are perceived on these 3 effect dimensions, and in the following it is possible to give a comparative evaluation of them.

Before that, a few remarks are in order on the use of the integrated sponsor evaluation system introduced here. Two aspects are important.

First, to evaluate how a specific sponsor program works, it is possible to have something to hold it up against. In the present approach, this is accomplished by analysing several different sponsorships.

Secondly, it is important both to be able to judge the overall effect of the activities, and to understand why different effects emerge.

To judge the overall effect, we look upon the effect index introduced above. With reference to the ELAM model (Figure 1), we can see that this measure include the variable numbers 6, 9 and 10, i.e. the variables in the right hand side of the diagram, in the effect end of the system. The measures used to identify the causes behind the effects, are the emotional responses and the attitudes towards the sponsor and towards the sponsorship.

---

**TABLE 4**

Two factor varimax rotated solution for emotions associated with sponsorships.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Factor I</th>
<th>Factor II</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>anger</td>
<td>-0.59</td>
<td>0.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>trust</td>
<td>0.53</td>
<td>0.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fear</td>
<td>-0.47</td>
<td>0.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>grief</td>
<td>-0.43</td>
<td>0.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>inspiring</td>
<td>0.43</td>
<td>0.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>joy</td>
<td>0.20</td>
<td>0.61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>accept</td>
<td>0.30</td>
<td>-0.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>enjoyment</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>0.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>happiness</td>
<td>-0.01</td>
<td>0.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hope</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>0.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dominating</td>
<td>-0.05</td>
<td>-0.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>surprising</td>
<td>-0.01</td>
<td>0.06</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Estimation of Emotional and Evaluating Effects of Sport Sponsorships

To the individual sponsor, concern is with his own scores, relative to those of other sponsors, or relative to those of competitors.

The present data are probably biased in several ways. Young students are more involved with sports, and they have other favourites than other segments of the population. Therefore, to illustrate the system by analysing single sponsors, may be more confusing than informative. Instead we have chosen to show some differences between team, event and individual sponsorships, between “good” and “bad” sponsorships and between the sponsoring of soccer and handball.

Different types of sponsorships compared

The 12 sports sponsorships are divided into three groups after type; sponsorships with persons, with teams and with “events”, the latter being put in quotation marks since the soccer and handball league aren’t typical events:

**Sponsorships with persons:**
- SAS–Thomas Bjørn
- Scanbox–Brian Nielsen
- Børsens Nyhedsmagasin–Christian Pless
- TV2–Camilla Andersen
- V6–Camilla Martin

**Sponsorships with teams:**
- Carlsberg–FCK
- MD Foods–Herrelandsholdet i fodbold
- Jolly cola–Damelandsholdet i håndbold
- Codan–Brøndby

**Sponsorships with Events:**
- Faxe Kondi–Superligaen
- Byggekram–Herrehåndboldligaen
- Spar–VM Håndbold for kvinder

In table 6 it is seen that in the present sample the team sponsorships get the best effectscore whereas the event and person sponsorships have lower scores. Seen in this light table 7 and 9 show how the three categories differ in terms of attitudes towards the sponsorships, emotional responses and attitudes towards the sponsors.

In terms of attitudes towards the sponsorships (table 7), teams do best on the first “trustworthiness” dimension, but also give rise to some negative responses in terms of boring and negative attitudes. On these two dimensions, person and event respectively, do the best.

Regarding emotional responses the teams in general create more emotions—positive as well as negative.

When it comes to attitudes towards the sponsor, sponsors of teams are seen as most dynamic and social, but not particularly prestigious. Here, not the least, one must have the specific grouping of the sponsorships and the nature of the sample in mind. The team sponsors may simply be more positively looked upon in the first place.

Still, in the present data, it can be seen that teams come out winning, because of the ability to arouse emotions, to be perceived as trustworthy, and to be the most social.

**Winners vs. losers**

Another way of investigating the data is to compare sponsorships that in some way are alike, and hereby determine if there are

---

**TABLE 5**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EFFECT SCORE</th>
<th>Number of observations</th>
<th>Linking</th>
<th>Liking</th>
<th>Buying intention</th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Faxe Kondi-Superligaen</td>
<td>143</td>
<td>1,20</td>
<td>1,16</td>
<td>1,05</td>
<td>1,45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MD Foods-Herrelandsholdet i fodbold</td>
<td>123</td>
<td>1,21</td>
<td>1,13</td>
<td>1,06</td>
<td>1,44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAS-Thomas Bjørn</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>1,10</td>
<td>1,15</td>
<td>1,06</td>
<td>1,36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jolly Cola-Damelandsholdet i håndbold</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>1,10</td>
<td>1,01</td>
<td>0,97</td>
<td>1,08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carlsberg-FCK</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>1,11</td>
<td>0,94</td>
<td>1,01</td>
<td>1,05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V6-Camilla Martin</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>1,05</td>
<td>0,96</td>
<td>0,95</td>
<td>0,96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Codan-Brøndby</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>0,89</td>
<td>1,01</td>
<td>0,98</td>
<td>0,88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TV2-Camilla Andersen</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>0,91</td>
<td>0,94</td>
<td>1,02</td>
<td>0,86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Børsens Nyhedsmagasin-Christian Pless</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>0,82</td>
<td>1,00</td>
<td>1,05</td>
<td>0,85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spar-VMhåndbold for kvinder</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>0,87</td>
<td>0,93</td>
<td>1,02</td>
<td>0,83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scanbox-Brian Nielsen</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>0,90</td>
<td>0,89</td>
<td>0,89</td>
<td>0,72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Byggekram-Herrehåndboldligaen</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>0,84</td>
<td>0,89</td>
<td>0,94</td>
<td>0,71</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TABLE 6**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Effect score Avg.</th>
<th>persons</th>
<th>teams</th>
<th>events</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sponsorships</strong></td>
<td>0,950</td>
<td>1,113</td>
<td>0,996</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
significant differences in the way they are judged by the respondents. This can determine if the effect measures used is capable of making reasonable and clear distinctions between those sponsorships comprehended positively and those comprehended negatively. This was done by finding a “winner” and a “loser” according to the effect score presented in table 5, in some categories. This was done as follows:

Carlsberg 1,05 vs. Codan 0,88 (Soccerteams)
MD Foods 1,44 vs. Jolly Cola 1,08 (National squads)
Faxe Kondi 1,45 vs. Byggekram 0,71 (Leagues)
SAS 1,36 vs. Børsens Nyhedsmagasin 0,85 (Individuals)
V6 0,96 vs. Scanbox 0,72 (Individuals).

These parings show that there are large differences between comparable sponsorships and its now interesting to investigate if the differences are reflected on the dimensions used in the earlier analyses. This is done simply by calculating the average scores for the five winners and the five losers separately. Results are shown in table 10,11 and 12.

In table 10 the results are very clear; the winners are more trustworthy, less unimaginative and less unappealing when it comes to attitudes towards the sponsorships.

With regard to emotional responses the results are again evident, in table 11 the winners scores higher on the positive and lower on the negative dimension.

Finally in table 12, attitudes towards the sponsors are investigated. Here the interpretation is more diffuse since the dimensions cannot be termed as positive or negative. Different companies have different values and goals; simple/social can be the wanted image for some, aesthetic/prestigious for others. Also the scores here are without doubt to a large degree explained in terms of the actual companies chosen for this analysis, rather than in terms of sponsoring activities.

**Handball vs. Soccer**

I Denmark the by far most popular sports, measured by number of active players, press coverage, television viewing etc., are soccer and handball. This also applies in the population analysed here.

Table 13 shows that soccer sponsorships give rise to much higher effect scores than handball. As suggested earlier, the student body include a slight male majority which in any event would favour soccer interests versus handball interests. However, the differences between the two kinds of sports sponsorships are so marked that it completely overrules this potential bias. Additionally the difference rest on marked and meaningful differences in the perception of the two sets of sponsorships (In the database a total of four handball sponsorships and similarly a total of four soccer sponsorships are included).

In terms of attitude towards the sponsorships (table 14) soccer is seen as more trustworthy and less unimaginative and less “seen to often”.

Emotionally it generates clearly more positive responses (table 15).

And in terms of evaluation of the sponsor (table 16), soccer sponsors maybe seen as more prestigious, dynamic and social straightforward. The latter of course may be ascribed to differences in the companies choosing to sponsor the different events.
### TABLE 10
Attitudes towards sponsorships

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Trustworthy/Goodwillmaking</th>
<th>Unimaginative/&quot;seen to often&quot;</th>
<th>Unappealing/Disgusting</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Winners</strong></td>
<td>28,19%</td>
<td>12,04%</td>
<td>2,70%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Losers</strong></td>
<td>19,24%</td>
<td>15,42%</td>
<td>4,62%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### TABLE 11
Emotions associated with sponsorships

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Joy/Enjoyment/Happiness</th>
<th>Fear/Anger/Grief</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Winners</strong></td>
<td>21,22%</td>
<td>2,86%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Losers</strong></td>
<td>9,31%</td>
<td>5,61%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### TABLE 12
Attitudes towards sponsors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Aesthetic/Prestigious</th>
<th>Dynamic/Modern</th>
<th>Simple/Social</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Winners</strong></td>
<td>11,71%</td>
<td>20,83%</td>
<td>13,55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Losers</strong></td>
<td>7,66%</td>
<td>19,04%</td>
<td>10,52%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### TABLE 13
Effect scores—Handball–Soccer

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Effect score Avg.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Soccer</td>
<td>1,21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Handball</td>
<td>0,87</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### TABLE 14
Attitudes towards sponsorships

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Trustworthy/goodwillmaking</th>
<th>Unimaginative/&quot;seen to often&quot;</th>
<th>Unappealing/disgusting</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Soccer</strong></td>
<td>27,43%</td>
<td>9,32%</td>
<td>3,06%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Handball</strong></td>
<td>16,50%</td>
<td>17,95%</td>
<td>3,77%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### TABLE 15
Emotions associated with sponsorships

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Joy/enjoyment/happiness</th>
<th>Anger/fear/grief</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Soccer</strong></td>
<td>12,43%</td>
<td>2,92%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Handball</strong></td>
<td>8,40%</td>
<td>3,03%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### TABLE 16
Attitudes towards sponsors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Aesthetic/Prestigious</th>
<th>Dynamic/Modern</th>
<th>Simple/Social</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Soccer</strong></td>
<td>10,89%</td>
<td>21,37%</td>
<td>18,80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Handball</strong></td>
<td>5,72%</td>
<td>16,57%</td>
<td>12,01%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CONCLUSION

Traditionally sponsoring has been evaluated in terms of its ability to generate exposure, recall, and occasionally attitude to or preference changes towards the sponsor. The latter, however, has in most cases been difficult to establish.

Departing in contemporary theories of communication concerned with low involvement, emotional peripheral ways of coping with information, it has been attempted here to demonstrate, that much more significant effects of sponsoring can be established when looking upon attitudes towards the sponsorship, liking, linking between sponsor and sponsorship, emotional responses etc.

The study has been carried out with a very extensive questionnaire to make sure that all possible details of such evaluations would be uncovered. Using a sample of qualified but biased respondents in terms of younger better educated persons of both sexes it has been established that remarkable differences can found in the way in which different sponsorships are evaluated. These effects by far overrule the more traditional measures of effect relying upon the idea that sponsoring should be studied as a effect hierarchy, and that its significance should be evaluated in the light of its ability to influence attitudes towards the sponsor, purchase intention, preferences and related behaviour.

In the project focus has been only on the effects of sponsorships generated by communication of the sponsorship trough the mass media. For many sponsors a number of other related activities such as inviting guests, providing gifts etc. are of importance also. These effects are left out of sight here. With an increasing acceptence of the role emotional unconscious responses play in advertising (Rasmussen, Damasio, Ambler, Aaker, Richins) it is obvious to expect that the effects of sponsorships may be seen in this light. The present study proves that this can be done meaningfully. To extent the findings and to make the observations more generally applicable, a wider selection of sponsorships and a more representative sample is required. To make such studies feasible a reduction of the questionnaire instrument used here has been part of the reporting of the findings shown. It is the hope of the research team to be able to carry out such more general studies with larger samples in the near future.

REFERENCES

Rasmussen, A.: “What is emotions?” in Contributions to marketing. Gallup Denmark, 1996
Evaluation of Public Spokespersons
Flemming Hansen, Copenhagen Business School, Denmark
Christian Kock, The University of Copenhagen, Denmark

“...but when I was speaking in America, they told me that there were 105 million TV sets in America ... It is a strange feeling to speak to millions of people. I think one feels it. There is something strange about television, very odd, also in another way. They told me over there that television is dangerous, you can’t hide your true nature, appearing on television. They said that McCarthy, then a very popular person, was ruined in one or two days, after appearing on television. People did not believe him, or they did not trust him any more.... In general, people who appeared on television over there were kind of “waterproof”. (Quotation from radio interview with Karen Blixen, 1955)

BACKGROUND

In our generation, audio-visual media have become a dominant force in the public arena, for political debate, transmission of news, business, and for many other purposes. In this context, the credibility of public persons has become an important item in the public sphere. For example, in Denmark the current Prime Minister, Mr Pouls Nyrup Rasmussen, is said by many commentators to have a severe “credibility problem”. This liability is said to have brought him defeat in the referendum he had called on the common European currency in September, 2000, which was won by the anti-Euro coalition, and it is also cited as grounds for his likely upset in the upcoming general election. Such claims are current in spite of the fact that Mr. Nyrup Rasmussen’s administration is admitted to have performed well by objective standards, at least as far as the economy is concerned.

It is not a new fact that credibility is considered important. For the last 50 years or so, communication scholars have studied it extensively. Howland et al. (1953) initiated this effort, Andersen & Clevenger (1963) summarized work so far, followed by, among many others, J. McCroskey, (e.g., McCroskey 1966; Whitehead 1968; Tuppen 1974).

After the heyday of empirical credibility studies, a new facet to the issue came into focus as television became the main source of political and other public communication. The ability to communicate well on TV was highlighted in the 1980’es in press commentaries as well as scholarly studies centering on President Ronald Reagan as a “master communicator”. Reagan’s masterful handling of the specific demands of this all-important medium were scrutinized. Since then, it has been a standard assumption that the ability to perform well on TV and in other mass-mediated contexts is crucial to success in politics as well as in business and public opinion generally, and there is a strong tendency to equate the notion of a source’s credibility with that source’s ability to handle TV and other media well and to “come across” in a way that will ingratiating viewers.

That raises the question as to what connection there might be between these two constructs: 1) credibility, as analyzed in the many empirical studies since the 50’es, and 2) the status as mass-mediated “master communicator,” as instantiated by Ronald Reagan, or in later decades, Bill Clinton or British PM Tony Blair. Are these two constructs basically the same? Or are they different but correlated? Or are they perhaps clearly separate?

To return to the case of Prime Minister Nyrup Rasmussen, it is generally said not only that his credibility is low, but also that his performance on TV is often toe-cringing. One way to see such a case is to conclude that credibility and the qualities that make a master communicator are closely connected, and that this is why a public figure would rank low in both respects.

On the other hand, there are observations that might suggest a different hypothesis. A point of departure for this study has been the regular appearance of credibility ratings for public persons, media, and organizations. On source of such ratings in Denmark has been the business weekly Borsens Nyhedsmagasin, which publishes an annual “credibility barometer”. More than once, we have been struck by the fact that the people and organizations usually considered “master communicators”–for example those politicians most praised by the media and by communication experts as being “telegenic,” capable of “coming across” on TV, of communicating in “headlines,” etc.–are often quite low on the list. Conversely, figures or organizations at the top of the list are generally such as usually such as appear to lack or to shun these qualities; more typically, they appear thoughtful, balanced, measured, and even reticent in their media appearances.

From these observations we have built the hypothesis that in this age of mass-mediated communication there might well be more than one dimension on which the public communication of, e.g., politicians and organizations is evaluated by the general public. Further, we hypothesize that these dimensions may well be separate and perhaps even negatively correlated. Specifically, we hypothesize that the “master communicator” dimension might be separate from the “credibility” construct.

In studies done over the last decades, scholars have tended to find that credibility has as one of its dimensions a factor revolving around “dynamism” or “charisma”. The work of Berlo & al. (1969) has been influential in this respect. What Berlo and his associates did was to compile a set of semantic differentials (statements) by asking a number of people to name qualities that would be found in people of whom they might say (rather vaguely perhaps), “If it’s good enough for him... it’s good enough for me”. They then had a number of individuals rate a set of “message sources” along these differentials and subjected the data to factor analysis. Other researchers, working largely along similar lines, included a growing number of differentials in their studies.

The problem with this tendency was that it became increasingly unclear whether all these differentials were actually relevant to the concept of credibility, or whether the construct whose factors were being studied was a larger, less coherent one. Berlo et al. chose, in the title of their paper, to use the term “Acceptability of Message Sources,” a term which leaves some obscurity as to whether this is the same as “credibility” or perhaps a vaguer, more inclusive concept.

An impressive number of studies on credibility and ethos continued to appear in the seventies, designed largely along the same lines: more and more semantic descriptors were selected and subjected to increasingly sophisticated factor-analytic procedures. At the same time, however, one of the originators, and perhaps the key figure, of this whole line of research, J.C. McCroskey, was beginning to doubt its soundness of the direction it was taking (McCroskey & Young 1981). He felt that credibility scholars, including himself, had distorted the credibility construct by including an ever wider battery of descriptors, while still assuming that
they were dealing with the same concept: credibility (or as McCroskey preferred to call it: ethos). By doing this they confounded credibility with other source characteristics unrelated to it. Source credibility, McCroskey now found, was merely a subset of a much larger construct of “person perception,” and scholars would have done well to limit their factor analysis of it to the original Aristotelian ethos construct, with its main factors of competence (phronesis), moral character (arete), and good will towards the audience (euonia)—a formula which had proved its robustness in one empirical study after the other, including McCroskey’s own.

The present study is based on a hypothesis that heed McCroskey’s warning: credibility, we hypothesize, is a quite narrow concept that is separate from other important and desirable source characteristics. Among these other desirable characteristics are, for example, “telegenic” qualities enabling a person to come across well on TV, as well as such personable qualities which might easily allow audiences to relate to and identify with that person.

In order to test this hypothesis, we have assembled a set of scales that might be involved in creating either of the overall impressions of a source that we wish to analyze. Among these are a number of statements that are typically used to refer to a public person’s media performance. This is one respect in which our study differs from the long line of pre-1980 studies, in which media performance was not a specific issue in relation to credibility. A further difference is that in a methodically simple but perhaps debatable move, we have included our main dependent variable, credibility, in the list of scales. We did this in order to see how the other scales would correlate with it, and whether a factor would actually emerge that might meaningfully be called “credibility”.

Just as we believe that there is a tendency to confound unrelated aspects of source evaluation under the term “credibility,” we also hypothesize that differentiation is called for in another respect: credibility, for different categories of public persons, may depend on different characteristics. This should really be a rather obvious point, yet it is one that was not explicitly made in credibility research until Cronkhite and Liska (1976).

It is likely that credibility and overall source evaluation for different public persons depend upon quite different characteristics of the source. The present study presents an attempt to develop an instrument which can give a more precise and more detailed picture of the way in which public spokespersons are perceived. At the same time it is an initial attempt to establish data that can show how such evaluations look in an European (Danish) context.

**HYPOTHESES**

To sum up: In the present study, we want to test the following hypotheses.

H1. Evaluation of public persons is made along several dimensions, among which credibility is one and just one.

H2. The dimension of credibility is separate from the dimension that might characterise telegenic “master communicators”.

H3. Different public persons are evaluated differently, along several evaluative dimensions.

H4. In particular, credibility depends, for different public persons, on different aspects of the overall impression made by that person.

In testing these hypotheses, ideally, a large number of different public persons should be evaluated along a large number of scales. To do so, would result in a questionnaire so extensive that it was feared that it would influence the response-rate and the quality of the responses.

For this reason, it was chosen to limit the study to five different public persons, with expectedly very different profiles.

**METHODOLOGY**

For the study, a battery of statements were developed, covering items that might be used meaningfully in describing public spokespersons.

Inspiration came from past studies of source effects (McCroskey et al. 1972), from corporate image studies (Worcester 1972), and from other evaluative measurements instruments, such as Osgood’s Attitude scales (Osgood, Suci and Tannenbaum, 1963). After some sorting and testing, a battery of 45 items was decided upon. The battery includes statements of the type: “is informative”, “is eloquent,” etc.

In the study, five high-profile public figures were included. These were two well-known political leaders with very different political orientation: Mr. Svend Auken (57), a leading Social Democrat, currently Minister of the Environment, and Ms. Pia Kjærsgaard (53), leader of the right-wing, anti-immigration Danish People’s Party; Denmark’s most notable businessman, Mr. Maersk McKinney Møller (87), owner of the huge and successful A.P. Møller group; Ms. Bodil Nyboe Andersen (60), Governor of the National Bank; and a celebrated sports personality who has moved into politics: Mr. Ulrik Vilbeck (42), former manager of the Danish ladies’ handball team, which he led to a series of international triumphs in the 90’es. Each of these persons was rated on a five-point Likert scale for each of the 45 statements. Respondents were 78 students in a graduate class of Marketing and Communication.

**DATA ANALYSIS**

Self-rating of the respondents’ awareness of the five spokespersons was also included in the questionnaire. Since the respondents were graduate students in business economics, we find it surprising that Mr. Møller and Ms. Nyboe Andersen were judged by several to be “not very well-known”.

In the following analysis, respondents’ ratings of persons they do not know, or do not know very well, are excluded. Awareness and average scores on self-rated credibility for the five public figures are shown in Table 1. It is obvious that considerable variation in the data exists. The two most credible figures, by far, are the non-political Governor of the National Bank and the leading business personality, but they are also the least known.

Factor analysis was conducted for each of the five persons. For a description of this technique, applied in the manner done here, see, e.g., Green and Tull (1978).

It appears that the solutions emerging here has significant similarity across individuals. This we take as an indication that the dimensions along which the different public persons are evaluated are similar, even though the precise evaluation of the persons may differ markedly. For this reason, we decided to define the dimensions based upon a combined analysis for all five public spokespersons. In this manner, the number of observations on which the analyses are based is increased from 78 to 391. The stability of the solution thereby improves significantly.

With three factors, 47 percent of the total variance in the data is accounted for. Adding more variables only slightly increases the amount of explained variance. As in other analyses of this kind, “noise” in the raw data (the ratings), combined with effects of skewness of the distribution of answers for many of the items, may account for this. It is a common observation that one can rarely explain more than 50-60 percent with factors which each accounts
The traits of persons scoring high on this factor are sensitive, warm, media magnetism ratings, while precisely people like Ms. Nyboe Andersen translate a favourite Danish term) often ranked low in credibility telegenic qualities and the ability to finally instigated this study: that political and public figures high in integrity proper. This finding may explain the observation which origi-

The interesting thing is that this dimension is separate from credibil-
y properly be described as standing for judge-like qualities –

TABLE 1
Awareness. 1-6 reflect degrees of awareness, 6 being the highest, and 1=do not know.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Svend Auken</th>
<th>Pia Kjærsgaard</th>
<th>Maersk McKinney Müller</th>
<th>Bodil Nyboe Andersen</th>
<th>Ulrik Wilbek</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

for at least as much variance as one single question. In the present case, to reach this level, the inclusion of nine factors would be required (64 percent explained variance). However, each of the last six factors explains only a little more variance than any single question. For this reason—and since the three-dimensional solution lends itself easily to a meaningful interpretation—we chose to focus on this. The solution is shown in Table 2.

The first factor, accounting for more than half of the explained variance, centers on credibility, which comes out with the highest loading of all statements. This lends support to the notion that “credibility” is indeed a separate factor, and that its name is an apt one. Moreover, the loadings of the other statements on this factor suggest some of the aspects that enter into the perception of credibility. On average for the five public figures, to be “irritating” (not surprisingly) detracts from credibility, whereas the perceptions that a person is intelligent, objective, and competent add to it. These are clearly representative of the Aristotelian “phronesis” dimension (cf. Aristotle’s Rhetoric, ed. Garver, 1995). Further, it is noteworthy that being able to see matters from different angles, and being balanced and respectful of others’ opinions are properties with high loadings. These represent a dimension that bear some resemblance to the Aristotelian “arete” and “eunoia” dimensions, but which may more properly be described as standing for judge-like qualities—independence, objectivity, incorruptibility, etc.

The second separate dimension in the evaluation of the five persons can be labelled “charisma”. Public spokespersons having this characteristics are extrovert, entertaining, telegenic, passionate, and able to explain things in a down-to-earth manner. Such people are the darlings of talkshow hosts and debate moderators on TV because they come across so well on the screen.

It is no surprise that this is a dimension in source evaluation. The interesting thing is that this dimension is separate from credibility proper. This finding may explain the observation which originally instigated this study: that political and public figures high in telegenic qualities and the ability to “sell tickets” on the screen (to translate a favourite Danish term) often ranked low in credibility ratings, while precisely people like Ms. Nyboe Andersen—high in expertise, independence, and balance, but soft-spoken and low in media magnetism—were invariably rated most credible.

The third dimension has a more emotional side to it. Important traits of persons scoring high on this factor are sensitive, warm, folksy, plain, and able to admit mistakes. The common denomina-
tor to these perceptions might be a homey, “one-of-us” quality.

Three-dimensional evaluation of spokespersons

Having determined three dimensions along which people evaluate public persons, we may try to profile the five public spokespersons individually on the three dimensions. This we could do by averaging that person’s scores on the more important items belonging to each of the three factors. A more sensitive and elaborate procedure, however, is to compute factor scores for each respondent’s evaluation of each public person on each of the three dimensions. The average factor score for each dimension then represents the degree to which each of the three public persons is associated with that dimension. These scores are shown in Table 3:

It is evident that the way in which the five spokespersons are regarded very differently. Maersk McKinney Møller is most credible, but he scores less well on the other factors. Least credible is Pia Kjærsgaard. However, along with sports celebrity Ulrik Wilbek, the right-wing party leader scores highest on charisma. This dimension is one that the low-key National Bank Governor, Bodil Nyboe Andersen, completely lacks. On the other hand, she is the only one to come anywhere near Møller on credibility. On the emotional “one-of-us” dimension, Auken and especially Wilbek stand out.

The nature of credibility

The way the five spokespersons achieve such credibility as they have varies significantly. At one end of the scale, we find Nyboe Andersen, at the other end Kjærsgaard (Table 3). But as we shall see, what explains the degree of credibility that each of the five persons has varies much between them.

The overall nature of credibility can be inferred from the statements that load high on the credibility dimension in the analysis shown in Table 2. It is, however, possible to analyse credibility in a slightly different way as well. By using the credibility score as a dependent variable in a correlation analysis, and using answers to the 45 statements as independent variables, it is possible to single out exactly what constitutes credibility for each spokesperson. To achieve this, a regression analysis for each of the five persons was carried out. Here the amount of explained variance in the credibility score varies from 85 to 99 percent.
TABLE 2
Three-dimensional solution

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Factor I</th>
<th>Factor II</th>
<th>Factor III</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Credible</td>
<td>.88</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Irritating</td>
<td>.85</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objective</td>
<td>.80</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intelligent</td>
<td>.79</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competent</td>
<td>.78</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unappealing</td>
<td>-.77</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Person I often agree with</td>
<td>.76</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Realistic</td>
<td>.76</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appealing</td>
<td>.75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Able to see matters from different angles</td>
<td>.72</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pleasant</td>
<td>.71</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calm</td>
<td>.70</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balanced</td>
<td>.69</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stupid</td>
<td>.69</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seen to often</td>
<td>-.66</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sincere</td>
<td>.65</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dishonest</td>
<td>-.64</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respects other people’s opinions</td>
<td>.60</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Artificial</td>
<td>-.56</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eloquent</td>
<td>.55</td>
<td>.48</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informative</td>
<td>.54</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exciting personality</td>
<td>.52</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unable to lie</td>
<td>.46</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Has simplistic views</td>
<td>-.38</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extrovert</td>
<td></td>
<td>.68</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entertaining</td>
<td>.67</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does not pull his/her punches</td>
<td>.59</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Telegenic</td>
<td>.58</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Passionate</td>
<td>.55</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brings matters down to earth</td>
<td>.54</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Has charisma</td>
<td>.41</td>
<td>.51</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imaginative</td>
<td>.51</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good at explaining things</td>
<td>.45</td>
<td>.50</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not telegenic</td>
<td>-.50</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good at making debate</td>
<td>.49</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dynamic</td>
<td>.48</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-confident</td>
<td>.47</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dull personality</td>
<td>-.45</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sensitive</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Warm</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Folksy</td>
<td>.41</td>
<td>.53</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capable of admitting mistakes</td>
<td>.48</td>
<td>.49</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incapable of admitting mistakes</td>
<td>-.39</td>
<td>-.47</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doesn’t respect other people’s opinions</td>
<td>-.40</td>
<td>-.43</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plain</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.36</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
From this analysis, it is obvious that credibility for the different spokespersons has to do with different perceived qualities in them. Findings are shown in Table 4.

Only few statements correlate significantly with credibility for more than one of the five spokespersons.

Clearly, each of these public figures has a different “credibility profile”; credibility has a somewhat different meaning depending on whose credibility we are talking about. The perceived credibility of Svend Auen, the Minister of Energy and the Environment, seems to have to do with his being realistic, respectful of the opinions of others, and informative, but not with any willingness to admit mistakes nor—surprisingly perhaps—with his being eloquent or extrovert. Many people would probably agree that Auen has these qualities; it seems, then, that there might be a tendency for his eloquence and extroversion to strike people as “too much”, detracting from his credibility. For Pia Kjærgaard, the right-wing, anti-immigrant party leader, the most significant findings are that those who find her credible also perceive her as disrespectful of the opinions of others, and that they do not see her as warm; they do not agree that she is unable to admit mistakes (but, somewhat contradictorily, will not go so far as to agree that she is able to admit them).

For Mr. Møller, the business tycoon, those who find him credible also perceive her as disrespectful of the opinions of others, and that they do not see her as warm; they do not agree that she is unable to admit mistakes (and, somewhat contradictorily, will not go so far as to agree that she is able to admit them).

For Mr. Møller, the business tycoon, those who find him credible also perceive her as disrespectful of the opinions of others, and that they do not see her as warm; they do not agree that she is unable to admit mistakes (and, somewhat contradictorily, will not go so far as to agree that she is able to admit them).

For Mr. Møller, the business tycoon, those who find him credible also perceive her as disrespectful of the opinions of others, and that they do not see her as warm; they do not agree that she is unable to admit mistakes (and, somewhat contradictorily, will not go so far as to agree that she is able to admit them).

DISCUSSION
The analysis clearly suggests that our evaluation of public persons takes place along several separate dimensions. Here, it has been proposed to work with a three-dimensional analysis: credibility, charisma, and “one-of-us” emotional appeal. This analysis supports our hypotheses 1 and 2: credibility is just one factor in the evaluation of a public communicator; and more specifically, credibility is separate from other qualities that public communicators may also wish to possess, such as a) charisma and b) “one-of-us” emotional appeal. To be even more specific: the much vaunted charismatic, “master communicator” quality that politicians and other public figures are often said to need in order to “come across” on TV is not the same thing as credibility.

To say this is not tantamount to saying that charismatic “master communicators” do not exist, or that the quality they possess is not a valuable and important one. Such a claim would fly in the face of facts, e.g., the case of Ms. Kjærgaard, who is undoubtedly, in some way, a master communicator with charismatic traits. Such a figure is clearly effective and persuasive in terms of building popular support. That raises the intriguing question of what the different kinds of persuasiveness or effectiveness are that we find in communicators who are strong on each of our three dimensions: credibility, charisma, and “one-of-us” appeal, respectively. The present study gives us no basis for theorising on that. However, the question calls to mind a perspective raised by an empirical study of persuasion in which one of the authors was involved (Jørgensen, Kock and Rørbech 1994; 1998). In that study, it became clear that we may distinguish between two different kinds of persuasive effectiveness, each corresponding to a separate persuasive strategy. These are vote-shifting and vote-gathering, respectively. Vote-shifting is the ability to win over votes from the opposite side. Vote-gathering is the ability to mobilise latent followers from the “undecided” group and to galvanise the enthusiasm of followers already mobilised. The typical vote-shifter, it turns out, is very reminiscent of the typical “credible” person of the present study; the typical vote-gatherer has most of the qualities that constitute our “charisma” factor. In fact, a public debate featuring Ms. Kjærgaard was a key case in the earlier study, and it turned out then that in persuasive strategy as well as in measurable persuasive effect she was perhaps the most typical vote-gatherer of all debaters studied (out of 74).

We began with a reference to the case of Denmark’s Prime Minister, Poul Nyrup Rasmussen. Looking back, we may now state that although in many people’s estimate he has neither credibility nor charisma, this should not lead anyone to think that the two dimensions are the same. They are identifiable and separate dimensions in the evaluation of public communicators.

However, when that is said, it also seems likely that these dimensions may upon somewhat different qualities for different communicators. For example, our everyday judgement of the credibility of different communicators relies upon different traits. This lends support to our hypotheses 3 and 4. When we look for reasons why this should be so, it is natural to point to the fact that these five figures belongs to very different spheres. First, we may assume that respondents have not rated their credibility or charisma, this should not lead anyone to think that the two dimensions are the same. They are identifiable and separate dimensions in the evaluation of public communicators.

When Mr. Møller communicates to the public at all (a rare event), he talks about business and how various policies will affect it, not about sports. So the credibility ratings he achieves refer to what he says within that sphere. Secondly, it is natural to assume that the qualities which make Mr. Møller credible on business matters are different.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Regression analysis</th>
<th>Unstandardized Coefficients</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients</th>
<th>t.Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Beta</td>
<td>Std. Error</td>
<td>Beta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Svend Auken</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>2.25</td>
<td>.32</td>
<td>1.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capable of admitting mistakes</td>
<td>-.35</td>
<td>.13</td>
<td>-.31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eloquent</td>
<td>-.26</td>
<td>.12</td>
<td>-.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informative</td>
<td>.36</td>
<td>.10</td>
<td>.37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respects other people’s opinions</td>
<td>.25</td>
<td>.12</td>
<td>.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dull personality</td>
<td>-.23</td>
<td>.11</td>
<td>-.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Realistic</td>
<td>.41</td>
<td>.10</td>
<td>.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extrovert</td>
<td>-.21</td>
<td>.10</td>
<td>-.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pia Kjaersgaard</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>1.84</td>
<td>1.52</td>
<td>1.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doesn’t respect other people’s opinions</td>
<td>.19</td>
<td>.09</td>
<td>.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Warm</td>
<td>-.24</td>
<td>.13</td>
<td>-.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Incapable of admitting mistakes</td>
<td>-.17</td>
<td>.09</td>
<td>-.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maersk McKinney Moller</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>1.38</td>
<td>1.75</td>
<td>.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objective</td>
<td>.33</td>
<td>.19</td>
<td>.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pleasant</td>
<td>.26</td>
<td>.17</td>
<td>.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dishonest</td>
<td>-.29</td>
<td>.16</td>
<td>-.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intelligent</td>
<td>.33</td>
<td>.19</td>
<td>.29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bodil Nyboe Andersen</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>.51</td>
<td>1.44</td>
<td>.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>”I often agree with”</td>
<td>-.48</td>
<td>.12</td>
<td>-.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competent</td>
<td>.54</td>
<td>.15</td>
<td>.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entertaining</td>
<td>-.50</td>
<td>.12</td>
<td>-.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Warm</td>
<td>-.45</td>
<td>.15</td>
<td>-.31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appealing</td>
<td>.32</td>
<td>.11</td>
<td>.37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dishonest</td>
<td>-.36</td>
<td>.10</td>
<td>-.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ulrik Wilbek</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>.86</td>
<td>1.33</td>
<td>.64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Telegenic</td>
<td>-.15</td>
<td>.11</td>
<td>-.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entertaining</td>
<td>.18</td>
<td>.11</td>
<td>.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does not pull his/her punches</td>
<td>.16</td>
<td>.11</td>
<td>.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unable to lie</td>
<td>.19</td>
<td>.10</td>
<td>.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charisma</td>
<td>-.25</td>
<td>.13</td>
<td>-.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calm</td>
<td>.22</td>
<td>.13</td>
<td>.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stupid</td>
<td>-.19</td>
<td>.12</td>
<td>-.22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
from those which make Mr. Wilbek credible on (certain) sports. Our readers may explore our tables for themselves to look for qualities that may be constitutive of credibility in politics, business, sports, etc., respectively. Suffice it here to conclude that differences in what makes for credibility in people from different life spheres are to be expected and have indeed emerged, yet the more interesting fact is perhaps that in spite of these differences there is a relation and an overlap between the credibility profiles of these very different figures—enough to allow us to conclude that credibility is a identifiable and separate construct, as are the other two factors in our analysis.

Based upon the present study, it would be possible to devise a meaningful instrument (of manageable size) for the profiling of spokespersons along the three dimensions suggested here. More specifically, to judge credibility, one would concentrate on those items in the analysis in Table 5 that contribute most to the explanation of the credibility of the spokespersons. With regard to the second and third dimension, it would be recommendable to work with at least three statements for each, providing a total battery of 16-20 statements, to be used for each person to be evaluated.

REFERENCES

The Country-of-Origin Effect and Brand Origin Knowledge: How Little Consumers Know
and How Important Knowledge Is
Terence A. Shimp, University of South Carolina, U.S.A.
Saeed Samiee, University of Tulsa, U.S.A.
Subhash Sharma, University of South Carolina, U.S.A.

RESEARCH OVERVIEW
This research examines consumers’ brand origin knowledge. Although country-of-origin researchers have determined that consumers discriminate between the same brand made in different countries on the basis of country stereotypes (e.g., Han 1989; Maheswaran 1994), research subjects are invariably alerted that a to-be-judged product has an unambiguous country of origin. By comparison, when consumers encounter brands in the marketplace, the country of origin (CO) is but one of many pieces of information that may or may not be sought, comprehended, and entered into the evaluative process. No compelling empirical evidence has been offered to support the salience of CO information during actual (non-laboratory) purchase processes (Samiee 1994). Moreover, Peterson and Jolibert’s (1995) exhaustive meta-analysis determined that the country-of-origin effect is inflated when research participants receive verbal descriptions of a brand’s CO compared to the more ecologically valid situation where shoppers search for such information at the point of sale or retrieve it spontaneously from memory.

We define brand origin knowledge (hereafter, BOK) as the consumer’s ability to correctly identify where a representative group of widely distributed and generally well-known brands have originated, their countries of origin. Measuring brand origin knowledge required that we select a range of brands from among the thousands available to American consumers, who were the respondents in our study. Using a rigorous screening procedure, we selected a large initial group of brands and then reduced through a two-stage process that number to a smaller set of 84. The 84 brands consist of 40 from the United States and 44 from eight other countries: England, France, Germany, Italy, Japan, Korea, the Netherlands, and Switzerland. These brands represent a range of consumer package goods, semi-durable, and durable products and constitute a representative selection of domestic and foreign brands that are available to most American consumers in department stores, mass merchandise outlets, supermarkets, and other common retail venues. BOK scores range between 0-1 and represent, in the aggregate, the proportion of brand origins that respondents correctly identify. We distinguish between knowledge of domestic brands (US-BOK) and of foreign brands (F-BOK). It is to be expected that American consumers would be more knowledgeable of the origins of US than foreign brands.

We drew a national sample of 5,000 adult households from a data bank of individuals holding a driver’s license in the United States. Overall, 480 usable responses were returned for a response rate of 12%. Respondents were presented with a matrix that listed the 84 foreign and domestic brands down the rows and headed columns with country names. They were instructed to circle for each brand its country origin. Given the task difficulty, this procedure undoubtedly produces BOK scores that represent a combination of actual knowledge along with error variance due to guessing. We found that respondents’ knowledge of the national origins of the brands constituting our brand sample is modest indeed. The average BOK score for all 84 brands was only slightly higher than one-third correct identification ($M=35\%; \ s.d.=16\%)$. Though respondents correctly identified about one-half of the 40 US brands ($M_{US-BOK}=49\%; \ s.d.=22\%)$, the average score for the 44 foreign brands reflected less than one-quarter correct responses ($M_{F-BOK}=22\%; \ s.d.=14\%)$.

We conducted separate analyses via structural equation modeling for F-BOK and US-BOK. With socioeconomic status, international experience (i.e., international travel experience and foreign-language ability), ethnocentric tendencies (Shimp and Sharma 1987), age, and gender as predictor variables, the model accounted for only 15% of the variance in US-BOK but 52% of the variance in F-BOK. Increasing degrees of F-BOK were accounted for by respondents’ having higher socioeconomic status, greater international experience, and lower ethnocentric tendencies. Also, males were more knowledgeable of foreign brands than were females.

Our research thus reveals that a brand’s origin—even if that brand happens to be from a country with positive equity (Shimp, Samiee, and Madden 1993)—may not represent a type of brand association that is judgment- or purchase-consequential. Consumers have limited recall of brand origins and apparently find such information relatively unimportant and unworthy of retention in memory. Retaining brand-origin information in memory may be considered nonfunctional because point-of-purchase cues (packaging and in-store displays and signs) provide consumers with external memories that can be acquired on demand (Bettman 1979).

In sum, a body of literature has reported consumer bias towards origins of products. This literature is mostly based on studies that have experimentally manipulated country-of-origin cues in controlled laboratory studies. Such manipulations are somewhat heavy-handed inasmuch as consumers are provided with little differentiating information other than a brand’s origin. Under these contrived circumstances, brands are evaluated more favorably when they are aligned with countries that are themselves judged favorably. It is easy to leap to the conclusion that country of origin plays an important role, but such a conclusion is based on the dubious assumption that consumers in the marketplace—i.e., under natural, ecologically valid circumstances—actually know the origins of brands when forming judgments and making purchase decisions. Our research questions this assumption.

Finally, marketers of brands that are associated with countries that have positive images can serve their brands well by aggressively communicating country-of-origin information (cf. Gürhan-Canli and Maheswaran 2000), Germany, for example, is known for fine craftsmanship and technological sophistication. It thus is in the best interest of German brands that possess technological properties to educate and reinforce the German origin of these brands when marketing overseas. In the final analysis, it would be presumptuous for marketers to assume that consumers are knowledgeable of their brands’ countries of origin. It thus is critical that BOK be monitored and managed.

REFERENCES


ABSTRACT

Marketers should be aware distinct responses by different ethnic groups to marketing programs contributes to heterogeneity of national markets. Based upon a survey of multinational students from different ethnic backgrounds studying in Australia, Hong Kong, Kenya, Malaysia, and Singapore, we investigated behavior of ethnic groups as a form of social organization. We found that, compared to weak ethnic identifiers, strong ethnic identifiers exhibit different preferences for retail outlets, acts of generosity, modes of transportation, and recreational and leisure activities. Through the tailoring of marketing programs, marketers could more effectively attract preferences of particular ethnic groups.

INTRODUCTION

The globalization of the marketplace as well as changing ethnic structures of society, both within and across national boundaries, have caused marketers to consider the development and implementation of marketing strategies specifically targeted towards diverse ethnic groups (Hui et al., 1993). There has been a proliferation of marketing literature reflecting the various approaches that practitioners have taken towards ‘cross-cultural marketing’ within both domestic and international markets (cf. Steenkamp, Hofstede and Wedel 1999). However studies focusing upon ethnicity on a cross-national basis are rare. Growing diversity of ethnic and cultural groups, and changing patterns of the ethnic balance of many nations has challenged conventional marketing wisdom. Research needs to be done in this area to provide managers with diagnostics of specific market response characteristics for each particular ethnic group in these important market segments.

The current research aims to provide further empirical evidence that ethnic background impacts upon customer attitudes and preferences across a range of products and services. Our paper draws upon current academic thinking devoted to operationalise the concept of ‘ethnicity’, and how it can be used to help explain consumption variance.

PERSPECTIVES OF ETHNIC IDENTITY IN CONSUMER RESEARCH

Ethnicity involves the social construction of origin as the basis for determining the community or collective and may be based upon a combination of history, territory, culture or physiognomical grounds (Anthias 1992). Furthermore, Anthias (1992) argues that the ‘boundaries’ of ethnic collectivities are most frequently determined by birth or marriage within the group but, ‘conversion or assimilation’ can often create the appropriate credentials for belongingness. He argues that boundaries often change in response to economic, political, and ideological conditions and this has clearly manifested within a marketing context through, amongst others, deregulation and globalization. Drawing upon a number of ‘cross-cultural’ consumer studies in the marketing literature (cf. Keilor, Hult and Babakus 1996; Laroche et al., 1997; Shimp and Sharma 1987), the studies devoted specifically to ethnic identification (cf. Deshpande, Hoyer and Donthu 1986; Donthu and Cherian 1994; Hirschman 1981) have shown a nexus between perceived ethnic affiliation and consumption patterns across certain consumer products. The underlying logic behind many ethnicity studies appears to have been to dichotomize individuals into either weak to strong ethnic identifiers based upon language spoken, religion, residential zone, and even the biological dimension - race. Whilst it is acknowledged that such studies have incorporated these and other dimensions in varying degrees, they all attempt to make comparisons between the resultant ‘ethnic clusters’ in terms of their responses to a variety of consumer behavior attitudes – ultimately translatable into marketing practices.

The ‘ethnic affiliation’ studies in the marketing literature have by and large provided clear empirical evidence that the ethnicity construct can be used as a reliable and valid indicator to help explain variance in consumer behavior patterns. Notable studies focusing specifically upon ‘ethnic identification’ have included marketing contexts, such as brand loyalty (Donuthu and Cherian 1994), product innovativeness and information transfer (Hirschman 1981), attitudes and purchase intentions (Green 1999), sales promotion and coupon usage (Donthu and Cherian 1994), media usage and reference group influence (Jikyeong and Kim 1998), response to marketing communications (Tan and Farley 1987), and gender roles and relative influence in the purchase decision (Webster 1994, 1997). Although not exhaustive, evidence presented from these studies tend to indicate that individuals with stronger ethnic affiliations respond more favorably toward marketing strategies specifically tailored towards their particular ethnic group. Furthermore their studies also suggest that attitudes towards consumption, and therefore responses to marketing strategy are differential across ethnic groups. Clearly this, and other related concepts, needs to be investigated further if empirical generalizations are to be drawn about the ethnicity construct in terms of its potential to moderate consumption.

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK AND PROPOSITIONS

Whilst the aforementioned studies provide many perspectives they mainly focus upon ‘intra-ethnic’ consumption patterns, however Hirschman (1981) found that ‘Jewish’ and ‘non-Jewish’ subjects differed significantly in terms of, amongst others, product innovativeness, product information transfers and cognitive characteristics relevant to consumer information processing. She postulates that this tends to occur because Jews, in general, exhibit higher than average levels of cognitively stimulating experiences as children, and ‘transfer’ these experiences to consumption situations. Her speculation provides a significant and distinct point of departure from the ‘strength of ethnic identification’ perspectives taken within the marketing literature, insofar as her work clearly indicates that ethnic affiliation should be viewed as a source of social interaction across a number of dimensions – whereby offering a useful guide to marketers in formulating marketing strategy. This implies that differing social processes between, and indeed within various ethnic groups, also manifest in a divergence of consumer behavior and purchasing tendencies. In many respects the marketing literature devoted to ethnic identification appears to encapsulate, at least in principle, the notion that ethnicity is largely socio-cultural and/or psychological (Barth 1969). Along with explanation of ethnic affiliation, these studies have paved the way for developing measures to investigate how the fabric of ethnicity impacts upon consumer behavior. In line with this direction we have put forward four propositions that have guided our study.
Proposition 1: Strong ethnic identifiers are more likely to shop in smaller community retail outlets, in particular their own ethnic stores, than are weaker ethnic identifiers. Recently, Hui, et al. (1997) acknowledged that ethnicity should be "better conceived as forms of social organization" (p15). Their approach appears to help explore some of the problems the existing marketing literature is facing and this provides the major impetus behind our study. To illustrate how these social organizations impact upon consumption, Donuthu and Cherian (1994) found that strong Hispanic identifiers were more inclined to be brand loyal and purchase products that were also used by their family members and friends. They argue further that stronger Hispanic identifiers are more likely to seek out Hispanic vendors for services as this involves higher levels of interaction with whom, presumably they are more comfortable with. Whilst these findings are specifically related to Hispanics, it is proposed that the desire of stronger ethnic identifiers to gravitate towards their own ethnic stores, will also translate into an inclination to shop at smaller community outlets rather than the larger, and often 'faceless' retail vendors.

Proposition 2: Strong ethnic identifiers are more likely to participate in consumption activities involving the social context than weak ethnic identifiers. Whilst much empirical evidence appears to highlight how consumers reinforce their ethnic identities, as well as express commitments to their ethnic kin through the products they consume (cf. Green 1999; Jikeong and Kim 1998), it has also been speculated that the very nature of ethnic group dynamics influences how consumers behave (Hirschman 1981). Drawing upon consumer socialization theory (cf. Moschis 1987; Moschis and Churchill 1978), Shim and Gehrt (1996) provide further empirical evidence of this, insofar as different ethnic groups display distinct shopping orientations (Sproles and Kendall 1986) as a consequence of varying consumer socialization processes within each of these groups. Although a paucity of studies exists, this evidence clearly supports the suggestion that social processes are transferred directly into the consumption context (cf. Donuthu and Cherian 1994; Hirschman 1981). As stronger ethnic identifiers are most likely to be more involved in their communities and hence have a collective mind-set – it is anticipated that this will reflect through their consumption context.

Proposition 3: Strong ethnic identifiers are more likely to expend excess disposable incomes in activities that strengthen the community than weak ethnic identifiers. Whilst it is acknowledged that the associated dynamics and processes within the ethnic collective impact upon consumer attitudes (Hirschman 1981), stronger ethnic identifiers are anticipated to act in manners which are contrived to influence and furnish the advancement of their respective ethnic and social institutions. We expect that as stronger ethnic identifiers are inclined to be more committed to the well being of their respective groups, than weak ethnic identifiers, this would manifest through consumer dynamics and related attitudes. Whilst the empirical evidence to date suggests that activities related to purchases, per se, are indeed a function of ethnicity, surprisingly, to our best knowledge, it appears as though no marketing studies have attempted to empirically demonstrate the possible nexus between ethnic affiliation and acts of "generosity and goodwill" to the community at large. Conceptually this can be regarded as strong identifiers encompassing; not only purchasing but also participating other consumer related activities to help reinforce the ethnic collective. Translating this into consumer action connotes that stronger identifiers will be more charitable in their actions towards both their ethnic kin and associated social institutions.

Proposition 4: Strong ethnic identifiers are more likely to purchase practical and functional motor vehicles, as well as frequent public modes of transport than are weak ethnic identifiers. Clearly the assumptions underpinning this, and the above mentioned propositions represent a significant and distinct conceptual definition that differs from conventional thinking – they indicate that individuals engage in consumption patterns, and related activities designed to influence the dynamics within their own ethnic communities, and hence the collective at large. It should be noted that this research does not attempt to make the distinction as to whether reinforcement of the ethnic collective, and/or institutions, is engaged at the conscious and/or subconscious levels. However taking this on face value, and melding our core assumptions and aforementioned propositions into current empirical studies in marketing, clearly suggests that strong ethnic identifiers will (1) reinforce their own ethnic identity through the products they buy, and (2) partake in consumer activities designed to stimulate social activity, whereby externalizing the notion of the ethnic collective, as would be characterized through ethnic group membership. Building on this, our rationale suggests that strong ethnic identifiers will thus (3) employ consumer behavior to help fortify their respective ethnic communities within the context of broader society—as reflected through Proposition 3.

Conceptually this tends to indicate that there is recursive relationship between ethnicity and consumption patterns. Whilst ethnicity and associated group dynamics have been empirically shown to act as a major source of influencing consumption – it is feasible, if not highly probable, that consumption patterns can be used to impact upon structure, processes, and dynamics of ethnic institutions. The very nature of what products are bought, where they are purchased, and the motive for purchase has the potential to create the perception, and indeed reality in many cases that one is contributing something, both on a tangible and intangible level, towards their ethnic communities. The notion that strong ethnic identifiers may seek to avoid ‘erosion’ of their own ethnic identity, both in terms of reinforcing their own ethnic values and contributing to interrelated social institutions, could, be ‘transferred’ into the consumption of a number of other product categories. Whilst there appears to be no supporting empirical evidence to substantiate this within the marketing literature, we argue that due to the dynamics associated with the collective, that is a common or shared fate (Anthias 1992), individuals with stronger ethnic affiliation may be more pragmatic in their consumption behavior. Consequently they may gravitate towards more practical and functional products and services than weaker ethnic identifiers. Whilst this may be an obscure and oversimplified generalization it is proposed that this manifests through modes of the transportation preferred, and the desire for generic and/or practical and functional products and services.

RESEARCH

The Questionnaire

In line with the focus of this study our research instrument was cultivated with the purpose of capturing data related to the ethnicity construct, as well as product and service related variables that impact upon consumer behavior. As the development of an ethnicity scale is not the major focus of this paper, we encompass the six dimensions proposed by Hui, et al. (1997) to capture the essence of the multi-faceted construct of ethnicity (see appendix 1). Respondents were asked to indicate their level of agreement towards a number of statements that ‘tapped’ ethnicity on a 7-point Likert scale - with 'strongly agree' and strongly disagree' as anchors. Whilst our approach imposes' parameters of the ethnicity construct upon the respondents, this method is consistent with the marketing
literature (cf. Deshpande, Hoyer and Donthu 1986; Hirschman 1981) insofar as it still enabled individuals to self-identify their perceived level of affiliation towards their respective ethnic groups—whereby enabling us to ‘dichotomize’ the construct for analysis purposes.

In attempts to explain consumption variance, Webster (1991/92) found that significant differences existed between Anglo-Americans, English and Spanish speaking Hispanics across the many facets of tactics in marketing, such as product quality, pricing, advertising, retailing and attraction towards particular vendors. In a similar fashion we draw upon many of her items, as well as incorporating questions related to levels of (1) enjoyment, (2) interest, (3) desire, (4) attraction, as well as (5) level of importance of attributes when shopping for a range of products and services. Items were chosen that we considered as being congruent with the typical consumption patterns of the multi-ethnic sample frame. These included categories related to recreation and holiday activities, motor vehicles, modes of transport, shopping venues, and general brand attributes desired. Each of the categories capture consumer attitudes and preferences using 7-point Likert scales – with relevant anchors for each of the product categories.

**Survey**

Curtin University of Technology in Perth, Western Australia, provides an ideal multi-ethnic and multi-cultural environment. It boasts two Western Australian campuses, as well as campuses in Singapore, Malaysia, and Hong Kong. We draw upon the abundance of Australian and international business students, as they offer a great source of ethnic diversity and reflect many of the characteristics of consumers within key Asian markets. Whilst it is argued that demographic characteristics are not conceptually independent from the socio-political ethnicity construct (Sharma, Shimp, and Shin 1995), the focus of this study is upon ethnic and cultural background. Thus the convenience sample chosen is an attempt to ‘control’ these ‘social variables’ – given they could account for some consumption variance, therefore biasing our findings. To ensure a relatively homogenous sample in terms of key demographics, such as age, education, income, as well as social status, we have selected second year students for our study. Furthermore, to ensure general validity of our research, we also included students from the National University of Kenya - Nairobi, Kenya.

---

1 Ideally ‘emic’ approaches to ethnographic classification should be used as imposed measures clearly fail to capture how people cognize their worlds (Ember 1977) and they therefore tend to be tainted by the cognitive ethnocentrism of the researcher (Bergier 1986). Cohen (1978) also points out that this type of subjective self-assessment is the only valid measure of the construct since it represents an individuals internal beliefs - hence the prominence, and reality of ethnic identity and affiliation.

---

**TABLE 1**

Inclination for Shopping and Brand Factors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Shopping and brand features</th>
<th>Weak (n=150)</th>
<th>Strong (n=177)</th>
<th>p-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Shopping at own ethnic store</td>
<td>2.91</td>
<td>3.34</td>
<td>0.028</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shopping at corner store</td>
<td>4.24</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shopping at market place</td>
<td>4.38</td>
<td>4.79</td>
<td>0.015</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Preference for shopping…: 1=strongly disagree, 7=strongly agree).

---

**Analysis**

A total of 327 usable questionnaires were used for the analysis which comprised the following respondents - 72 Australians, 61 Kenyans, 51 Singaporeans, 54 Hong Kong students, and 89 international students from various Asian ethnic backgrounds studying in Australia. Given the competence of all students in English there was no need to translate the questionnaire, and subsequently the English language format did not prove to present any difficulties to respondents. The questionnaire was self-administered by respondents, and it took respondents approximately 45 minutes to complete.

**Findings**

Whilst not presented in this paper in detail, similarity of demographics and ‘social variables’ indicate a high level of homogeneity between sample groups. Hui, et al. (1997) make the point that socio-economic status could be used to explain consumption variance rather than cultural factors so we needed to ensure that we were focusing upon the ethnicity construct proper. Individuals from the whole sample were then dichotomized into weak and strong ethnic identifiers across 21 ethnic indicators using k-means clustering (cf. Everitt 1993). The dichotomy resulted in 150 weak and 177 strong ethnic identifiers. Each of these clusters was then used to compare consumer preferences across a range of products and services using ANOVA in an attempt to empirically test our propositions.

Comparing the clusters of strong and weak ethnic identifiers across the range of product categories, depicted in the propositions are represented in tables 1-4. Firstly, the evidence presented (see table 1) supports the natural assumption drawn that people from the same ethnicity, particularly those that have stronger affiliations, have a predisposition towards their own ethnic kin – translating into the context of purchase - whereby supporting Proposition 1. Further support is presented in terms of the desire for strong ethnic identifiers to shop at the corner store, in which ‘closer contact’ with the vendor occurs, as well as showing a very strong tendency for face-to-face shopping as characterized by the marketplace. Furthermore, stronger ethnic identifiers are more inclined to seek bus and coach transportation (see table 4) corroborating the core supposition that they seek a ‘social context’ when purchasing.

Weaker ethnic identifiers participated in higher levels of entertainment that manifested through adventurous activities that involve higher levels of risk (see table 2). We believe that this is a reflection of them being less conservative in nature and more carefree than stronger identifiers. This mindset is also reflected in their preference for remote beaches where presumably they ‘divorce’ themselves from the world – resonating a desire for lower ‘social context’ entertainment. In contrast, stronger identifiers also gratify their entertainment through higher levels of family activity. Furthermore, they prefer more vocational activities such as educational and paradoxically intercultural tours, which we believe is a
TABLE 2
Inclination for Leisure Activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nature of leisure activities</th>
<th>Weak (n=150)</th>
<th>Strong (n=177)</th>
<th>p-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Going to remote beaches</td>
<td>5.80</td>
<td>5.33</td>
<td>0.005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intercultural and educational tours</td>
<td>4.24</td>
<td>4.58</td>
<td>0.032</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Picnics with family and friends</td>
<td>5.09</td>
<td>5.49</td>
<td>0.009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adventurous and dangerous activities</td>
<td>4.35</td>
<td>3.88</td>
<td>0.034</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Preference and liking for following activities…: 1=totally dislike, 7=totaly like).

TABLE 3
Inclination for Expenditure of Dispersible Income

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nature of expenditure</th>
<th>Weak (n=150)</th>
<th>Strong (n=177)</th>
<th>p-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Entertainment</td>
<td>3.46</td>
<td>4.98</td>
<td>0.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Donations to charity</td>
<td>3.52</td>
<td>4.05</td>
<td>0.004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support siblings in education</td>
<td>3.84</td>
<td>4.70</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Donate to ethnic group or charities</td>
<td>2.63</td>
<td>3.38</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Increases in disposable income results in higher levels of…: 1=strongly disagree, 7=strongly agree).

direct craving for the need to fervor entertainment within the social context - supporting Proposition 2.

Approaching ethnicity as a social institution (Hui, et al. 1997), it is not surprising that strong ethnic identifiers were more inclined to be generous with their disposable income in activities (see table 3), ultimately designed to preserve their own ethnic identities. The inclination to make donations to ethnic causes and charity tend to support the Proposition 3 that strong identifiers act in manners designed to strengthen their ethnic communities than weaker identifiers.

The need for ‘ethnic-preservation’ also manifested through a higher preference for stronger identifiers to contribute more to their siblings in education, than were weak identifiers. This was presumably due to the fact that their children represent the future of the ethnic collective. In stark contrast, weaker ethnic identifiers were more inclined to expend excess disposable income on self-entertainment – indicating further support for Proposition 3, as this represented their preference for self-indulgence over and above the ethnic collective.

Finally, as expected, stronger identifiers are inclined to show preference for more practical and functional motor vehicles (see table 4). These types of higher involvement products are of longer-term commitments; therefore, individuals with a higher collective mindset would be expected to place a lower emphasis upon self-indulgence in these purchases. Whilst this finding has not been attributed to any particular ethnic group, we argue that it is the ‘higher level of perceived membership’ of the ethnic collective per se, that is translated into preferences for higher involvement products. Furthermore, as the sample frame consists of predominantly students, and they by and large do not have children and families of their own, this finding clearly cannot be attributed to their current lifestyles, but rather a reflection of a deeply engrained mindset. It could however be attributed to a stronger collective ethnic upbringing, thus providing support for our Proposition 4. Also, given weaker ethnic identifiers are expected to have less of a collective mindset, this indicates a higher level of ‘individualism’. This, translated through higher levels of personal ‘indulgence’, characterized by the preference of personalized motor vehicles and air travel, also provides empirical support for this proposition.

DISCUSSION, LIMITATIONS AND FUTURE DIRECTIONS

Our findings offer new evidence that ethnicity, particularly within the Australiasian region, impacts upon consumer preferences. It reinforces reasoning that ethnic groups should be regarded as a form of social organization (Hui, et al. 1997), and that processes within the collective social organization would be translated into consumption situations (Hirschman 1981). The evidence presented here tends to indicate that the consumption of products and services by strong ethnic identifiers reinforces their commitment to the ethnic collective in a number of manners.

Firstly, as certain individuals would be inclined to interact more often within the collective, we argue that the totality of these experiences within the ethnic group will have a bearing upon both the content and context of the purchase decision. The dynamics associated with ethnic group interaction therefore needs further investigation to test whether there are any distinct differences in processes between ethnic groups that are translatable into consumption behavior, as speculated by Hirschman (1981).

Secondly, the impact of ‘non-ethnic’ institutions upon the individuals ethnic affiliation needs to be fully explored, particularly when they are an ethnic minority and/or they are of second or third generation. Breton (1964) points to the capacity of ethnic institutions to secure new immigrants commitment to their ethnic minority therefore it is quite possible that the second or third generation ‘off-spring’ from immigrant families will be more prone to acculturation of the majority ethnic group. The acculturation process of ethnic minorities, from all generations, towards the majority ethnic group, in terms of impact of upon consumption clearly needs further investigation.

Thirdly, comparisons need to be made between minority and majority ethnic group dynamics and processes to see if any differences exist and whether this can moderate consumption. This ‘cross-ethnic’ comparison also needs to occur between minority
Changing marketplace. Whilst the issues we discuss are not exhausted as the diverse richness of ethnicity in the context of an ever-given the globalization and fragmentation of mass markets, as well as the public system of transportation.

Clearly this matter needs to be addressed as a matter of urgency universal application across national, as well as ethnic boundaries. Researchers need to develop a much more comprehensive, and marketers tailor strategies directly towards each ethnic grouping, and what impact does this have upon consumption variance between strong and weak ethnic identifiers in two countries.

Finally, whilst we never compared consumption variances between weak and strong identifiers across ethnic groups, we feel that this needs to be investigated more thoroughly. In order to help marketers tailor strategies directly towards each ethnic grouping, researchers need to develop a much more comprehensive, and clearer construct that will have general applicability in conceptualization and measure of impacts of ethnicity upon consumer behavior. In this regard it should offer the potential to have universal application across national, as well as ethnic boundaries. Clearly this matter needs to be addressed as a matter of urgency given the globalization and fragmentation of mass markets, as well as the diverse richness of ethnicity in the context of an ever-changing marketplace. Whilst the issues we discuss are not exhaustive, the identification of relevant ‘interaction variables’ that could be universally applied to different ethnic groups from both within and across national boundaries is tantamount if a much richer and more sophisticated approach to targeting ethnic segments is to be achieved.

CONCLUSIONS

Our study has provided significant empirical evidence that, compared to weak ethnic identifiers, strong ethnic identifiers participate in consumption activities involving the social context. They were found to shop in smaller community retail outlets and their own ethnic retail stores. Furthermore, it was found that, compared to weaker ethnic identifiers, strong ethnic identifiers tended to be more generous towards their ethnic institutions, as well as towards the general community. Weaker identifiers were more inclined to indulge in personalized motor vehicles and other modes of travel, whereas stronger identifiers were found to opt for more practical modes of personal transport, as well as rely more heavily upon the public system of transportation.

This study focused on identifying particular factors that might impact upon how strong ethnic identifiers behave different from other mainstream consumers in the country of residence of particular consumers, which conventional marketing wisdom assumes as behavior influenced by a particular national culture. Based upon empirical data from a range of diverse environments, and without theorizing on the relationship between mainstream and ethnic cultures in a multicultural and multietnic environments, our study provide empirical substantiation for the need to use ethnicity as a base for market segmentation. In this way marketers could target specific segments with marketing programs that enhance response of particular customer groups that are strong ethnic identifiers. Although this exploratory study identified important variables that substantiates the importance of targeting ethnic groups, given the specifics that underlie behavior of each particular ethnic group, marketers need to study patterns of each targeted ethnic group to increase chances for favorable consumer responses.

REFERENCES


APPENDIX 1
Ethnicity Scale Items

1. You are involved in your own ethnic community.
2. Only English is spoken with close friends.
3. You have a strong association with political groups.
4. You only read, listen and watch ethnic media.
5. English is the only language spoken at home.
6. You only read, listen and watch English media.
7. You would never marry outside your ethnic group.
8. All your neighbors are from your ethnic group.
9. At home only a non-English language is spoken.
10. You need to worship in your religion more often.
11. You only mix with people outside your ethnic group.
12. Your family members must marry within your ethnic group.
13. Your family is the most important thing in your life.
14. All your close friends are from your own ethnic group.
15. With your close friends only a non-English language is spoken.
16. You often go to places with people of your same ethnicity.
17. You participate in ethnic political activities.
18. You consider that you have strong religious beliefs.
19. You had a strong religious upbringing.
20. Religious beliefs are an important part of your life.
21. Your parents have strong ethnic links.
22. Your friends have strong ethnic links.
23. You grew up in an ethnic environment.
24. Your school only catered for your ethnic group.
25. You only go out with people of the same ethnicity.

1. Respondents indicated level of agreement with statements in which: 1 = strongly disagree, 7 = strongly agree.
2. K-means clustering assigned respondents into strong and weak ethnic identifiers [2-groups] using these items.
EURO2000: A Study on the Influence of Program-Involvement on Commercial Selection and Memory in a Real Life Setting
Marjolein Moorman, University of Amsterdam, The Netherlands
Peter Neijens, University of Amsterdam, The Netherlands
Edith G. Smit, University of Amsterdam, The Netherlands

ABSTRACT
In the past decades, various experiments have demonstrated the effect of program-involvement on memory for advertising. An important limitation of these studies is the use of forced exposure. The present study investigates the influence of program-involvement in a real-life setting. Several matches of the 2000 European championship soccer were selected based on expected levels of involvement. A day after broadcasting, telephone interviews were held with a representative random sample (N=344). Contrary to experimental studies, results showed that commercials embedded in high-involvement matches were significantly viewed more frequently (selection) and were better remembered than commercials embedded in low-involvement matches.

1The study of the influence of program-involvement on commercial selection and processing in a real life setting is part of a Ph.D. project on advertising context, conducted at AScot. The authors would like to thank AScot, SWOCC and Interview/NSS for making this study possible.
The Use of Humor in Threat-Related Advertising: An Experiential Processing Perspective  
Ashesh Mukherjee, McGill University, Canada  
Laurette Dubé, McGill University, Canada

ABSTRACT
We report the results of an experiment designed to identify how humor operates in threat-related advertising (e.g., ads relating to AIDS prevention, drunk driving, life-insurance, car safety), in both experiential and rational modes of processing. Further, we investigate the effects of humor in different processing modes using a full portfolio of explicit and implicit measures of persuasion. 175 subjects were randomly assigned to a 2 (Humor) x 2 (Processing Style) between-subjects factorial design. Under rational processing, results show that humor had no effect on either explicit or implicit measures of attitudes and memory. Under experiential processing, humor had a positive effect on implicit attitudes and implicit memory, but no effect on explicit measures. These results are interpreted in the light of recent theorizing on the experiential mode of processing, and suggestions for future research are offered.
Are Negative Frames More Persuasive than Positive Frames for Senior Citizens?
An Exploratory Investigation of Age Differences in Framing Effects
Rama Jayanti, Cleveland State University, U.S.A.

ABSTRACT
The author explores the role of age differences in framing effects. Marketing studies in general have shown that negatively framed messages are more effective under conditions of high issue involvement. Public service campaign studies, on the other hand, claim that positively framed messages are more effective in encouraging healthy behaviors. Based on cognitive aging theory, it was hypothesized that prevention oriented behaviors are facilitated by positively framed messages for senior citizens. A significant interaction between age and framing lends support to this argument. Given a high involvement and prevention oriented behavior, positively framed messages were more effective for seniors compared to their younger counterparts who were influenced by negatively framed messages. Implications for persuasion and public policy are discussed.
Author Index

Agrawal, Nidhi ........................................ 120
Askegaard, Søren ................................. 245, 246
Bech-Larsen, Tino ................................. 11
Beckmann, Suzanne C. ............................ 18
Belk, Russell W. .................................... 197
Bengtsson, Anders ................................. 246
Bosmans, Anick ..................................... 47
Brengman, Malaika ............................... 135
Brown, Stephen ..................................... 61, 169
Brunso, Karen ....................................... 5
Chang, Joseph W. ................................... 24
Chaudhuri, Arjun ................................... 30
Christie, Jennifer .................................. 158
Cowley, Elizabeth .................................. 174
Curasi, Carolyn Folkman .......................... 260
Darke, Peter R. ..................................... 141
Davies, Andrea ...................................... 234
de Heer, Johan ...................................... 51, 66
Diehl, Sandra ....................................... 115
Dubé, Laurette ...................................... 1, 222, 233, 335
Eisen, Martin ........................................ 227
Ekström, Karin M. .................................. 145
Ekström, Marianne P. ............................. 145
Elliott, Richard .................................... 167, 203
Faber, Ronald J. .................................... 90
Fernandez, Nalini .................................. 269
Fitchett, James A. .................................. 234
Folkes, Valerie S. .................................. 215
Friese, Susanne .................................... 164
Gabrielsen, Gorm .................................. 300
Galan, Jean-Philippe .............................. 270
Garrow, Jade ........................................ 268
Ger, Güliz ............................................. 155
Geuens, Maggie .................................... 135
Gonzalez, Christine .............................. 270
Gould, Elizabeth A. ............................... 4
Gould, Nicholas ..................................... 4
Goulding, Christina ............................... 203
Grönhaug, Kjell .................................... 23
Grunert, Klaus G. .................................. 5, 11
Gutman, Jonathan .................................. 17
Hall, John lia ........................................ 82
Halling, Jens ........................................ 300, 310
Hansen, Flemming .................................. 290, 300, 310, 318
Hem, Leif E. ........................................ 23
Hildebrandt, Lutz .................................. 187
Hogg, Margaret K. .................................. 260, 268
Holbrook, Morris B. .............................. 30
Honea, Heather ..................................... 193
Imura, Yasutoshi .................................... 157
Jayanti, Rama ....................................... 336
Jensen, Thomas D. .................................. 158
Jones, Sandra C. .................................... 211
Kamlaige, Kerstin .................................. 187
Kates, Steven M. ................................... 168
Kiesler, Tina ........................................ 195
Kingshott, Ruel P.J. ............................... 327
Knoops, Stan ........................................ 17
Kock, Christian ..................................... 318
Krause, Niels ....................................... 180
Kristensen, Tore ................................... 300
Kuijlen, Ton ......................................... 51
Larsen, Gretchen .................................... 124
Lauritsen, Gitte Bach ............................. 310
Lawson, Rob ........................................ 124
Le Bel, Jordan L. .................................... 163, 222
Lee, Christiana Kwan-Choi ........................ 269
Lines, Rune .......................................... 23
Lockshin, Larry ..................................... 82
Maclaran, Pauline .................................. 260
Maheswaran, Durairaj ............................ 120
Mandachitra, Rujirutana ........................ 120
Marsden, David ..................................... 54
Martin, Brett A.S. d ............................... 157
Martin, Ingrid M. ................................. 215
McMellon, Charles A. ............................ 240
McQuarrie, Edward F. ............................ 46
Menon, Kalyani ..................................... 233
Michaut, Anne ....................................... 15
Moorman, Marjolein .............................. 334
Morschett, Dirk .................................... 107
Moritz, Vicki G. .................................... 195
Mukherjee, Ashesh ................................. 1, 335
Mulvey, Michael S. ............................... 196
Neijens, Peter ..................................... 334
Olsen, Douglas ..................................... 210
Oppenheim, Peter P. ............................. 82
Oppenhausen, Joke ................................ 73
Östberg, Jacob ..................................... 246
Paas, Leo ............................................. 51
Padgrett, Dan ....................................... 196
Park, Cheol .......................................... 281
Patterson, Maurice ................................. 167
Percy, Larry ......................................... 293
Phillips, Barbara J. ................................. 46
Poietz, Theo B.C. ................................. 66
Poulsen, Carsten Stig ............................. 5
Pracejus, John W. ................................. 286
Puntoni, Stefano .................................... 130
Rasmussen, Anders A. .......................... 297
Reisch, Lucia many ............................... 164
Rexha, Nexhimi ..................................... 327
Rossiter, John R. .................................... 174, 209
Russell, Cristel Antonia .......................... 193
Sjégers, Rosette .................................... 135
Samiee, Saeed ....................................... 325
Sandikci, Özlem .................................... 155
Schaeffer, Sabine M. ............................. 31
Schau, Hope ......................................... 61
Schmidt, Marcus .................................... 180
Scholander, Joachim .............................. 5
Schuchert-Güler, Pakize .......................... 227
Shanahan, Helena ................................. 145
Shankar, Avi ........................................ 203
Sharma, Subhash .................................... 325
Shimp, Terence A. .................................. 325
Sikk, Dirk ............................................ 73
Smit, Ale ............................................. 209
Smit, Edith G. ....................................... 334